FRANCISCAN VALUES AND SOCIAL CONTEXTS: A SOCIOLOGICAL STUDY OF FOUNDERS OF ANGLICAN FRANCISCAN THIRD ORDERS, 1882-1939.

Rosemary Ann Sharpe.

Thesis submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

The London School of Economics and Political Science

UMI Number: U055777

All rights reserved

INFORMATION TO ALL USERS

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.



UMI U055777

Published by ProQuest LLC 2014. Copyright in the Dissertation held by the Author.

Microform Edition © ProQuest LLC.

All rights reserved. This work is protected against unauthorized copying under Title 17, United States Code.



ProQuest LLC 789 East Eisenhower Parkway P.O. Box 1346 Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 THESES

STIGHT LINE STATES

CONTRATES A SER A

Chary Ann Sharpe

x210715064

The tempon Scouol of Scononies and Dollies \ cience

ABSTRACT.

This thesis is an account of how certain resources and the values they expressed came to be available and visible in society, and of how these values were taken up, transformed and used in particular ways. It will demonstrate how four individuals, in different social contexts, acquired and transformed these values, as they attempted to initiate varying forms of the same type of organisation.

The values with which the thesis is concerned are those inferred from the life of St. Francis of Assisi (1182-1226). Part One sketches how (a) Roman Catholics made the values they ascribed to St. Francis available as resources and (b) those outside the Roman Catholic Church, especially in the period 1882-1939, came to know of these resources and values, and Part Two consists of four life-history narratives modified them. constructed from oral history, manuscripts and printed materials. recount how four people in this period came to be stimulated by these resources, and attempted to institutionalise the values they absorbed from them in different forms of an Anglican Franciscan Third Order. The first narrative traces part of the mercurial life of James Adderley, who encouraged individuals to express Franciscan values through attempting to The second narrative explains how Emily bring about social justice. Marshall came to connect Franciscan values with her desire to see women's ministry recognised by the Church of England. The third and fourth narratives are set mainly in India. John Winslow in the 'High Noon' of the British Empire linked Franciscan and Indian bhakti values to form an Verrier Elwin merged Franciscan and ashram, Christa Seva Sangha. Gandhian values while living among aboriginal tribes. The final chapter analyses the complex interplay between Franciscan values and social contexts which is demonstrated by these four examples, and draws some sociological conclusions from the research.

TABLE OF CONTENTS.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	13.
A CHRONOLOGICAL CHART OF EVENTS FROM THE BIRTH OF FRANCIS TO HIS CANONISATION	14.
A CHRONOLOGICAL CHART OF SELECTED EVENTS RELEVANT TO THE FOUNDERS OF ANGLICAN FRANCISCAN THIRD ORDERS	16.
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	24.
1. Identifying a Franciscan Problem	24.
 The Problem of Past and Present. The Basic Facts about Francis of Assisi, 1182-1226. The Pope's Proclamation: A Saint, an Exemplar of Catholic Values. A Franciscan Revival, 1882-1926. The Mass Media at the High Point of the Franciscan Revival in 1926 Illustrate a Sociological Problem. 	
2. A Spiral of Franciscan Resources	32.
 The Production of Franciscan Texts: Three Approaches to a Problem. (a) Examining the Construction of Texts. (b) Examining the Content of Texts. (c) Examining the Distribution of Texts. Defining a Resource-Spiral: A Sociological Problem of Production and Consumption. The Consumption of Franciscan Texts: The Problems of Access, Comprehension and Interaction. Identifying the Range of Franciscan Resources Available for Consumption. 	
3. Investigating Some Aspects of the Consumption of Franciscan Resources: Four Founders of Anglican Franciscan Third Orders, 1882-1939	37.
(1) The Sample of Four Founders.	

	(2) (3)		
4.	The Re	search Process	40.
	(1) (2) (3) (4)		
5.	The Pr	esentation of Research Results	44.
	(3)	Situational Studies. Life Histories. Narratives. Theoretical Plots.	
6.	Summar	y of the Remaining Chapters	45.
		PART ONE.	56.
IAPTER '	rwo: The	CONSTRUCTION OF FRANCISCAN RESOURCES	
	ANI	VALUES	57.
Pa	rt One:	The Legacy of almost Seven Centuries.	
1.	Constr	ructing Franciscan Resources After Canonisation.	57.
	(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7)	Allocating Sacred Time. Celebrating Sacred Topography. Authorising Sacred Texts. Occupying Sacred Space. Appropriating Sacred Artefacts. Formalising Sacred Organisations. Summary.	
2.		ructing and Diminishing Franciscan Resources in ad, 1224-1558	68.
	(1) (2) (3)	The Coming of the Franciscan Cultus and Franciscan Orders to England. The Coming of the Protestants to England. Summary.	
3.	Modifi	cations to the Resources	71.
	(1)	The Growth of the Franciscan Orders: Human Resources.	
	(2) (3)	Modification of Franciscan Visual Resources. Modification of Franciscan Sacred Texts.	

4.	The Ce	ntury-Long Storm, 1789-1882	74.
	(1)	The Lack of a Strong Franciscan Presence in Protestant England and the European Mainland in an Age of Rationalism and Revolution.	
	(2)		
Par	rt Two:	Reviving and Rediscovering Franciscan Resources	
and	l Values	<u>. 1882–1926.</u>	
5.		ics and Others, 1882-1926	75.
	(1)	•	
		Addressed to Roman Catholics. (a) Commendation of St. Francis.	
		(b) Commendation of the Franciscan Third Order.	
	(2)	Paul Sabatier's alternative Proposition about	
		St. Francis Addressed to the 'Others'.	
		(a) The Controlling Constraints of the Institution in the Interpretation of	
		St. Francis.	
		(b) The Distorting Constraints of the Saint-	
		System in the Representation of St.	
		Francis. (c) The Positive Alternative: Seeing Francis,	
		the Man, in his Context.	
		(d) Francis, the Man for All Humanity.	
	(3)	The Demarcation of the Differences in Inter-	
		pretation among Roman Catholics and 'the Others'.	
6.	The De	velopment of the Roman Catholic Propositions	81.
	(1)	_	•
	(2) (3)	Authorising Franciscan Texts. Celebrating Franciscan Topographies and Buildings.	
	(4)		
7.	'The O	thers' Make a Franciscan Movement Visible in	
• •		Britain, c.1850-1926	84.
	(1)	The Absence of Franciscan Sacred Time.	
	(2)	The Provision of Franciscan Texts. (a) Issuing General Texts about St. Francis and	
		Franciscans: Isolated Examples, c. 1850-1894.	
		(b) Authorising Scholarly Texts, c. 1850-1926.	
		(c) Fine Art Criticism: Lectures and Other Texts, c. 1850-1926.	
		(d) General Interest Library Texts, 1894-1926.	
		(e) Texts for Personal Leisure Reading, 1850-1926.	
		(f) Children's Books.	

Table of Contents 6

(5) Appropriating Artoc. 1900-1926.	raphy, c. 1850-1926. on by Paintings, c. 1850-1926. efacts for New Purposes, c Space, 1900-1926.	
8. The Culmination at the Serancis's Death, 1926	eventh Centenary of St 97.	,
PART TWO	<u>o</u> . 108.	,
CHAPTER THREE: THE SOCIAL DRAMAS OF ADDERLEY	109.	,
	Social Contexts of Early Life,	,
	l. ctor at Oxford University. in Westminster Reads a	
2. Responding to the Bitter Bethnal Green, 1885-1888	Cry of the Outcast in	
(1) An Unconventional(2) A Soap-Box Orator(3) A Curate Among the		
	emmas Generated in Church and Ham, 1889-1893 117.	,
(1) Building a Church(2) Set Between Two Cla	of St. Frideswide. asses in the 1889 Dock Strike.	
4. Acting in National Arena	s, 1892-1894 120.	,
Social Union. (2) A Writing and Cyc. Fellowship. (3) A Confession of Po	nittee Member of the Christian ling Member of the Clarion olitical Belief at the Church d a Member of the Independent	
Labour Party.	riars in a Church Newspaper.	

	Part Two: Seeking a Franciscan Third Order, 1893-1926.				
	5. From Scholarly Fact to Popular Fiction, 1893				
		(1) A Serious Student of Franciscan Studies.(2) Author of the Popular Story, Stephen Remarx.			
	6.	National Vision and Parochial Constraint: The Society of the Divine Compassion, 1894-1897	131.		
		(1) Living the Story of Stephen Remarx in the Formation of the Society of the Divine Compassion.			
		(2) Reading Paul Sabatier's Francis of Assisi.			
		(3) Making Values Plain in the Language of the People.			
		(4) Leaving the Society of the Divine Compassion.			
	7.	Tension Between Spirit and Letter in West London, 1897-1902	138.		
		(1) Tenant of a Mayfair Chapel and a Brother of the Holy Spirit of Truth.			
		(2) Author of Francis: The Little Poor Man of Assisi.			
		(3) Paul Sabatier's New Third Order Challenge and Friendship.			
	8.	Returning to Birmingham and War Service, 1902-1918	142.		
		(1) The Vicar of Saltley and Deritend, Birmingham.(2) The First World War, 1914-1918.			
	9.	Handing Over to Other People, 1919-1926	144.		
	10.	Subsequent Events	146.		
CHAPT	er f	OUR: THE SUGGESTION OF EMILY ESTHER MARSHALL	159.		
		t One: Constructing a Suggestion for a Diaconate in derland, 1879-1889.			
	1.	Imbibing Values in Early and Middle Life, 1832-1879	159.		
		(1) Family Contexts.(2) Living in Sunderland, 1879-1889.			
	2.	'A Lady' in Three Sunderland Parishes, 1879-1889	162.		
		 District Visiting in St. Matthew's, Silksworth. 'A Lady of the Vicarage' at St. Mark's, Millfield. 			
		(3) An Aspiring Deacon at St. Paul's, Hendon.			

3.		ving Diocesan Organisations from a Distance,	171.
		The Auckland Brotherhood. The Daughters of St. Cuthbert. The White Cross Army.	
4.		ing from National and International Congresses, 1889	175.
		The Church Congresses. The Pan-Anglican Congress. Women's Organisations.	
5.		g and Presenting A Suggestion for Our Times, and ving Bishop Lightfoot's Response, 1889	177.
	(1)	Completing her Suggestion for a Diaconate for Women.	
	(2)	Bishop Lightfoot's Response to Miss	
	(3)	Marshall's Suggestion. The Bishop's Own Suggestion of a Franciscan Third Order.	
Par	t Two:	The Slow Emergence of a Franciscan Third Order.	
6.	Formin	g the League of St. Cuthbert, 1890-1893	179.
	(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6)	Designing a Badge and Choosing a Uniform. Selecting the Definitive Name.	
7.	The Bi	rth of the League of St. Cuthbert	183.
	(1) (2)	The Admission Ceremony. The First Members.	
8.		ming the Disadvantages of One Structure with the of Another	184.
	(1) (2)	'Duly Subordinate to the Clergy'. Crossing Parochial Boundaries by Posting Letters.	
9.		g Acquired Information and Ideas in Pamphlets, 893	186.
	(1)	Converting Imagined Talks into Printed Pamphlets.	
	(2)	Beginning her Search for Information About St. Francis.	
	(3)	Discovering Mrs. Oliphant's <i>Francis of Assisi</i> .	

	, ,	Examining Leo XIII's Rule. A Silent Dialogue with Bishop Westcott.	
10.	_	to See, Value and Understand Two Faces of St. s of Assisi, 1894	19
	(1)	Discovering S. François d'Assise and Meeting Paul Sabatier.	
	(2)	Coming to Understand the Roman Catholic Franciscan Third Order, Ancient and Modern.	
11.	The Mo	ulding of an Hybrid Organisation, 1894-1897	1
	(1)	The Growth of the Durham Franciscan Third Order in the West Indies.	
		Bishop Westcott of Durham Sanctions Deaconesses. Varying Appraisals of an Emerging Third Order Oorganisation.	
12.	The Ne	w Century, 1900-1915	1
		Longed-for Acceptance in Durham. Wider Liaisons.	
	(3)		
13.	Subsequ	ient Events	1
13.	Subseq	uent Events	1
	Ī	e ashram experiment of John Copley Winslow	1
R F <u>Par</u>	'IVE: TH		
R F <u>Par</u>	IVE: THOSE THOSE THE SECOND SE	E ASHRAM EXPERIMENT OF JOHN COPLEY WINSLOW	2
R F <u>Par</u> 188	IVE: THOSE THOSE THE SECOND SE	E ASHRAM EXPERIMENT OF JOHN COPLEY WINSLOW Acquiring Indian and Franciscan Values, Ing Values in British Social Contexts of Early 1883-1914	2
R F <u>Par</u> 188	TIVE: TH t One: 2-1919. Imbibi Life,	E ASHRAM EXPERIMENT OF JOHN COPLEY WINSLOW Acquiring Indian and Franciscan Values, Ing Values in British Social Contexts of Early 1883-1914	2
R F <u>Par</u> 188	IVE: THE 2-1919. Imbibit Life, (1)	E ASHRAM EXPERIMENT OF JOHN COPLEY WINSLOW Acquiring Indian and Franciscan Values, Ing Values in British Social Contexts of Early 1883-1914	
R F Par 188	TIVE: THE CONE: 12-1919. Imbibit Life, 11 (2) Fuller (1)	E ASHRAM EXPERIMENT OF JOHN COPLEY WINSLOW Acquiring Indian and Franciscan Values, Ing Values in British Social Contexts of Early 1883-1914	2
R F Par 188	rive: The tone: 2-1919. Imbibit Life, (1) (2) Fuller	E ASHRAM EXPERIMENT OF JOHN COPLEY WINSLOW Acquiring Indian and Franciscan Values, Ing Values in British Social Contexts of Early 1883-1914	2
R F Par 188	TIVE: THE CONE: 12-1919. Imbibit Life, (1) (2) Fuller (1) (2)	E ASHRAM EXPERIMENT OF JOHN COPLEY WINSLOW Acquiring Indian and Franciscan Values, Ing Values in British Social Contexts of Early 1883-1914	2 2 2
R F Par 188 1.	TIVE: THE CONE: 12-1919. Imbibit Life, (1) (2) Fuller (1) (2)	E ASHRAM EXPERIMENT OF JOHN COPLEY WINSLOW Acquiring Indian and Franciscan Values, Ing Values in British Social Contexts of Early 1883-1914	2
R F Par 188 1.	TIVE: THE CONE: 12-1919. Imbibit Life, 12) Fuller (1) (2) Acquir:	E ASHRAM EXPERIMENT OF JOHN COPLEY WINSLOW Acquiring Indian and Franciscan Values, Ing Values in British Social Contexts of Early 1883-1914	2 2 2

	(4)	Turning to Ashram Experiments.	
	(5)	Learning from Gandhi's Ashram Experiment.	
	(6)	Learning from Tagore's Ashram Experiment.	
	(7)	Learning from an Ashram Experiment of the	
		Christian Orthodox Church.	
	(8)	Winslow's Ideas for Liturgical Experiment.	
	(9)	Learning from Narayan Vaman Tilak's Christian	
		Ashram Experiment.	
4.	Consid	dering the Global Context of 1919	228.
	t Two:	The Development of Christa Seva Sangha,	
5.	Creati	ng a Christian-Indian Ashram in Ahmednagar,	
	1920-1	926	230.
	4		
	(1)	The First Two Experimental Years.	
	(2)	Receiving Episcopal Blessing for Christa Seva	
	(0)	Sangha.	
	(3)	Assessing the Indian Christa Seva Sangha Expeiriment.	
		Experriment.	
6.	Explai	ning Indian and Franciscan Values on a Tour of	
••		n in the Year of the Franciscan Centenary	235.
	D1 1 00.		2000
7.	A Grov	ving Inter-Racial Experiment, 1927-1928	237.
		• •	
	(1)	Englishmen Join the Ashram at a New Centre in	
		Poona.	
	(2)	The First Months in Poona.	
•	<i>-</i>		
8.		on in a Small and Complex Indian and Franciscan	020
	Urgani	sation, 1927-1929	239.
	(1)	Listening to Other Pipers Playing a Different	
	(1)	Tune.	
	(2)	Tension in Discerning Franciscan and Indian	
	(-,	Values.	
	(3)		
	(-)	Organisation.	
	(4)	Resolving Tensions.	
9.	Realis	ing the Potential of Print, 1928-1930	245.
	(1)		
	(2)	Describing Christa Seva Sangha.	
	(3)	Advocating The Dawn of Indian Freedom.	
10	To-c≜ c = 1	ing Chaigts Cove Consta to England 1000 1000	046
10.	rxtend	ing Christa Seva Sangha to England, 1930-1933	246.
	(1)	Meeting with the Fellowship of the Way.	
	(2)	Constituting the Third Order of the Society of	
	(2)	St. Francis.	

	11.	Activa	ting Dispersion in India, 1931-1939	248.
			Multiplying Experiments in 1931. The Division of Christa Seva Sangha.	
	12.	Subseq	uent Events	249.
CHAPTI	er s	IX: THE	FRANCISCAN-GANDHIAN VENTURE OF VERRIER ELWIN	260.
			Acquiring Franciscan and Mystical Values in d in India, 1902-1932.	
	1.		ng Values in Social Contexts of Early Life,	260.
		(1)	A Bishop's Son, a Pupil at Dean Close School, a Student and Vice-Principal at Oxford University.	
		(2)	Searching for Mystical and Romantic Values at Oxford University.	
		(3)	Extending his Enquiries with the Assistance of Visiting Scholars.	
		(4)	Deciding to Go to Assisi, and then to India to Join Christa Seva Sangha.	
	2.	•	ing Mystical and Franciscan Values in India and d, March 1927-November 1929	264.
			Enjoying Multi-Religious India. Visiting Gandhi's Ashram at Sabarmati and Analysing his Experiences There.	
		(3)	•	
		(4)	Acquiring an Italian Franciscan Spiritual Director.	
		(5)	Experiencing Spiritual Entente.	
	3.	Tension	n in India, 1929-1930	268.
		(1)	Finding Change at Christa Seva Sangha and Sabarmati.	
		(2)	Being a 'Son of St. Francis' and a 'Son of Gandhi'.	
	4.		ting Franciscan and Gandhian Values in Public, 1930-1931	270.
		(1) (2) (3)	Becoming a Franciscan-Gandhian Rebel. Expounding Franciscan Values. Proclaiming Ganhian Values.	

Table of Contents	12

5	Resolving Tensions	273.
	(1) Selecting the Most Important Values.(2) Deciding to Become a Franciscan Third Order Hermit.	
	rt Two: Transforming Franciscan and Gandhian Values at . Francis Ashram and Gond Seva Mandal, 1931-1939.	
6	Problems in Founding a Small and Complex Gandhian and Franciscan Organisation among the Gonds	277.
	(1) Finding a New Context and a Companion among the	
	Gonds. (2) Witnessing Gandhi's Arrest and Becoming his	
	Emissary. (3) Eventual New Beginnings at St. Francis Ashram, Karanjia.	
7.	Taking his Gandhian-Franciscan Message to Britain	281.
	(1) Political Actions.(2) Feeling 'Outcaste' Before Returning to the Gond.(3) Returning to Karanjia.	
8.	Realising the Potential of Print, 1923-1933	285.
	(1) Turning Franciscan and Gandhian Poverty into Literary Expression and Anthropological Research.	
	(2) Expressing Franciscan and Gandhian Love in	
	Journals and Newspapers. (3) Taking Franciscan and Gandhian Obedience into a Nation.	
9.	Subsequent Events	292.
CHAPTER	SEVEN: CONCLUSIONS	306.
1.	Theoretical Main Plot	306.
2.	Theoretical Sub-Plots	312.
3.	Suggestions for Further Research	327.
BIBLIOGE	АРНУ	331.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.

It will be evident that the writing of this thesis has only been possible because of the assistance of other people. I should like to thank Professor E. V. Barker for supervising the research and for arranging a series of seminars in the Sociology of Religion which I have always found stimulating. I have also appreciated meetings with Professor A. D. Smith, and with other staff and students of the London School of Economics and Political Science, especially at the recently instituted seminars for research students.

The Society of St. Francis has allowed me access to its archives, and I am grateful to the members of the Society, in all three of its Orders, living and departed, who have offered me printed, manuscript and oral In addition, I should like to thank the following for permission to consult or quote from their holdings: the Bodleian Library, Oxford; the World Council for Mission; the India Office Library; the Mahatma Gandhi Museum; the Smarak Sang Sangrahalaya; the Dean and Chapter Library, Durham; the Franciscan Study Centre, Canterbury; the Fawcett Library; the Guildhall Library; and the Local Studies centres at Sunderland, Darlington, Kensington, Hackney and Tower Hamlets. grateful to the following for allowing me to consult their research papers fully: John Swaby, Father Lucian Hunt, O.F.M., Sister Barbara Noreen, C.S.M.V. and Douglas Smith. Family and friends have offered their encouragement and support. The thesis would probably never have been completed had my husband, David, failed to persuade me that a word processor could be user-friendly, and that he could sort out my squabbles with it. He and Kate Compston have always been willing to discuss commas and other confusions.

AN APPROXIMATE CHRONOLOGICAL CHART OF SELECTED EVENTS FROM THE BIRTH OF ST. FRANCIS TO HIS CANONISATION.

- 1182. Birth of son, Giovanni (later called Francesco) to Pietro and Pica Bernardone. Francis received a simple Latin education.
- 1198. Accession of Pope Innocent III.
- 1202. Francis in prison in Perugia after battle of Collestrada.
- 1206. Francis sought knighthood, but returned home after vision. Loved Lady Poverty. Became Troubadour. Embraced leper. Exchanged clothes with a beggar. Gave away father's possessions. Brought before the Bishop of Assisi. Heard Gospel calling him. First preaching. Heard Christ from crucifix. Restored churches. Twelve disciples joined Francis.
- 1210. Francis journeyed to Rome. Pope Innocent III gave verbal approval to Rule of Life. Group continued simple way of life at Rivo Torto. Portiuncula became centre.
- 1212. Clare joined Francis and brothers. Foundation of Second Order at San Damiano. Francis sent brothers out in pairs. Visited Gubbio. Francis promised people at Cannara he would provide a way for them to follow in his path without leaving their homes or occupations. Luchesio and Bella Donna were first tertiaries. Continued care for lepers and poor. Hermitages at Mount Subasio and elsewhere.
- 1215. Lateran Council. Meeting with Dominic.
- 1216. Death of Innocent III and accession of Honorius III.
- 1219. Francis went to Crusades and met Muslim Sultan. Preached to birds at Bevagna.
- 1220. Peter Catanii appointed Minister General of First Order.
- 1221. Pope approved Third Order Rule.
- 1223. Pope approved First Order Rule. Francis celebrated Christmas at Greccio with live Crib.
- 1224. Mount La Verna given to Francis by a tertiary. Accompanied there by Brother Leo. Francis received Stigmata. Francis wrote Leo a note of encouragement. Friars arrived at Canterbury.
- 1225. Francis composed Canticle of the Sun. Treatment for eye illness at Rieti.

- 1226. Francis brought back to Assisi. Francis wrote his Testament. Died on 3 October.
- 1227. Cardinal Ugolino, Protector of Franciscans, became Pope Gregory IX.
- 1228. Canonisation of St. Francis. Blessing of foundation of Basilica. Thomas of Celano commissioned to write Legenda.

A CHRONOLOGICAL CHART OF SELECTED EVENTS RELEVANT TO THE FOUR FOUNDERS, 1832-1939.

- 1832. Birth of Emily Marshall.
- 1850. Restoration of the Roman Catholic Hierarchy of Bishops to England.
- 1858. Government of India Act. British India under control of the Crown.
- 1861. Birth of J. G. Adderley, son of Sir Charles and Lady Adderley.
- 1868. Pope Pius IX, Syllabus of Errors.
- 1875. J. B. Lightfoot appointed Lady Margaret Professor of Divinity at Cambridge.
- 1878. Church of England Report 'The Rise, Progress and Present Position of Sisterhoods and Deaconess Institutes in the Church of England'. Lambeth Conference considered the question of re-establishment of the Diaconate as a permanent, distinctive or vocational ministry. Cardinal Pecci of Perugia elected Pope, taking name of Leo XIII.
- 1879. Adderley left Eton.

Lightfoot enthroned Bishop of Durham.

- J. Ellice Hopkins, A Plea for the Wider Action of the Church of England in the Prevention of the Degradation of Women.
- J. R. Pretyman, Voluntary versus Legal Relief.

Miss Marshall witnesed erection of new civic buildings in Sunderland.

- 1880. First Durham Diocesan Conference. Formation of the Cambridge Mission to Delhi.
- 1881. Lightfoot presided at Church Congress at Newcastle.
- 1882. Leo XIII, Auspicato Concessum (Sept 17 1882).

 Lightfoot delivered Primary Charge to the Clergy of the Diocese of Durham advocating diaconate for women.

 Adderley graduated with a history degree from Oxford University.
- 1883. Anonynous publication, The Bitter Cry of Outcast London.

 Adderley visited in Bethnal Green.

 Death of Karl Marx.

 Leo XIII 'prudently mitigated' Franciscan Third Order Rule.

 Fabian Society founded.

 Lightfoot preached a Sermon on St. Cuthbert at Chester-le- Street.

 Canon G. Body appointed Canon Missioner of Durham.

 First members of White Cross Army enrolled at Bishop Auckland.

 W. P. Swaby married Helen Matilda Marshall.

Creation of an Independent Anglican Province of the West Indies.

1883. Formation of Durham Diocesan Branch of Purity Society.
J. C. Winslow born at Hanworth, Middlesex.

1884. Leo XIII, Humanum Genus (On Freemasonry).

Fortunata Pietro Luigi Josa appointed Rector of Holy Trinity, Essequibo, Diocese of Guiana.

Dr. Howson at Church Congress at Reading argued case for Ministry of Deaconesses.

Swaby inducted Vicar of St. Mark's Millfield.

Third Reform Act: household franchise was extended to counties.

1885. Redistribution Act: Parliamentary Constituencies were defined.
Houses of Laymen associated with the Convocations of each Province were elected by Diocesan Conferences.
Bishop of Alabama ordered Deaconesses with the laying on of hands. Formation of Indian National Congress in Bombay.
Adderley appointed Warden of Oxford House, Bethnal Green.
Wider use of linotype and monotype printing systems.

1887. Queen Victoria's Jubilee.

Winslow sang at Windsor Castle.

Licensing of first Women Church Workers in the Durham Diocese.

Formation of Women's Branch of Church Army.

Death of Helen Mathilda Marshall.

Adderley was soap box orator in Victoria Park.

Adderley ordained a deacon and appointed curate of St. John's, Bethnal Green.

1888. Lambeth Conference.

Pan-Anglican Conference in Durham attended by bishops, clergy and laity. Lightfoot ill afterwards.

Church Congress at Manchester discussed lay ministry. Canon Body proposed Orders of Virgins and Widows.

Lightfoot presided at Durham Diocesan Conference in Sunderland.
Adderley and Henson imitated St. Francis of Assisi in Bethnal Green.
Adderley appointed Christ Church Missioner.

1889. Adderley at St. Frideswides's Church, Bromley-by-Bow.

The London Dock Strike. Adderley at dock gates with Ben Tillet. Lightfoot returned to his diocese in May.

Formation of the Christian Social Union. Adderley was a London committee member.

Dunlop's pneumatic tyre making for improvements in bicycles.

Canon Body wrote in *The Church Times* about the financial burden of supporting women's church work.

Charles Gore edited Lux Mundi, 'new needs, new points of view, new questions'.

An Appeal Against Women's Suffrage.

[Marshall], A Suggestion for Our Times.

Lightfoot died in December.

1890. B. F. Westcott enthroned Bishop of Durham.

- 1891. First Issue of The Clarion.
- 1891. Miss Marshall and six others became the first members of the League of St. Cuthbert.

[Marshall], Deacons and Deaconesses, and a Proposed Adaptation, in Part, of the Third Order of St. Francis.

- 1892. Keir Hardie elected M. P. for West Ham, South.
- 1893. Swaby consecrated Bishop at Westminster Abbey (March).

Adderley spoke on 4 October about Labour Questions at the Church Congress.

Westcott at Durham Diocesan Conference stated that Theology was the work of Theologians (October).

Swaby having been consecrated Bishop sailed for British Guiana (November).

Paul Sabatier, S. François d'Assise.

Adderley joined the Independent Labour Party and addressed working men.

Adderley advertised for Franciscan friars.

1894. Adderley went to All Hallows, Barking-by-the-Tower, with A. S. Mason.

Miss Marshall visited French Riviera and Assisi.

Miss Marshall met Paul Sabatier.

We cott ordained first Durham Deaconesses with the laying on of hands.

Harcourt budget introduced redistributive taxation.

Adderley, Stephen Remarx.

Paul Sabatier, St. Francis of Assisi, English translation.

Paul Sabatier's S. François d'Assise listed on Index of Forbidden Books.

Adderley and others formed the Society of the Divine Compassion in Plaistow.

Gertrude Bomby and others formed the Society of the Incarnation in Plaistow.

Adderley founded and edited, Goodwill.

Adderley tramped around a number of counties.

Adderley, The Legend of the Way of Grief.

Adderley, The New Floreat.

Adderley, Social Aspects of the Gospel.

- 1895. Narayan Vaman Tilak baptised in Ahmednagar.
- 1896. First issue of The Daily Mail.
 [Marshall], The Dawn Breaking.
 Leo XIII, Apostolicae Curae.
- 1897. Adderley, Paul Mercer.

Adderley left the Society of the Divine Compassion.

Adderley hired the Berkeley Chapel in the West End.

Adderley was a soap box orator at Hyde Park Corner.

[Marshall], Some Thoughts on the Third Order of St. Francis.

Queen Victoria's Diamond Jubilee.

1900. Adderley, Francis, The Little Poor Man of Assisi.

1901. Death of Queen Victoria.

Sabatier finds Third Order Rule at Capistrano. He had the Rule printed in Paris.

Adderley and Marson, Franciscan Third Orders.

Beginning of the future British Society for Franciscan Studies.

Tagore established Ashram at Santiniketan.

Winslow went up to Balliol College, Oxford.

Adderley became Vicar of St. Mark's, Marylebone Road.

1902. Balfour Education Act introducing state-provided secondary education.

Birth of Verrier Elwin.

1903. Adderley edited Critical Sermons.
Adderley, A New Earth.
Death of Leo XIII.

- 1904. C. F. Andrews joined Cambridge Mission and Brotherhood in Delhi. Adderley appointed Vicar of St. Saviour's, Saltley.
 [Miss Marshall], Foundation of Anglican Third Order Magazine.
- 1905. Adderley edited Practical Questions.
 Sundar Singh baptised.
 Andrews in England.
 Winslow visited India.
- 1907. S. E. Stokes and others formed the Brotherhood of the Imitation of Jesus in Punjab.
- 1908. E. J. Palmer, Fellow of Balliol, appointed Bishop of Bombay.
- 1910. Edinburgh World Conference on Mission. V. S. Azariah was a speaker.
- 1912. Andrews, The Renaissance of Hinduism.
 Winslow teaching at St. Augustine's College, Canterbury.
 tokes visited St. Augustine's College.
- 1913. Azariah consecrated first Indian Bishop of Dornakal.
- 1914. Winslow arrived in India, sponsored by the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel.

 War begins in Europe.

 Adderley goes to France.

 Andrews left the Cambridge Mission and Brotherhood in Delhi.
- 1915. Gandhi returned to India and began to form Satyagraha Ashram at Sabaramati.

 Winslow appointed Vice-Principal of High School at Ahmednagar.

 Winslow formed a friendship with N. V. Tilak, an Indian, at ashram

of Marathi Mission.
Death of Miss Marshall.

1917. Winslow studied Bhakti poetry, especially that of Tukaram and Tagore.

N. V. Tilak, another bhakti poet, became Sanyasa at Ahmednagar.

The Russian Revolution.

Winslow visited Bethel Ashram.

1919. Winslow, Liturgy for India.

The Rowlatt Act followed by Satyagraha protests across India.

Siege of Amritsar.

N. V. Tilak died.

The Treaty of Versailles.

The Government of India Act.

Formation of the Church of England Addembly.

Foss Westcott enthroned as Metropolitan of India.

Winslow in Hampshire had a 'vision' of an ashram in India.

First issue of Young India.

G. G. Coulton, Christ, St. Francis and Today.

1920. Winslow, Eucharist in India, presented at Lambeth Conference.
Winslow returned to India to begin his ashram experiment with six Indians.

1921. Gandhi presided over bonfire of foreign cloth in Bombay (July). Gandhi adopted his 'mourning costume' (Sept.).

Visit of Prince of Wales to India.

1922. Tagore established Visabharati University at Shantiniketan. Mahatma Gandhi arrested.

Christa Seva Sangha (Fellowship of St. Barnabas) blessed by Bishop Palmer.

Housman's first Little Plays of St. Francis.

1923. G. K. Chesterton, St. Francis of Assisi.

Christa Seva Sangha moved to Ahmednagar.

Winslow, Narayan Vaman Tilak.

W. S. Robertson appointed S. C. M. Sec. to British Theological Students.

Winslow visited England. Christian Yoga.

1924. Winslow visited Gandhi, fasting for the unity of the Indian People.

Gandhi released from prison.

Elwin graduated from Merton College, Oxford.

Elwin appointed Vice-Principal of Wycliffe Hall.

Winslow, Jagadguru.

E. M. Forster, A Passage to India.

1925. Madeleine Slade joined Gandhi's ashram at Sabarmati.

1926. Celebration of the Seventh Centenary of the death of St. Francis.

Professor Heiler and Nicolas Arseniev visited Oxford.

Sadhu Sundar Singh visited Oxford.

J. C. Winslow visited Oxford.

R. H. Tawney visited Oxford.

Winslow, The Indian Mystic.

A. J. Appasamy, Christianity as Bhakti Marga.

1926. The Church Assembly Report, The Call from India.

The General Strike.

Dame Monica Wills, S. P. G. and others gave Winslow money to build ashram in Poona.

Lord Irwin appointed Viceroy of India.

1927. Indian Statutory Commission set up under chairmanship of Lord Simon.

V. Elwin, W.S. Robertson, O. Fielding Clarke and other Englishmen arrived at Christa Seva Sangha.

Winslow returned to Christa Seva Sangha with Royal, Coles and Huntley.

Elwin and other Englishmen visited Assisi and Kerala, and arrived at C. S. S.

C. S. S. had eight English and eight Indian members.

Indian Church Measure passed by Church Assembly, Parliament and Crown.

1928. The new C. S. S. Ashram building and Students' Hostel opened at Poona.

Elwin visited Sabarmati, was ill, returned to England to recuperate. St. Francis formally adopted as a second patron of C. S. S. Discussion and adoption of Rule and Constitution at C. S. S. Beginning of complex procedure of setting up three Franciscan

Orders.

Bishop Azariah of Cornakal succeeded Bishop Palmer as Visitor of

C. S. S.
Arrival of Simon Commission in India marked by all-India hartal.
Elwin at Oxford studied life of Richard Rolle, an English mystic.
Elwin began to correspond with Sorella Amata of Trevi, Italy.
Elwin became member of the Confraternity of Spiritual Entente.
Elwin met Olive Wyon and Evelyn Underhill, who were also studying

Elwin met Olive Wyon and Evelyn Underhill, who were also studying mysticism.

1929. Winslow visited England.

Elwin was achyra of C. S. S. in his absence.

Elwin actively espoused cause of Indian nationalists.

Winslow returned to C. S. S. in December.

Constitution of the Third Order of C. S. S. revised and membership extended.

Robertson and others became Sadhaks (novices).

Winslow made his profession as a Siddha (professed member).

Christa Seva Sangha Review first published.

Fellowship of the Way was formed in England.

W. Q. Lash appointed curate at St. Mary's, Portsea.

Parliament rejected the Deposited Book ("1928 Prayer Book").

1930. Indian pledge to obtain Purna Swaraj [Complete Independence], (January).

Gandhi and 78 ashram volunteers led walk from Sabarmati to Dandi for salt.

Gandhi arrested and put in Yeravada Prison.

Gandhi named Elwin, 'my son'.

Robertson left India (April).

Winslow visited England.

1930. Meeting in London to form English branch of the Third Order of C. S. S. (October).

Robertson inducted as Vicar of St. Ives, Hunts. (August).

Robertson professed as member of C. S. S. in England (October).

Gandhi at Round Table Conference in Whitehall.

Winslow and Elwin, The Dawn of Indian Freedom.

- 1930. Report of the Simon Commission (May). First Round Table Conference.
- 1931. Gandhi released from prison (Jan).
 Gandhi-Irwin Pact (March).
 Lord Irwin returned to England (April).
 Gandhi, Azariah, Sorella Amata and Andrews advised Elwin.
 Gandhi went to Second Round Table Conference in London (Sept.).
 Elwin edited special St. Francis number of C. S. S. Review.
 Indian leaders advised Elwin to go to territory of the Gond.
 Bishop of Nagpur suggested Karanjia as a suitable place.
 Shamrao Hivale asked to accompany Elwin to Gond territory.
 Second Round Table Conference ended in London (Dec.).
 New Third Order Ashrams established at Aundh and at Malaegon.
 Growth in England from St. Ives, Hunts. and Morden, Surrey.
 W. Q. Lash arrived at C. S. S. Ashram (December).
 Gandhi in prison.
- 1932. Gandhi and Hivale arrived at Bombay. Gandhi consulted Indian leaders and sent telegrams to Viceroy. Gandhi before arrest wrote a note to Elwin and about Elwin. Gandhi put in Yeravda Prison. Elwin and Hivale went to Karanjia. Elwin took The Truth About India to Bombay and met Indian leaders. Elwin had passport difficulties, but sailed for Britain. Elwin received by Irwin and Sankey, but not by Sir Samuel Hoare. Elwin refused a passport to return to India. Ramsay MacDonald announced the Communal Award (17 August). Gandhi fasted unto death in protest against the separate electorates. Gandhi wrote to Elwin. Elwin wrote to Sorella Amata. Yeravda Pact signed and Gandhi concluded fast (26 Sept.). Gandhi made Wardha his new nerve-centre. Elwin visited Assisi, Sorella Amata, Gandhi and Wardha. Elwin asked Bishop of Nagpur not to renew his license. Elwin returned to St. Francis Ashram and Gond Seva Mandal. Elwin and seven Indian Christians at St. Francis Ashram. Workers of different Faiths at Gond Seva Mandal.
- 1933. Gandhi arrested and released (May).
 Gandhi launched weekly, Harijan to replace Young India.
 Gandhi arrested and released (August).
 Gandhi began tour on behalf of Untouchables.
 Elwin and his company begin welfare work, especially among lepers.
 Lack of financial resources for ashram and mandal.
 Elwin, Leaves from the Jungle.
 Elwin, St. Francis of Assisi.

- 1934. Christa Seva Sangha divided.
 - Christa Prema Seva Sangha occupied former C. S. S. building at Pune.
 - C. S. S. in India (now mainly a Third Order and mainly Indians) moved to Aundh.
 - C. P. S. S. also had Third Order members. Winslow left for England.
- 1937. Elwin opened another ashram at Saubrwachlapur. Elwin appointed research associate of Sir D. J. Tate at Bombay.
- 1939. Elwin, The Baiga.
 Outbreak of Second World War.
- 1942. Death of Adderley.

 Elwin's ashram renamed Bhumijan Seva Mandal.

 Quit India Resolution (August).
- 1944. Elwin appointed Anthropologist to Government of Orissa. Elwin awarded Oxford D.Sc.
- 1946. Elwin appointed Deputy Director of Department of Anthropology at Calcutta.
- 1947. India celebrated her Independence.
- 1948. Gandhi shot, 30 January.
- 1949. Elwin, Tribal Art Research Unit.
- 1954. Elwin invited by Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru to become Adviser for Tribal Affairs.
- 1964. Death of Elwin.
- 1978. Death of Winslow.

CHAPTER ONE.

INTRODUCTION.

1. <u>IDENTIFYING A FRANCISCAN PROBLEM</u>.

- (1) The Problem of Past and Present. As David Lowenthal has observed, 'though the past is a topic of almost universal concern, little research focuses on how people in general see, value and understand it'. This thesis is an investigation first, of how people have seen, valued and understood Francis of Assisi since his death in 1226, and second, of how James Adderley, Emily Marshall, John Winslow, and Verrier Elwin came to found embryonic Anglican Franciscan Third Orders in the period 1882-1939. The main argument is that if we would know how men and women come to see, value and understand symbolic religious resources, we must examine the social contexts in which they do so.
- The Basic Facts about Francis of Assisi, 1182-1226. The basic facts about Francis of Assisi which few would dispute are these: Francesco (in English translated Francis) was born in Assisi in 1182, the son of Pietro Bernadone, a cloth merchant. In early manhood, he rejected worldly ambitions to follow Christ. Others followed his example, and when the numbers were sufficient, three Religious Orders were formed with Rules approved by the Pope. Francis and his brothers in due course became known as the First Order, the Order of the Friars Minor, and are commonly named Franciscans. Clare and some other women became known as the Second Order, and are often named Poor Clares. Those who remained in

their own homes and places of work, who were often married and owned property, became known as the Third Order, and are frequently named tertiaries.

Francis left very little personal record of his hopes and intentions.

After his death he was found to have written little more than a poem and some prayers in praise of God, and a few letters.

(3) The Pope's Proclamation: a Saint, an Exemplar of Catholic Values.

Francis's Christian life had, however, made sufficient impact on his generation for the Pope to canonise him less than two years later. By giving him the title, Saint, the Pope elevated Francis Bernardone to be 'a person, now dead, whom the Church allows to be publicly venerated'. By canonising Francis the Pope proclaimed that the values and virtues displayed in Francis's life were those of the Church which honoured him.

Using the already existing methods of what may conveniently be described as the Saint System, Catholics narrated those events in St. Francis's life which were the cause of this veneration to ensure their continuing prominence. They allocated time, celebrated topographies, occupied space, authorised texts, appropriated artefacts, and structured organisations to make information about St. Francis available and visible.

St. Francis, in sociological language, was presented to the Catholic public as a specific resource. Catholics used 'the means of supplying what is needed' to accumulate 'available assets' and construct 'a stock that can be drawn on', to foster veneration of St. Francis. This stock of assets from which information about St. Francis could be drawn will in this thesis be called Franciscan resources.

These Franciscan resources were intended to convey the values, the 'worth, desirability and utility', which the Catholic Church ascribed to her Saints. Catholics were encouraged to venerate St. Francis because, as a

heroic follower of the Faith of Christ, he was an exemplary member of the Catholic Church, an agent of miracles, an intercessor in heaven, an evangelist, and a founder of religious orders. St. Francis was presented as of worth, desirability and utility because these attributes were highly valued by the Catholic Church.

Despite the vicissitudes of its history, the Catholic Church maintained this evaluation of St. Francis, but the interest of her members in St. Francis had reached a low ebb by the mid-nineteenth century.

(4) A Franciscan Revival, 1882-1926. In the period, 1882-1926, however, there was a quite remarkable revival of devotion to St. Francis, set between celebrations of the seventh centenaries of his birth and death. Since this was a period often described broadly as a period of decline in religious devotion, the Roman Catholic Franciscan revival poses a problem for a sociologist to explain.

An even greater problem arises from the rediscovery of St. Francis by those outside the Roman Catholic Church. The 'others' also renewed interest in St. Francis in the period from 1882 to 1926. In 1882, it would have been very difficult for an English reader, who was not an educated Roman Catholic, to find texts about St. Francis. By 1926, there was an abundant choice of reading matter for coming to see, value and understand him.

This rising wave of writings reached a high point in October of that year when the mass media were flooded with articles about St. Francis and Franciscans. The 'others' outside the Roman Catholic Church as well as those within it had a great deal to say about St. Francis at the seventh centenary of his death. What they had to say epitomised how far the once neatly dove-tailed values which were conveyed in the Roman Catholic Franciscan resources had become splintered in English society. The term

Franciscan values in this thesis is used to describe any of the values which people found in St. Francis.

(5) The Mass Media at the High Point of the Franciscan Revival in 1926 Illustrate a Sociological Problem. It will be useful to illustrate the problem of the many-faced public representations of St. Francis by pausing to examine the situation in 1926 at the zenith of this wave of Franciscan revival.

Of St. Francis's worth, desirability and utility, there was surprising agreement among the Catholics and 'the others'. The Quarterly Review proclaimed the effect of changed attitudes to St. Francis. 'We are all Franciscans now; whatever the texture of our personal religion may be'. Francis was 'more than a Churchman, more than a Saint'. A leading article in The Times agreed. The Roman Catholic Church in her celebration of the Saint's centenary:

Will have with her the sympathy of many thousands who are not of her Communion, and of not a few who have little or no dogmatic belief.

In 1926, similar sentiments were expressed by a number of writers. Some were puzzled by the phenomenon and sought to define it. John Dobson, a Congregationalist, discerned 'a neo-Franciscan cult'. Father Bampton, a Jesuit, was amazed by 'these remarkable people' who had 'taken up' St. Francis and 'made him the object of a sort of fashionable cult':

Claiming as one of themselves a man whose religious standpoint was in flat contradiction to their own.

Father Cuthbert, a Roman Catholic Franciscan friar and biographer of St. Francis, wrote in *The Dublin Review* of 'what has been termed "the Franciscan cult" observing that St. Francis seemed to be having an influence 'even on those who do not profess obedience to the Catholic Church'. 11

What these writers termed a 'neo-Franciscan', 'fashionable' or 'Franciscan cult' was most evident in newspapers and journals. Their pages and columns about St. Francis had the traits of both a journalist's 'scoop' and recondite research. What is more, the two were not always separated, for the learned were called upon to make their 'expert' statements to the public through the agency of newspapers.

Numerous features of the Catholic assets and stocks built up over the centuries to convey the worth of St. Francis were news features. The Times, making use of new print technologies, reproduced a picture of the current press hero copied from of an Italian fresco. It was described by an expert in Fine Art. The next day, another, who had studied the medieval Franciscan texts, wrote to the editor quoting the Latin of twelve lines of Thomas of Celano's Legenda to inform readers that the fresco was an inaccurate later representation of the Saint.

Public argument was not confined to polite disagreement about St. Francis's facial features. The wounds which Roman Catholics claimed St. Francis had received as a mark of his devotion to Christ became newsworthy. Bishop Barnes of Birmingham, renowned for his modernist theology, in an article, "The Unwashed Saint", printed in *The Daily Express*, suggested that Francis had not washed properly. His bleeding wounds were because he scratched himself due to an irritation on the skin from his woollen garment.

Father Bampton asked by what process of research the Bishop 'came by this curious piece of recondite historical lore' and reminded his readers:

Chroniclers of the lives of great men, saintly or otherwise, do not generally intrude upon the privacy of their dressing room or their bathroom. Nor is it usually considered to be matter of good breeding in this country, at least, to make such public reference to such matters.

The following week, The Church Times, a paper written for members

of the Church of England, reported a meeting held at Church House in Westminster. Walter Seton, Secretary of the British Society of Franciscan Studies, 'amid loud applause' had been able 'to deal very faithfully' with the problem, casting grave doubts on the accuracy of the Bishop's contention that Francis did not use linen garments.

The narratives of Celano contain several references to his undergarments, and it seems to be quite probable that they were not woollen What we certainly know is that after his stigmatisation he rarely washed his feet and that he generally washed only his fingers, not his whole hands.

The Newcastle Chronicle kept the North East informed. Its leading article suggested:

The stigmata were as natural to Francis as breathing and thinking. It is the absence of them which would need explaining.

Other mass-media marketed for the reading public promoted related themes. St. Francis's rapport with animals, for instance, was linked with a number of current issues, including the protection of birds and a coal strike in North East England. The New Statesman: A Weekly Review of Politics and Literature asserted:

Clearly St. Francis was before his time in advocating a Wild Bird's Protection Act. 13

The Newcastle Journal drew inspiration from one of the stories in The Little Flowers of St. Francis contrasting the current failure to reconcile the parties in a coal strike with St. Francis's success in reconciling a wolf and the people of Gubbio. Readers were told that his 'remedy in perplexity was to throw himself into the breach':

Perhaps we await only a St. Francis now to show us the divinely simple way out of the wolf-and-the-people-of-Gubbio-difficulty.

There was so much else in the papers about St. Francis's relationship with the natural world that *Punch* carried a cartoon which apparently needed no explanation. 'A Footlight's Favourite' was being interviewed in

her dressing room:

And you'll put in a bit about how I adore the country and pigs and ducks and those sorts of things?

The journalist interrupted, 'I wrote all that part before I came'. 17

It was little wonder that Pope Pius XI drew the attention of his 'Venerable Brethren' to those who were seeing, valuing and understanding St. Francis 'according to their own caprice' rather than 'by the will of the Roman Pontiffs, canonically elected'. The Pontiff reminded them:

The herald of the great king did not come to make men doting lovers of flowers, birds, lambs, fishes and hares, but lovers of the Cross of Jesus.

This comment by Pius XI found support in some British publications.

Appreciation à la Mode emphasised this point:

A lady in the latest gown
Speaks to me thus in London Town:
"Of all the saints that really were,
I almost think that I prefer
Francesco of Assisi. He
seems absolutely sweet to me".
Then to her looking glass she goes
and puts fresh powder on her nose.

Other people took a much more serious approach to the Saint's worth, desirability and utility. The Dean of Durham made a thoughtful attempt to redress this alleged imbalance of popular opinion. In an article, "Real Values of Life: In the Footsteps of St. Francis", printed in *The Daily Telegraph*, he drew attention to St. Francis's compassion for the poor. Other suggested that the Saint could be more worthily honoured by some organisation devoted to the task of expressing this compassion in the modern world. Other people agreed with him and drew attention to St. Francis's personal and social virtues.

The Church Union Gazette, an organ of the Anglo Catholic wing of the Church of England, suggested that the time had come to restore St. Francis to the Church of England Calendar; but other people resisted attempts to make him an ecclesiastical figure.

Lawrence Housman wrote for *Theology* about 'Francis, the man', ²¹ as part of this attempt to free him from an ecclesiocentric cage. Following the 'human' theme, Housman's amusing plays about St. Francis were performed in a number of halls; for instance, at St. Hilary in Cornwall, named after a Cornish Saint, and at Armstrong College, named after an engineer, in Newcastle.

The Times Literary Supplement suggested St. Francis had become:

A vehicle of a somewhat marrowless ideal, presiding over a life flavoured with pious diminutives, a life that buoys itself on a weak belief that because a simpleton may be a saint there is a saintliness in being silly.22

While this deluge of Francis-inspired writing was inundating the media, many books about St. Francis were published. Visitors to England, such as Nicholas Arseniev from Russia, offered fresh interpretations of a Roman Catholic Saint in lectures at the universities. English scholars also delivered lectures, and drew the attention of the public to the British stock of scarce and valuable medieval Franciscan manuscripts. The British Museum arranged an exhibition in the centrally-placed Grenville Room on the ground floor. Displayed in glass cases, each manuscript had a descriptive label saying exactly how old it was and from where it had come. If

In summary, many Saints had achieved almost total obscurity by 1926, while St. Francis achieved a new pinnacle of fame. That such a torrent of English words and interest should spring from a thirteenth-century Italian invites some questions. Was this fame because of his own qualities? Was it due to the genius of those who had interpreted him? Was the condition of England at this time ideal for the germination of such interest?

The opportunities for enquiring into this interplay of values and contexts are too vast for a single study.

2. A SPIRAL OF FRANCISCAN RESOURCES.

(1) The Production of Franciscan Texts: Three Approaches to a Problem.

Enough has been said to show that there was a market for such work, but this does not explain why there was a market, or why the authors chose to exploit it. Was the market deliberately fostered, or did writers respond to a demand? Who constructed it? Did the content of the texts stimulate demand by making powerful and relevant comments about English society? Were these texts made available to a wide range of people, or were they confined to the highly-educated members of the middle and upper classes?

These are questions arising from the production of resources which have not been addressed in detail in this thesis. The questions, however, have been used to inform the general review of Franciscan resources in the following chapter. Introductory comments and considerations about the construction, content and distribution of the textual Franciscan resources are set out in the following sub-sections.

(a) Examining the Construction of Texts. One approach to the questions arising from the production of resources could be to study changes in the types of people involved in the construction of the Franciscan texts. A process of secularisation could be traced using specific examples. soon after canonisation, Catholics had authorised an account of St. Francis's life which became a sacred and authoritative text. Luther's claim that some of the Catholic Franciscan texts were 'gross fictions', 'incredible', and 'pestilent abominations' which made 'Christ our Lord, a figure and image of Francis, is might be taken as a convenient

starting-point in the secularisation process. Catholic monopoly of the interpretation of the sacred had been challenged. The process by which the authority of a sacred text was weakened was continued in the Age of Enlightenment. Catholics themselves examined the original Latin and Italian texts and edited their more extreme claims, knowing that what they wrote in commentary could be quoted against them. The secularisation process reached a third stage in 1893 when Paul Sabatier, a Calvinist modernist, informed Europe that Roman Catholics had 'arbitrarily confiscated' an original and unique man who was representative of all that was highest and best in all humanity. His thesis generalised St. Francis's significance. Since Vie de S. François d'Assise was translated into almost every European language, its publication could be termed a major stage in the process of secularisation. A fourth stage was reached when members of 'nonconformist' and 'deviant' religious groups offered minority and idiosyncratic definitions of St. Francis. People reading their individual newspapers at home, in a tram or a club, could be viewed as constituting an almost complete separation of St. Francis from the corporate community which had canonised him.

(b) Examining the Content of Texts. A second approach to the questions arising from the production of Franciscan resources could be a careful scrutiny of the content of texts. Since the period from 1850 to 1926 in which the number of Franciscan texts increased was the period of the classical theorists, their problematics could be tested against the evidence of their times. Does the content of the texts suggest that the renewed public presence of St. Francis, exemplified in the existence of the texts, was a reflection of, or a reaction to, industrialism, capitalism, socialism, liberalism, urbanism, rationalism, romanticism, intellectualism, pluralism, nationalism? Was it related to the ascendancy of science, technology and

bureaucracy? Was it connected with the inherent social tensions between church-based, sectarian and mystical forms of religion? Did it have anything to say about the dwindling of one kind of community and its replacement by another? Was the content designed to stir the poor or the rich, the powerful or the powerless, in the promotion of social movements, and if so, which movements? Would the content give meaning and enchantment to individuals? Was Franciscan literature constructed to be all of these things, some of them, or none of them?

Examining the Distribution of Texts. (c) A third approach to the questions arising from the processes of production could be an examination of the changes in the distribution of Franciscan texts. This could be turned into an exploration of the processes of social differentiation. The early Franciscan texts had almost all been written by Catholic clerics to be read by Catholic clerics. The period, 1882-1926, saw the growth of the professions and universities, the emergence of the 'intellectual', and the development of entrepreneurial publishing houses. Various compartments or pockets of British social life could be examined, including those of the ruling and working classes, to see in which pockets it was possible to find writings which could be broadly labelled Franciscan texts. Hypotheses could be tested. A first might be that the people listed in apparently separated elites who had access to Franciscan texts were in reality connected through their families and public school education. A that the fragmentation of the Franciscan resources into different subject areas had the effect of enhancing their visibility and availability. Giotto's frescos of St. Francis, inseparable from their walls, for example, could perhaps be seen, valued and understood by more people in a more informed way after technological inventions had made it possible to print plates. Texts were no longer just words.

For this investigation, it could be useful first, to categorise the British Pre-Reformation Franciscan texts according to their custodians: the Vatican, the Master of the Rolls, the Public Record Office, Lambeth Palace, Dean and Chapter libraries, the British Museum, the Oxford and Cambridge colleges, individual antiquarians, private owners and collectors, for example. The processes by which 'men-of-letters', theologians, antiquarians, archaeologists, linguists, philologists, palaeographers, and historians came to study these Franciscan texts could be examined. This might then be followed by an examination of the distribution of their findings in journals distributed to members of printing societies, such as the Early English Text Society or the Middlesex Archaeological Society. The question could then be asked: which commercial publishers thought which medieval Franciscan texts worthy of translation and printing for general distribution to the reading public?

The distribution of the medieval Franciscan texts could then be compared with the distribution of the 'new' texts printed for the first time in the period 1882-1926. What difference did it make if distribution was sponsored by publishers and authors seeking to make money from their texts? What about the distribution of one-day 'best-sellers'? How can thousands of words read one day, and probably discarded the next, be compared with a leather-bound 'world classic' passed from father to daughter?

(2) <u>Defining a Resource-Spiral: A Sociological Problem of Production and Consumption</u>. The *production of Franciscan resources*, that is the processes by which Franciscan resources were constructed, given value-content, and distributed, is the starting point of this thesis.

However, to study the construction, content and distribution of printed literature without also examining the consumption of what was

produced is to look at only one element of a resource-spiral. What happens after written words achieve independent identity is as interesting as the processes which led to their production. 28

My main purpose in this thesis is to study the processes of consumption which may, or may not, lead to the production of more resources.

(3) The Consumption of Franciscan Texts: The Problems of Access, Comprehension and Interaction. When attention is turned to the consumption of resources the sociological problem changes. Examining texts in this way we must ask a quite different set of questions.

How do people come to have access to texts? In what social contexts do men, women and children read (or ignore) them? Do they own what they read? Or do they read texts which are the property of other persons or organisations?

How do they comprehend what they read? Do they scan the texts once or peruse them on numerous occasions? With what expectations do they approach their reading? How do they interpret what they read? Are they equipped to assess the texts using critical methods or not? If so, what kind of criticism?

What effects does this reading have, if any, on their subsequent interaction with other people? It may be, as we have seen, that they produce more words to be printed: but is that all that happens?

Are there other social paths to be traced away from the resourcespiral into different areas of social life? These are the problems of access, comprehension and social interaction.

(4) <u>Identifying the Range of Franciscan Resources Available for Consumption</u>. To study how people have found St. Francis to be of

desirability, worth, and utility is, however, a very much more complex matter than examining how they read Franciscan texts. Certainly, the invention of linotype and monotype printing systems in the period 1882-1926 made the mass-production of writings cheaper and quicker; and the increased availability of education enabled more people to acquire reading skills. Yet print was only one of several categories of resource available for acquiring values from a person of the past. This was especially so of St. Francis.

People use material resources in other ways besides the production of texts to propagate and acquire values. Topographies and landscapes, buildings and paintings, statues and other artefacts are carriers of values. People themselves can be resources. Worshippers taking part in rituals and ceremonies, friars in their habits and pilgrims at their devotions, tourists and critics are also Franciscan resources.

Further, no person has access to resources without some kind of interaction with other people, however remote. No investigation would be complete which failed to take account of how people might converse about St. Francis or make mention of him in letters.

- 3. INVESTIGATING SOME ASPECTS OF THE CONSUMPTION OF FRANCISCAN RESOURCES: FOUR FOUNDERS OF ANGLICAN FRANCISCAN THIRD ORDERS, 1882-1939.
- (1) The Sample of Four Founders. The major part of this thesis is an account of how James Adderley, Emily Marshall, John Winslow, and Verrier Elwin came to have access to Franciscan resources and to form values from them. They were not founders of great institutions. I use the term founder to indicate one who laid the foundations on which other people built. They should perhaps be more accurately called 'remote' or 'would-be' founders of some kind of Anglican Franciscan Third Order. The

organisations for which they laid foundations do not exist in the same form today. Each was, however, the founder of an embryonic organisation which became a contributory strand to an organisation which today has members dispersed in most Provinces of the Anglican Communion, The Third Order of the Society of St. Francis.

Four is a very small sample, and even if those who interacted with them were to be included, I cannot claim these people were in any way typical of any population group. James Adderley, Emily Marshall, John Winslow and Verrier Elwin could, however, be a complete sample of Church of England founders of Anglican Franciscan Third Orders since the Protestant Reformation. For that reason they are of historical and sociological interest. As we shall see, they each drew on resources pertaining to the same religious figure in attempting to form quite different organisations with the same name in different social contexts

(2) Interrogating the Founders. Presently, I shall describe how I came to be able to collect and analyse data from which I could reconstruct the ways in which four people, James Adderley, Emily Marshall, John Winslow, and Verrier Elwin, formed some kind of embryonic Anglican Franciscan Third Order. As the data was being collected, and as I began to realise that I was interested in the selective evaluation and use to which the full range of Franciscan resources may have been put, I acquired the habit of constantly addressing questions to these four people.

For example, I asked: How did you come to have access to Franciscan resources? To which particular Franciscan resources did you give most attention? Did you visit Assisi, look at paintings, or meet Roman Catholic Franciscans? Was it easy or hard for you to find information, especially about Franciscan Third Orders? What was there in your social situation which might have motivated your interest in St. Francis? What values, if

any, did you derive from your situations? How did you link the values you acquired from St. Francis with those you acquired from other sources? With whom, if anyone, did you seek to share these values? What happened next? Such questions were put to each of the four founders many times, as one event in their lives led to the next, and as I found out more about their interaction with the Franciscan resources and other people in their social contexts.

(3) Investigating Social Contexts. By context I mean both what 'surrounds' and what 'precedes' the founders in their social settings. 29 As we shall see, sometimes the social context that surrounded and preceded the founders social situation had been institutionalised for centuries: sometimes it was what happened a few minutes ago. Sometimes something that happened hundreds, even thousands of miles away prompted the founder to act: sometimes what the founder did next was prompted by the last conversation in the same room. On some occasions, a crucial preceding context which motivated a founder was known to numerous people: at other times the context was very private and personal to the individual. Sometimes the social context could remain an inner inspiration to the founder; sometimes it could lead to direct actions in political and other public arenas. Social context in this thesis means anything that is perceived to exist or to have existed.

Social contexts were as important for the founders in the formation of their values and their organisations as the resources from which they took their evaluations of St. Francis and Franciscan Orders. Indeed, this was so much the case that my main argument is: if we wish to understand how people utilise a religious resource we should examine how they utilise their contexts.

4. THE RESEARCH PROCESS.

I need briefly to explain how I came to know of the four founders, how my research-role might have influenced my work, how I have collected data and how I have analysed it.

Quinlan Lash, whom I had known for many years, I learnt of archive material deposited on behalf of the Society of St. Francis at the Department of Modern Manuscripts in the Bodleian Library, Oxford, and at Hilfield Friary in Dorset. He had begun sorting boxes full of papers collected in India and England which he invited me to inspect. Before long, I was as fascinated as he by their jumbled contents which, among other matters, dealt with a large part of the history of the revival of the Franciscan Religious Life in the Anglican Communion. It was Bishop Lash who initially secured permission for me to use these archives. He also first directed me in the 1980s to a number of other people, who were also then in their seventies or eighties, who could tell me about the 1930s.

In this thesis, I have used very little of this archive material which I first studied, and not a great deal of the oral history which I collected. Afterwards, I found data in other archives in the Bodleian Library and elsewhere which led me both to an earlier period and to Franciscan Third Order organisations scarcely mentioned in the main archives.

The Society of St. Francis, to whose history the archives in Oxford and Dorset primarily relate, was formally constituted in 1937. The natural historical marker of 1939 has been selected for the close of the period considered in this thesis. There is therefore an overlap of only two years between the close of this study and the date of the formal foundation of the Society of St. Francis. I explain the processes of transition to an existing organisation, but take the study no further.

(2) <u>Historical-Outsider and Contemporary-Insider</u>. I am a member of the Third Order of the Society of St. Francis. A minor interest of this thesis for students of methodology could be that it offers another permutation of the insider-outsider role: a present insider, but an outsider to the lives of people who had died before I had even heard of their birth. No one instructed me concerning their contribution to the existing Third Order organisation because their efforts have not hitherto been more than very briefly considered.

Whether this insider role has influenced my research more than the fact that I was born a woman, that I was brought up on the Celtic fringes, that my teenage rebellion in the 1950s was to read a sociology degree, that I began my married life in Bethnal Green, that I have political convictions, and that I find pleasure in landscape, art and literature (all before I joined the Order), is for other people to judge. I have tried to be objective, but for my part, I agree with those sociologists who believe that students are not likely to be able successfully to avoid or to disclaim their contextual limitations and bias.

(3) The Second Stage of Data Collection. Access to most of the material used in this thesis I have negotiated for myself. It has been collected from archives in a range of places: among them, the India Office, the School of African and Oriental Studies, the Dean and Chapter Library in Durham, the National Gandhi Museum, Smarak Sang Sangrahalaya and a number of Local Studies Centres. Deposit libraries, especially the British Library, hold some pamphlets which do not seem to be available elsewhere. In addition, numerous individuals have offered me letters, family records, old photographs, newspapers, address lists, duplicated and typed sheets, magazines and the kind of material that is often discarded or not readily available.

Emily Marshall, James Adderley, John Winslow and Verrier Elwin all left some hand-written materials as well as pamphlets and leaflets printed for distribution. James Adderley's 'penny-a-line effusions' and Emily Marshall's pamphlets designed to be posted were of crucial importance for interpreting their actions. The three male founders also wrote longer texts published by commercial publishers for wider distribution, including those which can be loosely described as autobiographies.

Those with whom these four founders interacted have sometimes also left records of the same events or mentioned these founders in their autobiographies, which have assisted my interpretations. In addition, numerous studies which other people have made of various aspects of the social life of this period have informed my analyses.

Where possible, I have tried to 'collect' the Franciscan data in the form in which it was available to these four people; for example, finding the actual text in the exact edition when known, and examining the Umbrian topography as it was in their period from photographs. I have also made visits to most of the places in which the founders were (with the exception of the Indian locations) and tried to view the streets and houses and the people in them as they viewed them. This was particularly instructive and enjoyable in the North East, as with the assistance of local antiquarians and historians, a local woman was unearthed of whom they had not heard. An anonymous author of a lost text, A Suggestion for Our Times, Emily Marshall, was finally identified at the Mormon centre for genealogical research in Sunderland.

My aim has been to be very concrete, but unfortunately the evidence is incomplete because there are few records of one of the main forms of human interaction: conversation. (4) Analysis of the Data (i) Using Variables (ii) Testing the Plausibility of Hypotheses. In the course of the research, the data have been analysed in a number of different ways. I have, for example, used ideal types, selected different sets of variables for charts, and tested the plausibility of different explanatory hypotheses.

Ideal types were not at all satisfactory because I had too many models with which to deal. The variables analysis of both the Franciscan resources and the social context resources assisted in refining questions as I slowly learned what to look for. Making categories of Franciscan resources in terms of time, topographies, texts, occupancy of space, artefacts and formal organisations has become one of the organising principles of the thesis.

Explanatory hypotheses were turned into questions to test their plausibility. Were the founders influenced by their upbringing? Were there signs of social strain in their local situations? Were there concurrent changes taking place in the Anglican Communion and other religious bodies? Were major changes in global systems affecting their actions? To what extent were the organisations shaped by the technology available? Were they utilising St. Francis to achieve a sense of identity? Were they seeking Franciscan Third Orders as a return to a Golden Age, a nostalgia for a vanished world? Were they using St. Francis as a form of legitimation for their actions? Were they using him to manipulate other people? Was everything they did rational? Was their primary motivation the establishment of their organisation?

All these questions had some relevance in the course of the emergence of these organisations. All were unsatisfactory as single-factor explanations, not least because the contexts were constantly changing ones.

5. THE PRESENTATION OF RESEARCH RESULTS.

I am presenting my research describing how James Adderley, Emily Marshall, John Winslow and Verrier Elwin came to form embryonic Anglican Franciscan Third Orders in four chapters. Each is a situational study, a life-history, and a narrative with a theoretical plot.

- (1) <u>Situational Studies</u>. By using the term, situational study, I mean that factors of relevance in a situation have been included which had I worked primarily with variables could only have been included at a high level of abstraction. The thesis, for example, depicts the 'human faces' of Bishops of the Anglican Communion, representatives of the British 'Raj' and other social groups as they were experienced by the founders. Describing situations has allowed me to provide descriptive detail, for instance, of short notes written by one person for another.
- (2) <u>Life-histories</u>. By using the term, life history, I mean that material relevant to the founder's lives has been collected from as many sources as possible. A collector of life-histories does not, however, claim to have collected everything there is to know, and does not necessarily even study an entire life. What are offered here are 'topical life-histories' sections of lives which relate to the topic in hand. The advantage of a life-history method is that it makes the role of social actors plain.
- (3) Narratives. By using the term, narrative, I mean 'the organisation of material in a chronologically sequential order, and the focusing of content into a single coherent story, albeit with subplots'. In Peter Abell's words, I 'would seek to explain the occurrence of a particular event (a social outcome) in terms of those actions which, in context, brought it about'. As Lawrence Stone, Peter Abell, Paul Roth, Daniel Bertaux and other advocates of the modern narrative method insist, narratives are not just any sort of 'story'. They are stories written in a theoretically

structured way, and in which human action provides the moving force which procures the social outcomes which are of analytical interest.

One furnishes a narrative which purports not only to describe the actions themselves and their connectivity but also to explain what is realised or happens in the social world'.

(4) <u>Theoretical plots</u>. By using the term, theoretical plots, I mean that the narratives have a theoretical content. The main plots explain how it came to be that four people in different social contexts took values from a religious resource in the process of 'founding' organisations. The 'subplots' demonstrate the inadequacy of single-factor explanations of their social actions. These will be discussed in the final chapter.

6. SUMMARY OF THE REMAINING CHAPTERS.

Readers may find it useful to have a brief introduction to the remaining chapters of the thesis. This introductory chapter is followed by two parts and a concluding chapter.

<u>Part One</u> is a single chapter describing the construction, content and distribution of Franciscan resources.

Part Two consists of four chapters which trace the life histories of James Adderley, Emily Marshall, John Winslow, and Verrier Elwin. Each narrative has two parts; the first traces events before these people developed any idea that they would be founders of a Franciscan Third Order: the second traces how some kind of embryonic Franciscan Third Order organisation was formed.

Chapter Two: The Construction of Franciscan Resources and Values,

This chapter also has two parts. The first part begins by recounting how Catholics, mainly in Italy, first constructed the cultus of St. Francis within the framework of an already established Saint-system. The abundant thirteenth and fourteenth-century Italian resources were an

important feature of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century revival of interest in St. Francis. The second section sketches how and why England came to have Franciscan resources and then to lose most of them at the time of the English Protestant Reformation. The consequent dearth of English Franciscan resources was a second important feature of the 1882-1939 revival in England. The third section turns away from England and focuses briefly on the Spanish and other Roman Catholic Empires after This period was important in the later revival the Catholic Reformation. because it marked a second 'golden age', especially for the Franciscan The fourth section considers the modification of the Franciscan friars. resources in the period of European Enlightenment and Rationalism. final section of the first part is a brief account of the actions of Pope Pius IX and their effects.

The second part of the chapter traces the revival of devotion to St. Francis among Roman Catholics and the recovery of interest in him among the 'others' in the period 1882-1926. The propositions which Roman Catholics and the 'others' contributed to a 'great debate' about St. Francis in public domains from 1882 to 1926 will be outlined.

As has already been explained in notes, I use the term Roman Catholic to describe those people who, after the Protestant Reformation, were in communion with the See of Rome; and the term 'others' to describe those who were not Roman Catholics. This latter device has been adopted to avoid the problem of having constantly to hyphenate selections from Protestant, secular, liberal, modernist, lay, intellectual, professional.

Chapter Three: The Social Dramas of James Granville Adderley.

This narrative is a study of the fifth son of the first Lord Norton. An unsubstantiated claim was made in 1919 that Adderley was the best-known clergyman in the Church of England, 33 and since his death in 1942 his

name has been listed in a number of historical studies. He was a founder of 'the drama' at Oxford University, the first full-time warden of Oxford House (a university settlement in Bethnal Green), a writer of numerous tracts and stories, a prodigious letter-writer, a leading Christian Socialist, a member of the Independent Labour Party, and in 1894 a founder of the Society of the Divine Compassion, a religious community for men - and this is only a list of his most frequently recorded actions.

T. P. Stevens, Adderley's only biographer, wrote that he 'took for his pattern St. Francis of Assisi', but Stevens made no attempt to explain that statement. Barrie Williams recognised Adderley's influence on the Anglican Franciscan revival by naming a section of his study, 'The Age of Adderley', but Williams, like Anson, Allchin, Moorman and other students of Anglican religious orders, concentrated his attention on the formation of the Society of Divine Compassion. Few have taken much notice of what Adderley did before he joined it or after he left it. In my narrative, Adderley's forming and leaving this Society are set in a longer sequence, embracing several other contexts.

All who have written of Adderley agree that he was 'a character', a mercurial personality, a natural clown, a gifted actor, and a man of humour. More than one comment has been made to the effect that he never stayed long in any one place. It has been stated or implied that this was because he lacked staying power and consistency in following up his ideas. In my view, as I shall argue, this has been a wrong assessment.

The narrative closes in 1926 after which Adderley gracefully withdrew from being a public interpreter of Franciscan values. A final section summarises subsequent events until his death in 1942.

Chapter Four: The Suggestion of Emily Esther Marshall. This is a study of an unmarried woman who lived for most of her life in Sunderland

and Darlington, in the Anglican diocese of Durham in North East England. Previously, Miss Marshall, the second founder, has been 'hidden from history'. She has been mentioned in only a sentence of Barrie William's study of the Anglican Franciscan Revival. In a chapter headed with the name of Luigi Josa, Miss Marshall was wrongly described as 'Mrs. Skeffington', the name of the printers who published her 'Third Order Book'. 36

Miss Marshall was a contemporary of Adderley, but a major difference in their social situation in 1889, when she made her Suggestion for Our Times to Bishop Lightfoot of Durham, was that she was an untitled single woman of almost sixty, and he was a young recently-ordained aristocrat.

The first part of this narrative relates how in the period 1879-89, Miss Marshall observed events in three parishes in Sunderland, in the diocese of Durham, and in the Anglican Communion. This prompted her to suggest to Lightfoot that he should take further steps to prepare the way for women to be deacons. Shortly before his death in late 1889, according to Miss Marshall, Lightfoot suggested to her that the Anglican Communion also needed a Franciscan Third Order.

The second part of the chapter details how after Lightfoot's death, Miss Marshall searched for information about St. Francis and the Franciscan Third Order. She added the values drawn from them to her previous values and an organisation emerged which she and other people saw as both an embryonic diaconate and an embryonic Franciscan Third Order. There is more evidence of the effect of her actions than of Adderley's. The Anglican Third Order which Miss Marshall founded spread into a number of Provinces of the Anglican Communion. It had prolific growth in the West Indies.

In 1901, Miss Marshall gave up her central role in the formation of

the Order, having established an Inter-Provincial Council. A final section outlines the history of the Order until her death in 1915, and then up to 1939.

Chapter Five: The Ashram Experiment of John Copley Winslow. John Winslow (often called Jack), the third founder, is best known as a hymn writer and as one of 'the three musketeers' at the start of the Lee Abbey Fellowship, an organisation that still has its centre in South Devon. latter period of his life-history is not recounted, except in the final section tracing 'subsequent events'. The period mainly covered is from 1915 to 1934. Winslow has described this period himself in three books, and a Philipos Thomas, Andrew Webb, Helen number of printed news-letters. Ralston, Barrie Williams and some others have written brief chapters and articles about the formation of Christa Seva Sangha, an ashram which Winslow was instrumental in forming in West India.³⁷ In 1987, Sister Barbara Noreen, C.S.M.V., completed a comprehensive study of the Sangha, printed for limited circulation, which she has kindly allowed me to consult. Only Sister Barbara Noreen has given much attention to the emergence of a Franciscan Third Order from the ashram. Probably because Winslow did not remain a member of Anglican organisations which were specifically Franciscan, and because Christa Seva Sangha has been studied as one of the pioneering ashrams in India, the degree to which Franciscan values influenced Winslow's ashram experiment has, I believe, been underestimated in all the printed accounts.

The first part of this narrative describes the values and social contexts which influenced Winslow's decision to become a missionary, and traces his first years in India during which he acquired his blend of Indian and Franciscan values. It closes by explaining how Winslow matched Franciscan values with other values in the world context of 1919 and

returned to India to form Christa Seva Sangha.

The second part begins in 1926, the year of the seventh centenary of St. Francis, and traces how Englishmen joined the Indian members of Christa Seva Sangha. One of them especially, W. S. Robertson, was strongly motivated by a set of Franciscan values which differed in some respects from Winslow's, and, largely because of Robertson's influence, the Sangha was reorganised. Franciscan models drawn from the Western Church were merged with models which Winslow had previously drawn from India. The narrative closes in 1934, when Winslow returned to England. The final sections trace events in England and India until 1939, and then very briefly to Winslow's death in 1979.

Chapter Six: The Franciscan-Gandhian Venture of Verrier Elwin.

Verrier Elwin, the fourth founder, is known in the West as a distinguished, but unconventional anthropologist who studied Indian tribes. In India, he is honoured as a disciple of Gandhi and as the adviser to Nehru on tribal affairs. He was a prolific writer and there is an abundance of both printed and manuscript material for reconstructing his life-history. Others, mainly anthropologists, have written about Elwin. Misra, who has written the longest and fullest assessment of Elwin, recognised Elwin's Franciscan motivation only in a footnote. Careful study of his early life and access to letters has shown that Franciscan values were far more important to Elwin than this position indicates.

The first part of the narrative focuses on earlier stages of Elwin's life. It traces first why Elwin in 1926 left Oxford University to join Christa Seva Sangha in India. While there, he visited Gandhi's ashram. Two years later, influenced by Gandhi and other Indian nationalists, he left Christa Seva Sangha to form a St. Francis ashram, a Third Order settlement, in the jungle. He was guided by Gandhi and a Roman Catholic

Sister at a Franciscan convent in Trevi, not far from Assisi.

The second part traces how Elwin attempted to merge Franciscan and Gandhian values while living among the Gond and other tribes, but still influenced by rapidly changing political contexts. Deprived of other sources of income, Elwin transmuted his Franciscan values into a study of Indian tribes publishing the results of this study in order to have an income. This was the beginning of his career as an anthropologist. A final section records Elwin's adoption of Indian citizenship with the achievement of national independence, and events to his death in 1964.

Chapter Seven: Conclusions. The major virtue of situational analyses, life-histories and the narrative method is that it forces a sociologist to theorise about something concrete. The final chapter draws conclusions from the research in a discussion of the main theoretical plot and subplots. There are some suggestions for further research which might reveal whether other religious and historical resources, especially those from which symbolic values may be drawn, could yield further evidence about the location of religion and the past in the modern world.

NOTES.

- 1. David Lowenthal, Introduction to The Past is a Foreign Country, (1985:xxvi).
- 2. This definition of a Saint has been taken from Jacques Douillet, What is a Saint? (1958:84).
- 3. In general, I have used the term, Catholic, to describe the Church in Communion with the See of the Rome before the Protestant Reformation. When referring to the period after the Reformation I call it Roman Catholic to distinguish it from other churches.
- 4. This definition of resource has been taken from the Concise Oxford Dictionary.
- 5. This definition of values has been taken from the Concise Oxford Dictionary.
- 6. The term 'others' has been used to describe those who were not Roman Catholics. While I shall try to name agents, this device enables me to avoid the problem of having constantly to hyphenate Protestant-secular-liberal-modernist-lay-intellectual-professional.
- 7. Martin J. Welsh in an article "Brother Francis", The Quarterly Review, (1926:336, 341).
- 8. The Times, Leading article, 3 October, 1926.
- 9. James O. Dobson, The Little Poor Man of Assisi: A Consideration of the Life and Significance of St. Francis, (1926: Preface)
- 10. J. M. Bampton, The Secret of St. Francis, (1926:4).
- 11. Cuthbert Hess, "St. Francis of Assisi" in The Dublin Review, (1926:161).
- 12. J. M. Bampton, The Secret of St. Francis, (1926:4).
- 13. W. W. Seton, 1926, The Church Times, 15 October.
- 14. The Newcastle Chronicle, 2 October 1926.
- 15. The New Statesman, in an article "The Saint of the Animals" 9 October, 1926.
- 16. The Newcastle Journal, 4 October 1926.
- 17. Punch or the London Charivara, 6 October 1926.

Introduction. 53

18. Pius XI, Encyclical Letter to his venerable brethren the patriarchs, primates, archbishops, bishops, and other ordinaries in peace and communion with the Apostolic See, on St. Francis of Assisi, on the occasion of the seventh centenary of his death. (1926:16, 26).

- 19. Armel O' Connor, in Vincent, The Little Brown Company, (1925:75). This was an anthology printed for limited circulation.
- 20. The Daily Telegraph, 2 October, 1926.
- 21. Lawrence Housman, "Francis, the man", Theology, October 1926.
- 22. "St. Francis and the Modern World". The Times Literary Supplement. 30 September, 1926.
- 23. The Student Christian Movement Press in 1926 published Arseniev's, Mysticism and the Eastern Church. The author explained that St. Francis was a Western Saint who could be appreciated in the East.
- 24. A. G. Little, (1926), Notes on the Exhibition of Franciscan Manuscripts at the British Museum. There were several reviews of the exhibition of which the fullest would seem to be the one written by Robert Steele for The Blackfriars Journal.
- 25. Harold E. Goad in 1926 delivered a lecture, afterwards printed, *The Fame of St. Francis*. This was one of several such lectures delivered by different scholars in various settings.
- 26. Martin Luther. Preface to A Book of Selections from the Legends of St. Francis; entitled "The Absurd Acts of the Barefooted Franciscans to ennoble the Saint of their Order, literally 'The Owls' Play of the Barefooted Monks'. Luther urged: 'May England beware! May the Anglican Church protest against the encroachments of the papacy'. 'Beware Anglicana! (1542:5).
- 27. The work and influence of Paul Sabatier will be discussed much more fully in Chapter One of this thesis.
- 28. Richard Johnson in "The story so far: and further transformations?", a paper which formed part of a collection edited by David Palmer, Introduction to Contemporary Cultural Studies has written of what he named 'circuits of culture'. His circuit had four sectors: the sources of production, the actual 'texts', the process of 'readings' and 'lived cultures'. The last, he suggested, could be 'tough and shrubby undergrowth well away from the limelight. (1986: 283,287).
- 29. This definition of context has been taken from *The Concise Oxford Dictionary*.
- 30. William Quinlan Lash drew inspiration from St. Francis while at Cambridge and was closely associated with the Franciscan movement throughout his life. He became the achyra of Christa Prema Seva Sangha, a Franciscan ashram that grew out of the experiment,

Christa Seva Sangha discussed in this thesis. He was for many years the Bishop of Bombay, before returning to England in the 1960s to be the Assistant Bishop of the Diocese of Truro. He was then a close neighbour and friend of my family.

- 31. Lawrence Stone, "The revival of narrative: reflections on a new old history", (1987:74).
- 32. Peter Abell, The Syntax of Social Life, (1987: 3, 52).
- 33. F. W. Chambers, (1919), in a short article, "The Hon. the Rev. James Granville Adderley" in *Ecclesia*.
- 34. T. P. Stevens, Father Adderley. Stevens also quoted from a letter sent to him by Father Drury, C. R. who wrote of Adderley's 'deepseated devotion to St. Francis' (1943:79,57).
- 35. Barrie Williams (1982), The Franciscan Revival in the Anglican Communion; A.M. Allchin, (1958), The Silent Rebellion: Anglican Religious Communities, 1845-1900; Peter F. Anson, (1956), The Call of the Cloister: Religious Communities and Kindred Bodies in the Anglican Communion; John R.H. Moorman (1974), The Franciscans in England.
- 36. Barrie Williams, The Franciscan Revival in the Anglican Communion, (1982:30). Luigi Josa was a later participant in this organisation.
- 37. Philipos Thomas, (1977), "Christian Ashrams and the Evangelisation of India" in *The India Church History Review*, Andrew Webb, (1981) "The Christa Seva Ashram" in *South Asia Research*, Helen Ralston, (1988), *Christian Ashrams*, Barrie Williams, (1982), *The Franciscan Revival in the Anglican Communion*.
- 38. Sister Barbara Noreen, (the text is not dated), A Wheat Grain Sown in India.
- 39. Sister Barbara Noreen's account is in this respect very different from the narrative presented here.
- 40. M. C. Pradhan, R. D. Singh, P. K. Misra and D. B. Sastry, for example, edited Anthropology and Archaeology: Essays in Commemoration of Verrier Elwin, 1901-64. There were a large number of printed obituaries of Elwin after his death. There were also several reviews of his posthumously published autobiography, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin. Most of these were written in India by people who knew Elwin after the period with which this narrative is primarily concerned. He features in a number of other printed works, including Jawaharlal Nehru's (1942) An Autobiography with Musings on Recent Events in India and The Collected Works of Mahatma Gandhi.
- 41. Bhabugrahi Misra, (1973), Verrier Elwin: A Pioneer Indian Anthropologist.

Introduction. 55

42. The papers of John Sankey, Viscount Sankey of Moreton, Lord Chancellor, at the time of the 1931 Round Table Conference, illustrate the interconnections. Private letters exchanged between Elwin and Sankey about Elwin's 'Tertiary Settlement' at Gond Seva Mandal are in a collection of papers at the Department of Western Manuscripts at the Bodleian Library. Most of the other papers in the folios which deal with political relations between Indian and Britain are labelled 'secret', 'to be kept under lock and key', 'most secret', 'confidential', 'secret and confidential'. Finding references to St. Francis in these folios was a surprise even though I hoped to find them.

PART ONE.

CHAPTER TWO.

THE CONSTRUCTION OF FRANCISCAN RESOURCES AND VALUES, 1228-1926.

Part One.

THE LEGACY OF ALMOST SEVEN CENTURIES, 1228-1882.

1. CONSTRUCTING FRANCISCAN RESOURCES AFTER CANONISATION.

By the time of St. Francis' death in 1226, the Church had established a 'Saint-system' by which dead heroes were honoured. The term 'Saint', originally a Jewish concept of living heroes specially chosen by God, had, well before that time, come to mean the dead whose chosen status had been demonstrated by the quality of their lives, pre-eminently, those who had chosen to die for their beliefs. Since the Church had controlled the selection of those to be called 'Saint', and had developed a strong, centralised organisation, entry to the system pre-supposed qualities of life of which the Church approved. From these qualities, values, that is estimates of worth, desirability and utility, were distilled. After canonisation, the Church permitted public veneration of those values in accordance with the rules of the 'Saint-system'. In 1228, St. Francis was given a place in this system, and afterwards Catholics communicated his value to Catholics using six customary ways: allocating time, celebrating topography, authorising texts, occupying space, appropriating artefacts and formalising human organisations.

(1) Allocating Sacred Time. In July 1228, Gregory IX, papal monarch of the Western Catholic Church, took time to make the journey from Rome to Assisi. At a splendid ceremony he pronounced that Francesco Bernardone, who had died 4 October 1226, was a 'Saint'. People on earth could in their prayers address 'Saint Francis of Assisi', who was now in heavenly eternity, outside the confines of earthly time.

The Catholic Church had a sacred calendar, a cyclical arrangement of time, already crowded with feasts of Saints, which was (and is) revised each year. The Pope duly allocated to St. Francis the date of 4 October, the day of his death on earth and his birth in eternity, which has been included in the Roman Catholic Calendar ever since. By recording the year of Francis's death as 1226, he allocated him a place in earthly time as well as the cyclical remembrance of his heavenly timelessness. This ever-recurring pattern of remembrance ensured that values attributed to St. Francis were constantly recalled, and were subsequently celebrated in the other resources. As we shall see, this pattern was going to be interrupted.

Celebrating Sacred Topography. St. Francis's name in 1228 was added to the catalogue of Saints with a distinguishing title: of Assisi. According to Catholic teaching, the whole earth was God's, but a local man by his holy life and death could hallow and give meaning to the natural and constructed features of a particular area. The topographies of geographically defined spaces were resources which Catholics used to celebrate the worth, desirability and utility of Saints, who were themselves now in a Communion not limited by earthly boundaries. Catholics could give a new meaning and significance to Assisi where Francis had been born, had lived and had died. In addition, buildings and streets in numerous other Umbrian towns acquired meaning from specific incidents.

Francis had been to Spoleto, for example, where he had a dream that persuaded him to serve God generously; to Foligno, where he had sold his father's property to give to the poor; to Mount Subasio, where he had made a cave into a hermitage; to San Damiano, where in the crumbling church he had heard the words, 'Repair my Church'; to a little church of St. Mary-of-the-Angels (also known as the Portiuncula) where he had felt called to follow a Gospel way of life; to a hovel in Rivo Torto in which he had lived and tended lepers; to Bevagna, where he had preached to the birds; to Greccio, where he had recalled the poverty of Christ's birth by making a crib; to Cannara, where he had given guidance to men and women with family and civic responsibilities; to Mount Alverna, where in September 1224 he had received the stigmata of the wounds of Christ.

In his poverty, St. Francis travelled on foot. From this he had gained an extensive experience of the countryside and its animals, which later generations were to see as the hallmark of his life. His care for them, and his delight in the whole creation had found expression in a poem he wrote. This 'landscape of the mind' which he developed was later celebrated by a member of the Franciscan Third Order, Dante Alighieri (1265-1321).³

As we shall see, in the late-nineteenth and twentieth centuries, medieval walled cities, rural landscape, literary pictures of 'St. Francis country' and his own composition were going to acquire new meaning among those acquainted with urban sprawl, industrial smog and the terrain of war.

(3) Authorising Sacred Texts. At the time of the formation of Christianity, and still in the medieval period, those who could read and write were 'tiny literate reefs on top of vast illiterate oceans'. However, the literate clergy recorded the oral memories of the words and deeds of Saints

in texts. These texts, considered sacred in their own right, were strongly protected. Copied and read by clerics, stored in conventual libraries and never on open display, they were not readily available to the general population, or even the small number who could have understood them.

Thus, after the canonisation of St. Francis, the Pope commissioned Thomas of Celano, a Franciscan friar, a writer of proven ability, and an eye-witness to many of the recent events in Umbria, to collect oral testimonies and write the first sacred biography of St. Francis.

As other biographers of Saints for centuries had done, Thomas arranged his Latin narrative of 'a new light in the firmament of heaven' in a chronological sequence. Like the writers of the Gospels who provided a model for all hagiographers, he began with the circumstances and portents of birth and ended with miracles that occurred after death. In the customary manner, he recounted how, in the period between birth and death, Francis had rejected worldly wealth and fame; and then described carefully how, following the example of Christ, Francis had cared for the poor and lepers and in other ways followed his Lord. He emphasised that men and women had wanted to follow Francis's heroic example and that the Church had approved the three Religious Orders which developed to channel their devotion.

Thomas was unable to claim that Francis was a martyr, in the sense of being killed for his faith, but he had lived a life of penance and received the wounds of Christ on his body. Thomas cited posthumous miracles to establish his subject's sanctity. The implication was that Francis could still be an agent of miracles for Catholics, wherever they were, because he was no longer limited by time and space.

Thomas's narrative was (and is) the earliest source of detailed biographical information about St. Francis, but for several centuries it was

never officially available, even to literate Catholics. In 1266, the Chapter of the Friars Minor approved and adopted another sacred biography of St. Francis which it had commissioned the then Minister General of the Friars Minor, Giovanni di Fadanza Bonaventure, to write.

Bonaventure used Thomas's account of St. Francis's life as a source, but made some additions, deletions, and amendments. Bonaventure's Legenda (as the longer and shorter versions were named) became for Catholics, the official, sole, authoritative, and exclusive Legenda of St. Francis. The Chapter ordered that 'all Legends of the Blessed Father formerly made shall be destroyed'.

A controlling group had thus decided what other people could copy, distribute, read, and have read to them about St. Francis. Their intention was to get rid of all those manuscripts which they believed to be confusing, inadequate, inaccurate, unorthodox and deviant, especially those written by the 'spirituals' (the friars who had withdrawn from Assisi to the Marches because they objected to the building the controlling group were constructing in Assisi to commemorate St. Francis).

Thus, St. Francis had Bonaventure, a renowned theologian, later canonised and named 'a Doctor of the Church', for his sole official biographer. St. Bonaventure's reputation ensured that manuscripts containing the *Legenda* of St. Francis's life were copied and distributed, both inside and outside the Franciscan Order. Later, when the invention of printing made it necessary to select which texts to propagate by this method and which to keep in manuscript form, St. Bonaventure's *Legenda* of St. Francis were reproduced on a scale which could never have been achieved by manuscripts alone. By the end of the fifteenth century, there were enough copies for some to survive the assaults of future floods, fires, reformations, revolutions and wars.

As we shall presently observe, not quite all the earlier manuscripts were destroyed. A handful of copies of Thomas of Celano's two Legenda and a few other texts survived, together with St. Francis's own writings. Nor did a later controlling group succeed in suppressing copies of The Little Flowers of St. Francis, the work of a fourteenth-century 'Franciscan spiritual'. In the seventeenth century, Catholics were going to have to wrestle with the meanings of the varying texts to clarify the significance of the life of St. Francis for them. Later still, in the twentieth century, the 'others' who did not seek the imprimatur or nihil obstat of the Roman Catholic Church, would use these original thirteenth-century and edited seventeenth-century texts to construct new interpretations of the life of St. Francis. They were going to give preference to The Little Flowers, and almost ignore St. Bonaventure's text.

(4) Occupying Sacred Space. Building a church to cover the corpse of a newly canonised Saint at the place of his death - like allocating sacred time, designating topographies and authorising texts -was common Catholic practice.

What differentiated the case of St. Francis from that of most other Saints was that an efficient Pope and an efficient Franciscan Minister General, Brother Elias, used their positions and organising skills to obtain the necessary money and resources to construct an exceptionally large building. Although some of the 'spiritual' friars in 1230 argued that an immense, solid and permanent structure was not needed to commemorate a Poverello who had espoused 'Lady Poverty' and often slept in caves, their objections were ignored.

Catholic teaching was built into architecture. This was so in all churches. In addition at Assisi, the spaciousness which allowed for both public ceremony and individual contemplation, the designed darkness in the

lower church and light in the upper, the huge walls prepared for vast decorative panels, the unfettered naves, the building's prominence as a landmark, were forms of Catholic teaching about the perceived significance of St. Francis.

In other towns and villages, new churches, large and small, and chapels within churches, were soon built or dedicated in his honour - at Gubbio, Todi, Trevi, Florence, Bologna, Padua, Paris, London In them all, ceremonies and celebrations, worship which was visual and aural, took place, culminating in the Mass, the focal point of all Catholic liturgy.

Although Goethe later described the Assisi church in its period of relative neglect as melancholy, after its nineteenth-century restoration, some of the 'others' were going to find it of architectural and cultural merit and yet 'others' were going to compare it with the very different places in which Francis had prayed, such as caves and huts. Those who claimed no allegiance to the Roman Catholic Church would reopen the discussion of the desirability, worth and utility of a solid memorial to a man 'who lived for a fortnight on the chirp of grasshoppers'.

(5) Appropriating Sacred Artefacts. Catholics appropriated materials and skills to construct artefacts, products of human art and workmanship, to assist the faithful in their devitions. The materials and skills differed according to the place and time. St. Francis was canonised at a time when Italian Catholics were painting glittering and permanent frescos directly on the walls of their churches.

The huge frescos, which the Masters of the Florentine, Roman, Pisan, and Sienese schools were commissioned to paint in Assisi blazed from the walls of both the lower and the upper church. Their scenes depicted episodes from sacred narratives, usually the Old and the New Testaments and the hagiographies of the Saints. These were thought to be an

effective means of teaching Catholics the content of their Christian profession. In addition to the narratives, images, which were sometimes statues, portrayed still figures to encourage more contemplative devotion to God.

Thus, scenes like those which the Maestro di San Francesco painted in the Assisi lower church encouraged a pilgrim-worshipper, by a mere turn of the head first to the right, then to the left, to view scenes in the lives of three people: Christ, St. Francis and the self. On the right wall the meditating individual saw Christ stripped of his garments; on the left, a picture of St. Francis, who had stripped himself of his garments when he decided to serve his heavenly father. These first pictures were followed on the one side of the nave with more scenes from the life of Christ and on the other of St. Francis.

In the upper church, Giotto and his school painted twenty-eight large frescos depicting incidents which were 'absolutely narrative' and 'eminently dramatic'. 11 Incidents from the Old and New Testaments bordered them. The twenty-eight frescos narrated a detailed story which began with a local scene. The Temple of Minerva, which the new Church was intended to replace as the most important building in Assisi, was depicted. A local peasant was laying his cloak before a surprised youth, greeting him as if he already knew what all future worshippers who came to this shrine were expected to know: the youth was now a Saint of the universal Church. In the second episode, Francis was giving his colourful cloak to a poor knight; and the first local people to view the frescos saw their own town and Umbrian hills in the background. In one, an angry father and a puzzled crowd were watching the local bishop accept the decision of an almost naked Francis to renounce his earthly father's goods and serve his Father in Heaven; in another, Pope Innocent III, surrounded

by dignitaries of the Church in Rome, was handing to Francis the Rule of the Friars Minor which he had approved; in another, Francis was supporting a collapsing Lateran church on his shoulders. Other scenes were, for example, of Francis preaching to the birds and interpreting the Gospel with a Christmas crib at Greccio. The final frescoes portrayed events which took place after the death of Francis – the Saint healing a wounded man and releasing a woman from the bondage of sin, for instance. Each fresco was a visual portrayal of an incident which had been first narrated by Bonaventure in his written text.

Artefacts also confirmed for the faithful the virtues of St. Francis, 'a Confessor of the Faith'; the Faith held at all times and in all places by all the Saints. He was paired, for example, with St. Martin of Tours because he had also given his cloak to a poor man, with St. Dominic because he had also founded a mendicant order, and with St. Jerome because he also undertook severe penances. In his devotion to the Blessed Virgin Mary he was partnered with St. John the Evangelist. St. Francis could often be seen at a Sacra Conversazione, an assembly of Saints in heaven. 13

Catholics constantly confirmed Catholic teaching by the arrangement of paintings. Thus, in the Bardi Chapel of the church of San Croce in Florence, the first painting on one side of the chapel was of a Bishop receiving the self-offering of a naked Francis, a newly-born son of the Church. On the other side, the first painting was of Pope Honorius III confirming the later Rule of the Order of Friars Minor. There could be no doubt but that it was the Church which had approved and sanctioned the development of Franciscan organisation. After the Pope had canonised other members of the three Franciscan Orders, painted, and carved representations of St. Francis were placed beside representations of St.

Clare, founder of the Second Order, and St. Louis and St. Elizabeth, royal members and patrons of the Franciscan Third Order. As the number of Franciscan Saints increased - with the addition of St. Anthony of Padua, for example - so it became ever clearer that the Church thought St. Francis to be of importance because he had founded organisations capable of producing Saints in every generation.

Other sacred artefacts, each with a function, were made which taught that the daily life of St. Francis, a deacon, was inseparable from the Catholic way of life, of which the Mass was the central action. In numerous churches, the Mass was said or sung in front of reredos panels showing that St. Francis now that his days on earth had ended was in heaven. Light was filtered to the worshippers from 'heaven' through stained-glass windows brilliant with pictures of St. Francis's life on earth. Pulpits and vestment chests had intricate carvings of incidents in St. Francis's life, as in the Franciscan's church at San Croce in Florence.

As we shall see, in the period of the late-nineteenth and twentieth-century revival, 'others' were going to look at these artefacts constructed to be a gateway to heaven as a gateway to other objectives. Some reredos panels, for example, were going to become gallery and museum exhibits which narrated the story of developments in pictorial art.

(6) <u>Formalising Sacred Organisations</u>. The medieval Catholic Church, as we have already observed, was a highly organised institution which had many sub-organisations within it. In the thirteenth century, Religious Orders, such as that of St. Benedict, were thought to be of great worth.

Pope Gregory IX, who was a member of the Franciscan Third Order, wished to protect the three Franciscan Orders, which he valued highly, from the possibility of extinction. In particular, he disagreed with those Brothers who believed that the friars should continue always to follow St.

Francis in absolute poverty. On the 28 September 1230 in a papal bull, Quo Elongati, Gregory decreed that the friars could acquire or build houses and make suitable use of some possessions in their missions. The Sacro Convento, a commodious, arched building next to the Basilica in Assisi, for which the Pope laid the foundation stone in 1230, became the headquarters from which human and material resources were organised for the Franciscan missions across Europe.

As we shall later see, in the late-nineteenth and twentieth centuries, the 'others' were going to examine the organisation, the buildings, and the records which the friars kept, and use them for purposes which had nothing to do with the Holy See of Rome.

(7) Summary. In a historical context which has aptly been named 'High Christendom' in which 'a Papal Monarch' reigned over much of the Western world, Catholics used an already existing institution, the Catholic Church, and an already formalised system, the 'Saint-system', to construct a range of resources telling a single coherent story about the value of St. Francis and the Franciscan Orders. This was accomplished by (1) allocating time (2) celebrating topography (3) authorising texts (4) occupying space (5) appropriating artefacts and (6) formalising organisations. These resources were used to construct visual and aural experiences, usually of worship, expressed in rituals, ceremonies, and pilgrimages, which culminated in the Mass. The official Catholic Church taught, in brief, that Francis of Assisi was of worth, desirability and utility because he was a Saint. He was exemplary as (1) a follower of Christ (2) a member of the Catholic Church (3) an agent of miracles (4) an intercessor in heaven (5) a missioner and (6) a founder of religious orders. Further, selected incidents in the Saint's life represented in the resources were illustrative of Christian virtues: for example, of love, joy and humility; and especially for the

friars, of poverty, chastity and obedience.14

What was remarkable in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries was not the category of Sainthood, the construction of a single coherent narrative, the ways of constructing resources, the centrality of aural and visual experiences, the exemplary roles depicted, or the Christian virtues advocated. These were common. Artefacts in honour of St. Francis were exceptional because of their number, range, size, brilliance and the speed with which they were constructed. They also had unusual detail, intensity and emotional content.

As we shall see, in the late-nineteenth and twentieth centuries, 'others', who rejected at least some of the Catholic teachings which the original resources were designed to convey, were going to recognise the ability, even the genius, of the men who constructed them. They were going to use them as resources for new areas of study.

2. <u>CONSTRUCTING AND DIMINISHING FRANCISCAN RESOURCES IN ENGLAND, 1224-1558</u>.

Description and analysis of the next periods of history will be very much briefer. The purpose now is to sketch two social and religious transformations in England which had a direct effect on the distribution of Catholic Franciscan resources. The first is the social impact of the cultus of St. Francis and the second is the social impact of Protestantism. These are minefields for the unwary, but we need here only to record how in the course of more than three centuries Franciscan resources were constructed, and then how, in a much shorter time, they were nearly all destroyed, defaced or removed.

(1) The Coming of the Franciscan Cultus and Franciscan Orders to England. On 10 September 1224, two years before the death of St. Francis

and nearly four years before his canonisation, nine Franciscan friars led by Agnellus of Pisa, a deacon, arrived at Dover. They attracted recruits and numbers grew rapidly. The friars set up houses in Canterbury, Oxford, Cambridge, London, Bristol, Coventry, Chichester, Winchelsea, Norwich, Worcester, Hereford, Salisbury, Newcastle, York ... and thirty years later there were 1,242 friars in 49 English towns. We know that they were instrumental in observing the feast of St. Francis with special attention and that they worked transforming the topography of towns, building churches, copying sacred texts, sponsoring artefacts, and creating a living Franciscan presence in three religious orders. Robert Grossteste, William Chaucer and others depicted the varying character of the friars in the next three centuries. Roger Bacon, a leading scholar at Oxford, and the friar of Chaucer's tale could hardly have been more different.

(2) The Coming of the Protestants to England. For present purposes, we can conveniently identify the coming of English Protestantism with Henry VIII's proclamation that the English monarch, and not the Pope, was 'Supreme Head on Earth' of the Church of England. Afterwards, the king and his agent, Thomas Cromwell, and their successors (against some opposition) diminished English Franciscan resources as a part of their reforming policy. A visible and aural rupture, a division between past and present, took place in English society. 17

There is no complete list of those Franciscan resources which could be heard and seen in England prior to the Reformation. We shall therefore deal quickly with the process of their diminution which left only a few outward signs of the social presence of St. Francis which was maintained by the individuals and families who remained in communion with Rome.

In brief, Cyclic Time: in the Church of England Calendar the annual feast of St. Francis was deleted and his name was excluded from Litanies

and Collects. 18 The statutes forbade the clergy to offer 'enticements to the pilgrimage of any Saint' or 'to set forth or extol' images, relics, and miracles. Pilgrimages to Assisi ceased.

Occupied Space: English topography and its meaning was transformed when Henry VIII ordered his agents to seize the property of all Religious Orders on behalf of the Crown. The Benedictines provided Church of England cathedrals, but not a single Franciscan church became a Church of England cathedral or important place of worship because the friars had built simply. 19 Since they were missionaries to the towns, unlike the Cistercians, the Franciscans had no country properties suitable for conversion to gentlemen's private residences. A few of their town houses, such as at Canterbury, were sold to private owners and a few of the larger ones, such as at London, were sold to corporations. The walls of only about a dozen remained - at Richmond, Winchelsea, and Gloucester, for example. The majority of the 61 Franciscan houses which in 1530 had inhabitants were hacked down because the sites were considered more valuable than the buildings. At Bristol, for example, the stone was used to build a wharf.

Other Artefacts: what remained after Edward VI's reign succumbed to Cromwell's men who had authority to rip and burn sacred texts. A mere scattering was left. Just a few came into the possession of individuals. Paintings, stained glass, vestment cases, embroideries, seals and any other articles which could be construed as 'an offence to God' because they represented that 'detestable sin of idolatry' were burnt, removed, defaced, broken, or mutilated. The result, assuming that more representations of St. Francis once existed than the few we now know of, was almost complete annihilation.

Human Resources: Henry VIII dealt savagely with those Franciscans

who opposed him. The Guardian of the Richmond friary in 1533 was hanged, drawn and quartered. In the next year, 'two cartloads of friars' were carried to the Tower. In 1535, Thomas More, a member of the Franciscan Third Order, was beheaded and in 1538, John Forest, the Guardian of the Greenwich friary and confessor to the Queen (a member of the Franciscan Third Order) was burnt to death. The remainder of the 600 friars, about a third of the number there had once been in England, quietly accommodated to the change or ceased to be a visible presence in English social life.

As we shall see, in the late-nineteenth and twentieth centuries, 'others' working in a range of professions were going to study both the arrival of the friars in England and the subsequent dissolution of their houses.

(3) Summary. Catholics in the thirteenth to sixteenth centuries constructed a plentiful supply of Franciscan resources and Protestants in the sixteenth century brought about a scarcity. As we shall see, interplay between the abundance and richness of Italy's stock and the paucity and dullness of England's was going partially to shape the late-nineteenth and twentieth century Franciscan revival.

3. MODIFICATIONS TO THE RESOURCES.

(1) The Growth of the Franciscan Orders: Human Resources. At the time of the Council of Trent (1545-63) and in the next two centuries the number of Franciscan friars in Protestant countries was negligible. In Catholic countries the friars preserved and extended existing Franciscan landscapes, buildings, texts and artefacts.

When Henry VIII reigned in England, there were in the Roman Catholic Church approximately 50,000 Franciscan friars. In the seventeenth

century more than a hundred thousand men entered the Order: the highest number professed in any one century. The Franciscan Third Order likewise enjoyed a period of rapid growth. In Madrid alone in 1689, there were 25,000 tertiaries. St. Francis', it has been claimed, 'reigned as the supreme luminary over the whole of Spanish society: kings, bishops, scholars and artists thought it an honour' to call St. Francis 'our Seraphic Father'. 22

The rapid growth in numbers was matched by expanding opportunity. Franciscan friars served the missions of the Holy See and the spiritual and territorial needs of Catholic rulers. At court they were renowned for their music. Abroad, they went with the armies which colonised the New World as chaplains to the soldiers and missionaries to the conquered.

(2) Modification of Franciscan Visual Resources. Eminent artists of the calibre of Ribera (d. 1652), Rubens (d. 1640), Murillo (d. 1682), Zubaran (d.1684) and Van Dyke (d. 1641), painted St. Francis to portray the piety of the period, mainly for the benefit of the members of religious orders, and the rich and sophisticated. He was depicted as a motionless, wan, hollow-eyed, reclusive, intense and solitary figure. Most often he was in a posture of prayer, with his wounds revealed. 'Via Crucis', the way of the cross, almost obliterated stories of active love and joy. 24

Cruder representations were considered more suitable for the poor and illiterate in the New World and the Old. They were deemed to need simple, easily-recognised iconographic symbols. In painted statues, St. Francis and Franciscans were given grey habits and cords to distinguish them from the Saints of other religious orders who had white or black habits and belts. St. Francis carried a cross or a skull to distinguish him from other grey-habited Franciscan Saints, such as St. Bonaventure, who wore a mitre and held a book, and St. Anthony who had only a book.

(3) Modification of Franciscan Sacred Texts. The sixteenth and seventeenth centuries saw the growth in extent and influence of 'the European Enlightenment', most obviously in Protestant countries. Roman Catholic scholars responded to the developing 'literate mentality' and employed critical methods to assess the Church's texts. Written accounts, however sacred, were subjected to critical study, and judgements were made on the style and content. Among the Franciscans, those who were palaeographers began to examine St. Francis's own writings, the 'Legenda' written by Thomas of Celano, St. Bonaventure and others, the Rules and other early manuscripts. Even the stories of The Little Flowers were studied again, and were deemed to be historically unreliable. 25

Scholars, aware that what they wrote might be used against them, tried in their interpretations to meet one critical objection in particular; that of the 'excess of legends'. By the mid-eighteenth century, Butler wrote in his Lives of the Fathers, Martyrs and Other Principle Saints that he had taken account of the 'remarks of judicious modern critics and historians'. However, the huge printed tomes which grew from this level of study were only placed in selected libraries, and were rarely, if ever, made available to the 'others'. 27

The editing, copying, correcting, collating, annotating and interpreting involved in this endeavour produced an opposite effect on texts to the modification of visual representations, whether crude or sophisticated. While the subject matter of the latter had become simplified in single-subject compositions, the former had grown far more elaborate and complex with the need to meet new standards of textual criticism.

As we shall see, some of the paintings of St. Francis which were executed with great skill were going to become the prized and precious possessions of English collectors who hung them in private and public

galleries. Roman Catholic scholars were going to be called upon to emerge from their enclosed archives in order to speak publicly with the 'others' who had used their scholarship to construct a person whom Pope Pius XI labelled in 1926: an 'invented' St. Francis.

4. THE CENTURY-LONG STORM, 1789-1882.

the European Mainland in an Age of Rationalism and Revolution. In England, meanwhile, Puritanism persisted and 'no-Popery' was general, though there was some movement in the Church of England towards recognising itself as both Catholic and Protestant. However, Saints were not yet the subjects of paintings or of written discourse, except by some men of letters, such as Edward Gibbon, who viewed them as a source of 'perpetual theatre' and Dr. Priestley, a Unitarian, who objected to 'this great abuse ... a most horrid corruption of genuine Christianity'. St. Francis was not incorporated into the customs and ceremonies of local English communities at this time.

Europe was greatly affected by the socially transforming values which can conveniently be named Rationalism and Revolution. After the Constituent Assembly in France passed an edict suppressing all religious orders, the main human resource for propagating Franciscan values seemed set for 'inglorious extinction'. Across much of Europe, the Franciscan Orders had a 'great ordeal' and 'a century-long storm'. The numbers by 1850 were being counted in hundreds rather than thousands – there were nine Franciscan friars in England. Attacks on Roman Catholic values were coming not from those who practised other forms of Christianity, such as the Protestants, but often from those, such as Karl Marx, who attacked religion claiming it was a form of oppression.

(2) The Reign of Pope Pius IX. With the visible rise of numerous political, cultural, ideological, religious and social movements, Pope Pius IX issued a Syllabus of Errors in 1864 declaring that the exponents of Pantheism, Nationalism, Absolute Rationalism, Indifferentism, Socialism, Latitudinarianism and Modern Liberalism were leading the Church and the world astray. 33

Whoever teaches that the Roman Pontiff can and ought to reconcile and adjust himself with progress, liberalism and modern civilisation ... let him be anathema.

Roman Catholics developed a form of religion, which has been described as that of a fearful ghetto, an enclosed garden or a walled fortress, into which a Pope who had called a Council which sanctioned papal infallibility, led them. Roman Catholics took St. Francis with them into their ghetto, garden, and fortress expression of Christianity. Few countries, despite the efforts of Newman and some others, were more Ultramontane than England.

After Pius IX's death in 1878, a quite remarkable change in the social presence of St. Francis began to be evident which has continued ever since. There was firstly, a Roman Catholic revival of devotion to him and secondly, a quite remarkable rediscovery of the Saint among the 'others' whom Pius IX had condemned.

Part Two.

REVIVING AND REDISCOVERING FRANCISCAN RESOURCES AND VALUES, 1882-1926.

5. THE CONSTRUCTION OF AN ARGUMENT BETWEEN ROMAN CATHOLICS AND THE 'OTHERS', 1882-1926.

Though social and economic forces are always important for the explanation of religious movements, human catalysts are essential. Two names stand out from all others in this new chapter in the history of the

availability and visibility of Franciscan resources. The first is Gioacchino Vincenzo Raffaele Luigi Pecci, who was enthroned on 3 March 1878 as Supreme Pontiff of the Roman Catholic Church, taking the name of Leo XIII. The second is Paul Sabatier, a French Calvinist, whose book, Vie de S. François d'Assise, was first published in France in 1893.

The responses to the propositions of Leo XIII and Paul Sabatier ensured that there were many more resources giving information about St. Francis in 1939 than there had been in 1878. Any sociometric study, however, would reveal that those who were not well-educated contributed little to this stock.

(1) Pope Leo XIII's Proposition about St. Francis Addressed to Roman Catholics. Before being elected Pope, Pecci had been Bishop of Perugia in Umbria, a region steeped in Franciscan history, being only about ten kilometres from Assisi. While there, he had developed a deep devotion to St. Francis, become a member of the Franciscan Third Order, and its Bishop Protector throughout Italy.

As an English Cardinal observed, 'once only during the long period of 1800 years has the Vicar of Christ singled out a particular Saint and his spirit, and set the one before the Universal Church as a special reformer for all classes, and the other as a certain cure for the evils which affect the whole of society'. Leo XIII was unique among Popes because he singled out St. Francis of Assisi from the whole Communion of Saints for special attention.

(a) <u>Commendation of St. Francis</u>. In 1882, the 564th year of the celebration of St. Francis's birthday in heaven, Leo XIII addressed the Bishops of the universal Church in an encyclical, *Auspicato Concessum*. He urged them in their dioceses to encourage celebration of the six hundredth centenary of St. Francis's birthday on earth. 37

There was, however, little new which the Pope could narrate about St. Francis. The Roman Catholic definition of a Saint had not changed. Most of the resources needed for a revival of devotion to the Saint existed in plenty - a date in the calendar of the universal church (and numerous opportunities for several other centenaries before celebrating that of St. Francis's death), topographies in Italy and elsewhere, hundreds of church buildings, texts and artefacts. The Mass, together with pilgrimages and other gatherings, was still the focus of devotion throughout the Roman Catholic Church. Only human Franciscan organisation had suffered significant depletion in the previous hundred years.

(b) Commendation of the Franciscan Third Order. Leo XIII recognised the worth, desirability, and utility of human organisation, especially the Franciscan Orders, for his policy of emergence from the ghetto, and his attempt to revive and propagate Catholic values in industrialised societies. It was to the Franciscan Third Order that he gave this charge. He set out to increase its membership, especially in its Secular branch, for its members lived their daily lives in the workplaces of modern societies.

To enable this, Leo XIII in 1883 sanctioned a Revised Rule for Franciscan tertiaries which he promulgated the following year in a document named Misericors Dei Filius. He explained that he had 'prudently mitigated' the thirteenth-century Franciscan Third Order Rule, Supra Montem. It was 'not in all points suited to the present age and customs' since it 'gave rise to excessive difficulty and inconvenience'. (The Rule of 1289 had twenty chapters and laid down frequent prayers and fasts for tertiaries. The Revision of 1883 had three chapters and fewer devotional requirements). 38

In England, apart from deposit libraries, only libraries exclusively for Roman Catholic clerics listed copies of *Misericors Dei Filius*. Translations

in printed manuals were distributed to Roman Catholic tertiaries personally by Franciscan friars. In consequence, few of the 'others' saw this Rule, and few comments were made about it in the printed debates.

The following year, the Pope commended the Third Order in an encyclical, *Humanum Genus*, subtitled *On Freemasonry*. 'The Franciscan Third Order', he wrote, could cure 'the plight of our age', preventing the further spread of 'the contagion of wicked societies'. According to Leo XIII, the Franciscan Third Order:

Ought to be of great influence in suppressing the contagion of wicked societies. ... Amongst the many benefits to be expected from it will be the great benefit of drawing the minds of men to liberty, fraternity, and equality of right; not such as the Freemasons absurdly imagine, but such as Jesus Christ obtained for the human race and St. Francis aspired to: the liberty, We mean, of Sons of God. ... The equality which, founded on justice and charity, does not take away all distinctions among men, but, out of the varieties of life, of duties, and of pursuits, forms that union and harmony which naturally tend to the benefit and dignity of society.

Information about this encyclical was available briefly in England because of its attack on freemasonry, political and social movements.³⁹

(2) Paul's Sabatier's Alternative Proposition about St. Francis Addressed to the 'Others'. Although Paul Sabatier's book St. François d'Assise burst upon the European scene in a blaze of controversy, it was no 'creative act uncaused'. The impetus had come from his professor, Ernst Renan, who had directed him to study St. Francis.

Theirs was an unlikely alliance. Renan had been a Roman Catholic seminarian who had abandoned belief in favour of rationalism, but who had none-the-less retained an interest in the person of Jesus and St. Francis of Assisi. He wrote about both, in what may be described loosely as their 'human face'. In contrast, Sabatier was a Christian believer with a Calvinist background, who no doubt had to wrestle with his professor's rationalist attitude. Despite this tension, he undertook the duty of writing

the story of St. Francis, having been inspired by Renan's essay on the subject. He may well have seen in it an opportunity for furthering his interest in bringing Christian texts into dialogue with other Modernist thinkers, Protestant and Roman Catholic.

Basing his work on Francis's own words, and writing much of it in the Saint's native Umbria, Sabatier produced a book which was vivid, elegant and literary, while being accessible to the intelligent reader. Though it had no illustrations, it was not overburdened with footnotes.

There was tension, Sabatier found, between the St. Francis whose writings he had studied and the testimonies of the first witnesses at 'the tribunal of history'. He judged these witnesses wanting, and, though describing himself as a 'mere bystander', he offered an alternative proposition, giving the reasons which are briefly summarised in the following sections.

of St. Francis. The first cause of a mistaken evaluation, in Sabatier's view, was the constraining hand of the Church. All who undertook the early accounts or representations of St. Francis were either clerics or commissioned by clerics. They were therefore mentally circumscribed by the need to strengthen the arm of the Church. They were also rendered mentally myopic by their allegiance, so they, the priestly caste, stifled the prophetic spirit of Francis. Because in their eyes all who gathered bands of followers for a religious purpose must be founding religious orders, they could only interpret Francis as doing the same. Sabatier questioned the validity of this. He suggested that St. Francis's true intention had been to initiate a movement, 'a royal road of liberty, love and responsibility' to promote 'the mystic religious life in the heart of each Christian'.

(b) The Distorting Constraints of the Saint-System in the Representation

of St. Francis. Another cause of faulty assessment was to be found in the 'Saint System' of the Church. Those early writers had looked back on St. Francis after canonisation, and had therefore needed to integrate him into the Church's expectations of that system. Because of this they had failed to discern the spirit of Francis as it was during his life. Celano was reproved for turning a poem into a catalogue and Bonaventure for conducting his readers as though round a shop selling objects of piety. For the same reason he also found fault with the resources which had been created: the Basilica, in particular, pointed to 'the abyss which separates the ideal of St. Francis from the pontiff who canonised him'.

- Sabatier sought for facts behind the legends. He ignored the posthumous miracles and other evidence of the 'Saint System', apart from his condemnation of Gregory IX. He also set the man in his context. Abandoning the golden triptych, he took account of St. Francis's social context. In this he noted that tensions were growing within the feudal structure, that towns were longing to rid themselves of their rulers and that there was some unrest because of the aspirations of the poor.
- (d) Francis, the Man for all Humanity. Sabatier concluded that the Roman Catholic Church had, though not necessarily wilfully, entombed the spirit of St. Francis in the mausoleum of its own systems. In contrast, he interpreted the Saint as belonging to all humanity, like 'Homer, Dante, Shakespeare and Goethe'. He should be free, like them, to speak directly to all. He was unique and original. He was a mystic who transcended the boundaries of a sect (the Franciscan Order) and the Roman Catholic Church's 'absolute claim' and 'arbitrary confiscation'.
- (3) The Demarcation of the Differences in Interpretation among Roman Catholics and 'the Others'. The French Academy honoured Paul Sabatier,

but it was not entirely surprising that on 8 June 1894 Paul Sabatier's S. François d'Assise was added to the Roman Catholic Index of Forbidden Books. The official Roman Catholic Church had decided to oppose and resist this alternative interpretation of St. Francis which it regarded as unorthodox, heretical, invented and untrue. The 'others' adopted a new hero.

6. THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ROMAN CATHOLIC PROPOSITIONS, 1882-1926.

In this section there was a difficult choice between working chronologically and working with categories of resources. The latter course was chosen in order to be able to keep the various resources and strands of activity clearly distinguished. In each sub-section we look first at the world-wide Church, then at England.

(1) Human Organisations: The Roman Catholic Franciscan Third Order.

Leo XIII had seen the Third Order as a useful vehicle for the regeneration of society through lay involvement. After a slow start, his efforts to increase its size were successful in a number of ways, in both its Regular and Secular forms. Although there appear to have been only 10,000 members of the Secular branch in 1903, by 1926 there were almost 4,000,000. His successors in the Papacy followed his example in becoming members of the Third Order, even beyond the start of World War II. The situation in Britain is less easy to discover, as no figures could be gathered. Since there was no comment from those outside the Roman Catholic Church, it would seem that its growth was not as rapid in England as elsewhere.

(2) Authorising Franciscan Texts. At the beginning of this period there was a great burst of industry from Franciscan scholars, who embarked on

an intense study of the origins and development of their various branches of the Franciscan movement. This was especially true of mainland Europe, but there was also a great deal of activity in North America, where a Franciscan University was founded under the patronage of St. Bonaventure. The situation in England was very different. There was no university open to Roman Catholics at the start of this period, so there was little chance of deep and consistent study.

The Roman Catholic Church was not content merely to place Sabatier's work on the Index of Forbidden Books. There was a vigorous response from its writers, all rejecting Sabatier's interpretation. Leopold de Cherance found his biography of St. Francis reprinted and in great demand, prefaced as it was with assurances that it contained 'nothing therein but what is very orthodox and very capable of encouraging the faithful'. Paschal Robinson turned defence into attack, and used some of Sabatier's methods to point out his weaknesses. Where Sabatier had accused the Roman Catholic Church of failing to appreciate the true spirit of the Saint, he pointed out that, because of his attitude to the Church, Sabatier was 'crippled by his entire lack of sympathy with St. Francis's religious standpoint'. **

These works were translated into English, not in the interests of deep study, but to give the reading public texts which would show St. Francis in a different light. Other Roman Catholic accounts of the Saint's life were translated, for example Joergenson's biography which was originally in Danish. Not until 1911 did Father Cuthbert, a member of the Capuchin branch of the Order of Friars Minor, write the first English biography, a scholarly reply to Sabatier, who praised its excellence. All these were aimed not just at the Roman Catholic faithful, but also at 'others' who were interested, in the hope that the effect of Sabatier's work

would be lessened.

For all this, Leo XIII was as much the cause of this high level of activity as Sabatier. St. François d'Assise is better regarded as a catalyst than a cause of this scholarly endeavour.

Celebrating Franciscan Topographies and Buildings. (3) differences which divided the vitality of the Franciscan movement on the Continent of Europe from its much quieter progress in England were as evident in the effect it had on places as on scholarship. In 1818 the body of St. Francis which had been deeply hidden was found, and this had led to a revival of interest in the Basilica in Assisi. A crypt was added in 1824 to house the tomb of St. Francis. From then, and especially after Leo XIII had exhorted the faithful to accord greater honour to the Saint, there was a steady increase in the number of pilgrims to the basilica and the tomb. Roman Catholic writers interpreted topography in guidebooks. Peter Anson in 1926 instructed pilgrims on which side of the train to sit to catch the best views of the Basilica according to their direction of travel. 45 Arnoldo Fortini, the Mayor of Assisi, produced a fine layman's interpretation of St. Francis and his Umbrian values for the seventh centenary of the Saint's death, confessing that his own soul was 'in this landscape'.45

In England there were no such great events. The Friars Minor did return to town parishes, notably in Forest Gate in East London and in the northern dioceses. One small but significant event occurred at Chilworth in Surrey. A yew sapling was planted. This had been grown in Killarney from a cutting taken from a tree felled by Oliver Cromwell. It was returned to English soil, no doubt to signify a change in the tide of opinion, which now flowed more in favour of the Roman Catholic Church.

(4) Allocating Franciscan Sacred Time. The same pattern of a slow start

in the response to Leo XIII's encouragement of Franciscan observance can be seen in the interest aroused by the liturgical calendar. Despite the Pope's expressed hope, the seventh centenary of St. Francis's birth in 1882 was 'observed diffidently and, as it were, behind closed doors'. There was much greater interest in England in the beatification of Thomas More, John Forest and fifty other English martyrs of the Reformation.

In contrast, the Feast of St. Francis was observed on 4 October 1926 with great splendour. In Italy there was a public holiday and a special issue of postage stamps. At Mass in Assisi a huge congregation celebrated the Saint's 'happy departure from this earthly exile for his heavenly home'. Although Britain could not rise to these heights in honour of St. Francis, there was a national celebration in Westminster Cathedral.

Roman Catholics in 1926 had to defend their evaluation of the Saint. This had not been so at the time of canonisation. Pius XI in an encyclical urged Roman Catholics to banish 'that imaginary picture' of St. Francis 'so popular among champions of modern life'.

How foolish they are and how little they know of the Saint of Assisi who for the purposes of their own errors invent a Francis – an incredible Francis – who is impatient of the authority of the Church, who cares nothing for the teaching of our faith, who is the herald of that false freedom which has been so much vaunted since the beginning of the present century and is the cause of such unrest in church and state.

7. THE 'OTHERS' MAKE A FRANCISCAN MOVEMENT VISIBLE IN GREAT BRITAIN: c.1850-1926.

In this section the organising principle will continue to be categories of resources rather than chronological sequence. In the treatment of each separate category, chronological sequence will be followed. Various categories of Franciscan texts have been made because the opportunity to read about St. Francis was far greater than in any earlier period.

(1) The Absence of Franciscan Sacred Time. Throughout this period there was no official allocation of sacred time to St. Francis in the Church of England or other churches. His name did not appear in the Prayer Book Calendar and there were no special readings or prayers to bring him to the attention of even the most assiduous worshipper. There is evidence that isolated churches on the Anglo-Catholic wing of the Church of England used a selection of feasts from the Roman Calendar, but no evidence that St. Francis was consistently honoured even by this group. It was only in 1926 that the Church Union Gazette, a magazine of the Anglo Catholics, suggested that its readers might seek permission from the Bishops to use the collect of St. Francis because there was nothing in the 'wording or sentiment' to which 'anybody could reasonably take exception'. 50

There is evidence that a number of individual members of the episcopate, like Bishops Lightfoot and Westcott of Durham, and Bishops Frere, Henson and Lang, knew about St. Francis and Franciscan Orders. There is evidence also that other clergy and lay people devoted some of their personal time and energy to 'Franciscan Studies', but I have found little to suggest that this knowledge ever occasioned liturgical commemoration. Alfred W. Pollard, a layman, marvelled at what preachers had managed to say about St. Simon and St. Jude, and about Korah, Dathan and Abiram, when they featured in the calendar and lectionary, but he had never in thirty years of listening to sermons ever heard one about St. Francis. Other parts of this section will show that a considerable amount of personal, social and professional time was allocated to studying St. Francis and Franciscanism, though usually as an adjunct to other areas of study for this was the period of the emergence of the 'intellectual'. St.

(2) The Provision of Franciscan Texts. Print had become an important

method for conveying information about, and interpretations of St. Francis.

This section is sub-divided into six parts.

Examples, c.1850-1894. Because no sacred time was allocated to St. Francis by the Church of England, there were no authorised sacred texts for the 'others' in this period, and few Roman Catholic texts generally available. There were, however, some notable examples of personal contributions.

The first example was an essay by Sir James Stephen in the Edinburgh Review in 1850. In it he complained that St. Francis had been treated with 'unmerited neglect' and 'unwarranted opprobrium' by the Protestant Churches.

In the same year the first edition of Mrs. Jameson's study of the representation of monastic orders in fine art was published. Though this was not strictly 'art criticism', it was published in many editions and was referred to by art critics at the turn of the century and beyond. Her chief interest was in the content rather than in the form, composition and technique of the pictures. She listed fifty paintings of St. Francis in the Pinacoteca in Perugia alone, which leaves to the imagination how many there must have been in Italy as a whole. From these representations she formed the opinion that St. Francis was a spiritual democrat. There were also Italian pictures representing the Franciscan Third Order. She disapproved of these because of their lack of joy and colour. Of the Spanish paintings on the same subject she disapproved even more. Tertiaries were represented as wearing the halters and bridles of subdued beasts. §3

The first English biography of St. Francis to be written was published in 1867, in the Sunday Library of Household Reading series. Its author, Mrs. Margaret Oliphant, was one of the most popular novelists of

the day, especially among women.

In a popular text, published in 1888, Matthew Arnold wrote that St. Francis must be detached from 'the Church, Holy, Catholic, Apostolic, and Roman' which 'can take good care of itself'. For Arnold St. Francis was 'a figure of most magical power and charm' who wrote the best poetry 'known or thought in the world'. §4

There is no evidence to suggest why Sir James Stephen wrote as he did about St. Francis. The other three authors all spent considerable periods of time in Italy, and Margaret Oliphant and Matthew Arnold both spoke and read Italian fluently. The former had access to Bollandist Latin texts, which she consulted in the course of writing her book and Arnold translated St. Francis's Italian poetry into English.

These isolated iceberg tips do not seem to have caused great general interest in St. Francis, though there are hints that they prepared the way for later developments through their effect on individuals.

(b) Authorising Scholarly Texts, c.1850-1926. The texts which form the subject of this sub-section came to be written because of an intense interest in England's roots and foundations among some of the educated classes. This had many offshoots which increased the demand for information, notably the introduction of Modern History, which included Medieval History, as a separate discipline in the Universities.

Professor William Stubbs, who held the Regius Chair of History at Oxford, had been working on medieval documents, and preparing them for publication with explanatory notes and comment on the texts. He was not alone. There must have been a great demand for the originals, as the Master of the Rolls, a judge of the High Court, gave a judgement on 26 January 1857 which instructed that some of England's 'chronicles and memorials' which were 'most scarce and valuable' should be printed, so that

the originals could be preserved. One of the first texts to be selected for printing was Monumenta Franciscana of which the main text was Thomas of Eccleston's Latin essay, "De Adventu Fratrum Minorum in Angliam". This volume appeared in 1858, and Professor R. S. Brewer, its editor, discussed 'the age and peculiarities' of the document and its 'historical credibility and value'. He concluded that a study of the Franciscans could contribute to an understanding of:

The rising community of the town. He [a friar] is their representative in many particulars, as well as their teacher. Like them [the towns] he [the friar] appears under different forms.

This kind of scholarship promoted a knowledge of Franciscanism among others of like mind, but, because of much technical detail, would have been inaccessible to the general reader, however well educated in other disciplines.

Such endeavours continued, and even increased, in the twentieth century. The British Society of Franciscan Studies published over twenty volumes of studies, almost entirely in Latin. The British raw material needed for what was coming to be almost an academic industry was very scarce, and caused great difficulty to those who wished to pursue it. Some appear to have become 'professional' material hunters, scouring the libraries at Oxford and Cambridge, the cathedrals, across Europe and even the Vatican Collection. As even these sources of information became exhausted, the search continued, unearthing treasure in unexpected places. Walter Seton had the good fortune to purchase The Rule of the Thirde Order of Seynt Franceys for the Bretheren and Sisters of the Order of Penitentis at a Sotheby's auction which he later published on behalf of the Early English Text Society. \frac{57}{2}

It needs to be stressed that this study was not undertaken specifically to promote knowledge of St. Francis and Franciscanism. Its

prime object was to further knowledge in a variety of disciplines: the textual criticism of medieval documents, the study of particular aspects of England's history and, in Seton's case, the philological study of Middle English, the fruits of which he submitted to London University for the degree of Doctor of Letters.

(c) Fine Art Criticism: Lectures and Other Texts, c.1850-1926. Mention has already been made of Mrs. Jameson's contribution: but she was not the earliest of those interested in Fine Art to mention pictures dealing with Franciscan subjects. As early as 1825, Thomas Phillips, in a lecture at the Royal Academy, paid tribute to the work of Cimabue and Giotto. A later commentator on this lecture, Francis Haskell, pointed out that 'the sentiment was not new, but never had it been expressed by someone whose art had so little in common with what he was praising'. 58

John Ruskin, who was perhaps the most famous art critic of the nineteenth century, was also devoted to St. Francis, although he had given up the religion of his childhood. He wrote in one of his letters to English working men, in the series entitled *Fors Clavigera* (1871-84) that he was spiritually a member of the Franciscan Third Order of Lay Brothers. 59

In the last years of the nineteenth century and the first decades of the twentieth, a number of books and articles published by Bernard Berenson and Roger Fry, two leading critics and connoisseurs, were concerned with Giotto, Cimabue and other Italian painters. The timing of their appearance gives rise to the suspicion that they were stimulated by a response to Paul Sabatier's François d'Assise which appeared in an English Translation in 1894. Roger Fry described Giotto as 'the greatest story-teller in line, the supreme epic-painter of the world'.

At about this time the ability of printers to include colour plates in art books had a profound effect on the way in which pictures were

perceived. Much of the work of Giotto, especially, had been conceived as part of a series, as in the frescos in the basilica at Assisi. When pictures were reproduced in books, they were issued singly, so the narrative content was lost, although the visual effect could be appreciated by a wider public. It is interesting to note, in passing, that certain sections of the fresco story were rarely selected, for example, the posthumous miracles. Perhaps the English art critics and connoisseurs did not think such matters suitable for inclusion in that age of homage to the power of the natural sciences. This aspect of the role of art in the appreciation of St. Francis will be touched on in another sub-section.

(d) General Interest Library Texts, 1894-1926. Ever since the middle of the nineteenth century more books had been produced for the growing number of civic, school, university, postal and personal libraries. Collections and series were a feature of the era.

The translation of Sabatier's work, just mentioned, is included in this section because it seemed to bring him into a special relationship with English Franciscan scholars. Sabatier became President of the Society of Franciscan Studies, lectured at Cambridge University and spent a considerable proportion of his time in England, despite holding a chair at Strasbourg. He also exercised a considerable influence on the founders of two Anglican Franciscan Third Orders, the subjects of later chapters.

It is probable that, in the 1920s, Sabatier was also the influence behind the opinions of Professor G. G. Coulton, editor of the Cambridge Medieval History Series. One of the volumes which Coulton contributed to this series was entitled *The Friars and the Dead Weight of Tradition*. He gave the judgement in this, and in other articles and publications, that the things which made Francis original were irreconcilable with the Roman Catholic Church such as it was then and such as it has been at any time

since. This is so close to Sabatier's own thesis that it is difficult to avoid the conclusion that Coulton was Sabatier's disciple.

It is also tempting to see the same influence at work in another series of publications, J. M. Dent's "Temple Classics" which made the early Franciscan texts available to the 'others'. Though these were a selection of 'the choicest of the world's literary masterpieces' which included Greek and Roman, Muslim and Hindu texts, the inclusion of St. Bonaventure's Legenda of St. Francis testified to the Saint's rising importance at the time. The series was marketed for 'real booklovers', with 'thin yet strong and opaque paper, uncut edges save for the gilt top, photogravure frontispieces, and gracious margins'. Like others in this series, the publishers claimed, St. Bonaventure's Legenda could be carried 'lightly in the pocket without disturbing the symmetry of the most fashionably cut coat'. 63

(e) Texts for Personal Leisure Reading, 1850-1926. Margaret Oliphant came across a copy of The Little Flowers, while on one of her visits to Italy. She was much impressed by the simple directness of the stories, and found in the 'tiny little unbound volume in the worst type and the rudest paper, costing only a few bajocchi ... evidence enough how these touching chronicles have kept hold of the heart of the Italian people'. When writing her book she had taken 'full advantage' of 'the fresh and delightful variety of life and circumstances' which these stories provided for her narrative. 64 Sabatier found them of 'an inestimable worth' in 'what for want of a better term we may call their atmosphere' and warned historians not to despise them. 1 They were considered of sufficient commercial worth to have been published in English in more than thirty different editions by 1926. In the 1930s they were to form the basis of Lawrence Housman's Little Plays of St. Francis who found that some of the incidents in *The Little Flowers* 'move us to smiles'. 'St. Francis', Housman wrote in 1926, 'was the maker of one play, one play that lasted twenty years'. 66

It says much for the general awareness of St. Francis in the first half of the twentieth century that the Salvation Army published Brother Francis as the first title of the Army's Red Hot Library, because the Saint exemplified practical compassion and outdoor evangelism. In another series about mysticism, St. Francis was included as a good example 'of that type of mysticism called religious'. He kept strange company. One of the others featured in the series was Theophrast Paracelsus, who was described as 'more of a magician than a saint, being one of the greatest of the medieval occultists'. 67

(f) Children's books. Children's books were in vogue and they connected St. Francis with the Englishness of the educated classes. A series, Dainty Books for the Bairns listed among its titles Jolly Times in Animal Land and The Adventures of Friskers and his Friends and Florence Bone's Saint Francis of Assisi: being the story of the glorious poor little one retold in simple words for children who think. Thinking young readers were informed that Francis 'far away from England' learnt 'the Latin language, just as boys do today, and to write very well in Italian'.

In another, Father Mackay, ostensibly writing for older choirboys asked, 'Do you know what an Isis idol is?'. 'Francis was an Isis idol', he told them. 'He got his blue for cricket, hunted in the winter and was a very promising polo player'. 68

(3) <u>Celebrating Topography</u>, c.1850-1926. The Industrial Revolution caused a reaction in the educated English which became apparent at around the middle of the nineteenth century and has persisted ever since: a hankering for unspoilt countryside with its natural beauty and peace. §§

In mid-Victorian England, 'Englishness' came to be defined as 'rural landscape', 'South country' and a yearning for the company of animals and birds and the smell of wild flowers. 70

There was a ready identification with Sabatier's vivid evocations of Umbrian topography, describing the stony path 'under olive trees, amid odours of lavender and rosemary' from Assisi to the 'humble hermitage' of St. Damian. He also gave a graphic description of the rugged and slippery route which St. Francis and his first followers took from 'a ruinous cottage called Rivo Torto' in the plain beneath Assisi to the 'shallow natural grottos' on the ridge of Mount Subasio towering over the town. Matthew Arnold, whose appreciation of St. Francis as a nature poet has already been recorded, had prepared the way for this, and travel writers followed. Gabriel Fauré, for example, used this love of rural landscape and a fashionable interest in things Italian to celebrate what came to be called 'Franciscan Italy'. His book, The Land of St. Francis, translated from the French and published by the Medici Society, was typical of travel books produced by the 'others' for the 'others'. Reaching Assisi:

We must put away our books and wander through the streets of this town, immortalised by Francis Bernadone, for it is his [Francis's] life which gives it life and movement.

He warned, however, of 'what sadness, what frigidity' the tourist would find in the Franciscan topography constructed by men of the Church. Of St. Francis, Fauré wrote:

No one was less of a churchman. He was neither priest or theologian. He did not even know his Bible well. He hardly knew the Saints, of whom he was to become one of the greatest.

A further example of the identification of rural Englishness and its birds with St. Francis can be seen in the parish church of Selborne in Hampshire. The parish's most famous curate was also, and to some still is, the country's most celebrated naturalist, Gilbert White (1720-93), who wrote

The Natural History and Antiquities of Selborne. In 1926 a stained-glass window was designed for and installed in the church to commemorate him. St. Francis is featured prominently, preaching to the birds: but the birds are English, the species described in White's book.

(4)Silent Proclamation by Paintings, c.1850-1926. Private, municipal and national collectors were active in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Paintings of St. Francis came to England in this way, adding to the range of opportunities for knowledge of the Saint. Those that came from carefully-arranged religious displays suffered the same changes as reproductions in art books. They were seen in isolation, not as part of a total story. Three paintings purchased by the National Gallery illustrate this. The first, an Italian painting of the Virgin and Child with Saints Francis and Sebastian, had a portrayal of the donatrix kneeling as St. Francis's feet. Later additions were two of the fourteen versions of St. Francis painted by the Spaniard, Francisco Zubaran, bought to augment the Gallery's Spanish collection. All three had originally been hung in religious buildings as part of an integrated display. The curator had a different story to tell - more to do with the history and development of painting than St. Francis himself, but in telling it he brought the Saint to the attention of connoisseurs and the viewing public. 73

Some new paintings of this period served the same secondary purpose and added a further dimension of nostalgia for the past. The pre-Raphaelite St. John's Wood School made important contributions to the construction of Englishness in pictures which portrayed the values of past ages. Some of them were of St. Francis, which not only gave him more prominence, but helped to confirm the identification of the Saint with pre-industrial, pastoral Englishness. 15

(5) Appropriating Artefacts for New Purposes, 1900-1926. Artefacts from

the first age of Franciscan influence were very few. Possibly the only exhibitable example was the medieval town seal of Winchelsea, which was found in 1907 after being lost for many years. Its reverse side showed the town's Franciscan friary as one of a group of five buildings. 76

New artefacts of the period tended more to confirm the prominence achieved by Franciscanism than contribute to it. Domestic and garden ornaments, mass-produced in the early years of the century, included groups of friars drinking their beer dregs to keep warm. Copies of this group could be purchased for display on mantlepieces. Jugs in the shape of friars were commonplace. By 1926 it was possible to buy statues of St. Francis of various sizes and at different prices, a clear indication of the level of prominence he had achieved.

The Saint also features in artefacts used to commemorate the dead or to celebrate some event. Several examples can still be seen. Lt. Col. Forbes donated a stained-glass window to West Runton Church in Norfolk in memory of his wife. It shows St. Francis set in a garden scene composed of English and Italian motifs. In churches at Islip in Oxfordshire and Gosport in Hampshire, copies of the della Robbia bas-relief panel depicting St. Francis and St. Dominic greeting each other with the kiss of peace are hung as memorials to past members of the congregations. A sculpture of St. Francis and the Wolf of Gubbio - another symbol of reconciliation - was placed in St. Peter's Church, Plymouth. The memorial window at Selborne has already been mentioned.

It remains one of the great ironies that Church of England churches displayed representations of a Saint who had no place in their devotions.

(6) Occupying Symbolic Space, 1900-1926. Because the friars had built simply, and built in towns, very few of their pre-Reformation sites survived, even as ruins, and none on the scale of the great Benedictine

and Benedictine-derived abbey and priory ruins. Their former presence could be deduced from the number of streets, lanes and courts named 'Greyfriars', but little else.

The fashionable Victorian delight in the medieval period, combined with the growing awareness of Franciscanism, produced a great deal of patient antiquarian and archaeological activity. This served to enhance the cause of St. Francis still further. It would be interesting, though irrelevant, to speculate as to the reasons why St. Francis and his followers received this attention while St. Dominic's Black Friars did not. It is sufficient to note that, by the early years of the twentieth century, patient research was yielding information concerning the Franciscans' pre-Reformation activity, which a few examples will illustrate.

In the City of London, close to St. Paul's, there are two plaques on the same wall in Newgate. One reads: Site of Greyfriars Monastery 1225-1538, the other: Site of Christs Hospital 1552-1902. Shortly after the school moved to Horsham, the building was totally demolished to make way for the present structure, leaving no trace of either of its predecessors. Charles Lethbridge Kingsford explained in 1915 that the original ground plans of the monastery had to be reconstructed from documents scattered in various archive collections, including the Public Records Office, itself a latenineteenth century 'newcomer'. Using Kingsford's evidence, and that of the Camden Society and the London and Middlesex Archaeological Society, J. L. Lake wrote to The Times at the time of the centenary celebrations of St. Francis's Day, 1926, to remind the 'million who daily throng the City of London' that men who had seen the 'holy face' of St. Francis had walked on the streets of 'our city'. Moreover, the City Fathers had been patrons of the friars. Their church's nave had been built by Sir Henry le Waleys, 'who was five times Lord Mayor of London'. The bodies of four Queens and

the heart of Edward II had been buried there. 18

Canterbury was another centre of such activity. Here, the Franciscans' house remained, standing on the banks of the River Stour, in private occupation. Charles Cotton, having read about it in the 'records of the Franciscan Province of England' in the Cottonian Collection in the British Museum, found more documentary evidence in the Library of the Dean and Chapter of Canterbury Cathedral. He painstakingly pieced together its history, and, by the seventh centenary of the friars' arrival in Canterbury in 1924, was able to publish a full-length study of their arrival, their work in the city and their house. The book's frontispiece was provided by one of the rare photographs of Paul Sabatier, champion of the Greyfriars' cause, standing in the garden of Greyfriars House.

Cotton had been inspired and encouraged in this task by Sabatier's example, and Sabatier provided direct encouragement for further antiquarian and archaeological research. Sites in Chichester, Lincoln and Gloucester, among others, were places where the Greyfriars' life and work were reconstructed with the same patient care.

8. THE CULMINATION AT THE SEVENTH CENTENARY OF ST. FRANCIS'S DEATH, 1926.

The seventh centenary year of the death of St. Francis demonstrated the extent to which the Saint, barely known in this country seventy-five years previously, had become sufficiently visible to be public property. Incidents from and aspects of his recorded life were accepted as sufficiently well known to form the background for popular journalism and humour. As already observed, during the first week in October, The Times, The Daily Telegraph, The Daily Express and journals gave St. Francis extensive coverage.

Such prominence was not necessarily without cost. Father Bampton sympathised with 'the genuine sons of St. Francis', the Friars Minor, when he wrote about:

These excellent people [who] have 'taken up' St. Francis and made him the object of a sort of fashionable cult. We seem to know that class of persons, who feel that they must be up to date and be ready to talk glibly about St. Francis ... because everyone is.

Father Canice left no doubt in 1926 about the association between Roman Catholicism and the Franciscan Third Order in *The Thorough Catholic: An Ideal attained by the Third Order of St. Francis.* His book contained teaching virtually unaltered since an early member of that Order, Gregory IX, had canonised St. Francis in 1228.

The purpose in Part Two is to trace how, in different social contexts, James Granville Adderley, Emily Esther Marshall, John Copley Winslow, and Verrier Holman Elwin came to know of some of these Franciscan resources and the values they conveyed; and how they came to be founders of embryonic Anglican Franciscan Third Orders.

1.

NOTES.

- 'A Saint is a person, now dead, whom the Church allows to be publicly venerated.' Jacques Douillet, What is a Saint? (1958:84).
- 2. Jacques Douillet in What is a Saint explained the significance of the Church's Calendar: 'The Church's course could thus be followed stage by stage, at each of which trials and tribulations were overcome with the aid of those who in turn went before Christ's people, bearing the torch of holiness' (1958:104).
- 3. Regis Boyer (1981) in "An attempt to define the typology of medieval hagiography" in Hagiography and Medieval Literature, suggested that in medieval hagiographies the 'geographical frame is loose' and that landscapes only 'add gleams' to the lives of the Saints (1981:28-29). While this could be true of some medieval hagiographies, for example, of Saints of monastic Orders, it was not the case for the hagiographies of St. Francis. We need, however, to remember that photography and numerous word-pictures have today made many of these places familiar to us. We may see more than is actually written in the earliest accounts.
- 4. Benedict Anderson, Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism, (1983:9).
- 5. There are now many edited versions of Thomas of Celano's sacred biographies. The most useful and comprehensive source for all the early Franciscan texts is St. Francis of Assisi, Writings and Early Biographies: English Omnibus of the Sources for the Life of St. Francis. This work of almost 2,000 pages edited by Marion A. Habig contains an Introduction to Thomas of Celano written by Placid Hermann.
- 6. Marion A. Habig's Omnibus of Sources also includes St. Bonaventure's Legenda Eric Doyle (1983) in The Disciple and Master: St. Bonaventure's Sermons on St. Francis has written one of the best and most sympathetic studies of St. Bonaventure.
- 7. Lucien Febvre and Henri-Jean Martin in *The Coming of the Book: The Impact of Printing* have an excellent chapter, "The Book as a Force for Change". Febvre and Martin pointed out that the manuscripts which were to be made into identical, multiple copies had to be selected and that of all the manuscripts in existence, most were not selected. The writings of St. Bonaventure and of Dante were among those chosen for the new method. Once selected, printed texts were available 'on such a scale as to give them an impact which the manuscript has never achieved'; and 'by multiplying books by the hundred and then thousands the press achieved both increased volume and at the same time more rigorous selection' (1976:248-51 and 273).

- 8. Raphael Brown in Habig's, Omnibus of Sources, and in an edited edition of The Little Flowers of St. Francis, has placed this work in a historical perspective. There are now numerous editions available.
- 9. A. Koltonski in St Francis of Assisi and Giotto: Art on the Altar of Faith claimed that 'not a city in Italy did not possess a shrine consecrated to the Francis Cult' (1929:19). Koltonski has a fine description of the significance of Assisi's sacred architecture. There are today dozens of books which provide information.
- 10. T. A. Heslop (1987) in "Attitudes to the Visual Arts: The Evidence from Written Sources" has provided an excellent discussion of attitudes to visual art in the period 1200-1400. The article was written for the catalogue of the Royal Academy Exhibition, The Age of Chivalry: Art in Plantagenet England.
- 11. Francis Newton, St. Francis and his Basilica, Assisi, (1976:78).
- Andrew Martindale (1969) in The Complete Paintings of Giotto, introduced 12. the artist's work with "An Outline of the artist's critical history". Martindale quoted G. Boccaccio, c.1350, who in Decameron had written 'he [Giotto] was responsible for reviving that art which had for many centuries lain hidden on account of the erroneous opinion that the purpose of painting was to provide pleasure for the eyes of the ignorant rather than for the intellect of the knowledgeable'. Martindale also quoted F. Vilani, c.1381, who in De origine civitatis Florentiae et eiusdem famosis civibus had written of Giotto's work in Florence where the painter had also created a cycle of St. Francis: 'from this excellent man ... there gushed glistening streams of paintings, resulting in a completely new style in which nature was both cleverly and pleasantly portrayed'. (Both quotations on p.9). There is ample other evidence that the paintings were seen as a breakthrough when they were painted, even marking a change in religious sentiments.
- 13. Numerous paintings of St. Francis were placed in churches in Italy, especially in Umbria and Tuscany, and their importance for conveying and maintaining knowledge of St. Francis cannot be overemphasised. There is not space in this thesis to consider more than a few representative paintings and, some might feel, those of Gozzolli at Montefalco or of Cimabue at Assisi could have been a better choice for illustration. Although listing and discussing these paintings as works of art anticipates later discussion, it could be useful here to list some recent and accessible written and illustrative sources. An extensive listing of paintings with small photographs can be found in three works by George Kaftal, St. Francis and Italian Painting (1950), Iconography in Tuscan Paintings (1952), and Iconography of the Saints in Central and South Italian Schools of Painting (1965). Series like 'The Classics in World Art' and 'The Masters', provide large plates. For Giotto, Andrew Martindale, (1969), The Complete Paintings of Giotto, and P. B. Hetherington (n.d.), Giotto, have provided both introductory articles and plates. Jane Dillenberger (1986), Style and Content in Christian Art and Millard Meiss (1970), The Great Age of Fresco: Discoveries, Recoveries and Survivals have written excellent texts, the first about Christian art in general, and the second specifically about frescos. Descriptions made

in the period under particular review in the final section of this chapter, 1882-1926, remain valuable - for example, the works of Henry Thode, Mrs. Jameson, Mrs. Salter, Mrs. Bell, Roger Fry, Bernard Berenson, Tancred Borenius, and H. A. Goad.

- 14. For reasons already explained, it has not been possible to elaborate this aspect of the resources in detail. The Assisi church, for instance, had ceilings which allegorised poverty, chastity, and obedience.
- 15. Thomas of Eccleston's Chronicle, De Adventu Fratrum Minorum ad Angliam, from which these figures are taken will be discussed in greater detail later.
- 16. There are now many studies of the Reformation. Henry Bettinson (1988), in Documents of the Christian Church, has collected and edited the most important documentary sources from which quotation has been made Patrick Collinson's (1990) "The Late medieval Church and its Reformation" provides an excellent broad and visual picture of the period. There are to my knowledge no studies which deal with the full range of Franciscan resources which may once have existed in England. This is probably because there is not enough evidence to warrant a full-scale work. The difficulty of the task of reconstruction which we shall presently consider is illustrated by the publication in 1937 of A. R. Martin's Franciscan Architecture in England. This was the final volume of the Society of British Franciscan Studies and marked, as the Chairman believed, the completed reconstruction of Pre-Reformation architecture which the author had taken more than twenty-five years to assemble.
- 17. Margaret Bowker in "The Henrician Reformation and the Parish Clergy" has observed that 'even the simplest villager could not fail to notice a change when Saint's days were abolished, bibles purchased, and shrines and places of pilgrimage and devotion were removed'. (1987:76). The loss of Franciscan resources was not confined to the loss of the friaries.
- 18. Michael Perham, in The Communion of Saints: An Examination of the Place of the Christian Dead in the Belief and Worship and Calendar of the Church (1980) fully discussed the stages of the making of the Church of England Calendars of Saints, and the range of views in the Church of England about the Invocation of Saints. It is important to remember that not all Saints were removed from the Church of England Calendars. The Feast Day of St. Benedict, for example, was retained. St. Francis was given a place in the Calendar of the Church of England Prayer Book of 1928 which was rejected by Parliament, but was not restored legally to the official calendar of the Church of England approved by Parliament until 1987.
- 19. Margaret Aston, (1982), has written an excellent account, "English Ruins and English History: The Dissolution and the Sense of the Past" of the 'visible rupture' in English society.
- 20. Lazaro Iriarte, a Spanish Roman Catholic historian, in Franciscan History: The Three Orders of St. Francis of Assisi, placed English history in perspective. Iriarte described the seventeenth century as

'stable and 'productive' for the Franciscan Orders. The figures are those quoted by Iriarte, (1982:83). He explained that his methods of calculation were complex and approximate because of the divisions of the Roman Catholic Franciscan Orders into branches, and varying qualities of original sources. Since the point here is to contrast fewer than a thousands and many thousands, the finer distinctions can be by-passed.

- 21. Iriarte, Franciscan History, (1982:495).
- 22. Iriarte, Franciscan History, (1982:293)
- 23. Murillo, for example, painted St. Francis and Franciscan Saints for the Capuchin Convent at Seville (now in the Seville Museum); Zubaran painted St. Francis at least fourteen times (two now in the English National Gallery); and at least forty seven paintings of St. Francis by the prolific Rubens are still in existence.
- 24. Harold A. Goad, (1929) in *The Fame of St. Francis*, The First Walter Seton Memorial Lecture, contrasted Italian and Spanish representations of St. Francis.
- 25. Two collections especially were of long-term influence. Luke Wadding's 1623 collection, Beati Patris Francisci Assisiatis Opuscula, and the 1768 Bollandist collection in Acta Sanctorum. In the latter Fr. Constant Suyskens provided a lucid commentary. For the first time since 1263, as F. C. Burkitt observed in 1926 in his article, "The Study of the Sources of the Life of St. Francis of Assisi", the question of 'the relative value' of sources was posed.
- 26. Alban Butler, (1710-73), author of *The Lives of the Saints* was educated at Douai and ordained a priest of the Roman Catholic Church in 1735. After extensive travel and collection of sacred biographies he published his monumental account of the lives of over sixteen hundred Saints from 1756-9. From 1926 to 1938 a drastically reduced edition of twelve volumes was edited, revised and supplemented by H. Thurston, Norah Leeson, and D. Attwater. It has since been further revised, added to, and corrected, and in 1985 a concise edition was printed. Archbishop Hume, commending the last edition judged that 'it must surely rank with the *Douai Bible* and *The Garden of the Soul* as one of the most influential works of piety produced within the Catholic community'. Over centuries, this may be so; but only a minority of non-Catholics would have had access to the voluminous work before the twentieth century.
- 27. This inaccessibility of Roman Catholic 'learned works' has been commented upon by both Roman Catholic and non-Roman Catholic scholars. See, for example, Walter Seton, (1926), Essays in Commemoration 1226-1926, and Jacques Douillet, What is a Saint?. Douillet wrote that the Bollandist's prodigious work was 'not intended for the public at large, but for historians and biographers, whose business it is to digest and diffuse the results of so much expert research' (1958:116).
- 28. Many would still agree with R. H. Tawney that 'Puritanism, not the Tudor secession from Rome, was the true Reformation'. Religion and the Spirit of Capitalism, (1926:198).

- 29. Edward Gibbon, Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire in Six Volumes. Vol. Three, Ch. XXVIII, "Destruction of Paganism; Introduction of the Worship of Saints and Relics among Christians. (1737-1794). Gibbon wrote this chapter after touring Italy.
- 30. Joseph Priestley, A History of the Corruptions of Christianity, (1818:108 and 131).
- 31. Bob Bushaway (1982) in his overview of English 'folk customs' in By Rite: Custom, Ceremony and Community in England, 1870-1880 has no references to St. Francis. Even Charles Marson, who was one of the most avid collectors of folk lore, and devoted to St. Francis, failed to find evidence of the social presence of St. Francis in English folk culture in this period.
- 32. Lazaro Iriarte, Franciscan History: The Three Orders of St. Francis of Assisi. Part Three was titled "The Great Ordeal (c.1768-c.1880)" (1982:375-90).
- 33. The Syllabus of Errors grouped the condemned errors under ten heads.
- 34. The eightieth proposition of The Syllabus of Errors.
- A number of accounts have been written of the pontificate of Leo XIII. 35. He had an exceptionally long and productive reign (1878-1901). Only a handful of studies make more than passing references to his membership of the Third Order and his consistent promotion of it. There are, however, some useful sources. Lillian Parker Wallace, (1966), Leo XIII and the Rise of Socialism places the Pontificate in its European social context. Marion A. Habig, O.F.M. and Mark Hegener, O.F.M.(1977) in A Short History of the Third Order and Lazaro Iriarte, O.F.M. Cap., (1982), in Franciscan History: The Three Orders of St. Francis of Assisi examine his contribution to Franciscan history. Etienne Gilson (1954), has collected, translated and edited Leo XIII's Encyclical Letters containing 'social teachings' in The Church Speaks to the Modern World: The Social Teachings of Leo XIII. James Meyer (1943) has collected translations of Leo XIII's Encyclicals about the Franciscan Third Order in Rome Hath Spoken.
- 36. Cardinal Vaughan in a Preface dated 11 April, 1893, printed in the 1904 Franciscan Third Order Manual.
- 37. Today, Roman Catholic scholars, who have made Franciscan Studies their specialist subject, are united in their agreement that Auspicato Concessum marked and symbolised among Roman Catholics the start of a modern revival of devotion to St. Francis. See, for example, T. Matura, (1982) "François d'Assise et sa Posterité Aujourd'hui" and L. de A. Iriarte, (1982), Franciscan History.
- 38. Leo XIII also encouraged the growth of the Franciscan First Order. On 4 October 1897, he decreed the apostolic constitution Felicitate quadam, in which the developing Orders were combined under the single title: Ordo Fratrum Minorum. In addition to the Franciscans, O. F. M., there were the Conventuals (O. F. M. Conv.) and the Capuchins (O. F. M.

- Cap.). In addition, the Third Order Regular (T. O. R.), continued to develop. These Orders are beyond the scope of this thesis, except in so far as they impinge on the Third Order Secular.
- 39. Lillian Parker Wallace, (1966), Leo XIII and the Rise of Socialism has the fullest account of Leo XIII's efforts to counter new political and social movements. The Social Teachings of Leo XIII has the full texts of his encyclicals.
- 40. Ernst Renan's Nouvelles Etudes d'Histoire Religieuse was published in France in 1884 and in English, Studies in Religious History, in 1886. It was a sequel to studies of religious history in 1857 which dealt with the emergence and Graeco-Roman-Judaic influences in Christianity. "St. Francis of Assisi" was set in what H. A. Goad stingingly described as a 'philosophical pot-pourri'. St. Francis was placed in Renan's personal 'communion of saints' which included the Buddha, pagan and mythical deities, the Teaziehs of Persia, Joachim di Flor, Galileo, Port Royal nuns, and Spinoza. For Renan, St. Francis was at the heart of an exciting period of 'revolutionary agitation'. He had 'complete originality'. He was 'the only perfect Christian since Jesus'. He had lived for 'a fortnight on the chirp of a grasshopper'.
- 41. Iriarte, Franciscan History, (1982:509). Iriarte's figures are very much more sophisticated than this bald statement; the purpose here is only to point to broad contrasts.
- 42. Paschal Robinson's (1907) A Short Introduction to Franciscan Literature from which this quotation comes was published in New York but entered in London at the Stationer's Hall.
- 43. Francis Newton, O. M. C., St. Francis and his Basilica, Assisi, (1926:142).
- 44. Peter F. Anson, (1926), A Pilgrim's Guide to Italy. Mary Cameron and others also wrote guides. A comparison of guides to Assisi could be a very fruitful source of study for comparisons of content and outlook.
- 45. Gemma Fortini (1983) in "The Contribution of Arnaldo Fortini to Franciscan Studies" has written an account of the background of Fortini's book. Fortini's splendid account was not translated into English in 1926.
- 46. Lazaro Iriarte de Aspurz, Franciscan History: The Three Orders of St. Francis (1982:397).
- 47. Walter W. Seton in six "Letters from Assisi", each of several columns, printed in the *Church Times* for six weeks from 4 September 1926 wrote a full account of these proceedings. The publication of these letters is evidence of the interest of the Anglo-Catholic wing of the Church of England in Roman Catholic activities at this time.
- 48. The foundation stone of Westminster Cathedral was laid in 1897 to commemorate the arrival of St. Augustine, and the 1926 centenary of St. Francis was marked with laying the foundation stone of a new choir school.

- 49. Pius XI, Encyclical Letter of Pope Pius XI to his venerable brethren the patriarchs, primates, archbishops, bishops, and other ordinaries in peace and communion with the Apostolic See, on St. Francis of Assisi, on the occasion of the seventh centenary of his death. (1926:15).
- 50. The collect for which permission was sought was this: O God, who by the merits of Blessed Francis dost increase thy Church with new offspring; grant, we beseech Thee, that after his pattern we may learn to despise all things earthly, and ever rejoice in the partaking of Thy heavenly bounty. The Church Union Gazette. September, (1926:189).
- 51. Alfred W. Pollard, Introduction to the Series, Messages of the Saints, in L. Housman, Francis of Assisi, (1918:viii).
 - T. W. Heyck, (1982), in *The Transformation of Intellectual Life in Victorian England* explained the emergence of the 'intellectual'.
- 53. Anna B. Jameson, Legends of the Monastic Orders, as represented in the Fine Arts: forming the Second Series of Sacred and Legendary Art. Jameson outlined the life of St. Francis, as well as describing the paintings, (1850:238-46).
- 54. Matthew Arnold, Essays in Criticism. First edition 1865, but popular second series in 1888. The essay, "Pagan and Medieval Religious Sentiment", is about St. Francis.
- 55. R. S. Brewer, Preface to Monumenta Franciscana (1858: xiv).

52.

56.

- A. G. Little, (1932), in "A Note on the History and Work of the British Society of Franciscan Studies" outlined the development of this Society after its formal constitution. Its origin will be mentioned in this next chapter. By 1926, it had five professors in its editorial board.
- 57. Walter W. Seton, (1914), Two Fifteenth-Century Franciscan Rules edited from the MS.
- 58. Thomas Phillips's Lectures on the History and Principles of Painting were published in 1858. Haskell dicussed these lectures in Rediscoveries in Art: Some Aspects of Taste, Fashion and Collecting in England and France (1976). Citations from pages 88 and 95.
- 59. In Fors Clavigera. Ruskin's letter to 'working men' was quoted or copied on a number of occasions. In 1926, for example, Louis Vincent included an extract in his anthology printed for private circulation. The leading article of The Times Literary Supplement in the week of the seventh anniversary of the death of St. Francis (October 1926) also made reference to it. It has been claimed that Ruskin even considered joining the Roman Catholic Church because he wanted to be an actual member of the Franciscan Third Order. It is possible that the fraternity Ruskin founded in his latter years was influenced by the ideas he had formed of a Franciscan Third Order. These would seem to have been drawn entirely from art and his imagination, not from study of the 1229 Rule of the Third Order that he would have been required to observe.

- 60. Bernard Berenson followed his *The Central Italian Painters of the Renaissance* (1897) with more specific articles about Giotto and St. Francis, for example, in *The Burlington Journal*.
- 61. Roger Fry, "Giotto" in The Monthly Review (1900:151).
- 62. Francis Haskell, in *The Painful Birth of the Art Book*, pointed to this little-investigated phenomena. 'What perhaps also requires investigation is the more controversial role played by volumes of this kind in transforming paintings specifically designed for a wide variety of particular purposes religious contemplation, moral instruction, sexual arousal into objects whose pure aesthetic enjoyment is distorted only by occasional doubts as to the name of their creator' (1987:57).
- 63. The Temple Classic of St. Bonaventure's *Legenda* in the British Library is missing and it has been impossible to replace it. Did a gentleman unobtrusively slip it into his pocket?
- 64. Margaret Oliphant, Introduction to Francis of Assisi, (1879:xvi).
 - Paul Sabatier, Life of St. Francis of Assisi, (1894:416).
- 66. L. Housman, St. Francis, Poverello, (1918:2).

65.

- 67. Other mystics in the series were Swedish Seer: Emmanuel Swedenborg, English Quaker: George Fox, French Quietist: Madame Guyon; God-taught Philosopher: Jacob Boehme, Friend of God: John Tauler, Seer, Poet and Artist: William Blake and Spanish Saint: Theresa of Avila.
- 68. H. F. B. Mackay, The Message of St. Francis.
- 69. Jan Marsh (1982), in Back to the Land: The Pastoral Impulse in Victorian England, from 1880 to 1914 has written a full account of the passion of the English for what they believed to be their traditional landscape.
- 70. For a discussion of the concept of Englishness, see Robert Coles and Philip Dodd (Ed.), (1986), Englishness: Politics and Culture 1880-1920.
- 71. Fauré, The Land of St. Francis, (1924:78,68,75). Mary Lovett Cameron's, The Enquiring Pilgrim's Guide to Assisi: To Which is Added the First Life of St. Francis of Assisi by Thomas of Celano was published in 1926 by Methuen and Company giving an alternative interpretation. Edward Hutton's Cities of Umbria was published in 1915. Since then, there have been numerous travel guides.
- 72. David E. Allen, (1976), in *The Naturalist in Britain: A Social History* has written an account of the development of natural history in this period.
- 73. Martin Davies, (1946), A Few Saints in the National Gallery. When Stefano di Giovanni Sassetta's altar piece completed in 1444 for the church of S. Francesco at Borgo San Sepolchro was split in 1934, seven of the eight panels illustrating the life of St. Francis were bought by the National Gallery in London.

- 74. Malcolm Chase and Christopher Shaw (1989) have written of "the dimensions of nostalgia" in the paintings of the period.
- 75. Francis Haskell, "The Manufacture of the Past in Nineteenth Century Painting", in Haskell, Past and present in Art and Taste: Selected Essays. Henry Stacy Marks, R. A., founder of the St. John's Wood Clique, for example, painted a number of historical subjects. Only his 'St. Francis' is still available today in a Medici Society postcard (No. 2006).
- 76. The Seal of the Corporation of Winchelsea dates from the early part of the reign of Edward I (1272-1307). The Obverse names it 'The seal of the Barons of our Lord the King of England of Winchelsae'. The Counter Seal has representations of five buildings in the town, including the Franciscan friary. Winchelsea was much favoured as a residence of artists and poets in the late-nineteenth century, and water-colour paintings were often made of the ruins of the Franciscan friary there. Streets and hills of the neighbourhood are still named after the town's friaries.
- 77. Charles Dellheim (1982) in The Face of the Past: The Preservation of the Medieval Inheritance in Victorian England has written one of the fuller studies of this widespread trend.
- 78. J. L. Lake in a letter to the Editor of *The Times* written on 3 October, and published on 6 October, 1926.
- 79. Charles Cotton, "Records of the Franciscan Province of England: Cotton Charter XXX.40." Collectanea Franciscana I. Volume V of the British Society of Franciscan Studies, (1914:141-153). Charles Cotton, "Notes on the Documents in the Cathedral Library at Canterbury relating to Grey Friars". Collectanea Franciscana II. Volume X of the British Society for Franciscan Studies (1922:1-9).
- 80. Charles Cotton, (1924), The Grey Friars of Canterbury.
- 81. J. C. Bampton, The Secret of St. Francis, (1926:4).
- 82. Father Canice wrote a second book in 1926, The Ideal Franciscan: A Short Treatise for the Brothers and Sisters of Penance. Both books were published in Dublin.

PART TWO.

CHAPTER THREE.

THE SOCIAL DRAMAS OF JAMES GRANVILLE ADDERLEY.

Part One.

SEEKING TO BE 'A SORT OF FRIAR', 1861-1893.

1. IMBIBING VALUES FROM THE SOCIAL CONTEXTS OF EARLY LIFE, 1861-84.

(1) A Son of Hams Hall. James Granville Adderley, born on the 1st July 1861 at Hams Hall, Birmingham, was the fifth son of Sir Charles Bowyer Adderley and his wife, Eliza, daughter of the first Lord Leigh, a descendant of Oliver Cromwell. In 1878 Sir Charles Adderley retired from the House of Commons after thirty-seven years, was given a peerage, and took the title of Baron Norton. James Adderley became 'the Honourable'.

At Hams Hall, the family home near Birmingham, James Adderley met people motivated by various combinations of political, religious and social values which they applied in a wide range of social contexts. Lord Norton had served in Disraeli's governments, but 'with Mr. Gladstone especially he was long on cordial terms'. Archbishop Benson, Bishop Edward King of Lincoln, and Cardinal Manning were among those who regularly visited Hams Hall.

Actors were also frequent visitors because Lady Adderley, for as long as James could remember, had each year organised house parties for amateur actors which attained 'social celebrity'. As Adderley later recalled, 'I was brought up in a house famous for its theatricals': he was a troubadour among the Warwickshire county elite as Francesco Bernadone

had been among the ruling class in Umbria.

As far as we know, Roman Catholic Franciscan friars, of whom there were then very few in England, never went to Adderley's home or to Eton College where he was educated. There are no records to suggest that, when young, Adderley went to Assisi, or even to Italy. Yet, when he was fifty-five, he revealed that he 'was always wanting to be a sort of friar'. Nothing survives to explain how or when this early desire was formed. It could be, judging from his subsequent actions, that folk tales, Shakespeare's friars, and a translation of the Fioretti were early formative influences, but there is no concrete evidence to support this.

(2) From Student to Actor at Oxford University. Adderley (usually known as Jim) went up to Christ Church, Oxford, where he acquired information about St. Francis and Franciscans, imbibed an ethos, and gained tactical experience in overcoming institutional obstacles.

Adderley was a student in the history school, still in its infancy. He studied modern history (which included the medieval period) rather than the history of the ancient world. Though he was not a diligent student, nevertheless through lectures and reading he had access to information about the role of the Franciscan friars in the Middle Ages. This included the 'scarce and valuable' Franciscan documents which the Master of the Rolls had ordered to be printed for students. Roger Bacon, William of Ockham and a number of other friars who had helped to build Oxford's reputation as a centre of learning became familiar names, and the young student discovered that friars had engaged in the same kinds of activities as his parents. Like Lord Norton, they could be called 'fathers of town planning's and they too had been particularly concerned to provide adequate water and drainage - a nineteenth-century problem in urban areas to which Adderley was later often to refer. Like Lady Norton,

medieval friars had enabled the production and improvisation of plays.

Adderley also imbibed some of the values offered to students of his generation by those leading intellectuals, who thought deeply and widely beyond the confines of a particular period. Three arguments he long remembered: J. R. Green's argument that the history and making of the English people did not consist only in the actions of its kings, queens and aristocracy; T. H. Green's argument that ideal liberalism required 'a politics of conscience'; Charles Gore's argument that Christians should respond to new ideas without rejecting the basic tenets of Christianity.

Adderley had come to Oxford from Hams Hall with 'a mind bent on the stage'.10 However, in 1879, as Adderley commented, 'an acting undergraduate was an anomaly; he was forbidden by statutes; he had never existed and he must never do so'. The University 'forbade young men to run the risk of contamination by witnessing, or taking part in, a play of Shakespeare, Sheridan or Goldsmith'. He overcame the problem by persuading students to act in 'dramas'. The imaginative tactics with which he circumvented university regulations cannot be included in this selective account, but the success of his creative casuistry provided a model for his later behaviour. 12 Church of England statutes had for three centuries forbidden its members to become Franciscans, so Adderley overcame this problem by being what he wanted to be, a follower of St. Francis. persuaded other people to take part in the social dramas from which the title of this chapter is derived. 13

(3) An Articled Clerk in Westminster reads a Pamphlet. Perhaps because of his son's aptitude for drama and argument, Lord Norton articled Adderley to Birchams, a firm of solicitors in Westminster. It was an appropriate social context for the son of member of the House of Lords who might later want to be a member of the House of Commons. However, in

1883 Adderley began in the evenings and at weekends to leave the area of the Palace of Westminster to go the area of London which had recently been named 'the East End'. He had read *The Bitter Cry of Outcast London*, a pamphlet he bought for one penny.

The Bitter Cry of Outcast London was a vivid description of how people in the East End struggled to live in appalling housing conditions. There is no evidence to indicate whether or not the anonymous author derived his evocative title, The Bitter Cry of Outcast London, from information about St. Francis. However, three words in the tract's title echo St. Francis's own account of the occasion in which had heard 'the cry' of an 'outcast' leper, embraced him, and afterwards found that what was 'bitter' had become 'sweet'. The pamphlet, written the year after Leo XIII commended the example of St. Francis to Roman Catholics, invited those English people with good homes to meet 'the London outcasts'.

An anonymous author, a mass-produced disposable penny-pamphlet, a street news-seller, a recent technological improvement in printing, were the agents of Adderley's decision to live in the East End. Afterwards, he never doubted that cheap, short-term best-sellers and single-issue tracts could convey values and mobilise social action. A few pages of text could confirm, strengthen, or change people's values. Print could create communities of people who shared the same values, but who needed never to meet each other face to face. Each could apply the shared values in his own sphere of influence.

Consequently, when the anonymous author of *The Bitter Cry of Outcast London* had been identified, a Congregationalist minister, Adderley suggested that he 'should be canonised'. One who had no affiliation with the Church of Rome, which alone in the West canonised Saints, had performed miracles. These were not the miracles of healing individuals, but

the social miracles of improved housing and the reduction of disease through more adequate drainage. The one whom Adderley would have canonised had given impetus to a widespread social movement in English urban areas. The miracle was that people worked with each other in mutual self help, and individually and collectively brought pressure to bear on those who could implement changes. 17

2. RESPONDING TO THE BITTER CRY OF THE OUTCAST IN BETHNAL GREEN, 1885-88.

(1) An Unconventional Warden of Oxford House. Words in print had first enabled Adderley to hear the cry of the outcasts, but an acquaintance, the Rev. W. Jackson, took him to find them. As a result, Adderley was to become the first Warden of Oxford House in Bethnal Green. He never underestimated the efficacy of the hidden action in creating religious, cultural and social movements - in this next case, the university settlement movement.

Jackson was the emissary of a distinguished group of an older generation of Oxford graduates. Shocked by what they heard of East London, they formed a committee to consider the situation and decided that some members of the university should live for short periods in 'an Oxford house' among London's 'outcasts'. The committee in early 1885 purchased a house and appointed Adderley, who had been visiting Bethnal Green since 1883, to be its first full-time Warden.

There is evidence from later events and Adderley's own writings that his devotion to St. Francis was developing strongly at this time, but he did not foist his Franciscan values on those who visited Oxford House. He seems rarely to have spoken publicly about his personal motivation, although he was ready to be questioned by residents in private. Hensley

Henson, a visitor from All Soul's at Oxford, was one of those who did so.

Adderley selected somewhat unusual ways of discharging the committee's stated policy: 'Oxford House is to be religious in motive, but secular in method'. The young Warden, still a layman but privately considering abandoning the Law in favour of ordination, did not arrange lectures in theology. He had almost certainly learnt, either from St. Francis's popular English biographer, Mrs. Oliphant, or from Oxford lectures, that Francis had lived in a period in which Christianity had its dissidents and detractors, and that the Saint had understood what they were saying.

Acting from religious motives Adderley enabled those who came to Oxford House to understand contemporary secular views and methods. He invited, for example, Charles Bradlaugh, the secularist and atheist, and Annie Besant, a very controversial figure loathed by most churchmen, to deliver lectures. These invitations, to speak in a house founded with a religious motive, issued to those who had alternative values, who berated, censured, dismissed, modified or opposed the values of the Church, gave rise to criticism. This was not how many other university men interpreted the phrase, 'secular methods'. In the view of Hensley Henson, for instance, Oxford House had become a place for 'spurious theorists and cranks' to make 'unproven assertions. As matters are, the Oxford House furnishes a platform for Bradlaugh'. 1

(2) A Soap-box Orator in Victoria Park. Some of these 'spurious theorists and cranks' went regularly to Victoria Park, where Adderley heard them speak. A Park was a symbol of Englishness, and this East End park had recently been landscaped and named after the English monarch. It was intended to be 'the countryside' of the people of the East End, who lacked the fresh air and entertainment resources of the West End. 22 Men

and women - generally those who had employment and enough to eat - gathered there every weekend.

One corner of Victoria Park was fast becoming a second Hyde Park corner. People from the West End came to hear the East End debates, Adderley suggested, as if making a journey to 'a foreign place'. He joined the soap-box orators, sometimes using the bizarre methods of clown and jester. Audiences, he had observed, were not motivated to listen to preachers or teachers, but to those who dealt with issues which touched their daily lives. Recognising their political future after the recent Representation of the People Act, he used Victoria Park to try to influence the judgment of those whose votes would soon become effective in the kind of democracy which St. Francis had initiated among the 'powerless ones', the minores. Acting in modern conditions, he encouraged the 'groundlings' to argue with 'the Hon.' and onlookers to applaud and to jeer.

Invitations to detractors, friendships with social deviants and outdoor debates with hecklers were not customary even for an eccentric warden. When the Oxford House committee began to talk about a more orthodox educational role for the House, and to visualise its future as an embryonic college in the East End for London University, Adderley examined his values and future possibilities. 'I was not the man to collar the university' he decided.' 'There is too much of the free-lance in me to allow me to be the head of an institution that is forced by the very nature of things to be conventional'. 'Accordingly, he left Oxford House and prepared for ordination.'

(3) A Curate among Paupers. Adderley was ordained deacon in St. Paul's cathedral and licensed as a curate in St. John's parish in Bethnal Green. Ordination in the Church of England, in addition to being a theological rite, was also a form of admission to a profession. A deacon was expected to act

in accordance with the values of other professional men even though his particular profession might require him altruistically to take up residence in the East End. For Adderley, being a deacon was an opportunity to follow in the footsteps of St. Francis, who remained a deacon, and St. Stephen, one of the first deacons. With the encouragement of his vicar, he became a pauper among the growing number of East End paupers. This seems to have been his first attempt directly to imitate St. Francis.

Hensley Henson, who during his visits to Oxford House had objected to the content of lectures, had in private found out about Adderley's devotion to St. Francis. He, too, had become a devotee of St. Francis and he left the comfort of All Souls in order to imitate St. Francis with the man whose policy he had criticised. As Owen Chadwick has observed, 'at the time it was in dead earnest'. 'We were', Henson afterwards wrote, 'a brace of ardent fools'. 30

It was the different financial resources of Henson, the paupers and Adderley that brought this direct imitation of St. Francis to an abrupt end. Henson was a member of a family which had lost most of its financial capital; he needed to have a stipend to support his parents. He wrote in his journal:

- I long to throw aside all, and be an ascetic as was St. Francis I am not free to do what I would: I am not rich enough to be poor.
- Adderley learned the hard lesson that Henson could not afford to imitate St. Francis because of 'the impassable barrier' of his family. He came to recognise also, while living among them, that the paupers who had no opportunity to earn even a day's wage had not chosen to be poor. Unlike Henson, with a brilliant academic record, they had no ready-made route out of their penury.

From Henson and the paupers Adderley learnt that being born into

a rich family, which provided him with an unearned income, had given him a 'broad gate' into poverty and an easy exit from it. Acting as if he lacked material resources had done nothing, and would do nothing, to alter the chains of events which made some people poor and allowed other people to earn an income and yet others to increase their wealth without working. To accord to the outcast-paupers the dignity of truly being his brothers and sisters in the future required another kind of social action. They had to be given an economic and political value. They needed to be heard and to have the power to determine their own future. 'I became a radical', he wrote. 32

3. EXPERIENCING ETHICAL DILEMMAS GENERATED IN CHURCH AND SOCIETY IN POPLAR, WEST HAM, 1889-93.

- Green to the Christ Church Mission in Poplar, succeeding his brother, Reginald, as missioner. It was a deliberate step away from the 'stranglehold' of the Oxford culture of Oxford House. Adderley's immediate topography changed again. Gone were the sweated workshops of Bethnal Green, making products for export to the British Empire and beyond. Present were the ships and docks which had made Britain 'the Queen of the Oceans' and mistress of world trade. Sir John Soane's 'Waterloo' church of St. John on Bethnal Green, with its imposing pillared portico, gave place to a mission room, more like the huts in which St. Francis had ministered. This state of affairs was destined to change, inducing Adderley to undertake work he later considered to be a mistake.
- St. Francis, Adderley almost certainly knew, had in his *Testament* written of his devotion to churches. In the area of Poplar allocated to the Christ Church mission there was no consecrated church in which Adderley,

now a priest, could celebrate the Service of the Holy Communion with dignity. There was not even a closed space in which he could use his ability to draw crowds as the friars had once done with their plays, cribs, carols and stations of the cross. Adderley agreed with Canon Liddon of St. Paul's, who on behalf of Christ Church had oversight of the mission, that a church large enough to hold seven hundred people would be an asset. Money to pay for it was rapidly raised, mainly from Christ Church graduates and Adderley's social contacts. Twice, the social scene of Poplar was transformed when the upper classes visited. The Duchess of Albany, a member of the Royal Family, laid a foundation stone and Dr. Temple, the Bishop of London, dedicated the completed church to St. Frideswide. She had been the foundress-abbess of a Benedictine monastery which had stood on the present site of the City and University of Oxford.

Adderley then officiated at St. Frideswide's church which he later described as 'a terrible place'. It may not be too fanciful to see in this the same confusion which St. Francis had experienced after hearing the command 'rebuild my church', and promptly set about repairing the structure of San Damiano. Later, both men interpreted the command as having been to lead people to a deeper commitment to Christ's teaching.

an implicit tension in the situation in Poplar. Donations to build the church had not come from the local people, and the values proclaimed by its furnishings - one altar frontal alone had cost £2000 - had little in common with the area. Outside, men charged forward 'to the narrow entry' of the dock gate to earn a day's bread 'as if they had been at the gate of heaven'. In 1889, inspired and encouraged by Ben Tillet, whom Adderley already knew, the dock workers went on strike against the indignity of this degrading method of finding work. Adderley joined them

at the dock gates.

The Poplar 'groundlings' were unlike the crowds in Victoria Park. These men were frequently hungry. They were not idlers, or seeking entertainment, or arguing whether or not God existed, and if He did, how human beings could apprehend him. The point at issue was the human condition – the material conditions in which men, women and children were expected to live and work. Adderley listened and threw himself 'into the stream', but avoiding 'exact issues' because he did not understand them. Ben Tillet, as Adderley later judged, lectured while he himself preached platitudes. 35

Adderley faced a dilemma as he walked among men on strike: he had social relations with people on both sides of the dock gate. Because of one chain of events, he was linked with directors and shareholders, the holders of wealth. These were the people among whom his birth and education had placed him, and they were the traditional brokers of power. Because of another chain of events, he was linked with the men who refused to work. These were the people among whom his aspiration to be 'a sort of friar' had taken him, and they were seeking to be new brokers of power. His brothers by blood and kinship and his brothers by adoption and grace were at enmity.

Adderley attempted to resolve this problem through communication. He listened to his upper class peers and pointed out to them that the striking dockers, whom they considered greedy or lazy, were hungry for food and that they were often away from their homes for seventeen hours a day in order to maintain the strike. At the same time, he showed the dockers that some of the rich understood their plight. He stood with them, and collected money for them. 37

After the dock strike, Adderley was convinced that laissez-faire

values were not the only ones on which an economy could be based. Tillet had taught him that economic and political scientists worked from evidence. He decided that in order to challenge the contention that men and women acted only from economic self-interest, it was a Christian duty to provide new evidence for these new scientists. Economists should be given data which would prove they had been wrong in considering that men and women were motivated exclusively by the ethic of capitalism. Political scientists should be shown that men and women could organise a movement to modify capitalism and redistribute wealth more equitably. As Adderley later sought to show in stories and cartoons, Jesus had pointed to values other than economic self-interest and he had attracted disciples. St. Francis had rejected the opportunity to accumulate wealth and men and women inspired by his values had limited their personal consumption and redistributed their inherited wealth among the poor.

These reflections made Adderley an ardent Socialist 'though before I had been advancing that way'. He knew that the industrial and housing problems of Poplar, and those problems which Ben Tillet had taught him to name more exactly as structural problems, could not be solved using only the resources of university settlements, public parks, local Church of England parishes, printing presses, and acts of personal compassion.

4. ACTING IN NATIONAL ARENAS, 1892-4.

While Adderley's 'place of residence' was Poplar, he expressed his Franciscan values, which were now firmly linked to his political and social values, on other social stages. The Christian Social Union, the Church Congress, the Clarion Fellowship and the Independent Labour Party each drew sections of the English population to centres from which they then

dispersed to express their values in action - a form of organisation to which Adderley was being drawn as a model. Time was not occupied in numerous meetings and the meetings were not ends in themselves.

(1) A Troublesome Committee Member of the Christian Social Union. In 1889, Adderley became one of the first members of the Christian Social Union, another Church of England organisation founded by members of the ancient universities. After being elected to its central committee, he suggested that the university-educated members unintentionally excluded those with different reading skills from themselves. Those who used the new public libraries, who read new newspapers like The Daily Mail, who spent their money on inexpensive literature wanted a good story-line. Some would like drawings and cartoons. According to Adderley, B. F. Westcott, Bishop of Durham and national president of the Union, 'gazed at me with his wonderful eyes' and asked:

Is your proposal that we should save people the trouble of thinking?

Exactly the opposite was the case. Adderley saw the opportunities presented by increasing literacy following the Education Acts of the 1870s. He also recognised that in order to capture a mass readership's attention, any message would have to compete with the current popular press, pamphlets and advertising. What the situation needed was mass communication on a nation-wide scale which found a way of addressing individuals who chose what they read. Having heard the talk of Bethnal Green and Poplar, he realised that working class people had questions as deep as those of the intellectuals.

According to Adderley, the working class focused their thoughts at a very practical level. Their knowledge and experience should inform any Christian debate about social values and the regeneration of society.

did not immediately write stories illustrated with cartoons in which the personal dilemmas of an individual replaced impersonalised abstractions. Instead, he became a regular contributor to *The Clarion*, entering into the arguments carried on in its pages on the terms laid down by the pressmen who founded it.

One of the attractions of *The Clarion* was that it was both a newspaper and a 'fellowship' of geographically dispersed writers and readers, who communicated with each other through its columns on subjects they considered to be of importance. Although Robert Blatchford, its editor, was an atheist, he encouraged contributors who believed in God to write for the paper so that the social presence of religious beliefs and values and their practical application, could be fairly discussed. The attraction of *The Clarion* for Adderley was that articles submitted could reach a far greater range of people than those of 'intellectuals' who had conceived this method of communication, but who printed journals only for each other's benefit.

As Adderley had invited secularists, including Blatchford, to speak at a house with a religious foundation, so now he wrote about religious subjects in a paper founded on secular principles. For example, there was an article, "The Evidence of the Resurrection", in which his object was to make known to readers who had problems with 'the raising of a dead body' how 'serious students of this question' were discussing it. He saw no point in allowing those who were not theologians to imagine that specialists had found no difficulties with doctrine, especially 'the fact of the Resurrection of Christ'. After explaining the results of critical scholarship, Adderley discussed the practical consequences of 'belief' in a resurrected Christ. 'It should be noted that Mr. Blatchford's idea that the

Apostles were "interested parties" is absurd. They did not get £15,0000 a year for saying Christ was alive ... they were flogged, stoned and decapitated.

Further, the members of The Clarion Fellowship used other 'secular methods' of which those, like Adderley, with religious motivation could take advantage. They met occasionally in the open air for fellowship and discussion, often arranging bicycle rides from one town to another. The new bicycles with pneumatic tyres provided the 'minores' with a resource to speed journeys, giving greater opportunities to talk with more people than St. Francis had had in his journeys on foot. The open dialogue of the Clarion Fellowship later became one of Adderley's models for Franciscan Third Order organisation. ⁴⁵

(3) A Confession of Political Belief at the Church Congress. The Church of England's leaders had, since 1867, utilised the developing railway network to gather members to Church Congresses, annual conferences lasting about three days. In 1893, the Congress was held in Birmingham and was the largest to date, with 4,396 conference members representing most dioceses. As many as 6,000 attended some meetings. Lord Norton was a guarantor and a member of the 'subjects committee', the Hon. Arden Adderley was a member of the Reception Committee and Hams Hall was host to a house party which included the Archbishop of Canterbury.

It was, therefore, only to be expected that the Revd. the Hon. James Adderley should be invited to make his maiden speech at this Congress. He could have contributed to the debate on 'Preaching and Preaching Orders', a subject suitable for a disciple of St. Francis. This topic reached its 'greatest popularity at the time of the Congress of 1893'. For Adderley, however, content was more important than organisation and personal popularity. He chose to speak on 'Social and Labour Questions'

bringing with him as a supporting speaker an Alderman of West Ham.

It was one of those unplanned quirks of history that Adderley addressed the Congress on the 4th of October. This was the Feast of St. Francis in the Roman calendar, an observance suppressed in England at the Reformation. Adderley seems to have known of it, having been associated with Anglo-Catholic practices, but he made no mention of the Saint in his speech. Since he did not even associate his values with St. Francis in his speech, his audience could not have done so either.

Forsaking learned wit and classical or biblical quotations, Adderley employed the passion of a missioner, the methods of a soap-box orator, the urgency of a political campaigner and the skills of an experienced actor.

Adderley addressed this religious gathering on the laws of political economy 'which were not like the laws of astronomy or mathematics' because human beings had the power to change them. In the town where his father was a major landowner, Adderley urged 'comfortable people' who had the 'amazing effrontery' to call the present state of things 'beautiful and God-ordained' to meet with businessmen and workers who saw its other side. Clergy should encourage the laity to find ways of redressing social injustice. 'Clergy can learn. They are not absolute fools', he observed. 'I his rhetoric was accompanied, we may surmise, by that genial smile for which he was renowned.

The scene after Adderley's speech was very like that painted by Giotto after Francis had stripped himself in front of his father and the bishop. Stunned, the witnesses reacted to cover up the embarrassing situation and to make it look less naked. The Rev. J. Knox-Little praised Adderley's 'life of entire devotion ... which might have been given up to the constant enjoyment of life' but he took the opportunity of contradicting a speaker who was 'enthusiastic, young and a little unfair The

business of the clergy was to teach the poor to bear their poverty bravely. A few days later, the Archbishop wrote a note to Lord Norton, his host, heartily and affectionately congratulating him on his son's speech 'although it may be a question whether the details will work out as expected'.

Adderley left members of future Congresses to their debates, making gentle mock of them in the stories he later wrote. He turned next to the members of the working classes. For some of his social peers, they were becoming objects of academic scrutiny; for Adderley working men and women (and those without work) should become an active political force.

(4) 'A Black Lamb' and a Member of the Independent Labour Party.

Adderley was one of only a handful of Church of England clergy who had joined the Independent Labour Party in 1893, the year of its formation. This new political party, he believed, could write a fresh chapter in 'The Making of England'. Men of his birth, education and status could not for much longer rule. His borough of West Ham had elected Keir Hardie as its Member of Parliament. He addressed working men: 'I believe that the future of England is in the hands of the working classes ... I address you with whom the future of England stands'. 51

Having now openly associated himself, as St. Francis had, with the 'minores', Adderley was labelled, in his own words, 'a black lamb'. When it was claimed 'We are all Socialists now', he repeatedly made it plain that Socialism was for him a search for political power. In later reflection, he wrote that he might have 'risen from the ranks' had he not become a Socialist. \$\frac{52}{2}\$

His desire to be 'a sort of friar' persisted, and he still hoped that there might be other people in the Church of England who shared his inner aspirations. (5) Advertising for Friars in a Church Newspaper. In order to find out how many such people there might be, Adderley used a commercial resource. He placed an advertisement in *The Church Times*, a Church of England newspaper, asking any other readers who wanted to be Franciscan friars to contact him. 53

He received two answers. The first was from W. H. Frere, a distinguished scholar, who was working in the East End. They had met previously, having been ordained about the same time. Nothing came of their next meeting for they had different ideas about being 'a sort of friar', though Frere maintained his interest in St. Francis and Franciscans. Frere became, for example, a committee member of the British Society of Franciscan Studies, another of Adderley's St. Francis-inspired endeavours, and was the preacher in 1924 at the seventh centenary celebrations in Canterbury of the arrival of Franciscan friars in England. If

The second respondent was an older man, Dr. Arthur Mason, a former Fellow of Trinity College, Cambridge and at that time vicar of All Hallows, Barking-by-the-Tower. Adderley knew him already, his brother, Reginald, having been Mason's curate. Mason told Adderley that he had once wanted to be a Franciscan friar 'but the authorities of the Church dissuaded him'. He invited the younger man to come to live, work and study with him. Adderley accepted. 55

Print had proved its desirability, worth and utility. It had needed a printed advertisement for men who knew each other to be able to share their deep, personal, inner aspirations. The small response to the advertisement had also shown that the English were not rushing to become followers of St. Francis as the sacred biographers claimed Italians had centuries earlier.

Part Two.

SEEKING A FRANCISCAN THIRD ORDER, 1893-1926.

5. FROM SCHOLARLY FACT TO POPULAR FICTION, 1893.

(1) A Serious Student of Franciscan Studies. Though subsequent events indicate the progress of Adderley's thought during this next year, he left no notes or journals which give us precise details. It is likely that Dr. Mason, soon to return to Cambridge as Lady Margaret Professor of Divinity, acted as Adderley's personal tutor. He seems to have directed Adderley's attention to the Franciscan Third Order and to its effectiveness in disseminating St. Francis's values.

His pupil would now be far more motivated than he had been as an undergraduate, but it may not have been lack of interest which had prevented Adderley from hearing about Franciscan Third Orders at Oxford. Too little was known about the role of Franciscan tertiaries in medieval England for them to have been given much attention in the Modern History School.

At Barking, Adderley was within reach of the British Museum Library in Bloomsbury to which his social and graduate status gave him entry. He seems to have used its resources to study the origin, history and present organisation of the Franciscan Third Order. He chose as symbols of the personal, local and community application of Franciscan values those who were named as the first tertiaries: a married couple, Luchesio and his wife; and a village community, the people of Cannara. Apart from their desire to live in simplicity, following the example of St. Francis, very little was known of them. More was known about the Third Order in thirteenth and fourteenth-century Italy. Town-dwelling members in many places formed part of a social movement of protest against feudal values, so

Adderley took them as the symbol of shared values in political and social action.

Printed texts in the British Museum Library also provided information about the two forms of the Franciscan Third Order in the contemporary Roman Catholic Church: 'Regular' and 'Secular'. He now studied Pope Leo XIII's Revised Rule promulgated ten years earlier for the latter. It failed to inspire him. ⁵⁷

It was possibly Mason who introduced Adderley to Englishmen's writings about St. Francis which, having neither the words, 'Francis' or 'Franciscan' in their titles could not be found in catalogues under those headings. Sir James Stephen's essay most influenced Adderley. Originally a long article published in *The Edinburgh Review* in 1850, which Stephen described as 'not a biography, but a rapid sketch put forth by secular men to secular readers', it had been reprinted in *Essays in Ecclesiastical Biography*. Stephen argued that St. Francis had received 'unmerited neglect and indiscriminate opprobrium among us' and invited a writer to 'descend from Bodleian eminence' to fill 'the one great deficiency in the ecclesiastical literature of the Protestant world.'

That a man of social action, who was connected with 'the Clapham sect', should advocate the worth of St. Francis to English Protestants was a confirmation of Adderley's own mix of values. However, Stephen had not called for either the author or the kind of prose which Adderley knew that 'secular readers' would read. Stephen had also written before notice had been taken in England of the writings of Karl Marx. It seems that sitting in the library at which Karl Marx had worked, Adderley sought a way of reinterpreting St. Francis and Karl Marx for ordinary readers.

(2) <u>Author of the Popular Story, Stephen Remarx</u>. Adderley transformed James Stephen's argument into a story, Stephen Remarx, which was refused

by fourteen publishers. Edward Arnold accepted it, and in 1893 four impressions were printed because of its popularity. 12

Few knew enough of Adderley's life-story to be able to interpret it as, I believe, he intended. The title, Stephen Remarx, I suggest, had hidden meanings. The story was an update of the social actions of two Stephens and of Karl Marx. The name of the central figure of the story, Stephen, son of the late Lord Remarx of Bulstrode Abbey, was derived from two earlier Stephens. The one was a member of the first diaconate and the first Christian martyr, whose story was told in The Acts of the Apostles. The other was the nineteenth-century social reformer and advocate of Franciscan values among Protestants. Like both of the previous Stephens, Stephen Remarx had a vision of a social order at variance with that of his social peers. As they had, he tried to persuade others to change their world view by challenging dominant beliefs. In the past those who thought the Jews had the whole truth stoned Stephen. Those who maintained that the white races had the right to own black slaves fought bitterly against their critics. In the story, those in power resisted Stephen Remarx's teaching. It reached its climax in the 'the celebration of the feast of Stephen'. While the hero was visiting social outcasts on London's Embankment on the day after Christmas, he was run over by a self-seeking capitalist.

Adderley named Stephen 'Re-Marx'. Without naming his source, he had invented him to try to persuade Christians that they should take seriously Karl Marx's analysis of society. They should work, following 'Christ, the One True Liberator', to enable all men and women to find fulfilment in their labour and to have a due share in the wealth which was the product of it. Were they to do so, the 'chloroform with which the rich kept the poor asleep' would be unmasked.

The story was subtitled, A Venture in Ethics, and described how individuals might venture to do this, meeting together only occasionally to confirm their shared values, before continuing in their efforts to change the world. Their actions were not collective in the sense that they acted in the same situations. Each acted in his own context, knowing that others acted in other contexts. One refused to sell bad fish; another offended the members of grouse shooting parties by opening his land to students.

For most reviewers at the time, this story was of interest because it had the qualities of being an autobiographical novel, an account of an aristocrat who went to live among the poor. Like Adderley, Stephen Remarx had a title, was ordained, worked in the East End, read both the Booths, saw the limitations of the settlement movement, engaged in argument with secularists and theosophists, and understood why men became involved in industrial disputes. The remainder of the book turned out to be anticipated autobiography – its central figure moved to the West End and sought to convert men and women of wealth and influence. This led, in part, to its many reprints.

'It [the book, Stephen Remarx] gave me a notoriety I have never been able to quench', Adderley later wrote. He regretted that for many years readers apparently took more note of the central character in the story than of the two interconnected groups which Stephen Remarx had initiated which were for Adderley the crux of the story.

These groups of people who heeded Remarx were not to be constrained by already existing organisations or other people's expectations, so they took no name for themselves. 'Accordingly, Mr. Whittacker was not able to secure for them a place among his 250 different sects'. In the course of the story, however, they acquired names because of the need of other people to label them. The seven members of

the smaller group, who gave up their previous occupations to be available to serve the rich and poor without impediment, were Adderley's contemporary interpretation of the seven deacons, the inner circle of the Clapham Sect, and a Franciscan Regular Third Order: they were labelled 'the regulars'. The far larger group consisted of those who shared the aspirations of the smaller group, but they met only very occasionally, to report on the ethical ventures each had made in his or her own context to implement the vision sustained by the inner core: they were labelled 'the irregulars'.

The story was told with engaging good humour and a lightness of touch. It was not surprising that it was thought to be a relaxing diversion from the problems of everyday life. Only some of those who knew Adderley well recognised it was a serious proposition.

Henry Chappel, who had been at Oxford House with Adderley, and Henry Hardy, a friend, suggested that the story should become a real-life venture and that they could be the first 'regulars'. Gertrude Bromby, sister to Adderley's vicar at St. John's, Bethnal Green, who had watched Adderley when he lived among the Bethnal Green paupers in direct imitation of St. Francis, asked to be included in the revised plan which took account of Adderley's subsequent experiences and changes in outlook.

6. NATIONAL VISION AND PAROCHIAL CONSTRAINT: THE SOCIETY OF THE DIVINE COMPASSION, 1894-7.

of the Divine Compassion. Thus, as the result of a story, on the 20 January 1894 James Adderley, Henry Chappel and Henry Hardy made solemn promises of their intention to live a 'regular' religious life in the Society of the Divine Compassion. Shortly afterwards, Gertrude Bromby and some

of her friends did likewise. They took the title, The Society of the Incarnation. The men and women 'regulars' lived in two separate houses in Plaistow, in the borough of West Ham, where Adderley was licensed to take charge of the church of St. Philip. 67

To each individual who arrived at the houses, Adderley gave a copy of Stephen Remarx because this story defined the principles and the type of organisation he envisaged. It was not customary for novices to find their inspiration in a story, but Adderley's argument was that the Gospels and sacred biographies of Saints were narratives.

As in the story, Adderley expected the houses of the 'regulars' to be places where the 'irregulars' could come to renew their values and from which the 'regulars' went out to encourage the ethical ventures of men and women, married or unmarried, lay or clerical, in professional or manual occupations, who owned wealth or who were without possessions.

Like St. Francis, for weeks at a time Adderley walked the roads, sometimes with those who would become 'irregulars'. Arthur Shearley Cripps, for example, after visiting doss houses with Adderley, went to what was then Rhodesia and was later described by C. F. Andrews as 'our modern St. Francis'. Douglas Steere, Cripps' biographer, chose the term God's Irregular as the title of his account of how Cripps had acted irregularly to improve the conditions of the blacks in constant argument with the British Government and the Church. 69

Adderley was often away from Plaistow, but returned there to meet with the other 'regular brothers'. They had mainly stayed among the poor in the Plaistow parish where the Bishop had licensed them to serve, and had become involved in local affairs, trying to meet desperate local needs. Together, they were living a more monastic pattern of life which resembled that of a Regular Franciscan Third Order in the Roman Catholic Church.

This had not been Adderley's idea for, while he wanted to change the conditions of the poor, he had learned in Bethnal Green and Poplar that local East End problems often derived from the values of the people in the West End who formed policies. It was the first source of a rift.

Reading Paul Sabatier's, Francis of Assisi. A widening gap within the Society of the Divine Compassion, already growing in numbers, came as Adderley absorbed what he described as Paul Sabatier's 'epoch-making' study of St. Francis. Sabatier had argued, as Adderley already believed, that St. Francis was a man for all humanity and that in the intention of St. Francis there had been no fundamental difference between those who formed an inner circle and later became friars and those who applied their Gospel values in other settings. The sharp division of the Orders was not a feature of the origins of the Franciscan movement.

Assuming that Adderley had not read Sabatier in the French in 1893 before he wrote Stephen Remarx, we can appreciate the enthusiasm with which he greeted an interpretation so close to his own ideas. For some of the other brothers, however, Sabatier's thesis and its being placed on the Index of Forbidden Books would seem to have had a reverse effect. They began after 1894 to define themselves more strongly as a Religious Order within the Catholic tradition of the Church of England. They saw their vocation in more monastic terms living as a 'Brotherhood' among their brothers in Plaistow. They worked out a daily time-table with offices and drafted a fuller Rule and Constitution.

(3) Making Values Plain in the Language of the People. Another difficulty between Adderley and other members of the Society of Divine Compassion was likely to have been his methods of publicising the values which he ascribed to St. Francis and to the Society to which he belonged. In 1894 he was the sponsor, founder, manager, editor and principal

contributor to an inset for parish magazines, which he named Goodwilk St. Francis had made Goodwill, Pax et Bonum, his form of greeting. A parish magazine inset was a form of print literature which, like a penny-pamphlet was cheap and disposable, and which, like The Clarion, could encourage contributions from readers (whatever the policy of vicars). It could explain ethical ventures in serial stories. Within a year, Adderley was distributing 16,000 copies and he continued to edit Goodwill, which sold in varying thousands for each issue, for the next sixteen years.

At the turn of the century, the illustrated serial, Blue Friars, kept the possibility of the adoption and application of Franciscan values before the attention of readers. In the sixth instalment, Adderley admitted that he was the author and that 'I am myself 'a Blue Friar'; and he was telling the story of this 'remarkable society'. He related how four of the present Blue Friars had decided to adopt their way of life at 'the Chapter of the Cher' (an allusion for more informed readers to the Franciscan Chapter of Mats) which had lasted the length of the Cherwell from Oxford to Windsor. These Blue Friars, Adderley explained, were not bound to any obedience 'other than to that of conscience, enlightened by the Holy Ghost'.

The 'irregulars' had a prominent place in the serial. Arthur Sarum, for instance, was a typical upper-class fictional irregular. A wealthy landowner, he had visited the tomb of St. Francis in Assisi, and 'on this holy ground' had wanted to give up all his possessions as had St. Francis. His enlightened conscience had taught him that it was harder to have money 'and not use it for yourself and your own pleasure, than it would be to throw it away altogether'. Instead, he handed over his parks and woods to the County Council for public recreation. He sold his shares in 'Swampshire' and in South African gold mines and used his capital gains for housing projects. He went out in the Blue Friars van (in which they

transported a harmonium) and sang to the people in the streets. 10

Some of the contents of Goodwill irritated the Bishop of London, Mandell Creighton, who had been a Professor of Ecclesiastical History at Cambridge and editor of the English Historical Review before his consecration. With his well-developed appreciation of accurate scholarship carefully expressed, he reacted badly to Adderley's populist approach. He wrote to him: 'I don't know whether it is monasticism, Adderley, or socialism that make a man forget he is a gentleman'. ('That was pretty bad, wasn't it?' Adderley commented). St. Francis, Creighton told Adderley, 'did not regenerate the world by smart journalism It is for you to rise above this'. Adderley should 'deal with eternal problems' and show 'not how old forms can accord with modern ideas, but how spiritual power can create a purer atmosphere, in which there is neither old or new, but all things become beautiful and clear. Il Adderley, however, continued to believe that those who would 'speak and act [in God's name] must let themselves be led by the Holy Spirit, whatever any editor or Bishop may sav', 72 This was not a view held by most of the other members of the Society of the Divine Compassion, and Adderley found this difference an added cause of tension. 73

The main division of opinion in the Society of the Divine Compassion revolved around the tension between parochial and national mission. Adderley attached the greatest importance to 'irregular' Third Orders, whose members should not be tied to residence in a particular house or obedience to an all-embracing Rule. Men and women were needed throughout the nation who were free to follow their own enlightened consciences, guided by the Holy Spirit. The other members attached greater importance to the building of an exemplary local community of 'regulars'.

Paul Mercer was another of Adderley's stories in which he revealed again the importance, worth and utility of 'irregulars'. Making an 'irregular' the central figure was an attempt to rectify the common misinterpretation of his true purpose in writing Stephen Remarx. The name held allusions to two other Pauls and St. Francis. The first Paul, of Tarsus, represented those who 'irregularly' proclaimed Christian values in ways which could be accepted by new listeners. The second, Paul Sabatier, had proposed the thesis that St. Francis was not only for Roman Catholics, but for all humanity. The surname 'Mercer' seems to refer to St. Francis' father, who had been a mercer by trade.

This man, a wealthy industrialist, became an 'irregular' without giving up his factory or his marriage to live in community. This man devoted his energies to improving the conditions of his work-force - he manufactured 'Gloire de Dijon' soap - and truly considered the soap makers his brothers and sisters. In this work a group of 'regulars' supported him from their home at Bulstrode, where they used a liturgical calendar which contained festivals of 'new' saints like Elizabeth Fry and Wilberforce. Mercer rejoiced that the day had come when 'irregulars', 'a capitalist and the editor of a socialist journal, a working man, a monk and a stout parson' could together be 'a working band of brotherhood'. '!

(4) Leaving the Society of the Divine Compassion. This story was published in 1897, the year in which Adderley left the Plaistow house to live at 6 Grosvenor Street in Mayfair, because mission was required as much to the rich as to the poor.

It takes a great deal of hard knocking at Dives door to make him realise that Lazarus is at his gate.

He sent a letter to the brothers at Plaistow. The Society of the Divine Compassion, he told them, was leading 'towards development other than that for which I originally started it and for which I think God has fitted me personally to conduct it. He wrote:

I put Stephen Remarx into the hands of each of you who sought admission as giving a rough idea of the principles I had in view.

The Church of England needed broader activity on non-parochial lines.

The great social questions of the day can be better dealt with by men free from narrow local interests such as must always hamper a parish priest.

He was not leaving the Society of the Divine Compassion because he could not continue, or because of 'great changeableness' in his aspirations, but because of 'the obvious tendency' of the Plaistow group to be parochial which made it 'less and less able to do the broader work which I conceive to be needed'. 16

A fortnight later, Sister Gertrude wrote to Father Chappel and the other members of the Society of the Divine Compassion suggesting that 'faith and trust has not been yours'. She and her sisters, together with some brothers who followed Adderley, also left Plaistow for Mayfair.'

The Society of the Divine Compassion continued to have its main residential base in Plaistow, and today its house is occupied by members of the First Order of the present Society of St. Francis. It has rightly been recognised as a cornerstone of the Franciscan revival in the Anglican Communion. In my view, it has been incorrect, however, to suggest that the Society was not Franciscan in the mind of its founder. As one of the Society's later members remembered being told, 'we found ourselves Franciscans without any conscious effort to be so'. 19

The values which Adderley derived from interpretations of St. Francis and of the origins of the Franciscan movement were, I suggest, in great measure what inspired him first, to become a member of the Society of the Divine Compassion and secondly, to leave it. However,

following St. Francis, Adderley did not intend that any organisation with which he was associated should be bound by rules that had been made by, and for, other people in other historical or social contexts. As he explained he was looking for a religious life in 'a form suited to our changed conditions'.

7. TENSION BETWEEN SPIRIT AND LETTER IN WEST LONDON, 1897-1902.

(1) Tenant of a Mayfair Chapel and a Brother of the Holy Spirit of Truth.

In Mayfair, Adderley rented the Berkeley chapel which he used as his base as the first followers of St. Francis had used the chapel of St. Mary-of-the-Angels. This was his walled centre; it was close to Hyde Park Corner and that was his outdoor centre. *Paul Mercer* became a real-life venture in ethics but with a different organisational form from that of the Society of the Divine Compassion.

While based in Mayfair, Adderley became a member of The Brotherhood of the Holy Spirit of Truth. This firmly placed the 'irregulars' in a primary position. One of the Brothers, A. T. Rickarby, O. H. S., explained:

The Order of the Holy Spirit has a certain originality in its constitution, which is not the usual gradation of first and second orders with a tertiary order as a mere appendage, but, on the contrary, provides a tertiary rule for the whole Order, leaving first and second order rules to be evolved locally as inner circles.

According to T. P. Stevens, in 1897 Adderley 'took certain vows probably to Bishop Creighton'; ⁸² but there is no other evidence of this. If Adderley did take vows, it would have been more likely to have been in the presence of Charles Gore, who remained his constant friend and adviser.

Because of Adderley's idiosyncratic methods (which never involved keeping records) and the lack of other substantial evidence, it is quite impossible to know how small or great his influence was at this time and how many members this Spirit-led Order may have had. There is evidence that, while Adderley was a tenant in Mayfair, a network of people kept in contact with him, and sometimes with each other. Those we know most about, interesting though they are, were not directly in those spheres of life which Adderley was most concerned to penetrate. Jerome Hawes, an architect, for example, after reading a copy of Sabatier's book which Adderley gave him, refused any more to hunt and kill 'Brother Fox'. began to wear a homespun brown suit 'as an outward sign of his spiritual ideals' and then later a shabby jacket, flannel shirt, patched trousers and a cap which gave him 'a breath of real Franciscan freedom, rags and Later, he got in touch with Adderley again, and had his own extraordinary Franciscan venture described by Peter Anson. Martin, a priest from Cornwall with substantial private wealth, left it untouched, and worked as a porter in Covent Garden market. Rosslyn Bruce, whose biographer described him as 'the last eccentric' signed himself with St. Francis's name as well as his own, and when flowers were in short supply decorated the church with living animals and birds. 33

Author of Francis: The Little Poor Man of Assisi. While he was in Mayfair Adderley wrote for the first time about St. Francis and Franciscan Orders in simple, straightforward prose. He condensed his ideas into what became little more than a hundred small printed pages. He asked Paul Sabatier to write the Introduction for his 'little book'. Sabatier graciously consented and the publishers bound Adderley's Francis: The Little Poor Man of Assisi with the same cloth and gold lettering as its parent book.

Adderley explained to readers that his book was 'little more than a distillation' of Sabatier's thesis 'for those unable to indulge in the purchase of the larger biographies'. (Sabatier's book was a hardback

265 pages). When he came to describe and discuss the Third Order, Adderley wrote of "The Third Order" so called and insisted, as Sabatier had, that it was:

Very doubtful if Francis intended to found a separate order of persons living in the world It is more correct to say that in the intention of Francis there was but one order.

He did not ask the reader to linger with the contemporary Franciscan
Third Order in the Roman Catholic Church.

Nothing could be more different than the spirit of this story of St. Lucchesio and the modern rule of the Third Order of St. Francis, which is largely made up of attractive privileges and offers of easily-obtained indulgences.

Afterwards, Adderley recorded, 'I was frightfully pitched into by the Roman Catholic critics, but I survived and the book has always sold well'. The best thing it did for me', he observed, 'was to introduce me to that most delightfully human of all learned men, who has been one of my greatest friends ever since I wrote it - Paul Sabatier'.

had been searching ever since 1893 for evidence of the thirteenth-century Third Order. At about this time, probably between writing the Introduction to Adderley's life of St. Francis and its publication, he found a copy of a Third Order Rule, in a remote convent at Capistrano in the Abruzzi area of Italy. This Rule was unknown to Roman Catholic scholars, but confirmed their claim that a Third Order Rule had existed in the lifetime of St. Francis. It called in question Sabatier's contention that, in the mind of St. Francis, there should only ever be one Order. The Latin text of this Rule, printed in a Parisian journal in 1901, prescribed prayer, almsgiving and fasting, but made no mention of direct social action.

Adderley called a meeting to discuss the critical and practical problems raised by this document, which was attended by people gathered

from all parts of England, and invited Sabatier to explain these difficulties.

Most of those present were students interested in the criticism of medieval texts, while Adderley wished the main focus to be on the practical applications. The 'little book' which summarised their findings was an honourable compromise. Beginning with an English translation of the Latin text of the Rule, Charles Marson pointed to the limitations of the Rule. Such a dull document could not on its own explain the joyful activity of the first tertiaries. By its inadequacy it pointed to the greatness of the men and women who could achieve so much with such slight direction. This led to the conclusion that the original Third Order had its true grounding in the people who were its members rather than in the Rule.

Adderley's practical conclusion was that the original followers had needed to be restrained from excesses by a Rule, but that members of the Church of England had no need for a similar bit or bridle. The name 'Third Order' was furthermore unsuitable because there was not a First or Second Franciscan Order in the Church of England:

I should say that the Third Order in the Anglican Church had better, to begin with, not call itself by any such name. You cannot have a Third Order without a First and Second, except on the principle of the Midland Railway, with its Third Class without a Second; or of Eton College, with its Third Form without a First and Second.

This meeting, called to address a particular problem, grew into the British Society of Franciscan Studies. It developed into an academic forum, printing medieval texts in Latin. As this was not to Adderley's taste, he left it to follow its course. By 1939, this Society had brought the Franciscans of medieval England to the attention of scholars of the medieval period. More than twenty volumes of academic papers had been printed. 94

While consideration of the Rule was still absorbing much of his time,

Adderley left the elegance of Mayfair for the 'shabby gentility' of Marylebone to become the vicar of St. Mark's Church. His ministry there was as controversial as it had been elsewhere. He became a Borough Councillor, and canvassed from coster's barrows, at which he also conducted stations of the cross. There were frequent talks and lectures, some of which were published under the titles *Practical Questions* and *Critical Questions*.

8. RETURNING TO BIRMINGHAM AND WAR SERVICE, 1902-18.

(1) The Vicar of Saltley and Deritend, Birmingham. Soon after the publication of the little book, Third Orders, Adderley went to Birmingham. Lord Norton, who had watched his son's activities with mixed feelings, asked him to be the second vicar of Saltley, the area he owned on the edge of Birmingham, which he had made a model of town-planning. Everywhere in Saltley there was evidence of the Adderley family: Adderley Park, roads named after members of the Norton family, a teacher training college, a library, and a church that Lord Norton had built for the new ecclesiastical parish which had been created. The challenge for Adderley was how to hold to his Franciscan values in this social context. It was the stormiest period in his life.

As far as the development of 'a Franciscan Third Order (so-called)' is concerned, there is again a lack of substantial evidence that suggests either development or demise. Because of Adderley's commitment to minimal organisation (and in common with numerous other organisations that do not share this commitment), there are no records that firmly establish exactly who was drawn to accept or to reject Adderley's interpretation of Franciscan values and which contexts may have been affected, either directly or indirectly, by his actions. There is some evidence of the range

of people who came to Saltley vicarage, and of Adderley's continuing contacts with those who may have called themselves 'irregulars' or were given that name by others throughout England. Percy Dearmer and Conrad Noel, whose policies sought to open the Kingdom of God to all, through beauty, were likely to have been among them. In North America, Eva Mack read Adderley's book and helped to form a Third Order there.

Gertrude Bromby and her sisters also came to Birmingham and provided a 'regular' house to which 'irregulars' could come. It was their address which was advertised in *Third Orders* for they rather than a regular community of men were the people trying still to follow the principles of *Stephen Remarx* and its modifications. In 1911, when Adderley moved to another Birmingham parish, St. Gabriel's, Deritend where he remained until the outbreak of war, the sisters again followed him.

(2) The First World War, 1914-18. At the outbreak of war, Adderley was too old to be an official Chaplain to the armed forces, but he nevertheless went to France under the auspices of the Y. M. C. A. and the Church Army to be with those facing death. At this time, he wrote 'a sort of' autobiography, In Slums and Society, about some of his many acquaintances. Among them he mentioned G. K. Chesterton, who had come to speak at Saltley. Adderley described Chesterton as the 'most brilliant wit of the century'. It was tragic that church leaders preferred 'the dull logic of some dry-as-dust professor' to Chesterton's 'sparking paradox'. He greatly admired Chesterton, but Chesterton 'could hardly be expected to admit such a numb-skull' as himself into his circle. 99

This may have been only partially true. Why Chesterton wrote a life of St. Francis of Assisi has to my knowledge never been explained, but it may be observed how closely Chesterton's interpretation of the Saint's values resemble those of Adderley. Chesterton did not suggest the ethical

ventures to which they might lead, but he wrote an unusually long section about the Franciscan Third Order and its hidden influence. 100

9. HANDING OVER TO OTHER PEOPLE, 1919-26.

Chesterton's decision to write about St. Francis meant that the Saint had a fine exponent in English society. His account of St. Francis was first published for The People's Library that aimed to 'make the acquiring of knowledge a thrilling and entertaining adventure' - so close to Adderley's ideas that it could not have been bettered. In addition, Laurence Housman was also beginning to write his Little Plays of St. Francis portraying the life of the Saint in playful dramatic incidents - doing with consummate skill what Adderley had been doing in homes, churches and streets for more than twenty years. Adderley stood at the door of his church directing people away from it to hear Laurence Housman speak about St. Francis. [10]

G. G. Coulton, a younger scholar at Cambridge who made the Franciscans of medieval England his specialist subject, was discussing the relevance of his subject to the contemporary world, and beginning to write not only in learned journals, but in the popular press also. Two men who called themselves Brother Giles and Brother Douglas were living among the new outcasts - post-war vagrants - and organising social action to improve their conditions. In 1924, The Brotherhood of the Holy Cross was founded. This, too, drew its inspiration from St. Francis, and used as its base a derelict public house, "The Eagle", in Peckham. Other individuals and small groups in various places were fired by ideals drawn at least in part from St. Francis. The Labour party had become a political force, and movements were at work in most of the areas of social life about which Adderley cared.

Adderley had often been to Fleet Street to watch the production of papers. Never in seven centuries had so much been written in one month about St. Francis as in the October of 1926. Characteristically, as others flooded the popular press, he wrote for the more sombre and restrained journal, *Theology*. The war, he wrote, had made those like himself, who had in the past 'talked loudest' about the imitation of St. Francis, 'uncomfortable'. Still, however, he promoted the concept of a Third Order which would come 'not organised by a committee or patronised by Bishops, but gathered by the Holy Ghost'. 104

After 1926, Adderley encouraged others to take over the guidance of Anglican Franciscan Tertiaries, 'gathered by the Holy Ghost'. He had never wished to be a manager. Adderley wrote:

I always derive some comfort from Canon Scott Holland's reply to someone who said I was a rolling stone who gathered no moss. "After all, why should a stone gather moss?".

It is far easier for sociologists and historians if moss gathers and clings, but this narrative, I trust, has shown some of the ways in which Adderley attempted to roll his Franciscan values in the direction of other people hoping that some of them, at least, would become 'irregular' members of a 'Third Order (so-called)'.

His life-history was one in which there was constant interaction between the values he drew from Franciscan resources and the values he drew from his social contexts. His theory and practice, his academic study and stories, his organisations and movements, his prayer and action, developed almost each year and it is not surprising that Charles Gore is reputed to have said, 'To be with Adderley makes me grateful to be in a rut'. 106

10. SUBSEQUENT EVENTS.

Adderley maintained his devotion to St. Francis and to Socialism until his death in 1942 in Bethnal Green, where he had first sought outcasts. He was buried in the East London cemetery. A simple stone was engraved, 'Friend, Come Up Higher'. He had outlived most of his contemporaries at Eton, Oxford, and in East London, but T. P. Stevens gathered letters from those still alive who had known Adderley and wrote an encomium in which he stressed that Adderley 'spent most of his time succouring individuals'. 107

NOTES.

- 1. An article of six columns, "Sir Charles Bowyer Adderley, first Baron Norton", in *The Dictionary of National Biography*, 1901-11, outlined the political and religious activities of the first Lord Norton. W. S. C. Pemberton (1909) in *Lord Norton: Statesman and Philanthropist* wrote a very much fuller account. Pemberton quoted extensively from Lord Norton's autobiographical journal, his 'locked book', which had a number of references to his son, James.
- 2. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:139). Pemberton (1909) has a chapter, "Hams Theatricals, 1862-1886". He recorded that Lady Adderley began to organise the parties immediately after the birth of James in 1861. After the death of one of James's elder brothers, Arthur, Lady Adderley continued the drama parties 'for the sake of the many unselfish children I have left'. The plays were acted by members of the Adderley family and the 'rising amateurs of each generation' and the great houses in the neighbourhood were filled with guests at the times of the Hams Theatricals because 'many came from afar to witness these performances'. W. P. Stevens, (1943), in Father Adderley has also described the Hams theatricals fully. Alan Mackinnon (1910) in The Oxford Amateurs: A Short History of Theatricals at the University likewise wrote of the Hams Theatricals. All his life Adderley remained a companion and friend of actors. This aspect of Adderley's life will, however, be only briefly mentioned in this chapter.
- 3. To my knowledge, Adderley never explicitly wrote of these early analogies between his own youth and that of St. Francis. My reading is that he was aware of them, but that he was consistently critical of hagiographical writing, including any about himself.
- 4. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:70).
- 5. Arthur Marwick, (1970), in The Nature of History, and Phillippa Levine (1986), The Amateur and the Professional: Antiquarians, Historians and Archaeologists in Victorian England, 1838-1886, have described the emergence of history as a distinctive academic discipline. Adderley was able to compare the 'old' history of Carlyle and Macaulay and the 'new' history promoted by William Stubbs and his associates. See, for example, William Stubbs (1886), Seventeen Lectures on the Study of Medieval and Modern History and Kindred Subjects: Delivered at Oxford, 1867-1884.
- 6. Lord Norton was described as the 'father of town-planning' in *The Dictionary of National Biography*. He noted in 'my locked book': 'the singularly educative variety of my property. Hams, a charming country home in central England; Saltley, a suburban town property, adjoining such a busy place as Birmingham; Norton, a colliery and mining district, with another sort of manufacturing town near, at

Uppingham; then Peterborough (a small property near), a fen district requiring much draining. W. S. C. Pemberton, The Life of Lord Norton, (1909:27).

- 7. J. R. Green's Short History of the English People was first published in 1874. Its instant success was followed by a larger edition, A History of the English People (1887-80). Green's The Making of England was published while Adderley was an undergraduate.
- 8. Thomas Hill Green in 1878 became Professor of Philosophy at Oxford and died in 1882, the year in which Adderley took his degree. Melvin Richter in *The Politics of Conscience*, an appraisal of T. H. Green, 'the man, his thought, his milieu, and his influence', claimed that 'between 1880 and 1914 few, if any, other philosophers exerted a greater influence upon British thought and public policy than did T. H. Green' (1964:13).
- 9. 'Few people outside Oxford', Adderley wrote, 'knew the extraordinary patience and care with which Dr. Gore, then Principal of Pusey House, dealt with individuals like myself. I was absolutely ignorant until he opened my eyes as I sat and listened to his conversations, sometimes far into the night in his study'. Adderley wrote about his long acquaintance with Dr. Gore in Slums and Society, (1916:118-223).
- 10. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:139).
- 11. J. G. Adderley, The Fight for Drama at Oxford, (1883:3,13).
- 12. Alan Mackinnon (1910) has described in considerable detail how Adderley introduced dramatic performances to the Oxford calendar in The Oxford Amateurs: A Short History of Theatricals at the University. T. P. Stevens (1943) also recounted these events. W. L. Courtney, (1888) in his Preface to Adderley's, The Fight for the Drama at Oxford: Some Plain Facts, also paid tribute to Adderley's actions which led to the formation of The Oxford University Dramatic Society. Adderley himself was modest. He assembled 'plain facts' to show that other Oxford men before him, beside him, above him, and after him had shared in 'the fight' for drama at Oxford.
- 13. Victor W. Turner used the term, 'social drama' in Schism and Continuity in African Society:

The social drama is a limited area of transparency on the otherwise opaque surface of regular uneventful social life. Through it we are enabled to observe the crucial principles of social structure in their operation and their relevant dominance at successive points in time (1957:93).

- 14. Lord Norton recorded in his journal that 'James passed his Law examinations well'. Pemberton, Lord Norton, (1909:265).
- 15. St. Francis at the beginning of his *Testament* described his first meeting with a leper. He wrote that lepers, who had previously been bitter or nauseating to him, became sweet and a source of

consolation. There are incidents describing St. Francis and lepers in the earliest sacred biographies.

- 16. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:16).
- 17. Andrew Mearns, (1883), The Bitter Cry of Outcast London, was initially published anonymously. Anthony S. Wohl's "Introduction" to the 1974 reprint of the tract is an excellent and full account of the pamphlet's extraordinary impact.
- 18. Anon, The Oxford House in Bethnal Green (1948:10).
- 19. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, wrote that 'we did not trouble ourselves much about theological quarrels' at Oxford House. This is confirmed from independent evidence. (1916:47).
- 20. Anne Taylor (1992) in her biography of *Annie Besant* has an excellent account of the activities of Annie Besant and Charles Bradlaugh in the East End at this time. Neither were popular with most of the Church of England clergy.
- 21. Hensley Henson wrote in his journal, published in part as Retrospect of an Unimportant Life, that 'it ought to be an understood thing that lecturers shall answer objections. At worst, one unproved assertion is as good as another, and most of the secularist logic consists of unproved assertions' (1942:14).
- 22. William J. Fishman (1988) has provided an excellent description of Victoria Park at this time in East End, 1888: A Year in a London Borough among the Labouring Poor.
- 23. Adderley wrote in his Preface to Adcock's *East End Idylls*, 'Victoria Park, with all its peculiar attractiveness, cannot be mentioned in the same breath with its Sister "Hyde" or with Kensington Gardens' (1897:11).
- 24. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:55).
- 25. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:56).
- 26. There have been different constructions of Adderley's activities at Oxford House and in the area of Bethnal Green. In historical studies, he has been mentioned often, if briefly, because he was Oxford House's first full-time Head, a first developer of the university settlement movement, a rare Church of England soap-box orator, and an active member of the Guild of St. Matthew, a radical group founded earlier in Bethnal Green by Stewart Headlam. Adderley for his part claimed he had been appointed to Oxford House 'because there was no one else in the place who could devote time to it'. Oxford House, he insisted, was in his day a very 'inferior thing' to Toynbee Hall, the other Bethnal Green settlement founded in the same period. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:18).

- 27. Anthony Russell has written an excellent account of the social roles of the late-nineteenth century Anglican clergy in *The Clerical Profession* (1980).
- 28. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society (1916:67). Adderley's vicar, the Rev. H. C. Bromby, afterwards became Chaplain to West Malling Abbey, a Church of England contemplative community. He was associated also with The Community of St. Mary the Virgin at Wantage and with The Society of the Incarnation that his sister, Gertrude, 'founded' in Plaistow in 1894 in conjunction with Adderley. Adderley and Bromby remained 'firm friends' until Bromby's death. Adderley subsequently wrote of him that 'holiness shone out in his countenance' (In Slums and Society, 1916:67-8).
- 29. The East End News of 13 November 1888 recorded that there were 108,638 paupers in the East End compared with 10,431 the previous year.
- 30. Owen Chadwick, Hensley Henson: A Study in Friction between Church and State, (1983:41). Chadwick made a full study of Henson's journal written at this time now held in the Library of the Dean and Chapter of Durham. Both sources provide vivid accounts of Adderley at this time, from which I have quoted below.
- 31. Quoted, Owen Chadwick, Hensley Henson, (1983:41).
- 32. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:196).
- There have been differing constructions of Adderley's church-33. building activities at St. Frideswide's. T. P. Stevens described the splendid church as 'a monument to Adderley's energy and success' and drew attention to the altar frontal which had cost more than £2000. This attracted people to the church from miles around. Canon Liddon in his sermon 'The Vision of Corinth', preached in Christ Church Cathedral in 1889, celebrated the honour brought to Christ Church by men who could have 'relished' life's opportunities amid 'refined enjoyment', but who chose to bring honour to this 'great House' by working in Poplar. The Archbishop of Canterbury, Dr. Benson, after an evening spent in Poplar wrote to Lord Norton on the 12th of August 1892 that 'James is doing noble things in a nobly humble and faithful spirit'. The visit 'made me feel that the advice about your son was the soundest I ever gave'. (Quoted by Pemberton).
- 34. A. Adcock, East End Idylls, "At The Dock Gates", (1897:72).
- 35. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:197). He wrote that 'my ignorance of the exact issue prevented me from being a leader'. Afterwards, he was adamant that Christians should study the exact issues. This was a constant theme for his addresses during Lent and at retreats he conducted. Spiritual reading, he urged, should be supplemented with reading White Papers and the reports of Royal Commissions. See, for example, the printed addresses, Salvation by Jesus (1899) and Quis Habitat (1903).

- 36. One of Adderley's most interesting accounts of the dock strike written for the upper class was an epistolary novel, *The New Floreat:*A Letter to an Eton Boy on the Social Question. Adderley wittily contrasted the daily lives of the 'idle' rich and the 'idle' worker.
- 37. There is a considerable amount of independent evidence testifying to Adderley's involvement in the dock strike. 'A Communicant' wrote a letter to The Church Times published on 6 September 1889 saying that 'the clergy of Christ Church Oxford Mission, notably the Revd. the Hon. J. G. Adderley, have worked day and night in thorough sympathy with the men ... and that it was heartily appreciated by the men is evident from the vote of thanks given to Mr. Adderley at the meeting at the dock gates after Mr. Celestine Edwards' admirable address'. Ben Tillet, in his autobiography, Memories and Reflections, wrote: 'We found his influence and his connections invaluable in organising the work of relief. By his personal efforts he raised £800 for the relief fund'. (1931:137). A letter from Canon Liddon shows one of the ways in which Adderley used his influence. dated 31 August, 1889, began, 'Most gladly do I send you what I can for your good work in aiding the poor people who are distressed by I had hoped to come down and see you about it the strike. yesterday, but was prevented ... '. This, Adderley later presented to the Bodleian Library stuck in the front of a handwritten collection of Canon Liddon's sermons, 1862-89, which must have been given to An archivist has listed the letter, 'of no apparent connection'. (The Bodleian Library, The Department of Western Manuscripts, M.S. Engl. Th. e. 170).
- 38. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:193).
- 39. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:105).
- 40. Later cartoons were mainly in disposable literature. Adderley's *Old Seeds on New Ground*, a more substantial 'little book' printed in 1920 has twelve cartoons by Low.
- 41. Robert Blatchford wrote an article, "The Fellowship", in *The Clarion* of 9 March 1901, in which he described the origin and development of the paper and the Fellowship. Adderley shared in this development.
- 42. Haw (1904) observed in his Introduction to a collection of articles from *The Clarion:* 'Our writers range from working men Socialists to the son of a peer [Adderley] and the daughter of an archbishop' [Margaret Benson]. Adderley was a regular contributor over a long period.
- 43. In all Adderley's writings, what many would consider the sacred and the secular were merged. If I had allowed this thesis to develop into a full biography many cross-references could have been made. For instance, Adderley later wrote to Blatchford to explain that although one of his own papers had been included in a collection of 'The Oxford Papers' which his successor had printed, it was not his wish that Blatchford's papers should have been excluded.

- 44. J. G. Adderley, "The Evidence of the Resurrection" reprinted from The Clarion in Haw (Ed.) The Religious Doubts of Democracy (1904:94).
- 45. J. Woodforde, (1970), in *The Story of the Bicycle* has traced the social history of the bicycle. *The Clarion* carried many advertisements for bicycles.
- 46. A. M. Allchin, The Silent Rebellion, (1958:155). Lord Norton spoke in the Church Congress debate about Preaching and Preaching Orders. He had reservations about introducing a 'professional caste' into the Church of England which could never replace 'the individual influence of the pastor's home'. The Church Congress in Birmingham: Reports of the Papers and Discussions, (1893:355-7). The figures and lists of officials precede the transcripts of the debates.
- 47. The Church Congress in Birmingham: Reports of the Papers and Discussions, (1893:188-90).
- 48. The Church Congress in Birmingham: Reports of the Papers and Discussions, (1893:201).
- 49. The Archbishop of Canterbury's letter to Lord Norton, quoted Pemberton (1909:297).
- 50. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:193). Historians have often noted Adderley's membership of The Independent Labour Party. His 'irregular' political affiliation was a consequence of his 'irregular' religious values and the contrasting social contexts in which he had lived.
- 51. J. G. Adderley, Christ and Social Reform: An Appeal to Working Men (1893).
- 52. It is beyond the scope of this chapter to follow Adderley's political activities. He went to party meetings and to the Labour Churches in the North because he saw that these had a purpose beyond themselves. Keir Hardie was a close friend. In The Parson in Socialism: Jottings from my Notebook (1910) Adderley wrote his own Socialist autobiography, which is confirmed from independent evidence. Church historians have tended to ignore Adderley's later political actions, which were far more wide-ranging than his early membership of Christian Socialist societies which has often been mentioned.
- 53. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:70).
- 54. Alan Wilkinson, (1992), in *The Community of the Resurrection: A Centenary History* has written a full account of Frere's subsequent life in the Community of the Resurrection.
- 55. Adderley, In Slums and Society (1916:71). Later, Dr. Mason became Master of Pembroke College, Cambridge. It would be interesting to trace his influence from there. It could be that his devotion to St. Francis was passed to C. F. Andrews, also at Pembroke as its

Chaplain. The latter was later to become a friend of Gandhi, and of John Winslow, whose life-history this thesis will later consider.

- 56. Adderley made a number of references to the British Museum Library. He claimed that 'I was never more than a scribbler, a writer of words'. He had, however, acquired a long list of entries in the British Museum Library catalogues. 'I positively blush when I look at my name in the British Museum catalogue and see what a lot of space I take up with my penny-a-line effusions'. In Slums and Society, (1916:168, 174).
- 57. The three chapters of the Third Order Rule in *Misericors Dei Filius* were titled: (1) Concerning the Reception, Novitiate, and Profession of Members; (2) Concerning the Rule of Life; (3) Concerning the Offices, the Work of Visitors and the Rule Itself. Appendices listed Indulgences and Privileges that Roman Catholic Franciscans could obtain.
- 58. Adderley later explained:

The sources of information for the life of S. Francis are very numerous, as anyone can see for himself by looking in the British Museum Catalogue at the word Francis or Franciscans. (Francis: Little Poor Man of Assisi, 1900:151)

This work has an appendix of sources which indicated the detail and depth of Adderley's study in the British Museum.

- 59. Stephen wrote in his essay, "St. Francis of Assisi":

 Yet if, indeed, any student of Jewell or of Knox should so far descend from his Bodleian eminences as to cast a hasty glance over these lines, let him, if he will, first heartily censure, and then supply, their too palpable omissions. Let him write the complete story of St. Francis, and estimate impartially his acts, his opinions, his character, and his labours; and he will have written one important chapter of a History of the Monastic Orders, and will have contributed to supply one great deficiency in the ecclesiastical literature of the Protestant world. (1850:99).
- 60. E. M. Howse, (1976), in Saints in Politics: The 'Clapham Sect' and the Growth of Freedom has explained how the Clapham Sect acquired its name.
- 61. Stephen Remarx, like all Adderley's publications was cheap to buy and designed to be discarded. As he always insisted, it was merely a 'tract'. It was printed at least twelve times, and in a penny edition. The irony is that Stephen Remarx is now 'a rare book' and can be read in only a very few libraries. The copy that his father sent to Lord Gladstone, and on which Gladstone pencilled his comments (that Adderley later read at St. Deniol's Library) has been lost. Despite the difficulty in obtaining access to the story, I have not related it in any detail. There are adequate summaries in Anson (1956) and Drummond (1956), but they both stress the autobiographical and social gospel content, rather than the

organisational content which was, I argue, of first importance to Adderley.

- 62. Adderley's first publishing success (and none other of his writings were commercially as successful) was reviewed at the time and has been reviewed since in a number of different ways. It has been assessed for its literary qualities (and found wanting), for its autobiographical interest (and found interesting), for its social message (found to be that of Christian Socialism) and for its picture of the contemporary church (judged to be biassed). It has rarely been described as it was intended, as a prospectus for changing society by the introduction of a new form of social organisation. It has to my knowledge never before been suggested that it was an agenda for a 'sort of Franciscan Third Order'.
- 63. For readers of George Eliot's *Middlemarch* the name of Bulstrode would remind of one of her characters who had wanted to organise his social life on Franciscan lines. Adderley's writings are full of allusions of this kind.
- 64. Adderley, Stephen Remarx, (1893:6). Some of the themes of the Liberation Theologians of a century later were well worked out.
- 65. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:168).
- 66. J. G. Adderley, Stephen Remarx, (1993:129). Adderley may also have had other publications in mind such as J. H. Blunt's, Dictionary of Sects, Heresies, Ecclesiastical Parties and Schools of Religious Thought first published in 1874.
- 67. Those who have studied Church of England religious orders have tended to follow Peter Anson (1956) and to assume that a religious order is built on a 'community model'. In my view, Adderley never envisaged the Society of the Divine Compassion as a conventional 'community' of brothers and sisters. His view of a 'society' was one which was not confined to the locality of residence. This was perhaps easier for him than for some other people because of his upper-class background. Those who came to Hams Hall were never only 'locals'.
- 68. C. F. Andrews, John White of Mashonaland, (1935:117). One of Cripp's poems about St. Francis is published in The Oxford Book of Mystical Verse. Cripps also wrote an epitaph in the form of a short poem about Adderley 'once a comrade in tramping, dossing, and in preaching in the Gospel' for T. P. Steven's biographical encomium. There is an extensive archive about Cripps held in the National Archives at Harare.
- 69. Douglas V. Steere, (1973), God's Irregular: Arthur Shearly Cripps. Barrie Williams in The Franciscan Revival in the Anglican Communion has a brief biography of Cripps (1982:69-72).
- 70. The Blue Friar instalments were not printed in a form to survive. There are, to my knowledge, no existing copies of early editions of Goodwill. The British Library and the Bodleian Library both have

some later editions. In 1904, Adderley collected some of the Blue Friar stories which Wells, Gardner and Darton published as a cheap book. This is now a 'rare' book, but in both the libraries named above. The references in the thesis are mainly from chapter six.

- 71. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:87-88). Adderley later acknowledged his debt to Creighton's scholarship and drew the attention of readers to Creighton's lectures about St. Francis. See, for example, Francis: The Little Poor Man of Assisi (1900:156).
- 72. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:135).
- 73. The subject of 'authority' was of importance to many Anglicans in 1895-6. Leo XIII was at that time considering the validity of Anglican Orders. This was not a matter of concern to Adderley, but it was of concern to most who wrote and spoke about Anglican religious communities at this time.
- 74. J. G. Adderley, Paul Mercer, (1897:178). It is quite possible that this story was also an answer to John Ruskin's observations about St. Francis. Adderley was not concerned to establish 'craft-industries', but to improve the work conditions that he had actually seen in the East End. Space does not allow for this theme to be developed.
- 75. J. G. Adderley, Preface to Adcock, East End Idylls (1897:1). At this time, Adderley also suggested that the West End needed 'penitent forms'.
- 76. Adderley insisted that if the brothers looked at the record of the chapter meetings they could 'see how consistently I have maintained my position'. He reminded them that 'I was equally consistently opposed by the rest of Chapter'. This letter has been copied by hand into a Minute Book of the Society of the Divine Compassion now deposited with the archives of the Society of St. Francis at the Department of Western Manuscripts, the Bodleian Library, Oxford. It was clearly not available to those who have previously studied the Society of the Divine Compassion. The judgements previously made and that have been passed from one generation to another by oral tradition may be incorrect.
- 77. Sister Gertrude's letter was copied into the same minute book immediately following Adderley's letter.
- 78. Adderley wrote in Slums and Society that 'Father Chappel and Father Hardy allowed me to share with them' in the formation of the Society of the Divine Compassion. He acknowledged its continuing Franciscan spirit. 'The Franciscan model, which my love for St. Francis inclined me towards most of all, has been most effectively followed in the Society of the Divine Compassion.' (1916:78).
- 79. Mgr. Vernon, who had been a member of the Community of the Divine Compassion before his conversion to Roman Catholicism, in a letter to Fr. Lucian Hunt, O.F.M. on 26 September 1954.

- 80. J. G. Adderley, Looking Upward, (1896:89). He was clearly also uncomfortable about the quality of life of the 'regulars' compared with that in doss houses. He argued that 'regulars' in Church of England religious communities should not live 'even up to the standard of a second-class commercial hotel' (1896:205). There is independent evidence of Adderley's personal asceticism which, he always insisted, had lapses.
- 81. In a letter to The Church Times published on 5 July 1899.
- 82. T. P. Stevens, Father Adderley, (1943:22).
- 83. Peter Anson, The Hermit of Cat Island: The Life of Fra Jerome Hawes, (1958:10, 21, 25). Later, as this book recounted, Hawes became a hermit-missionary.
- 84. Barrie Williams, in *The Franciscan Revival in the Anglican Communion*, has a short outline of Martin's life (1982:72-3). Williams quoted from *Alumni Cantabrigiensis*, 'often a rather impersonal summary of careers' which recorded Martin had 'an influence almost hypnotic and a power for good that was irresistible'. Walkers of the Cornish Coast path pass a massive granite cross that George Martin erected at Dodman Point to be visible to seamen.
- 85. Verity Anderson, A Life of Rosslyn Bruce: The Last Eccentric, (1972:87, 136, 145).
- 86. Sabatier, in his concluding paragraph to the Introduction to Adderley's book, asked:

Where will the Church of Christ be tomorrow? I do not know. But what I am certain of is this, that she will be on the side of those who have made themselves poor; who have not imposed poverty on themselves as a privation or as a merit, but who have gained it with the enthusiasm of the prisoner who ended by breaking his last chain.

Francis: The Little Poor Man of Assisi, (1900:ix).

- 87. J. G. Adderley, Preface to Francis: The Little Poor Man of Assisi, (1900:v).
- 88. J. G. Adderley, St. Francis of Assisi, (1900:115).
- 89. J. G. Adderley, St. Francis of Assisi, (1900:117).
- 90. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:173). Adderley did not publicise the names of his critics. Pascal Robinson (1907), a leading Roman Catholic critic of Sabatier, was one of them.
- 91. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:174).
- 92. Paul Sabatier, (1901), Opuscules de critique historique.

- 93. C. L. Marson in J. G. Adderley and C. L. Marson, Third Orders: A Translation of an Ancient Rule of the Tertiaries, Together with an Account of Some Modern 'Third Orders', Two Sermons on St. Francis and an Article on the Religious Life, (1902:85). Third Orders has now also become a rare book. The British Library copy was destroyed by bombing in the 1939-1945 war and it has been impossible to replace it. There are copies in the libraries of Trinity College, Dublin, and the Bodleian Library, Oxford. Adderley sent a copy to Boston Public Library, because it was the world's first public library opened in 1852 and supported from taxation. This copy has a number of press reviews of the book attached to it. I was sent a copy from Pitts Theology Library, Emory University, Atlanta.
- 94. The extent of the rift between the scholars view and Adderley's view of the purpose of Franciscan Scholarship was brought out for me while collecting oral history. Father Lucian Hunt told me that in 1933, while he was a member of the Third Order of Christa Seva Sangha (to be discussed in a subsequent chapter), he was commissioned to see if the members could have a joint subscription to the Society. They were trying to live on the money provided by the dole at the time. He was told that the British Society of Franciscan Studies was 'nothing to do with that sort of thing our work is Latin texts'. A subscription was permitted when it was revealed that a fair proportion of the members of the Third Order could read Latin.
- 95. T. P. Steven's has an excellent account of Adderley in St. Marylebone written by Father Dru Drury, one of his curates. Drury acknowledged that 'few people could have worked happily under Adderley unless they were personally devoted to him, as I myself indeed was'. A. M. Coleman recalled a visit from Hensley Henson, now a Canon at Westminster, immaculately attired in a frock-coat and tall hat. When Adderley suggested a walk in the Park, the Canon gave a quick glance at the dishevelled garments of his friend, and said, 'Yes, after dark!'. Father Adderley (1943: 44-50).
- 96. J. G. Adderley (Ed.), Critical Questions (1903) and J. G. Adderley (Ed.), Practical Questions. Both books were lectures on Modern Difficulties in Church Life given at St. Mark's Church, Marylebone Road, 1902-4.
- 97. Nancy Dearmer, Life of Percy Dearmer, (1940:35). See also, Reg. Groves, (1967), Conrad Noel and the Thaxted Movement: An Adventure in Christian Socialism. There are now a number of studies of Dearmer and of Noel's 'Thaxted Movement'.
- 98. Barrie Williams (1982), has written about communities of American origin in Part III of *The Franciscan Revival in the Anglican Communion*. Eva Mack is mentioned on p. 154.
- 99. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:181).
- 100. The Franciscan Third Order, Chesterton suggested, 'is very little understood in Protestant countries and very little allowed for in Protestant history'. Those who lived in Protestant countries did not

know that St. Francis was 'an inspiration to innumerable crowds of ordinary married men and women; living lives like our own, only entirely different'. They could not see 'that morning glory' which St. Francis spread 'over a multitude of roofs and in a multitude of rooms':

Nothing is known of such obscure followers; and if possible less is known of the well-known followers. If we imagine passing us in the street a pageant of the Third Order of St. Francis, the famous figures would surprise us more than the strange ones for it would be like the unmasking of some mighty secret society. There rides St. Louis, there is Dante, crowned with laurel All sorts of great names from the most recent and rationalist centuries would stand revealed: the great Galvani, for instance, the father of all electricity, the magician who as made so many modern systems of stars and sounds.

- 101. T. P. Stevens, Father Adderley, (1943:71).
- 102. G. G. Coulton, (1919), Christ, St. Francis and Today was a series of lectures delivered without the restrictions of the tripos examinations in which Coulton discussed the practical relevance of St. Francis to a society recovering from the experience of war. He was in sympathy with Adderley's and Sabatier's modernist approach to the Franciscan Legenda.
- 103. Father Francis (1959) in Brother Douglas: Apostle of the Outcast has written an account of the life of Douglas Downes, and of his contribution to the eventual Society of St. Francis.
- 104. J. G. Adderley, "Franciscan Poverty", (1926:141-2).
- 105. J. G. Adderley, In Slums and Society, (1916:14).
- 106. Father Denis, S. S. F., from whom I collected oral history in 1988 in Alnmouth, who had been a novice of the Third Order in the early 1930s at St. Ives in Huntingdonshire, told me of Charles Gore's remark.
- 107. T. P. Stevens, Father Adderley, (Preface:5).

CHAPTER FOUR.

THE SUGGESTION OF EMILY ESTHER MARSHALL.

Part One.

CONSTRUCTING A SUGGESTION FOR A DIACONATE IN SUNDERLAND, 1879-89.

1. IMBIBING VALUES IN EARLY AND MIDDLE LIFE, 1832-1879.

(1) Family contexts. Emily Esther Marshall, born on the 4th of December 1832 in Hackney, Middlesex, was the fourth of the seven children, six daughters and one son, of Laurence Jopson and Jane Marshall. Her father had been a member of the Dragoon Guards and was then a Lloyds underwriter. She derived her membership of the Church of England from her father's family allegiance. With her three younger sisters she was baptised on the 6th of June 1837 at St. Olave Jewry in the City of London. Later, she was confirmed, and became a communicant member of the Church of England. 1

When Lawrence Marshall died, his widow, Jane Marshall, with her children, returned to Sunderland, the town of her birth, to live at Middle Hendon House, a large house (later to become a board school and now pulled down) in West Hendon, then a select residential area. She was the only daughter of a well-known Sunderland family, the Ogdens, owners of a number of properties and businesses, who, like most of Sunderland's leading families, were Quakers.

Miss Marshall derived her contemplative, but practical spirituality from her mother's Quaker family. Her only uncle, an unmarried solicitor, befriended the fatherless family. According to Corder, the Sunderland historian, he was 'an eccentric', and from him she is likely to have acquired her wide-ranging interests and independent outlook. She also acquired rather more social skills than most women of her class and generation. She was an accomplished local antiquarian, knowledgeable about art, and wrote and spoke fluent French.

Living in Sunderland, 1879-1889. When Miss Marshall in 1879 began to prepare her Suggestion which ten years later she presented to Bishop Lightfoot in Durham, she was still a spinster and 47 years old. Her mother had died, four of her sisters had married, and she was living at Douro House (now owned by Sunderland University) with her spinster sister. It was a fine town house, set in a terrace of family town houses. Leading Sunderland professional and business families were neighbours. In census returns, the Marshall sisters described themselves as holders of 'Fund and railway shares' and listed three or four resident servants.

Miss Marshall had seen the face of Sunderland change in the thirty years in which she had observed it as an adult. All around Douro Terrace was evidence that Sunderland entrepreneurs had constructed railways, built ships, carried coal, made steel, sunk mines, manufactured glass, bottled drinks, and marketed a banking system. The Sunderland City Fathers in 1879 registered their success in creating wealth with the construction of grand buildings near her home which were copies of Italian architecture: a new station, a new library, a new museum. Another wonder a few hundred yards away was a new bridge across the Wear. 1

However, in the decade which followed this outburst of civic pride and achievement, during which Miss Marshall composed her *Suggestion*, Sunderland's industrial, manufacturing and commercial enterprises fell on hard times while its population continued to increase. There were strikes,

lockouts, closures, and long periods of unemployment. Her observation of the social and economic changes in Sunderland was an important component of her Suggestion.

The original document of the Suggestion no longer exists, but other documents reveal that it was a proposal to the Bishop of Durham. Miss Marshall wanted the Bishop to take further steps towards the recognition of the ministry of women. Her particular Suggestion was that he should prepare the way for women to become ordained deacons. She claimed that there were many women who already carried out this ministry without payment. Even if they could not be paid for their service, their work should be officially recognised. It was desperately needed in the harsh economic climate of the final decades of the nineteenth century.

Miss Marshall made her Suggestion to the Bishop of Durham because she derived her sense of personal identity from her membership of the Church of England. Her social position in that Church was conventional in that like every other woman member of it, she had no statutory power. It was unconventional because she 'supported' three Sunderland parishes, a parish in Lancashire, and a parish in Kensington. This she believed gave her the experience and knowledge which made it appropriate for her to offer A Suggestion to the Church. Unusually, she believed that a woman was quite capable of making a Suggestion; but she knew that men held the legislative power to enact it.

Three of the Marshall sisters in the 1880s lived in new, low status, poor parishes in Sunderland which during their lifetime had been carved out of the ancient, large, well-endowed, and prestigious parish of St. Michael's, Bishopwearmouth, to meet the needs of its population growth. Douro House, at which Miss Marshall resided, was in the parish of St. Paul's, Hendon. Her sisters, Elisabeth and Helen, were married to the

vicars of St. Matthew's, Silksworth and St. Mark's, Millfield.

Another sister was married to the vicar of Oswaldtwistle, and Miss Marshall also had a home in London, a double-fronted house (which is now divided into flats), at 9 Hornton St. in the parish of St. Barnabas, Kensington.

Miss Marshall derived information to construct her Suggestion from this wide range of parochial contexts. It will be fruitful to consider the three Sunderland parishes. Through each of them she had an introduction to J. B. Lightfoot, formerly Lady Margaret Professor of Divinity at Cambridge, who was consecrated and enthroned Bishop of Durham in 1878.

2. 'A LADY' IN THREE SUNDERLAND PARISHES, 1879-89.

(1) <u>District Visiting in St. Matthew's, Silksworth</u>. The parish of Silksworth was one of Miss Marshall's first links with Bishop Lightfoot. In 1873, her sister, Elizabeth Maude, had married its first vicar, the Rev. J. J. Brown, a former pupil of Lightfoot.

Unlike Lightfoot and Brown, who had come from the South to the North only recently, Miss Marshall had known the village of Silksworth for most of her life. While a child, she had viewed the exterior of its pretty houses set among fields as she walked across the Tunstall hills to visit a cousin. By the time Lightfoot and Brown knew it, the agricultural village had been transformed. There had been a sudden invasion of immigrants, mainly from Ireland, who had come to work at the new coal pit which Lord Londonderry had opened outside the old village. The original village had been renamed 'Old Silksworth' and the newly-built area with houses for the miners had been named 'New Silksworth'. A new parish of St. Matthew's had been created to serve both populations. The traditional image of an English parish church at a village crossroads uniting a 'community' in a

common culture, with the rich and the poor caring for each other, was nonsense here. Almost everyone was a stranger to New Silksworth, and the people of Old Silksworth had closed ranks.

The vicar's sister-in-law who heard her sister's accounts of the homes which District Visitors entered, and which she almost certainly entered herself, recognised that residents in both 'Old' and 'New' Silksworth were at different times and for different reasons sometimes in deep poverty; it was not the same kind of poverty in the agricultural and mining halves of the parish. She related her first-hand observations at Silksworth to theories about methods for the relief of poverty discussed by the Charity Organisation Society. She had heard about them in the parish of St. Barnabas in Kensington, which parish, like most other parishes in the Church of England, also had women District Visitors. She had be sisted to be same that the church of England, also had women District Visitors.

Old Silksworth prompted Miss Marshall to assess the usefulness of members of the Church of England dispensing charity in the name of Christ by 'old methods'. When there was an outbreak of cholera, or of influenza, or when a father became disabled, or when a husband died leaving a widow, or a couple had grown old, gifts from the Church of grocery and coal tickets, portions of soup and jelly, and bars of soap were insulting. It was wrong, she decided, to make people dependent on inadequate charity when they were in need, often through no fault of their own. Traditional methods of relief, which Christians had practised for centuries were not suitable. 'New times and new ways are coming in', she wrote. 12

New Silksworth prompted her to assess the usefulness of members of the Church of England dispensing financial relief by 'new methods'. The thought of a Church of England district visitor writing down in a notebook exactly how an Irish Roman Catholic family obtained and spent its money after a sudden mining accident or death was for Miss Marshall 'offensive' and a form of 'espionage repugnant to English feelings'. A Church of England vicar, even though his Bishop had charged him to be a good shepherd to all his flock, should not be expected to send Church of England women to an Irish Roman Catholic sheepfold to separate undeserving goats from deserving sheep. Christian women should refuse to be 'inquisitorial agents' of a 'double-distilled system of spying among the poor'. 'How should we like it if the Archbishop of Canterbury told off certain duchesses to pay us weekly visits with a view to finding out the state of our income, and whether we were deserving?', she asked. 13

For Miss Marshall, the hardship in Silksworth was 'a disgrace to our civilisation' and its cure was beyond the healing scope of Church of England district visitors, whether they set out on their visits with soothing jellies or with note books to fill with statistics. Statutory agencies sponsored by the national government should take over responsibility for the relief of poverty because once money became the object of those visited by voluntary agencies 'the good you might have done in suitable conversation, advice and sympathy is at an end'. 15

If this were to happen, hundreds, even thousands, of women working voluntarily throughout England as District Visitors would be freed for other occupations. Her Suggestion was that women 'of talent, wealth and influence' could work alongside those who had developed a robust spirituality without comparable education, money and status in a sisterhood. Together, these women could develop each others spiritual resources to improve the conditions for all in society. Her Quaker forbears had shown that women were capable of such work.

Bishop Lightfoot in his Primary Charge to the clergy had said women deacons in the New Testament period had 'distinct apostolic authority'.

Lightfoot continued:

As I read my New Testament, the female Diaconate is as definite an institution in the Apostolic Church as the male Diaconate. Phoebe is as much a deacon as Stephen or Philip is a Deacon.

The Bishop had insisted that this was a subject about which 'he felt strongly'. Since Dean Howson and others also were advocating the restoration of the office of deacon for women, Miss Marshall thought it would be appropriate, when authority allowed, for some of these District Visitors to become deacons. 17

Meanwhile, Miss Marshall maintained, women should cease from being District Visitors because it was impossible to do the work effectively. She quoted the late Francis Hessey, former vicar of St. Barnabas, Kensington, who had said to her: 'Beware lest an office [of District Visitor] so closely bordering on that of a Deacon be evil spoken of through your unconscientious discharge of its duties'. 18

It did not occur to Miss Marshall at this time that her objections to District Visitors, with her related Suggestion that women should instead use their spiritual gifts as deacons, might themselves be superseded. However, since her mind remained flexible and acute, she retained her capacity for creative change. After 1891, as we shall see, she transformed her ideas, and began to advocate an Anglican Franciscan Third Order as well as a women's diaconate.

(2) 'A Lady of the Vicarage' at St. Mark's, Millfield. In 1884, the Rev. W. P. Swaby, who the previous year had married Miss Marshall's sister, Helen Mathilda, was appointed the second vicar of St. Mark's Millfield, formally constituted in 1879 as a parish to serve the people living in an area which had recently become heavily industrialised and densely populated.

At St. Mark's parish, Miss Marshall met Bishop Lightfoot more

frequently and also had access to his many statements delivered to the clergy, which were afterwards printed. He was, she discovered, a consistent advocate of the ministry of the diaconate for women.

Bishop Lightfoot was frequently in Sunderland because he had set himself the hard task of persuading the leaders of Durham society that the area of his diocese which most needed his attention was not its cathedral city, but the large and growing town of Sunderland. He had a special liking for the vicar of Millfield, the practical son of a builder, an able priest, a family man twice married, who was also studying for a third degree, a doctorate. When his friend, B. F. Westcott (later to be Lightfoot's successor as Bishop of Durham) asked for a suitable vicar and parish for one of his sons to serve his title as curate, it was to Swaby at Millfield that Lightfoot sent him. It was probably due in part to Lightfoot's influence that Swaby was diligent in studying church organisation and that in 1893 he became a Bishop himself.

Miss Marshall had, however, known Millfield for far longer than either the Bishop or Swaby. Her grandfather's flour mill had given it its name, and she had watched the fields around the mill become railways, factories and rows of single-storey 'cottages', a form of architecture distinctive then (and now) to Millfield.

In the 1880s, however, Miss Marshall viewed Millfield mainly from the social role which was assigned to her, and which she created for herself, as 'a lady of the vicarage'. She was often at the large and gracious house (now Chester's Restaurant) on the perimeter of the parish because Helen, her sister, had become the step-mother of four young children, was frequently ill, and in 1888 died. Miss Marshall seems to have acted as a surrogate for her sister in the dining room and in the parish.

Like several hundred thousand other women at this time, Miss

Marshall employed 'her leisure' not only in district visiting but in other philanthropic work, which required considerable organising ability. This work was completely without official recognition, and the clergy, according to Miss Marshall, seemed to have little concern for the spiritual needs of those who worked so hard. She insisted:

The upper classes should not be left out of the ministry which the poor receive. "

Even so, Miss Marshall provided fancy goods for stalls, organised and occasionally opened bazaars. She donated food for a table to seat twenty at a tea which catered for over two hundred, and then poured the tea for those who sat at her table. She provided flour, violins and bibles for cookery, music and scripture classes. She encouraged those with a low income to put money aside in savings banks and organised blanket, clothing and shoe clubs. She dispensed goods to mothers collected by a lying-in society. Where even pennies could not be found for a growing family's 'penny-dinners', she provided coins. She also wrote cheques to build a Sunday school, a Church day school and a second church so that this parish also could be divided. Her Suggestion was going to be that the women throughout the Church of England who were 'serving tables', 'teaching' and enabling 'improvements' should be 'recognised' and supported as deacons. He

At St. Mark's, Miss Marshall worked out the economic facets of her Suggestion. The deacons she had in mind would not need to be paid for their time-consuming work. She had learned at St. Mark's how much energy was expended in raising money, and she did not wish to add to this burden of 'successful' parishes. St. Mark's was often packed, and a second church was being built, but, although the congregation in one month gave 3573 coins in collections, they were mainly pence. Money

from outside the parish would be needed to pay for the building. Some local industrialists were generous, but Millfield could not command the interest which churches in East London attracted.

The new church was to be dedicated to St. Hilda (614-80). It is not fanciful, I believe, to hear Miss Marshall's understanding of a woman's possible domain in Swaby's announcement and explanation of the choice of patron Saint. It was the first church in Sunderland to be dedicated to a woman Saint. The woman chosen was not, like St. Elizabeth or St. Bridget, renowned for her charitable gifts to the poor, but for her presidency of a monastery, a spiritual power house, to which many came. Hilda was the host of the Council of Whitby at which, as Bede related, the structure of English Christianity had been formed. For Miss Marshall, who had made extensive study of the Church of the North East, Hilda was a role model. 29

In the dining room of St. Mark's vicarage, while performing her social duties, Miss Marshall learnt a very great deal about the present structures of the Church of England. It was not women but men - mainly clergymen - who were the policy makers of the Church of England. Since the Church had become more of a bureaucracy in the previous thirty years, the clergy, according to their status in a hierarchical structure, could make their suggestions at parish, deanery, diocesan, provincial and, at Lambeth Conferences, inter-provincial levels. Lay men had opportunity to speak at parish councils and many diocesan conferences. At all of these, a woman's voice was never heard. She realised that it would expedient in due course to send her Suggestion to the Bishop, and that it would be the clergy whom she would have to persuade to adopt and implement it.

Miss Marshall had no idea at this time that in the Millfield dining room she met the two clergymen who would be the hardest for her to persuade: Canon Body, who had been appointed Durham Diocesan missioner, who had strong Anglo Catholic convictions, and Canon Westcott, the father of one Swaby's curates, whose wife, in the same year as Miss Marshall submitted her Suggestion, would be one of the signatories of a Petition Against the Suffrage of Women. Westcott would later return to Millfield after he had been appointed Lightfoot's successor as Bishop of Durham. 31

Exiled sometimes to the drawing room - a social custom to which Miss Marshall was greatly opposed - she read the printed transactions of most of those meetings which the clergy attended. The clergy of Sunderland Rural Deanery - as she observed, an inappropriate name - gave her a ray of hope. Very unusually for this period, they had supported a lay initiative which had won the public praise and support of the Bishop. Seamen had suggested that they could interpret the New Testament to other men - they went to the same ports as St. Paul - and that men did not derive their social identity from their place of residence. To authorise their evangelism, two Orders of Lay Evangelists had been instituted with Lightfoot's consent in the Sunderland Rural Deanery to serve these men, regardless of the particular parish in which their home happened to be situated. 32

At St. Mark's, Swaby had already encouraged women 'cottage evangelists' to visit the women who worked in their cottage homes. Miss Marshall knew of the inequitable and uneven distribution of lay assistance in parishes. (Unlike Swaby, other vicars probably did not have sisters-in-law who brought in outsiders to work in their parishes). Her Suggestion to Lightfoot was going to be that he should exercise his prerogative as bishop and send women to those parishes where they were most needed. Lightfoot addressing the Durham diocesan conference suggested that 'due appreciation of the parochial system is one thing: a blind idolatry of it is another'. When 'the time was ripe', Emily believed,

the Bishop could ordain cottage evangelists as deacons with a ministry derived from his office. They should minister in the domain of women, as they had in the New Testament and Patristic period.

(3) An Aspiring Deacon at St. Paul's, Hendon. Douro House, Miss Marshall's own residence, was in St. Paul's parish. This district had been made into a parish in 1852, and Canon Mathie, its first vicar, was still its vicar in 1889, and he had long been a friend of the Marshall sisters. St. Paul's and Mathie were a further link with Bishop Lightfoot, because the latter had singled out Miss Marshall's home parish for his special attention. She was not preparing her ideas for presentation to a total stranger. Her intention was to assist him in implementing his own ideas in the geographical area of his choice.

Lightfoot was aware that St. Paul's at Hendon had the largest and most concentrated population of any parish in the diocese of Durham. He decided in 1888 that this poor area would be 'the fittest locality' for him to make a personal thank-offering for God's many and great blessings. The parish, he wrote to Mathie, because of its size and the needs of its people, ought to be divided into two, but 'being inhabited chiefly by working men, it [the parish] could not be expected to contribute very largely to such an object from its own resources'. He may have had the money-raising problems at St. Mark's in mind. Lightfoot told Mathie that he would himself pay the total cost for the new church for the new parish.

Lightfoot chose its dedication: St. Ignatius, a first-century Bishop of Antioch. Miss Marshall, a parishioner of this parish, who described herself as 'imbued with the New Testament and the Patristic period', and who had read Lightfoot's and other scholarly treatises, knew that the Bishop was convinced there had been women deacons in the time of St. Ignatius.

Miss Marshall's Suggestion, which she was soon going to send to him, was that it would be appropriate for him to take the first steps towards the restoration of this ministry in the location which he had chosen for his personal memorial.

A ministry made official and recognised would overcome the problems of lack of support and being taken for granted, which Miss Marshall had already found unacceptable. As a property owner she paid rates and was listed in Ward's street directories, but, being a woman, her name did not appear on any electoral register. This subjection of women while accepting their contributions was part of nineteenth century culture which she intended to change. In order to be allowed to minister in the private and domestic domain, she must first obtain permission to do so by contributing to the debates taking place in the public domain.

Miss Marshall may have hoped that Bishop Lightfoot would ease her entry to this debate; but it was not her intention to persuade him to assist her to become a member of a Franciscan Third Order. Her study had been of the Patristic period and of the founders of England described by Bede. She was until 1889 'in entire ignorance' of the Franciscan Third Order's existence, originating, as it did, in a later medieval period. 36

3. OBSERVING DIOCESAN ORGANISATIONS FROM A DISTANCE, 1879-89.

It must not be thought that Miss Marshall's Suggestion derived only from her view of the inadequacy of voluntary agencies to meet the poverty consequent upon economic hazards, from the successes and difficulties of the Church of England in three Sunderland parishes, from her admiration of Lightfoot's concern to meet the needs of Sunderland, and from her study of the period of history before the Council of Whitby. She also took a keen interest in three of Lightfoot's diocesan initiatives to extend and

deepen Christian ministry in his diocese: The Auckland Brotherhood, The Daughters of St. Cuthbert, and the White Cross Army. Each encouraged her to make her *Suggestion* intended to provide the Bishop with the opportunity of taking another initiative in his diocese, in which she could participate.

(1) The Auckland Brotherhood. The Auckland Brotherhood was the name given to the men who came to Lightfoot from Oxford and Cambridge universities to prepare for ordination under his direction at Auckland Castle. Lightfoot had pioneered an attempt to provide spiritual training for clergy who afterwards worked in the Durham diocese for a very low stipend, or for no payment at all, usually in new parishes without endowments in Gateshead and Sunderland. If

By 1889, however, Lightfoot was less of a personal magnet to ordinands at the universities, for he had resigned the Lady Margaret Chair of Divinity at Cambridge ten years previously. Fewer men were eschewing London and the South to come North, and the difficulty of paying even low stipends to those who were now priests, and in charge of new parishes, had become acute.

Miss Marshall duly made out her cheque to a Diocesan Fund which Lightfoot set up in 1888 to increase the funds available for areas of need. It could be construed as a discreet way of paying her brothers-in-law for their ministry. At the same time, however, she was preparing her Suggestion that the Church ought to 'desire not only our money - but our intellects, talents and time'. Her practical Suggestion was going to be that women, especially those who had intellects, talents and time, and who did not need to earn an income, could offset the lack of male recruits. In most cases, they would not even need houses provided for them.

(2) The Daughters of St. Cuthbert. Lightfoot's second diocesan initiative in which his Sunderland disciple took a keen interest was directly related to the diaconate for women. To prepare for the Church of England's eventual acceptance of this ministry, Lightfoot had invited women from the South to come to Durham to train for full-time ministry in the Church of England. The Bishop in 1885 gave Canon George Body, whom he had appointed as Canon Missioner with a diocesan brief, oversight of the women.

On 6 May 1887, in the year of Queen Victoria's Jubilee, Lightfoot commissioned the first trained women to serve in the diocese as 'church workers' in Durham Cathedral. Although he advocated the ministry of women deacons, he was not willing to act unilaterally and ordain them as deacons without the consent and agreement of his brother bishops. The Durham women were not, however, made deaconesses. They were deacons-in-waiting. In Durham, they became affectionately known as 'the Daughters of St. Cuthbert' because their training house was near Durham cathedral which had St. Cuthbert's shrine. 40

Again, lack of money was by 1889 a problem and more than a handful of new women in training would be a financial embarrassment. Canon Body in a letter to *The Church Times*, wrote of the 'burden' of these forty-one women, 'the weight of which weighs on me heavily in a time of illness'. Miss Marshall's practical *Suggestion* was to be that good use could be made of women already in the Durham diocese. 'Why wait for money? There are plenty of good workers who want no payment, if you would organise to use them', she was going to suggest. She was also unable to hide her anger that the women who had been trained in the diocese for three years were not being given the responsibilities allocated to male deacons, whose training, if any, lasted only one year. The licensed women did little other

than that which many other women, like herself, were also doing in parishes. But, since this was so, surely this currently unrecognised ministry could in the future be recognised?

(3) The White Cross Army. Lightfoot had shown that he was willing to work with women. In 1882, he had invited Ellice Hopkins to speak at a public meeting at Auckland Castle about the Purity Movement she wished the Church of England to promote. Miss Hopkins told her male audience that they should stop abusing the bodies of women by their words and actions. More than thirty of the Auckland men that night pledged support of her cause of sexual purity. The following year, Lightfoot chaired a larger public meeting at Edinburgh at which Miss Hopkins again spoke. The next day, Lightfoot gave this meeting nation-wide publicity by writing a letter to The Times. As the Bishop himself said at a Durham Diocesan Conference, 'I lost no opportunity' of urging the clergy to attend to the need for purity 'as a primary duty'. \frac{43}{2}.

As Miss Marshall was able to observe, Miss Hopkins and Bishop Lightfoot worked together, and in only seven years, an organisation, The White Cross Army, had been formed to link together those men who made pledges of purity across the Anglican Communion. Ellice Hopkins, because of the Bishop's co-operation, had used already existing structures of the Anglican Church to spread her message. A Council of Reference met occasionally to coordinate reports from Anglican Provinces spread across the British Empire and North America. Miss Marshall saw this combination of a lay woman's pressure and a Bishop's promotion, the use of existing church structures, and a Pan-Anglican Council as a model for the advocacy and implementation of her Suggestion. As Lightfoot wrote, a spark which had been struck in the Diocese of Durham had kindled a flame which was spreading far and wide.

4. LEARNING FROM NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL CONGRESSES, 1879-89.

(1) The Church Congresses. Miss Marshall, as we have observed, studied reports of clergy convocations, chapters, committees, conferences and commissions to which she could not contribute. The Church of England was, however, in the latter half of the nineteenth century, also beginning to recognise that more men, both lay and clerical, would appreciate forums to meet with each other and exchange ideas. Lay Houses of Convocation, diocesan conferences and parish meetings gave men this opportunity. The only gatherings to which women could go were those which lacked statutory authority and which had no legislative powers: for example, the Church Congresses. In 1878, Miss Whateley had a paper which she had written about women's role read at the Congress for her, and latterly, there had been some separate meetings for women. The hotels in the evenings, however, offered some opportunity for discussion between men and women which Miss Marshall, accompanied by Swaby, seems to have enjoyed and of which later she would take full advantage. 12

Members of the Church Congresses had for some years now been discussing deacons, deaconesses, and sisterhoods, and Miss Marshall had learnt that Canon Body, the Durham diocesan missioner she had met, had strong views about the necessity of keeping 'sisterhoods' in a state of 'ecclesiastical recognition and dependency'. She may have been surprised, however, at the Church Congress in 1888 to hear him expound a new suggestion. This was that the Church of England should restore an Order of virgins, and an Order of widows, especially the latter, to meet parochial needs. Widows, Canon Body suggested, need not become deaconesses, they could be 'simple Christian women'. 47

Since Canon Body held an influential position in the Durham diocese, this speech may also have persuaded Miss Marshall that the time was ripe for her in 1889 to make her own suggestion to Lightfoot. Canon Body had proposed Orders which were defined by an absence of sexual relations, thereby excluding married women. Although Miss Marshall was herself not married, she wanted the work of married women recognised. Like those Church of England clergy who were married, married women could fulfil a ministry in the diaconate. The wives of the clergy could have recognition and spiritual support at present confined to their husbands.

I want to mass and organise the splendid workers that exist, and who are at work *unrecognised*; to secure them to the organisation of the Church, as part of the organisation of the present day.

She had no idea as yet that this conviction also could be incorporated into a Franciscan Third order.

- (2) The Pan-Anglican Congress. Yet another feature of Miss Marshall's Suggestion stemmed from Lightfoot's initiative in Durham. After the 1888 Lambeth Conference (the first had been twenty years earlier) Lightfoot had invited many of the bishops from other Provinces of the Anglican Communion to Durham for a Pan-Anglican Gathering to meet clergy and laity. 49 As he would have wished, this gathering of the whole Church, and not of bishops only, gave Miss Marshall an inspiring and informed vision. She learned, for instance, that bishops of the West Indies had already raised the question of the ordination of women deacons at Lambeth Conferences, and that American bishops in Alabama and New York had already ordained deaconesses (not women deacons) with the laying on of hands. She knew that the Bishop of New York had told the ordained women that 'men will look up to you, and learn of you, because they see in you that columnar quality'.
- (3) <u>Women's Organisations</u>. As we have seen, Miss Marshall's *Suggestion* arose primarily from her contexts in North East England, and her commitment to the Anglican Communion, but she must also have been aware

in 1889 that the position of women was on international and national agendas. In Washington in 1888 sixty American and eight European delegates had founded the International Council of Women. In England, in 1889 the election of Lady Sandhurst to the London County Council had been ruled out of order, and there was much argument that year about political suffrage. She had seen in 1889, we may assume, a *Church Times* leader on 14 April which referred to 'the position of women' as 'a slightly reviving impulse to a languid cause ... which will enable men to see the only too probable result of any violent change'. It also could have spurred her to action.

5. WRITING AND PRESENTING A SUGGESTION FOR OUR TIMES AND RECEIVING BISHOP LIGHTFOOT'S RESPONSE, 1889.

Anglican Congress, Lightfoot collapsed. Despite a service of thanksgiving for his recovery on Ascension Day, 1889, some saw that the 'hand of death was upon him'. He, for his part, promised to attend to the diocese for so long as he was able. It was at this juncture that Miss Marshall wrote the final copy of her Suggestion for Our Times, and sent it to the Bishop, who had inspired her to see the diaconate as a ministry of desirability, worth, and utility. He had been the architect of its main proposition, the restoration of the diaconate of women to the Church of England, and he knew all the circumstances she had interpreted to define the needs of 'our times'. The need of the Church for ministers which it had not enough money to pay had inspired her particular Suggestion of a non-stipendiary diaconate.

As mentioned earlier, the original copy of the Suggestion that Lightfoot received and the letters that he and Miss Marshall afterwards sent to each other no longer exist. Nor, of course, were their private

conversations recorded. The only extant evidence is in papers that she later had printed, and from which Luigi Josa subsequently copied in Guiana.

Bishop Lightfoot's Response to Miss Marshall's Suggestion. According to Miss Marshall, the Bishop was enthusiastic about her Suggestion. He knew of the 'very large amount of time, energy and power latent among our upper and middle classes, which might be utilised for an untold amount of good work'. He believed her proposal 'should be productive of great good'. She also wrote that Bishop Lightfoot 'appreciated the possible advantage and importance of such a formation, partly in consequence of the opinions expressed in several letters from people of some consequence which I sent to him'. §6

Miss Marshall later told her correspondents that Lightfoot had asked her to revise her terminology. In order to explain that she was suggesting a ministry which would not require payment, as 'professionals' were paid, she had written of 'lay deacons', to indicate that those about whom she was writing would not be paid:

Names which I was soon told could not be passed, being inaccurate. But Bishop Lightfoot was very kind and good, disregarding, though correcting, a natural error, and in encouraging the idea, said it would have to be considered in what relation this new formation should hold to the Orders already at work.

(3) The Bishop's Own Suggestion of a Franciscan Third Order. Lightfoot was perhaps more aware than Miss Marshall was that the Church of England could still be many years distant from accepting the ministry of women deacons. Perhaps he realised that she was seeking not only recognition of women's spirituality, but a ministry and a means of encouraging it. He spoke to her of another 'Third Order' of ministry: a Franciscan Third Order. The Church of England, Lightfoot suggested to her, required a religious order imbued with 'the spirit of St. Francis, but

not his methods. According to Miss Marshall, Lightfoot told her:

The history of the monastic orders teaches us that what is really wanted for the evangelisation of the world is the self-renunciation of the monk or friar, without the cowl and cloister.

It is likely that the ailing Bishop did not expand these points. When Miss Marshall later came to consider them she was not, at first, certain whether she should be examining the spirit and methods of St. Francis of Assisi or St. Francis of Sales. Both men, she discovered later, had 'a gentle spirit' and had founded Third Orders. From her reminiscences recorded over a period of more than twenty years, it is clear that she came only gradually to wonder if a dying Bishop Lightfoot had gently proffered either a Franciscan alternative, or a Franciscan supplement, to her Suggestion for an unpaid diaconate for women.

Bishop Lightfoot died 21 December 1889 leaving a bereaved Miss Marshall to launch her Suggestion, which she had been formulating for the entire length of his episcopate, without his guidance and support. 'This idea, encouraged in its embryo form by Bishop Lightfoot, suffered from his death,' she later claimed. 59

Part Two.

THE SLOW EMERGENCE OF A FRANCISCAN THIRD ORDER.

6. FORMING THE LEAGUE OF ST. CUTHBERT, 1890-3.

(1) The Dominant Influence of Canon Body. Thus, when the time came for Miss Marshall's Suggestion to take shape in an organisation, Bishop Lightfoot had died, and Canon Body, who already directed the women in full-time training, had assumed command of her Suggestion at diocesan level.

That Miss Marshall did not trust him, she made clear in a written

note:

Canon Body told me, he [the Bishop] had written to him on the subject. I asked him at once if I could see the letter, and if anything had been said about the Third Order. I could not see the letter, but doubted if the Bishop were well enough to send it.

In spite of this lack of trust, she had to work with him, and so, under his supervision, she undertook the task of writing a Rule of Life for the proposed organisation. This made clear tensions between them from the outset. She had wanted to restore a ministry from the Patristic period, while he interpreted her Suggestion in terms of another Church of England organisation for women like the Mothers' Union or the Girls' Friendly Society, with a Rule, a patron, a badge, a uniform and an admission ceremony. 61

(2) Writing a Rule. Lightfoot had 'besought me above all things to be practical and to give the idea practical form', she recalled. This agreed with her Quaker-bred instincts to write a rule which was flexible and 'very light, very little of a yoke'. Canon Body had other ideas, which derived from the Anglo Catholic imitation of Roman Catholic organisation, in which rules were seen as needing to be firm in order to impart spiritual discipline. The final product was necessarily a compromise. It was brief but definite, requiring 'willing service to the Church', remembrance of the vows 'laid upon us in our Baptism and Confirmation' recitation of the collect of St. Barnabas, wearing a badge and the giving of alms. The final clause enjoined members 'to be duly subordinate to the ordained clergy, as taking part in the Parochial system in which they are placed'.

The final clause owed everything to Canon Body's frequently-expressed belief that the authority of the parochial clergy should be unchallenged. He had been in some trouble himself for trespassing on this 'holy ground' in his work as Canon Missioner, and had been forbidden to

preach in the Archdiocese of York, presumably for some breach of hierarchical etiquette. In a few words he negated one of Miss Marshall's cherished hopes, that the organisation should be free to minister wherever there was need, a hope which she firmly believed had been encouraged by Bishop Lightfoot. Without his support, she had to succumb to what Brian Heeney has recently described as 'the context of subordination' of women in the Church of England.

Lightfoot's death robbed her of support in other ways. He had referred to Roman Catholic methods. He must have known what these methods were, but without him, she was unable to obtain a manual of the Third Order of St. Francis or a text of any papal document in which there references to the Franciscan Third Order or a Latin or translated copy of the Rule which guided its members. Despite her inability to claim the direct patronage of St. Francis, in 1891 she described the organisation as a Third Order 'adapted from' and 'spiritually associated with St. Francis of Assisi'.

Choosing a Name and a Patron. Having been involved in the naming of two new churches: St. Hilda's and St. Ignatius' in Sunderland, Miss Marshall chose the Patron of her organisation with care. The Venerable Bede had written about St. Cuthbert. Bishop Lightfoot had preached a sermon, which was published in 1890, in which he expounded the debt which North East England owed to its Saint. Conveying his greater knowledge of the universal Church, he had said that St. Cuthbert's range of sympathy remind of St. Francis of Assisi. In addition, the thirteenth centenary of St. Cuthbert's death in 1887 had given rise to publications and events in commemoration of his life and work. This augmented the efforts of the archaeologists and antiquarians who had already done much to revive her interest in England's past. Accordingly, he became the

patron, not least because the other women waiting to be deaconesses had become known as the Daughters of St. Cuthbert. She chose to call the new organisation, 'The League of the Cross of St. Cuthbert' because that cross, his pectoral cross, was preserved in the Treasury of Durham Cathedral, and provided a convenient and appropriate model for an emblem. 67

- (4) Designing a Badge and Choosing a Uniform. The design of the badge, she suggested, should be a copy of the St. Cuthbert cross, with either real or imitation amethysts set in tracery of silver or some cheaper metal. She drew a smaller copy to be the crest on membership cards. To judge from the number of organisations which were in existence at this time, many members attached great importance to the presentation of badges and cards. For 'uniform', she suggested to Canon Body that members of the organisation should wear black while they carried out their duties. This, she stressed, would be practical for travel, and at that time there would have been no suggestion that to wear black might be laying claim to clerical status.
- Marshall's first choice, though it did have the benefit of signifying something wide-spread. However, it was not precise. She would have preferred a name which expressed her intentions, and favoured 'An Outer Order to the Diaconate'. This made clear that the members were 'outside' the ordained diaconate, but were ready to move into it as soon as it might be lawful for them to do so. She was aware that a women's religious community at London Colney had an outer order of those who were either waiting to join it or were wanting to 'sanctify' a secular vocation.

Canon Body, on the other hand, with his insistence on authority, wished the organisation to be called 'Parochial Order'. He considered it wrong to have organisations working in parishes unless they were under

the control of the incumbent. The noun 'League' was an honourable compromise, and shielded the Canon from any hint of the ordination of women.

There was, at first, some discussion of the term 'Third Order'. This had several attractions for Miss Marshall. It gave her organisation the potential of becoming a 'third order' of ordained ministry, deacons: third in succession to bishops and priests, or, on a different model, being a 'third order' which a bishop could ordain, after priests and the male diaconate. In Durham it could have been a 'third training order' in the scheme of the Auckland Brotherhood and the Society of Mary. In Sunderland there were already two orders of Lay Evangelists, to which hers could become a 'Third Order'. In addition, it could have designated an organisation of members living under rule in secular occupations, like the Third Orders of some Anglican religious communities.

In the end, 'League' became the accepted name. One further consideration might have commended it to Miss Marshall. Its very imprecision freed it from any hint of being bound to pre-existent groups, leaving it free to be simply 'spiritually associated with St. Francis of Assisi'.

(6) Lack of a Clear Constitution. Miss Marshall wished to be a member of a lawfully constituted and canonical apostolic ministry, for which the League might be 'ladies in waiting'. Such a body might have had its own officers and a governing council, giving it a clear identity. However, by 1890 it was clear that Canon Body intended to keep it under his personal control, which gave rise to a nick-name: 'Canon Body's Third Order'. This was not a name which she ever used, but it was the one which stuck until after both Miss Marshall's and Canon Body's deaths. 69

7. THE BIRTH OF THE LEAGUE OF ST. CUTHBERT.

(1)The Admission Ceremony. The final act of preparation had been to compose a service for the admission of members. On 27 October 1891 in the chapel of Durham Castle, Canon Body set the seal on his dominance by officiating at the first ceremony, though Miss Marshall had hoped it would have been conducted by Bishop Westcott, the new Bishop of Durham, in the Cathedral. She and five other women were admitted to The League of the Cross of St. Cuthbert. In view of all the discussion and compromise involved in deciding on this title, it was small wonder that Miss Marshall should later be entranced by Paul Sabatier's account of an organisational form to which, he claimed, St. Francis in his wisdom had not given a name. (2) The First Members. There is no surviving list of the first members, though the parish magazine of St. Mark's, Millfield lists six ladies, headed by Miss Marshall, which could have been the original group. If this is so, they began early to give their work new directions, since they took the parish branch of the Band of Hope and the Bible Class to Finchdale Abbey for tea and spiritual instruction.

8. OVERCOMING THE DISADVANTAGES OF ONE STRUCTURE WITH THE MERITS OF ANOTHER.

organisational form and recognition, Miss Marshall wanted to make its existence known so that it could be discussed in every parish, deanery, and diocese, and desired that 'Convocation should recognise it, as it has now other forms of workers'. Being also practical, she suggested to Canon Body that she should write a paper to present at the next Church Congress, a public forum at which her case could be presented if not by herself, at least by Swaby on her behalf. According to Miss Marshall, Canon Body would not allow this. Nor would Canon Body allow her to visit

parishes, other than those in which she had residential qualifications, to expound her ideas:

It was so little understood it could hardly be discussed, and I was told not to seek to bring it forward at Church Congresses and Diocesan Synods but to work at it among individuals. But the power of the individual in the Church is very limited, and rightly so. The clergy do not in general care to undertake anything without their Bishops' approval and the Bishops do not care to sanction an unproved thing.

In consequence, it seemed as if Miss Marshall would not be able to promote her ideas to the clergy, but only privately to women, who could not become members of the League without the approval of their vicar or rector. Unlike Florence Nightingale who had Herbert as a public spokesman, and Ellice Hopkins who had Lightfoot, and Louise Mandell Creighton and Henrietta Barnett who had husbands, and other women, who had fathers or brothers to constrain or encourage them, she was without an influential male partner in a position of higher social status than a vicar. She had to find her own solution.

Crossing Parochial Boundaries by Posting Letters. Miss Marshall already had a high regard for the letter as a means of communication between one person and another, and between one person and a whole assembly. St. Paul and St. Ignatius, patrons of the two parishes in which she lived, had addressed their solutions to questions of ministry by writing letters to congregations and individuals miles distant from them. She determined that like them – and, maybe, like Mary Wollstonecraft – she would overcome the problem of restrictive circumstances by sending letters. New times were coming in, and she could now stamp letters herself and know that they could reach every home in the land and most other parts of the British Empire.

Working quietly at Douro House in Sunderland, she wrote numerous letters by hand. The majority were addressed to individual clergy: to the

Rev. Boddington, the first vicar of the parish of St. Ignatius, to priests in other parishes in Sunderland Rural Deanery, to her brother-in-law in Lancashire, to Swaby's former curates now in other parishes, to clergy she had met at Church Congresses who were in other dioceses, and to clergy she knew in other lands. She wrote to the friends of Lightfoot, including the Archbishop of Canterbury. Having obtained encouragement from the Archbishop, she told the clergy:

I must mention that his Grace the Archbishop of Canterbury has said that if any of the clergy in his diocese apply to him on this matter, he will be glad to give it his favourable consideration.

She sometimes added 'a nucleus ... has already been formed under Canon Body'. [3]

Miss Marshall wrote to women in Durham, London, Paris, Australia and Africa urging them to ask 'permission' from their parish priests to keep the simple Rule of Life. By this hidden method, using her own time, her own income, and the postal system as her major resources, she mobilised discussion of her ideas and recruited a considerable number of members for the League, who joined it with the permission of their parish priests. Her correspondents asked questions, and she addressed questions to herself as she answered theirs.

9. SHARING ACQUIRED INFORMATION AND IDEAS IN PAMPHLETS, 1890-93.

(1) Converting Imagined Talks into Printed Pamphlets. Miss Marshall's correspondence served to clarify two questions which she had suppressed in her concern to get the Suggestion launched in some kind of acceptable organisational form. First, what had Lightfoot in mind when he commended 'the spirit of St. Francis'? Secondly, why had he criticised the 'methods' of Roman Catholic Franciscan Third Order organisation? In other words, what were the qualities of St. Francis that he suggested she should seek?

What were the qualities of a Roman Catholic Franciscan Third Order that he suggested she should avoid?

As Miss Marshall found information, she wrote it down, and then organised her notes into those talks which she would like to have given had she been allowed to do so. These notes became papers which were her answers to questions which her correspondents had raised about district visiting, deacons and deaconesses, and her first answers to her own questions about the spirit of St. Francis and the methods of the Roman Catholic Third Order. They had all the hallmarks of early investigation: long quotations, disconnected comments, unrestrained enthusiasm, incomplete sources. Since she had been forbidden to read them in public, she decided that other people should be offered the opportunity to read what she wrote about District Visitors, Deacons and Deaconesses in private. She probably saw in 1890 an advertisement in *The Church Times* that 'Messrs. Skeffingtons are willing to undertake the publication of suitable works on the AUTHOR'S ACCOUNT [sic]'.

By paying Skeffingtons to print District Visitors, Deacons and Deaconesses her papers, which she made chapters of small books, she obtained many more copies of what she had written than she could ever have done by hand or with one of the typewriters just becoming available. She also had complete control of the distribution of the packages sent by post. This had its advantages given that she had devised a scheme which Canon Body had not anticipated. Lightfoot had written in his renowned commentary on St. Paul's Epistles to the Philippians that the Kingdom of God, 'not being a kingdom of this world' was not 'limited by restrictions which fetter other societies, political or religious'. She took his words quite literally, and for the next ten years she asked Skeffingtons to print little books which would conveniently fit into envelopes with titles which

stated they were written by 'The Author of a Suggestion for Our Times'.

She probably thought that the clergy would give more attention to their post if her gender were not apparent. 76

(2) Beginning her Search for Information about St. Francis. Bishop Lightfoot had always placed great emphasis on an inner spirituality that issued in outward form. His disciple began therefore to search for the inner spirit of St. Francis of Assisi who the Bishop said had such affinity with St. Cuthbert. 77

Her difficulty had been that when Lightfoot commended St. Francis to her she had been unable to sustain a conversation or correspondence about the Saint because she knew so little about him. Umbria was not on the route of the 'Grand Tour' of cities that she had broadly followed, and she had never seen Giotto's narrative frescos in the upper church of St. Francis in Assisi that told the story of his life. She was informed about Italian art, but art books were not yet sophisticated enough to provide plates, except to privileged collectors. She knew more about painters than about their subjects.

For Miss Marshall, information about St. Francis that was anything more than a passing reference, or a short article, was difficult to find. Doubtless, she searched for information in Sunderland Public Library only a short walk from her home. It had plenty of information about St. Cuthbert and other Northern Saints among its antiquarian publications, but not a single book-length life of St. Francis. It held Lightfoot's numerous volumes about Syrian Saints and the Greek Fathers of the first centuries of Christianity, but nothing about this thirteenth-century Italian Saint. She probably also consulted the lists of Sunderland subscription library and postal subscription libraries, such as Mudie's Select Library for the Circulation and Sale of Books. She may also have tried the London

Library. They all lacked books about St. Francis. She could have found information at the British Museum Library, in the Oxford and Cambridge University libraries, and in Roman Catholic libraries and seminaries, but she did not have access to these places. She 'scoured', as she explained, not only libraries, but bookshops to little avail.

Oliphant's, Life of St. Francis of Assisi. It may have been the original version published by the Sunday Library for Household Reading for which Oliphant first wrote her account in 1867, or it may have been a later edition published by Macmillans which in 1879, more than ten years earlier, had its sixth thousandth and final printing. 18

The book made an immediate and favourable impression on Miss Marshall. She already admired Mrs. Oliphant, and responded to her combination of scholarship and story-telling. The character of St. Francis as interpreted in the book appealed to her greatly, especially his founding of the Third Order and framing its Rule. The Saint is frequently commended in this account for his 'utter naturalness' and his willingness to speak to people concerning their actual situation, not according to some 'a priori' standards of his own devising.

Miss Marshall had long been unhappy with the condescension and patronising attitude of the District Visitor scheme. That St. Francis had occupied himself in bringing spiritual joy to his hearers rather than questioning them about the conduct of their lives seemed wholly appropriate. The account given of the founding of the Third Order accorded with this. When, according to the Legend quoted by Mrs. Oliphant, large numbers of people wished to follow the Saint's example, he accepted their need to carry on with their lives; working, caring for

children and other dependents, looking after property and the affairs of State and generally maintaining society's fabric. For them he devised a simple rule of prayer, fasting and almsgiving which they could discharge even at their busiest times. Entry to the Third Order was made conditional on a person's standing in his or her community, not in terms of 'respectability', but in putting right past wrongs or shortcomings and making restitution where necessary. She recognised the appropriateness of these conditions for the time in which she lived.

With her long-standing desire to be a deacon, Miss Marshall identified with the man who had remained a deacon at a time when it was natural for all deacons to proceed to priesthood. Other matters Mrs. Oliphant ascribed to the spirit of the age in which St. Francis lived. However, she shrewdly observed that the Third Order at first was like every other reforming movement. Its members were the Puritans or Society of Methodists of their day, and, like them, rejected its fashionable vanities, distractions and perceived excesses.

Miss Marshall found nothing to object to in any of this, rather she seems to have been captivated by its evangelical simplicity. She concluded that 'a revival of a useful and beautiful idea of St. Francis' in the Church of England was long overdue. An Anglican Third Order 'might be useful to humanity and the world'.

(4) Examining Leo XIII's Rule. The late Bishop of Durham's warning about methods continued to puzzle her. It may well have been her decision to leave Sunderland and live at Craig Lea, a house in Darlington (now the Darlington Education Office) which enabled her to obtain access to a Roman Catholic Franciscan Third Order Manual and edited versions of Pope Leo XIII's statements. One of the very few Roman Catholic convents for women keeping the Rule of St. Clare, the second Order of the Franciscan family

of Orders, was only a few hundred yards from her new home. She may have obtained her information from there, or from some person associated with the Sisters. The other possibility is that she obtained it on a visit to France, because she had to translate some of it from French. By whatever method, she came to study the Roman Catholic Franciscan Third Order Rule.

Once she had seen the list of indulgences, the form of admission requiring the wearing of a cord, the frequent prayers to Our Lady, she understood that it was not in keeping with the breadth of Anglicanism. As she later wrote:

The clear intentions of Leo XIII may be new and interesting to some who think his Order can only be connected with Franciscans, and not also grafted onto a more solid and lasting thing, the Church itself.

She did not linger with this Rule, because she found far greater interest in a publication by B. F. Westcott, who had succeeded Lightfoot as Bishop of Durham.

(5) A Silent Dialogue with Bishop Westcott. Soon after his enthronement in 1891, Westcott had given Canon Body permission to admit Miss Marshall and her companions to The League of St. Cuthbert, but would seem to have given no positive encouragement to the new small organisation in his diocese. This very much disappointed her.

Miss Marshall read, however, many of the books and papers which Westcott wrote as she had those of his predecessor. When Westcott's Essays in the History of Christian Thought in the West was published in late 1891, to her surprise it included a whole section, initially an address delivered to laymen, about the Franciscan Third Order. Her own Bishop was claiming that 'by the institution of the Third Order of Penitents, as they were called, the work of Francis was consummated'. Westcott wrote that Francis, a deacon, should be an inspiration to laymen. According to

Westcott, she deduced, deacons were lay, not clerical: and lay people were male only. Theology, Westcott had told his Diocesan Conference, was the province of the clergy.

Having been instructed by Lightfoot that deacons were clerics, Miss Marshall wanted to argue theology with his successor. 'I wish to point out ... ', she wrote in her notes. Her principal objection to Westcott's approach was that 'men only, or women only, are only half of humanity, and religion was meant for the whole of it'. 84

Miss Marshall made little headway in recruiting in the Durham diocese because neither Westcott nor Body encouraged her, but there was in 1892 a steady growth in the numbers of members in London. In her brother-in-law's parish of Oswaldtwisle there were twenty members. Their vicar had informed them, when preaching about the Shunamite, that 'a fair woman without discretion is like a jewel of gold in a swine's snout.

10. COMING TO SEE, VALUE AND UNDERSTAND TWO FACES OF ST. FRANCIS OF ASSISI, 1894.

Miss Marshall's brother-in-law, William Proctor Swaby, in 1893 was elected Bishop of British Guiana and after his consecration at Westminster Abbey and his enthronement in Georgetown in May 1894, she set out on the long journey from Sunderland to Assisi. The indications are that she travelled alone.

(1) <u>Discovering S. François d'Assise</u> and <u>Meeting Paul Sabatier</u>. Miss Marshall's first stop of any duration was in Paris. She looked there in shops and libraries for information about St. Francis. It could not have been a better year in which to look, for Paul Sabatier's S. François d'Assise had that year taken France by storm, but had not yet been translated into English or reviewed in England. She bought a copy in the

French language - the eleventh impression in less than a year. She moved on to the French Riviera and read it avidly. She wrote in her journal that Sabatier:

Has an acknowledged touch of genius which, it is said, only genius can understand; but in this instance it has been very generally appreciated.

Miss Marshall then went further South into Italy. She may have stopped in Florence, but her main destination was the Hotel Subasio (still one of Assisi's most prestigious hotels) next to the double church which housed both St. Francis's body and Giotto's frescoes.

Miss Marshall had gone to Assisi, the main centre of the Roman Catholic cultus of St. Francis, to obtain information from Roman Catholics and to spend much of her time looking at the Italian paintings of St. Francis. She had arrived at the little town in the year in which its Saint had had his first major reinterpretation since Pope Gregory IX canonised him more than seven centuries earlier. Sabatier's book was:

Further interesting, because the present Pope, whose great appreciation of Franciscan ideals is well known, on hearing of the book, sent the author his blessing. Still further, it has met with notice from the Roman Church - from the party opposed to evangelical freedom in it - by being placed on the Index Expurgatorius.

'St. Francis was a mystic', she wrote, and he must 'have been a great puzzle to the priests of his day'.88

Paul Sabatier was also a guest at the Hotel Subasio with his wife and family and she had opportunity to speak with him. She told Sabatier, who was less than half her age, about her experiences in England, the Suggestion that she had made, the response of Bishop Lightfoot, and her present search for the spirit of St. Francis and the methods of the Roman Catholic Franciscan Order. 'M. Sabatier was much interested in hearing of any such Order as the Parochial Third Order in the English Church'. It

was already, he told her, 'dans le sens de S. François ... votre église d'Angleterre, celle ci a une grande mission à accomplir".

Ancient and Modern. The young scholar clarified for this older woman the differences between his version of the origins of the Order and the Roman Catholic viewpoint, and the differences between the rule and constitution of the organisation she had founded in England and the rule and organisation of the Roman Catholic Franciscan Third Order. She was now well informed about the origin of the Franciscan Third Order, and the changes in it in the course of its historical development. She made copious notes for Skeffingtons to print on her return to England.

11. THE MOULDING OF AN HYBRID ORGANISATION, 1894-7.

(1) Growth of the Durham Franciscan Third Order in the West Indies.

On return to England, Miss Marshall learned of the activities of her brother-in-law, W. P. Swaby, Bishop of British Guiana. He had appointed an Italian, Fortunata Pietro Luigi Josa, but a priest of the Church of England, to oversee the planting and growth of organisations that originated in Durham, especially the White Cross Army and the League of St. Cuthbert, 'spiritually associated with St. Francis of Assisi'. The Italian knew about St. Francis, but not about St. Cuthbert, and since the Province of the West Indies already had a diaconate for women, he fostered an organisation which in the West Indies was named a Franciscan Third Order, to which Swaby gave his episcopal approval.

In the first year, West Indian members were enrolled in their hundreds, men as well as women. Under episcopal authority, the new organisation was a brotherhood and sisterhood, and Josa became its leading advocate. After Swaby was translated to Antigua, the White Cross Army in

the islands was merged with the Franciscan Third Order. The organisation grew rapidly in the West Indies.

Bishop Westcott of Durham Sanctions Deaconesses. (2) while she had been on her travels, Bishop Westcott, following a decision made by Church of England bishops about the legitimacy of ordaining deaconesses had in 1894 in Durham Cathedral commissioned Elizabeth Clarkson as the first deaconess of the diocese. Miss Marshall's dream of women being deacons, not deaconesses, in the Durham diocese was wiped out for the foreseeable future. As she saw it, a Fourth Order, following after the male Orders of bishops, priests, and deacons had now been There was no immediate possibility of women being part of a created. Third Order of Apostolic Ministry, deacons. St. Francis could not now be appropriated as an exemplar for a Third Order of deacons in the English Provinces of the Anglican Communion. As she later wrote: 'One important change was made when the Bishops re-organised the Order Deaconesses'.90

Always practical, Miss Marshall recognised that a Franciscan Third Order might give women a better chance of deepening their spiritual lives and exercising an active ministry and offer a valid ministry to men and women in the West Indies. She wrote:

I feel as if this spiritual association with the Third Order of St. Francis was one more step heavenward, one more step above the mists and perplexities of life, and a joining of hands with those in the warfare and with those who are at rest.

(3) Varying Appraisals of an Emerging Third Order Organisation.

Controversy, however, now increased. The clergy with whom she had been corresponding over the years agonized over the structural form of the organisation. How could this organisation originating in the Durham diocese claim to be a beacon lighting two paths? How could it point the

Anglican Communion in one direction to the restoration of women deacons, and in another to the restoration of a Franciscan Third Order? Was there any logical connection between them? How could an organisation that in England attracted 'the upper grades' of white women be linked with one in the West Indies that attracted illiterate out-of-work black men?

Each of her clerical correspondents had his own criticisms of the emerging and growing organisation which she sought to answer. The discussion in 1895 was coloured by the hope of some Anglo Catholic clergy that Pope Leo XIII would recognise the validity of the Anglican Orders of Bishops, Priests and Deacons. These clergy wanted to adopt the Franciscan Rule which Leo XIII had given to the Third Order. Her slightly acid reply was:

Ritualistic clergy have a fancy for introducing Benediction, the Stations of the Cross, Missa Cantatas, High Mass and so many things partly Roman [They] condemn the Rules as useless because there is no special mention of how often the sacrament should be taken. I very much doubt if St. Francis made such a rule for tertiaries.

Others had different problems. 'St. Francis is a foreigner', one objected. 'So is most of the food you eat', Miss Marshall replied. 'Third Order is an antiquated term' another said. 'Archdeacon has no relation to present day facts', she retorted. 93

Two substantial pamphlets, The Dawn Breaking and Some Thoughts on the Third Order of St. Francis, Ancient and Modern were printed and distributed in 1896 and 1897 in which Miss Marshall edited the arguments of those who had written to her. In 1897 she wrote:

I shall be glad if more of our fathers in God will pay attention to this large subject [The Third Order of the Franciscans].

Luigi Josa in Guiana took this as an invitation. Bishop Swaby must have told him of Miss Marshall's difficulties in the diocese of Durham and he wrote a forthright dedication for his book. He praised 'my own

Bishop, the Right Reverend William Proctor Swaby, D.D.', and registered his 'appreciation of his act in making this organisation, which is founded on the Third Order of St. Francis, Diocesan'. However, he referred to Miss Marshall as 'a simple member of the Anglican Church' who had 'by divine grace' formed the Order. Canon Body wrote a very cautious Preface saying the book had been written 'for those connected with an adaptation of the Third Order'. Josa's book, published by Mowbrays in England, seemed to make the situation for the developing organisation in the Church of England more difficult than before as the clergy in the West Indies and England argued with each other. Some of the English clergy began to call Miss Marshall, 'Our Foundress'.

12. THE NEW CENTURY, 1900-15.

(1) Longed-for Acceptance in Durham. At the turn of the century, Miss Marshall was almost seventy years old. Her brother-in-law had been translated to the diocese of Barbados, and there was now a Third Order Council of West Indian bishops. On the 16th November, 1901, she wrote to the new Bishop of Durham, H. C. G. Moule:

My Lord,

May I be allowed to draw your attention, when more at leisure, to this Order, which began in Durham in Bishop Lightfoot's time, but tho' he was encouraging me in letters, as to the formation of some such Order, he died before it could be fully formed.

No one wrote more beautifully and sympathetically than Bishop Westcott of the Third Order of S. Francis; and he agreed with me in desiring some such formation for ordinary people. I enclose these papers for a further explanation, and if at any time you would like to see me on the subject I shall be glad to wait on you. The Order was made Diocesan in Guiana by Bishop Swaby, and I have had many letters from the clergy there and elsewhere, saying how useful they found it especially in keeping things together after disestablishment. I should be glad if, while I am yet alive, I could see the Order Diocesan in Durham, where it arose. I myself meant it always to be a Third Order as an extension of the Diaconate; in its two branches of men and women.

Bishop Moule was persuaded by Miss Marshall's argument. He joined

the West Indian bishops on the Council of Reference of the Order. This Council was modelled on the one Lightfoot had set up with Miss Hopkins for the White Cross Army. Now that 'her barque had been launched' Miss Marshall prepared to hand over the direction to other people.

(2) <u>Wider Liaisons</u>. In 1900, James Adderley published his first straight-forward account of St. Francis. Miss Marshall may have been in contact with him earlier. She could well have attended the meeting which Adderley organised in London to meet Paul Sabatier. Certainly, Adderley included a copy of The Rule of the Third Order which Miss Marshall had founded in an Appendix of the study of *Third Orders* published subsequent to that meeting.

In 1901 she edited her last documents, a book with articles written by six priests, who were seeking to guide the Order. The Anglican Third Order magazine, which she had founded, had a new editor, from India. By 1909, the Order had several hundred members, and am Inter-Provincial Council of thirty. She then described herself as *Della Fontana*, a fountain allowed to be intermittent. When war seemed likely in 1913, she described the Order in the magazine as 'a wavering flame that is not easily blown out'.

(3) Resolving the Relationship Between Appearance and Essence. In her last years Miss Marshall showed herself to be a true disciple of Lightfoot. She had long been struggling with a question that she had been unable to conceptualise clearly. It was a question troubling other people at this time: 'How should inner spirituality be reflected in Christian organisations and their decision-making?'

This question permeated many of the writings of Bishop Lightfoot. It permeated also Miss Marshall's understanding of herself. Now over eighty, she saw herself inwardly a deacon-in-waiting in the Third Order

of Apostolic Ministry and a tertiary-in-waiting in the Third Order of the Franciscan family of three Orders. In due course, she was convinced both of these identities would receive full and official recognition in the Anglican Communion.

The phrase, Third Order, has no terrors for me and those like minded. It was our raison d'être, whether on account of the fascinating and worldwide lessons of St. Francis, or the safe connection with the organisation of the Ancient and Universal Church.

Miss Marshall believed, as Professor Moberley claimed Lightfoot had taught:

That the outward represents the inward, and the inward which is represented is far higher than the outward which represents it: therefore while the inward is essentially necessary for the reality of the outward, the outward is only conventionally necessary for the reality of the inward.

This was not a hard position for a person whose family had been Quakers. She argued that 'by connecting' the Anglican Third Order' with the Diaconate, we distinguish from the Roman use, which it is both honourable and important to do'. 101

In contrast, in the eyes of constitutionalists, she was not a deacon or a Franciscan. In the words with which Leo XIII described other Anglican Orders, her organisation was null and void because it was defective in both intention and form.

13. SUBSEQUENT EVENTS.

Miss Emily Marshall died in Ripon. *The Guardian* on the 8 July 1915 published an obituary from which this quotation is taken.

Her name will especially be connected with the endeavour to establish an Order of Tertiaries in connection with the Church of this country and of the Anglican Communion throughout the world. S. Francis of Assisi was her ideal saint, and she endeavoured to conform her life to the spirit of this great servant of God.

The Anglican Third Order Quarterly Magazine that August recalled that Miss

Marshall 'did start anew the Order in our midst - she saw the great opportunities which such an Order afforded, and seized them'.

The hybrid organisation lingered. Sister Beatrice, a 'former member of Canon Body's Third Order' from the Channel Islands informed Dorothy Swayne of The Fellowship of the Way, a new embryonic Franciscan group in 1931 of her membership of a Franciscan Third Order. The Reverend Joseph Jones in 1932 informed the handful of members of the emerging Franciscan Third Order of Christ Seva Sangha, brought from India to St. Ives in Huntingdonshire, that there were already Franciscan tertiaries in the West Indies. When the Fellowship of the Way and the Third Order of Christa Seva Sangha merged, they wrote to Durham, and having found that it had died there, proceeded to establish a Church of England Franciscan Third Order. 103

Sister Beatrice, of Les Giroflees, Croute, Guernsey, who wore a light grey habit, was listed in the new organisation as a 'former member of Canon Body's Third Order'. She told Dorothy Swayne of Miss Marshall's experiences and Miss Swayne took heed. In 1940, Sister Beatrice 'believed herself to be the only surviving member of the earlier English revival', while from the West Indies Joseph Jones persisted in reminding the new organisation of former and present success in the West Indies. In the present Third Order of the Society of St. Francis, there are a number of women deacons.

NOTES.

Miss Marshall's pamphlets have been listed in the Bibliography as: Author of A Suggestion for Our Times, [Emily Esther Marshall]. In the notes I have used titles alone. Referencing for the period before 1890 is always quoted with a later date because the earlier history has had to be reconstructed from retrospective accounts printed in these pamphlets, Anglican Third Order magazines, The Third Order at Work, and the two editions of Luigi Josa's book.

- 1. The Register of the Church of St. Olave Jewry, Guildhall Library Ms. 4401/2.
- 2. Sunderland Local Studies centre has a map showing the location of the house, which is listed in street directories. John Swaby of Richmond, who has assisted my research into the life of the sister-in-law of his grandfather has a painting of it. It is a very substantial house. R. A. Waters, (1900) in Hendon Past and Present has described the area in the period in which Miss Marshall lived in it.
- 3. Miss Marshall's family history can be traced from Corder's manuscripts.
- 4. The Corder Manuscripts, "Friend's Pedigree", Sunderland Local Studies Centre, (11-12 and 55-58). Corder lost interest in the Marshall family because of the lack of a male heir in the Sunderland line. He also refused to include those he called 'foreign importations' in his detailed studies of many volumes.
- 5. I have adopted the convention of the late-nineteenth century and used Emily Marshall's title of 'Miss' throughout this chapter. It was customary for Adderley and the other founders to be called by their surnames: it would not have been customary to address a middle-aged woman in Miss Marshall's social position as 'Marshall'.
- 6. The 1851 Census, HO 107 2390 f.157, Entry No. 611.
- 7. Local historians have collected a vast amount of material about the history of Sunderland, but a walk in the area of Miss Marshall's former home still provides a sense of Sunderland's pride in its achievement in the mid-nineteenth century. Sunderland, River, Town and People, edited in 1988 by Geoffrey Milburn and Stuart T. Miller, has some excellent articles and photographs.
- 8. Suggestions were a genre of the period. For example, A Few Practical Suggestions on Electoral Reform and the Ballot (1854), Suggestions for the Efficacy of the Navy (1862) and Lay Suggestions on Modern Preaching and Preachers (1867).

- 9. D. W. Smith (1989) has studied the strange story of this cousin, Priscilla Mary Beckwith, 1806-77: A Forgotten Victorian Lady, who built a Roman Catholic Church in Silksworth, but who died just before Miss Marshall visited Silksworth Church of England vicarage. D. W. Smith, a local historian, provided me with an immense amount of information about Silksworth. He was very impressed that Miss Marshall knew of the antiquarian publications which examined the itineraries of St. Cuthbert and 'the Community of St. Cuthbert' in an area that had become a coal mine.
- 10. There are now several excellent studies of the philanthropic activity of women in the late-nineteenth century which have drawn attention to the importance of District Visiting as both national and local nineteenth-century phenomena. F. K. Prochaska, (1980) Women and Philanthropy in Nineteenth-Century England, has a detailed section, in which he made reference to Miss Marshall's later anonymous Prochaska failed to understand the significance of the pamphlet. desire for 'a black dress', but his study was one of the clues that enabled me to identify Miss Marshall. Brian Heeney (1988) in The Women's Movement in The Church of England, 1850-1930 also dealt fully with the role of Church of England district visitors. Had this thesis been allowed to develop into a study of Sunderland, an interesting comparison could have been made with Lambeth, which was studied by Jeremy Cox. Variations in the activities of the churches would be found in Sunderland, not unlike those Cox described in The English Churches in Secular Society: Lambeth, 1870-1930. Miss Marshall was aware of the differences in her brother-in law's parishes, although to the outsider they would look very similar.
- 11. A number of publications of the Charity Organisation Society during this period illustrate the contemporary discussion of district visiting and its reform. For example, Francis Peak (1879), The Uncharitableness of Inadequate Relief; C. S. Loch (1882), Some Necessary Reforms in Charitable Work; M. W. Moggridge (1889), London and Provincial Aspects of Charity Organisation. Suggestions for the Best Means of Organising Local Charity Organisations (n.d.) could have inspired Miss Marshall's own use of the term 'Suggestion'.
- 12. Quoted Josa, St. Francis and the Third Order in the Anglo Catholic Church, (1903:110), from one of Miss Marshall's earlier pamphlets.
- 13. District Visitors, Deacons, and Deaconesses, (1890:7). Other references to District Visiting are scattered throughout the pamphlets which Miss Marshall subsequently had printed. See, for example, District Visitors, Deacons, and Deaconesses (1890 and 1891). She acknowledged that she borrowed some of her ideas from other sources. The quotation with which the paragraph closes was taken from a 'Refractory Visitor'.
- 14. District Visitors, Deacons, and Deaconesses and a Proposed Adaptation, (1890:4).
- 15. District Visitors, Deacons, and Deaconesses, (1890:4).

- 16. Bishop J. B. Lightfoot in his Primary Charge to the Clergy of the Diocese of Durham.
- 17. Dr. J. S. Howson published his study of deaconesses in 1862 after he had visited the Kaiserworth Deaconesses. At the Church Congress in 1883, which Miss Marshall almost certainly attended, he had said that 'the argument for the recognition of Deaconesses as a part of Christian ministry is as strong as the argument for episcopacy'.
- 18. Miss Marshall quoted extensively from Hessey's Hints to District Visitors in District Visitors, Deaconesses and a Proposed Adaptation, (1901 and 1902). She wrote that Hessey had independently arrived at the same conclusions as she had.
- 19. Lightfoot had already arranged the division of the Durham Diocese. The new Diocese of Newcastle had been formed so that more thorough attention could be given to the growing population there. This made Sunderland the main centre of population in the smaller diocese of Durham.
- 20. Swaby obtained his B.D. Degree at Durham in 1887, and his Doctorate in 1890 at the age of 48. Bishop Lightfoot clearly encouraged his mature student. The Barbados Gazette in 1916, at the time of Swaby's death, recorded the devotion which Swaby had to Bishop Lightfoot.
- 21. St. Mark's parish had more than 20 District Visitors in July 1884. The number almost doubled in the next seven years. Mrs. Swaby (and presumably Miss Marshall as her surrogate) had charge of Offerton Street, a street which still has cottages today.
- 22. Some Thoughts of the Third Order of St. Francis (1897:41). In this work Miss Marshall writes of the experiences which gave rise to her Suggestion for the benefit of new members. She tends to generalise her experience because she is wanting to extend the Order well beyond Sunderland.
- 23. The examples in this paragraph have been taken from the Parish Magazines of St. Mark's, Millfield, one of the parishes with which Miss Marshall was closely associated. These magazines have not been deposited at the Durham Record Office. The copies I consulted are held by the present vicar of St. Mark's, Millfield.
- 24. Louise Hubbard suggested that about half a million women in England were occupied 'more or less continuously or semi-professionally' in philanthropic work (1893:364). Brian Heeney estimated that 'several hundred thousand certainly worked directly under Church of England auspices' (1988:22).
- 25. St. Mark's parish magazines provide abundant evidence of high attendances at church. To be sure of obtaining a seat at services, regular attenders were invited to come ten minutes or half-an-hour early, depending on the occasion, and enter by the vestry door, before the main door was opened. Swaby chid them when a Wednesday evening congregation fell below one hundred people.

- 26. This was the number of coins given in November 1884. I am grateful to John Swaby for pointing me to the significance of the number and the values of the coins.
- 27. The site for St. Hilda's church was purchased in 1887. In March 1889, the estimated cost was £5,760 of which only £1,600 was raised or promised. St. Mark's Parish accounts.
- 28. There are architectural plans of St. Mark's Church, a large building, on permanent display in Sunderland Museum. The Church has now been destroyed.
- 29. St. Hilda's Church was not completed before Swaby vacated the parish. Money to complete it was anonymously donated. Could Miss Marshall have been the donor?
- 30. Kenneth A. Thompson, (1980), has written an excellent study of the growth of bureaucracy in the Church of England in this period. The archives at the Dean and Chapter Library in Durham and at the Durham Record Office reveal that the Diocese of Durham was no exception to the general trend. Bishop Lightfoot seems to have been particularly anxious, however, that the proceedings of these male and clerical bureaucracies should be made available to, and discussed by all members of the laity who might want to take an interest in them.
- 31. St. Hilda's Church was consecrated in June 1894.
- 32. The two Orders of Lay Evangelists were possibly related to the arrival of the Salvation Army in 1879 in Sunderland. The Lay Evangelists were described in Parish, Rural Deanery and Diocesan Literature.
- 33. St. Mark's parish was a particularly appropriate place in which to practise 'cottage religion', because of the 'Sunderland cottages'. Although Emily does not mention the Bible Women who worked with Mrs. Raynard, who died in 1879, it is possible that her 1889 Suggestion was a protest at the change of role of these women from Bible preachers to nurses. Miss Marshall may also have known of other women who were cottage evangelists, like those described by Deborah M. Valenze (1985) in Prophetic Sons and Daughters: Female Preaching and Popular Religion in Industrial England.
- 34. J. B. Lightfoot, Primary Charge, (1884).
- 35. Lightfoot's letter to Canon Mathie was printed in St. Ignatius's Magazine in March, 1890. "Notes by a Church-Warden" describe and explain the choice and the church in considerable detail.
- 36. Miss Marshall was in 1889 'quite unconscious' of the existence of Leo XIII's Revised Third Order Rule. Quoted Luigi Josa, St. Francis of Assisi and the Third Order in the Anglo Catholic Church, (1903:110).
- 37. A very sensitive impression of the life of the Auckland Brotherhood can be found in R. W. Barbour (1896), *Auckland Castle*. Barbour, a Free Church Minister stayed there in 1882. Miss Marshall would have

known some of the men described.

- 38. Durham Diocesan Accounts.
- 39. Papers held in the archives at the Dean and Chapter Library of Durham indicate that Lightfoot initially issued personal invitations to women to come to the Durham Diocese. One paper, written by one of the women (unnamed and undated) said 'they placed themselves under his [Lightfoot's] direction to work in any parish to which they might be invited and he might send them'. This writer claimed that the women began with 'no funds, no definite rule, no organisation'. One of those who came, Miss Fitzmaurice, became a friend of Miss Marshall. She may well have been a source of information for the latter.
- 40. The evidence suggests that, while Lightfoot was Bishop of Durham, The Daughters of St. Cuthbert had a very fluid organisation with emphasis on the development of an inner spirituality. This was in harmony with the spirit of the Auckland Brotherhood.
- 41. Canon Body's letter dated the 5 October was printed in *The Church Times* on 11 October 1889.
- 42. Miss Marshall reported this in Some Thoughts on the Third Order of St. Francis (1987:38). She was always insistent on the economy of her Suggestion; and constantly surprised that the clergy seemed embarrassed to view its practical merits.
- 43. J. B. Lightfoot, A Charge Delivered to the Clergy of the Diocese of Durham, (1886:38).
- 44. A considerable amount of literature, all of it slight in length and light in weight, was printed about the White Cross Army. Marshall would have seen it at the Sunderland vicarages. following are good examples: J.B. Lightfoot, An Address to Members of the White Cross Army (delivered at St. Mary's Church, Gateshead on 20 May, 1883), Ellice J. Hopkins, A Plea for the Wider Action of the Church of England in the Prevention of the Degradation of Women (1879), Grave Moral Questions Addressed to the Men and Women of England (1882), The White Cross Army: A Statement of the Bishop of Durham's Movement (1883), The Purity Movement: Cannot We Use Existing Institutions? A Practical Suggestion to Clergy and Layworkers (1885), The White Cross Army, (n.d.), Ten Reasons Why I Should Join the White Cross Movement, (n.d.), The Power of Womanhood, 1899. These and other pamphlets were all deposited at the British Museum Library, but they have not attracted much attention from students of the period.
- 45. Miss Marshall explained to her later correspondents, for example, in Some Thoughts of the Third Order of St. Francis, Ancient and Modern, that 'for some time past I have been in the habit of taking much interest in the different forms of religious life in our English Church, and in attending Church Congresses when it has been in my power to do so' (1897:1). The reason for making this remark at the start of this book was the 'distinct colouring and incisiveness' of the

Church Congress debates after Leo XIII in 1896 had declared Anglican Orders 'null and void'. This incisiveness had previously in her view been lacking.

- 46. Canon G. Body at the Convocation of the Province of York in 1883 had spoken of the 'practical importance' of keeping sisterhoods in 'such a state of ecclesiastical recognition and dependency as might save them from such lamentable developments as might grow up if they [the Convocations] left them independent of the control of the Church' (1883:97).
- 47. The Editor of the Official Report of the Church Congress recorded that Canon Body's paper was lost before reaching the publishers. The report printed of Canon Body's speech had been extracted from a Manchester newspaper. This was very unusual (1888:750).
- 48. Miss Marshall, quoted Josa, St. Francis and the Third Order in the Anglo Catholic Church, (1903:110).
- 49. There is a full account of the Durham Congress in the Durham Diocesan Gazette of the same year which Miss Marshall would have read. Alan Stephenson (1978) in Anglicanism and the Lambeth Conferences has since written one of the fullest accounts of this Durham Congress and the Lambeth Conference which preceded it. Like other writers, he stressed the influence of Bishop Lightfoot upon the proceedings.
- 50. Miss Marshall was well informed about North America because Swaby went in 1886 to study the church there.
- 51. District Visitors, Deacons and Deaconesses, (1891:66).
- 52. Edith F. Hurwitz (1977) in "The International Sisterhood" has since described and explained the significance of 1889 for women's organisations.
- 53. The Church Times leader, 'The Position of Women', on 18 April 1889 was of two and a half columns. On 26 July 1889, the same paper carried a review praising Heber's Women's Suffrage and National Danger: A Plea for the Ascendancy of Man. Miss Marshall observed later that The Guardian and The Church Times, two Church of England newspapers which she read regularly, would not promote her arguments, or the cause of the Diaconate for women.
- 54. There is just a possibility that Lightfoot never himself wrote to Miss Marshall. Lightfoot's chaplain in the 1889 Quarterly Review, published soon after the Bishop's death revealed that Lightfoot always answered letters, but that his chaplains often composed them:

 No letter remained unanswered, whether it was that of the Southern farmer who wished to know if the Bishop could supply him with Durham cows, or that of a lady who felt sure he could find time to read a theological work in MS before she sent it to the press and 'may she say in her Preface that it had his approval?'.

Could this latter remark have referred to Miss Marshall? It seems

most unlikely because she had met the Bishop on a number of occasions and on several occasions quoted his letters to her in print. Sadly, it is unlikely that we shall ever have sight of hand-written letters. Diligent search has not resulted in finding a single handwritten letter sent by Miss Marshall to Lightfoot, or by Lightfoot to Miss Marshall. As John Robinson explained, 'An appeal was made in *The Times* of 2 June 1893 by H. W. Watkins, the Archdeacon of Durham, saying that the Executors and Trustees of the late Bishop Lightfoot desired to make a collection of his letters. But no sign of them survive'. It would be thoroughly in character for Miss Marshall to have responded to this appeal.

- 55. Quoted by Miss Marshall in the 1894 Quarterly Magazine, Vol.I, No.1, p.1. The British Library holds the only copies I have seen of this magazine.
- 56. Some Thoughts on the Third Order of St. Francis, (1897:39). When some other people, as we shall see, later took up her Suggestion and argued that what she had intended was a Franciscan Third Order taken from a contemporary Roman Catholic model, Miss Marshall always reminded them of the origin of her suggestion. 'Only I know', she claimed more than once.
- 57. The Dawn Breaking, (1897:39).
- 58. Miss Marshall reported Lightfoot's suggestion to her in *The Dawn Breaking*, (1896: chapter 5.) She revealed this information because some of the clergy in 1895 were urging the introduction of Roman Catholic Franciscan Third Order methods.
- 59. The Third Order at Work, (1901:7).
- 60. The italics have been added. Miss Marshall never changed her opinion of Canon Body. Later she discovered that the National Church Magazine had said 'that Canon Body doubtless thought to strengthen the upper Orders by organising the lower, and wished the movement heartily God speed'. (Quoted Third Order Quarterly Magazine, (1904:1)
- 61. The Rule was printed at the close of the pamphlets which Miss Marshall later distributed. I have not found a single copy of the cards she had printed. She wrote that supplies were kept at Church House by Mr. Fitzmaurice. Many church records, such as those of some of the Christian Socialist groups, thought to have been at Church House in this period are missing.
- 62. District Visitors, Deacons and Deaconesses, (1891:36).
- 63. The Manuals of the Roman Catholic Franciscan Third Order were distributed by the Franciscan friars. They sometimes contained injunctions discouraging Roman Catholic tertiaries from showing them to other people.

- 64. James Raine in 1828 had edited a large volume, St. Cuthbert, with an account of the state in which his remains were found upon the opening of his tomb in Durham Cathedral in the year 1827. This event would have prepared Miss Marshall for information about the opening of St. Francis's tomb. As Lightfoot suggested in his sermon, there were a number of remarkable affinities between the lives and the cultus of St. Cuthbert and St. Francis.
- 65. J. B. Lightfoot, "St. Cuthbert" (1890:83). Lightfoot's sermon preached in 1883 at Chester-le-Street was printed in *Leaders of the Northern Church*.
- 66. George Allan, (1824), City of Durham, for example.
- 67. Miss Marshall never forgot her early devotion to St. Cuthbert. Nearly thirty years later, in the Magazine of the Anglican Third Order in 1911, she wrote that in 1890:

I was taking the finished and accepted Rules of the proposed Third Order through the fields of Silksworth, Co. Durham to the village post-office, I was thinking things over, and that it was the country where St. Cuthbert lived and worked, and turned to God.

- 68. It was not until the 1900s that Miss Marshall revealed in her printed pamphlets the difficulties which she had experienced in the first three years of her attempt to set up her organisation. Presumably, once the organisation was established, she felt more able to write about the past.
- 69. The name 'Canon Body's Third Order' prevailed even after his death. Michael Hill in his study of *The Religious Order* mentioned this organisation in a paragraph noting the Canon's influence (1973:255). Canon Body's was only the only name associated with the Order which was generally known.
- 70. District Visitors, Deacons, Deaconesses, (1890:22).
- 71. Some Thoughts on the Third Order of St. Francis, (1897: 52).
- 72. Mary Wollstonecraft's letters were published in 1889, the year in which Miss Marshall submitted her Suggestion to Bishop Lightfoot.
- 73. Deacons, Deaconesses, and a Proposed Adaptation, (1890:88-90)
- 74. Some Thoughts on the Third Order of St. Francis, Ancient and Modern, (1897:51,52).
- 75. Skeffington's advertisement informed potential customers that the firm 'will furnish estimate of the probable cost of any manuscript, and all copies sold will be accounted for to the Author, on the usual commission terms'. The Church Times, 13 August, (1890:1267).

- 76. Had Miss Marshall not failed to notice an allusion to herself as 'she' in an edition in 1897 which included some of the replies she had received to earlier editions, it would have been impossible to be certain of her gender. It is significant, I believe, that she did not call herself an 'authoress' and that she was not prepared, like George Eliot, for example, to take a male name. It took me nearly two years after finding the initials, E. E. M., in the 1897 book to discover the name of the person to whom they referred, and a further year after that to track down her Sunderland identity. This is, perhaps, an indication of how well she hid her identity and location in the first tracts.
- 77. Miss Marshall copied also long passages written in French from the life of St. Francis de Sales which she had printed.
- 78. The catalogue of Sunderland Public Library at this time had not a single book with the name of St. Francis in the title. An 1890s list had over forty books by Mrs. Oliphant, an indication of her popularity, but Oliphant's St. Francis of Assisi was not among them. It was not in Darlington Public Library either. Public libraries in some towns in the South, however, held this book. It could be that the dominant Quaker influence and the small Roman Catholic presence in both these Northern towns meant that few books about Roman Catholic Saints were purchased or donated. Subscription libraries, that, like Miss Marshall made use of the postal system, were an important feature of social life in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The Church Times which Emily read regularly carried an advertisement for Mudie's Library on 30 January, 1889. The Town subscription was one guinea and the Country subscription was two guineas
- 79. Deacons, Deaconesses and a Proposed Adaptation, (1890:22).
- 80. Deacons, Deaconesses and a Proposed Adaptation, (1890:22).
- 81. Some Thoughts on the Third Order of St. Francis, Ancient and Modern, (1897:52).
- 82. Swaby had been given a collection of Westcott's complete works as a present after Westcott's son left St. Mark's parish. Miss Marshall must have been one of very few people in the Durham diocese to have had the opportunity to study the new Bishop's writings before his enthronement.
- 83. Westcott, Essays in the History of Christian Thought in the West, (1891:42).
- 84. Deacons and Deaconesses, (1891:9). Miss Marshall probably deliberately echoed Mrs. Oliphant's fictional character, Phoebe of Carlingford. 'Women are half of the world, and their opinion is as good as another'. The Chronicles of Carlingford were first published in 1876. Mrs. Oliphant's life and writings have recently been a subject of considerable interest. Phoebe Junior can now be read as Number 310 of Virago Modern Classics. The quotation is from p. 117 of the 1989 Edition. There is in my opinion little doubt that Miss

Marshall was attracted to St. Francis, in part, because the only full life of the Saint available to her had been written by a woman with a cultivated and independent mind. Mrs. Oliphant criticised Francis, for instance, for placing Clare in a convent.

- 85. The Anglican Third Order Quarterly Magazine, The First Quarter, 1894.
- 86. The West Indies was a self-governing Province of the world-wide Anglican Communion. It elected its own Bishops, made its own canons and Regulations by synodical act, and administered its own finances. In Guiana 50% of the population was non-Christian. Swaby wrote extensively about Guiana for St. Mark's, Millfield, Parish Magazine.
- 87. The Dawn Breaking, (1896:21).
- 88. The Dawn Breaking, (1896:22).
- 89. The Dawn Breaking, (1896:27).
- 90. The Third Order at Work, (1901:10).
- 91. The Dawn Breaking, (1896:7).
- 92. The Dawn Breaking, (1896:35).
- 93. These discussions were summarised in 1902 in The Anglican Third Order at Work.
- 94. Some Thoughts on the Third Order of St. Francis, Ancient and Modern, (1897:52).
- 95. L. F. Josa, (1898), St. Francis of Assisi and the Third Order in the Anglo Catholic Church.
- 96. I have quoted this letter at length because it is the only evidence pertaining to Miss Marshall's activities in the archives at The Dean and Chapter Library, Durham. (Nor are there any at the Durham Record Office, at Durham University or in the Sunderland Local Studies Centre). Some months after I had completed a lengthy search of possible files, the Dean and Chapter's archivist, Roger Norris, found it in a quite unrelated file, and kindly sent it to me, for which I am grateful.
- 97. The Parochial or Third Order (Anglican): Thoughts and Experiences, The Order at Work. (1901). The early copies of the Magazine are missing. They had to be destroyed because Miss Marshall had not known that she was breaking copyright laws by making a drawing of a Holman Hunt picture for the cover. Some of the later magazines are in the British Library at Bloomsbury. I have not found any elsewhere.
- 98. The Third Order Magazine, (1909:13).
- 99. The Anglican Third Order Magazine, 1914.

- 100. Moberley, Ministerial Priesthood, (1897:viii).
- 101. The Third Order at Work, (1901:9).
- 102. The membership list held by Father Lucian Hunt O. F. M. who became an Anglican Franciscan at this time.
- 103. The Minute Book of the Third Order of Christa Seva Sangha at St. Ives, Huntingdonshire. The S.S.F. Archive at the Bodleian Library.
- 104. The Franciscan Third Order archives at Hilfield Friary, Dorset.

CHAPTER FIVE.

THE ASHRAM EXPERIMENT OF JOHN COPLEY WINSLOW.

Part One.

ACQUIRING INDIAN AND FRANCISCAN VALUES, 1883-1919.

1. IMBIBING VALUES IN BRITISH SOCIAL CONTEXTS OF EARLY LIFE, 1883-1914.

(1) Growing up at Hanworth Rectory, at Eton, and Studying at Balliol College, Oxford. John Copley Winslow was the only son of a country rector. He was born at Hanworth, Middlesex, in 1883. The village was still free from London's encroachment at that time, having a population of only 1,000. Winslow's childhood was therefore conditioned by the Victorian conventions of parsonage life in a local community, so his social world would be different from that of most of the parishioners. As his immediate family was related to the Charringtons, the brewers, and he was educated at Eton, his social contacts were mainly with people who could broadly be described as English upper-middle class.

Winslow grew up in a period which was 'the High Noon' of the British Empire. In 1897, he was one of the thousand Eton pupils who processed with flaming torches to Windsor Castle to serenade Victoria, Queen of England and Empress of India, celebrating her diamond jubilee. The following year, his school was honoured when Lord Curzon, a former pupil, was appointed the Queen's Viceroy.

After leaving Eton, Winslow went to Balliol College, Oxford. The resources he required for his own study had been provided by the Greeks

and Romans, but he met students whose library requirements were texts from 'the Orient'. Max Muller, Monier Williams and others had introduced them to the West, and made them the content of a demanding intellectual discipline, Oriental Studies. As Winslow later recalled, Balliol 'was something of a pioneer in breaking down social and racial barriers' because it had students who were dark-skinned members of the races which Britain ruled.

(2) <u>Visiting India.</u> Stimulated by the varied impressions he had acquired, Winslow visited India during the 'high season' of winter and spring in 1905-1906 to decide whether or not he would like to work there. Balliol was eminent in sending young graduates to India to administer the Raj. Already considering the possibility of ordination, he examined several contexts in India in which he could work if he were to become a priest of the Church of England.

At the Cambridge Mission to Delhi, Winslow was attracted by the personality and ideas of C. F. Andrews, a teacher at St. Stephen's, a college of higher education for Indian students. Andrews suggested to Winslow that ancient Indian values were to the people of the Indian subcontinent what Greek and Roman values were to the people of Europe: a rich cultural reservoir. The purpose of someone from the West coming to the Orient should be to enrich Christianity, not to persuade Hindus and Muslims that their religion could be improved.

In spite of his admiration for Andrews, and this challenging concept of mission, Winslow rejected the idea of joining the Cambridge Mission because it was pioneering an Anglican form of religious life for men, 'a Brotherhood'. Winslow was not at all attracted to the monastic life, although he confessed to being 'enormously moved by the story of St. Francis and his troubadours'.

After a period at Oxford House in Bethnal Green and training at Wells Theological College, Winslow was ordained in 1907, appointed a curate in Wimbledon, and then a Lecturer and Fellow teaching and researching 'Mission Studies' at St. Augustine's College, Canterbury. His room in Canterbury looked out on buildings resonant with the Western values which St. Augustine had brought to England from Rome, but he studied Indian values, and the historical contexts in which they had been formed, lost and recovered.

2. <u>FULLER IMPRESSIONS OF INDIA, 1914–15.</u>

- **(1)** Deciding to Work in India. When almost thirty years of age, Winslow decided after all to go to India. His decision was influenced by four people: Edwin James Palmer, his former tutor at Balliol, who had been Bishop of Bombay since 1908; Vedanayamakam Samuel Azariah, who had spoken at the World Missionary Conference in Edinburgh in 1910, describing his vision of Indians offering Indian Christianity to Indians 'in an Indian cup'; Samuel Stokes, an American, who had formed an unconventional Franciscan community in the Punjab; and C. F. Andrews. his first friend in India, with whom he had kept in regular contact.' All four men, if for different reasons, argued cogently that it was necessary for Christians in India to evolve a form of Christianity which was distinctively Indian. All four were deviants from the consensus common to the British at home and abroad that the Church of England in India should be a transplantation of the English Church in England's Empire. 11
- considering the Effects of Being British and a Member of the Church of England. On the 1st of January 1914, Winslow arrived for a second time at Bombay. 'His old friend, Jimmy Palmer' licensed him to work in Bombay diocese, and the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts,

a Church of England missionary society, appointed him and paid him to work as Vice-Principal of the High School in Ahmednagar, a town of forty thousand people, the largest in the Deccan.

Winslow wrote:

There was I in Ahmednagar, living like any European in Government service, even though more cheaply. I wore European clothes. I lived in a large, well furnished bungalow. I ate European food. I sat at a table for my meals, and used a knife and fork. I slept on a bed at night.

My Indian fellow-Christians wore a shirt, dhoti and sandals, lived in the simplest of rooms with barely any furniture; slept on a thin mattress on the floor at night; and at meal times sat on the floor, eating with their fingers food that cost about an eighth of what mine did. 12

The Church of England's growth in India, as Winslow knew, had always been complex. The East India Company had employed chaplains to minister to its employees, which they did exactly as though they were still in England: the Book of Common Prayer was used in all its Cranmerian grandeur, and there was no authorised attempt to introduce Indians to Christianity, still less to convert them.

As the Company gave way to the Raj, there had been no noticeable change in this attitude. Chaplains were Government employees, and brought with them their Oath of Obedience to 'use the form [of worship] in the said book [The Book of Common Prayer] prescribed, and none other, except in so far as it shall be permitted by lawful authority'. It is unlikely that those working in the Indian Civil Service and the Indian Army even considered how the Indians might have viewed their practices.

As the nineteenth century progressed, missionary societies arrived in India with the express intention of converting Indians to Christianity. It seems as though they made some concessions to the Indian way of life. They did translate *Hymns Ancient and Modern* into the local Indian language, but they made sure that any translations fitted the metres of

Victorian tunes so that they could be sung 'in Western dress', just as the Indian worshippers were at first expected to wear Western dress, even to keeping their shoes on their feet. There was no concession to Indian culture in church buildings or furniture. Victorian Gothic buildings, filled with rows of pews and 'proper' choir stalls ensured conformity to English tradition. This was especially true of cathedrals when they were built, in which the beauty and dignity of Prayer Book liturgy were imitated to the best of local ability.¹³

Winslow soon came to agree with Andrews that Christians in India should take careful account of the Indian Renaissance of the nineteenth century. This would mean losing the accretions of Victorian England and seeking an expression of Christianity which was appropriate to multireligious and multi-racial India. Existing forms of Church of England Christianity in India were unsuitable for a nation which was moving very slowly, but inevitably, towards becoming an independent nation-state. Significantly, he realised that he would have to 'shed all inner feelings of superiority ... In a word, I must become an Indian to the Indians'. 14

Thus, from the High School at Ahmednagar, which had sessions modelled on British academic years, Winslow began his search for personal values and for a 'fresh' organisational expression of Christianity for a nation only now coming to independent political existence, although it had a long history. He was already 'enormously moved' by St. Francis, but it must be stressed that Winslow did not set out in India to examine Franciscan values or to form a Franciscan Order. He may already have read Sabatier's account of the life of St. Francis before 1914, but if not, he was soon to learn of its contents through his relationship with C. F. Andrews.

3. ACQUIRING VALUES FROM INDIAN RESOURCES, 1915-19.

Andrews to be his 'Spiritual Director'. Winslow asked Andrews to be his 'spiritual director' and Andrews became to Winslow a 'guru', a person whom he believed had reached 'God-realisation', and who could therefore instruct and lead him to this same state. Winslow claimed that Andrews' radiance was for him 'a benediction' which continued until Andrews's death in 1940. 17

Winslow's relationship with Andrews was an intensely personal one and not one that he had to record, for example, for Crockford's Clerical Directory or the Eton Register. Conversations were private, personal, confidential and without a written summary. This is unfortunate for a sociologist who would like 'solid evidence' but it was, perhaps, fortunate for Winslow. Those members of the British Establishment who sponsored and consulted these formal facts of biography might well have frowned upon his choice.

Soon after Winslow's arrival, but not because of it, Andrews left the Cambridge Mission, the Brotherhood in Delhi, and St. Stephen's College. He began to spend his time at the ashrams formed by Mohandas Gandhi and Rabindranath Tagore with their respective followers, and asked to be addressed as 'Mister' and not 'the Reverend'. It was rumoured, and some believed the rumours to be true, that Andrews had forsaken both Christianity and the Church. In the opinion of some of the British, Andrews was a traitor to Englishness who had defected to Indian nationalists. None accused Andrews of defection to Roman Catholicism, but he had privately become devoted to St. Francis of Assisi.

Winslow wrote that 'long before' St. Francis was formally adopted as the patron of the ashram organisation which he was to begin in 1920, he 'had begun to hold in affection and esteem the Little Poor Man of Assisi'. 19

His inward appreciation of the desirability, worth and utility of St. Francis in India was enhanced as a result of his relationship with his chosen spiritual director.

How Andrews came first to acquire his own devotion to St. Francis as an exemplar is uncertain. He had been at Cambridge when Sabatier's book was first published and reviewed in England, and this is the most likely explanation. However, the source of Andrews' increased Franciscan devotion in the year in which Winslow invited him to be his spiritual director is very clear. Andrews had been deeply moved by the attempt of an American, Samuel Stokes, to imitate St. Francis. This would have been 'a conversational resource' for him to share with his new disciple, who had almost certainly already met Stokes in Canterbury.

Experiment. Stokes' Franciscan experiment taught Winslow a fundamental difference between Christian and Hindu values of the medieval period. In the West, medieval Catholics had valued highly vows of celibacy, poverty and obedience, holding people who took these vows to be 'superior' to householders. In the East, Hindus of this period, while esteeming ascetics who became celibate in their youth or old age, gave positive recognition to married men and women. They honoured the parents of children, 'the supporters of birds, animals and other creatures' because having children and caring for a village was discharging a debt to ancestors and to a future society. medieval Catholicism was dualistic; Hinduism of the same period was monistic.

In the view of Samuel E. Stokes, modern India needed families, men, women and their children, not celibate ascetics, to build Indian culture and economies in the villages. For this reason, he had abandoned his attempt to imitate a celibate St. Francis, and disbanded the community of unmarried

men which had gathered around him.

Since Stokes' Franciscan experiment was a resource for Winslow, and had other far-reaching effects, it must be examined in a little more detail. Stokes had broken boundaries. He was a wealthy young American, a 'free-lance' missionary, who in 1905, in his own understanding (but not that of any Church) had become a Franciscan friar, following St. Francis, 'the perfect friar' who had imitated 'the homeless, suffering, serving Christ.' Although he was a Christian, the Sikhs to whom he ministered in plague-infected villages named him a 'bhagat of God'.

Racial, caste and ecclesiastical protocols were defied when two Brahmin sanyasi, Swami Isanander and Swami Dhar Tirath, both converts to Christianity, with F. J. Weston, a member of the Anglican Cambridge Brotherhood, had joined Stokes in his experiment. At the same time Andrews had become 'an associate member' and 'Chaplain of the Order'. 21

Under the influence of Weston and Andrews, Stokes then became a member of the Church of England. However, before there were any constitutional discussions about this little group, Stokes had married an Indian from the Kotgarh, thus becoming a householder. This set him on a new stage, the second of the four 'ashrams', which marked the journey through life for Hindu Indians. He named his home, Harmony Hall.

Subsequently, Stokes had explained to Andrews why he also disbanded the Franciscan community: by his asceticism, he had presented a misleading interpretation of the Christian doctrine of Incarnation to twentieth-century Indians. While Andrews accepted Stoke's argument, he had been 'more sad than he could say' that an attempt to form a distinctively Indian Christianity had ceased.

(3) Learning from Sundar Singh. Winslow and Andrews were, however, of the opinion that Stoke's view that St. Francis was in some way of

relevance to India and to the West was correct. Other events were showing that this was so. Stokes had baptised Sundar Singh, and persuaded him to don the saffron robe of India as St. Francis had taken the hermit's robe of Italy. Sundar Singh was being named an Indian St. Francis.

Sundar Singh had, however, not addressed the problems of organisations and bureaucracy. He lacked Winslow's social contacts with those who organised large international companies, and the government of an Empire and an Anglican Communion. For Winslow, who recognised that British institutions had introduced him to India, the forms of social organisation which suppressed or promoted values were of crucial importance. Sundar Singh was correct in saying that 'those who are thirsty will go to the river: the river need not go to them'; but not in ignoring the river's need for shape and form. If

- Andrews selected, and to which he directed Winslow's attention, was the Indian 'ashram', which could be a form of community. This flexible structure, which could include men and women, he had already commended to the National Missionary Society as suitable for Christians to use. Two ashram experiments were readily available for study: and Winslow soon began his own study of these distinctively Indian organisations as a preparation for his own future project. Gandhi had described his life as an 'experiment with truth', and Charles Gore was later going to describe Winslow's ashram, which he formed after 1919, as 'a whole complex of experiments'. Because Winslow was 'trying out' an Indian form of Christianity, this chapter has been called an 'ashram experiment'.
- (5) <u>Learning from Gandhi's Ashram Experiment</u>. Winslow's opportunity to use Gandhi's ashram at Sabarmati as a resource for his own values was

unusual, if not quite unique, among the British people in India at this time. It was C. F. Andrews again, one of Gandhi's closest companions, who was Winslow's interpreter; but we do not know the full details of their conversations, or share the information which they had about Gandhi, despite the libraries which have subsequently been written about the Mahatma.

Gandhi and Andrews had been in England when Paul Sabatier's study of St. Francis and Tolstoy's The Kingdom of Heaven is Within Us had both been published. Gandhi is known to have taken inspiration from Tolstoy's book, and, as Tolstoy had translated Sabatier's St. François d'Assise, it is possible that Gandhi himself was not only acquainted with that interpretation of St. Francis, but absorbed ideas from it.

Whether this is the case or not, using Sabatier's account of St. Francis as a source, Andrews later published an elaborate comparison of the Gandhi and St. Francis, which may well first have been discussed with Winslow. If this was so, such early comparisons, we may surmise, became Winslow's inner inspirations. They may be summarised as the practice of poverty, seeking to be freed from any trace of possessiveness; acting as magnets for others to share in their experiments; the conviction that others would take the values which each expressed through community living and spread them across continents. Most tellingly, each showed concern for and love of those rejected by society. St. Francis embraced and cared for lepers: Gandhi sought out harijans, the outcasts and pariahs, the 'untouchables'. Given the influence of Andrews upon Winslow, it is hard to believe that such resemblances could not have fed Winslow's inner life.

(6) Learning from Tagore's Ashram Experiment. Winslow also drew inspiration from the poet and philosopher Rabindranath Tagore, whose

ashram was at Santiniketan. Before coming to India, Winslow had studied the Bhagavid Gita and Indian bhakti poets, whose work had been revived by Indians during the Indian Renaissance; but Tagore was the first living poet whom Winslow had heard who followed the bhakti path or 'marga' of loving personal devotion to God.

Andrews was translating Tagore's bhakti poetry into English and Winslow, who had quickly improved his initial knowledge of Indian languages, at the same time began to translate the poems of Tukaram. Struggling to find the right words to convey nuances of meaning was a way of becoming very familiar with a bhakti resource. Winslow used the words of this early seventeenth-century bhakti poet, who Indians had recovered in the Indian Renaissance, and who was a native of Maharashtra, the area in which he was living, to assist his own devotion. There were too many resemblances between the lives of St. Francis and Tukaram. Not only were they both totally devoted to God, each had a merchant father, rebuilt shrines, and attracted followers to their 'marga'. 31

Tagore also provided Winslow with an organisational resource to consider. At Santiniketan, a master, a guru, had pupil-disciples. Together, they studied the apprehension of reality in art, literature and philosophy. A Gurukula, an Indian school, which could draw people from all over the world, was coming into existence. If an analogy with British history were to be drawn, it was with the Oxford and Cambridge colleges as they were in their early days when the Franciscans taught in them. Andrews delighted to relate that he owed 'all the education I have received to a Franciscan College, at Cambridge, whose first walls were made of mud and wattle, and whose first teachers were two disciples of Francis of Assisi, the saint who followed Christ in the spirit of utter poverty'. Winslow, seeking to lose all 'superiority' did not publicly draw such a comparison,

although this aspect of Andrew's view of Cambridge and Tagore's ashram was incorporated into his own later proposal and its application.

Church. It was an Indian Church almost indigenous to India which next became a resource for the formulation of Winslow's ideas. He discovered that T. T. Geevaghese, a member of the East Syrian Orthodox Church in Central Travancore (now Kerala), who later became Archbishop Mar Ivanios, was setting up an experiment, Bethel ashram, inspired both by the Christian Orthodox East, which had been by-passed by Western Catholicism, and by Hindu Indian forms.

Winslow admired its social organisation. It was a minimally-structured, fluid organisation modelled on ancient Hindu ashrams and Orthodox monasteries. This was a form of 'the religious life' very different from that which Anglo Catholics in the Church of England were forming from Roman Catholic models. Bethel ashram had separate houses for men and women, sketes (small houses for two or three people) and hermitages or cells (for one in solitude). Winslow added this fluidity, flexibility and varied groupings of members, sometimes for a short duration and sometimes for life, and the range of opportunities offered to men and women, to the stock of resources from which he would later formulate his own organisational ideas. There were marked similarities to Sabatier's picture of the Franciscan movement at its origin.

Another characteristic of this emerging ashram which Winslow found useful and important was the 'worth' it gave to 'worship'. Devotion to God - which for Winslow was the heart of Hindu bhakti and of Christian spirituality - had been shaped into a Liturgy. The Liturgy at this ashram acknowledged the centrality of 'the Holy Communion' in a form appropriate to India. It drew on the words of a Jacobite rite but Indian ceremonies

were used - the worshippers greeted each other with folded hands, for instance. The processions which were made in the hills where they had their hermitages not only resembled those which Hindus made to their holy places, but also those of other branches of Orthodox Christendom.

(8) Winslow's Ideas for Liturgical Experiment. The liturgy Winslow witnessed at the Bethel ashram inspired him to renew his own efforts to find a suitably 'Indian cup' for Christian worship. In 1917 he gathered people together, Indian and British, to create a Liturgy which would do justice to the richness of Indian spiritual culture while preserving what was essential to Christianity. One member of this group was E. C. Ratcliffe, who later became an eminent liturgical scholar. Work had to be done speedily. If change were to be effected, it would need to be authorised by the Lambeth Conference of 1920, or any proposals would have to wait ten more years before they could receive approval. 'We must move, and move quickly, while things are still plastic', Winslow urged. 35 Palmer recognised the importance of their contribution, and sent the proposal to Lambeth adding his own preface by way of endorsement. This Liturgy was 'important' and 'revolutionary' because it brought into the open a 'crucial question' in a 'concrete form'. 36

(9) Learning from Narayan Vaman Tilak's Christian Ashram Experiment.

For one who sought to be an Indian to the Indians, Winslow's experience so far described lacked the one essential component of prolonged, regular and frequent meeting with an Indian. Quite independently of all his other sources of information and enlightenment, he found his most significant help in the town where he worked.

Ahmednagar was a most unlikely context for a member of the Church of England to find a form of organisation which blended Christian-Hindu values. It was Muslim territory and its buildings and landscape had been

shaped largely by the Muslim values of the majority of its population. Although it was in the Bombay diocese - the Church of England divided the vast sub-continent of India into dioceses as if it were an extension of England - there were hardly any members of the Church of England there and even fewer English people. Ahmednagar had for more than a century been the territory of the American Marathi Mission.

Winslow became acquainted with Narayan Vaman Tilak, a Christian convert from Hinduism, who was the minister at the Marathi Mission's church in Ahmednagar. This Mission was based on Congregational organisation, with a doctrinal system which owed much to Calvinism. By the time Winslow met Tilak its organisation and ministry were both almost totally in the hands of Indians, and the church was maintained entirely by local effort, owing nothing to contributions from its original American sponsors. This was so different from the prevailing culture of Anglicanism that it challenged Winslow.

Quite apart from these considerations of church organisation, the two men had a great deal in common. Both were lovers of poetry. Tilak was more: he was a poet in the bhakti tradition like Tagore, but a baptised Christian. He was able to give Winslow a foretaste of 'the enrichment which would come to the West were India to lay the wealth of her spiritual heritage at the feet of Christ'. Winslow used to cycle out to Tilak's garden in the evenings to share in poetry and conversation, often far into the night. Christianity for Tilak was 'not primarily doctrines, principles or rules of life, but loving devotion to Christ himself'. My only reason for loving Christ', Tilak wrote, 'is that He is the essence of Beauty. I delight in Beauty, therefore I have loved Him sincerely'.

Under this influence, Winslow, too, began to write bhakti poetry, and the acquaintanceship deepened into a true and lasting friendship, so that Winslow was able to write, more than thirty years later, 'I shall not forget those times of rich refreshment and illumination'. He found in Tilak 'santi, a mental and spiritual tranquillity' which seemed to 'radiate sunshine and warmth'.

Winslow learnt that poetry in the bhakti tradition need not simply be read, it could become an act of worship that was physical, mental and spiritual. He was encouraged to take part in 'kirtans', group activities in which poetry was chanted rhythmically in 'combinations of music, poetry, eloquence and humour'. Winslow, whose formal worship had been confined to the recitation of the Book of Common Prayer, experienced the power of this true bhakti worship in which 'the body sways rhythmically to the music as the spirit soars' to 'a personal God who desires our love, and on whom we can lay the burden of our sin'. Such acts of worship often took place in the open air, and could last far into the night.

Their relationship was not simply one of shared love of poetry, for Tilak was a man with a firm grasp of practical matters, who led Winslow to a more clear-sighted appreciation of India. He led him to see that religious poetry was far from the whole story of Hinduism, and told him of his own experience of being 'outcast'. When he was first converted to Christianity in 1893, through the influence of a European who had shared his love of poetry and had showed him exceptional courtesy, he had been exiled by his wife and family, eating his meals on the verandah. He explained that the caste system was fundamental to India, so that, though the country people may not have much to lose in becoming Christian, those of higher caste would suffer greatly. The caste system created an inhumane preeminence which could be as destructive as the racial and class superiority of the 'Rulers of India'.

Tilak had found a way to lessen the impact of caste differences. He

turned his own home into a place where people of different races, castes, religions and ways of thought could gather under one roof. It was an ashram, and became the seed-bed for Winslow's next submission to Bishop Palmer, which was to be made after the Lambeth Conference had given cautious approval for his use of experimental liturgies.

Tilak explained to Winslow that there were four stages of ashrama, elements of a total life course, which he had adapted to his Christian ministry and discipleship. This concept of ashram was connected with, but distinct from, the concept of ashram as a gathering of people in a geographical location. An ashram was grounded on soil only because at some place a living guru directed his disciples. Its social organisation and its effects extended to the places to which the disciples of the guru dispersed. Apprentices, pupils, or students, married persons working to sustain and improve the conditions of human existence, those who had retired from society-centred activities and people who had become solitaries in the forests or hills, were linked together in a shared life cycle, which each lived individually. The course from birth to death was common to all, but unique to each.

In consequence, a particular expression of an ashram was always transient. Since each person brought to each stage his own inner values and resources, ashrams could never be identical or develop into a highly organised system. Maintaining ashrams was a hard work (another meaning of the word) because of the constant changes in human relationships. Winslow saw this aspect of an ashram demonstrated in Tilak's own life.

Thus, after being an apprentice Christian (Brahmachari), he had entered the married state at the centre of a busy household, with employment as minister of the Marathi Mission (Grihastha). While Winslow was visiting him he was beginning the process of withdrawal from activity

to contemplation (Vanaprastha). In his fifty-fifth year, Winslow watched as he left his home to become a 'forest dweller' (Sannyasi).

Tilak died in 1919, leaving a note addressed to Western missionaries:

Cease to be fathers and mothers. Be real brothers and sisters. Know how to appreciate, trust people and take the place of India's revered saints.

For Winslow, who began to write his biography, Tilak was 'a great man, a great Indian, a great poet ... and a great Christian'. He convinced Winslow that Western Christians were wrong in believing 'they had everything to teach and nothing to learn'. I

4. CONSIDERING THE GLOBAL CONTEXT OF 1919.

After Tilak's death, Winslow went on furlough to Britain taking with him all his experiences, but especially Tilak's last words. However, other events in 1919, besides Tilak's last testament, became resources for Winslow's attempt in 1920 to match his inner thoughts and values with an appropriate social organisation. A relationship of 'real brothers and sisters' in which each appreciated and trusted, and none acted as 'fathers and mothers' was not evident in either East or West.

It was clear to Winslow, as it has been subsequently to historians, that a political and cultural volcano had erupted in India. The 'experiments with truth' which for five years Gandhi had been training Indians to make, suddenly flashed, blazed and created havoc across India.

In the East, the year began with numerous local protests which the British considered seditious. In March, in order to obtain control, the Rowlatt Act gave the Government of India the right not to call juries to try crimes. In protest, Gandhi called Indians to make satygraha (truth-force) protests throughout India. On 28 March, Jinnah, a leading Muslim lawyer, indicated Muslim solidarity by resigning from the Legislature because it

was a machine propelled by a foreign executive. On 30 March, Gandhi called on all Indians to stop work and to unite in 'a day of humiliation and The next day, there was another concerted wave of prayer', a hartal. satygraha demonstrations across India. Not all of them were, as Gandhi intended, peaceful and non-violent. In Delhi, there were riots, and six people were killed. In the following days, it became clear that Gandhi was mobilising a continent. On 12 April, Tagore named Gandhi, Mahatma, a great On 13 April, Brigadier-General Dyer ordered that an leader of men. assembly in Jallianwala Bagh Park in Amritsar should be dispersed by gunfire. More than three hundred people were shot dead. These deaths sparked more protests and uprisings. On the 16 April, the British passed martial laws to control the areas of greatest turmoil, but there were still On 18 April, Gandhi called for a halt to the civil violent skirmishes. disobedience movement because of the violence it was engendering. On the 24 April, C. F. Andrews wrote to Gandhi, 'We are living as it were on the edge of a volcano and the crust on which we are standing is very thin'. 1 On the 8th May, Tagore publicly renounced his British Knighthood. On 21 May, Lord Chelmsford, the Viceroy, explained to the King-Emperor, George V., that the Government of India was exercising its power 'to preserve the peace and rescue it from any future anarchical or revolutionary movements'.32

The West to which Winslow returned was, as he observed, equally unsettled and 'different from that which I had left'. In May, political leaders signed the Treaty of Versailles. The war which had divided nations was over, and though there was talk of a League of Nations, bitter international strife continued. In Eastern Europe, following the 1917 Revolution, there was strife between 'the reds' and 'the whites'. Uprisings in Egypt, Turkey, and Ireland added to the sense of unrest.

It was an unusual time. Vera Brittain recalled, for instance, that until that year the educated classes could believe that life was:

Individual, one's own affair; that the events happening in the world outside were important enough in their own way, but were personally quite irrelevant.

After the War, they recognised:

That no life is really private, or isolated, or self sufficient For better, for worse, we are now each of us part of the surge and swell of great economic and political movements, and whatever we do, as individuals or nations, affects everyone else.

In the context of this global turmoil, Winslow sought 'to read the signs of the times'. His thoughts, he wrote, 'were often in India, looking back over events of the past few years, and forward to what might lie ahead'. He sat in a Hampshire country garden and on 12 August his 'dissatisfactions and musings came to a head'. He wrote down what he personally could do next to contribute to global changes which might in the long term affect international, national, regional, local and personal relationships.

The original is lost, but he recorded the incident subsequently in these words:

I was given the vision of a Christian ashram, in which Indians and English Christians, of whatever caste or class origin, would live together in terms of complete equality, sharing a simple Indian lifestyle of poverty and service, and offering to God a worship which was in the traditions of the East as well as the West.

Part Two.

THE DEVELOPMENT OF CHRISTA SEVA SANGHA, 1920-1934.

- 5. <u>CREATING A CHRISTIAN-INDIAN ASHRAM IN AHMEDNAGAR, 1920-26.</u>
- (1) The First Two Experimental Years. Bishop Palmer gave his consent to Winslow's request to make his proposed 'ashram experiment' in his

diocese. The Society for the Propagation of the Gospel agreed that Winslow's salary could for a limited period be paid into an ashram account, and not to him personally. C. F. Andrews and Bishop Azariah continued to be available for counsel, for this was an experiment to be made within the Church of England. The parties knew that the Church of England Assembly and the British Parliament was expected in the next few years to pass legislation which would formally initiate a new Independent Province of the Anglican Communion, the Church of India, Burma and Ceylon. For only another ten years or so, would the situation in India still be 'plastic'.

In accordance with the way in which Indian ashrams were formed, Indian disciples gathered around Winslow. His vision had pictured British and Indian Christians together merging the traditions of East and West in exploring a global spirituality, but until 1927 no other British people came to participate fully in this experiment.

The Indians in the ashram, however, had been born into different castes, and they were all at different Indian ashrama stages. Bala, Dada, and Bhika, three young apprentices, were at the pupil stage. Shankarrao and Malanbai Wairagar, a carpenter and his wife, who had worked at the school of which Winslow had formerly been Vice-Principal, were at the householder ashramic stage. They brought their two children with them. The Reverend Manohar Tarkhadkar and his wife, born into the Brahmin caste, were older and at the third stage. Alexander Abhane was already a Christian 'forest dweller' and a sannyasi. Village people shared in the kirtans, after the pattern at Tilak's ashram. He wrote that, like St. Francis, they went singing through the world, finding it filled with beauty, and were hardly able to contain their mirth. \$\frac{19}{2}\$

They did more, drawing on different features of Winslow's investigations. They worked to improve village sanitation in the nearby

villages, following Gandhi's example. Following Tagore, they studied and wrote poetry and music. Their liturgy was modelled on the combination of Orthodox and Hindu practice like that of the Bethel ashram. Unlike Sundar Singh, Winslow had a constitution in mind for a new Province of the Anglican Communion. Unlike Stoke's experiment, the ashram had a place for householders, for women and children. 60

As Winslow wrote, after he began to be more open about his inner devotion to St. Francis, 'St. Francis would have approved of our humble beginnings. It was significant to Winslow, but less so for the Indians, that St. Francis and his first followers had been constantly on the move before they found a simple base, the Portiuncula, which was lent to them. Winslow and his company similarly lived together briefly at Miri and Junnar, before finding a base (a former Muslim tomb) near Ahmednagar, which was lent to them by the American Marathi Mission. 52 There were other common attributes. Those people who came to be with St. Francis had to begin with little organisation to structure their devotion to the Gospel of Jesus. Winslow and the Indians also had little organisation to sustain theirs. In Umbria, worship of God had been the predominant note in the lives of Francis and his companions, often issuing in joyous Italian song out of doors. In Ahmednagar, this was also the case as they chanted, sang Tilak's bhajans, and danced. St. Francis had associated himself with the minores, the class struggling to rise from the base of the feudal structure, and with other social movements of the time: this Sabatier had stressed. In Ahmednagar, they associated themselves with India's nationalist struggle.

Apart from the sanayasi, who wore traditional Indian saffron, the Ahmednagar group wore white cotton garments with a saffron cord. White home spun cotton, 'khadi', was Gandhi's sign and symbol of a nation

aspiring to independence; saffron was India's colour of religious dedication. At a practical level, this loose form of clothing enabled them all to sit on the mud floor in Indian style. They did not beg: they earned a little, and Winslow's salary paid for food for eight people.

(2) Receiving Episcopal Blessing for Christa Seva Sangha. 'After an experimental year of living together', Winslow wrote, 'the experiment began to take concrete shape'. On the 12th of June 1922, Bishop Palmer dedicated their ashram and approved a very simple Rule and Constitution which gave parity of esteem to every member. As it was St. Barnabas's day and the blessing took place in St. Barnabas's Church, the group was named 'The Fellowship of St. Barnabas'. St. Barnabas had made it possible for Paul to link values derived from Greek and Hebrew contexts and he was therefore an appropriate patron. St. Francis would for Winslow also have been appropriate, but it could not, by the same happy accident of day and place, have been 'The Fellowship of St. Francis' because the Italian Saint did not then have a place in the Church of England Prayer Book Calendar and there were no Church of England churches dedicated to him in the Deccan.

It was a 'Fellowship'. Men and women were members of it, and therefore it was not 'a Brotherhood'. Winslow was not a 'Father Superior' or a president or chairman: he was a pupil learning from Indians how to be an Indian. Jesus was at the centre, the intended guru.

The ashram's Indian name was Christa Seva Sangha: 'The Society of the Servants of Christ'. The Society would serve India, not rule it. Perhaps Winslow hoped that in due course it would have members dispersed across India like the Servants of India.

We should note that, as Sabatier claimed for his Italian exemplar, Winslow had not at this formative stage any inkling that some other people

would later want to complete this fluid experiment by transforming it into three Anglican Franciscan Orders after a Western pattern, separating a celibate First Order from a Third Order of householders and their children.

Assessing the Indian Christa Seva Sangha Experiment. Winslow prepared to return to England for a visit in 1926 'with a heavy heart'. As he readily acknowledged, his ashram experiment had not produced 'any startling results'. He was also perhaps discouraged that others were seeking results which he thought of little worth - a huge amount of time and money was being expended on a statistical survey counting converts in the villages, for example. In a report written for the newly-constituted Church of England Assembly, and in Bishop Chatterton's account of the Church of England in India, written in 1924, his experiment had not been described at all as he saw it himself. Legislation to sever the Church of India from the Church of England was shortly going to be discussed.

History had shown that once values were institutionalised and organisational forms were structured they were not afterwards easily changed. To lose this opportunity of having Indian values recognised could be an irreparable disaster for the Anglican Communion. In *The National Christian Council Review*, Winslow had written a provocative article which prompted correspondence. He was accused of having reduced the Lambeth Quadrilateral to a Triangle because, while he sought to preserve a place in Indian Christianity for a form of episcopacy, the sacraments and the Bible, he had omitted the creeds. §§

Perhaps for these reasons, Winslow had written *The Indian Mystic:* Some Thoughts on India's Contribution to Christianity. Early in the book he wrote, 'I think it unthinkable that Hinduism, with its astounding richness of spiritual and cultural heritage' should not make 'a permanent contribution to man's spiritual wisdom'. To

This book was directed primarily to British readers. In it he included a sentence which was to have far-reaching effects. Because he was writing for the British, he suggested that the 'freshness' which the Western Church needed was of the kind that St. Francis and the Franciscan movement had brought to the thirteenth century and which India could offer in the twentieth century to the West and East.

What we need is a new movement like that of St. Francis of Assisi with his enthusiastic devotion ... and his rapturous joy in the espousal of Lady Poverty. Such a fresh movement might well come to us from India.

Some were to take this in 1926, the year in which the Church of England celebrated St. Francis more widely than before the Reformation, as an invitation primarily to use Winslow's ashram as a means of restoring Franciscan Orders to the Anglican Communion. 72

6. EXPLAINING INDIAN AND FRANCISCAN VALUES ON A TOUR OF BRITAIN IN THE YEAR OF THE FRANCISCAN CENTENARY.

As Winslow toured Britain on behalf of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, which still paid his salary, he attracted considerable interest. He was a slim figure with a black beard, sometimes dressed in his turban and white robes, occasionally adding a shawl. He used his gentle and musical voice to explain perfectly pronounced Indian terms, to read his translations of Indian bhakti poets, and on occasions to expound his global spirituality.

India was a conversational resource in 1926. The 'High Noon' of Empire had waned, Britain's Imperial Century was drawing to a close, and 'the Raj' had its critics. The Amritsar incident, the publicity given to Gandhi's imprisonment, and British plans to implement constitutional changes made India a subject of political discourse. R. H. Tawney and others were pointing out that Britain's being the first successful industrial

nation had consequent effects across the globe. There was awareness of real and absolute poverty in the West and East beneath the evident affluence of the few.

Radhakkrishnan's, The Hindu Way of Life was published in England. E. M. Forster had with A Passage to India 'achieved not only critical acclaim, but also high sales'. Memorable phrases and sentences evoked strong images: the British were 'an army of occupation with an anthem'. 'You're superior to them, don't forget'. At the end of the novel, 'poor little talkative Christianity', Forster intimated, 'after years of intellectualism' could kneel again. 'S

The Call of India recognised that the concept of mission was changing and invited 'the best men and women that our universities and hospitals can supply' to demonstrate that 'the influence of Christian personality' was 'most effective' in evangelism. Sadhu Sundar Singh on his visits had been called the Indian St. Francis. The First Summer School of Sociology organised by Anglo Catholics had published its report, 'Thinking Internationally'. Charles Gore had published, Can we then Believe? Hermann Hesse had written of "Our Age's Yearning for a Philosophy of Life".

Winslow may have expected India, Indian religion and problems of credal orthodoxy to be subjects which would arouse some interest. What he was quite unprepared for was that in 1926 St. Francis was also a conversational resource among the middle classes in England - to the extent that *Punch* had made a cartoon of such a conversation. 79

This may - for the records do not exist - have led Winslow to relate what he had to say more to St. Francis and the thirteenth-century Franciscan movement than he might otherwise have done. This would not be surprising since he had held St. Francis in his innermost thoughts for

more than ten years. If he were drawn to speak about St. Francis, he had plenty of ideas on which to draw, although he had quite deliberately written about India's Saints.

Certainly, it was St. Francis who caught the attention of some of those who listened to Winslow. It would be easier for them to converse about St. Francis, about whom much had been written that year in the press and in books, than it would be to converse about bhakti values and ashrams, about which hardly anything had been published.

7. A GROWING INTER-RACIAL EXPERIMENT, 1927-8.

(1) Englishmen Join the Ashram at a new Centre in Poona. Winslow attracted patrons. Dame Monica Wills, with whom he stayed in Bristol, gave sufficient money to purchase land to build an ashram, and later a gurukula. Others also offered gifts to further his aims.

Winslow also attracted a number of gifted young men who were interested in what he was saying and doing, and a few of these asked to join him at Christa Seva Sangha ashram in India. The year 1927 looked full of promise.

Winslow returned to India and bought land in Poona. Stanley Royal and George Huntley, working class men who had worked in Newcastle shipyards, travelled with him. As Francis had laboured with his Lord, these Englishmen began their life in India by helping the Indians of Christa Seva Sangha ashram to lay the foundations of the new building, a Hindu-style structure, whitewashed, and in the shape of a hollow square facing a garden. This was a sign of the ashram's intention to break down divisions between the British and the Indian.

The other Englishmen - all but one of whom had taken degrees at Oxford or Cambridge - first made a pilgrimage to Assisi. It was from St.

Francis that they sought their inspiration. It was the Roman Catholic Franciscan Orders in Assisi which gave them Western models for their Indian experiment. Winslow arranged also for them to visit Bethel ashram which one of them wrote was run on 'Franciscan lines'. 80

(2)The First Months in Poona. Each of the volunteers had his own personal values and expectations, but Winslow was glad to receive them When the building was complete, each fulfilled one or other of the actions he had envisaged. William Strowan Robertson, who had been working in theological colleges for the Student Christian Movement and who had previously taught at St. Paul's College in Calcutta, had already demonstrated his outstanding gifts of communication with students. He became the warden of a house where Christians, Hindus, Muslims, Parsees, and men of no faith were welcome - an adaptation of an Indian ashram gurukula, inspired by Tagore. Verrier Elwin, already deeply read in the mystics, and anxious to learn about Indian mysticism, learnt Indian languages, met Indian bhakta, and helped to generate dialogue with Brahmins. 87 Oliver Fielding Clarke had been disturbed by R. H. Tawney's arguments and was now interested in social and economic problems. He worked with the grihastha, the householders, those discharging 'their debt to the ancestors' by marriage and work, and by political involvement at every level from the village to the global. Hugh Davenport, who had been a hairdresser from Lafayette in Bond St., was creative in the garden and in any number of other directions. The Indians continued to work in the villages.

This was much as the participants themselves had seen their future. Bishop Gore had lightly hinted, when he commissioned some of them, that there were differences among them that, in the enthusiasm of early manhood, they had not recognised. 'The wise old man' knew, Fielding

Clarke afterwards reflected, they 'had bitten off more than they could chew'. Certainly, with the benefit of hindsight, it is clear that while each of them had chosen to make an experiment in company with the others, each was also going to India to make or test his own hypothesis. This created conflict - and none of this group of men that set out with high expectations in 1927 was at the ashram at the close of 1934.

8. TENSION IN A SMALL AND COMPLEX INDIAN AND FRANCISCAN ORGANISATION, 1927-9.

(1) Listening to Other Pipers Playing a Different Tune. Until 1927, the Christa Seva Sangha ashram experiment had been testing how Christianity could be made more Indian - and Winslow had been considering which Indian values and organisation might be of value beyond India. St. Francis had been an inspiration wholly in tune with these aims, and the flexible organisation of the early days of his community had resembled an ashram. Winslow played an Indian tune with some Franciscan harmonies. The argument which arose in 1927-9 was an internal one which developed because some of the newcomers wanted to play a Franciscan tune with Indian harmonies.

The main issue was whether the ashram was to be defined primarily according to Indian values and in accordance with Indian patterns of organisation, or whether it should be defined according to Western values with Western patterns of organisation. It was an argument among Christians and not between men of different faiths.

The shuttlecock which was batted to and fro was St. Francis. The fundamental difference between the two parties stemmed in large measure from two different interpretations of the Saint's life, which can be fairly precisely tied down. One party took Sabatier's account of St. Francis, first

published in 1893, as its primary resource: the other party took Father Cuthbert's account published in 1911 as its primary resource. Both books had run into many editions in the West; they were both brilliant studies of St. Francis and of the origins of the Franciscan movement. Since both scholars had studied carefully St. Francis's own writings, there was quite remarkable agreement about the values of humility, love and joy which the Saint exemplified. Their disagreement was about the organisational forms which St. Francis intended for those who were attracted to follow his example. In a nutshell, Sabatier had argued that St. Francis had not intended a division into three Orders and the formal constitutions and separation of the Orders had ruined the Saint's vision: Cuthbert had argued that St. Francis intended to found three Orders and the Church had in her wisdom ratified this vision.

This argument now became mixed with argument about Indian values and Indian ashram organisation. Those who favoured Sabatier's interpretation could most easily accommodate Indian values and ashram organisation because it had stressed that St. Francis was the Saint of humanity who had wanted fluid organisation. Those who favoured the other interpretation could less easily accommodate Indian values because it had located St. Francis's values more firmly in the tradition of the Catholic Church. The former directed to origins; the latter pointed to the tradition which the Franciscan Orders had preserved ever since.

In other words, those who gave priority to enriching and refreshing the Anglican Communion with Indian Christianity followed the Protestant, Professor Sabatier. Those who gave priority to the desirability of restoring Franciscan Orders to the Anglican Communion after a gap of seven centuries followed the Roman Catholic, Fr. Cuthbert.

(2) Tension in Discerning Franciscan and Indian Values. The Sabatier

and the Cuthbert parties both wanted to follow the paths of love, simplicity, humility, joy and service. The Sabatier-Indian party saw these, however, as primarily universal (catholic with a lower case 'c') values, representing the highest aspirations of humanity. Some Indian Saints, especially the bhakti Saints, such as Tukaram, and some Christian Saints of the Western Church, such as St. Francis, were exemplars of these human qualities lived and expressed at their highest level. The Cuthbert-Western party also saw these same qualities as universal but for them Catholic was spelt with an upper-case 'C'. Catholic values were universal in so far as they were the same in India as in England, and the same in the thirteenth century and the twentieth century, but they were not the same as the qualities of the bhakti Saints because they sprang from a different interpretation of God's self-revelation. Thus, the Sabatier party defined love, humility and joy as values which Indians could draw from Indian cultures; and the Cuthbert party defined them as virtues which could be drawn from the Catholic Church of the West, which was also in India.

Both parties wanted to celebrate the beauty of creation and to hold all human life as sacred, breaking down barriers of injustice. All were agreed on the centrality of Christ. For the one, Christ was 'the true Bhagwan, the one all-lovely and adorable God Incarnate, Crucified and Risen, whose love is the inspiration of service and reward of sacrifice', a view which could include all; for the other, too, Christ was Incarnate, Crucified and Risen, but they interpreted this as conferring on the Church an exclusive claim to everyone's obedience.

(3) <u>Tension in Choosing Franciscan and Indian Organisation</u>. It was differences of opinion about community organisation that caused the major difficulties.

The Sabatier-Indian party wanted the organisation to be as close as

possible to traditional Indian ashrams with movement between the four Indian ashrama stages. Celibate and married, men and women and their children, would live in one fellowship. Vows could be optional and temporary.

The Cuthbert-Western party wanted the organisation to be as close as possible to traditional Roman Catholic Franciscan Orders with clear distinctions between First, Second and Third Orders and separation of the celibate from the married and their children. Life-vows were considered essential for the celibate.

The Sabatier party wanted all the ashram buildings to be open to everyone as far as was practicable: the Cuthbert party wanted there to be separated areas for members of the First Order, and separate buildings for the Second and Third Order. The Sabatier party wanted there to be little distinction in daily life between those who were priests and those were not: the Cuthbert party wanted priestly and lay functions more clearly defined. The Sabatier party wanted freedom to worship as each was led: the Cuthbert party wanted were more daily services such as the monastic offices of Terce and None.

In summary: the Sabatier party wanted to adapt Franciscan patterns of organisation to Indian customs: the Cuthbert party wanted to mould Indian customs to Franciscan patterns of organisation.

Those who have written about these discussions agree that the participants were 'a very mixed bag' who 'ran into all kinds of problems' and that it was 'a most difficult period'. A student of this debate, Sister Barbara Noreen judged that reaching a synthesis was 'a miraculous achievement'. Although the issue was not directly a confrontation between two people, the disagreement was focused in the views of two people: Winslow and Robertson.

Robertson's friend and biographer wrote that it seemed doubtful whether Winslow and Robertson had 'understood, worked out and resolved' their fundamental differences 'before joining forces'. He suggested that although Robertson saw St. Francis as the Mirror of Perfection, he could act more like St. Ignatius Loyola. As we have seen, Winslow was trying to shed all 'feelings of superiority' and he could not act like a general. He refused to impose his own view as a founder.

Instead, Winslow grieved, as Sabatier suggested St. Francis had done, as Churchmen prematurely organised his vision before it had time to develop fully. The Churchmen, for their part, as Cuthbert suggested had happened in the past, and Robertson's biographer suggested occurred in 1928, interpreted their actions as 'crowning' a vision with sound organisation.

Winslow acknowledged publicly late in his life that Robertson was 'a very remarkable man ... unlike any other man I have ever known'.

Once he had seen his course, and was convinced that it was the will of God, he would pursue it with relentless ardour and would press it upon others with a winsome and affectionate pleading which it was hard to resist.

(4) Resolving Tensions. By the close of 1929, although the difficulties between the two parties were not fully resolved, a Constitution written in Marathi, which reflected the priority of the Sabatier-Indian party, in Latin, which reflected the priority of the Cuthbert-Western party and English for those who could read neither, was agreed.

The problem of dividing four ashrama stages into three Franciscan Orders had been solved by making 'special provision' for the sanyasi. A sanyasi would be 'one who has arrived at such an age and such ripe experience in the spiritual life, as well as such certainty of God's call, that he will never afterward regret what he cannot alter'.

A Rule was written for three other Orders, each resembling the Franciscan Orders, two of which were given Indian names. The First Order, or Brahmacharya, was for celibate men. Vows in this Order could be made for a fixed period or for life, but making such vows 'should not bestow pre-eminence' over those who had not made them. As novices, before taking any vows, members were called 'sid'dha. After they had made their vows they were named 'sadhak'. The Second Order was for celibate women (who came to join the ashram from England).

The Third Order, called 'Grihastha', was for those living (a) in close association with the First Order in Poona but in a separate house (b) in family-group households further away 'to exhibit the beauty of a Christian household' (c) for persons living in places apart from other Third Order members. The Third Order was to be a 'bonding together of men and women living in the world' and its members would keep 'such a measure of the promises as is congruous with the obligations of family life'. By 1931 the term 'Grihastha' was dropped as the Third Order changed to become physically separated from the houses of the First and Second Orders, reflecting a more traditionally Western pattern.

Christa Seva Sangha was intended to be distinctively Indian, in spite of Western influences. The Indian Church Measure, which would constitute an independent Church of India, had received the Royal Assent in December, 1927. The final severance would not occur until 1 March 1930, but Christa Seva Sangha already had an Indian bishop, Bishop Azariah, as its official visitor after Palmer's retirement in 1928.

The aim to be 'Indian to the Indians' was retained, as some extracts show. 'To non-Indian members India has become their adopted Mother Land'. 'The Sangha seeks in all things to be a truly Indian community.'

The members of the three Orders were to sift ceremonies, customs, modes

of worship, rules of life, confessions of faith and use those 'local in origin and suited to India, and to develop forms of worship and methods of prayer congenial to the religious life of India. 90

9. REALISING THE POTENTIAL OF PRINT, 1928-30.

(1) Composing The Principles of Christa Seva Sangha. After the Rules and Constitution were agreed, Winslow withdrew to the hills. There, he drafted an Introduction to the Rule and Constitution in which he described The Principles of Christa Seva Sangha. These he discussed with Verrier Elwin, who, having been ill, had been in England while most of these discussions were taking place, before offering them to the Sangha.

The Principles outlined a spirituality which was Indian and Franciscan. Winslow had been working on their combination for many years now. He set his Principles out in the way Tilak had shown him. They began with words of the guru: Christ. Each section was written to be applicable to all. Three ways to God were described; the way of devotion or prayer, the way of knowledge or study, the way of work or service.

Fielding Clarke wrote of them, 'I thought (the Principles) impressive and I was not alone in thinking this'. The whole Sabha, as the assembled members called themselves, willingly subscribed to them. Vandana, who revived Christa Seva Sangha ashram forty years later has remarked that they remain as relevant today as when they were written. Many members of the present Society of St. Francis, to whom Robertson brought them, endorse that view.

(2) <u>Describing Christa Seva Sangha</u>. In 1930, Winslow left for England, and there wrote *Christa Seva Sangha* at the request of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, although he had sought to avoid the 'snare of self-advertisement'. It was a straight-forward account for young people

of the experiment that he had initiated in India which made no reference to the inner tensions of the ashram.

(3) Advocating The Dawn of Indian Freedom. Winslow also wrote papers which were published in The Dawn of Indian Freedom. Written for adults, Winslow made it clear that for him the religious and political, the local and global, the personal and communal, formed an indivisible whole. He wrote of the freedom he envisaged for an Indian Church freed from the Church of England, and of the freedom of an Indian nation released from British Rule.

10. EXTENDING CHRISTA SEVA SANGHA TO ENGLAND, 1930-3.

(1) Meeting with The Fellowship of the Way. Dorothy Swayne, a representative of a group, 'The Fellowship of the Way', centred in South London, contacted Winslow. Miss Swayne had been sent a copy of the Principles of Christa Seva Sangha which Winslow had written, by her friend, Carol Graham, who was one of the 'isolated' Christa Seva Sangha members working with Bishop Azariah in the diocese of Dornakal. 95

The Fellowship of the Way had members dispersed in various parts of Britian who were seeking to respond in a Christian spirit to the needs of people 'in field and factory, mine and dockyard, school and sanctuary, hospital and home'. Some within Fellowship, especially Miss Swayne, were living in voluntary poverty in order to share the penury induced by the slump in the British economy.

As a result of her approach, Winslow introduced her to Robertson, who had left India on 25 April 1930, never to return, because he had developed a tropical illness from which he did not fully recover. This introduction was the beginning of a partnership which lasted many years.

For two years, the Fellowship of the Way, the organisation to which

Miss Swayne was attached, and the Third Order of Christa Seva Sangha, which Robertson fostered from his vicarage at St. Ives, held occasional meetings together. 97

October 1933 the two organisations formally became the Third Order of the Society of St. Francis, which had a First Order drawn from the those men desiring to be celibate, who had come to Robertson at St. Ives and others who were already living a Franciscan life with Brother Douglas Downes from a base in Dorset. The *Principles of Christa Seva Sangha* which Winslow, assisted by Elwin, had written in India became the Principles of the Society of St. Francis, but the Ashram's Rules were soon adapted for use in the Church of England's Franciscan Orders.

As Barrie Williams has rightly stated, and oral history confirms, Dorothy Swayne was a key figure in the new organisation. She had not only learnt of Emily Marshall's experiences, but also of the inspiration which Winslow gave to Carol Graham and other early members of the Christa Seva Sangha Third Order. She ensured that those joining the Third Order of the Society of St. Francis had opportunity to study both Sabatier's and Cuthbert's accounts of the life of St. Francis. Since copies of both were out of print in the late 1930s, a postal library was established. Parcels weighing almost five pounds were sent to Third Order aspirants.

11. ACTIVATING DISPERSION IN INDIA, 1931-9.

(1) <u>Multiplying Experiments in 1931</u>. In 1931, Winslow was back in India, having decided to stay for just three more years as midwife to his Indian experiment. While he still very much regretted that the original Indians had become members of a Third Order and the British had most often

became members of a First Order, there were, that year, a number of signs of ashram growth, especially of the Third Order. There was now a second ashram at Aundh, a village on the outskirts of Poona, which had mainly Indian Third Order members and which included families. There were English and Indian Third Order marriages from the ashram. Freeman, a young Cambridge graduate and his wife, Millicent, a nurse, both members of the Third Order, went to Malaegon, 180 miles North of Poona, to serve the poor, especially lepers, in their 'house-hold'. Jane Latham, who had been Winslow's neighbour and the Principal of St. Monica's School in Ahmednagar, at the age of sixty four, entered the Third Order, and went also to Malaegon as an 'isolated' member in the third ashram stage to pray for the active young couple and their ministry. Shamroa Hivale and Verrier Elwin decided in 1931 they were going to follow in the footsteps of Richard Rolle, a Franciscan Third Order hermit, and live and work among aboriginal tribes. New arrivals, especially William Quinlan Lash, wanted to explore both Indian and Franciscan values and did not seem to find ashram and Franciscan organisation so much in conflict with one another as some others had.

(2) The Division of Christa Seva Sangha. However, the previous tensions had surfaced again by 1933. These were compounded by financial difficulties, the formation of the Society of St. Francis in England, and discussion of a proposed united Church of South India. All these factors made it necessary to take the view of sponsors into account. After a split had taken place in 1934 dividing the original ashram into Christa Prema Seva Sangha and Christa Seva Sangha, Winslow returned to England, as he had probably always intended to do, once the Church of India had become independent. Before leaving he wrote in the Christa Seva Sangha Newsheet:

It now seems quite plain that the Sangha is to develop as a Religious Community, and I have not, and never have had, a call to that life.

He acknowledged that the decision had been taken with his consent, as it was clear that the majority felt called to go in that direction, but he was no more ready in 1933 than he had been in 1904 to live in a formal religious community. He wrote that he was considering joining the Franciscan Third Order, but he did not do so after his arrival in England.

12. SUBSEQUENT EVENTS.

In England, the Society of St. Francis, which grew from Winslow's ashram experiment, continues to exist with about sixteen hundred members. In India, as Winslow would have wished, Lash walked barefoot into Bombay cathedral to be consecrated a Bishop of the Province of India on the feast of St. Clare. As Winslow had acted as midwife to the birth of an independent Anglican Church of India, so Lash acted as midwife to the united Church of South India before also leaving for England. With his departure, the Christa Prema Seva Sangha building in Poona was closed, but reopened as Christa Seva Ashram in the 1970s.

Winslow took his Indian and Franciscan values with him to Lee Abbey which rapidly acquired about five thousand 'friends' - those in the householder ashrama stage who came to Lee Abbey to be with its small core community. He introduced there a 'Chapter of Friends', when hundreds arrived to celebrate his English version of the thirteenth-century 'Chapter of Mats'. 100

In his ninety-first year Winslow returned to Christa Seva ashram, then reopened and recognised as a pioneering Christian ashram, to say his goodbye to the land which had seen *The Dawn of Indian Freedom* and given him his Indian and Franciscan values.

NOTES.

- 1. Winslow wrote two printed autobiographies, The Eyelids of the Dawn: Memoirs, Reflections, and Hopes (1954), and A Testament of Thanksgiving (1974). In the former he had a chapter about his childhood that he called 'Glimpses of a Vanished World'. He described his home as 'Victorian' and living at Hanworth, before its modern expansion, as being 'in almost feudal days'. He was not 'really happy' at Eton. He went there in the year in which J. G. Adderley published his New Floreat: A Letter to an Eton Schoolboy, but there is no evidence to indicate whether or not Winslow read it, or whether his values were in any way formed from knowing Adderley.
- 2. There are now many studies of the construction of 'Orientalism'. See, for example, E. W. Said, *Orientalism*.
- 3. J. C. Winslow, Eyelids of the Dawn, (1954:13 and 41). Winslow wrote of 'the inflated pride in Empire' of the period of his youth.
- 4. 'For seventeen years, 1888 to 1905, Balliol monopolized the Viceroyalty of India. Between 1878 and 1914 more than 200 Balliol men passed into the Indian Civil Service.' Kenneth Rose, Superior Person, (1969:47).
- 5. A. M. Allchin (1958) has a chapter in The Silent Rebellion: Anglican Religious Communities, 1845-1900 describing the formation of the Oxford Brotherhood of the Epiphany in Calcutta and the Cambridge Brotherhood in Delhi. He explained their emergence in the historical context of the growth of nineteenth- century Church of England religious communities. Like others who have written about these missions, Allchin stressed the influence of B. F. Westcott in their formation. Daniel O'Connor in Gospel, Raj, and Swaraj: The Missionary Years of C. S. Andrews (1981) has explained in more detail how the Westcott family could have influenced C. S. Andrew's decision to go to Delhi.
- 6. J. C. Winslow, A Testament of Thanksgiving (1974:32). Winslow on several occasions made a point of affirming the importance of St. Francis to him. This was still so in 1974, when, at the age of ninety-two, he returned to India to the ashram that he had left in 1934 to return to Britain. (There is an account of this visit in a privately circulated newsletter received by the late Miss Olive Snow (now in SSF\TO archives) and in Sister Barbara Noreen's privately printed text (circulated by the Community of St. Mary, the Virgin, at Wantage). One of the interests of this research has been the importance of letters that people write to each other. Winslow and Andrews were both prolific letter writers, but the main contact between them, as befitted their special relationship, was one of face-to-face meetings. In consequence, I have used the phrase, 'we may

surmise' where concrete evidence is lacking.

- 7. Vedanayakam Samuel Azariah was afterwards consecrated bishop in St. Paul's Cathedral, Calcutta, on 29 December 1912, and appointed the first bishop of Dornakal. See Carol Graham, (1946), Azariah of Dornakal, for a full account of his contribution at the Edinburgh Conference and afterwards.
- 8. Samuel Stokes visited St. Augustine's College in 1911 and wrote articles for *East and West*, the journal of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, whose history and work Winslow studied, and to whom he was soon to offer his services in India.
- 9. C. F. Andrews, as Daniel O' Connor has shown, was a prolific writer at this time; and Winslow used Andrew's essays and books as study material with his students. In 1912 Andrews had published a provocative study, *The Renaissance of India: Its Missionary Aspect*, written in the form of a study-guide.
- 10. The role of Palmer and Azariah in the development of Indian Christianity has been mentioned in numerous histories of the Indian Church and of the Anglican Communion. See, for example, Cecil John Grimes (1946), Towards an Indian Church: The Growth of the Church in India in Constitution and Life. The life and work of Andrews has also been extensively studied. Stokes has received much less attention.
- 11. For a typical British assessment, see E. Chatterton (1924), A History of the Church of England in India.
- 12. J. C. Winslow, Eyelids of the Dawn, (1954;73).
- 13. Winslow described his first experiences of Christianity in India in Christa Seva Sangha, (1931), Eyelids of the Dawn, (1954), and A Testament of Thanksgiving, (1974).
- 14. J. C. Winslow, The Eyelids of the Dawn, (1954:74). 'Inner feelings of superiority' would have come easily to Balliol men in India at that time. The Viceroy, Curzon, Eton and Balliol like Winslow, had been lampooned in The Masque of Balliol (1881): 'My name is George Nathaniel Curzon, I am a most superior person'. This appellation 'stuck to him like a burr' for the rest of his life. K. Rose, Superior Person (1969:49).
- 15. J. C. Winslow, The Eyelids of the Dawn, (1954:60).
- 16. Winslow in 1914 had little understanding of the concept of 'guru' because there was not then the amount of literature that now exists about different interpretations of this role. It was a term with which he long wrestled on the one hand wanting Jesus to be a 'living guru' and on the other, seeking, finding, and meeting 'living gurus' who were on earth as he was. Since the period of Winslow's pioneering experiment, there has been a steady flow of Western and Indian interpretations of the guru-disciple relationship written in the English language. Among recent writings, see for example, Francis,

Acharya of the Kurisumala Ashram, (1982), "The Guru: The Spiritual Father in the Hindu Tradition"; David M. Miller (1976), "The Guru as the Centre of Sacredness".

- 17. 'I thank God for the friendship, during thirty years, of Charlie Andrews. To be with him was a benediction, for his whole being radiated love. It was this man's life and writings which first kindled my desire to enter more deeply into the spirit of India and to be more closely identified with her people'. Winslow, *The Eyelids of the Dawn* (1954:77).
- 18. Excellent accounts of how Andrew saw himself and how others saw him at this time can be found in Hugh Tinker, *The Ordeal of Love*, (1974) and Daniel O'Connor, *Gospel, Raj and Swaraj*, (1990).
- 19. J. C. Winslow, Christa Seva Sangha, (1931:39).
- 20. In 1893-4, Adderley and B. F. Westcott were also drawing social values from the life of St. Francis. Since that year Andrews won a prize for an essay discussing relations of labour and capitalism and was the Cambridge President of the Christian Social Union, he may well have come across their work and talked with them of St. Francis. (He was a close friend of one of Westcott's sons). In the 1890s Cambridge historians were also collecting evidence of the life and work of the friars in England. Andrews's extensive writing over a long period has many brief and unexpected allusions to St. Francis. His fullest treatment of the Saint can be found in the July 1928 edition of the Vishabharti Quarterly published from Tagore's ashram in which he compared thirteenth-century Italy and twentieth-century India, and St. Francis with Tukaram, Gandhi, Tagore and Radhakrishnan.
- 21. In 1914, Andrews wrote to a correspondent, E. S. Talbot, (and doubtless also told Winslow by word of mouth) that for him it would have been 'a false move' to join the Brotherhood of the Imitation of Christ working among lepers. 'For while Stokes was clearly called to the villages, I was as clearly called to the English educated'. (Andrews to E. S. Talbot, 1914, quoted O' Connor).
- 22. Stokes in a letter to A. M. H. printed in 1912 in *The Love of God: A Book of Prose and Verse* wrote that he had 'confirmed the mistaken conviction that truly religious life is to be attained only by freeing oneself from the world'. (1912:XXX).
- 23. Hugh Tinker in *The Ordeal of Love* quoted these words in a letter which Andrews wrote on 27 October 1911. Tinker wrote that when this 'venture of enormous promise withered and perished' it left Andrews 'sadly discouraged'.
- 24. J. C. Winslow, The Eyelids of the Dawn, (1954:25).
- 25. Marjorie Sykes, (1925), C. F. Andrews: Representative Writings. Entry for 1912. See also, Archives of World Conference for Mission.
- 26. Father Denis, Father Algy, (1964:78).

- 27. Nadejda Gorodetsky (1976) in Saint Tikhon of Zadonsk: Inspirer of Dostoevsky has an interesting discussion of the ability of a Saint to inspire literature in which she mentions St. Francis, Tolstoy and Gandhi.
- 28. C. F. Andrews, "St. Francis of Assisi" in *The Vishvabharati Quarterly* (July 1928).
- 29. C. F. Andrews on a number of occasions compared the movement initiated by Gandhi and St. Francis; and often appealed to the British to accept Gandhi (who many appeared to distrust) as another like unto St. Francis (who many seemed to admire). For instance, in *India and the Simon Report*, (categorised in most libraries as political science) Andrews wrote: 'We all recognise that the Franciscan movement changed the face of Western Europe and ushered in vast political changes. In the same way the Gandhi movement is changing from within the face of modern India and creating vast political upheaval' (1930:44). These ideas, we may assume, he discussed earlier with Winslow.
- 30. If later evidence is taken into account, it was Gandhi's spiritual values, especially of non-violence, which Winslow came most to appreciate it was these values about which he wrote in 1931 in The Dawn of Indian Freedom. Winslow's appreciation of his debt to Gandhi was explained, in part, in an essay he contributed to Radakrishan's collection of essays presented to Gandhi in 1939 to celebrate the Mahatma's seventieth birthday.
- 31. Winslow was not the only Christian who saw the relevance of bhakti values to Christians. In the course of his research, he met with several other people who were also discovering Indian Bhakti poets. A number of translations of Indian Bhakti poets were made. Nicol Macnicol, for example, was making translations published in 1920 of Psalms of the Marathi Saints. Since then, the bhakti path has been expounded much more frequently by Christians. Those seeking further information about bhakti could read, for instance, A. J. Appasamy's D.Phil. thesis at Oxford University, which was published in 1926 in Madras as Christianity as Bhakti Marga: A Study of the Johannine Doctrine of Love. (A.J. Appasamy (1964) described his search for Indian Christianity in My Theological Quest). John S. Hoyland in 1932 translated Tukaram's poems (many had been already translated by Winslow) published in a collection entitled An Indian Peasant Mystic (Translations of Tukaram). Stephen C. Neill (1964) in Bhakti Hindu and Christian has traced the interplay that Christians have made with bhakti. A brief, but more recent account of Bhakti marga can be found in John R. Hinnels and Eric J. Sharpe, (1972), Hinduism.
- 32. Andrews' relationship with Tagore has been extensively studied. Winslow refers to Tagore's impact in a number of places, for example in *N. V. Tilak* (1923:87).
- 33. C. Andrews, quoted by Marjorie Sykes (Ed.), C. F. Andrews: Representative Writings, (1973:72).

34. Later observers of Winslow's own experiment, such as Halstead, Vice-Principal of Lucknow, found his liturgical expression of Indian

Christianity most unusual.

It is rather trite to say that India needs a deeply mystical religion and highly liturgical worship - but, trite or not, the recognition of this fact is not by any means a working hypothesis of most existing expression of Christianity in India.

Halstead, Christa Seva Sangha Review, (1932).

- 35. J. C. Winslow, J. E. G. Festing, D. R. Athavale, and E. C. Ratcliffe, (1920), The Eucharist in India: A Plea for a Distinctive Liturgy for the Indian Church with a Suggested Form. The Eucharist of India, Introduction.
- 36. E. Palmer, Preface to *The Eucharist in India*, (1920:x). Palmer also correctly predicted that it would be 'a long step' to the 'implementation' of his former pupil's suggestions.
- 37. World Conference for Mission, American Marathi Mission Archive, Box 399.
- 38. J. C. Winslow, The Eyelids of the Dawn (1954). A mush fuller view of his debt can be obtained from his biography of Tilak, Narayan Vaman Tilak: The Christian Poet of Maharashtra, (1923).
- 39. J. C. Winslow, Narayan Vaman Tilak: the Christian Poet of Maharashtra, (1923:17).
- 40. Winslow, Narayan Vaman Tilak, (1923:101).
- 41. Lakshambai Tilak, The Story of Narayam Waman Tilak and Lakshambai, his Wife, (1956:83).
- 42. J. C. Winslow, The Eyelids of the Dawn (1954:67).
- 43. J. C. Winslow, Narayan Vaman Tilak, (1923: 29,43).
- 44. Winslow, Narayan Vaman Tilak, (1923:62). Winslow described kirtans at length in this work. This was a type of worship unknown to residents of the West until followers of the Hare Krishna Movement began to have kirtans in streets and parks.
- 45. J. C. Winslow, The Eyelids of the Dawn, (1954:21).
- 46. Tilak was rejected by the Hindus in 1894, the same year in which Sabatier's book was placed on the Index of Forbidden Books. This could have led to discussion of the power of leaders of institutional religion in both the East and the West.
- 47. Lakshambai Tilak, The Story of Narayam Waman Tilak and Lakshambai, his Wife, (1956:81).

- 48. Tilak's note to missionaries was also quoted by K. R. Shirsat in Narayan Vaman Tilak, Poet and Patriot, (1979:43).
- 49. J. C. Winslow, N. V. Tilak, (1923:100).
- 50. J. C. Winslow, The Indian Mystic: Some Thoughts on India's Contribution to Christianity, (1926:7).
- 51. This letter of C. F. Andrews to Gandhi, 24th. April, 1919, was quoted by Tinker, C. F. Andrews: The Ordeal of Love, (1979:152).
- 52. For the importance of 1919-20 in the history of India see, for example, Subhas C. Bhose (1935), The Indian Struggle: 1920-1934; Louis Fischer (1982), The Life of Mahatma Gandhi; Judith M. Brown (1985), Modern India: The Origins of an Asian Democracy; Judith M. Brown (1989), Gandhi: Prisoner of Hope.
- 53. J. C. Winslow, The Eyelids of the Dawn, (1954:76).
- 54. Alan Wilkinson (1978) has written an excellent account of the disturbing impact of the 1914-18 war on the upper and middle-class members of the Church of England in *The Church of England and the First World War*.
- 55. Vera Brittain, Testament of Youth, (1980:472).
- 56. J. C. Winslow, Eyelids of the Dawn#, (1954:73).
- 57. J. C. Winslow, Eyelids of the Dawn, (1954:78). Winslow's ashram vision was at time of the feast of St. Clare, whom St. Francis had described as 'his little plant'. Winslow, in Christa Seva Sangha, described the ashram as 'a little planting' (1931:18). Clare, above all the Franciscan Saints, could be described as a 'bhakta'. There is, however, no direct evidence that St. Clare was in Winslow's mind at the time of his 'vision'.
- 58. J. C. Winslow, A Testament of Thanksgiving, (1974:36).
- 59. J. C. Winslow, Christa Seva Sangha, (1931:22).
- 60. There are descriptions of the development of Christa Seva Sangha from 1919-26 in Winslow's two autobiographies (1959 and 1974) and in Christa Seva Sangha (1930). Information can also be obtained from editions of The Christ Seva Sangha Review, for which Winslow wrote retrospective articles. Sister Barbara Noreen in A Wheat Grain Sown in India (n.d.) has reconstructed the period very thoroughly.
- 61. In Christa Seva Sangha, describing the formal adoption of St. Francis, he wrote that he had 'even before this, begun to hold in special esteem and affection the Little Poor Man of Assisi'. (1931:39).
- 62. The Reports of the American Marathi Mission at this time were full and lavishly illustrated. Unlike the missionaries of the Society of the Propagation of the Gospel, most of the Marathi missionaries were

Indians and lay people. In 1926 the Marathi Mission had 39 'foreign' and 536 Indian staff, of whom only 34 were ordained. The Congregationalist Church in Ahmednagar that it sponsored was self-supporting, and not at all dependent on foreign contributions. (World Council of Mission Archives, held at S.O.A.S., London, and at Geneva).

- 63. As Tilak had, Winslow wore suits when he thought it appropriate. His sense of propriety was not conventional. Attired in his flowing Indian garment, he attended a dinner of Old Etonians at Simla in order to seek donations for more permanent ashram buildings.
- 64. The average missionary, Winslow estimated, spent eight times as much on food as the average Indian. They are 'the food of exiles'.
- 65. A simple Rule and Constitution was composed in 1922. The constitution stated that there was to be 'no Guru or Head but Jesus Christ our ever-present master.'

 Also quoted by Sister Barbara Noreen, A Wheat Grain Sown in India. (n.d.:58).
- 66. A full description of the Rule and Constitution can be found in Sister Barbara Noreen's, A Wheat Grain Sown in India.
- 67. J. C. Winslow, A Testament of Thanksgiving, (1974:37).
- 68. Eyre Chatterton, A History of the Church of England in India, (1924:214).
- 69. World Conference for Mission Archive, National Christian Council Review Box.
- 70. J. C. Winslow, The Indian Mystic. (1926:7-9).
- 71. J. C. Winslow, The Indian Mystic. (1926:45-47).
- 72. J. C. Winslow, The Indian Mystic, (1926:45).
- 73. R. Hyam has written an excellent account in *Britain's Imperial Century, A Study of Empire and Expansion 1885-1914.* (1976).
- 74. Stallybrass in Editor's Introduction to A Passage to India, (1985:14). 17,000 hard back copies were printed (and mostly sold) in Britain during 1924.
- 75. E.M. Forster, A Passage to India, (1985:43,56,146,196).
- 76. The Call of India, (1926:83).
- 77. B. H. Streeter and A. J. Appasamy, The Sadhu: A Study in Mysticism and Practical Religion. (1921).
- 78. F. D. Mackenzie (1926), "Thinking Internationally", in Towards a Catholic Standard of Life, Being a Short Report of the First Summer

- ~ School of Sociology held at Keble College in 1925.
- 79. Punch. (1926:3 October).
- 80. Verrier Elwin in *The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin* and Oliver Fielding Clarke in *Unfinished Conflict* both describe the journey to Christa Seva Sangha in great detail.
- 81. Tissington Tatlow, in *The Story of the Student Christian Movement*, wrote that Algy Robertson was 'a keen Anglo Catholic, a good speaker, and a man of spiritual power'. (1933:800). Peart Binns in *Ambrose Reeves* wrote of Robertson's 'undiluted Anglo Catholicism'. Father Denis, S. S. F., (1964) has written Robertson's biography, *Father Algy*.
- 82. Verrier Elwin wrote an autobiography, The Tribal World of verrier Elwin, published posthumously in 1964, in which he described in an early chapter his stay at Christa Seva Sangha.
- 83. Oliver Fielding-Clarke (1970) wrote his autobiography, Unfinished Conflict, in which he had a chapter describing his experience at Christa Seva Sangha, 1927-1929. Limitation of space does not allow me in this chapter to follow in any detail the individual life-stories of any the members of Christa Seva Sangha other than Winslow.
- 84. Fielding-Clarke, Unfinished Conflict: An Autobiography of O. Fielding Clarke. (1970:153).
- 85. The evidence on which this reconstruction and the following argument has been made comes from oral history and careful examination of what records there are. Subsequent events demonstrate the divisiveness of strongly held opinions. The leader of the Cuthbert-Western party returned to the West and established a Society of three orders there. The Indian-Sabatier party reverted to something more akin to the earlier ashram organisation.
 - Interviews with T. Ramsbotham (Winslow's brother-in-law), Father Denis, S. S. F., Sister Barbara Noreen, C. S. M. V. and W. Q. Lash have been especially helpful. Study of the C. S. S. Newsletters has been rewarding. The Minutes of the meetings at St. Ives of the Third Order in England are in the Bodleian Library.
- 86. Fielding Clarke, Unfinished Conflict. Fielding Clarke 'found the strain of the discussions more than I could cope with' and left the Christa Seva Sangha claiming 'a very deep need in me to paddle my own canoe'. (1979:174, 81).
- 87. Sister Barbara Noreen, C. S. M. V., A Wheat Grain Sown in India, devotes a tightly-worded chapter to the discussions which led to the Rule and Constitution. There is not space in this thesis to analyse the documents fully. (n.d.:chap. 6, 57-75).
- 88. Fr. Denis, S. S. F., Father Algy. He was commenting on Robertson's style of leadership when he wrote, '... there was perhaps more of St. Ignatius than of St. Francis.' (1964:80).

- 89. J. C. Winslow, A Testament of Thanksgiving, (1974:38). Winslow was much more open in a talk delivered in 1974 at the present Christa Seva Ashram. 'They were much more drawn to the monastic vocation and wanted things according to Rule ... which wasn't my idea'. Sister Barbara Noreen, (n.d. 58). This interpretation of two conflicting evaluations of organisation was confirmed for her in interviews in India and in correspondence.
- 90. Sister Barbara Noreen, A Wheat Grain Sown in India, (n.d.:59-61).
- 91. Fielding Clark, Unfinished Conflict. (1970:173).
- 92. Vandana, Gurus, Ashrams and Christians. (1978:75).
- 93. Research for this thesis began with the collection of oral history from two selected samples of members of the present Third Order of the Society of St. Francis. The tension between Rule and Principles was evident, but most spoke of the inspiration they received from the Principles.
- 94. J. C. Winslow, Christa Seva Sangha. (1930:Preface)
- 95. A record of this, and some other of Dorothy Swayne's papers, is held in the Hilfield Archives.
- 96. There are very few records of the activities of The Fellowship of the Way. The quotation has been taken from a printed leaflet in the archives at both Hilfield and the Bodleain. There are address lists, the latter ones stapled to lists of the members of Christa Seva Sangha. They illustrate the transition to the use of typewriters and carbon ribbons a form of domestic technology not available to Miss Marshall. Miss Swayne became a prodigious writer of carbon copied letters.
- 97. There were separate lists of members, typed by Dorothy Swayne, who stapled them together and distributed them by post to the dispersed members. To my knowledge, the only extant copies of these lists for 1931 and 1932 are held by Fr. Lucian Hunt, O. F. M., who was professed as a member of the Third Order of Christa Seva Sangha in Peckham, before later becoming a Roman Catholic and a member of the Order of Friars Minor. The Minute Book of the Third Order of Christa Seva Sangha describes some of the events of these two years.
- 98. The lists of the first postal libraries of the Third Order of the Society of St. Francis are still held in the Archives of the Society at the Bodleian Library. Many of the actual books including those donated from the estate of Evelyn Underhill are now held at the convent of the present Sisters of the First Order of the Society of St. Francis (formerly the Community of St. Francis). They were given to them when parcel postage was considered to be expensive, and after paper-back lives of St. Francis became more readily available. The first librarian (and second secretary of the Third Order of the Society), John Hurst, has been a most informative source of oral history.

- 99. J. C. Winslow, The Servant of Christ, (1933, No. 18). Carol Graham wrote later '... it is impossible to describe what an impossible, unthinkable blow it seemed when Jack Jack of all people announced that he was not coming back to live and work in India'. "Jack Winslow, A Personal Recollection" in The Franciscan, Volume XVI, Number 4, September, (1974:170).
- 100. J. C. Winslow, (1964), The Lee Abbey Story and Richard More, (1982), The Lee Abbey Story.

CHAPTER SIX.

THE FRANCISCAN-GANDHIAN VENTURE OF VERRIER ELWIN,

Part One.

ACQUIRING FRANCISCAN AND MYSTICAL VALUES IN ENGLAND AND IN INDIA, 1902-1932.

1. IMBIBING VALUES IN SOCIAL CONTEXTS OF EARLY LIFE, 1902-26.

A Bishop's son, a Pupil at Dean Close School, a Student and Vice-Principal at Oxford University. Harry Verrier Holman Elwin, born in 1902, was the son of a bishop of Sierra Leone. His father died when he was eight, and his widowed mother nurtured him in a Church of England Evangelical tradition which he found 'the dullest type of religion in the world'. He was educated at Dean Close School, Cheltenham, which fostered the same religious tradition, and where he taught himself to read Rosetti's poems in the orginal 'as a romantic way' of learning Italian. In 1919, he collected numerous school prizes and in October of 1921 became a student at Merton College, Oxford.

In 1924, Elwin obtained a First Class Honours degree in English Literature, and a First in Theology in 1926. In addition, he was awarded scholarships and prizes including the Matthew Arnold Prize for an essay, The Poetry of Revolution, a theme which was to inspire him for the rest of his life. After ordination in the Church of England, Elwin was appointed Vice-Principal of Wycliffe Hall. As Lord Sankey, Lord Chancellor of England, later wrote, Elwin had every prospect in 1926 of a distinguished

university career or of holding high office in the Church of England.

(2) Searching for Mystical and Romantic Values at Oxford University.

At this time Elwin was studying mysticism 'voraciously'. He had 'fantastically learned talks about the pseudo-Dionysus the Areopagite and Caeserius of Heisterbach' and sought direct and personal mystical knowledge as he prayed and fasted. It was therefore the mysticism of St. Francis in which Elwin was most interested during the 1926 Franciscan celebrations.

Elwin's visual image of St. Francis was in part that of the seventeenth-century Spanish painters. He may well have seen Francisco Zurbaran's study of St. Francis, unquestionably praying and fasting and absorbed in God, hung in the National Gallery in London. He had not been seen the Italian narrative paintings in Assisi, or had very much contact with any members of the Roman Catholic Church. This Church was of interest to him mainly because some its Saints from previous centuries had been mystics.

The literary resources from which Elwin obtained information about St. Francis were wide-ranging. Doubtless, he read some of the numerous articles written in 1926, but none seem to have made a permanent impression. There is abundant evidence that he treasured the fourteenth-century Little Flowers of St. Francis, G. K. Chesterton's account of the Saint's life, and those of Laurence Housman's Little Plays of St. Francis which had already been printed. These he must surely have read in or before 1926. It would be very surprising if a don, who took his first degree in English Literature, won a Matthew Arnold prize, and who was later named 'The Scholar Gypsy' by his closest friend, had not studied Matthew Arnold's essay about St. Francis – and almost certainly also that of Ernest Renan. Elwin's own writing after 1926 gave clear evidence that

he had also studied the two main standard works of modern scholarship available in English about St. Francis at this time: Paul Sabatier's epochmaking study, which was first published in 1893, and Cuthbert of Brighton's equally brilliant Roman Catholic reply, first published in 1911.

These studies of St. Francis with which Elwin was first familiar could all be incorporated into a theme of Romance. Most were poetic. For Elwin, as for Shelley, romantic poetry was of value to the world because it was the most unfailing herald, companion or follower of the awakening of a great people. Following Chesterton and other students of English and European literature at this time, Elwin always claimed that romantics were often sane, when those around them were crazy.

(3) Extending his Enquiries with the Assistance of Visiting Scholars.

After the shattering events of the 1914-1918 war and of the Russian Revolution which forced the thoughtful to ask questions, Oxford dons, looking for a new world, invited scholars from the continent of Europe to deliver lectures. Two of these, one from the West and the other from the East of Europe, introduced Elwin to new ways of viewing St. Francis. Friedrich Heiler, a German theologian, suggested that theologians could study 'religious man' by creating and using typologies to make comparisons, while also appreciating the limited understanding which categorisation provided. 'There is', Heiler advised, 'a higher method of study than the religious and historical method of analysing into types, which necessarily operates from without. There is a Christian method which operates from within'.'

Nicolas Arseniev was a Russian exile, living in Germany in the 1920s. When he visited Oxford, he suggested that the West esteemed too highly 'the stifling gloom' of their medieval Catholic Saints. St. Francis, Arseniev argued, was a rare exception to the generality of Saints canonised in the

West. He was 'a brilliant flame' because in his devotion to the Crucified Christ he had not been gloomy, but shone with the radiant Resurrection joy which characterised Saints of the Eastern Orthodox tradition. He had bridged, within himself, Eastern and Western strands of Christian consciousness. In other words, Arseniev rejected the St. Francis painted by Zurbanan suggesting he should be viewed more as the Russians visualised St. Sergius of Russia (1314-92), surrounded by light, not darkness.

Stimulated by Heiler's analytical categories and Arseniev's interpretation of mystical joy, Elwin began an attempt to analyse St. Francis's mysticism into categories. This he finally abandoned in 1933 with the observation: 'the Poverello did not fit models'.

At Oxford, Elwin also heard Sadhu Sundar Singh speak. Streeter and Appasamy, among others, had named the Indian mystic: the St. Francis of India. 10 Elwin then became interested in other Indian mystics, especially in those who upset categories. Gandhi was world-denying in his personal life, but as Indian friends persuaded Elwin, world-transforming in his actions. Elwin could see that Tagore, whose poetry he read, was both a mystic and a man of action.

'Then came Jack Winslow', Elwin recorded. Winslow had written that 'a fresh Franciscan movement could well come to us from India' and at meetings which Elwin attended he explained how the revival of Indian bhakti tradition, which was poetic and mystical, national and global, could stimulate a global awakening. Robertson, a friend of Elwin also seeking a fresh Franciscan movement, had decided to join Winslow at Christa Seva Sangha.

(4) Deciding to Go to Assisi, and then to India to Join Christ Seva Sangha.

After 'a long struggle', Elwin decided at Capel Curig (a North

Wales landscape not unlike descriptions of the Umbrian mountains) that 'some life of men unblest' was driving him, as it had driven Arnold's Scholar Gypsy, into 'the wilds'. 14

Elwin could see the possibility of becoming 'a Franciscan' as a part of a 'fresh Franciscan movement' in India; but he acknowledged his mixed motivation. He always insisted that he did not want to be a missionary in the ordinary sense of the word. Part of his motive for going there was to make 'reparation' for what his country and his class had done to the Indian people; part was his desire to see whether an Indian Franciscan tradition could assist Western Christianity to put on an 'oriental garb'; part was because he sought spiritual adventure. He knew he was risking his future; and that is why this chapter has been named 'a venture'.

Elwin with Robertson and two of the other men who were going to Christa Seva Sangha first made a pilgrimage to Assisi. They sailed from Italy to India, and first went to visit the Orthodox ashram about which Winslow had told them and Elwin noted that it was 'run on Franciscan lines'.

2. <u>MODIFYING MYSTICAL AND FRANCISCAN VALUES IN INDIA AND ENGLAND, MARCH, 1927-NOVEMBER 1929</u>.

(1) Enjoying Multi-Religious India. At Christa Seva Sangha, Winslow encouraged Elwin to learn Sanskrit and Marathi, in which languages he quickly learnt most of the Indian mystical terms. At group meetings with those of other Faiths, called an International Fellowship, he took part in discussions of religious experience. At a single meeting, he met 'a tall figure with the trident of Vishnu on his forehead, an earnest social worker from the Arya Samaj, a Parsee historian, a charming liberated Jew of the

Ben-Israel Community, a cultured Brahmo, a learned Muslim With Winslow's approval, he went to Gandhi's ashram at Sabarmati in January 1928 for a residential conference of this International Fellowship. 20

Visiting Gandhi's Ashram at Sabarmati and Analysing His Experiences

There. During the Conference, Elwin often recalled, 'there occurred an event which was to disturb and change my whole life'. The seeds of his departure from Christa Seva Sangha, and ultimately from the Christian Church, were sown in his first months in India, although his devotion to St. Francis persisted.

Just as C. F. Andrews had been 'haunted' by Tagore, and Winslow had been haunted by N. V. Tilak, Elwin felt himself drawn as if by a magnet to Gandhi. The 'impact' of Gandhi in those few days, he reflected later, was 'extraordinary'. 'From that moment I was doomed'. 'I was reborn an Indian on Indian soil'. 'I now became an ardent disciple'. His was to be a Franciscan-Gandhian venture.

Having returned to Christa Seva Sangha, Elwin analysed his outward observation and his inner experience into its components and made comparisons: as St. Francis had been, this extraordinary little man was a monastic founder, a spiritual director, a Mahatma - a Great Soul. Firstly, Gandhi was a founder of 'co-monasticism'. At Sabarmati, men, women and children were all leading lives of strict discipline. Secondly, Gandhi was 'a spiritual director', but not as that term was generally understood by members of the Church of England. Gandhi directed while tending cracks on the soles of feet and cleaning latrines. He wrote short notes to encourage. Thirdly, Gandhi was 'Mahatma'- a Great Soul who radiated a divine mystery, an 'almost unearthly dignity and beauty'. St. Francis and St. Sergius had been similarly described.

(3) Returning To England. After the conference was over, 'wafting on

a wave of excitement', Elwin struggled to practise the discipline he had glimpsed at Sabarmati at Christa Seva Sangha. Unused to India's climate and sleeping on cement floors, and eating only what was offered him, he became seriously ill. Bishop Palmer of Bombay, the official Church of England 'visitor' of Christa Seva Sangha, administered the last rites when it looked as if Elwin might die of a fever, and brought him champagne when it looked as if he would recover. In March 1928, the Bishop sent Elwin back to England to recuperate his strength, and provided Christa Seva Sangha with beds which he ordered to be used. In England, Elwin's health rapidly improved.

(4) Acquiring an Italian Franciscan Spiritual Director. C. F. Andrews, friend to Gandhi and Winslow, could see the difficulties that might arise for Elwin. After twenty years of struggle, he was still trying to integrate the values he drew from St. Francis and Gandhi. Being Winslow's friend too, he was aware of the tensions in Christa Seva Sangha and anticipated further clashes between Gandhi and the British Government. He suggested to Elwin that he should seek a spiritual director who was not directly connected with these events with whom he could share his desire to know God within a Franciscan mystical tradition. 28

Thus, Elwin wrote to the 'little sisters' who were seeking to revive a 'primitive' Franciscan tradition at 'Eremo Francescano' on the outskirts of Trevi, not far from Assisi. Within a few months, Sorella Amata had become the 'spiritual director' of 'Fratello Verrier', as she called Elwin. Soon, Fratello Verrier began to tell this Sorella about his impatience with religious arguments. 'Not finding truth in comfort and amidst disputes, I went to find Him in simplicity and poverty, as so many have done before me', he told her. Six months later, still recuperating in Oxford, he informed her that he had little interest in institutional religion (which had

become an important feature of the arguments at Christa Seva Sangha). Wanting to pass beyond these arguments, he explained to her what he sought:

The master was sitting with his disciple meditating before the sacred fire. The master got up; he stamped out the fire. Turning to his disciple, the master said: 'Hitherto thou has learnt the value of religion: learn now its worthlessness'.

He quoted a Veda to her: 'From the Unreal Lead Me to the Real, from Darkness Lead me to Light'. 30

(5) Experiencing Spiritual Entente. This disciple of St. Clare, who also sought eternal values, showed Elwin that she was interested in his earth-bound contexts, too. She asked Elwin to arrange a subscription to Young India, Gandhi's journal, for the Sorelle. She also arranged from Italy for Elwin to join a Confraternity of Spiritual Entente. The Entente was a practical answer to Elwin's request. Its members, who belonged to Catholic and Protestant Churches, or to no Church at all, were bound together only by their common search for a transcendent dimension to human existence. They had no arranged meetings and no rules, only an address list, which enabled them to correspond with each other, and arrange to meet each other, if they wished to do so.

Thus, Elwin met two English women who were already part of the Entente: Olive Wyon and Evelyn Underhill, both of whom were becoming well-known as English writers about mystics and mysticism. Elwin told Sorella Amata of his pleasure when Olive Wyon came to a London meeting to hear him compare the values of St. Francis and Hindu mystics. 12

During his convalescence, Elwin became interested in the writings of Richard Rolle, a Franciscan Third Order hermit who had been drawn from fourteenth-century Oxford to solitude in Yorkshire by his experience of 'the Fire of Love'. He may well have discussed his study with Evelyn

Underhill, who was studying other Franciscan mystics: especially Jacapone da Todi and Angela of Foligno. 33

3. TENSION IN INDIA, 1929-30.

(1) Finding Change at Christa Seva Sangha and Sabarmati. In November 1929, Elwin returned to India and to Christa Seva Sangha. The arguments between those who saw the Sangha primarily as Indian and those who saw it primarily as Franciscan had been brought to a resolution, but he found that the ashram in Poona had become 'much more monastic' during his absence. 34

His first action on return was to assist Winslow in writing the final revision of *The Principles of Christa Seva Sangha. The Principles*, as we noticed in the previous chapter, were welcomed by all as a fine exposition of the Sangha's values and accepted without argument.

Elwin then went again to visit Sabarmati. On this visit he was invited to stay in Gandhi's house. Gandhi, who rose at five a.m. for work, taught his visitor that 'body labour' was a duty imposed by nature upon mankind: Elwin's name was on the roll call for spinning.

Elwin marvelled at the spinning wheel (charka) as a mystical technique. It could lead an individual from the Unreal to the Real, and produce the home-spun cotton thread from which khadi was woven. Gandhi believed it could be the symbol of changing values for 300 million people, who would then change the political context of a whole continent.

Having returned to Christa Seva Sangha in mid-December, Elwin began to write about this experiment, which was both mystical and political, not knowing that he had been at Sabarmati during a prelude to civil disobedience, and that he was about to see another of Gandhi's experiments with truth.

(2) Being a 'Son of St. Francis' and a 'Son of Gandhi'. Late in December 1929, Winslow returned to England. The Brothers elected Elwin, who had not been involved in the arguments, to be their acting-achyra, as the new constitution called the ashram's central figure. This unexpected honour determined one aspect of Elwin's social context for 1930.³⁷

On 31 December 1929, Gandhi hoisted a tricoloured flag, a nationalist flag, a symbol of a free India. This proclamation determined the other aspect of Elwin's social context in 1930. With the dawn of the New Year there was hope and confidence in every heart', Subhas C. Bose, an Indian leader, wrote. The National Congress named 26 January 1930: Independence Day. Indians from platforms throughout the subcontinent pledged themselves to obtain 'Purna Swaraj', or Self-Rule, for India and to sever 'the British connection'.

We believe that it is the inalienable right of the Indian people as of any other people to have freedom.... We believe also that if any Government deprives the people of these rights and oppresses them, the people have a further right to alter it or to abolish it. The British Government in India has ... ruined India economically, politically, culturally and spiritually. We therefore believe that India must sever the British connection and obtain Purna Swaraj or complete independence.

'All eyes now turned to Sabarmati, curious to know what Gandhi would do next'. On 5 March, a young English Quaker, Reginald Reynolds (wearing khaki shorts, as the British press indignantly reported) delivered a note from Gandhi to Lord Irwin, the Viceroy, informing him that he intended to defy the British Tax on Salt. On 12 March, Gandhi and eighty members of the ashram began their barefoot walk of 241 miles from Sabarmati to the coast. On 6 April, when they arrived at their destination, Gandhi ceremonially picked up salt. On 5 May, when Gandhi tried to enter a salt works, he was arrested by British police and put in Yeravda Central Prison in Pune.

As the prison was only three miles from the Christa Seva Sangha ashram, Elwin visited Gandhi frequently. Gandhi summed up the development in their relationship by giving him the title 'son'. Elwin later wrote, 'from that day I regarded myself as a citizen of India'. 41

Elwin was now the spiritual child of an Italian mother, Sorella Amata, and an Indian father, Gandhi, and attempting to integrate the Franciscan values of the former and the spiritual, social and political values of the latter. It would not be long before he found Christa Seva Sangha an impossible context for this task.

4. <u>ADVOCATING FRANCISCAN AND GANDHIAN VALUES IN PUBLIC ARENAS, 1930-1.</u>

(1) Becoming a Franciscan-Gandhian Rebel. In a year which Bose described as 'stormy 1930', 12 Elwin challenged his Franciscan brothers and sisters to consider what their Franciscan profession demanded from them in the current situation. He reminded them that on 1 March 1930, the Anglican Church of India had become independent of the Anglican Church of England on 1 March 1930. It was no longer legally tied to British Rule and was free to create a distinctively Indian form of Anglicanism. Erastianism had not always governed Christian action. They should be prophets and critics. They needed to act immediately, but should remember:

This political revolution is a mere incident, a detail in a vast war of ideas.

Thus challenged, the Brothers decided to show their support for the Indian nationalist cause both within Christa Seva Sangha and outside it. One of the Indian brothers, Shamrao Hivale, wrote that these were 'great days for C. S. S. for they were able to link themselves with the Congress Movement. Several brothers nearly went to jail'. At dawn, the Indian

and British Brothers ceremonially placed contraband salt in the holy water for their ritual asperges. After their prayers, they spun at their wheels for at least fifteen minutes. All day, they wore khadi and 'Gandhi caps' as an outward sign to other people of their support for the Indian nationalist cause. In the evenings at meetings, they spoke publicly of their support for Congress. Each week the ashram became a centre for more Christian rebels and missionaries in sympathy with Gandhi.

Elwin on his own went further. He hoisted the red, white and green nationalist flag above the ashram, claiming to follow the precedent set by the authorities of Bombay Cathedral. They declared their sympathies in this war of ideas by flying the Union Jack. (The brothers asked him to take it down, but none suggested he should replace it with the Union Jack). He lectured about the spinning wheel, which he described as 'spiritualised politics and ethicalised economics'. He invited Reginald Reynolds, the young Quaker who had delivered Gandhi's message to Lord Irwin, to give a lecture in Christa Seva Sangha's hall. Reynolds attracted a large audience – possibly, Elwin suggested, because of the khaki shorts he had worn to the Viceregal Lodge. There was a noisy uproar during the meeting.

Until then, the ruling British had not intervened. After this meeting, the Archdeacon visited to inform Elwin that the British Government was disturbed by his behaviour. Elwin reminded the Archdeacon that a Commissioner of Police should have come if it were felt that the Sangha was disturbing the peace. The Church of which his visitor was Archdeacon no longer had official connections with the British Government.

(2) Expounding Franciscan Values. Amid these events, Elwin did not lose his devotion to a lyrical, romantic and mystical St. Francis, whose spiritual light was needed in both East and West. For that October, he

wrote and produced a poetic drama, The Romance of St. Francis. It was acted at the ashram for six nights before an audience representative of different races and religions. In turn, the Spirit of the West and the Spirit of the East besought the Spirit of St. Francis. The Spirit of the East attributed Gandhi's key value, ahimsa (non-violence), to St. Francis:

Thou art the pure shrine of ahimsa. Come to the land of the saffron robe, where the banner of renunciation has ever flown. Lady Poverty is already enthroned on the Himalayan snows.

Elwin also began to draft a word-portrait of Gandhi to accompany a book of line drawings - perhaps even having in mind that St. Bonaventure provided the text for Giotto's paintings. Elwin headed his sketches of Gandhi: the explorer, the ascetic, the labourer, the poet and artist, the rebel, the devotee. He made his sketches also, as St. Bonaventure had, into an opportunity to write mystical theology. Gandhi, Elwin argued, was an 'ideal figure of the romance' but he worked with logical scientific accuracy:

His [Gandhi's] laboratory is the whole world. His experiments range over every aspect of life. The daring and scope of these experiments invest the Mahatma with something of the radiance of an ideal figure of the romantic age. But the experiments themselves are conducted with the scientific accuracy of the modern scholar.

(3) Proclaiming Gandhian Values. Winslow returned to India in the November of 1930, and again became achyra of Christa Seva Sangha, but neither he nor Elwin were often at the ashram during the first months of 1931. Winslow had decided to stay just three more years to encourage Indian Christians in their formation of an independent Church of India. Elwin was among the Indian nationalists.

Gandhi was released from prison on 26 January 1931, exactly one year after the Declaration of Independence. Judith Brown has suggested that his political influence and prestige reached their zenith in the following two months, culminating in the Gandhi-Irwin pact, made on 4

March. Opley, another historian, found these months 'a high point'. The diminutive Gandhi, dressed in his khadi 'mourning garment', negotiated this 'pact' with the tall and regal Viceroy on behalf of three hundred million people.

The incident prompted Winslow and Elwin together to complete *The Dawn of Indian Freedom* which was published in England by Allen and Unwin. Elwin entitled a chapter 'The Half-Naked Fakir'. In it he maintained that Gandhi, striding half-naked up the steps of the Viceroy's palace, was not, as it was being suggested by some in Britain, a seditious fraud. Gandhi resembled the Saint whom the English told each other in numerous publications, they most loved and admired. Elwin wrote:

I believe that the real secret of Gandhi's power is his Fransciscanism - and the same sort of things which made men love Francis are making men love Gandhi.

5. RESOLVING TENSIONS.

(1) Selecting the Most Important Values. In April 1931, Lord Irwin, who knew Winslow because of Eton links, and who, having visited Christa Seva Sangha in its earlier days, had some appreciation of Winslow's outlook, returned to Britain. Elwin anticipated that the new Viceroy, Lord Willingdon, was not likely to be as tolerant of his public proclamation of Gandhian political values as Lord Irwin had been. He had now also spoken boldly in print and was being criticised by the British press and by the clergy in India who no longer asked him to preach. Christa Seva Sangha could be embarrassed by him; and he was no longer sure that his beliefs were those of his brothers there. He wondered whether to leave it.

Gandhi observed Elwin's indecision. Although that May was perhaps the busiest month of Gandhi's life, he called for his son. Elwin described the meeting to Sorella Amata as 'heavenly conversation'. He told

her that Gandhi had advised him to tell the members of Christa Seva Sangha the truth, the worst truth about himself, even to the point of exaggerating his difficulties. The other members of that organisation should decide how much of his new values they could swallow and whether they could continue to accept him as a member. §§

The Constitution of Christa Seva Sangha, which had been formulated and passed while Elwin was recuperating in England, required an account of the situation to be given to Bishop Azariah of Dornakal, the episcopal visitor of Christa Seva Sangha. The Indian Bishop asked a straight question. If Elwin had to choose between Gandhi and Christa Seva Sangha, which would he choose? The answer was Gandhi. 'You should resign', Azariah told him. ⁵⁶

Elwin did so. In a letter to Sorella Amata, he expressed his apprehension. 'It is a step at midnight. I do not know whether I shall have anyone with me. I have no idea what the future holds'. Exactly how Elwin should 'resign' from the Sangha was, however, a subject of much private discussion and correspondence. Letters exist which Elwin wrote to Gandhi, Sorella Amata and C. F. Andrews – and doubtless, there were more, especially between Winslow and Bishop Azariah.

On the 18 June 1931, Elwin wrote to Sorella Amata to say that a 'working compromise' had been agreed with Bishop Azariah and that he would be following 'God's leading as a member of the Sangha'. On 17 July 1931, he told her that this would make his departure from Pune 'less dramatic, less sensational' than total severance. He was going to follow a similar path in India to that of the Franciscan hermit, Richard Rolle, in Yorkshire.

(2) <u>Deciding to Become a Franciscan Third Order Hermit</u>. This possibility had been in Elwin's mind since his convalescence in Oxford during 1928.

While there he had studied Rolle's writings in the Bodleian Library, and had also learned about Indian spirituality in the Oxford Institute of Indian Studies. This work had prompted his making connections between British hermits and Indian bhakta, which in turn sparked his correspondence with Sorella Amata on 'the Fire of Love'.

Elwin's desire to follow in Rolle's footsteps posed a problem for the constitutionalists at Christa Seva Sangha. Those who drew on the Roman Catholic pattern of Franciscan Orders as a basis for the ashram's organisation had not included all the patterns which Franciscans had created in the past. They had not considered the possibility of Christa having a sannyasi, a British hermit, 'in the wilds' of India, affiliated to the Franciscan Third Order rather than the First Order.

Elwin had been considering it for some time, as is shown by the publication of his book, Richard Rolle: A Christian Sannyasi in 1930. It appeared in A. J. Appasamy's series, 'Bhaktas of the World', and was his plea to Indians to teach the British how to revive their own bhakti tradition. They needed to do so, he argued, because only the 'bhaktas of the world' could recall the world to the supremacy of the spiritual. Although the idea of a 'wandering sanyasi, a devotee of God' was puzzling to the twentieth century Western mind, in Rolle's day there had been over seven hundred hermit and anchorite cells in the British Isles, including a few for married couples. The idea, therefore, was not new.

Rolle's membership of the Franciscan Third Order was important to Elwin. It exposed a nineteenth century misinterpretation of that order, which taught that tertiary followers of Francis were primarily engaged in good works. Rolle demonstrated that they could be hermits, 'bhakti devotees of God'.

While Gandhi was in London at the Round Table Conference, the

community of Christa Seva Sangha decided that Elwin should leave Poona on 5 October to prepare for a new life as a bhakti-Franciscan Third Order hermit, living in a remote part of India. St. Francis's day on 4 October that year was lavishly observed with a service of 'new beginnings. A statue of the Saint in the garden 'math' where the brothers assembled to worship was draped in garlands. It was, as we observed in the previous chapter, a day of multiple births for an Indian Franciscan Third Order movement.

Elwin persuaded a number of his English and Indian friends to help him produce a Special St. Francis Edition of the Christa Seva Sangha Review. He wrote a long article for it discussing the 'ever varying forms and interests' of followers of St. Francis. One of Evelyn Underhill's articles about Eremo Francescano was a central feature. Lawrence Houseman, author of The Little Plays of St. Francis, argued that if the West had understood St. Francis there would be no problem of East versus West. Brother Leonard described an 'English Franciscan Ashram' called Flowers Farm at Hilfield in rural Dorset.

Indians who were of other religious faiths also wrote about St. Francis. Swami Vishvananda of the Ramakrishna Mission reminded readers that 'St. Francis was not a metaphysician but a devotee, a Bhakti of the highest rank'. Pandit Taranath, head of a Hindu ashram, wrote that St. Francis was 'a mad man of God':

Is it not madness to act with a purpose unintelligible to the ordinary? He too is mad who differs in mind and heart from his contemporaries and that to an enormous extent.

Part Two.

TRANSFORMING FRANCISCAN AND GANDHIAN VALUES AT ST. FRANCIS ASHRAM AND GOND SEVA MANDAL, 1931-39.

- 6. PROBLEMS IN FOUNDING A SMALL AND COMPLEX GANDHIAN AND FRANCISCAN ORGANISATION AMONG THE GOND.
- (1) Finding a New Context and a Companion among the Gonds. 'The chief practical result was that I no longer had a society to pay my bills', Elwin wrote. We started the Eremo venture with 10 lire', Sorella Amata told him. Mortified, he replied that although he was homeless, he had 'a home in her heart and in the heart of India'. Elwin had his heart in India and his head in the heavens, but he still needed a place for his two feet somewhere.

This problem was solved by three eminent Indians, Sardar Vallabhbhai Patel, Seth Jamnalal Bajaj, and A. V. Thappar. Patel was one of Gandhi's closest associates who had already introduced Elwin to Gujarati villages, and was later described as 'the builder and consolidator of India, Bajaj, a wealthy cotton merchant, had managed the Sabarmati ashram and at this time was using his land and capital to create a similar ashram a Warda. Thappar was a member of The Servants of India. He had shown Elwin the dire poverty of Bombay and had also initiated ashrams among the Bhils, an aboriginal tribe.

Elwin, these Indian nationalist leaders said, could live an Indian eremitic life among an aboriginal tribe. Since he did not intend to beg, he could work at a mandal - another form of ashram created in India. In a mandal, educated Indians seeking a 'new India' worked to share their vision of a renewed society with those who lived in poor country areas. Mandals usually consisted of men and women who professed a number of

creeds. Jamnalal promised to provide the necessary resources for a mandal in the Central Provinces similar to the one which Thakkar took Elwin to visit among the Bhil. Bhil Seva Mandal, Elwin wrote, was 're-invigorating the Bhil community on truly national lines'. 68

Elwin was still a member of the Church of India, so he asked Bishop Wood, in whose diocese the aboriginal of the Central Provinces lived, if he could suggest a particular place for him to go. The Bishop suggested Karanjia, a Gond village in the Maikal Hills. Of the last five Europeans to stay there, the Bishop told Elwin, four had died within a year and the other had become insane. The British Bishop had not yet realised how differently he and Elwin visualised the Church of India, and he gave Elwin a license to act as a priest in Karanjia.

Shamrao Hivale, an Indian member of the Sangha, who was at the time in England studying theology, heard of Elwin's plan and asked to join Elwin 'in Franciscan style' among the Gond. There were now two would-be Franciscan hermits: one British, one Indian. They intended to have a hermitage in the centre of a mandal. As Elwin explained, in a leaflet written later to seek money for the mandal, the ashram and the mandal would be:

Two intersecting circles, separate yet vitally connected. The ashram will be for those who wish to live the religious life in somewhat Franciscan fashion. The Gond Seva Mandal will have larger scope including both Franciscan brothers and also any of whatever religion, who are ready to give their lives in disinterested service to the poorest of the poor and to become one of them. The Mandal will we hope draw members of different faiths into a real brotherhood - not of syncretism, but of service, East and West, Hindu Mussalman, Christian, Parsee, working together for love of the poor.

At the end of December, Elwin went to Bombay to meet Hivale as he arrived on S.S. Pilsna with Gandhi and his party returning from the Round Table Conference in London. 'Never was a king or a victorious general

given a warmer welcome', Judith Brown has observed of the day in which two hundred thousand Indians greeted the returning Mahatma. After the excitement, Elwin and Hivale went to Matheran to make plans for their remote Franciscan ashram and mandal in some degree of quiet.

Witnessing Gandhi's Arrest and becoming his Emissary. Gandhi also sought a quiet context with other Indian nationalists in which to discuss the British Raj, and what they could do to change it. He was staying at a house in Bombay, Mani Bhuvan, and for five days exchanged cables with the Viceroy in Delhi. Gandhi's secretary, Mahadev Desai, anticipated that his cable of the fifth day would be considered seditious, and he sent another cable to Elwin and Hivale asking them to come to Mani Bhuvan.

They came immediately; but it was evening and Gandhi had already begun his dusk-to-dusk weekly day of silence. Brief notes were exchanged, and Elwin rested on the roof within three yards of 'Bapu'. In the middle of that night the police came to arrest Gandhi, who signalled he would like half an hour to make his preparations. Gandhi wrote more little notes. One was to Elwin and another about Elwin. The first was this:

I am so glad you have come. I would like you yourself to tell your countrymen that I love them even as I love my own countrymen. I have never done anything towards them in hatred or malice and God willing I shall never do anything in that manner in future. I am acting no differently towards them now from what I have done in similar circumstances towards my own kith and kin. With love yours, M. K. Gandhi.

The second was an instruction to his secretary that Elwin should be sent immediately to investigate the situation in Peshawar where rioting was reported.

The two men, who the day before had been planning a hermitage, went immediately and investigated carefully. They were observed, and escorted back to Bombay by twelve policemen. Elwin had hidden his reports into a packet of Force (a cereal) for the journey, but the

authorities in Bombay found them and took them from him. The two were not imprisoned but, as Elwin was to discover later, their actions were recorded by British officials.

While they had been away, Jamnalal, their patron, most of the leading members of the India Congress, and more than fourteen thousand other Indians had been arrested and imprisoned. In February, a further seventeen thousand eight hundred more Indians were taken into custody. Elwin visited Jamnalal in prison, was so shocked at what he saw, that he resolved to walk barefoot, like St. Francis and Gandhi, until Indian national autonomy was achieved. 15

(3) Eventual New Beginnings at St. Francis Ashram, Karanjia. On 30 January 1932, Elwin and Hivale arrived at Karanjia which could only be approached along dirt tracks. There was no railway station anywhere near and the post could take anything up to a month. There were two or three British neighbours within a radius of thirty miles, but there were about two million Gonds in the region. Elwin described them as once a royal and prosperous people, but now ignorant, oppressed, diseased, dragging out their existence in little tumbledown huts on the borders of the tiger-haunted jungle.

The two hermits setting up their mandal had no choice about being poor and having to work with the Government of India to improve conditions for the Gond. Their Indian patron, Jamnalal, was in prison. The two men settled in a goat shed and fought fleas at the start of their mystical quest. Then they built a mud and thatch hut for themselves and a little chapel. The walls were decorated with Gond animals - elephants, camels, leopards, peacocks, tigers ... 'a new two hundred for St. Francis!', Elwin wrote. A crucifix wearing a loin cloth of khadi woven from threads which Gandhi had spun was centrally placed. A courtyard was

planted with flowers in memory of St. Francis's wish that all who saw them should remember Eternal Beauty. 78

While also planning the mandal to which men and women of other religions would soon be coming, sitting on a mud floor and using a primitive typewriter, Elwin wrote *The Truth About India* which he described as a 'Message to England'. He was obeying Gandhi's request to tell the truth to his own countrymen and he addressed his text 'to any sincere men and women in Britain for whom Gandhi and Congress are an enigma'. It is necessary in the public interest', he wrote, 'that the whole truth about this matter [Gandhi's arrest] should be known'; and he charted those crucial days before Gandhi's arrest and what had happened in India since then.

Elwin offered 'another reading of the situation'. He listed his qualifications for providing it: an eyewitness of Gandhi's arrest; a traveller along three thousand miles of roads staying in villages; an investigator deprived of his report by British Government officials; a visitor to Indians in prison. He had even seen British officials seize parish magazines if they expressed any sympathy with the India Congress. Earlier, Elwin had shown no interest whatever in 'systems', 'institutions' or 'formal organisations', but now he 'had no antagonism towards individuals but only towards the system they represented'.

7. TAKING HIS GANDHIAN-FRANCISCAN MESSAGE TO BRITAIN.

(1) Political Actions. Elwin took his draft to Bombay and obtained copies of relevant documents to make seven appendices: the telegrams exchanged between Gandhi and Lord Willingdon between 29 December 1931 and 4 January 1932 and the earlier correspondence between Sir Samuel Hoare, Secretary of State for India, and Gandhi were copied in full.

He asked some Indian nationalists to make additions or corrections.

Pandit M. M. Malaviya wrote an addition which strongly criticised the

British Secretary of State:

Little does Sir Samuel Hoare realise what damage he has done to the reputation of British Statesmen in this sorry affair. It would be unbelievable, were it not true, that the Secretary of State should have let the Viceroy refuse to give Gandhi an interview.

After considerable difficulty over his passport which he failed to understand until later, Elwin left for Britain with his amended text in June 1932. He met his friend, Laurence Housman, known to the English as author of light-hearted plays about St. Francis, who wrote a Preface. Elwin, he wrote, 'had no hatred or bitterness in him'. In spite of this, the editor of George Allen and Unwin amended the title to *The Truth about India: Can We Get It?* and then published it. 82

The India Bulletin informed the British of Elwin's arrival in London. Blwin sought appointments to press his case. He was received by Lord Sankey, the Lord Chancellor, and by Lord Irwin, the former Viceroy of India. The Secretary of State for India, Sir Samuel Hoare, refused to see him: he said it would not be fitting for him to see someone who criticised his administration. Elwin also spoke at a number of meetings. C. F. Andrews, who was also in England, was in the chair at one and George Lansbury at another. The would-be hermit followed in Gandhi's footsteps with a meeting at Kingsley Hall.

Amid this activity, Elwin realised that he needed to renew his passport because it been validated in Bombay only until 15 July 1932.84

He sent it for renewal, and had an unexpected reply:

In accordance with a request made by the Secretary of State for India you will not be given passport facilities to return to India.

(2) <u>Feeling 'Outcaste' before Returning to the Gond</u>. Elwin described himself as 'a political outcaste in Europe ... in front of a great precipice

up which there was no hope of climbing. He wrote to Sorella Amata asking for 'a little novena with intention for the Secretary of State for India that he would change his heart for me and let God's people go. He also wrote three letters to Gandhi to which he had no replies because Gandhi was facing another great precipice in the long story of British-Indian relations: a disagreement about the organisation of India's electorates.

On 14 August, Ramsay Macdonald, the British Prime Minister, announced the 'Communal Award', which swept aside Gandhi's passionately held vision of an integrated Indian society in favour of separate electorates for untouchable outcastes. Elwin had a letter from Gandhi written from Yeravda Mandir (a Mandir because Gandhi liked to think of his prison as a temple) which had been censored. Gandhi informed Elwin that he had just informed the Prime Minister of his intention from 20 September 'to fast unto death' in protest against 'the Communal Award'. Elwin and all his English friends 'were before my mind's eye when I penned my letters to the Prime Minister'. In Britain, the public announcement which followed was, Hugh Tinker suggested, 'a thunderclap in a clear sky'.

Gandhi fasted. While Sir Samuel Hoare was at Balmoral, word arrived from India that 'the crisis is serious'. The electorates were then renegotiated at Gandhi's bed and his fast ended on 26 September with the making of 'the Poona Pact'. A week later it was the feast of St. Francis, which was an important day in the calendar of the members of Christa Seva Sangha. Gandhi wrote to Elwin that day saying he had just been visited in prison by Winslow and the Christa Seva Sangha brothers. Of Elwin's precipice and exile, he wrote:

We can but do the best that it is possible for us to do. The result is in his hands. Therefore, be careful for nothing.

The political context had now changed once more. Sir Samuel Hoare found it possible to do what he would not do a month earlier. He acted on the advice of those who pleaded for Elwin - C. F. Andrews, Lord Sankey, Sir Francis Younghusband, and Lord Irwin 93.

Elwin signed an agreement. He undertook:

Entirely to work among the Gonds; to take no part in civil disobedience or any other political movement; to refrain, as far as possible, from associating with any person engaged in political agitation; to refrain from writing articles about the Government; and to observe the undertaking in the spirit as well as the letter.

His passport returned, Elwin next arranged to meet Sorella Amata face to face for the first time, before returning to Karanjia. At this meeting between two followers of St. Francis in an Italian convent, decisions were made about how Elwin could express his Franciscan and Gandhian values among an Indian tribe. Elwin should take as his authority the intuition of the Saints, remove himself from the authority of the Bishop of Nagpur, and be cautious with the British Government.

(3) Returning to Karanjia. On 24 October 1932, Elwin sailed from Genoa. Five days later he wrote to the Metropolitan of the Church of India, Bishop Foss Westcott, to say he had withdrawn from 'the maelstrom of politics' and to Bishop Wood of Nagpur to say he did not wish to have his license to act as a priest in his diocese renewed.

On his arrival in India, Elwin visited Gandhi, then returned to Karanjia on 29 November 1932. There were soon seven people, all Indians except Elwin, at St. Francis Ashram, and more than double that number at Gond Seva Mandal, the latter all Indians, who were Hindus, Muslims and Parsees. A new multi-racial and inter-religious Franciscan venture, with married and unmarried members, developed in tribal India. Its Franciscan roots were complex, the main ones emanating from Francis in Italy, Richard Rolle in England, and Samuel Stokes in India.

Elwin corresponded regularly with Bapu and Sorella Amata in the next few months. Elwin told Gandhi that the St. Francis ashram was 'entirely one with Sabarmati and Warda [Gandhi's new ashram], though a thousand miles behind. He told Sorella Amata it was 'a constant struggle to be loyal to St. Francis. An ashram with people of different religions was fine theory, but very difficult in practice.

8. REALISING THE POTENTIAL OF PRINT, 1932-3.

The St. Francis ashram Principles which Elwin wrote, and which both Gandhi and Sorella Amata read, were adapted from those which Elwin had helped Winslow to revise at Christa Seva Sangha. The three main values to be sought were poverty, love and obedience. Each of them, to Elwin's own surprise, in conjunction with the political changes brought about by a people moving to national independence, contributed to St. Francis ashram becoming an institute of anthropological research. Its hermitfounder became a distinguished anthropologist. The values he derived from St. Francis in some measure conditioned the content and method of his research.

(1) Turning Franciscan and Gandhian Poverty into Literary Expression and Anthropological Research. The theory of giving value to poverty was simple. 'At St. Francis ashram, they were to trust God to put into the hearts of their friends to give them what is necessary'.

Gifts were the only possible source of income because Elwin had spent his capital (a small amount) on purchasing the site. By his own actions he had cut himself off from Western missionary societies, from the stipendiary ministry of the Church of India, from salaried service for the British Government, from the steady income of Christa Seva Sangha, and from many potential British supporters in both India and Britain. 99

In Britain, there were rumours that Elwin had 'gone native' and become a 'Hindu', and apart from a few donations from Housman and others, little came from British people. He reproved his mother for not collecting more: 'I think you are a lot of poor prunes to be unable to raise any money ... '. 100 A few of the British in India gave a little, but most were like Mrs Waddy, who told Elwin that 'None of the people we know would care to meet you, I am afraid'. 101 Most of the rich Indian nationalists whom Elwin knew were in prison, and other Indian sympathisers had many calls on their generosity. It was ironic that in the first year Elwin and the Indians were kept alive mainly from the royalties of The Truth about India: Can We Get It? Elwin admitted to Sorella Amata that poverty was not as romantic as he had once dreamt: it was 'noisy, dirty, dull and inconvenient'. 102

Sorella Amata encouraged Elwin to use his literary gifts to earn money. Elwin responded to her challenge, and wrote two books which were not overtly polemical or political, but impregnated with his Franciscan-Gandhian values. St. Francis of Assisi was written for a market of English-educated Indians 'to show how St. Francis fitted into the Indian scene' because in 'the great Eastern world' the Italian Saint was 'too little known'. Leaves from the Jungle was written for a British market and designed to attract and amuse a broad spectrum of readers.

Both books were successful at raising royalties. In both books, Elwin stressed that poverty was valued because it gave freedom. Freedom, for instance, to believe that one did not have an exclusive hold on truth. He informed British readers of Leaves from the Jungle that at St. Francis ashram, no one was asked to surrender the tenets of his faith, or to cease its practice. Elwin summed up their attitudes in the following words, incidentally telling his readers that the Christian members were devotees

of St. Francis.

Our Mussalman was a good Mussalman; our Hindus observed the tenets of their religion; and in the same way the Christian members tried to follow, however imperfectly, the ideals of St. Francis of Assisi.

He also let it be known that Hivale was 'a Gandhi man', but in a way that ensured a watchful British government official would smile. He described the difficulties of eating chicken: [The italics have been added].

Mustapha Khan cannot eat it because the chicken was not killed in the sacred name of Allah; Tiblu cannot eat it because it was a black chicken and the Agarias offer black chickens to the Great Black Spirit of the iron-kilns; Nanas cannot eat it, because the Raj Gonds never eat animals with only two legs, though they take freely of those with four; our Brahmin cannot eat it because his section of Brahmins is vegetarian; Shamrao cannot eat it because he is trying to be a Gandhi man; and I cannot eat it because I have indigestion.

Passages from Leaves of the Jungle like the one just quoted were not written as a means of entry to an academic context, but Elwin's accounts of tribal life enabled him in October 1937 to obtain a paid appointment (100 R's a year) as a research associate of Sir D. J. Tate at the School of Social Studies at Bombay. He spent his first payment on a new typewriter and began to collect material for a full study of the Baiga tribe while at the same time living and working among them as the work of Gond Seva Mandal was extended. 106

A journalist of *The Evening News of India*, on 17 March 1939, having learned that Elwin was in Bombay and on his way to England announced that the former political activist had arrived 'with scholarly stoop ... and a roll of proofs in his hand - a properly learned work and liable to be as heavy as nine hundred pages can make it'. It was not the political dynamite they hoped for, but Elwin's first major anthropological study, although he had never read a word of anthropology before going to the Gond four years earlier. 107

The Baiga was widely acclaimed. J. H. Hutton, Professor of Social Anthropology at Cambridge, judged it 'incomparably the greatest work written on an Indian tribe'. Furer-Haimendorf agreed. 'No one has ever described an Indian tribe with so much sensitive intimacy, and from the moment of the publication of this important and elegantly written book Elwin had to be taken seriously by anthropologists'.

The purpose of Indian anthropology for Elwin was to inform literate Indians of the existence of tribal peoples, and of their way of life, so that they could integrate them into their nation-state. The purpose of his Franciscan and Gandhian poverty was to ensure that the tribal songs, dances, folk-tales, customs, ceremonies and beliefs of the poor were respected and preserved. The vernacular songs and tales arising from the poverty of St. Francis and of Richard Rolle had helped to form Italian and English national cultures, and tribal vernacular songs and tales could form part of an infinitely richer tapestry of Indian national culture. These could only be recorded by one who remained among the people he was both serving and studying. One side of his activity was to make sure the people had medicine to combat disease: the other to ensure that healthy tribal peoples could, if they wished, preserve their own form of sanity.

Those anthropologists who wanted to collect data for comparative studies, and to remain detached from the wider contexts in which tribal peoples lived, were reluctant to admit Elwin into their academic community. They saw him as romantic and unscientific: he saw them as dull and without vision. 'What inferior work these ethnographic people produce', he wrote to his sister. Thousands of pages of the great volumes of the Ethnographic Survey - Thurston, Risley, Renthoven, Anantakrishna, Iyer, Russell and Hiralal had failed to mention one song. Such anthropologists produced 'books of the dark half of the month; the light of the moon of

verse does not shine through them'. 111

(2) Expressing Franciscan and Gandhian Love in Journals and Newspapers. 'The work, the aim, and policy of our Ashram is love, and whatever love would do we are prepared to do'. The manner in which Elwin adapted the second Principle of St. Francis ashram, Love, in the context of St. Francis ashram and the mandals also led him towards anthropology.

Gandhi had left Sabarmati and handed it over to the untouchables, the outcasts, the harijans, 'God's people'. He was working from a new Ashram at Warda to obtain changes to their status. Elwin had told that Hindus had created the caste system and they only could change it. Instead, among tribal people, Elwin found in plenty those untouchables whom Francis had embraced: lepers. To begin with the eight or nine brothers that by 1932 had gathered at St. Francis ashram simply rejoiced that they had lepers as neighbours, that they could tend their sores in the Gond Seva Mandal dispensary and invite them into St. Francis ashram. In his diary of 18 January 1934 Elwin admitted:

Feel very pious at the sight of so many lepers in the ashram, but remind myself firmly that we are living in the twentieth century, and decide they must be sent home.

On 12 February, a practical experiment began: a refuge for five lepers. On 12 May, Ronald and Millicent Freeman, who had started another Third Order St. Francis ashram as an off-shoot of Christa Seva Sangha, came to visit. To Elwin, they seemed 'to know everything in the world about leprosy':

Ronald, with a sinister and modernist look in his eye, informs us that if the leper kissed by St. Francis was (as is most probable) an N case, there was no danger, as this type not contagious. St. Francis, however, would not have known this so act equally meritorious.

That Christmas Elwin told his correspondents that lepers came to their Christmas ceremony and sat on their separate mats to enjoy Devali lights. On 14 February 1936, there was rejoicing that Samala, a leper, was cured.

Elwin, however, recognised that people with far greater resources were needed to prevent, tend and cure leprosy than he could muster. His love for them could be shown by creating greater empathy for them - and that could increase the resources made available for their needs. Housman's play, in which he had portrayed how a leper felt before and after St. Francis embraced them, inspired his tactic. It was the complete opposite to that employed by all those writers of sacred biographies who related only how their subject, St. Francis, felt before and after he had touched a leper.

Elwin combined his first attempt, a novel about a tribal leper titled *Phulmat of the Hills*, with the need to raise money in the short term. It was, however, a financial and literary failure, probably because he tried to incorporate numerous allusions to the life-story of St. Francis – such as sweet-sour days – which only the most informed of readers would have been able to recognise. 114

Elwin's second attempt was scholarly - anthropological journals. After a number of brief 'communications' had been printed, he submitted an article in 1939 to the editor of *Man*, who published it. Elwin compared the dreams of lepers in a number of different tribes - Gonds, Raj-Gonds, Bharias, Bhumia-Baigas, and others - to see if tribal influences made any difference to their dreams. He found that all lepers dreamt about their rejection and the progress of their disease and their dreams:

Reveal all too clearly the sense of social and sexual frustration, the constant dread, the mental conflict, which is not the least of the miseries of this terrible disease. It's

Elwin's next attempts were designed to reach more people. He wrote for *The Illustrated News of India* and continued to flood editors with articles. As late as 1953, The Times of India published Elwin's article, 'On the first sight of leprosy discovered in an aboriginal girl'. He had by then been writing and supervising publications for twenty years, believing that they could be agents of social change.

(3) Taking Franciscan and Gandhian Obedience into a Nation. 'The allegiance of the brothers is bound only to Truth and Love'.

The Church of India in Elwin's view had not become 'characteristically Indian': it continued to be characteristically exclusive and racist. He described his non-racialist Franciscan vision very lightly in The Leaves of the Jungle:

I have to record a tragic event - the death of the youngest member of our ashram, Brother Rajah, who has been killed by a panther. Rajah was a true Franciscan, though I grieve to say he was never admitted to formal membership of the Church of England. His punctuality at meals, and his constant cheerfulness even after them, set an example to us all. I have never known anyone less tainted with race-prejudice.

In a letter of 24 July 1933 to Sorella Amata, Elwin acknowledged 'intense inner conflict'. He was 'deeply disappointed' and suffered 'physical pain' because of his inability to reconcile obedience to the 'truth' and to the Church of which he was a member. Since coming to India, studying Indian mystics, meeting an International Fellowship of all races, meeting Gandhi, meeting tribal people, he had found it increasingly hard to accept the exclusive claims which Christians made about Christ. Eighteen months later, on 2 November 1935, Elwin wrote 'what was for me a momentous letter' to the Metropolitan in Calcutta. He told Westcott that he could no longer be a priest or a communicant. The following year he signed a 'Deed of Relinquishment' under The Clerical Disabilities Act of 1870 relinquishing 'all rights, privileges, advantages and exemptions of my office as by law belonging to it'. 118

In pursuit of truth, Elwin had freed himself from the obedience he

had promised when he became a priest at Oxford. He had not formally left the Church of India, but it became of less importance to him. It was not an end, however, of obedience to his Franciscan principles or of St. Francis ashram. More Indians came to work at the mandal and the St. Francis ashram remained its nerve centre. Another branch of the Mandal was opened in early 1937 at Saubrwachlapur. The Deputy Commissioner came to the opening and two thousand people from more than thirty villages danced all night. 119

When Elwin was appointed Honorary Ethnographer of Bastar state, St. Francis ashram was given a new name, 'Bhumijan Seva Mandal' and while maintaining its Franciscan devotions and its original welfare work, it was also organised to be a research institute. Among the Saori, Elwin, for example, took down the incantations, prayers and travel-trances directly, squatting on the floor as near as possible to the officiating shaman. He published at a fast rate to raise money for the continuation of the welfare and research work and to raise consciousness of the 'truths' that tribal people held.

The outbreak of war and the 'Quit India' campaign produced 'a bad time for ethnographic work, there was suspicion all round'. Elwin in a letter typed to circulate among his friends confided that there are 'many things I would like to tell you but I am not a free man'.

There are things too sacred to talk of lightly - the fellowship of the brothers, the prayer at dawn and sunset, our little chapel of St. Francis, successive crises, Government, church, landlords, our ill health, our own spirits, have conspired towards the wrecking of our little ashram, but the love of the Poverello is with us... in an obscure and shunned corner of the world, far away from the so-called active, civilised and progressive part of mankind.

9. SUBSEQUENT EVENTS.

The year of 1939, which has been selected as the terminus for the

period studied in this thesis, marked a turn in Elwin's life towards an even stronger identification with India. In 1944, he was appointed Anthropologist to the Government of Orissa and in the same year awarded an Oxford Doctorate of Science. From 1946-49 he was Deputy Director of the Department of Anthropology at Calcutta, and after that he set up more research among tribal peoples. Bhumijan Seva Mandal became 'The Tribal Art Research Unit' - and still, Gandhian-Franciscan poverty continued. From the common purse each member could draw up to 250 R's a month IF HE REQUIRES IT [written as original].

In 1954, Elwin was invited by Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru to become Adviser for Tribal affairs to the North East Frontier Agency (NEFA). It was an important last stage of his life, for Elwin brought his values into the Indian administration of tribal territories. Nehru in 1957 in a Preface to Elwin's, A Philosophy for NEFA, (The North East Frontier Agency) wrote:

Verrier Elwin has done me the honour of saying that he is a missionary of my views on tribal affairs. ... It would be more correct to say that I have learnt from him rather than that I have influenced him in any way. 122

In the ten years that followed, Elwin received many tokens of the recognition of his valuable work. India honoured Elwin and Patel, who had sent Elwin to tribal people to live his Gandhian-Franciscan values, by inviting Elwin to deliver the Patel lectures in 1962 on Indian radio. The lectures, given less than two years before his death, were an expression of his values, *The Philosophy of Love*, delivered in a context which may have reached millions. More than one obituary suggested that India had seen 'Saintliness among Tribesmen'. 123

NOTES.

- 1. The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:2).
- 2. The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:15).
- 3. Lord Sankey's comment was written as a Foreword to Elwin's Leaves from the Jungle, to which reference will later be made. For a number of reasons, Sankey's Foreword was not used when the book was published. His drafted Foreword is now among 'The Sankey Papers' at the Department of Western Manuscripts, the Bodleian Library, Others shared Sankey's opinion of Elwin's ability. Gerald Sparrow in Land of the Moonflower wrote that 'After a brilliant career at Oxford, he (Elwin) had entered the Church to become the youngest head of an Oxford Ecclesiastical College. He had the certainty of rapid advancement in the Church of England, for he stood head and shoulders above his peers as a scholar and as a man'(1955:140). Gerald Sparrow was President of the Cambridge Union in 1925 while Elwin was at Oxford. The theme of Elwin's brilliance was prominent in a number of obituaries written after Elwin's death in 1964 and in reviews of The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, his posthumously published autobiography. W. G. Archer in The Daily Telegraph of 22 October 1964 wrote that 'He [Elwin] might have gone anywhere if he had stayed at home'. David George in the Indian and Foreign Review (New Delhi) of 15 October 1964 referred to 'that freakish Englishman [Elwin], the brilliance of whose eccentricities even Oxford could not dim'. C. H. V. Patty in Bharat Jyoti (Bombay) of 30 August 1964 suggested that 'had he cared for the ephemeral cakes of the world, Elwin could have amassed a fortune'.
- 4. Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin (1964:28-32). In this work, as in other writings throughout his life, Elwin referred in considerable detail to his study and practice of mysticism. For his Theology degree, he took a paper on mysticism, with special reference to William Law. His discussion of pseudo-Dionysus the Areopagite and Caeserius of Heisterbach was with 'Tommy Strong, the Bishop of Oxford'. Later, Elwin's study of mysticism informed his response to Gandhi and his work as an anthropologist.
- 5. St. Francis, the mystic, was not a dominant theme in British and North American literature during the period of the 1883-1926 revival of Franciscan studies. Indeed, it was because of a deficiency in this respect that D. H. S. Nicholson wrote *The Mysticism of St. Francis* (1923) in which he drew attention to the Saint's membership of 'the Open Secret Society of Mystics'. Nicholson captured well the variety of other ways in which St. Francis had been interpreted, and which Elwin rejected.

He [St. Francis] has been considered as an impassioned and far-sighted social reformer, as a great statesman, as an obedient son of the Church, as a semi-rebel whose mission was

to reform its more salient abuses, as a tender-hearted lover of animals and of all things that live, as an inspired poet, as man deeply imbued with knightly tradition, as a rather weak-minded if amiable enthusiast who did no great harm but certainly no great good, as a fanatic, as a mentally deranged neurasthenic; but, except for passing references, I have not been able to discover that he has been treated as a mystic. (1923:20)

Nicholson's comment: 'It must be a hard saying for the Church, that the kingdom of heaven is within, for she would have it believed, rather, that the kingdom is in her own keeping' (1923:78) summed up a problem with which Elwin was already wrestling.

- 6. Shelley, The Defence of Poetry. Peter Brooker and Peter Widdowson, (1986), in "A Literature for England" have discussed the forging of an English literary tradition which developed in this period.
- 7. Friedrich Heiler, The Spirit of Worship, (1926:114). Elwin made several references to Heiler in his later work.
- 8. Arseniev's, Mysticism and the Eastern Church, was translated in 1926 from the German by Arthur Chambers. Professor Heiler provided an outline of Arseniev's life and works. He suggested that Arseniev's study of mysticism should be set against his experience of the Russian Revolution, which had caused him to seek exile in Germany. Arseniev's 1926 text was reprinted in New York in 1979 by St. Vladimir's Seminary Press.
- 9. Elwin, St. Francis if Assisi. (1933:40).
- 10. B. H. Streeter and A. J. Appasamy (1921), The Sadhu: A Study in Mysticism and Practical Religion. The Sadhu's life, they wrote, 'as far as external conditions are concerned, resembles that of St. Francis of Assisi'. 'While we do not suggest that the Sadhu is on the same plane with St. Francis or St. Paul, we feel that, from having known him, we understand them better'.
- 11. Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:36).
- 12. J. C. Winslow, The Indian Mystic, (1926:45). There is every reason to believe that Elwin studied Winslow's book, and other of Winslow's papers printed in 1923 and 1924 for private circulation only. Elwin had a far greater grasp of Winslow's intentions than any of the other men who went to India in 1927.
- 13. Almost forty years later, after Elwin had been a citizen of an independent Indian nation for almost twenty years, he wrote, 'I do not believe that I have loved anything in the world all my life as much as I loved Oxford in those days.' He believed that he was for ever leaving the world of scholarship. The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:34).
- 14. Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:35). A postcard of Capel Curig bears the simple statement, 'The place that Elwin had his call'. The handwriting is that of Eldwyth, Elwin's sister. The India

Office 'Elwin Collection'.

- 15. Elwin's desire to make 'reparation' was commented upon by several reviewers of Elwin's autobiography. Christopher Wordsworth in The Observer (25 Oct. 1964) described Elwin's decision to leave Oxford as 'a flocculent act of reparation'. Raymond Mortimer in The Sunday Times (25 October 1964) carefully explained that 'reparation' must be understood 'in the theological sense of the term'. Manohar Malgonkar Hamilton in The Current Weekly of Bombay (4 July 1964) wrote that Elwin 'set out to apply the Catholic spiritual ideals of reparation'. It is likely that St. Francis's commission from the crucified Christ at the start of his new life, 'Repair my Church', was also in Elwin's mind.
- 16. Elwin, Leaves from the Jungle, (1957:viii).
- 17. Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:34-7).
- 18. The other activities of members of Christa Seva Sangha during 1927 were described in the previous chapter.
- 19. Sister Barbara Noreen, C. S. M. V., in A Wheat Grain Sown in India, has a more detailed account of the International Fellowship (n.d.:135).
- 20. Judith Brown in *Gandhi: Prisoner of Hope*, has written a full account of Sabarmati at this time (1989:204).
- 21. Elwin, Leaves from the Jungle, (1957:ix).
- 22. Elwin seemed never to tire of describing his first meeting with Gandhi. These quotations come from his autobiography and letters. Elwin's fullest account of how he saw Gandhi during the period 1928-1932 is in Kanu Desai's, Mahatma Gandhi: Sketches in Pen, Pencil and Brush, with an essay by Verrier Elwin, (1932). Elwin's essay a series of word pictures complemented Kanu Desai's drawings. The frequent use of the word 'beauty' reflected Elwin's study at the time of The Philokalia (Love of Beauty), a selection of spiritual writings collected by Orthodox Christians.
- 23. Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:42).
- 24. Elwin, Leaves from the Jungle, (1957:ix) and Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:54).
- 25. Judith Brown in *Gandhi: Prisoner of Hope* calculated that there were 133 men, 68 women, and 78 children at Sabarmati in the late 1920s. (1989:199).
- 26. Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:54). It is very likely that Elwin was reminded of the short note which St. Francis wrote to Brother Leo.
- 27. Elwin's letter to his mother of 31 February 1928.

- 28. There were a number of people in England who could have 'directed' Elwin as an aspiring Franciscan; but it is uncertain whether Andrews knew of them. There is no evidence, for example, to show whether or not he knew of James Adderley or of the Community of St. Francis, a Church of England Franciscan women's community. Andrews may have deliberately suggested a member of an Italian contemplative community because he anticipated that Elwin was going to have difficulties working out his relationship with the Church of England.
- 29. The correspondence between Elwin and the Sorelli in Italy has been preserved in The Elwin Collection, The India Office Library.
- 30. Elwin's letter to Sorella Amata of 12 March 1929.
- 31. Elwin's letter to Sorella Amata of 12 March 1929.
- 32. Elwin told Sorella Amata in his letter of 6 October 1929 that 'Miss Wyon came to our meeting (C.S.S.) on 27 August, 1929. 'Such a joy to meet her and to hear something of you and obtain her prayerhelp. Thank you for telling her about us'. There are no other records as far as I know of discussion between Elwin and Olive Wyon. Olive Wyon in 1929 could already have begun translating Ernst Troeltsch's The Social Teaching of the Christian Church, a work that wrestled with the mystical type of religion. Elwin quoted from this work later and was probably also influenced by Troeltsch's 'The Absoluteness of Christianity'.
- 33. Evelyn Underhill described the Confraternity of Spiritual Entente as a 'curiously strong little organisation'. (Quoted, Dana Greene, Evelyn Underhill, (1991:74). Evelyn Underhill wrote an article published in The Spectator, titled, "A Franciscan Hermitage", which was a description of Eremo Francescano, which Elwin published in the 1932 Christa Seva Sangha Review. Both Evelyn Underhill and Olive Wyon were close friends of Dorothy Swayne, another student of mysticism, who in 1933 became the first secretary of the present Third Order and involved it in a mystical\sect\church tension which it is beyond the scope of this thesis to discuss.
- 34. Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:47). The process by which Christa Seva Sangha became 'much more monastic' while Elwin was in England was described in the previous chapter.
- 35. Elwin, Religious and Cultural Aspects of Khadi.
- 36. Judith Brown, Gandhi: Prisoner of Hope, (1989:224).
- 37. In a letter to his sister dated 24 January 1930 Elwin wrote, 'I am preparing hard for the office of Abbot' clearly intended to be interpreted lightly, but an indication of the depth of change at Christa Seva Sangha.
- 38. Subhas C. Bose, The Indian Struggle: 1920-1934. (1935:202).

- 39. The complete text of the Declaration of Independence was quoted by Subhas C. Bose in *The Indian Struggle: 1920-1934* (1935:202-4). Elwin knew Bose and entertained him at Christa Seva Sangha.
- 40. P.G. Tendular, Mahatma: Life of Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi Vol.3, 1930-34. (1952:5).
- 41. Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:54,55).
- 42. Subhas C. Bose, The Indian Struggle: 1920-1934, (1935: Title of Chapter X.). Judith M. Brown, Gandhi: Prisoner of Hope, (1989:195).
- 43. This latter statement about 'a war of ideas' was developed by Elwin in Kanu Desai and Verrier Elwin, Mahatma Gandhi: Sketches in Pen, Pencil and Brush with an essay by Verrier Elwin, (quotation,1932:15). In 1933, Elwin wrote 'The Supremacy of the Spiritual' which extended his argument that the 'stakes' were ultimately spiritual values.
- 44. Hivale, The Scholar Gypsy, (1946:66).
- 45. Religious and Cultural Aspects of Khadi (1932).
- 46. Shamrao Hivale in *The Scholar Gypsy: A Study of Verrier Elwin* (1946) told of this incident with evident pride. Hivale wrote as Indian political Independence from Britain was about to be enacted and he wanted Elwin's contribution at an earlier stage to be recognised and recorded.
- 47. These incidents were vividly described by Hivale in The Scholar Gypsy: A Study of Verrier Elwin, (1946:84-88)
- 48. The Christa Seva Sangha Newsletter 1930.
- 49. Kanu Desai and Verrier Elwin, Mahatma Gandhi: Sketches in Pen, Pencil and Brush (1932:2). Elwin wrote that he 'tried to portray Mahatma Gandhi - in my own clumsy and stubborn medium - in the form in which he has touched my heart and helped me'. It is likely that Elwin's sketches of Gandhi were composed during 1930-1932. In 1933 he revealed that he had taken a lot of trouble with them. Originally published in India in 1932, the sketches were afterwards published in England. Elwin did not in this work compare Gandhi with St. Francis although he was already making this comparison. This could be because: (i) he was only just beginning to make his own comparison, extending the comparisons already suggested to him by C. F. Andrews and Winslow; (ii) he was writing primarily for Indian readers to whom St. Francis was not familiar; (iii) he did not wish to say anything that was not totally in agreement with the interpretation of Kanu Desai; (iv) he wanted Gandhi alone to be the subject of the work; (v) he was already working on a prose account that he intended for later publication.
- 50. Judith Brown, Gandhi and Civil Disobedience: The Mahatma in Indian Politics 1928-1934, (1977:191).

- 51. Antony Copley, Gandhi: Against the Tide, (1987:47).
- 52. The previous year Allen and Unwin had published books on India by C. F. Andrews and Sir George Younghusband. Andrews had pointed out an affinity between St. Francis and Gandhi. Younghusband wrote of the role of Indian mysticism in the formation of Indian nationalism. In his chapters Elwin enlarged their themes.
- 53. Elwin, in Jack Winslow and Verrier Elwin, The Dawn of Indian Freedom, (1930:45).
- 54. Dhanunjay Keer in Mahatma Gandhi: Political Saint and Unarmed Prophet, noted that during May 'the brother of the King of Bhutan, Father Verrier Elwin and Subhas Bose met Gandhi' (1973:547).
- 55. Shamrao Hivale, The Scholar Gypsy (1946:22).
- 56. Hivale and Elwin both recount this incident, but the letters exchanged were not mentioned.
- 57. Elwin's letter to Sorella Amata of 31 May 1931.
- 58. H. E. Allen in 1927 published Writings, ascribed to Richard Rolle, Hermit of Hampole, and materials for his biography. This was a vast work replete with information of every kind on Rolle and his writings, and included (pp.430-526) an outline of Rolle's life based on researches by the author and other scholars. David Knowles later wrote that 'While the materials are extremely valuable, Miss Allen has a tendency to treat as acquired fact what she has previously put forward as a probable reconstruction', (Footnote No.1 of Chapter IV, p.49 of The English Mystical Tradition.) Knowles would have made the same comment about Elwin's interpretation of Rolle. It is the originality of Elwin's argument relating Rolle and Indian mystics that is of most interest in his study. He could well have been studying Rolle's best-known work, The Fire of Love, when he wrote of fire to Sorella Amata.
- 59. Elwin quoted R. M. Clay The Hermits and Anchorites of England (1914) as his source. Francis D. S. Darwin in The English Medieval Recluse (n.d.) also discussed the distinction between a hermit and an anchorite. Being a hermit does not necessarily imply enclosure and staying in one place.
- 60. This view was expanded in The Supremacy of the Spiritual. Having claimed that to be Franciscan was to follow Christ, Elwin continued:

 The Christ of nineteenth-century humanitarianism, kindly, amiable, tolerable, bestowing the good things of life in his followers, is now recognised by scholars to be a portrait which, as Gibbon said of Pope's translation of Homer, was endowed with every merit save that of likeness to the original, (1933:2).
- 61. Gandhi visited Mrs. Elwin and met English supporters of Christa Seva Sangha while he was in England. It seems likely that his intervention enabled Elwin's family to accept Elwin's decision. The

consequences were, of course, not apparent at this stage.

- 62. See Lawrence Housman, *The Little Plays of St. Francis.* 'Brother Sun' tells the story of the visit of Francis to the Sultan and makes this point clearly.
- 63. Christa Seva Sangha Review, (1931).
- 64. Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:59)
- 65. Elwin's to Sorella Amata of 14 November 1931.
- 66. Letters were frequently exchanged between Elwin and Sorella Amata throughout November and December 1931. He told her in a letter of 2 December 1931, 'your letters have been a fountain of strength to me'.
- 67. D.V. Tahmankar, Sardar Patel, (1970:18). This biographer emphasised Patel's 'extraordinary powers of organisation' and the 'decisive part' he played in the emergence of the Indian nation. In 1929 Patel had worked among the poor of Gujarat and had taken Elwin, while he was still at Christa Seva Sangha, to the villages.
- 68. Elwin, St. Francis Ashram, (n.d.:2).
- 69. Shamrao Hivale, The Scholar Gypsy (1946:23). Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:59).
- 70. A leaflet headed, St. Francis Ashram. Not dated, but almost certainly printed in 1933.
- 71. Subhas C. Bose, The Indian Struggle, (1935:268).
- 72. Elwin described this night fully in The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin (1964: 65-69). The incident is reported and the letter quoted also by Shamrao Hivale, in The Scholar Gypsy: A Study of Verrier Elwin (1946) and by D.G.Tendulkar, Mahatma: Life of Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi. Vol.3. (1953). It is printed also in The Collected Works of Mahatma Gandhi, Vol. 49, p. 4. The handwritten letter is held in The Elwin Collection at The India Office Library and Records in London.
- 73. Elwin's letter to Sorella Amata of 31 January 1932.
- 74. Official statistics, quoted Subhas Bose, The Indian Struggle, (1935:271).
- 75. Elwin kept this vow, only wearing shoes on occasional town visits. His bare feet were mentioned in a number of obituaries
- 76. At the close of a leaflet written to be distributed later that year in England, Elwin said visitors were welcome at the ashram. He gave directions: Visitors can reach Karanjia either from Jubbulpore (by train to Mandla, bus to Dindori, horse or bullock cart for forty miles to Karanjia) or via Bilaspur on the main Calcutta-Bombay line. This

is the easiest way. Take the train from Bilaspur to Pendra Road, and carriers will be sent to bring you the twenty-five miles over the mountains to Karanjia. Or you can come by car from Pendra Road, thirty-three miles over a broken road.

- 77. Norval Mitchell's manuscripts at the Indian Office Library and Records [MSS Eur D 944] provide an interesting contrast with Elwin's description of the Gond. In a draft manuscript titled, Years that have Ended, Mitchell recorded that the 'so-called Gonds were always in the drunken brawl category' (1931:61).
- 78. Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:106-8). Leaves from the Jungle, (1932:41).
- 79. Elwin, The Truth about India: Can We Get It? Introductory: What Britain Believes, (1932:14).
- 80. A statement prepared for Presentation to Parliament in accordance with the requirements of the 26th Section of the Government of India Act for the year 1931-32 published in 1933 noted that after Gandhi's return from the Round Table Conference:

The correspondence that ensued was so important and has been given so much prominence in certain quarters that it must be described in some detail; as it is also reproduced in full in the appendix. (1933:32. Appendix: 231-238).

This was published after Elwin had printed the letters in The Truth About India: Can We Get It?

- 81. Elwin, The Truth About India: Can We Get It? Appendix by Pandit M. M. Malaviya, (1932:88).
- 82. George Allen and Unwin had already published C. F. Andrews, India and the Simon Report (1930), and Winslow's and Elwin's, The Dawn of Indian Freedom, (1931).
- 83. The India Bulletin was edited by Peter Adison and Reginald Reynolds. Elwin had been reprimanded at Poona for entertaining Reynolds at Christa Seva Sangha.
- 84. Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin (1964:79). The complicated process of negotiation about the passport is described more fully in letters to Sorella Amata.
- 85. Shamrao Hivale has inserted a photograph of the original letter in *The Scholar Gypsy*. The full text is in Elwin, *The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin* (1964:81). Elwin told Sorella Amata of his distress in a letter of 23 July 1932.
- 86. Elwin, The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin, (1964:81).
- 87. Elwin's letter to Sorella Amata of 30 July 1932 contained the request for this novena.

- 88. The Award was announced on 14 August 1932.
- 89. Unable to reach Gandhi who received news of this announcement in prison, Elwin wrote again to Sorella Amata. "You are just two and a half times as old, five times as wise, ten times as good . . ." he began.
- 90. This letter is printed in full in *The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin*, (1964:83).
- 91. Hugh Tinker's description in The Ordeal of Love: C. F. Andrews and India. (1979:259).
- 92. Gandhi's letter to Elwin of 5 October 1932.
- 93. The archives of the World Council for Mission list a letter from "Lord Irwin re Elwin" at this time. Unfortunately, it seems to be missing from the microfiche copy of the archives held at The School of African and Oriental Studies, London.
- 94. The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin (1964:82). Elwin tactfully suggested he had a few friends working behind the scenes. Sir Francis Younghusband later remarked: 'I will always be thankful to Sam Hoare for one thing at least, that he forced Elwin from politics to poetry'. Elwin from now on maintained contact with both Lord Sankey and Sir Francis Younghusband.
- 95. Gandhi wrote to Sorella Amata on 24 November 1932 to say Elwin had returned safely. He was sorry that he had not managed to fit a visit to her convent in his schedule during the Round Table Conference. 'But that is of no moment. It is the spirit that matters and I always have Verrier's spirit with me'.
- 96. Elwin, Leaves from the Jungle, (1958:51). Entry for 29 November, 1932.
- 97. Elwin's correspondence with Sorella Amata is held at the India Office Library and Records in London. His correspondence with Gandhi is held at Gandhi Smarak Nidhi, New Delhi. Nine letters exchanged with Gandhi were printed with permission in Bhabugrahi Misra's Verrier Elwin: A Pioneer Indian Anthropologist. (1973: Appendix A, pp. 116-126). Misra makes little reference to them. They were sent to him in North America, and the way he has relegated them to an Appendix makes it look as if Misra felt obliged to acknowledge them but did not know how to use them. This is understandable, because they deal with very personal matters. Further, since Misra in the first instance wrote his monograph as a thesis for a Ph.D. in anthropology, assessing Elwin as an anthropologist, it was also a sensitive way of handling them.
- 98. The Ashram of St. Francis, Karanjia (n.d.:4).
- 99. Elwin's letter to Sorella Amata of 30 March 1932.
- 100. Elwin's letter to Mrs. Elwin of 10 August 1935.

- 101. The problem for Mrs. Waddy could be compared with a situation described by Dennis Kincaid in 1938. Having observed that in the nineteenth century questions of precedence were 'baffling enough', Kincaid described the even more baffling problems in 1938 in arranging a dinner party. 'There were such difficult questions as the status of a Nominated Member of the Council of State vis -a- vis an Army dentist holding the rank of captain; or whether the sister of a Bishop preceded the wife of an M.B.E., or whether an A.D.C. to the Nizam would sit on the right or left of the hostess when the Siamese consul had also been invited; or what on earth one did with all these cold weather tourists who had no conceivable status and yet hated being sent to dinner after a black Jesuit physiologist.' Kincaid, British Social Life in India: 1608-1937 (1938:215).
- 102. Elwin's letter to Sorella Amata of 13 November 1932.
- 103. Elwin, St. Francis of Assisi, (1933:2 and 1957:viii). "'I told one of our Evangelical ladies,' Eldyth writes, 'that my brother had written a life of St. Francis. But, said she, looking at me in a cow-like manner, I understood that the life of St. Francis had been written some time ago.'" Elwin, 1933: Entry for October 8th. (1933:81).
- 104. Elwin, Leaves from the Jungle, (1957:xx).
- 105. Elwin, Leaves from the Jungle, (1957:122). Entry for October 20th. 1934.
- 106. Elwin afterwards in *The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin*, (1964:149) described his field work methods. He made reference to St. Francis. [Italics added to the quotation below].

The next morning, I was standing in the forest when a large pig lumbered up to me with a leaf in its mouth which it dropped at my feet. I was rather moved by this - sort of Francis among the birds touch, I thought - and then forgot all about it. But no sooner had I returned home than I went down with a violent attack of fever. The local magicians waited on me, and soon diagnosed the cause - the witch of Bohi, annoyed at my presence in the village, had put magic in a leaf and sent it to me by her pig. They immediately took the necessary measures and I recovered.

- 107. Elwin squeezed a message for the British into the text of *The Baiga*. According to various members of the Baiga tribe was Gandhi was 'a great and powerful raja', 'a very rich man who has made a lot of money fighting the English' When the English 'put handcuffs on his hands they turned into flowers and fell off, and when they put him in jail, he flew away in a chariot over the wall'. *The Baiga*, (1939:74).
- 108. J. H. Hutton suggested also that 'the most important part of Mr. Elwin's work is probably to be found in that part of his book which deals with the future'. (Foreword;xxiv). Already Elwin was rebelling against the argument that anthropologists were only academics, not advisers about policies.

- 109. C. von Furer-Haimendorf, "Obituary of Verrier Elwin." Man: A Record of Anthropological Science. (1964:114)
- 110. Elwin wrote a great many anthropological articles as well as books, many of them after 1939. Some of these have been listed in the bibliography. An almost complete list and an appraisal can be found in M. C. Pradhan et al. (1969), Anthropology and Archaeology: Essays in Commemoration of Verrier Elwin.
- 111. Verrier Elwin and Shamrao Hivale, Folk-Songs of the Maikal Hills, (1944:intro, p.xiv).
- 112. Ronald Freeman, who had started another Franciscan ashram among lepers, died very shortly after this from leprosy at the age of 33.
- 113. Doubtless, the brothers at St. Francis Ashram remembered St. Francis's reprimand to his brothers when lepers were taken to Church. They must be sensitive to everyone's feelings at public worship. Elwin wrote poems about lepers for his Christmas cards and sent photographs of individual lepers to his friends. He asked for money specifically for named lepers.
- 114. There is no evidence to suggest that was in imitation of Adderley's methods although it is possible. Phulmat, young and beautiful, visited Julan, a Pardhan, with 'kind, humorous, inquisitive eyes' who for thirty years had been arbiter of tribal customs, but latterly had contracted leprosy. He knew 'Sour-Sweet Days' (a chapter title reflecting St. Francis's experience of embracing a leper usually translated as 'bitter-sweet') such as those when Phulmat visited him, but then left him. Elwin's picture of St. Clare may have also been incorporated into this story. At the time he wrote it, English women had recently arrived to join St. Francis ashram.
- 115. The 1936 Report of the Proceedings of the Royal Anthropological Institute, for example, published 'a summary of a communication from Mr. Elwin about dreams of Baigas' in Man, in Jan. 1937.
- 116. Verrier Elwin, "Dreams of Indian Aboriginal Lepers".
- 117. Elwin, Leaves from the Jungle, (1957; Foreword, xxvi)
- I was deeply, almost passionately religious and was specially attached to the mystical aspects of the Catholic religion and to that Christian Neo-Platonism which in its attachment to the Good, the True and the Beautiful, rises above communal and credal restrictions ... My contact with Mahatma Gandhi and his followers ... made it impossible to believe that there was only one way to heaven. (1957:xxvii).
- 119. Elwin's letter to his mother of 26 April 1937.

- 120. The emphases and values that were going to guide the research at the Institute were evident from the names of its patrons Bishop Walter Carey, Lawrence Housman, Sir Francis Younghusband, and Lady Gowan were well-known for their pursuit of truth in folk, poetic, mystical, and artistic contexts.
- 121. Bulletin No. 1 of Bhumijan Seva Mandal, March 1942.
- 122. Jawaharlal Nehru in Foreword to *A Philosophy for NEFA*, dated 16 February, 1857.
- 123. Robert Mortimer used the phrase, 'Saintliness Among the Tribesmen' as a title for his review of *The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin*, published after Elwin's death. *The Sunday Times*, 18 October 1964.

CHAPTER SEVEN.

CONCLUSIONS.

Some sociologists, working within the sociology of religion and outside it, are suggesting that one of the ways forward for the discipline could be to study how people in advanced industrial societies use religious resources. In so far as this thesis has examined how a religious resource was taken from its religious anchorage in the Roman Catholic Church, placed in other public arenas, and retrieved and used by members of the Church of England to form religious organisations, it has been a small contribution in this direction.

In Part One, I traced how Catholics and 'others' produced Franciscan resources from which Franciscan values could be taken. Particular attention was given to the period from 1882 to 1926. In Part Two, I related four narratives. They explained how and why James Adderley, Emily Marshall, John Winslow and Verrier Elwin, in their different contexts, came to have access to some of these Franciscan resources, how and why they came to form Franciscan values from them, and how and why the outcomes of embryonic Anglican Franciscan Third Orders were reached.

1. THE THEORETICAL MAIN PLOT.

The narratives were designed to tell coherent sociological stories. They have explained how it came to be that the selection of Franciscan values varied according to social contexts. This main

Conclusions. 307

theoretical plot was plainly interwoven into the narratives, and here it will receive only brief comment, so that more attention may be given to the sociological sub-plots. The organising principle of the discussion of the main plot will be the categories of resources used earlier, but organised into four groups for the sake of brevity.

First, the resource of time, which was of importance. The observed wave of Franciscan revival, evident from the constructed resources, was set in a historical period. Sight of it could be discerned in 1882 and it peaked in 1926. Some years had more significance than others: (1) 1882/3 in which Leo XIII made his propositions for a Roman Catholic Franciscan revival (ii) 1893/4 in which Paul Sabatier made his counter-propositions of a man for all humanity (iii) 1926 in which the seventh centenary of St. Francis's death was celebrated. They were 'Franciscan years'.

There was a direct relationship between what was constructed in public arenas and the emergence of Anglican Franciscan Third Orders. It is instructive that the first four known attempts to form Anglican Franciscan Third Orders since the Protestant Reformation began between the years 1882 and 1926. The 'Franciscan years' had particular significance in their development. (i) Each took note of Leo XIII's propositions. (ii) The two organisations being formed while Sabatier's proposition was being examined in 1893/4 were profoundly influenced by it. Both Adderley and Miss Marshall met him. His thesis had an indirect impact on the latter organisations in India. (iii) Miss Marshall had died ten years before 1926, but the year was of great importance in the structuring of the other three organisations. It was Adderley's signal to hand the fostering of an English Franciscan movement and Franciscan organisation into other hands; and it marked a

major turning point for both Winslow and Elwin.

The uses of the Franciscan resource in time are, however, more complex than this matching of dates. In England, the Franciscan resources from which Franciscan values could be taken were associated primarily with two earlier periods of history: (a) Italy in the thirteenth century (b) England in the Pre-Reformation and therefore pre-industrial period.

Quite explicitly, the four founders all looked back. There were marked differences which stemmed from interest in (a). This depended on whether the founders were most drawn to the life span of Francis before his canonisation in 1228 or to the period after it in which the Franciscan churches and other resources were constructed. Further differences stemmed from their attitudes towards the developed Franciscan cultus and the formal organisation of the Franciscan Order in Pre-Reformation England and their view of its diminution.

The differences in their interpretations of St. Francis and of Franciscan Third Orders depended in great measure, however, upon those other historical periods in which each had interest. Adderley looked back to the origins in the thirteenth century. After Sabatier found the Third Order Rule in Capistrano, he wrestled with the problems of the institutionalisation of the original Third Order. He also linked his experience in East London with the English friars who had lived in England's pre-industrial urban areas. His other referents were wideranging, including the 'feast of Stephen' and the Communist Manifesto. Miss Marshall's referents were periods before the Roman dominance of Western Christianity: the Patristic period, and that of St. Cuthbert, a Celt, who had adjusted to Roman practice. She associated St. Francis with them.

Winslow linked the little group who first gathered around Francis with the little group which gathered at the ashram in Ahmednagar. For Winslow there was no separation of Orders in the social origins of both groups. He linked the Franciscan movement which flowed from Assisi with 'the fresh movement' of the nineteenth-century revival of Indian bhakti devotion. Others who came to join him at Christa Seva Sangha, on the other hand, were seeking to restore to the Church of England the Catholicism and the Religious Orders it had before the Protestant Reformation. Pre-Reformation England was also important for Elwin, but he looked back to Richard Rolle and the hermits who had once been 'bhakti' in England.

Second, the founders took values from Franciscan landscape, topography and buildings which they associated with other landscapes, topographies and buildings. Adderley, after easily raising money for St. Frideswide's, never again devoted energy to erecting church buildings. The simplicity of St. Francis's hovel at Rivo Torto had far more appeal for rebuilding God's people. Miss Marshall lived in St. Cuthbert country. The topographical arrangement of towns and villages of the North East separated by vast stretches of rural scenery amid which St. Cuthbert walked had for her a resemblance to Umbria. After the difficulty of raising money for St. Hilda's, she had no wish to devote energy to the construction of church buildings.

Winslow was a poet and, assisted by C. F. Andrews, he found poetic connections in India with St. Francis's landscape. He wanted to replace the grand buildings of the 'Raj' with something simpler. Elwin built a little chapel surrounded by flowers and decorated with animals. None of the founders was greatly inspired by the double church in Assisi as a building, but all seem to have been attracted to some of the scenes

painted by Giotto. Surprisingly though, only Miss Marshall made mention of Franciscan art as a major resource.

Each recognised that St. Francis and Franciscans had transformed topographies. For Miss Marshall, it was cottages and homes. For Adderley, it was towns. For Winslow, it was villages. For Elwin, it was hermitages, in which vernacular national cultures and languages, represented in *The Little Flowers* and Rolles's *Fire of Love* had come to birth.

Third, each of the founders came to use Franciscan texts as resources for their values. The difference in their availability is evident if the experiences of the former pair of founders in obtaining access to them is compared with the latter pair. Miss Marshall had to 'scour' the continent of Europe: Elwin, familiar with the products of the past, had to look beyond England and Europe to find scholars with new and challenging interpretations of St. Francis.

In each of the organisations, there were some difficulties arising from different interpretations of the Franciscan story among those involved in the organisations. This was most apparent at Christa Seva Sangha in 1928 when there were two quite distinct parties: those who followed Father Cuthbert's Roman Catholic and traditionalist thesis, and those who followed Sabatier's Protestant and modernist thesis.

However, it was not only differences of interpretation of texts concerning St. Francis which governed the differences between the founders and those with whom they interacted. The view of each was modified by their other interests and the texts associated with them.

Adderley linked Franciscan texts with the popular literature of the 'new reader'. He eschewed the style of Stephen, the author of Essays in Ecclesiastical Biography, who nevertheless inspired him. Miss Marshall

connected Franciscan Third Order texts with texts pertaining to the diaconate, which confused many of her clerical correspondents, who could not see her stepping stones. Winslow compared Franciscan texts with Indian texts. Elwin's range included mystical, political and anthropological studies.

Finally, none of the founders sat down and said, 'Let there be an Anglican Franciscan Third Order'. None took the Roman Catholic models of Franciscan Third Orders as their first inspiration. Instead, they took their organisational ideas and values from other sources. These were varied. This category of resource which they took from their differing social contexts strongly influenced the differences in the organisations.

The existing models of Franciscan Third Orders were not powerful influences, so others models could be. Adderley took the print community of *The Clarion* and its Fellowship as one of his main models. The Clapham Sect was another, but he took care not to acquire a similar name. Miss Marshall took the early diaconate, the Sunderland evangelists and the White Cross Army for three of hers. Winslow merged ideas from a number of Indian ashrams, but was especially influenced by the interpretation of this form of organisation which he acquired from N. V. Tilak. Elwin was particularly influenced by Gandhi's ashrams at Sabaramati and Wardha, the mandal in the Bhils tribal land and the convent at which Sorella Amata lived in Trevi.

Each of the founders envisaged their organisations as parts of wider social movements into which they incorporated their Franciscan movements. Each saw Franciscan values as constituents of other social movements: women's movements, socialist movements, nationalist movements, and movements towards global spirituality.

2. THEORETICAL SUB PLOTS.

The data which have been organised into narratives to relate how four people came to found Anglican Franciscan Third Orders could be used to tell any number of other sociological stories. While examining closely how people came to see, value and understand a religious figure of the past, this thesis has also been examining society. The data provide possibilities for building, modifying or demolishing any number of sociological hypotheses.

We can usefully review just a few explanatory theories which I have used as hypotheses and relegated to 'sub-plots'. The narrative method has shown that none taken singly provides a convincing theoretical plot for explaining the social situations and the life-histories which led to the outcomes of Anglican Franciscan Third Orders. All can offer some insights.

The founders were influenced by their childhood experiences.

Emily Marshall responded to her birth into a family of five daughters,

Adderley reacted to the politics of his influential father, Winslow

rejected the ethos of a school which serviced the Raj, and Elwin escaped

from the control of his widowed mother and her evangelical brand of

religion. These childhood influences do not, however, provide a

sociological explanation of all the subsequent events. Why should being

a 'superfluous' middle-aged spinster take Miss Marshall to Assisi? Why

should a famous father, who was a Tory cabinet minister, drive Adderley

to writing stories? Why should unhappiness at Eton persuade Winslow to

compose indigenous liturgies? Why should an evangelical upbringing and

a widowed mother lead Elwin to become an anthropologist?

It could be argued that the four founders were all seeking a distinctive identity or social role, both as individuals and for other

people. This could be, according to one interpretation, because of dissatisfaction with what they had received and acquired from their families, their education and their present occupations. It could, on the other hand, be because they realised that the personal identity and social role which they enjoyed was denied to others. Miss Marshall was seeking a spiritual and ministerial identity for herself and a social role for herself and other women. Adderley was seeking a spiritual and political identity for himself and a political role for the working class. Winslow was seeking a global spirituality for himself, but much more, he was seeking recognition for the validity of Indian spirituality. Elwin sought an identity which accorded with his changed beliefs and a role for himself as an author as well as respect for the aboriginals in pluralist India.

Or it could be argued, each was, at least partially, conditioned in what they were able to do in the process of forming organisations by the given factors of their social status. Socially-ascribed status roles, such as those derived from gender and family, for example, were both opportunities and constraints. Being a single woman of independent means in late-middle age, and 'a lady of the vicarage' in a North Eastern industrial town, was a social opportunity for Miss Marshall; it gave her social access in the dining room to the company of an unmarried Bishop not much older than herself. After Lightfoot's death, her allotted status 'subordinate' to Canon Body and the parish clergy was a constraint. Adderley's aristocratic birth was advantageous to him in his giving publicity to the plight of London's paupers, but it effectively led readers to miss the central message of Stephen Remarx because they read it as his autobiography, not as a challenge to themselves.

Changing the argument slightly, it is often the case with the formation of new organisations, that the founders are members of a social class and a profession accustomed to taking responsibility and to initiating or impeding social changes. This was so in the case of the three male founders. For each it had two effects. Elwin had the advice of eminent Indian nationalists when he decided to leave Christa Seva Sangha; but he could not avoid the power of authority as it was applied to his British passport.

Eton and Balliol affiliations, and ordination, enabled Winslow to submit a plan for liturgical changes to a Lambeth Conference; but another result was that some of his peers labelled his desire to 'be an Indian to Indians' as 'going native' thus releasing them from any obligation to listen to him. This had previously been true of Adderley: he was invited at a young age to speak at The Church Congress, but afterwards those whose social mores he had offended labelled him 'a black sheep' and a 'rolling stone', impotent to affect contemporary events. Miss Marshall was angry that despite having read more theology than many of the clergy, being a woman without ordained status, she was unable to enter into public debate with Bishop Westcott.

Theorists who look for the roots of organisations in evidence of personal and social strains in immediate localities could claim that strains were present in all four cases. Adderley came to believe that the invasion and settlement of Oxford gentlemen in Bethnal Green had done little to answer The Bitter Cry of the Outcast London. He felt the strain of being suspended between two cultures, and took refuge in living among the paupers. He then recognised that Henson, the poorly paid and the unemployed suffered strains because of their different levels of relative or absolute poverty. Later, there was strain between

Adderley and the other members of the Society of the Divine Compassion as they assessed the merits of a 'regular' local ministry in Plaistow and an 'irregular' dispersed ministry.

Having observed the domestic effects of different forms of industrial stoppages in three Sunderland parishes, Miss Marshall was convinced of the unsuitability of the old system of district visiting and of the new methods of investigating relief. Her personal anxiety about hundreds of women being asked to act as agents of espionage among the poor was contributory to her organisational Suggestion that the ministry of the diaconate should be again be available to women. It was, in part, the strain of her position in the diocese of Durham which made her decide to visit Assisi.

Winslow came to feel the strain of being associated with the Christianity of the 'Raj' while assessing Indian ashram experiments, especially at Ahmednagar, in the company of Tilak, a former Brahmin.

C. F. Andrews recognised the strain Elwin would meet on his return to India after his illness and found him an Italian spiritual director.

Gandhi, while in prison, recognised the strain imposed on Elwin at Christa Seva Sangha because of his Sabarmati experience. It was the strains of his position at Karanjia and that of the lepers who he tended which persuaded Elwin to write about the ashram and the lepers.

Examining the situations of the founders from another viewpoint, it could be argued that they were responding to perceived and real strains within the Church of England and the Anglican Communion.

Adderley responded to the insular parochial organisation of the Church of England which kept the poor and powerless parishioners of East London and the rich and influential parishioners of West London insulated from each other. Miss Marshall responded to the pressure placed on the

parochial system by rapid population growth in Sunderland and to the consequent difficulty of paying clergy from limited diocesan resources. Winslow and Elwin were both seeking forms of Indian organisation to replace the Englishness which an Independent Anglican Province of the Church of India would otherwise inherit.

Another way of interpreting their organisations could lead to an argument about the concept of community. Each of the organisations was a reflection of the tension between the concept of a local residential community and that of a network which transcended residential localities. Adderley wanted 'irregulars' to be in an irregular and dispersed communicative network and Miss Marshall wanted an organisation which resembled the White Cross Army, which united an intentional community of ideals and commitment, rather than a neighbourhood group. Winslow's ashram theory was that of dispersed community with a centre in a guru. Some of its members would be in the hills and others would be submerged in their households and places of work. Only a nucleus would be at the place of the guru. Elwin sought to draw people across India and in Britain into the concerns of a local community by ensuring there were watchmen outside it to preserve it.

The founders and their organisations, another theory would suggest, were little more than puppets in the emergence of vast global changes. Systemic changes in society on a far larger scale than that of the local environment or the Anglican Communion shaped their actions. Miss Marshall in 1889, an important year in women's movements, embodied a challenge to male dominance which could be plotted across North America and Britain. Hers was one of the many faces of feminism. Adderley was representative of one of the many shades of socialism, which took numerous organisational forms at this time.

Although an unusual example because he was white-skinned, Winslow was nevertheless merely one of numerous signals of unrest in India caused by white imperialism. Elwin was little more than a representative of those thousands who could no longer honestly hold traditional credal beliefs. He exemplified those who were confused as they sought ways of living harmoniously with those of different beliefs in pluralist societies.

Viewed from a quite opposite perspective, it could be argued that the founders were pioneers of major global changes, which have not yet been completed. They were crusaders, initiators of pressure groups, or of prophetic, reforming or self-help organisations. They were inspired virtuosi who showed what the world could be like. Or, they were 'romantics' who, as Elwin claimed, grasped the vital and unchanging essentials in a vast war of ideas. Or, they were 'fools', after the pattern of St. Francis, who challenged accepted values. They showed in their initiatives how micro events could affect the institutional structures of long duration.

Against this view, it could be argued that these people responded to the suggestions of other people. Explanations should never be attributed to the thought and action of a single individual. There is, it could be argued, no such person as a 'founder'. Had Bishop Lightfoot not been Bishop of Durham while Miss Marshall lived in Durham diocese, she would never have thought of founding a Third Order. Had Dr. Mason not replied to Adderley's advertisement asking for people who wanted to be friars to contact him, Adderley might never have thought of a Franciscan Third Order. Had C. F. Andrews not been devoted to St. Francis, and Robertson not wanted to restore Franciscan Orders to the Anglican Communion, Christa Seva Sangha might not have become overtly

Franciscan. Had Elwin in the 1926 centenary year not heard Arseniev, Heiler and Winslow lecture at Oxford, had he not enjoyed Housman's friendship, he might have been drawn preeminently to some other mystic.

On the other hand, it could be argued that it was the social actions of people at the head of hierarchical structures which were of importance, especially in shaping the organisations. Although bishops were not the founders, it could be argued that they determined what happened. Thus, Bishops Gore, Westcott and Creighton influenced Adderley. Miss Marshall's plan was inspired by Bishop Lightfoot, upset by Bishop Westcott and finally accepted by Bishop Moule, respectively, three Bishops of Durham. It was the consecration of her brother-in-law as Bishop of Guiana, and his subsequent election as Metropolitan of the West Indies which kept her organisation vigourous in a Province of the Anglican Communion. Bishops Azariah, Palmer, and Wood guided the actions of the founders in India.

Or, selecting another theoretical choice, a case could be made that the organisations were influenced by what other people were doing in political spheres. Adderley was in Poplar at the time of the dock strike and in West Ham at the time of the election of the first. Socialist Member of Parliament. Ben Tillet and Keir Hardie were his political tutors. Miss Marshall made her Suggestion in the year in which women's suffrage was a political issue and learnt about the Franciscan Third Order because Leo XIII had written his answer to the influence to Freemasonry in an encyclical.

Winslow began his ashram after the shooting at Amritsar. Elwin was 'acting abbot' at Christa Seva Sangha when Gandhi led the Salt March to Dandi. The replacement of Lord Irwin as Viceroy by Lord Willingdon, and the actions of both Sir Samuel Hoare, Secretary of State for India,

and Lord Sankey, the Lord Chancellor, had far reaching consequences for Elwin's experiment in Karanjia. The Quit India campaign nearly 'ruined' his St. Francis ashram.

Another way of explaining what happened would be to say that each defined a problem and set about finding a rational way to solve it. The Franciscan organisations which came into being were the result of the founder's purposive activities in which they made the most of their opportunities. Adderley wanted to change the structures of Western society and to replace unbridled capitalism with Socialism because this was how he interpreted the teaching of Jesus and St. Francis. He kept a Franciscan Third Order title from public view, not least because his purpose differed from the more conservative Pope, Leo XIII. He knew too that the Bishops who sanctioned formal structures would have difficulty in accepting an extra-parochial organisation guided by 'the Spirit of Truth'.

Miss Marshall came to found a Franciscan Third Order because it was more likely to be accepted by the Church of England into its structures than the female diaconate, at least in the short term. Winslow opted to be midwife to the Church of India, and in the process came to be the founder of a Franciscan-inspired ashram, afterwards respecting the newly-independent child's right to rational self-determination. Elwin acted rationally as he made choices to ensure that the aboriginal tribes would be recognised as contributors to the pluralist culture of a modern nation state.

Each it could be contended was in one way or another responding to the processes of bureaucracy. Miss Marshall studied the parochial, deanery, diocesan, provincial and inter-provincial structures of the Church of England and the Anglican Communion, and worked to become part of them because she saw no other way of her Suggestion being accepted. Adderley, on the other hand, was impressed by the tactics of the Clapham Sect, the Clarion Fellowship and groups that spent little time at meetings. Bureaucracy was only acceptable to Adderley if it liberated. He recommended people should read White Papers in periods of prayer which could for Christians precede social action. Winslow wanted to ensure that the Church of India, despite the needs imposed by geographical size, should maintain fluid organisations traditional to her culture. On the other hand, he saw the inefficiency of maintaining separated churches in a land in which Christianity was a minority religion. Elwin wanted to preserve tribal identity as expressed in songs and folk tales, but became 'a bureaucrat' in N.E.F.A. in order to guide the necessary legislation.

It could be claimed that the shape of the organisations came from the obstacles with which the founders had to contend. Adderley had to contend with the assumption that with the formation of the Society of the Divine Compassion he had founded a 'brotherhood', and that after he had left it, he had 'given up'. He had to cope with the expectation that he would write for graduates, not for the readers of inexpensive and light literature, and the consequent dismissal of his efforts. These factors seem to have made him more determined to follow his chosen Miss Marshall had to overcome the obstacle of parochial autonomy path. of which Canon Body became the spokesperson. She used the postal system to cross parochial boundaries, but this conditioned the subsequent pattern and form of organisation. Winslow's ashram was in his view halted in its development by those who brought the West with them to the East. Elwin's major obstacle was lack of funds, and this circumstance in great measure led him to publish in a genre which made money.

Contingently, this shaped the ashram, and also his reputation as anthropologist because his social position was unlike those who enjoyed academic tenure at universities.

Alternatively, the focus of explanation could be on the real or symbolic boundaries in various sectors of society which the founders tested in forming their organisations. Their actions revealed some of the hidden shibboleths of the Anglican Communion, for instance. Bishop Creighton of London told Adderley that he had strayed beyond the pale with his popularising of the sacred, but Adderley tested that boundary by continuing to defy the accepted conventions with his 'penny-a-line effusions', finally presenting Gospel stories in cartoons. Within all the organisations, but especially the Indian organisations, the boundaries of dialogue within Christianity were tested. All the parties learnt in the process where their own boundaries were.

Both Winslow and Elwin tested the boundaries with other Faiths.

Elwin made his own boundaries. He signed the Clerical Disabilities Act when he could no longer accept the exclusive claims made in Christian theology for the redemptive action of Christ. He saw no reason whatever for abandoning his devotion to St. Francis at the same time, even though he had once been drawn to the Saint because of his mystical identification with the wounds of Christ. For Elwin, St. Francis transcended all boundaries.

If certain episodes were selectively emphasised, it could be argued that the founders were looking back to a past golden age with nostalgia as an escape from the realities of the present. They all drew inspiration from St. Francis. When having difficulty with Canon Body, Miss Marshall took St. Cuthbert and St. Hilda as her heroes. Adderley sought modern martyrs who had the daring of St. Stephen. Winslow was a

devotee following Tukaram's bhakti tradition in his worship of God. Elwin in convalescence found solace in Richard Rolle, who had left Oxford centuries earlier to become a hermit.

There were times too when they all seemed to be manipulating other people to their ends, often using St. Francis as their tool. Adderley's desire to convert scholars of medieval texts into practical politicians and Miss Marshall's selective use of quotations from texts and letters could be construed in this way. Winslow may have intentionally compared a 'fresh movement' from India with a fresh movement from Assisi because Chesterton had St. Francis popular among English readers. Elwin's attempt to persuade the British that a 'half-naked fakir' was a Saint could be interpreted in this way.

Those who have demonstrated how traditions were 'invented' in this historical period could find illustrative support from these narratives. It would be accurate to say that the portrayal of Franciscan activity promoted by Adderley and Elwin in Stephen Remarx, Paul Mercer and Phulmat of the Hills bore little resemblance to historical reality. Doubtless, some would go so far as to suggest that their pictures of the tribal life of the English upper classes and of the aboriginals also had elements of 'inventiveness'. Each, it could be argued, built an organisation based partially on historical illusions, for maybe Miss Marshall and Winslow also inaccurately interpreted the past.

Another approach to explaining the nature of organisations could be from examination of the resources used in inaugurating them. If, for the moment, we limit the concept of resources to material ones over which the founders had direct control, we can see how important they were for shaping each of the organisations. Miss Marshall used her own money to print and distribute her pamphlets. Adderley also had enough money to do what he wanted to do. Winslow did not share this advantage. He was given money for the building, but the ashram had financial problems after he no longer accepted money from a missionary society. After the creation of Franciscan Orders, the majority of sponsors in England made it clear that they would not support a family organisation, only celibate Franciscans. Elwin spent all his capital assets on land, and wrote Leaves from the Jungle and a book about St. Francis to earn royalties.

Other theories would stress that the levels of technology which were available at the time and place of the formation of organisations strongly influenced their pattern of development. Adderley, in addition to his feet tramping the roads, made himself mobile using trains, a bicycle and later, the cars of his friends. He made extensive use of print technology and frequently visited Fleet Street. Miss Marshall used the postal system to move her organisation out of Sunderland; and boats and trains to reach Assisi. Winslow and Elwin walked, but they also used the network of communication which the British had established within India, and to link Britain with her Empire. Without the information from newspapers and correspondence which brought the world to his door, Winslow's global vision of 1919 would not have been possible.

Cablegrams exchanged between Gandhi and the Viceroy precipitated a chain of communications which left Elwin without a sponsor in Karanjia and stranded in Britain without a passport. Later, Elwin had wait a month for post to be collected. Karanjia in 1931 offered him less in the way of technology than Miss Marshall had enjoyed in Sunderland in 1891.

From another viewpoint, it is arguable that it was the subjective

impact of communications such as The Bitter Cry of Outcast London, Leo XIII's encyclicals, and Tilak's and Gandhi's notes which gave them their importance. The founders, it could be said, interpreted words written on paper in ways which were possibly not intended by the authors. The Bitter Cry of Outcast London for Adderley became a modern Testament of St. Francis, the document in which St. Francis described his meeting with an outcast leper. Leo XIII's encyclical commending Franciscan Third Orders to the Catholic faithful as an instrument to enable them to combat the 'contagion of wicked societies' for Miss Marshall became an instrument in her search for a ministry of active contemplation.

Tilak's hand-written note urging missionaries to be brothers enhanced Winslow's determination not to be 'a superior person'. Gandhi's hand-written note became for Elwin a little note of encouragement and commission such as St. Francis wrote to Brother Leo. All that matters, some might say, is the manner in which people interpret such little things for it is from micro events that all else follows.

In conclusion, enough has been said without developing other theoretical hypotheses to suggest that they all have their merits and limitations. Let me explain this in another way. If single incidents or groups of incidents in any of the narratives were to be made into snapshots and mounted on separate pages, these pages could be explained by using an appropriate selection from theories which have been developed to elucidate the emergence of organisations. However, one or two pages from the album would permit only a very restricted interpretation of life-histories and social situations.

Thus, only a very partial explanation would be possible if Emily Marshall were seen only in 1885 in Silksworth working as a district visitor, or only in 1887 in the dining room at St. Mark's vicarage

listening to the clergy, or only in 1890 at the Close in Durham negotiating the terms of her subordination to Canon Body, or only in 1893 at the consecration of Swaby, or only in 1894 at the Hotel Subasio in Assisi eagerly questioning Paul Sabatier. It is the sequence which began in district visiting and led to a hotel in Assisi and a Franciscan Third Order which grew rapidly in the West Indies but not in Durham, not any isolated incident, which is explanatory.

Similarly, if Adderley were to be viewed only in 1883 in

Westminster reading The Bitter Cry of East London, or only in 1885

arranging for Bradlaugh to lecture at Oxford House, or only in 1887 on

his soap-box in Victoria Park, or only in 1893 telling the members of

the Church Congress to redefine 'economic man', or only with Dr. Mason

in 1894 discussing Franciscan texts, or perhaps ten years later

entertaining G. K. Chesterton, an incomplete picture would be perceived.

It is how he moved from the East End respecting Bradlaugh's secularism

to rejecting Leo XIII's Secular Franciscan Third Order, to replacing it

with the hopes expressed in Stephen Remarx, to withdrawing in 1926 from

writing regularly about St. Francis which is instructive.

Winslow's varied activities studying in the precincts of Canterbury in 1911, letting his body sway and his spirit soar in bhakti devotion in 1917, staying with Dame Monica Wills in 1926, and later organising the Lee Abbey Fellowship cohere only if the connections are made plain.

Two pictures of Elwin, both taken in 1932, make the same point. In the first he is in Indian dress in his little mud hut with tigers on the walls, praying before a crucifix on which the Christ wears a khadi loin cloth made from thread spun by Gandhi, his spiritual father. In the second he is in Western dress, an English visitor at the Mass in a

Roman Catholic convent in Trevi, which was the home of his spiritual mother, Sorella Amata. To know the reasons for his being in both places, and what happened subsequently, is necessary for an adequate understanding.

To be sure, selection from total contexts of a life-history always has to be made and to be interpreted; and I have made certain selections and offered interpretations which explain how religious resources were used to form values and organisations. The events described in this thesis could, however, have been used to tell quite other organisational stories in which St. Francis scarcely featured. The first study presented in this thesis, a narrative account leading to the outcome of James Adderley's embryonic Franciscan Third Order, could be presented as the development of a network of communicative action working towards the first Labour Government. To do so, would only be to leave out some of the motivating values. The second study presented in this thesis of Miss Marshall's embryonic Franciscan Third Order could be traced as a women's organisation which opened itself to men in the West Indies in a joint attempt to win spiritual recognition. To do so, would only necessitate omitting some of the motivating Franciscan values. The third study of John Winslow presented here as a study of John Winslow's ashram experiment, which led to Franciscan Orders, could be otherwise interpreted. It was one of the pioneering examples of a Christian ashram movement, of the construction of indigenous Christian liturgy, of a movement drawing on the spiritualities of both the West and East, and one of the roots of the Lee Abbey Fellowship. To do so, would simply leave out some of his inner Franciscan inspirations and aspirations. The fourth study of Verrier Elwin sketched here as a Third Order Franciscan ashram settlement set up in conjunction with a multireligious and multi-racial mandal, could be interpreted as an example of a pioneering Indian anthropological research unit revealing tensions within that discipline. To do so, would just mean failure to see how a religious resource can continue to inspire even when the religion with which it was connected has been abandoned.

The facts remain that, in however many ways incidents in these narratives are interpreted, and whatever is included or excluded, the events depicted were the seed beds of Anglican Franciscan Third Orders, and that an existing organisation, the present Third Order of the Anglican Society of St. Francis, owes something to each of them.

The narratives and this investigation of theoretical sub-plots have shown the complexity which sociologists may find once they begin to investigate how a religious resource or a figure of the past is seen, valued, and understood.

A basic methodological argument of this thesis is that narratives which depict social contextual sequences provide insights because they unravel and reveal the complexity of social situations. Theoretical insights are helpful in explaining individual incidents, but individually they cannot depict the kaleidoscopic nature of emergent sequences of events or differentiate the complex characteristics of diverse organisations.

3. SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH.

As Part One indicated, the resources available for coming to see, value and understand St. Francis of Assisi are vast. Studies could, I believe, usefully be made which concentrate on how only one of the categories of the Franciscan resource has been seen, valued and understood by selected social groups. The Franciscan expression could

be studied on its own or compared with other resources in the same categories.

If the latter, and if, as in this thesis, texts were to be taken as a starting point, then there would be abundant choice. Today, there are books which depict the Saints of the world's religions, sacred times, sacred landscapes, sacred topographies and buildings, sacred texts, and describe sacred organisations in far greater numbers than ever before. Some of them have excellent colour illustrations. A selection of them has been listed in the bibliography. To this list of books, could be added narrowcast and broadcast aural and visual experiences, of which there is an abundance available. The ownership of televisions and video-recording machines makes it possible to bring religious resources, including landscapes, buildings, paintings, festivals, and conversations into homes.

Further, because social time is now differently organised from the historical periods studied in this thesis, more people spend time in study, more people have paid holidays, and more people enjoy a period of active retirement, than ever before. The opportunities for attending sacred festivals, visiting sacred landscapes and buildings, and meeting members of sacred organisations are widely available. This is often possible without evidence of religious commitment.

To study how people respond to these resources in the present would have great advantages, which would offset the major limitation of this thesis. Direct observation, formal and informal interviews, and survey methods would be possible.

The questions are numerous. What do people find at Assisi today, for instance? Is this different from what is found at Lourdes or Lindisfarne? What is the social impact of St. Bernadette, St. Francis

and St. Cuthbert? These are overtly religious resources, but there are many other possibilities. Nation states, regions and localities often have heros. Landscapes of many writers have become 'countries of the mind' and bearers of spiritual values. Elwin, it may be remembered, made a decision at Capel Curig and became 'a scholar-gypsy'.

To return to a Franciscan theme, I have examined only a small part of the possible social effects at the time of a single wave of 'the modern Franciscan movement'. There was another wave in the post-war period, another in the early 1960s and another which began in the late 1970s. The latest wave would include Margaret Thatcher in 1979 televised on her election victory night reciting 'the St. Francis prayer' to the nation, Oliver Messiaen bringing St. Francis's reception of his wounds into opera houses, and the World Wildlife Fund, a secular organisation, summoning scientists, engineers and technologists to Assisi to discuss the material resources of the planet. To say nothing of the impact of Leonardo Boff's claim that St. Francis is a model of post-modern liberation and Russell Harty telling readers of The Sunday Times that St. Francis in July 1987 was everywhere in Assisi 'even on umbrellas'. The paintings of Giotto are there also.

These successive waves of a Franciscan Movement have been accompanied by growth in the Anglican Third Order of the Society of St. Francis which now has members in most Provinces of the Anglican Communion. Its present organisation could be studied. Preliminary observation and the present 'working archives' suggest that traces of each of the embryonic organisations described in this thesis can be detected still.

If this is so, an existing movement and organisation can be shown to be very complex phenomena. Such complexity, which has been suggested as the result of studying the life history of four people, has serious implications for the future study of the uses of religious resources. It would seem to point to a need for breaking down sub-disciplines. In writing this thesis, I have had to trespass in the areas assumed to be those of geographers, art historians, anthropologists, antiquarians, archaeologists, philologists and students of technology and nationalism. If we are to learn how people come to see, value and understand a religious resource from the past, then, following St. Francis, we may have to view the world as a parish. Unfortunately, he left only a few writings to guide us. Students of many disciplines and cultures may have to learn alone and together how to live and to study in global society.

BIBLIOGRAPHY.

- 1644. The Rule of Penance of the Seraphicall Father S. Francis ... Together with a Declaration on each point of the Rule. Douay; the Widdow of Marke Wyon.
- 1855. Manual of the Third Order of St. Francis, called also the Order of Penance. London; Burns and Lambert.
- 1869. Manual of the Third Order of St. Francis of Assisi, called also the Order of Penance, with a Preface by Father Emidius, 2 Volumes. London; Burns and Oates.
- 1883. Rule and Ceremonial of the Third Order of St. Francis, according to the Constitution of Leo XIII, and the Decree of the Sacred Congregation of Rites. London; Burns and Oates.
- 1883. New Manual of the Third Order Secular of S. Francis of Assisi. With the Encyclical Letter of Leo XIII of the 17th Sept. 1882, and the Constitution of 1883 mitigating the Rule of the Order, in
- 1899. The Little Manual of the Third Order of St. Francis, new and Revised Edition, edited by the Friars Minor of the English Province. London; Burns and Oates.
- 1907. Eton School Lists: 1871-1880, Part IV. Eton; Spottiswoode and Co.
- 1909-11. The Anglican Third Order to the Diaconate in its two Branches of Men and Women Deacons: The Quarterly Magazine of the Order. Latin and English. London; Burns and Oates.
- 1912. "Sir Charles Bowyer Adderley, first Baron Norton", in *The Dictionary of National Biography*, Vol.I., Twentieth Century, 1901–11. Oxford; Oxford University Press.
- 1915. The Little Manual of the Third Order of St. Francis, new and revised edition, edited by the Friars Minor of the English Province. London; Burns and Oates.
- 1921. Handbook to the Third Order of St. Francis of Assisi. Olton, Birmingham; The Franciscan Monastery.
- 1922. Eton Register: 1899-1909. Eton; Spottiswoode, Ballantyne and Co.
- 1931. The Little Manual of the Third Order of St. Francis, edited by the Rev. Fr. Angelo, new edition revised and brought up-to-date by the Rev. Fr. Francis. Lucknow.

- 1932. India in 1930-31: A Statement prepared for Presentation to Parliament in accordance with the requirements of the 26th Section of the Government of India Act. Delhi; Government of India Central Publications Bureau.
- 1933. India in 1931-32: A Statement prepared for Presentation to Parliament in accordance with the requirements of the 26th Section of the Government of India Act. Delhi; Government of India Central Publications Bureau.
- 1934. India in 1932-33: A Statement prepared for Presentation to Parliament in accordance with the requirements of the 26th Section of the Government of India Act. Delhi; Manager of Publications.
- 1935. The Prevention and Relief of Distress: A Handbook of Information regarding the Statutory and Voluntary Means Available for the Relief of Distress and the Improvement of Social Conditions in the County of London. Westminster; Charity Organisation Society.
- 1988. Deacons in the Ministry of the Church: A Report to the House of Bishops of the General Synod of the Church of England. London; Church House Publishing.

A Capuchin Father (Ed.)

1904. Franciscan Tertiary Manual containing the Rule and Ceromonial of the Third Order, together with the Encyclical Letter of Pope Leo XIII and an Explanation of the New Rule. N. Wales; Pantasaph, Holywell.

Abell, Peter.

1984. "Comparative Narratives: Some Rules for the Study of Action".

Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour 14, (3), 309-332.

Abell, Peter.

1985. "Analyzing Qualitative Sequences: The Algebra of Narrative", in Michael Proctor and Peter Abell (Eds.), Sequence Analysis. Aldershot; Gower.

Abell, Peter.

1986. The Syntax of Social Life: The Theory and Method of Comparative Narratives. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Abell, Peter.

1988. "The 'Structuration' of Action: Inference and Comparative Narratives", in Nigel G. Fielding (Ed.), Actions and Structures: Research Methods and Social Theory. 185-196.

Abhishiktananda [Henri Le Saux, O. S. B.]

1974. Guru and Disciple, translated by Heather Sandeman. London; S. P. C. K.

Abrams, Philip.

1982. Historical Sociology. West Compton House, Near Shepton Mallet, England; Open Books.

Acland, C. D. H.

1984. "Coast and Country", in Robin Fedden and Rosemary Joekes, *The National Trust Guide*, 479-491.

Adcock, A. St. John.

1897. East End Idylls. London; James Bowden.

Adderley, James Granville.

1886. Jesus Christ Today. Oxford House Papers, No. XIV. London; Rivington.

Adderley, James Granville.

1888. The Fight for the Drama at Oxford: Some Plain Facts. Oxford; Blackwells.

Adderley, James Granville.

1893. Christ and Social Reform: An Appeal to Working Men. London; S. P. C. K.

Adderley, James Granville.

1893. Stephen Remarx: The Story of a Venture in Ethics. London; Edward Arnold.

Adderley, James Granville.

1894. "Social Aspects of the Gospel", in A. Reid (Ed.), Vox Clamantium: The Gospel of the People.

Adderley, James Granville.

1894. The Legend of the Way of Grief: Thoughts for Meditation on the Stations of The Cross. Oxford; Mowbrays.

Adderley, James Granville.

1894. The New Floreat: A Letter to an Eton Boy on the Social Question. London; Wells, Gardner, Darton and Co.

Adderley, James Granville.

1896. God's Fast: Considerations for the Use of a Serious Christian in View of Social Perplexities. London; T. Hibberd.

Adderley, James Granville.

1896. Looking Upward: Papers Introductory to the Study of Social Questions from a Religious Point of View. London; Wells, Gardner, Darton and Co.

Adderley, James Granville.

1897. Paul Mercer: A Story of Repentance among Millions. London; Edward Arnold.

Adderley, James Granville.

1897. Preface to A. St. John Adcock, East End Idylls, 1-8.

Adderley, James Granville.

1899. Salvation by Jesus: An Address to a Penitent Soul Concerning Conversion, Repentance and Grace. London; Wells, Gardner, Darton and Co.

Adderley, James Granville.

1899. Talitha Cumi: A Letter to Laura, the Sister of Dick. London; Wells, Gardner and Co.

Adderley, James Granville.

1900. Francis, The Little Poor Man of Assisi: A Short Story of the Founder of the Brothers Minor. London; Edward Arnold.

Adderley, James Granville.

1901. Monsieur Vincent: A Sketch of a Christian Social Reformer of the Seventeenth Century. London; Edward Arnold.

Adderley, James Granville, and C. L. Marson,

1902. Third Orders: A Translation of an Ancient Rule of the Tertiaries, Together with an Account of Some Modern 'Third Orders', Two Sermons on St. Francis and an Article on the Religious Life. London; A. R. Mowbray.

Adderley, James Granville.

1903. A New Earth: Sermons, Addresses and Lectures. London; S. C. Brown, Langham and Co.

Adderley, James Granville (Ed.)

1903. Critical Sermons. London; S. C. Brown and Co.

Adderley, James Granville.

1903. Quis Habitat: A Meditation for Christian Socialists, Being the Substance of Three Addresses Delivered to the Christian Social Union at their Annual Retreat, Passiontide, 1901. London; S. C. Brown, Langham and Co.

Adderley, James Granville.

1904. "The Evidence for the Resurrection", in G. Haw (Ed.), The Religious Doubts of Democracy. 90-100.

Adderley, James Granville.

1904. Blue Friars: Goodwill Stories. London; Wells, Gardner, Darton and Co.

Adderley, James Granville (Ed.)

1904. Goodwill: A Monthly Magazine for the People.

Adderley, James Granville.

1904. Prayer Book Teaching: An Attempt to Construct a Positive Statement of Church of England Doctrine and Practice from the Words of the Book of Common Prayer and the Articles. London; Wells, Gardner, Darton and Co.

Adderley, James Granville.

1904. Stephen Remarx: The Story of a Venture in Ethics. 12th. Ed. and Penny Edition. London; S. C. Brown, Langham and Co.

Adderley, James Granville.

1905. Practical Questions: Lectures on Modern Difficulties in Church Life, Preached at St. Mark's Church, Marylebone Road, 1902-4. London; S. C. Brown, Langham and Co.

Adderley, James Granville.

1906. Children's Flower Service. Oxford; A. R. Mowbray.

Adderley, James Granville.

1907. Behold, the Days Come: A Fancy in Christian Politics. London; Methuen.

Adderley, James Granville.

1908. The Catholicism of the Church of England. London; Francis Griffiths.

Adderley, James Granville,

1910. Foreword to Alan Mackinnon, The Oxford Amateurs: A Short History of Theatricals at the University.

Adderley, James Granville.

1910. Is Socialism Atheism? London; Frank Palmer.

Adderley, James Granville.

1910. The Parson in Socialism: Jottings from My Note Book. Leeds; Richard Jackson.

Adderley, James Granville.

1916. In Slums and Society: Reminiscences of Old Friends. London; T. Fisher and Unwin.

Adderley, James Granville.

1920. Old Seeds on New Ground. With Twelve Cartoons by Low. London; G. P. Puttnam and Sons.

Adderley, James Granville.

1926. "Franciscan Poverty". Theology, Vol. XIII, No. 75, 136-144.

Adderley, James Granville.

1926. St. Francis of Assisi and His Friars. Christian Knowledge Booklets, No. 13. London; S. P. C. K.

Aitken, W. Francis.

1902. Canon Barnett: Warden of Toynbee Hall. London; S. W. Partridge.

Allan, George (Ed.)

1824. City of Durham: Historical and Descriptive View of the City of Durham and its Environs with The Legend of St. Cuthbert, or the Histories of his Churches at Lindisfarne, Cunecascestre and Dunholm by Robert Hegg. Durham; T. Hoggett.

Allchin, A. M.

1958. The Silent Rebellion: Anglican Religious Communities, 1845-1900. London; S. C. M.

Allen, David Elliston.

1976. The Naturalist in Britain: A Social History. Harmondsworth; Penguin.

Allen, H. E.

1927. Writings, ascribed to Richard Rolle, Hermit of Hampole, and Materials for his Biography. New York and London; Oxford University Press.

Allington, The Very Rev. C. A.

1926. "Real Values of Life: In the Footsteps of St. Francis". The Daily Telegraph, Saturday, 2 October.

Almond, Brenda and Bryan Wilson.

1988. Values: A Symposium. Atlantic Highlands, N.J.; Humanities Press International.

Aloysius, Fr., O. F. M.

1933. St. Francis of Assisi in Paragraph and Picture. Dublin; M. H. Gill and Son.

Alter, Robert.

1982. The Art of Biblical Narrative. London; Allen and Unwin.

Anderson, B.

1983. Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism. London; Verso.

Anderson, Olive.

1969. "Women preachers in mid-Victorian Britain; some reflections on feminism, popular religion and social change". *Historical Journal* XII, 3, 467-84.

Anderson, Verity.

1972. A Life of Rosslyn Bruce: The Last of the Eccentrics. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Andrews, C. F.

1910. The Historical Character of the Gospel Established from Non-Christian Sources by a Member of the Brotherhood of the Imitation. London.

Andrews, C. F.

1912. The Renaissance in India: Its Missionary Aspect. London; Young People's Missionary Movement.

Andrews, C. F.

1921. The Indian Problem. Madras; G. A. Nateson and Co.

Andrews, C. F.

1924. Christ and Labour. London; S. C. M. Press.

Andrews, C. F.

1930. India and the Simon Report. London; George Allen and Unwin.

Andrews, C. F.

1935. John White of Mashonaland. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Anon.

1894. Bishop Lightfoot, reprinted from The Quarterly Review, 1889. London; Macmillan.

Anon.

1899. "Invocation of Saints". The Church Quarterly Review, Vol. XLVII, No. XCIV, Article I, 273-301.

Anon.

1902. "His Holiness and the Third Order". The Franciscan Monthly. Vol. VII, April, No 64, 98-103.

Anon.

1926. "St. Francis and the Modern World". The Times Literary Supplement, 30 September.

Anon.

1926. "The Saint of Assisi". Leading article in The Times, 2 October.

Anon.

1926. "The Saint of the Animals". The New Statesman: A Weekly Review of Politics and Literature. 9 October, 734-5.

Anon.

1948. The Oxford House in Bethnal Green, 1884-1948. London; T. Brakell.

Anon.

1953. "The Third Order of St. Francis in Medieval England." Franciscan Studies, Vol. XIII, 50-58.

Anon.

1964. "The Hon. and Rev. James Granville Adderley", in Who Was Who. Vol. IV, 1941-50, 6-7. London; A. and C. Black.

Anon.

1965. Review of The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin. Thought, 24 April.

Anon.

1966. "Verrier Elwin (1902-64)". The Journal of Asian and African Studies, Vol. I, No. 2.

Anon.

n.d. Suggestions for the Best Means of Organising Local Charity Organisations. London; Charity Organisation Society.

Anon. (Ed.) [Emily Esther Marshall.]

1901. The Parochial, or Third Order, (Anglican): Thoughts and Experiences, The Order at Work. London; A. R. Mowbray and Co.

Anon. [A Tertiary of St. Francis].

1899. The Spirit of the Third Order of St. Francis, translated from French by The Very Rev. Father Peter Baptist, O. F. M. London; Catholic Truth Society.

Anon. [Andrew Mearns].

1883. The Bitter Cry of Outcast London. London; James Clarke and Co. Reprinted in 1974 for the Victorian Library by Leicester University Press.

Anson, Peter F.

1926. A Pilgrim's Guide to Franciscan Italy. London; Sands.

Anson, Peter F.

1956. The Call of the Cloister: Religious Communities and Kindred Bodies in the Anglican Communion. London; S. P. C. K.

Anson, Peter F.

1958. The Hermit of Cat Island: The Life of Fra Jerome Hawes. London; Burns and Oates.

Appasamy, A. J.

1926. Christianity as Bhakti Marga: A Study of the Johannine Doctrine of Love. Madras; Christian Literature Society for India.

Appasamy, A. J.

1951. The Christian Task in Independent India. London; S. P. C. K.

Appasamy, A. J.

1964. My Theological Quest. Madras; Christian Literature Society.

Archer, Margaret S.

1988. Culture and Agency: The Place of Culture in Social Theory. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Armstrong, Edward A.

1973. St. Francis, Nature Mystic: The Derivation and Significance of the Nature Stories in the Franciscan Legend. Berkeley; University of California Press.

Armytage, W. H. G.

1968. Yesterday's Tomorrows: A Historical Survey of Future Societies. London; Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Arnold, Matthew.

1889. "Pagan and Medieval Religious Sentiment", in Culture and Anarchy: An Essay in Political and Social Criticism. 225-258.

Arnold, Matthew.

1889. Culture and Anarchy: An Essay in Political and Social Criticism. Popular edition of work first published in 1869. London; Smith, Elder and Co.

Arseniev, Nicholas.

1979. Mysticism and the Eastern Church, translated from the German by Arthur Chambers. First published 1926 by S. C. M. New York; St. Vladimir's Seminary Press.

Aston, Margaret.

1982. "English Ruins and English History: The Dissolution and the Sense of the Past". Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes, Vol. XXXVI, 231-55.

Attwater, Donald.

1958. "St. Francis of Assisi". A Dictionary of Saints. First published in 1938. London; Burns and Oates.

Author of A Suggestion for Our Times, [Emily Esther Marshall].

1890. District Visitors, Deaconesses and a Proposed Adaptation, in part, of the Third Order. First Edition. London; Skeffington and Son.

Author of A Suggestion for Our Times, [Emily Esther Marshall].

1891. Deacons, Deaconesses, and a Proposed Adaptation, in Part, of the Third Order of St. Francis: Or a Proposed Outer Order, for Men and Women Living in the World. Third and New Edition. London; Skeffington and Son.

Author of A Suggestion for Our Times, [Emily Esther Marshall].

1891. District Visitors, Deaconesses and a Proposed Adaptation, in part, of the Third Order. Second Edition. London; Skeffington and Son.

Author of A Suggestion for Our Times, [Emily Esther Marshall].

1896. The Dawn Breaking: And Some Thoughts on The Third Order of St. Francis, with Translations from the French. London; Skeffington and Son.

Author of A Suggestion for Our Times, [Emily Esther Marshall].

1897. Some Thoughts on the Third Order of St. Francis, Ancient and Modern: with Translations from the French by an Anglican. London; Skeffington and Son.

Baago, Kaj.

1969. Pioneers of Indigenous Christianity. Bangalore; Christian Institute for the Study of Religion and Society.

Bainbridge, William Sims.

1985. "Utopian Communities: Theoretical Issues", in Philip E. Hammond, The Sacred in a Secular Age.

Baker, Derek (Ed.)

1978. Religious Motivation: Biographical and Sociological Problems for the Church Historian. Vol. 15 of Studies in Church History. Oxford; Blackwell.

Bampton, Fr. J. M., S. J.

1926. The Secret of St. Francis. London; Burns, Oates and Washburn.

Banks, J.A. and O. Banks.

1965. Feminism and Family Planning in Victorian England. Liverpool; Liverpool University Press.

Banks, Olive.

1981. Faces of Feminism: A Study of Feminism as a Social Movement.
Oxford; Martin Robinson.

Banks, Olive.

1986. Becoming a Feminist: The Social Origins of 'First Wave' Feminism. Brighton; Wheatsheaf.

Bann, Stephen.

1984. The Clothing of Clio: A Study of the Representation of History in Nineteenth-Century Britain and France. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Bann, Stephen.

1990. The Inventions of History: Essays on the Representations of the Past. Manchester; Manchester University Press.

Barbara Noreen, Sister, C. S. M. V.

n.d. A Wheat Grain Sown in India. Wantage; Printed for Private Circulation.

Barbour, R. W.

1896. Auckland Castle: Three letters written by the Rev. R. W. Barbour (a distinguished young Minister of the Free Church of Scotland) who was Bishop Lightfoot's guest for a few days in 1882. Printed with permission in Canterbury by the Bishop of Dover.

Barker, Eileen (Ed.)

1982. New Religious Movements: A Perspective for Understanding Society. New York; Edwin Mellen.

Barnett, Henrietta.

1918. Canon Barnett: His Life, Work, and Friends. 2 Vols. London; John Murray.

Barnett, James Monroe.

1979 The Diaconate: A Full and Equal Order, A Comprehensive and Critical Study of the Origin, Development, and Decline of the Diaconate in the Context of the Church's Total Ministry and a Proposal for Renewal. New York; Seabury.

Barrow, Logie.

1986. Independent Spirits: Spiritualism and English Plebeians, 1850-1910. London; Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Beaver, R. Pierce.

1965. "Christian ashrams in India". Christian Century, 82, 887-889.

Beckford, J. A. and Martine Levasseur.

1986. "New Religious Movements in Western Europe", in New Religious Movements and Rapid Social Change. U. N. E. S. C. O. 29-54.

Beckford, James and Thomas Luckmann,

1989. The Changing Face of Religion. London; Sage Studies in International Sociology. 37.

Beckford, James.

1989. Religion and Advanced Industrial Society. London; Unwin Hyman.

Bede, The Venerable.

1968. A History of the English Church and People, translated and with an Introduction by Leo Sherley-Price. Revised by R. E. Latham. Harmondsworth; Penguin.

Benko, Stephen.

1964. The Meaning of Sanctorum Communio. Studies of Historical Theology, Vol. 3. London; S. C. M. Press.

Berenson, Bernard.

1897. The Central Italian Painters of the Rennaissance. London; Putnams.

Berenson, Bernard.

1903. "A Sienese Painter of the Franciscan Legend". Burlington Magazine for Connoisseurs.

Berger, Peter L. and Thomas Luckmann.

1966. The Social Construction of Reality. Harmondsworth; The Penguin Press.

Berger, Peter L. and Brigitte Berger.

1976. Sociology: A Biographical Approach. First published in the U.S. A. 1972. Harmondsworth; Penguin Books.

Bertaux, Daniel (Ed.)

1981. Biography and Society: The Life History Approach in the Social Sciences. Sage Studies in International Sociology 23. London; Sage Publications.

Bertaux, Daniel.

1981. "From the Life-History Approach to the Transformation of Sociological Practice", in Bertaux (Ed.), Biography and Society: The Life History Approach in the Social Sciences.

Bettany, F. G.

1926. Stewart Headlam: A Biography. London; John Murray.

Bey, Hamdi.

1964. Review of The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin. The Frontier Times. Shillong.

Bhikhu, Parekh.

1989. Colonialism, Tradition and Reform: An Analysis of Gandhi's Political Discourse. New Delhi; Sage Publications India.

Bhose, Subhas C.

1935. The Indian Struggle: 1920-1934. London; Wishart and Co.

Bienefeld, M. A.

1972. Working Hours in British History: An Economic History. London; Weidenfeld and Nicholson.

Biersack, Louis, O. F. M. Cap.

1943. The Saints and Blessed of the Third Order of St. Francis. Paterson, N. J.; St. Anthony Guild Press.

Bijker, Wiebe E., Thomas P. Hughes and Trevor J. Pinch. (Eds.)

1987. The Social Construction of Technological Systems: New Directions in the Sociology and History of Technology. Massachusetts; M. I. T.

Binyon, Gilbert Clive.

1931. The Christian Socialist Movement in England: An Introduction to the Study of its History. London; S. P. C. K.

Blatchford, Robert.

1901. "The Fellowship". The Clarion. No. 483, 9 March.

Blunt, John Henry (Ed.)

1874. Dictionary of Sects, Heresies, Ecclesiastical Parties and Schools of Religious Thought. London; Rivingtons.

Blythe, Ronald.

1986. Divine Landscapes. Harmondworth; Penguin, Viking Books.

Bock, E. W.

1972. "The Transformation of Religious Symbols: A Case study of St. Nicholas". Social Compass. Vol. XIX, 4, 537-548.

Boff, Leonardo and Walbert Buhlmann.

1984. Build Up My Church: Franciscan Inspirations For and From The Third World. Chicago: Interprovincial Secretariat for the Missions.

Boff, Leonardo.

1982. St. Francis: A Model for Human Liberation, translated by John W. Diercksmeier. New York; Crossroads.

Bone, Florence.

1909. Saint Francis of Assisi: being the story of the glorious poor little one retold in simple words for children who think. London; Robert Culley.

Bone, Gerald.

1964. Review of The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin. The Oxford Mail. 15 October.

Bonnard, Abel.

1930. Saint Francis of Assisi, translated from the French by Florence Simmonds. London; The Medici Society.

Borenius, Tancred.

1926. "Some Franciscan Subjects in Italian Art", in Seton, Essays in Commemoration, 1226-1926. 3-14.

Bossy, John.

1975. The English Catholic Community, 1570-1850. London; Darton, Longman and Todd.

Bossy, John.

1985. Christianity in the West, 1400-1700. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Bowker, Margaret.

1987. "The Henrician Reformation and the Parish Clergy", in Christopher Haigh (Ed.), The English Reformation Revised, 75-93.

Boyd, R.

1974. India and the Latin Captivity of the Church: The Cultural Context of the Gospel. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Boyer, Regis.

1981. "An attempt to define the typology of medieval hagiography", in Hagiography and Medieval Literature. A Symposium organised by The Centre for the Study of Vernacular Literature in the Middle Ages. Odense, Denmark; Odense University Press. 27-36.

Braley, Evelyn Foley (Ed.)

1950. Letters of Herbert Henley Henson. London; S. P. C. K.

Branca, Patricia.

1975. Silent Sisterhood: Middle Class Women in the Victorian Home. London; Croom Helm.

Brandon, S. G. F.

1975. Man and God in Art and Ritual: A Study of Iconogaphy, Architecture and Ritual Action as Primary Evidence of Religious Belief and Practice. New York; Charles Scribner.

Branston, A. J.

1978 Introducing Postal History. London; Stanley Gibbons.

Braudy, Leo.

1983. The Frenzy of Renown: Fame and its History. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Braybrooke, M.

1971. Together to the Truth: Developments in Hindu and Christian Thought since 1800. Delhi; S. P. C. K.

Braybrooke, M.

1973. The Undiscovered Christ. Madras; Christian Literature Society.

Brewer, J. S. (Ed.)

1858. Monumenta Franciscana. London; Longman, Brown, Green, Longmans and Robert.

Bridenthal, Renate and Claudia Koonz.

1977. Becoming Visible: Women in European History. Boston; Houghton Mifflin.

Brittain, Vera.

1980. Testament of Youth: An Autobiographical Study of the Years 1900-1925. First published in 1933. London; Fontana.

Bromley, David G. and Larry Shinn (Eds.)

1988. Krishna Consciousness in the West. Lewisburg, PA; Bucknell University Press.

Brooke, Christopher.

1971. "Paul Sabatier and St. Francis of Assisi", in Medieval Church and Society: Collected Essays. 197-213.

Brooke, Christopher.

1971. Medieval Church and Society: Collected Essays. London; Sidgwick and Jackson.

Brooke, Rosalind and Christopher.

1984. Popular Religion in the Middle Ages: Western Europe, 1000-1300. London; Thames and Hudson.

Brooker, Peter and Peter Widdowson.

1986. "A Literature for England", in Englishness: Politics and Culture 1880-1920. London; Croom Helm. 116-163.

Brophy. Liam.

1984. "The Saint and Scholars: How Chesterton, Jorgenson and Others Approached St. Francis". *The Cord.* Vol. 34, 1, 17-23.

Brown, Judith M.

1977. Gandhi and Civil Disobedience: The Mahatma in Indian Politics 1928-1934. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Brown, Judith M.

1985. Modern India: The Origins of an Asian Democracy. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Brown, Judith M.

1989. Gandhi: Prisoner of Hope. New Haven; Yale University Press.

Brown, Peter.

1981. The Cult of the Saints: Its Rise and Function in Latin Christianity. Chicago; University of Chicago Press.

Brown, Raphael.

1958. The Little Flowers of St. Francis. First complete edition, and an entirely new version with twenty additional chapters. Garden City, New York; Image Books.

Brown, Raphael.

1973. "Introduction to The Little Flowers of St. Francis" in Marion Habig (Ed.), St. Francis of Assisi, Writings and Early Biographies: English Omnibus of the Sources for the Life of St. Francis. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press. 1269-1293.

Bryant, Sir Arthur.

1984. Introduction to Our Christian Heritage. Basingstoke; Official Souvenir Publication.

Bryman, Alan.

1988. Quantity and Quality in Social Research. London; Unwin Hyman.

Bulmer, Martin (Ed.)

1977. Sociological Research Methods: An Introduction. London; Macmillan.

Burgess, Anthony and Francis Haskell.

1967. The Age of the Grand Tour containing Sketches of the Manner Society and Customs of France, Flanders, the United Provinces, Germany, Switzerland and Italy in the letters, journals, and writings of the most celebrated voyagers between the years 1720-1820. Together with the story of such traffic told by A. Burgess and the Art of Europe discussed by F. Haskell. London; Paul Elek.

Burkitt, F. C.

1932. "St. Francis of Assisi and Some of His Biographers". The Second Walter Seton Memorial Lecture (1931), Franciscan Essays, Vol. 2, 19-40. Manchester; Manchester University Press.

Bushaway, Bob.

1982. By Rite: Custom, Ceremony, and Community in England 1770-1880. London; Junction Books.

Buxton, Ethel M. W.

1920. A Little Book of St. Francis and his Brethren. London; Burns, Oates and Washbourne.

Caldecott, Alfred.

1891. English Colonisation and Empire. London; John Murray.

Callon, Michel.

1987. "Society in the Making: The Study of Technology as a Tool for Sociological Analysis", in Bijker et al., The Social Construction of Technological Systems: New Directions in the Sociology and History of Technology. 83-106.

Cameron, Mary Lovett.

1926. The Enquiring Pilgrim's Guide to Assisi: To Which is Added the First Life of St. Francis of Assisi by Thomas of Celano. London; Methuen and Company.

Campbell, A. K.

1934. In Praise of St. Francis. London; Skeffington and Son.

Camps, Arnulf, O. F. M.

1983. "New Dialogue with Hinduism in India", in John Coleman and Gregory Baum, New Religious Movements. Edinburgh; T. and T. Clark.

Canice, Father.

1926. The Thorough Catholic: An Ideal attained by the Third Order of St. Francis, adapted from the French. Dublin; M. H. Gill and Son.

Canice, Father.

1926. The Ideal Franciscan. A Short Treatise for the Brothers and Sisters of The Third Order of St. Francis, adapted from the French. Dublin; M. H. Gill and Son.

Cannadine, David.

1983. "The Context, Performance and Meaning of Ritual: The British Monarchy and the 'Invention of Tradition', c.1820-1977", in Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (Eds.), The Invention of Tradition.

Capps, Walter.

1983. The Monastic Impulse. New York; Crossroads.

Carlyle, Thomas.

1901. On Heroes, Hero-Worship and the Heroic in History. Lectures delivered in 1840. London; Chapman and Hall.

Carman, John B.

1983. "Conceiving Hindu 'Bhakti' as Theocentric Mysticism", in Katz (Ed.), Mysticism and Religious Traditions. 191-226.

Carpenter, S. C.

1949. Winnington-Ingram: The Biography of Arthur Foley Winnington-Ingram, Bishop of London, 1901-1939. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Castells, M.

1985. "Commentary on G. V. Pickvance's 'The Rise and Fall of Urban Movements'". Society and Space, Vol.3, 1, March, 55-61.

Bibliography.

347

Catchside, F. L.

1879. Life of St. Cuthbert: Bishop of Lindisfarne. London; E. W. Allen.

Chadwick, Owen.

1981. The Popes and European Revolution. Oxford; Clarendon Press.

Chadwick, Owen.

1983. Hensley Henson: A Study in the Friction between Church and State. Oxford; Clarendon Press.

Chalippe, Candide, O. F. M.

1847. Life of St. Francis of Assisi, translated by F. W. Faber from French of 1727. Also 1899 edition, translated by the Congregation of the Oratory. New York; Congregation of the Oratory.

Chamberlin, E. R.

1979. Preserving the Past. London; J. M. Dent and Sons.

Chamberlin, Russell.

1987. The Idea of England. London; Thames and Hudson.

Chambers, F. W.

1919. "The Hon. the Rev. James Granville Adderley". Ecclesia, Vol.IX, No.107, 125-6.

Chand, Bool.

1964. Review of *The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin. Kurukshetra.* New Delhi. July.

Chant, Colin (Ed.)

1989. Science, Technology and Everyday Life, 1870-1950. London; Routledge.

Chappell, Jennie.

1900. Noble Work by Noble Women: Sketches of the Lives of Baroness Burdett Coutts, Lady Henry Somerset, Miss Sarah Robinson, Mrs. Fawcett and Mrs. Gladstone. London; S. W. Partridge and Co.

Chase, Malcolm and Christopher Shaw.

1989. "The dimensions of nostalgia", in Shaw and Chase, The Imagined Past: History and Nostalgia. 1-17.

Chatterton, Eyre.

1924. A History of the Church of England in India: Since the Early Days of the East India Company. London; S. P. C. K.

Chatterton, Eyre.

1946. Our Anglican Church in India: 1815-1946. London; The Indian Church Aid Association.

Cheal, David J.

1975. "Political Radicalism and Religion: Competitors for Commitment". Social Compass, Vol. XXII, 245-259.

- Chenchiah P., Chakkarai, V. and Sudarisam, A. N. (Eds.)
 - 1941. Ashramas Past and Present. Madras; Indian Christian Book Club.
- Cherance, The Very Revd. Leopald de, O. S. F. C.
 - 1910. St. Francis of Assisi. First published in France in 1879, translated from the French by R. F. O'Connor. London; R. and T. Washbourne.
- Chesterton, G. K.
 - 1908. Orthodoxy. London; The Bodley Head.
- Chesterton, G. K.
 - 1960. St. Francis of Assisi. First published in 1923. London; Hodder and Stoughton.
- Clanchy, M. T.
 - 1979. From Memory to Written Record: England 1066-1307. London; Edward Arnold.
- Clarke, Joe F.
 - 1990. "Ship Building 1780-1914", in Sunderland: River, Town and People. A History from the 1780s. 45-56.
- Cohen, A. P. (Ed.)
 - 1986. Symbolic Boundaries: Identity and Diversity in British Culture. Manchester; Manchester University Press.
- Cohen, Jean L.
 - 1985. "Strategy or Identity: New Theoretical Paradigms and Contemporary Social Movements". Social Research, Vol. 52, No. 4, Winter, 663-716.
- Cohn, Bernard S.
 - 1983. "Representing Authority in Victorian India", in E. Hobsbawm and T. Ranger, *The Invention of Tradition.* 165-210.
- Coit, Stanton.
 - 1910. Woman in Church and State. London; West London Ethical Society.
- Colgrave, Bertram.
 - 1985. Two Lives of St. Cuthbert: A Life by an Anonymous Monk of Lindisfarne and Bede's Prose Life. Text, Translation and Notes. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.
- Collingwood, R. G.
 - 1946. The Idea of History. Oxford; Oxford University Press.
- Collins, Katherine.
 - 1908. A Modern Reading of St. Francis of Assisi. London; C. W. Daniel.
- Collins, Randall.
 - 1988. "The Micro Contribution to Macro Sociology". Sociological Theory, Vol. 6 (Fall), 242-253.

Collinson, Patrick.

1990. "The Late Medieval Church and its Reformation 1400-1600", in John McManners, *The Oxford Illustrated History of Christianity*. 233-266.

Colls, Robert and Philip Dodd (Eds.)

1986. Englishness: Politics and Culture 1880-1920. London; Croom Helm.

Colls, Robert.

1986. "Englishness and the Political Culture", in Robert Colls and Philip Dodd (Eds.), Englishness: Politics and Culture 1880-1920. London; Croom Helm. 29-61.

Consitt, Edward.

1887. Life of St. Cuthbert. London; Burns and Oates.

Constable, Giles.

1985. "The diversity of religious life and acceptance of social pluralism in the twelfth century", in Derek Beales and Geoffrey Best (Eds.), History, Society and the Churches: Essays in Honour of Owen Chadwick. 29-48.

Copley, Antony.

1987. Gandhi: Against the Tide. Oxford; Basil Blackwell.

Cormack, Patrick.

1976. Heritage in Danger. London; New English Library.

Corrigan, D. Felicitas.

1985. The Nun, the Infidel and the Superman: The Remarkable Friendships of Dame Laurentia McLachlan with Sydney Cockerell, Bernard Shaw and Others. London; John Murray.

Cotton, Charles.

1924. The Grey Friars of Canterbury: 1224-1538. Manchester; Manchester University Press.

Coulton, G. G.

1907. From St. Francis to Dante: Translations from the Chronicle of the Franciscan Salimbine 1221-1228. London; David Nutt.

Coulton, G. G.

1919. Christ, St. Francis and Today. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Coulton, G. G.

1927. Five Centuries of Religion: The Friars and the Dead Weight of Tradition 1200-1400. Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, Volume II. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Coulton, G. G.

1932. Two Saints: St. Bernard and St. Francis. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Courtney, W. L.

1888. Preface to J. G. Adderley, The Fight for the Drama at Oxford: Some Plain Facts, i-xii.

Cousins, Ewart H.

1983. "Francis of Assisi: Christian Mysticism at the Crossroads", in Katz (Ed.), Mysticism and Religious Traditions. 163-190.

Cox, Jeffrey.

1982. The English Churches in Secular Society: Lambeth, 1870-1930. New York; Oxford University Press.

Cross, F. L. (Ed.)

1957. The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church. London; Oxford University Press.

Cruickshank, J. W. and A. M.

1901. The Umbrian Towns. Grant Allen's Historical Guides No. 6. London; Grant Richards.

Culler, A. Dwight.

1985. The Victorian Mirror of History. New Haven; Yale University Press.

Cunningham, Lawrence S.

1980. The Meaning of Saints. San Francisco; Harper and Row.

Cuthbert, (Hess), Father, O. S. F. C.

1899. St. Francis and You: An Appeal to Franciscan Tertiaries. London; Burns and Oates.

Cuthbert, (Hess), Father, O. S. F. C.

1912. The Romanticism of St. Francis: And Other Studies in the Genius of the Franciscans. London; Longmans, Green and Co.

Cuthbert, (Hess) Father, O. S. F. C.

1913. Life of St. Francis of Assisi. London; Longmans Green and Co.

Cuthbert, (Hess), Father, O. S. F. C.

1926. "St. Francis of Assisi". *The Dublin Review*, Vol. 179, No. 359. 161-171.

Cuthbert, (Hess), Father, O. S. F. C.

1932. "The Mysticism of St. Francis of Assisi; His Sacramental View of the Visible World". *Ecclesiastical Review*, Vol. 87, 225-237.

D'Costa, Gavin.

1986. Theology and Religious Pluralism: The Challenge of Other Religions. Oxford; Basil Blackwell.

Daly, George.

1982. The Three Orders: Feudal Society Imagined. Chicago; University of Chicago Press.

Darmesteter, Madame James [A. Mary F. Robinson].

1897. The Life of Ernest Renan. London; Methuen.

David, George.

1964. Review of The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin. Indian and Foreign Review, New Delhi. 15 October.

Davies, Graham.

1983. "Squires in the East End?". Theology. Vol. LXXXVI, No. 712, 249-

Davies, Martin.

1946. A Few Saints in the National Gallery. London; Trustees of the National Gallery.

De Roebeck, Nesta.

1929. Among the Franciscan Tertiaries. London; J. M. Dent and Sons.

Defoe. Daniel.

1971. A Tour Through the Whole Island of Great Britain: Divided into Circuits or Journies Giving a Particular and Diverting Account of Whatever is Curious and Worth Observation. First published in three volumes, 1724-6. Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Delamont, S. and L. Duffin.

1978. The Nineteenth Century Woman: Her Cultural and Physical World. London; Croom Helm.

Delgrado, Gary.

1986. Organising the Movement: The Roots and Growth of ACORN.
Philadelphia; Temple University Press.

Dellafave, L. Richard, and George A. Hillery, Jr.

1980. "Status Inequality in a Religious Community: the Case of a Trappist Monastery". Social Forces, Vol 59, 1. 62-84.

Dellheim, Charles.

1982. The Face of the Past: The Preservation of the Medieval Inheritance in Victorian England. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Dennis, Fr. S. S. F.

1964. Father Algy. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Derry, T. K.

1978. "The Setting in World History", in Trevor I. Williams (Ed.), A History of Technology.

Desai, Kanu and Verrier Elwin.

1932. Mahatma Gandhi: Sketches in Pen, Pencil and Brush, with an Essay by Verrier Elwin. London; Golden Vista Press. Bombay; D. B. Tarapurevala.

Dessain, C. S. and T. Gornall (Ed.)

1973. Letters and Diaries of J. H. Newman. Oxford; Clarendon Press.

Dhavamony, Mariasusai.

1978. "Monasticism: Hindu and Christian". Bulletin Secretarius pro non Christianis, 37, 131, 40-53.

Dickens, A. G.

1989. The English Reformation. Second Edition. London. B. T. Batsford.

Dillenberger, Jane.

1986. Style and Content in Christian Art. London; S. C. M.

Dobbelaere, Karel.

1981. Secularization: A Multi-Dimensional Concept. Current Sociology, Volume 29 Number 2. London; Sage Publications.

Dobson, James O.

1926. The Little Poor Man of Assisi: A Consideration of the Life and Significance of St. Francis. London; S. C. M.

Dodd, Philip.

1986. "Englishness and the National Culture", in Englishness: Politics and Culture 1880-1920. London; Croom Helm. 1-29.

Doe, Vanessa.

1974. "Later Urban Landscapes: Italian Landscape in Nineteenth Century Bradford", in Landscapes and Documents. 63-74.

Douglas, Eileen, Brigadier.

n.d. Brother Francis or Less the Least. The Salvation Army; Red Hot Library.

Douglas, J. D. (Ed.)

1974. The New International Dictionary of the Christian Church. Exeter; Paternoster Press.

Douglas, Mary.

1982. "The Effects of Modernization on Religious Change", in Mary Douglas and Steven Tipton (Eds.), Religion and America. Boston; Beacon Press. 25-43.

Douillet, Jacques.

1958. What is a Saint? Translated from the French by Donald Attwater. London; Burns and Oates.

Doyle, Eric, O. F. M.

1974. The Rule and Testament of St. Francis. Godalming; Ladywell Press.

Doyle, Eric.

1983. The Disciple and the Master: St. Bonaventure's Sermons on St. Francis of Assisi. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Drummond, Andrew L.

1950. The Churches in English Fiction. Leicester; Edgar Backus.

Dubois, Leo L.

1906. St. Francis of Assisi: Social Reformer. New York; Benzigger Bros.

Dunkerley, C. (Ed.)

1889. The Official Report of the Church Congress held at Cardiff, October 1-4, 1889. London: Bemrose and Sons.

Dunkerley, C. (Ed.)

1893. The Church Congress in Birmingham: Reports of the Papers and Discussions. London; Bemrose and Sons.

Dupre, Louis and Don E. Saliers (Eds.)

1989. Christian Spirituality: Post-Reformation and Modern. New York; The Crossroad Publishing Company.

Dykes, Janet and Christine Standing.

1917. The Man Who Chose Poverty: The Story of St. Francis. Kingsway Series. London; Headley Bros.

Eden, George R. and F. C. Macdonald.

1932. Lightfoot of Durham: Memories and Appreciations. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Edwards, David L.

1987. The Futures of Christianity: An Analysis of Historical, Contemporary and Future Trends Within the Worldwide Church. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Egan, Father Andrew, O. F. M.

1900. "An English Tertiary". The Franciscan Monthly, Vol. V, 344-48.

Egan, Maurice F.

1912. Everybody's St. Francis. London; T. Fisher Unwin.

Ehrenheich, B. and D. English.

1979. For Her Own Good: 150 Years of the Experts' Advice to Women. London; Pluto Press.

Eisenstein, Elizabeth.

1968. "Some Conjectures about the Impact of Printing on Western Society and Thought; a Preliminary Report". Journal of Modern History, 40. I, March, 1-56.

Elenjimattam, Anthony

1963. St. Francis of Assisi: The Bhakti Yogi. Bombay; Aquinas Publications.

Ellis, Ienan.

1988. "The Intellectual Challenge to 'Official Religion'", in T. Thomas (Ed.), The British: Their Religious Beliefs and Practices, 1800-1986.

Ellwood Post, W.

1985. Saints, Signs and Symbols. Second Edition. London; S. P. C. K.

Elwin, Edward F.

1907. Indian Jottings: From Ten Years Experience in and around Poona City. London; John Murray.

Elwin, Verrier.

1930. Christian Dhyana: Or Prayer of Living Regard. London; S. P. C. K.

Elwin, Verrier.

1930. Richard Rolle: A Christian Sannyasi. Madras; Christian Literature Society.

Elwin, Verrier.

1932. Religious and Cultural Aspects of Khadi. Madras; M. R. Seshan.

Elwin, Verrier.

1932. Truth About India: Can We Get It? London; George Allen and Unwin.

Elwin, Verrier.

1933. St. Francis of Assisi. Madras; Christian Literature Society.

Elwin, Verrier.

1934. "A Mission of Service in the Wilds: The Gond Seva Mandal". Hindustan Times, 14 May.

Elwin, Verrier.

1937. Phulmat of the Hills. London; John Murray.

Elwin, Verrier.

1939. The Baiga. London; John Murray.

Elwin, Verrier.

1941. "Dreams of Indian Aboriginal Lepers". Man: A Record of Anthropological Science, Vol. XLI, May-June, Art.39, 55-60.

Elwin, Verrier.

1941. "Western Styles and Contrasting Eastern Jungle Fashions". The Illustrated Weekly of India, 12 Oct.

Elwin, Verrier.

1942. "What the Well-Dressed Jungle Man Wears". The Illustrated Weekly of India, 2 Aug.

Elwin, Verrier.

1952. "Twenty-One Years of Tribal India". The Illustrated Weekly of India, 21 Sept.

Elwin, Verrier.

1953. "Going Native". The Times of India, 24 May.

Elwin, Verrier.

1957. A Philosophy for NEFA. Shillong; NEFA.

Elwin, Verrier.

1958. Leaves from the Jungle: Life in a Gond Village. Second Edition. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Elwin, Verrier.

1962. The Philosophy of Love. The Patel Memorial Lecture. Delhi; Ministry of Information and Broadcasting.

Elwin, Verrier.

1964. The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin: An Autobiography. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Englebert, Omer.

1950. St. Francis of Assisi. London; Burns and Oates.

Ensor, R. C. K.

1963. England 1870-1914. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Erikson, Erik H.

1970. Gandhi's Truth: On the Origins of Militant Nonviolence. London; Faber and Faber.

Ettema, Michael J.

1987. "History museums and the culture of materialism", in Jo Blatti (Ed.), Past meets Present: Essays about Historic Interpretation and Public Audiences. Washington D.C. 62-85.

Everett, Alan.

1985. Landscape and Community in England. London; The Hambledon Press.

Farnham, Christie (Ed.)

1987. The Impact of Feminist Research in the Academy. Indiana, Bloomington; Indiania University Press.

Farquhar, J. N.

1915. The Crown of Hinduism. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Farquhar, J. N.

1929. Modern Religious Movements in India. London; Macmillan and Co.

Farrugia, Jean and Tony Gammons.

1980. Carrying British Mails: Five Centuries of Postal Transport by Land, Sea, and Air. London; National Postal Museum.

Fauré, Gabriel.

1924. The Land of St. Francis of Assisi. London; The Medici Society.

Febvre, Lucien and Henri-Jean Martin,

1976. The Coming of the Book: The Impact of Printing, 1450-1800. Translated by David Gerard. London; New Left Books.

Bibliography.

356

Fedden, Robin and Rosemary Joekes.

1984. The National Trust Guide, Third Edition. London; Jonathan Cape with the National Trust.

Felder, H.

1925. The Ideals of St. Francis of Assisi. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Fell, Christine E.

1981. "Hild, Abbess of Streonaeshalih", in *Hagiography and Medieval Literature*. A Symposium organised by The Centre for the Study of Vernacular Literature in the Middle Ages. Odense, Denmark; Odense University Press. 76-99.

Fenn, Richard K.

1978. Toward a Theory of Secularization. Norwich, CT; The Society for the Scientific Study of Religion.

Fenn, Richard K.

1982. Liturgies and Trials: The Secularization of Religious Language. Oxford; Basil Blackwell.

Fernandez, Frank.

1969. "A Critique of Verrier Elwin's Anthropology: Hill Bondo Social Organisation and Kinship Analysis", in M. C. Pradhan et al., Anthropology and Archaeology. 19-39.

Field-Bibb, J.

1991. Women Towards Priesthood. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Fielding Clarke, Oliver.

1970. Unfinished Conflict: An Autobiography of O. Fielding Clarke. Derby; The Citadel Press.

Fielding, Nigel G.

1988. "Between Micro and Macro", in Nigel G. Fielding (Ed.), Actions and Structures: Research Methods and Social Theory. 1-19.

Fielding, Nigel G.

1988. "Micro-sociology and Macro-theory", in Nigel G. Fielding (Ed.), Actions and Structures: Research Methods and Social Theory. 197-198.

Fielding, Nigel G.

1988. Actions and Structures: Research Methods and Social Theory. London; Sage.

Finberg, H. P. R.

1976. The Formation of England, 550-1042. London; Collins (Paladin).

Fischer, David Hackett.

1990. Albion's Seed: Four Folkways in America. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Fischer, Louis.

1982. The Life of Mahatma Gandhi. London; Granada Publishing.

Fishman, William J.

1988. East End, 1888: A Year in a London Borough among the Labouring Poor. London; Duckworth.

Flood, David, O. F. M. and Thadee Matura, O. F. M.

1975. The Birth of a Movement, translated by Paul Lachance, O. F. M. and Paul Schwartz, O. F. M. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Fortini, Gemma.

1983. "The Contribution of Arnaldo Fortini to Franciscan Studies". Franciscan Studies, Vol. 43.

Fracchia, Charles A.

1979. Living Together Alone: The New American Monasticism. San Francisco; Harper and Row.

Francis, Acharya of the Kurisumala Ashram.

1982. "The Guru: The Spiritual Father in the Hindu Tradition". Abba. Kalamazoo; Cistercian Publications.

Francis, E. K.

1950. "Toward a Typology of Religious Orders." The American Journal of Sociology, Vol. XV, No. 5, 437-449.

Francis, Fr., S. S. F.

1959. Brother Douglas: Apostle of the Outcast. London; A. R. Mowbray and Co.

Frere, W. H. and W. M. Kennedy.

1910. Visitation Articles and Injunctions of the Period of the Reformation 1536-58. Alcuin Club Collections XV.

Fry, Roger.

1900. "Giotto". The Monthly Review. December.

Furer-Haimendorf, C. von.

1964. "Obituary of Verrier Elwin". Man: A Record of Anthropological Science, Vol LXIV, Article 135, 114-115.

Furer-Haimendorf, C. von.

1964. Review of The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin. The Spectator. 22 December.

Gage, Richard L.

1989. Choose Life, A Dialogue, Arnold Toynbee and Daisaku Ikeda.
Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Gardner, Edmund G.

1926. "Saint Francis and Dante", in Seton (Ed.), Essays in Commemoration 1226-1926. 65-96.

Garvey. Colin, O. F. M.

1984. "Twisted Roots and Muddied Sources." The Cord, Vol. 34, No. 3, 68-83.

Gemello, Robert M.

1983. "Mysticism in its Contexts", in Katz (Ed.), Mysticism and Religious Traditions. 61-88.

Geoffrey, Brother, S. S. F.

1981. The Way of St. Francis: Tough Love in Practice. Oxford; Community of St. Clare.

George, Father, O. S. F.

1897. "The Discovery of America". The Franciscan Monthly, Vol. V, No. 6, 179-184.

Ghanshyam, Das Birla.

1977. Bapu: A Unique Association. Vol. 1. Bombay; Bharatiya Vidya Bhavan.

Ghilardi, Agostino.

1967. The Life and Times of St. Francis, translated by Salvator Attanasio. London; Paul Hamlyn.

Ghosh, Sadhan Kumar.

1964. "Talking about Books; Ezra Pound; 'Encounters'; Verrier Elwin; Keats; Shakespeare". Hindustan Standard, Calcutta, 23 August.

Gibbon, Edward.

1972. Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire in Six Volumes. First Published 1737-94. New York; J. M. Dent.

Gilson, Eric C. S.

1900. "The Parochial System", in H. Henson (Ed.), Church Problems, 113-142.

Gilson, Etienne (Ed.)

1954. The Church Speaks to the Modern World: The Social Teachings of Leo XIII. New York; Doubleday.

Glassman, Ronald M. and William H. Swatos (Eds.)

1986. Charisma, History, and Social Structure. New York and London; Greenwood Press.

Goa, D.

1979. "The Incarnation of Meaning: Approaching the Material Culture of Religious Traditions". *Material History Bulletin*, Vol. 8, 43-52.

Goad, Harold E.

1926. "The Dilemma of St. Francis: A Study of the Two Traditions", in W. W. Seton, St. Francis of Assisi, 1226-1926: Essays in Commemoration.

Goad, Harold E.

1929. The Fame of St. Francis: The First Walter Seton Memorial Lecture.
London; London University Press.

Goodich, Michael.

1983. "The politics of canonisation in the thirteenth century: lay and mendicant saints", in Wilson (Ed.), Saints and Their Cults. 169-187.

Gopalaswami, K.

1965. Gandhi and Bombay. Bombay; Gandhi Smarak Nidhii.

Gore, Charles (Ed.)

1890. Lux Mundi: A Series of Studies in the Religion of the Incarnation. London; John Murray.

Gore, Charles.

1890. Preface to Charles Gore (Ed.) Lux Mundi: A Series of Studies in the Religion of the Incarnation.

Gore, Charles.

1926. Can We Then Believe? London; John Murray.

Gorodetzky, Nadejda.

1976. Saint Tikhon of Zadonsk: Inspirer of Dostoevsky. Revised Edition. Crestwood, NY; St. Vladimir's Seminary Press.

Goudge, Elizabeth.

1959. St. Francis of Assisi. London; Duckworth.

Graham, Carol.

1946. Azariah of Dornakel: 1874-1945. London; S. C. M.

Graham, Carol.

1974. "Jack Winslow: A Personal Recollection". The Franciscan, Vol. XVI, 4, 169-170.

Green, John Richard.

1881. The Making of England. London; Macmillan.

Green, John Richard.

1888-90. A Short History of the English People, with maps, tables and an analysis by C. W. A. Tait. London; Macmillan.

Green, Julien.

1983. God's Fool: The Life and Times of Francis of Assisi, translated from the French by Peter Heinegg. London; Harper and Row.

Green, Martin (Ed.)

1987. Gandhi in India: In His Own Words. Hanover and London; University Press of New England.

Greene, Dana.

1991. Evelyn Underhill: Artist of the Infinite Life. London; Darton, Longman and Todd.

Grele, R.

1975. Envelopes of Sound: Oral History. Chicago; President Publishing.

Grierson, Janet.

1981. The Deaconess. London; C. I. O. Publishing.

Griffiths, Bede.

1966. Christian Ashram: Essays Towards a Hindu-Christian Dialogue. London; Darton, Longman and Todd.

Grimes, Cecil John.

1946. Towards an Indian Church: The Growth of the Church in India in Constitution and Life. London; S. P. C. K.

Groves, Reg.

1967. Conrad Noel and the Thaxted Movement: An Adventure in Christian Socialism. London; Merlin Press.

Habig, Marion A. O. F. M.

1947. As The Morning Star: The Passing of St. Francis. New York; McMullen.

Habig, Marion A., O. F. M. and Mark Hegener, O. F. M.

1977. A Short History of the Third Order. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Habig, Marion A., O. F. M. (Ed.)

1977. St. Francis of Assisi, Writings and Early Biographies: English Omnibus of the Sources for the Life of St. Francis. Translations by Raphael Brown, Benen Fahy, Placid Hermann, Paul Oligny, Nesta de Roebeck and Leo Shirley-Price, with a Research Bibliography by R. Brown. Third revised edition, including A New Fioretti, by John J. Moorman. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Habig, Marion A., O. F. M. (Ed.).

1979. The Franciscan Book of Saints: Revised and Rearranged according to the New Roman and Franciscan Liturgical Calendars of 1970 and 1975. Revised Edition. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Haigh, Christopher (Ed.)

1987. The English Reformation Revised. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Hall, John.

1979. The Sociology of Literature. London; Longmans.

Hallack, Cecily and Peter F. Anson.

1957. These Made Peace: Studies in the Lives of the Beatified and Canonised Members of the Third Order of St. Francis of Assisi. Edition revised and edited by Marion A. Habig, O. F. M. London; Burns and Oates.

Hammer, Robert. O. F. M.

1929. St. Francis of Assisi as an Educator and his Pedagogical Method. Washington; Franciscan Education Conference.

Hammond, Philip E. (Ed.)

1985. The Sacred in a Secular Age. Berkeley; University of California Press.

Hanson, A. T. and R. P. C. Hanson.

1987. The Identity of the Church: A Guide to Recognising the Contemporary Church. London; S. C. M.

Hardon, John. S. J.

1980. "Franciscans". Modern Catholic Dictionary. London; Robert Hale. 219.

Harrison, Alan.

1983. Bound for Life. London; Mowbray.

Harrison, B.

1978. Separate Spheres: The Opposition to Women's Suffrage in Britain. London; Croom Helm.

Harty, Russell.

1987. "Saints alive in the streets of old Assisi". The Sunday Times, 19 July, 40.

Haskell, Francis.

1976. Rediscoveries in Art: Some Aspects of Taste, Fashion and Collecting in England and France. Oxford; Phaidon.

Haskell, Francis.

1987. "The Manufacture of the Past in Nineteenth-Century Painting", in Haskell, Past and Present in Art and Taste: Selected Essays, 75-89.

Haskell, Francis.

1987. Past and Present in Art and Taste: Selected Essays. New Haven; Yale University Press.

Haskell, Francis.

1987. The Painful Birth of the Art Book. The Nineteenth Walter Neurath Memorial Lecture. London; Thames and Hudson.

Hassard, John (Ed.)

1990. The Sociology of Time. London; Macmillan.

Hastings, Adrian.

1986. A History of English Christianity. London; Collins.

Haw, George (Ed.)

1904. The Religious Doubts of Democracy. London; Macmillan.

Hay, Stephen.

1989. "The making of a late Victorian Hindu: M. K. Gandhi in London, 1888-1891." Victorian Studies, Vol. 33, No. 1, Autumn. 75-98.

Head, Thomas.

1990. Hagiography and the Cult of Saints: The Diocese of Orleans, 800-1200. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Heeney, Brian.

1988. The Women's Movement in The Church of England 1850-1930. Oxford; Clarendon Press.

Heffernan, Thomas J.

1988. Sacred Biography: Saints and their Biographers in the Middle Ages. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Heiler, Friedrich.

1924 Sadhu Sundar Singh: Ein Apostel des Ostens und Westens. Munchen; Verlag von Ernst Reinhardt.

Heiler, Friedrich.

1926. The Spirit of Worship: Its Forms and Manifestations in the Christian Churches, with an Additional Essay on Catholicity, Eastern, Roman, and Evangelical. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Heiler, Friedrich.

1979. Preface to Nicholas Arseniev, Mysticism and the Eastern Church. (First published 1926).

Henderson, Katherine Usher and Barbara F. McManus.

1985. Half Humankind: Contexts and Texts of the Controversy about Women in England, 1540-1640. Urbana and Chicago; University of Illinois Press.

Henige, David.

1982. Oral Historiography. London; Longmans.

Henson, Henley.

1942. Retrospect of an Unimportant Life. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Henson, Hensley (Ed.)

1900. Church Problems: A View of Modern Anglicanism. London; J. Murray.

Henson, Hensley.

1950. An Open Letter to a Young Padre. Reprinted from H. Henson, Retrospect of an Unimportant Life. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Hermann, Placid, O. F. M.

1973. "Introduction to the First and Second Life of St. Francis with Selections from Treatises on the Miracles of Blessed Francis by Thomas of Celano", in Marion A. Habig (Ed.), St. Francis of Assisi, Writings and Early Biographies: English Omnibus of the Sources for the Life of St. Francis. 177-212.

Heslop, T. A.

1987. "Attitudes to the Visual Arts: The Evidence from Visual Sources", in *The Age of Chivalry: Art in Plantagenet England*. London; The Royal Academy.

Hesse, Hermann.

1974. "From the Childhood of St. Francis of Assisi", first published in 1919, in Hesse, Stories of Five Decades. London; Jonathan Cape. 249-257.

Hesse, Hermann.

1974. Stories of Five Decades, translated by Ralph Manheim. London; Jonathan Cape.

Hesse, Hermann.

1978. "Our Age's Yearning for a Philosophy of Life: 1926-1927" in My Belief: Essays on Life and Art. St. Albans; Triad Books.

Hewison, Robert.

1987. The Heritage Industry: Britain in a Climate of Decline. London; Methuen.

Heyck, T. W.

1982. The Transformation of Intellectual Life in Victorian England. London and Canberra; Croom Helm.

Hill, Christopher.

1989. A Turbulent, Seditious, and Factious People: John Bunyan and his Church. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Hill, Michael.

1973. The Religious Order: A Study of Virtuoso Religion and its Legitimation in the Nineteenth Century Church of England. London; Heinemann.

Hinnels, John R. and Eric J. Sharpe (Eds.)

1972. Hinduism. Newcastle upon Tyne; Oriel Press.

Hivale, Shamrao.

1946. The Scholar Gypsy: A Study of Verrier Elwin. Bombay; N. M. Tripathi.

Hobsbawm, Eric and Terence Ranger (Eds.)

1983. The Invention of Tradition. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Hobsbawm, Eric.

1983. "Introduction: Inventing Traditions" in E. Hobsbawm and T. Ranger (Eds.), The Invention of Tradition. 1-14.

Hobsbawn, Eric.

1989. Nations and Nationalism since 1780. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Hocking, W. E.

1932. Re-thinking Missions. New York; Harper and Row.

Holcombe, L.

1973. Victorian Ladies at Work. London; David and Charles.

Holl, Adolph.

1980. The Last Christian. Trans. Peter Heinegg. New York; Doubleday.

Hollis, Patricia.

1979. Women in Public 1850-1900: Documents of the Victorian Women's Movement. London; George Allen and Unwin.

Holmes, George (Ed.)

1988. The Oxford Illustrated History of Medieval Europe. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Holmes, J. Derek.

1981. The Papacy in the Modern World 1914-1978. London; Burns and Oates.

Hook, Sidney.

1943. The Hero in History: A Study in Limitation and Possibility. New York; John Day Company.

Hope, Ronald Kemp.

1985. Guyana: Politics and Development in an Emergent Socialist State. New York; Mosaic Press.

Hopkins, C. H. G.

1954. Pallion, 1874-1954. Sunderland; Wearside Printing Co.

Hopkins, J. Ellice.

1879. A Plea for the Wider Action of the Church of England in the Prevention of the Degradation of Women. London; Hatchards.

Hopkins, J. Ellice.

1882. Grave Moral Questions Addressed to the Men and Women of England. London; Hatchards.

Hopkins, J. Ellice.

1883. The White Cross Army: A Statement of the Bishop of Durham's Movement. London; Hatchards.

Hopkins, J. Ellice.

1885. The Purity Movement: Cannot We Use Existing Institutions? A Practical Suggestion to Clergy and Layworkers. London: Hatchards.

Hopkins, J. Ellice.

n.d. Ten Reasons Why I Should Join the White Cross Movement. Printer unknown.

Hopkins, J. Ellice.

n.d. The White Cross Army. London; Baines, printers.

Horne, Donald.

1984. The Great Museum: The Re-Presentation of History. London; Pluto Press.

Horne, Donald.

1986. The Public Culture: The Triumph of Industrialism. London; Pluto Press.

Hornsby-Smith, Michael P.

1987. Roman Catholics in England: Studies in Social Structure since the Second World War. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Housman, Laurence.

1918. St. Francis Poverello. Part of a Series, Messages of the Saints, edited by Alfred W. Pollard. London; Sidgwick and Jackson.

Housman, Laurence.

1926. "St. Francis, the Man". Theology, Vol. XIII, Sept. No. 75, 125-8.

Housman, Laurence.

1958. Little Plays of St. Francis. Vols. I, II and III. First published in Three Volumes 1935. Published separately and in series from 1922. London; Sidgwick and Jackson.

Howard, Ebenezer.

1965. Garden Centres of Tomorrow. Cambridge (Mass.); Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

Howell, A. G. Ferrers.

1906. Franciscan Days. Selections for Every Day of the Year from Ancient Franciscan Writings. London; Methuen.

Howse, D.

1980. Greenwich Mean Time and the Discovery of Longitude. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Howse, Ernest Marshall.

1976. Saints in Politics: The 'Clapham Sect' and The Growth of Freedom. First published 1952 in Toronto. London; George Allen and Unwin.

Hoyland, John S.

1932. An Indian Peasant Mystic (Translations of Tukaram). London; Allenson and Co.

Hoyland, John S.

1934. Village Songs of Western India (Translations of Tukaram).
London; Allenson and Co.

Hudson, Kenneth.

1981. A Social History of Archaelogy: The British Experience. London; Macmillan.

Hudson, Kenneth.

1987. Museums of Influence. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Hurwitz, Edith F.

1977. "The International Sisterhood" in Renate Bridenthal and Claudia Koonz, Becoming Visible: Women in European History, 325-345.

Hutchinson, John.

1987. The Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism: The Gaelic Revival and the Creation of the Irish Nation State. London; Allen and Unwin.

Hutton, Edward.

1913. Cities of Umbria. Fifth Edition. First Edition 1905. London; Methuen.

Hutton, Edward.

1926. The Franciscans in England: 1224-1538. London; Constable and Company.

Hutton, Edward.

1950. Introduction to Omer Englebert, St. Francis of Assisi, 1-18.

Cavanna, P. Nicola.

1910. L'Umbria Francescana Illustrata. Perugia.

Hutton, J. H.

1939. Foreword to Verrier Elwin, The Baiga. xxi-xxv.

Hyam, R.

1976. Britain's Imperial Century: A Study of Empire and Expansion, 1885-1914. London; Macmillan.

Inglis, K. S.

1963. Churches and the Working Class in Victorian England. London; Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Iriarte, Father Lazaro de Aspurz, O. F. M. Cap.,

1982. Franciscan History: The Three Orders of St. Francis of Assisi.
Translated from the Spanish by Patricia Ross. Chicago;
Franciscan Herald Press.

Irwin, Lord.

1932. Indian Problems: Speeches by Lord Irwin. London; George Allen and Unwin.

Jackson, Holbrook.

1927. The Eighteen Nineties: A Review of Art and Ideas at the Close of the Nineteenth Century. First Published in 1913. Harmondsworth; Penguin.

Jackson, J. B.

1986. "The Vernacular Landscape", in Penning-Rowell and Lowenthal (Eds.), Landscapes, Meanings and Values, 65-77.

Jacob, Plamthudathal.

1929. The Experiential Response of N. V. Tilak. Madras; Christian Literature Society.

Jake, J. L.

1926. "The Franciscans in London; Associations with the City". The Times, 2 Oct.

Jameson, Mrs.

1852. Legends of the Monastic Orders as represented in the Fine Arts forming the Second Series of Sacred and Legendary Art. Second Edition. London; Longman, Brown, Green and Longmans.

Jaques, Elliott.

1990. "The Enigma of Time", in John Hassard (Ed.), The Sociology of Time. 21-34.

Jayaraman, R.

1981. Caste and Class: Dynamics of Inequality in Indian Society. Delhi; Hindustan Publishing Corporation.

Jeffreys, Sheila.

1985. The Spinster and her Enemies: Feminism and Sexuality 1880-1930. London; Pandora.

Jessop, Augustus.

1889. "Daily life in a Medieval Monastery", in The Coming of the Friars and Other Essays. 90-165.

Jessop, Augustus.

1889. The Coming of the Friars and Other Essays. London; T. Fisher Unwin.

Jesudasan, I., S. J.

1937. Ashrams Ancient and Modern: Their Aims and Ideals. Vellore; Sri Ramchandra Press.

Jesudasan I., S. J.

1970. "Gandhian Perspectives on Missiology". The Indian Church History Review, Vol. IV, No. 1, 45-72.

Jioultsis, Basil.

1975. "Religious Brotherhoods: A Sociological View". Social Compass, Vol XXII, 1, 67-83.

Joergenson, Johannes.

1965. St. Francis of Assisi: A Biography. First published 1912. Translated from the Danish by T. O'Connor Sloane. New York; Longmans, Green and Co.

Joerges, Bernward.

1988. "Technology in Everyday Life: Conceptual Queries". Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour, 18, 2, June, 219-237.

Johnson, Richard, Gregor McLennan, Bill Schwarz and David Sutton (Eds.) 1982. Making Histories: Studies in History-Writing and Politics. London; Hutchinson.

Johnson, Richard.

1986. "The story so far: and further transformations?", in David Palmer (Ed.), Introduction to Contemporary Culture Studies. London; Longman. 277-313.

Johnston, William.

1978. The Mysticism of the Cloud of Unknowing. Vol. 8 of Religious Experience Series. Wheathampstead, Hertfordshire; Anthony Clarke.

Jones, Charles W.

1978. St. Nicholas of Myra, Bari, and Manhattan: Biography of a Legend. Chicago; University of Chicago Press.

Jones, E. Stanley.

1925. The Christ of the Indian Road. Lucknow; Lucknow Publishing House.

Jones, Michael Owen.

1988. Field Studies of Culture and Symbolism. London; Sage Publications.

Jones, P. d'A.

1968. The Christian Socialist Revival, 1877-1914. Princeton; Princeton University Press.

Josa, Luigi Fortunata.

1888. The Apostle of the Indians: A Memoir of the Life and Labours of the Rev. W. H. Brett, B.D. for Forty Years a Missionary in Guiana. London; Wells, Garner, Darton and Co.

Josa, Luigi Fortunata.

1898. St Francis of Assisi and the Third Order in the Anglo-Catholic Church. First Edition. Oxford; A. R. Mowbray and Co.

Josa, Luigi Fortunata.

1903. St Francis of Assisi and the Third Order in the Anglo-Catholic Church. First Edition revised and reprinted. Oxford; A. R. Mowbray and Co.

Jung, L. Shannon.

1987. "Ethics and the Image of the Self in the Theology of Story", in W. H. Swatos, Jr., Religious Sociology: Interfaces and Boundaries.

Kaftal, George.

1950. St. Francis in Italian Painting. London; George Allen and Unwin.

Kaftal, George.

1952. Iconography in Tuscan Paintings. Florence; Sansoni.

Kaftal, George.

1965. Iconography of the Saints in Central and South Italian Schools of Painting. Florence; Sansoni.

Kanter, Rosabeth Moss.

1972. Commitment and Community: Communes and Utopias in Sociological Perspective. Cambridge, Massachusetts; Harvard University Press.

Katz, Steven T. (Ed.)

1983. Mysticism and Religious Traditions. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Kavanagh, Gaynor.

1990. History Curatorship. Leicester; Leicester University Press.

Kazantzakis, Nikos.

1975. God's Pauper: St. Francis of Assisi. Translated from the Greek by P. A. Bien, 1962. Oxford; Bruno Cassirer.

Kedourie, Elie (Ed.)

1970. Nationalism in Asia and Africa. London; Weidenfeld and Nicholson.

Kedourie, Elie.

1970. Introduction to Kedourie, Nationalism in Asia and Africa. 1-12.

Keer, Dhanunjay.

1973. Mahatma Gandhi: Political Saint and Unarmed Prophet. Bombay; Popular Prakashan.

Kelway, A. Clifton (Ed.)

1908. A Frianciscan Revival: The Story of the Society of the Divine Compassion. Plaistow, East London; Whitwell Press.

Kenners, Emmanuel, Fr.

1913. Portiuncula: or the Celebrated Indulgence Granted by Our Lord Christ at Request of the Seraphic Father, St. Francis of Assisi. Glasgow; Murray and Donnelly.

Kern, Stephen.

1983. The Culture of Time and Space, 1880-1918. London; Weidenfeld and Nicolson.

Kieckhefer, Richard and George D. Bond. (Eds.)

1988. "Afterword: Toward a Comparative Study of Sainthood", in Sainthood: Its Manifestations in World Religions. 243-254.

Kieckhefer, Richard and George D. Bond (Eds.)

1988. Sainthood: Its Manifestations in World Religions. Berkeley; University of Berkeley Press.

Kieckhefer, Richard.

1988. "Imitators of Christ: Sainthood in the Christian Tradition", in Sainthood: Its Manifestations in World Religions, 1-42.

Kielbowicz, Richard B. and C. Scherer.

1986. "The Role of the Press in the Dynamics of Social Movements". Research and Social Movements, Conflicts and Change, Vol. 9, 71-96.

Kincaid, Dennis.

1938. British Social Life in India: 1608-1937. London; George Routledge and Sons.

Klostermaier, Klaus.

1969. Hindu and Christian in Vrindabam. London; S. C. M. Press.

Klostermaier, Klaus.

1980. "Will India's Past be America's Future?" Journal of Asian and African Studies, 15, 1-2, 99.

Knott, Kim.

1986. My Sweet Lord: The Hare Krishna Movement. Wellingborough; The Aquarian Press.

Knowles, David.

1981. The English Mystical Tradition. London; Burns and Oates.

Knowles, Dom David, O. S. B.

1959. The Religious Orders in England. Three Volumes. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Kohli, Martin.

1981. "Biography: Account, Text, Method", in Bertaux (Ed.), Biography and Society: The Life History Approach in the Social Sciences.

Koltonski, A.

1926. St Francis of Assisi and Giotto: Art on the Altar of Faith, translated by Edward Weintal. London; Sampson Lowe, Marston and Co.

Lambertini, Prosper.

1851. Heroic Virtue: A Portion of the Treatise of Benedict XIV on the Beatification and Canonisation of the Servants of God. 3 Vols. London; Thomas Richardson and Son.

Langford-James, R. Ll.

1926. "St. Francis: The Mystic". Theology, Vol. XIII, No. 75, 129-135.

Lasch, Christopher.

1984. "The politics of nostalgia". Harper's. November, 65-70.

Le Monnier, Abbé Leon.

1894. History of St. Francis of Assisi, translated from the French by A Franciscan Tertiary. London; Kegan Paul, Trench Trubner and Co.

Leclerc, Eloi, O. F. M.

1972. The Song of the Dawn, translated from the French by Paul Schwartz and Paul Lachance. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Leclerc, Eloi, O. F. M.

1977. The Canticle of Creatures, Symbols of Union: An Analysis of St. Francis of Assisi, translated from the French by Matthew J. O'Connell. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Leclerc, Eloi, O. F. M.

1983. Francis of Assisi: Return to the Gospel, translated from the French by Bro. Richard Arnandex, F. S. C.. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Leclercq, Jean, O. S. B.

1970. "A Sociological Approach to the History of a Religious Order", in Pennington (Ed.), The Cistercian Spirit: A Symposium, 88-134.

Leidt, William (Ed.)

1963. The Anglican Mosaic. Toronto; The Anglican Congress.

Leo XIII and Successors.

1943. Rome Hath Spoken (Papal encyclicals on the Third Order of St. Francis), translated by James Meyer. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Leone, Mark P.

1979. Roots of Modern Mormonism. Cambridge Mass: Harvard University Press.

Levi, Peter.

1987. The Frontiers of Paradise: A Study of Monks and Monasteries. London; Collins Harvill.

Levine, Philippa.

1986. The Amateur and the Professional: Antiquarians, Historians and Archaeologists in Victorian England, 1838-1886. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Levine, Philippa.

1990. Feminist Lives in Victorian England: Private Roles and Public Commitment. Oxford; Basil Blackwell.

Lewis, I. M.

1986. Religion in Context: Cults and Charisma. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Lewis, Jane.

1984. Women in England 1870-1950: Sexual Divisions and Social Change. Sussex; Wheatsheaf.

Liddon, H. P.

1889. The Vision at Corinth. A Sermon preached in the Cathedral Church of Christ at Oxford on behalf of the Christ Church Mission at Poplar, East London on 12 May.

Lightfoot, J. B.

1883. An Address to Members of the White Cross Army, delivered at St. Mary's Church, Gateshead on 20 May. London; Hatchards.

Lightfoot J. B.

1884. Primary Charge: Two Addresses Delivered to the Clergy of the Diocese of Durham in December 1882. London; Macmillan.

Lightfoot, J. B.

1886. A Charge Delivered to the Clergy of the Diocese of Durham, November 25th., 1886. London; Macmillan.

Lightfoot, J. B.

1890. "The Christina Ministry" in Lightfoot, St. Paul's First Epistle to the Philippians, with Introduction, Notes and Dissertations. First Edition in 1868. London; Macmillan. 181-229.

Lightfoot, J. B.

1890. Leaders in the Northern Church: Sermons Preached in the Diocese of Durham. London; Macmillan.

Little, A. G.

1892. The Grey Friars in Oxford . . . together with Appendices of Original Documents. Oxford; Oxford Historical Society Publications, Vol. 20.

Little, A. G.

1926. Notes on the Exhibition of Franciscan Manuscripts at the British Museum. London; British Museum.

Little, A. G. and H. Boehmer.

1926. The Coming of the Friars Minor to England and Germany: Being the Chronicles of Brother Thomas of Eccleston and Brother Jordan of Giano, translated from the Latin by E. Gurney Salter. London; J. M. Dent.

Little, A. G.

1928. "Guide pour les études franciscaines". Etudes Franciscaines, Vol. 40, 517-533.

Little, A. G.

1929. "Guide pour les études franciscaines". Etudes Franciscaines, Vol. 41, 64-74.

Little, A. G.

1932. "A Note on the History and Work of the British Society of Franciscan Studies". Franciscan Essays II: Extra Series, Vol. III, vii-xii. Manchester; Manchester University Press.

Little, A. G.

1937. Franciscan History and Legend in English Medieval Art. Manchester; Manchester University Press.

Little, A. G.

1943. Franciscan Papers, Lists and Documents. Manchester; Manchester University Press.

Lloyd, Teresa.

1969. Poor Man of Assisi. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Loch, C. S.

1882. Some Necessary Reforms in Charitable Work. London; Charity Organisation Society.

Lockley, Andrew.

1976. Christian Communes. London; S. C. M. Press.

Lofland, John.

1976. Doing Social Life: The Qualitative Study of Human Interaction in Natural Settings. New York; John Wibey and Sons.

Longford, Lord.

1978. Francis of Assisi: A Life for all Seasons. London; Weidenfeld and Nicholson.

Longley, Clifford.

1986. "Search for Anglican Identity". The Times, Monday 14 April.

Lowenthal, David,

1986. Introduction to Penning-Rowelland Lowenthal (Eds.), Landscapes, Meanings and Values, 1-3.

Lowenthal, David.

1985. The Past is a Foreign Country. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Lowenthal, David.

1989. "Nostalgia tells it like it wasn't", in Christopher Shaw and Malcolm Chase (Eds.), The Imagined Past: History and Nostalgia. 18-32.

Lumley, Robert (Ed.)

1988. The Museum Time-Machine: Putting Cultures on Display. London; Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Luther, Martin.

1845. Preface to a Book of Selections from the Legends of St. Francis; entitled "The Absurd Acts of the Barefooted Franciscans to enoble the Saint of their Order, literally 'The Owls' Play of the Barefooted Monks", translated from the German text of 1542. Brighton; William Whittemore, Kings Road.

Lynch-Watson, Janet.

1975. The Saffron Robe: A Life of Sadhu Sundar Singh. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Macfarlane, Alan.

1987. The Culture of Capitalism. Oxford; Blackwell.

Mackay, Henry F. B.

1924. The Message of St. Francis. London; Society of St. Peter and St. Paul.

Mackenzie, D. and J. Wajcman (Ed.)

1985. The Social Shaping of Technology. Milton Keynes; Open University Press.

Mackenzie, F. D.

1926. "Thinking Internationally", in Towards a Catholic Standard of Life: Being a Short Report of the First Summmer School of Sociology, July 1925 at Keble College. London; The Church Literature Association. 113-128.

Mackinnon, Alan.

1910. The Oxford Amateurs: A Short History of Theatricals at the University. London; Chapman and Hall.

Majumdar, D. N.

1952. Review of Verrier Elwin, Bondo Highlander. Man in India, Vol. 32, 1, 43-7.

Mandelbaum, David G.

1965. "Verrier Elwin, 1902-1964". American Anthropologist, Vol. 67, No. 2, April, 448-452.

Marcus, S.

1966. The Other Victorians: A Study of Sexuality and Pornography in Mid-Nineteenth Century England. London; Weidenfeld and Nicholson.

Marsh, Jan.

1982. Back to the Land: The Pastoral Impulse in Victorian England, from 1880 to 1914. London; Quartet Books.

Marson, C. L.

1894. "The Social Teachings of the Early Fathers", in A. Reid (Ed.), Vox Clamantium.

Martin, A. R. (Ed.)

1937. Franciscan Architecture in England. British Society for Franciscan Studies, Vol. XVIII. Manchester; Manchester University Press.

Martin, David.

1975. Foreword to Whitworth, God's Blueprints: A Sociological Study of Three Utopian Sects.

Martin, Hugh.

1927. Christian Social Reformers of the Nineteenth Century. London; S. C. M.

Martindale, Andrew and Edi Baccheschi.

1966. The Complete Paintings of Giotto. Classics of World Art. London; Weidenfeld and Nicholson.

Marwick, A.

1977. Women at War 1914-18. London; Fontana.

Marwick, Arthur.

1970. The Nature of History. Basingstoke; Macmillan.

Masseron, Alexandre.

1931. The Franciscans, translated from the French by Warre B. Wells. London; Burns Oates and Washbourne.

Mathar, K. S.

1964. Review of The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin. International Journal of Comparative Sociology. Vol. 8, 127-8.

Matura, Thadee.

1982. "François d'Assise et sa Posterité Aujourd'hui", in Rotzetter et al., Un Chemin d'Evangile: L'Esprit Franciscain Hier and Aujourdhui. 267-321.

Maurice, F. D.

1886. The Religions of the World and their Relations to Christianity.
The Boyle Lectures. London; Macmillan.

Bibliography.

Mayhew, Arthur.

1929. Christianity and the Government of India: An Examination of the Christian Forces at Work in the Administration of India and of the Mutual Relations of the British Government and the Christian Missions 1600-1920. London; Faber and Gwyer Limited.

McCrindle, J. and S. Rowbottom.

1977. Dutiful Daughters of London. London; Allen Lane.

McDonnell, Colleen and Bernhardt Lang.

1988. Heaven: A History. Yale; Yale University Press.

McElrath, Damien (Ed.)

1980. Franciscan Christology: Selected Texts, Translations and Introductory Essays. New York; Franciscan Institute of St. Bonaventure.

McLeod, H.

1984. Religion and the Working Class in Nineteenth-Century Britain. London; Macmillan.

McLeod, Hugh.

1974. Class And Religion in the Late Victorian City. London; Croom Helm.

McLeod, Hugh.

1981. Religion and the People of Western Europe, 1789-1970. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

McManners, John (Ed.)

1990. The Oxford Illustrated History of Christianity. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Meacham, Standish.

1987. Toynbee Hall and Social Reform, 1880-1914. Yale; Yale University Press.

Meersman, Achilles, Fr.

1975. The Franciscans in Bombay: History of the Franciscans in the Territory Comprised within the Boundaries of the Present Archdiocese of Bombay. Bangalore; St. Anthony's Friary.

Mehra, Parshotan.

1985. A Dictionary of Modern Indian History: 1707-1947. Delhi; Oxford University Press.

Meiss, Millard.

1970. The Great Age of Fresco: Discoveries, Recoveries and Survivals. London; Phaidon Press.

Melucci, Alberto.

1980. "The New Social Movements: A Theoretical Approach". Social Science Information, 19, 199-226.

Melucci, Alberto.

1985. "The Symbolic Challenge of Contemporary Movements". Social Research, Vol. 52, No. 4, Winter, 789-816.

Metcalf, Thomas R.

1990. Indian Architecture and Britain's Raj. London; Faber.

Meyer, James.

1937. The Social Teachings of St. Francis. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Milburn, Geoffrey E. and Stuart Miller (Ed.)

1990. Sunderland: River, Town and People. A History from the 1780s. Sunderland; Sunderland Borough Council.

Milburn, Geoffrey E.

1990. "Education and Learning 1780-1914", in Milburn and Miller (Eds.), Sunderland: River, Town and People. A History from the 1780s. 141-154.

Milburn, Geoffrey E.

1990. "Religion and Society 1780-1914", in Sunderland: River, Town and People. A History from the 1780s. 105-123.

Miles, Matthew B.

1984. Qualitative Data Analysis: A Sourcebook of New Methods. London; Sage.

Mill, J. S.

1929. On the Subjection of Women. First published in 1869. London; Everyman.

Milleken, E. K.

1967. English Monasticism: Yesterday and Today. London; George Harrap.

Miller, David M.

1976. "The Guru as the Centre of Sacredness". Studies in Religion, 6, No. 5, 527-533.

Miller, David M. and Dorothy C. Wertz.

1976. Hindu Monastic Life and the Monks and Monasteries of Bhubaneswar. Montreal; McGill, Queens University Press.

Miller, Edward.

1973. That Noble Cabinet: A History of the British Museum. London; Andre Deutsch.

Misra, Bhabugrahi

1973. Verrier Elwin: A Pioneer Indian Anthropologist. London; Asia Publishing House.

Mitchell, J. Clyde.

1983. "Case and situation analysis". Sociological Review, Vol. 31, 2, 187-211.

Mitchell, Timothy

1989. "The World as Exhibition". Comparative Studies in Society and History. Vol. 31, 217-336.

Mitchinson, Naomi.

1964. "A Capacity for Joy". Review of The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin. Glasgow Herald. 31 October.

Moberley, R. C.

1897. Ministerial Priesthood. London; John Murray.

Mockler, Anthony.

1976. Francis of Assisi: The Wandering Years. Oxford; Phaidon.

Moggridge, M. W.

1889. London and Provincial Aspects of Charity Organisation. London; Charity Organisation Society.

Mol, Hans.

1976. Identity and the Sacred: A Sketch for a New Social-Scientific Theory of Religion. Oxford; Basil Blackwell.

Moleta, V.

1983. From St. Francis to Giotto: The Influence of St. Francis on Early Italian Art and Literature. Chicago; University of Chicago Press.

Moore, Katharine.

1974. Victorian Wives. London; Allison and Busby.

Moorhouse, Geoffrey.

1969. Against All Reason: The Religious Life in the Modern World. London; Weidenfeld and Nicholson.

Moorman, John R. H.

1940. Sources for the Life of St. Francis. Manchester; Manchester University Press.

Moorman, John R. H.

1950. St. Francis of Assisi. London; S. P. C. K.

Moorman, John R. H.

1968. A History of the Franciscan Order: From its Origins to the Year 1517. Oxford; Clarendon Press.

Moorman, John R. H.

1974. Franciscans in England. London; Mowbrays.

Moorman, John, R. H.

1977. Richest of Poor Men: The Spirituality of St. Francis of Assisi. London; Darton, Longman and Todd.

More, Richard.

1982. Growing in Faith: The Lee Abbey Story. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Morris, Colin.

1972. Medieval Media: Mass Communication in the Making of Europe, an Inaugural Lecture delivered to the University on 14 March. Southampton; University of Southampton.

Morris, Colin.

1989. The Papal Monarchy: The Western Church from 1050 to 1250. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Morris, Colin.

1990. "Christian Civilisation (1050-1400)", in John McManners (Ed.), The Oxford Illustrated History of Christianity. Oxford; Oxford University Press. 196-232.

Morris, Terence.

1976. Deviance and Control: The Secular Heresy. London; Hutchinson.

Mortimer, Raymond.

1964. "Saintliness Among the Tribesmen." Review of The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin. The Sunday Times, 18 October.

Mudie-Smith, R.

1904. The Religious Life of London. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Murray, Muz.

1980. Seeking the Master: A Guide to the Ashrams of India. Jersey, Channel Islands; Neville and Spearman.

Nanda, B. R.

1985. Gandhi and his Critics. Delhi; Oxford University Press.

Needleham, Jacob, and George Baker (Eds.)

1978. Understanding the New Religions. New York; The Seabury Press.

Neff, W. F.

1966. Victorian Working Women. First published in 1929 by Allen and Unwin. London; Frank Cass.

Nehru, Jawaharlal.

1942. An Autobiography with Musings on Recent Events in India. New Edition. London; John Lane, the Bodley Head.

Neibuhr, H. Richard.

1952. Christ and Culture. London; Faber and Faber.

Neill, Stephen C.

1934. Builders of the Indian Church: Present Problems in the Light of the Past. London; Edinburgh House Press.

Neill, Stephen C.

1964. A History of Christian Missions. Harmondsworth; Penguin Books.

Neill, Stephen C.

1974. Bhakti Hindu and Christian. Madras; Christian Literature Society.

Neill, Stephen C.

1977. Anglicanism. First Edition 1958. London; Mowbrays.

Newton, Francis, O. M. C.

1926. St. Francis and his Basilica, Assisi. Assisi; Casa Editrice Francescana, Sacro Convento.

Nicholson, D. H. S.

1923. The Mysticism of St. Francis of Assisi. London; Jonathan Cape.

Nigg, Walter.

1976. Francis of Assisi, translated from the German by William Neill. 71 full colour photographs by Toni Schneiders. London; A. R. Mowbray.

Nock, David A.

1981. "The Historical Process and the Reformulation of Religious Typologies: The Case of the Anglican Communion". Sociological Review, Vol 29, No. 3, 521-541.

Norman, Edward R.

1976. Church and Society in England: An Historical Survey, 1770-1990. Oxford; Clarendon.

Norman, Edward R.

1985. "Cardinal Manning and Temporal Power", in Derek Beales and Geoffrey Best, History, Society and the Churches: Essays in Honour of Owen Chadwick.

Norman, Edward R.

1987. The Victorian Christian Socialists. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

North, Richard.

1987. Fools for God. London; Collins.

Nyland, Chris.

1990. "Capitalism and the History of Work-Time Thought", in John Hassard (Ed.), The Sociology of Time. 130-154.

O'Brien, Isodore, O. F. M.

1975. Francis of Assisi: Mirror of Christ. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

O'Toole, Michael.

1983. Christian Ashrams in India. Pune; Ishvani Kendra.

O'Connor, Daniel.

1990. Gospel, Raj and Swaraj: The Missionary years of C. F. Andrews. London; U. S. P. G.

Oakley, Ann.

1982. Subject Women. Glasgow; Fontana.

Offe, Claus.

1985. "New Social Movements: Challenging the Boundaries of Institutional Politics". Social Research, Vol. 52, No. 4, Winter, 817-868.

Offner, Richard.

1952. Introduction to George Kaftal: Iconography in Tuscan Paintings.

Oliphant, Margaret.

1879. Francis of Assisi. First Published 1869 for The Sunday Library for Household Reading. London; Macmillan.

Oliphant, Margaret.

1989. Phoebe Junior. First published in 1876. London; Virago Press.

Osborne, Arthur.

1980. "The Nature and Function of the Guru". The Mountain Path, 17, 129-133.

Oswald, Father, O. S. F. C.

1929. The Third Order of St. Francis. Three lectures delivered in 1928 at the Franciscan School, Oxford.

Otto, Rudolph.

1926. The Idea of the Holy. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Otto, Rudolph.

1930. India's Religion of Grace. London; S. C. M. Press.

Otto, Rupolph.

1932. Mysticism, East and West. London; Macmillan.

Outhwaite, William.

1975. Understanding Social Life: The Method called 'Verstehen'.
London; George Allen and Unwin.

Ozanam, Frederick.

1914. The Franciscan Poets in Italy of the Thirteenth Century, translated and annotated by A. E. Nellen and N. C. Craig. London; David Nutt.

Palmer, David (Ed.)

1986. Introduction to Contemporary Culture Studies. London; Longman.

Pandey, B. N. (Ed.)

1979. The Indian Nationalist Movement 1885-1947: Select Documents. London; Macmillan.

Panikkar, R.

1968. The Unknown Christ of Hinduism. London; Darton, Longman and

Parekh, C. L.

1892. Eminent Indians on Indian Politics: With Sketches of their Lives, Portraits and Speeches. Bombay; Education Society's Steam Press.

Parrinder, Geoffrey.

1975. The Wisdom of the Forest: Sages of the Indian Upanishads. London; Sheldon Press.

Parsons, Gerald

1988. "Victorian Roman Catholicism: Emancipation, Expansion and Achievement", in Gerald Parsons (Ed.), Religion in Victorian Britain: Volume 1 Traditions. 146-183.

Parsons, Gerald (Ed.)

1988. Religion in Victorian Britain: Volume 1 Traditions. Manchester; Manchester University Press.

Parsons, Gerald.

1988. "Reform, Revival and Realignment: The Experience of Victorian Anglicanism", in Gerald Parsons (Ed.), Religion in Victorian Britain: Volume 1 Traditions. 14-66.

Pathy, C. H. V.

1964. Review of The Tribal World of Verrier Elwin. Bharat Jyoti. Bombay; 30 August.

Pawley, Bernard and Margaret.

1974. Rome and Canterbury Through Four Centuries. London; A. R. Mowbray and Co.

Payne, Robert.

1969. The Life and Death of Mahatma Gandhi. London; Bodley Head.

Peak, Francis.

1879. The Uncharitableness of Inadequate Relief. London; The Charity Organisation Society.

Pearce, Susan.

1986. "Objects as Signs and Symbols". Museums Journal, Vol. 86, No. 3, December, 131-135.

Pearce, Susan.

1986. "Objects, High and Low". Museums Journal, Vol. 86, No. 2, September, 79-82.

Pearce, Susan.

1986. "Thinking About Things". Museums Journal, Vol. 85, No. 4, March, 198-201.

Pearce, Susan.

1987. "Objects in Structures". Museums Journal, Vol. 86, No. 4, March, 178-181.

Peart-Binns, John S.

1973. Ambrose Reeves. London; Victor Gollancz.

Peer, Sir Charles.

1937. Preface to A. R. Martin, Franciscan Architecture in England, xv-xvi.

Pemberton, William S. Childe.

1909. The Life of Lord Norton (The Right Honourable Sir Charles Adderley, K.C.M.G., M.P.) 1814-1905: Statesman and Philanthropist. London; John Murray.

Penning-Rowell, Edmund C. and David Lowenthal (Eds.)
1986. Landscapes: Meanings and Values. London; Allen and Unwin.

Pennington, M. Basil (Ed.)

1970. The Cistercian Spirit: A Symposium. Shannon; Irish University.

Personal Narratives Group (Ed.)

1989. Interpreting Women's Lives: Feminist Theory and Personal Narratives. Bloomington and Indianapolois; Indiana University Press.

Petry, R. C.

1934. Ideal of Poverty of St. Francis of Assisi. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Pfaffenberger, Bryan.

1988. Microcomputer Applications in Qualitative Research. Sage University Papers on Qualitative Research Methods, Vol. 14. Beverly Hills CA; Sage.

Philipp, J.

1983. "Traditional Historical Narrative and Action-Oriented (or Ethnographic) History". Historical Studies, Vol 20, 339-352.

Pickering, W. S. F. (Ed.)

1981. A Social History of the Diocese of Newcastle, 1882-1982. London; Oriel Press.

Pickvance, C.

1985. "The Rise and Fall of Urban Movements and the Role of Comparative Analysis". Society and Space, Vol. 3, 31-53.

Piggin, Stuart.

1978. "Assessing Nineteenth-Century Missionary Motivation: Some Considerations of Theory and Method", in Baker, *Religious Motivation*, 327-337.

Pimlott, J. A. R.

1947. The Englishman's Holiday: A Social History. London; Faber and Faber.

Pinch, Trevor J. and Wiebe E. Bijker.

1987. "The Social Construction of Facts and Artefacts: Or How the Sociology of Science and the Sociology of Technology Might Benefit Each Other", in Bijker et al., The Social Construction of Technological Systems: New Directions in the Sociology and History of Technology. 17-50.

Pinchbeck, I.

1930. Women Workers and the Industrial Revolution 1750-1850. London; Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Pinney, Christopher.

1990. "Colonial Anthropology in the 'Laboratory of Mankind'", in C. A. Bayly (Ed.), *The Raj: India and the British 1600-1947.* London; National Portrait Gallery. 252-263.

Pius XI.

1926. Encyclical Letter of Pope Pius XI to his Venerable Brethren the Patriarchs, Primates, Archbishops, Bishops, and Other Ordinaries in Peace and Communion with the Apostolic See, on St. Francis of Assisi, on the Occasion of the Seventh Centenary of his Death. London; Burns, Oates and Washbourne.

Piven, Frances Fox and Richard A. Cloward.

1977. Poor People's Movements: Why They Succeed, How They Fail. New York; Pantheon Books.

Plummer, Ken.

1983. Documents of Life: An Introduction to the Problems and Literature of a Humanistic Method. London; George Allen and Unwin.

Pollard, Alfred W.

1903. Introduction to the Series, Messages of the Saints, in Housman, Francis of Assisi.

Ponsford, M. W.

1975. Excavations at Greyfriars, Bristol. Bristol; City of Bristol Museum and Art Gallery.

Poppy, Maximus, O. F. M.

1945. The Rules of the Third Order of St. Francis. New York; St. Bonaventure.

Popular Memory Group.

1982. "Popular Memory: Theory, Politics, Method", in Richard Johnson, Gregor McLennan, Bill Schwarz and David Sutton (Eds.), Making Histories: Studies in History-Writing and Politics.

Prabhu, Pandharrynath H.

1963. Hindu Social Organisation: A Study in Socio-Psychological and Ideological Foundations. Fourth Edition. Bombay; Popular Prakashan.

Pradhan, M. C.

1969. "Verrier Elwin as Anthropologist", in M. C. Pradhan et al., Anthropology and Archaeology. 3-18.

Pradhan, M. C., R. D. Singh, P. K. Misra, and D. B. Sastry (Eds.)

1969. Anthropology and Archaeology: Essays in Commemoration of
Verrier Elwin, 1902-1964. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Pretyman, the Rev. J. R.

1879. Voluntary versus Legal Relief. A paper given at Lower Hall, Exeter Hall, London. Charity Organisation Miscellaneous Papers.

Priestley, Joseph.

1818. A History of the Corruptions of Christianity. London; The British and Foreign Unitarian Association.

Prochaska, F. K.

1980. Women and Philanthropy in Nineteenth-Century England. Oxford; Clarendon Press.

Quinlan, Will. [The Rt. Rev. W. Q. Lash].

1947. To High Kailas. Bombay; Hind Kitabs Ltd.

Quinlan, Will. [The Rt. Rev. W. Q. Lash].

n.d. The Christian Ashram and the Religious Life. Madras; S. P. C. K.

Race, Alan.

1983. Christians and Religious Pluralism: Patterns in the Christian Theology of Religions. London; S. C. M. Press.

Radhakrishnan.

1988. The Hindu View of Life. Upton Lectures of 1926, first published by George Allen and Unwin, 1927. London; Unwin Hyman.

Ragin, Charles C.

1987. The Comparative Method: Moving Beyond Qualitative and Quantitative Strategies. Berkeley; The University of California Press.

Raine, James.

1828. Saint Cuthbert, with an account of the state in which his remains were found upon the opening of his tomb in Durham Cathedral in the year 1827. Durham; Dean and Chapter.

Ralston, H.

1988. Christian Ashrams. New York; Edwin Mellin Press.

Ramirez, Francisco O.

1981. "Comparative Social Movements". International Journal of Comparative Sociology, 22, 1-2, 3-21.

Raymond, Ernest.

1938. In the Steps of St. Francis. London; Rich and Cowan.

Read, Herbert (Consulting Editor).

1966. The Thames and Hudson Encyclopaedia of the Arts. London; Thames and Hudson.

Reckitt, Maurice B.

1946. Maurice to Temple: A Century of the Social Movement in the Church of England. London; Faber and Faber.

Reid, A. (Ed.)

1894. Vox Clamantium: The Gospel of the People. London; A. D. Innes.

Renan, Ernest.

1884. Nouvelles Études d'Histoire Religieuse. Paris; Calmann Levy.

Renan, Ernest.

1886. "Francis of Assisi", in Studies in Religious History. Authorised English Version of Nouvelles Études d' Histoire Religieuse. London; Richard Bentley and Son. 305-329.

Richards, Bernard.

1988. "Values and the Novel", in Brenda Almond and Bryan Wilson (Eds.), Values: A Symposium, 207-218.

Richter, Melvin.

1964. The Politics of Conscience: T. H. Green and His Age. London; Weidenfeld and Nicholson.

Riddle, Donald W.

1931. The Martyrs: A Study in Social Control. Chicago; University of Chicago Press.

Riegl, Alois.

1982. "The modern cult of monuments: its character and its origin". Oppositions, 25 (Fall), 21-51. New York; Rizzoli.

Riley, Matilda White (Ed.)

1988. Social Structures and Human Lives. American Sociological Association Presidential Series, Vol. 1 and Vol. 2. London; Sage.

Robbins, Thomas.

1988. Cults, Converts and Charisma: the Sociology of New Religious Movements. London; Sage, Current Sociology Student Edition.

Robertson, Roland.

1989. "Globalization, Politics and Religion", in James A. Beckford and Thomas Luckman (Eds.), *The Changing Face of Religion*. London; Sage Studies in International Sociology, 37, 10-23.

Robinson, John A. T.

1979. Truth is Two-Eyed. London; S. C. M. Press.

Robinson, Paschal, O. F. M.

1906. The Writings of St. Francis of Assisi, Newly Translated with Notes and Introduction. London; J. M. Dent.

387

Robinson, Paschal, O. F. M.

1907. A Short Introduction to Franciscan Literature. New York: Tennant and Ward and entered at Stationers Hall, London.

Robinson, Paschal, O. F. M.

1913. "Saint Francis of Assisi", in *The Catholic Encylopedia*, Vol. Six. New York; Encylopedic Press. 221-30.

Roeder, Helen.

1955. Saints and their Attributes: With a Guide to Localities and Patronage. London; Longmans.

Rogers, Alan and Trevor Rowley (Eds.)

1974. Landscapes and Documents. London; Standing Conference for Local History.

Roggen, Heribert, O. F. M.

1970. Spirit and Life: The Gospel Way of Life in the Writings of St. Francis and St. Clare. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Rollason D. W. (Ed.)

1987. Cuthbert: Saint and Patron. Durham; Dean and Chapter of Durham.

Rollason, D. W.

1987. "The wanderings of the community", in D. W. Rollason (Ed.), Cuthbert: Saint and Patron. 49-59.

Rollason, D. W.

1987. "Why was St. Cuthbert so popular?", in D. W. Rollason (Ed.), Cuthbert: Saint and Patron. 9-22.

Rollason, D. W.

1989. Saints and Relics in Anglo-Saxon England. Oxford; Basil Blackwell.

Ronaldshay, The Earl of.

1924. India: A Bird's-Eye View. London; Constable and Co.

Rose, Kenneth.

1969. Superior Person: A Portrait of Curzon and his Circle in Late Victorian England. London; Weidenfeld and Nicholson.

Rosenblum, Robert.

1967. Transformations in Late-Eighteenth Century Art. Princeton, New Jersey; Princeton University Press.

Roth, Paul A.

1989. "How Narratives Explain". Social Research, Vol. 56, No. 2, 449-478.

Rotzetter, A., W. C. Van Dijk and T. Matura.

1982. Un Chemin d'Evangile: l'Esprit Franciscain Hier et Aujourd'hui, translated by Norbert Sadin. Paris; Mediaspaul.

Rowbotham, Sheila.

1977. Hidden from History: Three Hundred Years of Women's Oppression and the Fight Against It. London; Pluto Press.

Rowe, D. J.

1981. "The Social and Economic Characteristics of Northumberland in the 1880's", in W. S. F. Pickering, A Social History of the Diocese of Newcastle.

Rudolph, Susanne Hoeber and Lloyd I. Rudolph.

1967. Gandhi: The Traditional Roots of Charisma. Chicago; University of Chicago Press.

Runcie, Robert.

1988. Authority in Crisis? An Anglican Response. London; S. C. M. Press.

Ruskin, J.

1871. Abstract of the Objects and Conditions of St. George's Guild.

Ruskin, J.

1896. Fors Clavigera. Orpington; George Allen.

Ruskin, J.

1900. Giotto and His Work in Padua. Orpington; George Allen.

Russell, Anthony.

1984. The Clerical Profession. London; S. P. C. K.

Sabatier, Paul.

1894. The Life of St. Francis of Assisi. First published in France in 1893, translated from the French by Louise Seymour Houghton. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Sabatier, Paul.

1900. "Regula antiqua fratrum er sororum de paenitentia seu tertii ordinis Sancti Francesci. Nunc primum edidit P. Sabatier". Opuscules de critique historiane. Fasc. 1.

Sabatier, Paul.

1900. Introduction to J. G. Adderley, Francis: The Little Poor Man of Assisi, vii-ix.

Sabatier, Paul.

1901. Vie de S. François d'Assise. Vingt-neuvième édition. Paris.

Sabatier, Paul.

1908. Modernism: The Jowett Lectures, 1908. Translated by C. A. Miles. London; T. Fisher Unwin.

Sabatier, Paul.

1912. "L'Originalité de S. François d'Assise." Franciscan Essays 1-17. Aberdeen; Aberdeen University Press.

Sabatier, Paul.

1915. A Frenchman's Thoughts on the War. Translated by Bernard Miall. London; T. Fisher Unwin.

Sabatier, Paul.

1926. Preface to Seton (Ed.), St Francis of Assisi, 1226-1926: Essays in Commemoration. London; University of London Press. v-ix.

Said, E. W.

1980. Orientalism. London; Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Salter, Emma Gurney.

1905. Franciscan Legends in Italian Art: Pictures in Italian Churches and Galleries. London; J. M. Dent.

Samartha, S. J.

1974. The Hindu Response to the Unbound Christ. Madras; Christian Literature Society.

Sarma, D. S.

1944. The Renaissance of Hinduism in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries. Benares; Benares Hindu University.

Saxe, Leonard and Michelle Fine.

1981. Social Experiments: Methods for Design and Evaluation. London; Sage Library of Social Research, Vol. 131.

Sayer, A.

1989. "The 'New' Regional Geography and Problems of Narrative".

Environment and Planning: Society and Space, Vol. 7, 253-276.

Scarvagliera, Guiseppe.

1980. La Vita Religiosa Degli Assisani. Assisi: Movimento Francescano.

Schaaf, Larry.

1992. Out of the Shadows: Herschel, Talbot and the Invention of Photography. Yale; Yale University Press.

Schmidt, Gail Ramshaw.

1982. Francis: A Saint We Share. A Discussion Guide for Lutherans and Roman Catholics. New York; Paulist Press.

Scott, Joan Wallach.

1987. "Women's History and the Rewriting of History", in C. Farnham,

The Impact of Feminist Research in the Academy. 34-50.

Bibliography.

390

Scott, Sr. Macrina, O. S. F.

1986. "Lifestages of a Saint". The Cord, Vol. 36, No.4, 98-105.

Seeley, J. R.

1883. The Expansion of England. London; Macmillan.

Seraphim, Sr. Mary, P. C. P. A.

1984. Clare: Her Light and Her Song. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Seton, Walter W.

1914. Two Fifteenth-Century Franciscan Rules edited from the MS. Published for the Early English Text Society by Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner and Co. Ltd.

Seton, Walter W.

1926. Six "Letters from Assisi" printed in the Church Times for six weeks from 4 Sept.

Seton, Walter W.

1926. "The Rediscovery of St. Francis", in Seton (Ed.), St Francis of Assisi, 1226-1926: Essays in Commemoration. London; University of London Press. 245-266.

Seton, Walter W. (Ed.)

1926. St Francis of Assisi, 1226-1926: Essays in Commemoration. London; University of London Press.

Shannon, Richard.

1976. The Crisis of Imperialism 1865-1915. St. Albans; Paladin.

Sharma, Avind.

1973. "Hinduism and Christian Missionary Activity: A Case Study for the Nineteenth Century". *The Indian Church History Review*, Vol. VII, No. 2, 151-158.

Sharpe, E.

1977. Faith Meets Faith: Some Christian Attitudes to Hinduism in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries. London; S. C. M. Press.

Sharpe, Rosemary.

1992. "Emily Marshall of Sunderland: A Victorian Campaigner for Women's Work in Anglican Parish Life". Antiquities of Sunderland, Vol. XXXIII, 1-14.

Shaw, Christopher and Malcolm Chase.

1989. The Imagined Past: History and Nostalgia. Manchester; Manchester University Press.

Shevelow, Kathryn.

1989. Women and Print Culture: The Construction of Feminity in the Early Periodical. London; Routledge.

Shils, Edward.

1975. Center and Periphery: Essays in Macrosociology. Chicago; The University of Chicago Press.

Shirley-Price, Leo.

1959. The Little Flowers of St. Francis. Translated with an Introduction. Harmondsworth; Penguin Classics.

Shirsat, K. R.

1979. Narayan Vaman Tilak: Poet and Patriot. Bombay; Bombay Tract and Book Society.

Short, Martin.

1989. Inside the Brotherhood: Further Secrets of Freemasons. London; Grafton.

Sinclair, Neil T.

1990. "Industry to 1914", in Geoffrey E. Milburn (Ed.), Sunderland: River, Town and People. A History from the 1780s. 21-32.

Smart, Alastair.

1971. The Assisi Problem and the Art of Giotto. Oxford; Clarendon Press.

Smart, Ninian.

1968. The Yogi and the Devotee: The Interplay between the Upanishads and Catholic Theology. New York; Allen and Unwin and Humanities Press.

Smith, Anthony D.

1984. "Ethnic Myths and Ethnic Revivals". Archives of European Sociology, Vol. XXV, 283-305.

Smith, Anthony D.

1984. "National Identity and Myths of Ethnic Descent". Research in Social Movements, Conflict and Change, Vol. 7, 95-130.

Smith, D. W.

1989. "Priscilla Maria Beckwith, 1806-1877: A Forgotten Victorian Lady". Northern Catholic History, Vol 30, Autumn, 20-31.

Smith, Valene L.

1977. Hosts and Guests: The Anthropology of Tourism. Pennsylvania; University of Pennsylvania Press.

Smith, Warren Sylvester.

1930. The London Heretics 1870-1914. London; Constable.

Sorrell, Roger D.

1988. St. Francis of Assisi and Nature: Tradition and Innovation in Western Christian Attitudes towards the Environment. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Bibliography.

Southern, R. W.

1970. Western Society and the Church in the Middle Ages. Pelican History of the Church, Volume Two. Harmondsworth; Penguin.

Sparrow, Gerald.

1955. Land of the Moonflower. London; Elek Books.

Stafford, William.

1989. "'This once happy country': nostalgia for pre-modern society", in Christopher Shaw and Malcolm Chase (Ed.), The Imagined Past; History and Nostalgia.

Stavrianos, L. S.

1990. Lifelines From Our Past: A New World History. London; I. B. Tauris.

Steane, John.

1985. The Archaeology of Medieval England and Wales. Beckenham, Kent; Croom Helm.

Steck, Francis Borgia, O. F. M.

1920. Franciscans and the Protestant Revolution in England. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Steele, Robert.

1926. Saint Francis and the Franciscans in the British Museum. Oxford; Basil Blackwell.

Steere, Douglas.

1977. God's Irregular: Arthur Shearly Cripps. London; S. C. M. Press.

Steinberg, S. H.

1966. Five Hundred Years of Printing. Harmondsworth; Penguin.

Steiner, Rudolph.

1928. Anthroposophical Ethics: With an Account of Francis of Assisi. London; Anthroposophical Publishing Company.

Stephenson, Alan M. G.

1978. Anglicanism and the Lambeth Conferences. London; S. P. C. K.

Stevens, T. P.

1943. Father Adderley. London; T. Werner Laurie.

Stevenson, John and Chris Cook.

1977. The Slump. London; Quartet Books.

Stevenson, Joseph. S. J.

1887. The Life of St. Cuthbert by the Venerable Bede, a translation from the Latin. London; Burns and Oates.

Stocking, George W. Jr.

1987. Victorian Anthropology. New York and London; The Free Press.

Stone, Laurence.

1987. "The Revival of Narrative: Reflections on a New Old History", in Stone, *The Past and the Present Revisited.* 74-96.

Stone, Lawrence,

1987. The Past and The Present Revisited, revised edition. London; Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Street, Paul.

1989. "Painting deepest England: the late landscape of John Linnell and the uses of nostalgia", in Shaw and Chase, The Imagined Past: History and Nostalgia. 68-80.

Streeter B. H. and A. J. Appasamy.

1921. The Sadhu: A Study in Mysticism and Practical Religion. London; Macmillan.

Stubblebine, James H.

1985. Assisi and the Rise of Vernacular Art. New York; Harper and Row.

Studdert-Kennedy, Gerald.

1990. "Gandhi and the Christian Imperialists". History Today. Vol 40, October, 1219-26.

Subercaseaux, Errazuriz, P.

1976. The Life of St. Francis in 50 Water Colour Paintings: With Introduction by Johannes Joergenson, and Foreword adapted from an Article by Annette S. Driscoll. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Swainson, W. P.

1903. Francis of Assisi: Saint and Mystic. No. 1 in a Series of Sketches of the Lives and Works of some Leaders of Christian Thought. London; C. W. Daniel.

Swanson, R. N.

1990. Church and Society in Late Medieval England. Oxford; Blackwell.

Swatos, William H. Jnr.

1979. "Into Denominationalism: The Anglican Metamorphosis", Monograph Series No. 2 of Society for the Scientific Study of Religion, Connecticut.

Swatos, William H. Jnr.

1987. Religious Sociology: Interfaces and Boundaries. New York; Greenwood Press.

Sykes, Marjorie (Ed.)

1973. C. F. Andrews: Representative Writings. New Delhi; National Book Trust.

Sykes, Stephen.

1984. The Identity of Christianity: Theologians and the Essence of Christianity from Schleiermacher to Barth. London; S. P. C. K.

Tahmankar, D. V.

1970. Sardar Patel. London; George Allen and Unwin.

Tamassia, Nino.

1910. St. Francis and His Legend, translated by Lonsdale Ragg. London; T. Fisher Unwin.

Tastard. Terry, S. S. F.

1989. The Spark in the Soul: Spirituality and Social Justice. London; Darton, Longman and Todd.

Tatlow, Tissington.

1933. The Story of the Student Christian Movement of Great Britain and Ireland. London; S. C. M. Press.

Tawney, R. H.

1921. The Acquisitive Society. London; G. Bell.

Tawney, R. H.

1926. Religion and the Rise of Capitalism: A Historical Study. London; John Murray.

Taylor, Anne.

1992. Annie Besant. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Telford, John.

1924. Thoughts from St. Francis of Assisi. London; The Epworth Press.

Temperini, Linus, T. O. R.

1974. "The Rule of the Third Order Regular of Saint Francis from its origins to the present day". Analecta, Volume XIII, No. 123, titled Tertii Ordinis Regularis Sancti Francisci. Rome; Curia Generalizia del Terzo Ordine Regolare Francescano. 73-91.

Tendulkar, D. G.

1952. Mahatma: Life of Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi. 3 Vols. Bombay; Vithalbhai K. Jhaveri and D. G. Tendulkar.

Thapar, Romita.

1981. "The householder and the renouncer in the Brahmanical and Buddhist traditions". Contributions to Indian Sociology (NS), 15, 273-298.

The Janitor.

1930. Pulpits and Personalities: A Survey of some Leading London Churches. London; Duckworth.

Thode, Henry.

1904. Franz von Assisi: Und die Anfanger der Kunst der Renaissance in Italien. Berlin; Verlagsbuchhandlung.

Thomas, Charles.

1971. The Early Christian Archaelogy of North Britain. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Thomas, M. M.

1969. The Acknowledged Christ of the Indian Renaissance. London; S. C. M. Press.

Thomas, M. M.

1976. The Secular Ideologies of India and the Secular Meaning of Christ. Madras; Christian Literature Society.

Thomas, Philipos.

1977. "Christian Ashrams and Evangelisation of India". The Indian Church History Review, Vol. XI, No. 3, 204-221.

Thomas, Terence (Ed.)

1989. The British: Their Religious Beliefs and Practices, 1800-1986. London; Routledge.

Thomas, W. I. and F. Znaniecki.

1920. The Polish Peasant in Europe and America. Chicago; University of Chicago Press.

Thompson, E.

1926. Rabindranath Tagore: Poet and Dramatist. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Thompson, Kenneth A.

1980. Bureaucracy and Church Reform: The Organisational Response of the Church of England to Social Change. Oxford; The Clarendon Press.

Thompson, Paul.

1981. "Life Histories and the Analysis of Social Change", in Bertaux (Ed.), Biography and Society: The Life History Approach in the Social Sciences.

Thrift, Nigel.

1990. "The Making of a Capitalist Time Consciousness", in John Hassard (Ed.), The Sociology of Time. 105-129.

Tilak, Lakshamibai.

1956. From Brahma to Christ: The Story of Narayam Waman Tilak and Lakshamibai his Wife. London; United Society for Christian Literature.

Tillett, B.

1931. Memories and Reflections. London; John Long.

Tindall, Gillian.

1991. Countries of the Mind: The Meaning of Place to Writers. London; Hogarth Press.

Tinker, Hugh.

1979. The Ordeal of Love: C. F. Andrews and India. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Tintori, L. and M. Meiss.

1967. The Paintings of the Life of St. Francis of Assisi. New York; Norton Paperbacks.

Tonkin, Elizabeth, Maryon McDonald and Malcolm Chapman (Eds.) 1989. History and Ethnicity. London; Routledge.

Touraine, Alain.

1978. The Voice and The Eye: An Analysis of Social Movements. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Townrow, John.

1988. "S. S. F. Over the Years". The Franciscan, Vol. XXX, No. 3, 134-139.

Trilling, Lionel.

1982. Matthew Arnold. Oxford; Oxford University Press.

Troeltsch, E.

1972. The Absoluteness of Christianity. London; S. C. M. Press.

Turner, Bryan S.

1983. Religion and Social Theory: A Materialist Perspective. London; Heinemann Educational Books.

Turner, Victor.

1957. Schism and Continuity in African Society. Oxford; Blackwell.

Turner, Victor.

1974. Fields and Metaphor: Symbolic Action in Human Society. Ithaca; Cornell University Press.

Turner, Victor.

1978. Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture: Anthropological Perspectives. Oxford; Blackwell.

Underhill, Evelyn.

1911. "A Franciscan Mystic of the Thirteenth Century: The Blessed Angela of Foligno". British Society of Franciscan Studies, Extra Series, Vol. 1, 88-107.

Underhill, Evelyn.

1926. "The Authority of Personal Religious Experience". Theology, Vol. 10, No. 55, Jan., 8-18.

Underhill, Evelyn.

1979. Introduction to Nicholas Arseniev, Mysticism and the Eastern Church. (First published 1926).

Valenze, Deborah M.

1985. Prophetic Sons and Daughters: Female Preaching and Popular Religion in Industrial England. Princeton, N. J.; Princeton University Press.

Van der Weyer, Robert.

1975. Guru Jesus. London; S. P. C. K.

Van der Weyer, Robert.

1988. The Little Gidding Way: Christian Community for Ordinary People. London; Darton, Longman and Todd.

Van Dijk, W.

1982. "L'Esprit Franciscain à Travers Les Siècles" in A. Rotzetter, W. C. Van Dijk, and T. Matura, *Un Chemin d'Evangile: l'Esprit Franciscain Hier et Aujourd'hui*. Paris; Mediaspaul. 155-264.

Vandana, Sister.

1978. Gurus, Ashrams and Christians. London; Darton Longman and Todd.

Varghese, K.

1961. Herbert Pakenham Walsh: A Memoir. Delhi; S. P. C. K.

Varghese, V. Titus and P. P. Philip.

1983. Glimpses of the History of the Christian Churches in India. Madras; The Christian Literature Society.

Vaughan, Herbert, Cardinal.

1893. Preface dated 11 April to the 1904 Franciscan Tertiary Manual containing the Rule and Ceromonial of the Third Order, together with the Encyclical Letter of Pope Leo XIII and an Explanation of the New Rule. ix-xvii.

Vaughan, Herbert, Cardinal.

1894. Preface to Le Monnier, History of St. Francis of Assisi. London; Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner and Co.

Vicinus, Martha.

1972. Suffer and be Still: Women of the Victorian Age. London; Bloomington.

Vidler, Alec.

1974. The Church in an Age of Revolution. Harmondsworth; Penguin.

Vincent, Louis (Ed.)

1925. The Little Brown Company: An Anthology of Franciscan Poetry and Prose. Limited Edition. Glasgow; University Press.

Von Galli, Mario, S. J.

1976. Living our Future: Francis of Assisi and the Church of Tomorrow. Colour photographs by Denis Stock. Translated by Maureen Sullivan and John Drury. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Vorreux, Damien, O. F. M.

1973. "Introduction to Major and Minor Life of St. Francis with Excerpts from Other Works of St. Bonaventure", in Habig (Ed.) St. Francis of Assisi, Writings and Early Biographies: English Omnibus of the Sources for the Life of St. Francis. 613-626.

Vorreux, Damien, O. F. M.

1977. A Franciscan Symbol, the Tau: History, Theology, Iconography, translated by Marilyn Archer, O. S. F. and Paul Lachance, O. F. M. Chicago; Franciscan Herald Press.

Walkowitz, Judith.

1980. Prostitution in Victorian Society: Women, Class, and the State. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Wallace, Anthony F. C.

1956. "Revitalisation Movements." American Anthropologist, Vol. 58, 264-281.

Wallace, Lillian Parker.

1966. Leo XIII and the Rise of Socialism. Duke University Press.

Walsh, James J.

1921. "The Historical Background of the Third Order of St. Francis."
A paper delivered at the 1921 U.S. Convention of Franciscan
Tertiaries.

Walsh, M. (Ed.)

1985. Butler's Lives of the Saints, concise edition. London; Burns and Oates.

Warner, Marina.

1976. Alone of all her Sex: The Myth and the Cult of the Virgin Mary. London; Weidenfield and Nicholson.

Washburn, Henry Bradford.

1931. The Religious Motive in Philanthropy: Studies in Biography. The George Dana Boardman Lectures. Philadelphia; University of Philadelphia Press.

Waters, Robert Amor.

1900. Hendon Past and Present. Sunderland; Hills and Co.

Weare, G. E.

1893. The Bristol Friars Minor. Bristol; W. Bennett.

Webb, Andrew.

1981. "The Christa Seva Sangh Ashram, 1922-1934". South Asia Research, 1, 37-52.

Webb, E. J., D. T. Campbell, R. D. Schwarz and L. Sechrest.

1977. "The Use of Archival Sources in Social Research", in Martin Bulmer (Ed.), Sociological Research Methods: An Introduction.

Weber, Max.

1964. The Sociology of Religion. First Published in Germany 1922. Translated by Ephraim Fischoff. Boston; Beacon Paperback.

Weinstein, Donald and Rudolph M. Bell.

1982. Saints and Society: The Two Worlds of Western Christendom, 1000-1700. Chicago; University of Chicago Press.

Welsh, Martin J.

1926. "Brother Francis." The Quarterly Review. No. 490. October, 336-46.

Westcott, B. F.

1887. Social Aspects of Christianity. London; Macmillan.

Westcott, B. F.

1890. Socialism. A paper read at the Church Congress, Hull. London; Offices of the Guild of St. Matthew.

Westcott, B. F.

1891. The National Church and the Nation. London; Church Defence Institution.

Westcott, B. F.

1892. The Idea and Work of the Church of England. London; Church Defence Institution.

Weston, Wilfred, O. S. B.

1983. Preface to Alan Harrison, Bound for Life, xi-xiv.

White, Charles, S.J.

1988. "Indian Developments: Sainthood in Hinduism", in Sainthood: Its Manifestations in World Religions, 98-139.

White, Lynn, Jnr.

1967. "The Historical Roots of our Ecological Crisis". Science, Vol. 155, No. 3767, 10 March.

Whitehead, The Rt. Revd. Henry.

1924. Indian Problems in Religion, Education, Politics. London; Constable and Co.

Whitworth, John McKelvie.

1975. God's Blueprints: A Sociological Study of Three Utopian Sects. London; Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Whitworth, John and Martin Shiels,

1982. 'From across the Black Water: Two Imported Varieties of Hinduism', in Barker (Ed.), New Religious Movements: A Perspective for Understanding Society. 155-172.

Wiener, Martin J.

1981. English Culture and the Decline of the Industrial Spirit, 1850-1980. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Wilkinson, Alan.

1978. The Church of England and the First World War. London; S. P. C. K.

Wilkinson, Alan.

1992. The Community of the Resurrection: A Centenary History. London; S. C. M. Press.

Wilkinson, J. J.

1931. Antiquities of Sunderland, Volume 18. Sunderland; Sunderland Antiquarian Society.

William, Father, O. S. F. C.

1913. Franciscan Tertiaries. London; R. and T. Washbourne.

Williams, Barrie.

1982. The Franciscan Revival in the Anglican Communion. London; Darton, Longman and Todd.

Williams, Thomas Jay.

1965. Priscilla Lydia Sellon. London; S. P. C. K.

Williams, Thomas Jay and Allan Walter Campbell.

1965. The Park Village Sisterhood. London; S. P. C. K.

Williams, Trevor, I. (Ed.)

1987. A History of Technology, Volume VI, Part I, The Twentieth Century. Oxford; Oxford Clarendon Press.

Wilmot-Buxton, E. M.

1926. St. Francis of Assisi. London; George G. Harrap.

Wilson, Bryan R.

1978. "Becoming a Sectarian: Motivation and Commitment", in Derek Baker (Ed.), Religious Motivation: Biographical and Sociological Problems for The Church Historian. 481-506.

Wilson, David M.

1989. The British Museum: Purpose and Politics. London; British Museum Publications.

Wilson, Ian.

1988. The Bleeding Mind. London; Weidenfeld and Nicholson.

Wilson, Stephen (Ed.)

1983. Saints and their Cults: Studies in Religious Sociology, Folklore and History. Cambridge; Cambridge University Press.

Winslow, J. C., J. Festing, D. R. Athavale and E. C. Ratcliffe.

1920. The Eucharist in India: A Plea for a Distinctive Liturgy for the Indian Church with a Suggested Form. London; Longmans, Green and Co.

Winslow, J. C.

1923. Christian Yoga: Or the Threefold Path of Union With God. London; S. P. G. (Printed for Private Circulation).

Winslow, J. C.

1923. Narayan Vaman Tilak: The Christian Poet of Maharashtra. London; S. C. M.

Winslow, J. C.

1924. Jagadguru: Or the World Significance of Jesus Christ. London; S. P. G. (Printed for Private Circulation).

Winslow, J. C.

1926. The Indian Mystic: Some Thoughts on India's Contribution to Christianity. London; S. C. M.

Winslow, J. C.

1930. Christa Seva Sangha. London; S. P. G.

Winslow, J. C. and Verrier Elwin.

1931. The Dawn of Indian Freedom. London; George Allen and Unwin.

Winslow, J. C.

1936. The Church In Action. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Winslow, J. C.

1938. When I Awake: Thoughts on Keeping the Morning Watch. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Winslow, J. C.

1939. "Mahatma Gandhi and Aggressive Pacifism", in S. Radhakrishnan (Ed.), Mahatma Gandhi: Essays and Reflections on His Life and Work Presented to Him on his Seventieth Birthday. 310-313.

Winslow, J. C.

1954. The Eyelids of the Dawn: Memoirs, Reflections and Hopes. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Winslow, J. C.

1962. The Lee Abbey Story. Worcester; The Lee Abbey Fellowship.

Winslow, J. C.

1974. A Testament of Thanksgiving. London; Hodder and Stoughton.

Wittlin, Alma.

1949. The Museum: Its History and its Tasks in Education. London; Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Wohl, Anthony S.

1974. "Introduction" to 1974 reprint of Anon. [A. Mearns], The Bitter Cry of Outcast London.

Wohl, R.

1979. The Generation of 1914. Mass.; Harvard University Press.

Wolff, J. and J. Seed (Ed.)

1988. The Culture of Captalism. Manchester; Manchester University Press.

Wollstonecraft, M.

1889. Letters Written During a Short Residence in Sweden, Norway and Denmark. First published in 1796. London; Cassell.

Wollstonecraft, M.

1929. Vindication of the Rights of Women. First published in 1792. London; Everyman.

Woodforde, J.

1970. The Story of the Bicycle. London; Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Woodward, Kenneth L.

1991. Making Saints Inside the Vatican: Who Became Saints, Who Did Not, and Why London; Chatto and Windus.

Wright, Patrick.

1985. On Living in an Old Country: The National Past in Contemporary Britain. London; Verso.

Wuthnow, Robert.

1978. "Religious Movements and the Transition in World Order", in J. Needleham and G. Baker (Eds.), *Understanding New Religions*. 63-79.

Yin, Robert K.

1984. Case Study Research: Design and Methods. Applied Social Research Methods Series Volume 5. London; Sage Publications.

Younghusband, Sir Francis.

1930. Dawn in India. London; John Murray.

Zald, M. N. and J. D. McCarthy.

1979. The Dynamics of Social Movements. Cambridge; Winthrop.

Zaremba, Theodore A.

1947. Franciscan Social Reform: A Study of the Third Order Secular of St. Francis as an Agency of Social Reform According to Certain Papal Documents. Wisconsin; Franciscan Printery.

Zernov, Nicholas.

1938. St. Sergius: Builder of Russia. London: S. P. C. K.

Zerubavel, Eviatar.

1990. "Private-Time and Public-Time", in John Hassard (Ed.), The Sociology of Time. 168-177.

Zijderveld, Anton C.

1982. Reality in a Looking-Glass: Rationality through an Analysis of Traditional Folly. London; Routledge and Kegan Paul.

CORRECTIONS.

Page.	Line.	Correction.
5.	28.	Delete second full stop.
7.	27.	Suggestion should read Suggestions.
10.	2,3.	Poona should read Pune.
10.	18.	Expeiriment should read Experiment.
11.	30.	'should be'.
11.	Last	Ganhian should read Gandhian.
16.	20.	witnesed should read witnessed.
16.	28.	anonynous should read anonymous.
19.	30.	tokes should read Stokes.
20.	12.	Addembly should read Assembly.
21.	24.	Cornakal should read Dornakal.
22.	26.	Yeravda should read Yeravada and also line 35.
28.	10.	Delete of.
3 8.	14.	Add full stop to close sentence.
39.	10.	founders should read founder's.
44.	15.	founder's should read founders.
45.	9.	organisiations should read organisations.
53.	26.	Anglicana! should read Anglicana!'.
53.	31.	Insert, after studies.
53.	35.	Insert , after limelight.
54. 60.	1.	Insert , after Sangha.
63.	4. 20.	Insert to after even. devitions should read devotions.
65.	20. 3.	a should read the.
71.	25.	Delete existing.
73.	15.	Principle should read Principal.
76.	24.	564th should read 654th.
82.	25.	Delete the first and insert an.
83.	13.	basilica should read Basilica (and later).
88.	2.	insert 'sets of'. text should read component.
94.	1.	1926 should read 1920.
101.	13.	medieval should read Medieval.
102.	6.	thousands should read thousand.
104.	28.	Delete A comparison of.
105.	25.	in should read on.
109.	19.	Delete , after Lincoln.
114.	25.	Park should read park.
115.	20.	Insert, after university'.
121.	16.	Delete 'after ?.
122.	13.	Delete , after application.
128.	9.	Delete, after words.
139.	16.	Insert, after eccentric'.
141.	4.	'little book' should read 'little book'.
150.	28.	Insert, after sermon.
153.	38.	Insert, after publications.
155.	9.	Addlerly should read Adderley.
155.	35.	followeing should read following.
157.	25.	Stephen's should read Stephens.
158.	19.	Coulton should read Coulton's.
159.	2. 20	Suggestion should read Suggestions.
173. 177.	20.	Delete, after The Church Times.
181.	7. 11.	Insert this discussion of before 'the position. Add were at end of line.
101.	11.	Aud Wele at end of line.

```
187.
          17.
                   Delete her papers ... small books,
198.
          15.
                   am should read an.
                   Order' with should read Order 'with.
199.
          18.
200.
           8.
                   Christ should read Christa.
201.
          15.
                   Insert, after grandfather.
202.
          20.
                   Insert, after 1930.
209.
          23.
                   Insert, after Marshall.
          24.
209.
                   Emily should read Miss Marshall.
210.
           9.
                   Regulations should read regulations.
218.
          23.
                   medieval should read Medieval.
219.
           7.
                   Christ. should read Christ'.
221.
          15.
                   Delete the.
227.
      13.,22.
                   Delete, after pupils.: delete a.
                   Radhakkrishnan's, should read Radhakrishnan's.
236.
           4.
239.
          12.
                   organisation should read organisations.
                   'sid'dha. should read 'sid'dha'.
244.
           6.
                   Britian should read Britain.
246.
          17.
248.
           1.
                   became should read become.
          21.
                   Insert moves towards before the formation.
248.
           8.
254.
                   expression should read expressions.
          19.
254.
                   mush should read must.
255.
          32.
                   Christ should read Christa.
257.
          12.
                   verrier should read Verrier.
260.
           3.
                   Replace, at end of title with full stop.
261.
          12.
                   Delete been.
269.
           8.
                   With should read 'With.
270.
          17.
                   Delete on 1 March 1930.
276.
                   beginnings. should read beginnings'.
           4.
276.
          14.
                   Houseman should read Housman.
277.
          19.
                   a should read at.
                   aboriginal should read aboriginals.
278.
           6.
          25.
                   Sentence Thousands ... song should be quotation.
288.
289.
          10.
                   had told should read had been told.
           8.
290.
                   them should read him.
295.
        2,41.
                   Insert a before lover: days. should read days'.
296.
          19.
                   Delete, after Hope.
299.
          10.
                   Delete, after Prophet.
                   Clay should read Clay's.
299.
          30.
299.
          42.
                   Delete, after original.
300.
           7.
                   Insert letter after Elwin's.
                   statement should read Statement.
          14.
301.
          39.
                   Delete first was.
303.
304.
          18.
                   that was in imitation should read Elwin imitated.
305.
           8.
                   1857 should read 1957.
307.
          10.
                   (I) should read (i).
308.
           9.
                   This should read These.
           6.
312.
                   Replace possibilities with blocks towards.
       10,20.
315.
                   Delete be: who should read whom.
318.
          24.
                   to should read of.
322.
          10.
                   Insert made after had.
329.
        Last.
                   phenomena should read phenomenon.
330.
           1.
                   history should read histories.
331.
          14.
                   Delete in.
          21.
                   Delete Latin and English.
331.
```