When Civil Servants meet Consultants:
Convergence or Conversion in the Representations of Change?

Kavita Rachel Abraham

Thesis Submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Institute of Social Psychology
London School of Economics and Political Science
August, 2007
Abstract:
Public Sector Reform has been on the agenda of governments in United Kingdom for many decades. New Public Management is the most recent thinking that is driving the changes in Public Administration since the 1980s. This thesis explores the social psychology of an encounter of Civil Servants and the Consultants, engaged by the government in the late 1990s.

This encounter between two fundamentally different groups, that is, the institution of the British Civil Service and the community of practice of the management consultants, resulted in a culture clash of ethos, languages, rites and rituals, perceptions of change, and actions. This is a crucial moment to capture the experience of change and the consequences of these representations in the process.

This thesis tracks the social representations of change and the acts of representing the change over a nine-month period. Over 800 staff members from both groups worked intensively together, impacting over 10,000 employees, and documenting this change period. Drawing on a social psychological theory of representations, this thesis looks at these processes both cross-sectionally and longitudinally. Representations are analysed using co-occurrence analysis on the languages used in the documentation about the change (using ALCESTE software).

The results of this study looks at the implications of this ‘arranged marriage’ between two different cultures being put together by a third party, in this case, the government. The study presents evidence of convergence and conversion of representations over time, and offers putative conditions for one or the other to occur. The recommendations made for Private Sector change models to work towards convergence rather than conversion.

Key words: Public-private sector partnership, institutions, the British Civil Service, communities of practice, management consultants, representations, representing, isomorphism, convergence, conversion, document analysis, ALCESTE.

Kavita Abraham
Contents

Abstract: ............................................................................................................................................ 2

Acknowledgements .......................................................................................................................... 14

Chapter 1: Introduction .................................................................................................................. 1

Chapter Summaries ....................................................................................................................... 4

Chapter 2: The Theoretical Framework - Social Representations Theory 4

Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consultants 4

Chapter 4: Organisations as Institutions: The British Service .............................................. 5

Chapter 5: New Public Management ......................................................................................... 5

Chapter 6: Convergence or Conversion ..................................................................................... 5

Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology and ALCESTE .................................... 6

Chapter 8: Results: Cross Sectional - Establishing Differences in the Social Representations of Change ....................................................................................................................... 7

Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal – Establishing the Impact of the Process of Socially Representing of the Change ......................................................................................................................... 7

Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions ..................................................................................... 7

Contributions of the Thesis .......................................................................................................... 7

Contributions to the literary debates ............................................................................................. 7

Contributions to Methodology ...................................................................................................... 9

Implications for Practitioners ....................................................................................................... 9

Chapter 2: Theoretical Framework - Social Representations .................................................... 11

The Theoretical Framework - Social Representations Theory .................................................. 12

The Roots of Social Representations ............................................................................................ 13

The Semantic Structure of Social Representations: How is it Represented? .......................... 15

The Theory of Social Representations ......................................................................................... 15

The Nature of Social Representations .......................................................................................... 16

The Constituents and Creation of Social Representations .......................................................... 17

The Context of Social Representations ......................................................................................... 19

The Function of Social Representations ....................................................................................... 20

Kavita Abraham
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

Management Consultants: A Community of Practice
The Nature of Communities of Practice
Management Consulting: A Shared History
Literature on Management Consultants and Management Consulting
Management Consultants as a Community
Management Consultants: a Community of ‘Experts’
Management Consultants as Private Sector Change experts
Management Consultants and the Language of Change
Management Consultants and Representations of Change
Management Consultants Theories of Change
Business Process Re-engineering
The Boston Consulting Group’s Growth/Share Matrix
The Ethos of Management Consulting
Management Consultants and the Rhetoric of Change
The Character of the Management ‘Guru’

Chapter 4: Organisations as Institutions: The British Civil Service
The British Civil Service
History .................................................................................................... 70
Scale......................................................................................... 71
The Civil Service: An Institution............................................................ 71
  The Civil Service: Institutional Power/The Institutional Act
  (Legitimisation and Facilitation) .................................................... 72
  The Civil Service: Institutional Rites and Rituals (Habituation)........ 75
  The Ethos of the Civil Service Institution ....................................... 76
The Civil Service: A Bureaucracy ......................................................... 77
  The Typification of Bureaucracy as a Theoretical Framework ......... 77
  The Civil Service: a Traditional Weberian Bureaucracy .............. 78
  The Iron Cage of Bureaucracy...................................................... 81

Chapter 5: New Public Management .......................................................... 83
  The Critique of Bureaucracy............................................................ 84
    The Moral Calamity..................................................................... 84
    Weberianism not 'Weber'............................................................ 85
    The Key Missing Functionality of the Informal Structures of Authority 86
    The Ideological Critique............................................................ 88
    The Core Principles of New Public Management ....................... 89
    The Role of the New Public Manager ....................................... 91
    The Rhetoric of New Public Management ................................ 93
  The Critiques of the Public Private Sector Partnership of New Public
  Management..................................................................................... 98
    Once Upon a Time in the Bureaucracy - A Case Study by Jon Stokes
    and Stewart Clegg........................................................................ 99

Chapter 6: Convergence or Conversion .......................................................... 102
  Chapter 6: Convergence or Conversion........................................ 103
    The Propositions.......................................................................... 104
    Argumentation as a Tool to Establish the Ethos of the Two Communities 105
      The Landscape of Argumentation Theory ................................. 105
      Aristotle: The Rational Ideal.................................................... 105
      Toulmin : The Interactionists Approach.................................... 106
      Perelman and Olbrechts-Tyteca : The New Rhetoric ............ 108
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology and ALCESTE

The Case Study

The Government’s Welfare Reform Agenda

The History of the Buro

The Buro Reform Programme

Objectives of Buro Reform

Scope of the Buro Reform

Management of Buro Reform

The Overall Plan of Buro Reform

The Role of the Researcher in the Change - Understanding the Field Conditions

The Specific Case of Change X

Research Timeline

The Four Stages of Change X

Research Design: The Act of Conducting Social Research on Organisational Problematiques

Data Corpora

Data Archiving

Data Analysis

ALCESTE

Kavita Abraham
Refining the Analysis: ................................................................. 152
Developing the Protocol for Reporting of ALCESTE Results......... 155
Cross-sectional vs. Longitudinal Analysis.................................... 155
The Rhetoric of Clusters............................................................... 157
Relation among Clusters............................................................. 159
Argumentation Analysis.............................................................. 160
Participant Observation.............................................................. 161
Qualitative Research in Social Sciences........................................ 164
Features of Qualitative Research............................................... 165
Using the Single Case Study Approach to Qualitative Research ..... 173
Quality Criteria........................................................................... 175
Triangulation in the Study of Social Representations.................. 177
Corpus Construction................................................................. 178

Chapter 8: Results: Cross Sectional Analysis ............................. 180
Establishing Differences in the Social Representations of Change.. 180
Chapter Summary........................................................................ 180
Chapter 8: Results: Cross Sectional Analysis............................. 181
Analysis of Private Change X..................................................... 181
  Research Design....................................................................... 181
  Formation of the Cluster.......................................................... 182
  Content of the Clusters............................................................ 183
  Rhetorical Features of the Clusters............................................ 184
  Relations among Clusters....................................................... 185
  Summary of Analysis of the Documentation Produced by the Biz on
  Change X .................................................................................. 187
Analysis of Hybrid Change X Single Document............................ 188
  Research Design....................................................................... 188
  Formation of the Cluster.......................................................... 188
  Content of Clusters:................................................................. 189
  Rhetorical Features of Clusters:............................................... 191
  Relation among Clusters.......................................................... 192
  Summary of Analysis.............................................................. 193
The Overall Cross Sectional Comparative Analysis of Change X..... 194
Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions - The Public Private Sector Partnership

Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions .......................................................... 246
Conversion II: Indicators of Conversion II ...................................................... 249
Possible Explanations for Conversion II .......................................................... 252
Convergence: Indicator of Convergence - Argumentation ............................... 253
Variations in Argumentation Style of the Consultants and Civil Servants. .......... 254
The Overall Shifting Core Concerns Over Time .............................................. 256
The Overall findings of this research: ............................................................. 257
Discussion and Conclusions ......................................................................... 257
I. Establishing Difference: Cross Sectional Analysis => Conversion .......... 259
II. Creating Similarity: Longitudinal Main Themes => Convergence ...... 260
List of Figures
List of Tables
List of Figures

Figure 2-1 Duality of the Nature of Social Representations .......................................... 13
Figure 2-2 The Representational Triad ........................................................................... 18
Figure 2-3 The Mode of Production of Social Representations .................................... 18
Figure 2-4 Constituents of Social Representations as seen in a Public Private Sector Project ............................................................................................................................. 24
Figure 2-5 Depiction of the Evolution of Representations Over Time: Convergence or Conversion ...................................................................................................................... 25

Figure 3-1 : High Level Phases of a Change Project ..................................................... 54
Figure 3-2 The Boston Consulting Group's Growth/Share Matrix ................................... 61

Figure 6-1 Toulmin’s Model of Argumentation. ‘D; W; so C, [or Data, Warrant, so Conclusion’ (Toulmin 2003) ........................................................................................ 107
Figure 6-2 Typification of the Argument of the Private Sector Change Experts .............. 114
Figure 6-3 Typification of the Argument of the Public Sector ....................................... 115

Figure 7-1 Example of the Type of Business Processes, Functions and Associated Agencies Within Buro ............................................................................. 129
Figure 7-2 Central Programme Structure of Buro Reform ............................................. 134
Figure 7-3 Overall Plan of Buro Reform ......................................................................... 136
Figure 7-4 The Phases of the Business Change ............................................................. 139
Figure 7-5 The Four Phases of Change X .................................................................... 140
Figure 7-6 Triangulation Within the Case Study/ Research Design .............................. 144
Figure 7-7 Research Design ........................................................................................ 163

Figure 8-1 Research Design – Private Change X ............................................................ 181
Figure 8-2 Dendrogram Private Change X ...................................................................... 182
Figure 8-3 Relation Between Clusters, Private Change X ........................................... 186
Figure 8-4 Summary of Private Change X Analysis - Change Diagram ....................... 187
Figure 8-5 Research Design: Hybrid Change X ............................................................ 188
Figure 8-6 Dendrogram Hybrid Change X ...................................................................... 189
Figure 8-7 Relation Between Clusters, Hybrid Change X ............................................ 192
Figure 8- 8 Summary of Hybrid Change X Analysis! ................................................... 193
Figure 8- 9 Analysis 3: Private x Change Representation ........................................ 197
Figure 8- 10 Dendrogram Private Change x.............................................................. 197
Figure 8- 11 Relation Between Clusters Private Change x ...................................... 201
Figure 8- 12 Summary of Analysis Private Change x .............................................. 202
Figure 8- 13 Research Design Hybrid Change x...................................................... 204
Figure 8- 14 Dendrogram Hybrid Change x............................................................. 204
Figure 8- 15 Relation Among Clusters Hybrid Change x ..................................... 208
Figure 8- 16 Summary of Analysis Hybrid Change x ............................................. 209
Figure 8- 17 Research Design Overall Analysis..................................................... 212
Figure 8- 18 Dendrogram Overall Analysis ............................................................ 212
Figure 8- 19 Relation Between Overall Clusters.................................................... 215
Figure 8- 20 Summary of Overall Documentation ............................................... 216
Figure 8- 21 Research Design – Joint Change X.................................................... 219
Figure 8- 22 Cluster Formation Joint Change X.................................................... 219
Figure 8- 23 Relation between Clusters Joint Change X...................................... 222
Figure 8- 24 Summary of Joint Changes.............................................................. 224
Figure 8- 25 Overall Clusters Formed within Change X Documentation .......... 225
Figure 8- 26 Research Design for Analysis VII Change x .................................... 226
Figure 8- 27 Formation of Clusters Joint............................................................... 227
Figure 8- 28 Relation between Clusters Change x .............................................. 231
Figure 8- 29 Summary of Analysis for Joint x Documents .................................... 232
Figure 8- 30 Summary of Clusters Joint x............................................................. 233
Figure 8- 31 Clusters Around Change X and Change x ...................................... 235
Figure 8- 32 Overall Analysis............................................................................... 238
Figure 8- 33 Relation Between Overall Clusters ............................................... 240
List of Tables

Table 2-1 Comparison of Social and Collective Representations ........................................... 14
Table 2-2 Definitions of Community (Source: Howarth, 2001) .................................................... 31

Table 3-1 Business Process Re-engineering Framework ............................................................ 60

Table 4-1 Weber’s Ideal – Type Construction of Bureaucracy (Blau, 1056) ......................... 77

Table 5-1 Principles of Entrepreneurial Government ................................................................. 90
Table 5-2 Comparison of the Principles of Bureaucracy and Entrepreneurial Management .................. 93

Table 6-1 Comparative Description of Public Private Sector Argumentation Ritual .................. 115

Table 7-1 The Change Aims With Their Measurable Objectives ................................................ 129
Table 7-2 The Main Organisational Change Areas ................................................................. 131
Table 7-3 Diagnostic Table for Data Analysis ............................................................................ 146
Table 7-4 Diagnostic Table of Analysis and Expected Results .................................................. 149
Table 7-5 Cross Sectional and Longitude Analysis Strategy ..................................................... 154
Table 7-6 Features of Qualitative Research (Source: Flick, 1999) .............................................. 163
Table 7-7 Functional Equivalents for Quality Assessment with Reference to Public Accountability (Source: Gaskell and Bauer, p344) ......................................................... 172

Table 8-1 Primary and Secondary Clusters Formed in Change X ........................................ 189
Table 8-2 Overall Change x Representations ............................................................................ 198
To my teachers


Acknowledgements

When I read through the pages of this thesis I can hear the voices and feel the presence of many people who walked parts of this journey besides me and contributed in immeasurable ways to the production of this work. For the formal content of these pages thanks must go to my supervisor, Martin Bauer for his support, guidance and insights through the many phases of such a journey. The early guidance of Sandra Jovchelovitch and Lucia Garcia as my upgrade committee were invaluable. To Rachel Kurian, who gave up her vacations to comment on my thesis with such enthusiasm and in such detail, thank you. My thesis editor, Layla Mathew, thank you for your eye on the detail and diligent reads of the thesis, even when I could not longer see the many mistakes. Many of my colleagues in the Institute of Social Psychology and the Methodology Institute, and fellow PhD students have contributed to the thesis, reading sections, providing feedback and sharing the anxious moments. For them I am very grateful, for their critiques, comments and good humour through it all.

Outside the LSE a number of people walked alongside me and helped enormously during different phases of this piece of work. Many thanks go to them for sharing the load. To my parents, my first teachers, thank you for your belief, your example, your determination and your never ending patience. To my sister, thank you for always having faith, for allowing me to fail and fall without judgment and for having the adamance to believe it could be done. To my friends, thank you for opening your hearts, homes, tea cupboards and bottles of wine along the way. Many thanks.

Swasthi Praja bhyah Pari Pala Yantam
Nya yena Margena Mahi Mahishaha
Go Brahmanebhayaha Shubhamastu Nityam
Lokaa Samastha Sukhino Bhavanthu.

(Rig Veda)

Kavita Abraham
Chapter 1: Introduction

‘The Arranged Marriage’

The last 30 years have seen the encouragement and promotion of public-private partnerships (PPP) as fundamental to increasing the ‘efficiency’ and ‘quality’ of the public sector service delivery (Osbourne, S. P, 2000). Economists, financial experts, and politicians have provided numerous reasons as to why such partnerships are ‘rational’ and need to be implemented across the public sector.

The White Paper on New Public Management (NPM) of 1992 provided the stimulus for the development of new forms of public-private partnerships and paved the way for numerous forms of such partnerships, including financial alliances (Rabin, J. et al, 1998), organisational operations delivery alliances (Geddes, M., 2005) or even change implementation alliances (Bult – Spiering, M. & Dewult, G, 2006). The experience of over 15 years of such public-private sector partnerships, have shown that they are largely complex and difficult tasks, sometimes leading to failures and public embarrassment for the ministers. There appears to be a large gap developed between the expectations of the NPM agenda and the results it has delivered.

This thesis suggests that an explanation for this gap can be understood by considering the role of individuals and groups participating in these changes – an aspect of the PPP that has received relatively limited attention. A significant contribution to analysing the public-private partnership from the involvement of the different participants can be made from the field of social representations. This field suggests that social knowledges are constructed in the spaces between individuals at the boundaries of communities, exemplified in the moment of change.

The scope of the thesis integrates perspectives and theories from three major disciplines, management, public administration, and social psychology. The focus is on the social representations of change within the two groups, their differences at the beginning of the change process and how these representations are affected by working in close contact over

---

1 (the Passport Office failures(2002) and the Child Support Agency(2003) to name just a few).
Chapter 1: Introduction

a period of nine months. Two aspects of the social representations are investigated: the content (social representations) and the process (socially representing) of creating new representations. The language used by the groups involved in the change, therefore provides evidence of the representations of the change held by the two groups.

Analysing the language of the two communities over time will show the development of the representations of change of the public and the private sector, as the representations of change of coming together. The thesis proposes that the coming together of the language of change may be through a process of convergence (mutual learning), or conversion. Conversion can assume two forms, with civil servants learning from consultants (Conversion I) or consultants learning from civil servants (Conversion II).

The thesis investigates the change process – as demonstrated through the language - in a single case-study of a public-private sector partnership in the UK, involved in public-sector change implementation. The role of the private sector in this change, was that of the ‘change experts’ and the public sector were the ‘change recipients’. The bringing together of these two groups, and the style in which it was done, was to fulfill the agenda of the third party, the political commitments of the government in power.

This thesis looks at this strategic alliance through the metaphor of an arranged marriage of two fundamentally different entities that appear similar on the outside, and may even have had a similar training or background, the public and the private sectors. These two groups are brought together by a third party, the agenda of the political party, and then they work together for an extended period of time to achieve a common goal. At the end of this, we need to ask the question of whether it is a marriage of permanence or a marriage of convenience.

For this study the more critical feature of this marriage is arranged, and therefore neither party has been courted or understand what it really entails. Together they could make progress, but where does the expertise lie and which party must make the most changes?
Chapter 1: Introduction

This thesis starts by presenting the theoretical framework of social representations theory (Chapter 2). This theory provides a useful framework for the investigation of socially constructed knowledge at the boundary of communities, during a period of change.

The subsequent chapters (Chapters 3 and 4) study the historical and social contexts of the management consulting industry and the institutions of the British Civil Service, the two main groups involved in the PPP, in order to explain and underscore the fundamental differences that exist in their social knowledges and thus, languages around change.

In spite of these differences, these two groups are brought together in the 'arranged marriage' of New Public Management (Chapter 5). This creates the moment for the social representations of change of the two groups to engage and move towards proposed processes of convergence, Conversion I, or Conversion II (Chapter 6). The use of the Argumentation theory allows for a deeper analysis of the different processes of convergence or conversion.

This is followed by the analysis of the specific case-study, the research design and methodology (Chapter 7), concerning the organizational transformation (PPP) of a government agency over a period of 11 months, covering two phases of transformational change. To systematically investigate the language of the two meaning groups, the period of change was divided into Change X and change x divided around a critical moment (1st July, 2002) when the Cabinet Minister decided to significantly downscale Change X. The documentation produced before and after this moment by each group was analysed using ALCESTE to define the core representations of the change during each time period, within each community (Chapter 8).

There are two innovative aspects in the use of ALCESTE, as developed in this methodology. Firstly, it provides a protocol of reporting ALCESTE output using four key moments (formation of clusters- dendograms, content of clusters – wordlists, rhetorical features of clusters – sentence lists, and relation among clusters – 2x2 grid). In this way, a standardised format of reporting ALCESTE qualitative data is constructed. Secondly, it
Chapter 1: Introduction

uses ALCESTE in the analysis of longitudinal text data (Chapter 9), demonstrating the shifting core-meaning clusters (anchors) of an argument mapping the changing core areas of concern in a discussion over time.

Chapter Summaries

Chapter 2: The Theoretical Framework - Social Representations Theory

The theory of social representations, as developed by Moscovici is explored in order to develop a theoretical framework to analyse the negotiations of representations between communities engaged in a process of change. This chapter looks at a social representation, its constituents, its creation, the context, function, and its historical nature.

These concepts help us to understand how knowledges are constructed in the space between communities through social encounters. Four features of Social Representations are highlighted: anchoring and objectification and the reified and the consensual universes of knowledge.

Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consultants

This chapter draws upon the disciplines of organisational psychology and social psychology to understand the historical and social contexts of management consultants as change experts. The notion of a community of practice is highlighted as a useful conceptual tool to understand the specific nature of the consulting firms within the ‘change design and implementation’ sector.

The commodification of expertise and very effective selling of expert knowledge around the change process, including the role of the management ‘guru’ is examined. With their position as the authorities and experts on organisation change management, the consultants shift to the public sector as the ‘voice of authority,’ giving ‘organisational legitimacy’ to the government’s reform plans, and implementing private sector change models in the public sector.
Chapter 4: Organisations as Institutions: The British Service

This chapter is concerned with the long-standing culture of the institution of the British Civil Service. The civil service is looked at through the lens of intuitional theory. The nature of institutions is considered, looking at the notions of institutional power and the act of instituting, and institutional rights and rituals. This chapter looks at the history of the British Civil Service, analysing it as a unique organisational institution with its own culture and considering it within its own boundaries of existence. Using the notions of bureaucracy discussed by Weber, Macintyre, Blau and Crozier, this chapter argues that the function of the Civil Service was to promote stability in a changing society.

Chapter 5: New Public Management

This chapter is concerned with the introduction of New Public Management (NPM) into the civil service in the 1990s. NPM requires civil servants to take on the role of managers running a business, and assuming some of the priorities of the private sector. This chapter includes existing critiques of the NPM, underscoring the tensions that can arise between individuals and groups, leading to a lack of trust and a break in communication. Under these circumstances, the civil servants resisted change, resulting in a failure of the PPP.

Chapter 6: Convergence or Conversion

This chapter formulates three hypothetical outcomes of the encounter between the civil servants and the management consultants, as well as provides the logic and tools of the argumentation analysis. The key hypotheses result from the previous theoretical discussions. There is the ideal state of Convergence (hypothesis 1), Conversion I (hypothesis 2) where the civil servants convert to the language representations of the consultants, and Conversion II (hypothesis 3) where the consultants shift their language representations to those of the civil service.

This is followed by an argumentation analysis, based on the field data using Toulmin's model of argumentation. A content analysis using Atlas.ti is also conducted on the documentation, analyzing the rhetorical features of a ‘ethos’, ‘pathos and ‘logos’ and claims, data, warrants and backing.

Kavita Abraham
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology and ALCESTE

This chapter presents the details of the case study. It gives information on the overall project, the detailed planning that was undertaken for the whole project, the aims, scope and management of the project. This also gives a flavour of the levels of complexity that were in the organisational setting before the researcher entered the site and of the complexity of the project that was being undertaken. This background serves to give the reader, a flavour of the rhetoric and project management tools that are used in the private sector during change implementation.

The specific case of Change X is then described in detail, with the research timeline during which this specific research was conducted. It also details the key phases of time within this longitudinal and cross-sectional study, describing the reasons for the critical moment around which the data has been divided.

Also in this chapter, is the detailed layout of the research design and data gathered as described in the methodological framework. Pertinent features of qualitative research in the social sciences are presented. These include a single case-study, quality criterion and the use of triangulation, both in data and method. The research design of this thesis is then described, along with the processes that were undertaken in this study. These processes deal with defining the data corpora, data archiving, and data analysis.

This chapter then describes the analysis strategy of this research and develops a new protocol of the presentation of ALCESTE results. It demonstrates the data has been used for the cross-sectional and longitudinal analysis. This protocol includes five levels of presentation and description of the ALCESTE results, suggesting new uses for the output. Of particular importance, is the use of the analysis of rhetoric, and the dendrograms and tables that are often overlooked in the qualitative use of ALCESTE. The presentations are therefore more transparent and have a systemic approach - two of the often-made criticisms of qualitative analysis.
Chapter 8: Results: Cross Sectional - Establishing Differences in the Social Representations of Change

The results are presented in four sections, the analysis of private change X, hybrid (all hybrid documents are those with joint authorship of the public and private sector) change X, private change x and hybrid change x. At the end of the two analysis of change X, there is a discussion of the comparative results, presenting the idea of the evangelical private sector, vs. the change-fatigued public sector. An analysis of the overall documentation of the change project is also presented at the end, as an indicator of which community has a 'louder voice'.

Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal – Establishing the Impact of the Process of Socially Representing of the Change

This chapter presents the results of four analyses. The analysis of all documentation in the first time period (Change X), the analysis of all documentation in the second time period (change x), the analysis of the overall documentation of the project, and the analysis of the overall documentation of the project with the dates and the authors tagged. This is to demonstrate the development, if any, of the conversation around change and whether these core clusters of meaning, are in any way related to the time of the project implementation.

Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions

The final chapter brings together the research findings. It provides an explanation for certain forms of convergence and conversion which have taken place within the NPM implementation in this thesis. Four practical implications and areas for future research resulting from this study are also presented.

Contributions of the Thesis

Contributions to the literary debates

This thesis brings together three literatures, the management school literature around
change and management consultants, the government department literature around the civil service and New Public Management and the social psychology literature on social representations theory.

The management school literature is drawn primarily out of institutional theory and the macro-level of the development of industries, within a competitive market. Management Institutional theory is drawn on to understand change within large-scale industry through the concept of Isomorphism.

Some theorists argue that change has become such an essential part of the survival of organisations that it should be an in-built expectation among any organisational design and structure. Others state that although organisations are in a constant state of flux, they are becoming more similar and continue to hold on to some of the fundamental principles of bureaucracy and Max Weber’s Iron Cage.

The change is one of Isomorphism that occurs as organisations are forced to change (Coercive Isomorphism), by internal or external market forces, or when organisations imitate each other’s best practices (Mimetic Isomorphism) to remain competitive in the market or finally, when organisations set industry standards through Normative Isomorphism. This theory presented by DiMaggio and Powell (1983) is used to understand the development of the management consulting industry and their development as the ‘change experts’ who have commodified and sold, as an community, the knowledges around change. The question posed here is whether these are new knowledges each time, or mimetic and normative processes in action.

The literature on the civil service explored here, starts from Max Weber’s theories of bureaucracy until the current day implementation of New Public Management in the civil service. Into this literature, is introduced the concept of social representations theory from social psychology. In this thesis, by using the theoretical framework of this theory, and through the notion of social representations as a noun vs. social representing, we try to separate the two. We try to examine the implications of the two disparate communities,
who apparently speak the same language, working together towards the same goal.

Contributions to Methodology
The use of qualitative software, ALCESTE, to support two of the quality criterion called for by Bauer and Gaskell (2000) in the practice of qualitative analysis are contributions of this thesis. The explicit systematic development of a protocol of reporting the ALCESTE results, increases the level of transparency and systematicity of the analysis results and the conclusions reached.

The use of ALCESTE to explore the tone of the conversations or the rhetorical pathos of the two groups is investigated. Using documentation over an 11-month period, gives particular insights into the development of written conversations, over time. This thesis has also used the ALCESTE tagging function to show the linkages or the impact of time on this process, while establishing the differences and similarities though the two time periods.

The use of Atlas.ti to look at the argumentation tone; that is the ethos, pathos, and logos, over the documentation is an unusual use of the software, and is suggested as a tool to support the argumentation analysis presented in Chapter 9.

Implications for Practitioners
The analysis in this thesis, makes some suggestions towards understanding the human perspective of the partnership of the public and private sectors. There are some implications for both the public and the private sectors. The public sector would benefit, it is suggested, by taking ownership of the expertise of the change programmes, and ensuring that their change concerns are voiced and addressed by the private sectors.

Understanding the ethos of the consulting firm and its rhetoric, are crucial for such long-term, large-scale change implementations, and therefore a more assertive stance by the public sector and ownership of the change would be recommended, from the perspective of getting their buy-in for the change and dealing with the change-fatigue.
Chapter 1: Introduction

The private sector consulting firms would benefit, it is suggested by this thesis, by creating long-term relationships with the public sector agencies, as this is fundamental to their ethos and to build a relationship of trust and learning. This would require a shift in the fundamental model of consulting from shorter term engagements to more long-term projects. This would call into question, the ethos of consulting. However, this maybe in orde, as the public sector turns into one of their most lucrative clients. Alternatively, the consulting firms could suggest training the civil service change leaders to make them change ‘experts’ and not be involved on the actual sites.
Chapter 2: Theoretical Framework - Social Representations

Chapter Summary

The theory of social representations, as developed by Moscovici, is explored in order to develop a theoretical framework to analyse the negotiations of representations between communities engaged in a process of change. This chapter looks at what a social representation is, its constituents, its creation, the context, function, and its historical nature. It also looks at the relationship between Social Representations and Culture, specifically, the creation of ‘otherness’, values, and attitudes.

These concepts help us to understand how knowledges are constructed in the space between communities through social encounters. Four features of Social Representations are highlighted: anchoring, objectification, the reified, and the consensual universes of knowledge.
Chapter 2: Social Representations

The Theoretical Framework - Social Representations Theory

Social representations are critical in the everyday functioning of people. They serve a functional purpose in the collaborative living that is part of daily life. They serve a function both for the individual and for the social level of interaction and cognition. We are constantly being bombarded by much information and numerous stimuli. It would be a cognitive impossibility to try to analyse and understand every bit of information separately as in doing so, we would cognitively just grind to a halt and be incapable of performing any daily functions.

We use social representations to make sense of our surroundings and give meaning and shape to our everyday existence. Social representations are given to us by the context and circumstances of our birth, as part of an evolving social community, with a common history, shared values, norms, and concepts of everyday life. Social representations are our reality and we live it. This thesis deals with this duality; that is, the content vs. the process of social representations.

J. Vaalsiner (2003) has taken this a step further in stating that social representations that he has called “semiotic mediators” (p.7.2) place a constraint on our present to future development, through his theory of enablement. Thus in the change process that is investigated in this thesis, understanding the present-day representations and then longitudinally studying their development over time, may enable us to see this in action.

In other words, we can take a closer look at the impact of a social representation of today on the social representations on future social representations, while one is engaged in a social context that is directly impacted by the social representations in question.

See Figure 2-1 for a diagrammatic representation of social representations.
Chapter 2: Social Representations

The Roots of Social Representations

The theory of social representation has its ancestry in the classical sociological theory of collective representations. (Durkheim, 1898). A comparison of these two types of representations may help to clarify the concept of social representations. See Table 2-1.

Emile Durkheim who is considered by many as one of the founders and great scholars of sociology, wrote about collective representation. Durkheim (1966), wrote about societies and the roles of collective representations, from their evolution to their role, in the way societies function. Collective representations held by a society or group, tended to be far more permanent and evolved much slower than social representations. Collective representations are modified and new ones generated, only under exceptional circumstances outside customary social interactions.

These most often are effervescent states under which the entire society collaborates to create new ideas and feelings that are then embedded in the collective memory of the society. The collective representations are then inculcated as stable frameworks into daily communal life. Furthermore, the representations become partly anonymous with the power of reinforcing and repelling one another and forming various types of synthesis among themselves.
**Characteristics of Collective Representations (Durkheim)**

- Degree of invariance
- Determine the variable perceptions and feelings of individuals ie. Exerts a coercion
- Shared homogenously by all members of a community ie. no other representations prevail
- New representations generated outside customary social interactions – impetus of a ritual
- Society joins together to produce new ideas and feelings – embedded into a collective memory by education
- Partially autonomous of the social setting in which they are formed
- Representations are pre-established – one conforms without restriction

**Characteristics of Social Representations (Moscovici)**

- Constantly evolving
- Determined by the perceptions, cognitions and feelings of individuals
- Network of heterogeneous interacting concepts and images whose contents evolve
- Determined by interaction between individuals and groups – final decision is a joint effort
- No need for explicit consensus as long as initiatives are in line with the social flow
- Evolved and integrated onto the social setting
- Constantly in the making

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2- 1 Comparison of Social and Collective Representations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Collective representations have a degree of invariance and determine the variable perceptions and feelings of individuals. They are grounded in a community where all members of society, homogenously share their collective representations. Often the collective representations are shared by a generation of individuals and exert a coercive force over them (Berson, 1932, as quoted in Moscovici, 2006).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Social representations evolved out of this school of thinking and deals with the lower level, more fluid, daily representations that we develop through conversations and daily interactions. Social representations are more fluid and evolving representations, shared by
networks or groups in societies with a shared history that are constantly being challenged, renewed and changed when these social groups interact with outsiders.

The Semantic Structure of Social Representations: How is it Represented?

The Theory of Social Representations

The theory of social representations, first presented by Moscovici in 1963, developed out of a French tradition of research. The notion was first mentioned in Moscovici’s review of literature on attitudes and opinions for the Annual Review of Psychology in the same year.

The definition presented in this paper was:

“Social representations are...the elaboration of a social object by the community for the purpose of behaving and communicating”. (Moscovici, 1963, p. 251)

Social representations are systems of symbols constructed by human communities during the processes of communication and social exchange. This theory is grounded in the assumption that knowledge systems of social groups are not abstract and detached systems. There is a fundamental relationship between knowledge and the context of its production.

Furthermore, knowledge is seen as social action; that is, all knowledge grows out of the process of knowing and its communicative implications. Therefore, all knowledge is local and has strong implications for action. The local being a condition of possibility of all knowledge and in this sense, knowledge systems are fundamentally entangled with the way of life of communities and social groups.

The study of social representations is primarily concerned with the understanding of the processes, whereby expert or new knowledge is distilled into the common sense understanding of different social milieus (Bauer & Gaskell, 1999). It looks at the processes of the social construction of knowledge within communities.
Chapter 2: Social Representations

The Nature of Social Representations

One of the most exhaustive definitions of social representations can be found in the introduction to Herzlich’s work, titled ‘Health and Illness: A social psychological analysis’ (1973).

Here Moscovici says that social representations are:

‘...cognitive systems with a logic and language of their own...They do not represent simply ‘opinions about’, ‘images of’ or ‘attitudes towards’ but ‘theories’ or ‘branches of knowledge’ in their own right, for the discovery and organisation of reality...[Social representations are] systems of values, ideas and practices with a two-fold function; first to establish an order which will enable individuals to orientate themselves in their material and social world and to master it; secondly, to enable communication to take place among members of a community by providing them with a code for social exchange and a code for naming and classifying unambiguously the various aspects of their world and their individual and group history.’

(Moscovici, p. xiii in his foreword to Herzlich, 1973)

Proponents of the theory of social representations would say that only a very small proportion of our knowledge of daily life is based in factual knowledge or even on our personal experience. The majority of the knowledge on which we function and conduct our daily routines is based on social representations, which we have developed from the social milieus to which we belong.

The study of social representations is largely the study of common sense and how new information and developments in the world around us, are filtered into social groups. This later becomes the common sense of different social groups.

Moscovici’s work on social representations focuses on the birth, development, and embedding of ideas into the common sense of various social milieus, rather than on the study of a social representation, after it has already been formed and stabilised.
Chapter 2: Social Representations

Furthermore, although the content of a social representations (for example, psychoanalysis or biotechnology) play a significant role in the interpretations of the social representation, this is not what is at the core of this field. What remains of key interest to most researchers investigating social representations, is the process whereby any new information is presented to, received by, and developed in varying social milieus with varying histories and social agendas.

In other words, the actual meaning of the term “psychoanalysis” in any absolute form is secondary to the social representations that are created by a social group that is impacted by this social representation. What is of interest to the researcher is also, what the social representations tell us about the social agenda of any milieu.

The Constituents and Creation of Social Representations

Another way to clarify the concept of social representations would be to look at the elements of a social representation and where they exist. If a representation takes the place of and stands for something that is not itself, by definition, the underlying assumptions are that representations are always constructed by someone (individual subject or a collective subject). Representations are always symbolic constructions of something that exists in the world. In other words, representations point to or signify something, outside of their literal selves.

Representations exist to communicate a meaning for someone to either themselves or the social group. Bauer & Gaskell in their paper ‘Towards a paradigm for research on Social Representations’, 1999, depict the representational triad as the triangle. Figure 2-2 shows the minimal requirement for the existence of a social representation. That is, Subject 1, Subject 2 and an Object and a Project that is being discussed or described. This triangle is referred to as the Triangle of Mediation and is seen as the ‘basic unit for the elaboration of meaning.’ (Bauer & Gaskell, 1999)
Chapter 2: Social Representations

It is integral to the study of social representation to note the context of production. This is because representations are formed and shaped by social contexts. To know is an act dependant on who knows, what is known, from where and when one knows, and in relation to which significant others one knows.

In other words, these symbolic representations express the social subjects who construct them, the objects to which they refer and the social exchange among the people who produce them, and the people who decode them.

Social representations must be understood as an integral part of any communication system. Communication systems exist in social milieus, in the interaction between any two individuals or among groups of individuals. It is here between the two subjects of a communication, that social representations are born, evolve, and exist. This is shown in Fig 2.3

Figure 2-2 The Representational Triad

Figure 2-3 The Mode of Production of Social Representations
Chapter 2: Social Representations

It is in the interaction between two subjects through the process of communication and/or action, that social representations are born.

‘In social milieus, understood as communication systems, representations are elaborated, circulated and received, the process of symbolic cultivation. They are embodied in one or more of four modes: habitual behaviour, individual cognition, and informal and formal communication.’ (Bauer & Gaskell, 1999)

The Context of Social Representations

Social representations are socio-genetic; that is, social + psychological by origin. Some would argue that this is the very business of social psychology to investigate and understand the level of interaction and cognition between the individual and the social group. They are fundamentally at their core, embedded in society. To state a social representation without its context, would be to state only half of the picture. Community therefore, is a key concept in the understanding of social representations.

The key function of community in understanding social representations, is the problem of mediation. That is, to understand that the production of both knowledge and community is entangled in a set of relationships grounded in space (context) and time (history). Knowledge is socially constructed and fundamentally embedded.

Therefore, understanding the processes whereby social knowledge and communities are mutually shaped, is critical. This is the recognition of the significance of the symbolic register, its creation, its dependence on recognition, and its role in the formation of self, identities, and language.

Social representations are seen as an expression of:

Individual – How social subjects represent themselves, what they do, others, what others do, their tasks, their roles, the network of relationships to which they belong and the beliefs around what they could do and what they desire to do.
Chapter 2: Social Representations

Society – The sets of formal and informal relationships that shape, in each historical time, the ways of behaviour that a group of people develops about itself.

Culture – The stock of traditions and established categories of thinking that define the codes of understanding and interpretation, as well as the daily practices of a group of people.

The Function of Social Representations

In the theory of social representations, where reality is concerned, our social representations are all we have. Groups of individuals, communities, and societies each have a common understanding of reality that may be particular to that group. This then means that communities respond and react to their environment in a similar manner owing to those common definitions.

Reality thus becomes an individual experience with members of the same community having strong underlying commonalities in their interpretation of this reality. Social representations conventionalise the objects, persons, and events that we encounter, to give them a definite form, locate them in a category, and establish them as a model for future reference.

This has a strong functional aspect since it allows for reduced cognitive pressure since each time a situation is faced or an object is recognised, along with the recognition, there are prescribed behaviours, interactions, conventions, etc. This allows for much easier functioning within our daily lives and for allocation of attention to other purposes.

'To apply the standpoint of a psycho-sociology of knowledge in the approach to the relationship between a community and those members which it considers alien, is not to adopt a resolutely ‘rational’ and intellectualist point of view....on the contrary it is an attempt to embrace in their totality the processes which bind the life of groups to a social ideation, by applying the properties of the idea of representations, a concept which has become crucial in the explanation of psychological and social functioning of individual and collective action' (Jodelet, 1991).
Social representations are conceived of as 'theories', which are created and operate at a social level. This research focused on the involvement of social representations in the construction of everyday reality, in the behaviour and communications that evolve from it and in the way of life and means of expression of the groups within which these representations are forged.

Social representations are shared by many and influence many, but are not merely thought – they are re-thought, re-cited, and re-presented. This is because every experience we have influences our perception of reality, moulding, and re-moulding our representations.

Past experience continues to be active – it changes and infiltrates our present ideas. The power and clarity of representations derives from the success with which they control the reality of today, through that of yesterday and the continuity that they presuppose. Individuals and groups in the course of communication and cooperation, create representations.

Once created, they lead a life of their own, circulate, merge, attract, and repel one another, giving birth to new representations while the old ones die out. They are not only a reflection of social behaviour but often condition and may even respond to behaviour.

Representations provide legitimacy and meaning to our lives and our choices. 'Representations make super-explanations' available that go far beyond everyday relevance. They tell us why things are as they are, how they are, explain the existence of the objects identified in them. Name surviving aspects of our lives and society and justify value judgements and moral opinions' (Wagner and Hayes, 2005). Super explanations explicate the invisible reasons behind the visible manifestations (Moscovici and Hewstone, 1983).

Representations provide order in chaos, reduce ambivalence, provide identity by setting
Chapter 2: Social Representations

the boundaries ideas of us versus them (Tajfel, 1981, Moscovici 1988), and individually reduce the uncertainty of dealing with the many stimuli of the everyday (Wagner, 1988).

The Features of Social Representations: (a) Anchoring and Objectification

The purpose of social representations is to make something familiar out of the unfamiliar or out of unfamiliarity itself (Moscovici, 1984). The act of representation is a means of transferring what threatens and disturbs us, disturbs our universe from the outside to the inside, from far off to nearby. This action of familiarizing the unfamiliar, is done by using two processes – anchoring and objectifyng.

The process of anchoring entails the *grounding of the system of thought and allocation of meaning and an instrumentalisation of knowledge* ([Vaalsiner, J. 2003, p.7.4] italics taken from the original]. These are the core nuclei of associations that are used to make the unfamiliar, familiar. These core notions when associated during the formation of the representation, bring with them their own values and surrounding systems that surround the anchoring process. If the anchoring of a social representation is questioned, the entire social representation itself must change to allow this core to be shifted.

Often, the arena for dispute and questioning is in the objectification of the social representation. The anchors remain stable and solid since without them, the social representation would not make sense. This would lead to cognitive dissonance and confusion, with a need to re-frame the system of thought. This is when real change happens.

Anchoring is the process that draws something foreign and disturbing that intrigues us, into our particular system of categories and compares it to the paradigm of a category that we think would be suitable. In this process, we attach positive and negative connotations to the representation on a graded hierarchy.

The process of anchoring comprehends grounding in the system of thought, an allocation of
meaning, and an instrumentalisation of knowledge. This process explains how new information is first transformed and integrated into the ensemble of socially established knowledge. It is also integrated into the network of significations available to society to interpret their reality and then re-incorporated, as categories that guide both understanding and action.

The process of objectification refers to the stages whereby a social representation that has been anchored, acquired features, flavours and values and is individualised around the anchor to which it has been associated. It then makes the unfamiliar, familiar. In some cases, so familiar, that they indeed become reality (Moscovici, 1981). Representations create structuring fields (Jodolet, 1991) in which structures and values and meanings are contested or assigned.

These are assigned or contested, based on social norms or organised principles of societal values, cognitive schemata, or even other representational structures. ‘Objectification entails selective construction, structuring schematisation, and naturalisation of the cognitive whole which is the social representation’ [(Vaalsiner, J. 2003, p.7.4)] italics taken from the original].

Objectification saturates the idea of unfamiliarity with reality; that is, turns it into the very essence of reality. To objectify is to discover the iconic quality of an idea, to reproduce a conception and image, and to compare it to an already existing picture. Changes to the objectification take place during the transmission of familiar outlines that gradually respond to the recent intake.

Objectification explains representations as a selective construction, a structuring schematisation, a naturalisation, that is to say as a cognitive whole which retains, from the information provided by the external world, a limited number of elements linked by relationships which form them into a structure responsible for organising the field of representation and which is accorded the status of objective reality.
Chapter 2: Social Representations

This analysis permits us to describe the structural nature of social representations as the result of interaction between experiential data and the social frameworks within which they are apprehended and memorised. At the same time, this analysis also allows us to recreate the genesis of representations and to find in their origins and functions, a law of organisation.’ (Jodelet, 1991)

Anchoring of change representations within a Public Private sector partnership would be within the metaphor and rhetoric created between the two groups with an allocation of particular meanings and familiar structures to the new representation, depending on the history and context of the creation of the social representation. See Figure 2- 4.

![Figure 2- 4 Constituents of Social Representations as seen in a Public Private Sector Project](image)

This would then be considered over a period of time as the two groups continue to interact, thereby influencing the anchoring and objectifications of the representations of change at any particular point in the project as seen in R1, R2, etc.
Chapter 2: Social Representations

Figure 2-5 Depiction of the Evolution of Representations Over Time: Convergence or Conversion

The Features of Social Representations: (b) Reified and the Consensual Knowledges
Moscovici in his writings about social representations has divided reality into individual entities; that is, the consensual and the reified universe. In the consensual universe, society is a visible, continuous creation, permeated with meaning and purpose, possessing a human voice, in accord with human existence and acting and reacting like a human being.
Chapter 2: Social Representations

It is within this universe that social representations are born, get developed and transformed and eventually die out. The reified universe however, is a where society is transformed into a system of solid, basic, unvarying entities, which are indifferent to individuality and lack identity.

In the consensual universe, thinking is done out loud. It becomes a noisy, public activity that satisfies the need for communication and thus maintains and consolidates the group, whilst conveying the character each member requires of it. In the reified universe, the competence that each member acquires, determines the degree of participation according to merit. There is proper behavior and language for every situation.

Within the consensual universe ‘Reality for the individual is, to a high degree determined by what is socially accepted as reality’ (Lewin, 1948). Social representations also allow for a much easier understanding within communities that share their representations. We think by means of a language and we organise our thoughts according to a system, conditioned by representations and our culture.

Often representations may be prescriptive and impose themselves upon us without our conscious realisation and with irresistible force. This force is normally the structure before we can think for ourselves.

As young children, we are trained and taught to a degree what we should think and how we should behave. An important feature brought to light here, is that social representations are normally shared by communities that have a common historical and traditional ancestry. Nobody’s mind is free from the effects of the prior conditioning that is imposed by their representations, language, and culture.

Social Representations, Symbols and Meaning
The creation of a social representation is an act, it is a labour. To represent means to take
the place of someone or something. To represent is literally to re-present, to make present again. Through a representation that is the outcome of representing, something symbolizes something else.

The labour to create a representation always takes place in a historical context that exists prior to the act. It is the context of community or the ‘everyday’ of the social group. It is the background of all possible knowledge of that group. It is through the act of representing, that social representations take on symbolic power and gain meaning.

The power of symbolic representations is in their ability to signify and to express a meaning commonly understood by its social group, which may have no literal connection at all, either to its holders or the ‘outside world’. This expressed meaning is only specific to the shared social group and therefore, becomes known as part of its ‘cultural understanding’. These representations constitute concrete symbolic environments for the social group and thereby are the instigators of thought and action.

To understand a people or a community, we must understand and study the symbols and representations used in everyday life in a society. For it is in the hearts and minds of people that consensual agreements are made about the significance and symbolism of the features of society. Therefore, something that holds a particular meaning and significance in a particular time and place, may no longer hold that significance at another time or place. It is a way of looking at social phenomena and a system of describing and explaining them.

The Study of Social Representations

Understanding the social psychology of representations involves considering the relationship between the subject and the object:

There is a philosophy of the pure subject or a purely subjective world. Here the knowledge of any external factors (to the subject) is only established by the thinking subject. The thinking or cognising subject, is the measure and means of all external objects and the sole shaper of reality in an absolute fashion. The external (to the subject) world of the object
Chapter 2: Social Representations

appears and exists only as a function of the perspective of the subject. In this philosophy, the world is a collection of subjective accounts.

Alternatively, there is also the philosophy of the pure object or positivism. In this school of thinking, the objects in our world exist a priori, waiting to be known. Objects hold in themselves, all their intrinsic properties and conditions for existence. They have priority and subjects may merely look for empirical regularities of objects. In this philosophy, the world is a collection of regularities, independent of human action of intentionality.

The study of social representations falls into the first philosophical group. The epistemological question answered in the study of social representations is, if human reality is made of multiple perspectives (all in principle legitimate) how can we reconcile the idea of multiple perspectives with the notion of a single reality? The social representations theory is one perspective on how that may be achieved.

In the study of social representations, the researcher may additionally study the rationality of knowing its diversity. The researchers could look at the modalities of knowledge such as, science, common sense, etc. They could study the hierarchies of knowledges through ranking and valuation of knowledges. Alternatively, they could look at the progress and evolution of knowledge as is given in this thesis, the focus of which is the transforming or evolving social representations of change within two organizational communities who work together over a period of time to implement an organizational change.

The role of social representations lies in providing the social psychologist with the conceptual framework of the problem of social knowledge in general and the tools to carry this conceptual exercise to the ground. The contribution of social psychology in this area lies in the re-conceptualisation of knowledge which despite theoretical and methodological variation, lies at the heart of social psychology.

The theory of social representations is a part of this effort. It is a part of the movement of conceptualizing knowledge as grounded in an inter-subjective world of a community. The
Jodolet suggests that social representations can be studied in two ways:

- Globally: When we concentrate on the positions held by social subjects (individuals or groups) towards objects whose value is socially asserted or contested; representations are treated as *structured fields*. In other words, as contents whose dimensions (information, values, beliefs, opinions, images etc.) are delimited by an organising principle (attitude, cultural schemata, cognitive structure, etc.)

- Specifically: When we concentrate on them as modes of knowledge, representations are treated as *structuring nuclei*. In other words, knowledge structures orchestrating the totality of significations relative to the known object. (Jodelet 1991)

**The Pragmatic Function of Social Representations: What is Achieved by Representing?**

The act of re-presenting has three primary functions:

- The legal function – To take the place
- The temporal function – To make present
- The geographical function – To show the absence

**The Construction of Identity through Institution, Community, Culture**

*The Weberian Institution Ideal Type Construct*

The Weberian ideal type bureaucratic organisation is a methodological ideal. It is not a reflection of reality but a conceptual tool devised using the core characteristics of the bureaucratic organisation and abstracted to its purest form. It may be used to compare the characteristics of individual bureaucratic organisations in relation to the scientific ideal, but there is no expectation of finding in reality, an ideal typical bureaucratic organisation.
Chapter 2: Social Representations

It is just expressing one end of the spectrum. Blau (1956) states that its intention is purely as a guide for empirical research, rather than a substitute for it. It merely helps to guide the researcher towards primary characteristics of a type of organisation, which may be investigated to understand the extent of bureaucratisation. The key notion to be clarified here, is that an ideal type theoretical construct may not be refuted by empirical findings.

Although ideal type constructs contain ‘pure’ constructs, there are also a number of assertions made regarding the relationships between these constructs. For example, that increased bureaucracy increases efficiency. Such relationships between the purist construct, may be refuted or confirmed during empirical research. The existence of the relationship is not in question, it is the strength of the assertion that is being studied and which may vary.

Some theorists even refer to the strength of the assertion being dependant on the degree of bureaucratisation. In other words, if the link between increased bureaucracy and efficiency tends to be extremely weak, then the conclusion would be that the organisation being studied, is indeed very slightly bureaucratised, if at all.

The Nature of Communities

A community is often defined by a shared cultural identity.

‘Cultural identity is a matter of becoming, as well as of being. It belongs to the future as much as to the past. It is not something which already exists, transcending place, time, history, and culture. Cultural identities come from somewhere and have histories.

However, like everything that is historical, they undergo constant transformation. Far from being eternally fixed in some essentialised past, they are subject to the continuous ‘play’ of history, culture, and power. Far from being grounded in a mere ‘recovery’ of the past, which is waiting to be found, and which when found, will secure our senses of ourselves into eternity, identities are the names we give to the different ways we are positioned by and position ourselves within the narratives of the past.’ (Hall, 1997)
Chapter 2: Social Representations

The concept of community within social psychology is a highly contested one, over the last forty years and across a number of disciplines with some researchers even stating it as a redundant concept in the new global village that we live in. Definitions of community are abundant, as seen in Table 2-2.

- A community is a group of people who share a common history and set of beliefs (e.g., the Muslim community).
- A community is an area where those who live there interact on a frequent and supportive basis (e.g., a village community).
- A community is a collectivity of people that share common interests and hobbies (e.g., a youth community).
- A community is a group of people that co-constructs a common identity and a sense of difference (e.g., the gay community).
- A community is a body of people that are brought together through similar experiences of exclusion and discrimination imposed by the wider society (e.g., the black community).
- A community is a group of people that share similar work patterns and a work culture (e.g., the academic community).
- A community is a collectivity that has a common politics and economics (e.g., the European community).

Table 2-2 Definitions of Community (Source: Howarth, 2001)

From a social psychological perspective, the definition of a community may be that which allows similarity in the groups and differences with the other groups. People are referred to as a community because they have some things in common and it is precisely this commonality that distinguishes them from another such group of people.

This conception of community is a relational idea in which the community defines itself in relation to other communities. The key conceptual tool here, is the boundaries that demarcate the end of one community and the beginning of another. These boundaries may be physical boundaries, such as geographic or regional boundaries. They may be social, such as religious, ethnic, or cultural boundaries. The boundaries may also be social, psychological, or socially constructed by the members.
Chapter 2: Social Representations

In social psychological research, what is interesting to the look at, are these socially created perceptual boundaries that fundamentally affect the way a group of people define and perceive themselves and the way that other groups define and perceive the community. ‘The sense of oneself and the sense of belonging to a collective are both shaped by the knowledge, traditions, values and practices one shares with members of the community’ (Gervais & Jovchelovic, 1998).

Understanding community boundaries is critical to understanding the community, since the group symbolically constructs these boundaries. People perceive and give meaning to boundaries as part of the process of constructing a cultural identity. The boundaries and social identities of a community are produced by the workings of social memory that are constituted of a common stock of symbols that a group of people share. In other words, the stock of social representations that are shared by the community.

The psychological needs of belonging, sharing, communication, and identity are fulfilled through the creation of community, defined by social memory and social representations. In other words, the interplay of identity, memory and representations defines the process of sharing that creates the boundaries of a community.

Community boundaries are very tightly interlinked with the identity and social memory of a group. The social memory of a group in this case, is the accumulated collection of memories of a people that last over time. It is capable of evoking the ‘has been’ of a community. Working through that past, is very important for the identity of the present of a community. There are two axes in the formation of community. The first axis is that of similarity and consistence that defines the common shared culture that people with a shared history and ancestry, hold in common. They have experienced and lived common historical experiences and have shared cultural codes.

The second axis is of difference and transformation where the critical points are the points of difference which constitute what we constantly become. This is the effort of the community to differentiate itself from another.
The study of social representations has been increasingly seen as a useful method of understanding communities. Howarth (2001) states, 'Social representations are dynamic systems of knowledge, mutual understanding and practices. They are the tools which people use to make sense of their worlds, to interpret the novel, the unfamiliar and the strange.' Social representations are our means of communicating and sharing common experiences, thoughts, and ideas. ‘The reality of community in people’s experience thus inheres in their attachment to a common body of symbols’ (Cohen, 1995).

Once the person’s experience has been established, social representations allow people to move forward effectively in a cultural context, adding the longitudinal dimension to the process by creating social representations. ‘Social representations enables the persons – in their individual ontology (personal culture) and social ontogeny (based on internalisation/externalisation) to guide themselves in the next encounter with the environment, and to orient that guidance itself, by enhancing its direction or letting some other directions from the past diminish’ (Vaalinser, J. 2003, p.7.14).

There has been much discussion about organizational forms and types over the years. In the early years of management theory, there seemed to repeatedly appear the notion of a single best form of organizing that manifests itself, as a largely linear progression of organizational forms. This can be seen in Weber’s Bureaucracy followed by Taylor’s Scientific Management and the Human Relations Movement.

Today’s organizational literature accepts the notion that organizations exist in multiple forms and structures determined by their function, history, geography, product or business and success. In addition to their actual existing structure, a number of metaphors have also been used to conceptualize organizations most famously by Gareth Morgan (1986) in Images of Organizations.

Here he uses the power of metaphors to conceptualize the actual structures and processes within organization. Morgan harnesses the power of the metaphor to illustrate core and
peripheral elements of a particular form of organizing, which are often overlooked in the normal structural and functional analysis of organizations.

Morgan believes that organizational structures influence the organization, while at the same time people within the organization, influence the organizational structures. A deeper exploration of this is done, using the tool of the metaphor. Examples of this include, looking at organizations as organic, as machines, as cultures, as psychic prisons, as theatres, etc.

Within social psychology, there has been a long history of exploring and understanding the nature of communities, their form, their structure, their social function, and their limitations. More recently within organisational theorists, there has been a move to incorporate the sociological, social, psychological and anthropological notions of community into organisational theory.

The most profound of these crossover attempts has been in the work of Etienne Wenger and his introduction into the world of Organisation and Management literature of the conceptualisation of some organisational forms as ‘Communities of Practice’. We will explore this notion further in depth, later in this chapter, and understand why this is a powerful, appropriate and useful metaphor of conceptualising Management Consulting firms. First let us explore a little further, the notion of communities within the Social Psychology literature.

Community is an often-used word and concept within society today. Individual academic disciplines may offer numerous definitions of this concept, depending on the perspective of the defining discipline. Social Psychology looks at communities as one of its core units of analysis or structures within society. The grouping of individuals, who have something in common, be it something as powerful as ideology or something as changeable as geography.

Social Psychologists, tend to be largely concerned with communities as active powerful
Chapter 2: Social Representations

entities, essential for our co-existence as social beings and critical to our engagement with those around us, both individually and others in the form of alternate communities.

Communities in this form, confer identities, create common languages and knowledge, provide forums for discourse, agreement, disagreement and change, produce new knowledge, create rites and rituals of acceptance and belonging and are a natural inevitability of the human condition. Communities have more permeable boundaries than institutions and membership to communities may be multiple in a lifetime. Often they are multiple in an individual, at any point in time. Community membership has a higher degree of agency and choice than institutions.

Communities also have a much shorter history, than institutions, sometimes being formed around arbitrary features of social living, such as buying a house on the same road. Communities are therefore smaller in size, have a shorter history and consequently, far more flexible in their entirety than institutions.

Viewing organizations through the metaphor of communities therefore confers upon these organizations, specific structures and responsibilities. Organizations that exist as communities, must provide its members with a shared identity, prescribed means of communication, and a sense of a common goal. Communities bring to organizations numerous values that are often shared and relatively homogeneous, across the communities.

These include including trust, relevance, leadership, motivation, communication and negotiation. In other words communities share culture, and communities of practice or organizational communities, also share culture.

To access the organization or the community, one must access the culture of the organization. For it is within this culture that a researcher can begin to gain access to the threads of the fabric that are woven together to create the organizational community. This community that has its own language, norms, rituals, rites, motivations, leadership structure, and modes of communication may only be accessed through its culture. This is
achieved within social psychology by the investigation of the social representations of this culture.

The notions of social representation are explored further, later in this thesis. However, it is sufficient to state here that the social representations of a community are the corner stones or building blocks of a community. They are the very social space where meaning is negotiated, constructed, and conferred within the community. They preserve the social knowledge of the community and are at the core of the individual identity that the organization builds. This is the project of this thesis, to gain access into the culture of the public and private sector.

Social Representations and Culture

We hoped that collectively we might stop all the arguing about what Culture really was - an endless ontological argument- and focus instead on analyses of the processes of representation. We could get out of the ‘game of truth or falsity’ and look at the pragmatics, poetics, politics and ethics of organisational research and theory and organisational practice. We could create a cultured organisational research, instead of researching organisational culture, to do as suggested by Rabinow and ‘anthropologise’ organisation and management theory and practice.

In Smirchich, L. and Calas, M. (1987) ‘Post Culture: Is the Organisational Culture literature dominant but dead,

The study of social representations is the study of how groups of people construct everyday knowledge. To understand the logic of production of knowledge, we must have an understanding of the communicative action and an understanding of who communicates what, to whom, in which way and with what sort of power.

The study of social representations, asks the questions of how these knowledges are linked to the identity of the groups where they are found. The fundamental assumption held by
social representations researchers, is that social knowledge is always expressive of who
knows and of how the knower displays himself in the act of knowing. The question then is
further posed about how these knowledges, express the representations held by a group
about a variety of relevant topics.

In the case of this research project, studying the representations that comprise the content of
the knowledge of the public and private sector communities, is crucial to understand what
shape and what sense, a group of people gives to its reality. As a final level of analysis, we
may look at how knowledges express the cultural codes that define, in each historical
moment, the way of life of a community.

For example, the context of production of the social representations of change is related to
the history of the communities that are looked at. These are influenced by the stock of
cultural codes that the communities use in every moment of their trajectory, as well as the
narratives and mythologies that can be found in their institutionalisation as communities.

The Creation of Otherness
A difference (whether it is national or ethnic in origin, based on colour or race or simply on
language and way of life) has always invariably made those who manifest it, seem alien to
those who find their territorial or cultural roots in a natural reason to remain with their own
kind.

- The otherness outside us: Of regions, of people whose discovery extends our knowledge
of ourselves and questions our image of ourselves.

- The otherness inside us: Of groups, of people whose otherness is defined, in a deceitful or
violent implementation, by the lines of social division.

'...there appear to be social processes at work which, in defining the other as that which is
not me or mine, conceive of this other in a concrete negativity. ...the study of social
representation is critical in understanding the 'way in which otherness is created' (Jodolet,
1991)
Chapter 2: Social Representations

Nowadays the importance and feasibility of the study of the production and efficacy of representations within a social whole have ceased to be a subject of doubt. All that is required, is a careful definition of the conditions for its empirical implementation.

Social representations are conceived of as ‘theories’ that are created and operative at a social level. This research is focused on the involvement of social representations in the construction of everyday reality, in the behaviour and communications that evolve from it and in the way of life and means of expression of the groups within which these representations are forged.

Representations are approached as a product, expression and instrument of a group in its relationship with otherness.

To apply the standpoint of a psycho-sociology of knowledge in the approach to the relationship between a community and those members which it considers alien is not a adopt a resolutely ‘rational’ and intellectualist point of view... on the contrary it is an attempt to embrace in their totality the processes which bind the life of groups to a social ideation, by applying the properties of the one idea of representations, a concept which has become crucial in he explanation of psychological and social functioning of individual and collective action(Jodelet 1991).

The Creation of ‘Values’ and Attitudes

Social representations are part of a process. They are the result of a process but are inherently part of the next process of forming. This is because social representations exist in a context that they are fundamentally a part of while at the same time, they play a critical role in creating the meaning of that context.

One of the processes that are influenced by the process of social representation is called the process of valuing. It is through this process that the signs and symbols of a community, gain their power and their influence, since they are increased or decreased in value.
depending on their attachment or detachment from the surrounding social representations.

John E. Pudifoot (1999) calls this process valuing, ‘Underlying all social interactions is a common process that may be called valuing such that all activities are scrutinised with respect to their meaning and significance in relation to actual or presumed values. Each ‘innocent’ interaction is fraught with a myriad possible interpretations and future implications.’ Once again, we reach one of the core features of social representations that they are both noun and verb (Wagner, 1996), that they are both noun and verb, produced and producing, never silent (Howarth, 2001).

Jovcelovich (1996) had earlier made a similar stance while calling for social representations to be placed within a wider and richer context of inter-subjective reality of public life, where she says that social representations are indeed born and where they exert their influence.

This process of valuing does not have a rational basis to it but rather is as Markova (1996) states, a process whereby people can ‘...not only reproduce their ontological realities, but also engage in epistemological processes and as a result change their ontological realities’ (p. 180)...in which they live. It is for this reason that the study of the public and private sector within this thesis are looked at through the lens of the social representations that they have formed around ‘the change’.

This is the fundamental underlying theoretical idea that the social representations have a forceful and strong power over the enacted behaviour of the participants in the change.

The Rhetorical Act of Persuasion in the Process of Habituation

Engaging in the process of persuasion is critical in the process of change and habituation. This is even more critical while attempting to create change within institutional setting where the status quo is deeply embedded and has survived the long duress. The process identified by sociologists as the preliminary to institutionalisation: habituation which, by
subsuming the variety of situations under a single predefinition, eases the adaptive effort, reduces tensions, facilitates action and takes root, disguised as routine, in the obvious facts of communal knowledge (Berger and Luckmann, 1966).

The nature of habituation is also valid for familiarisation. The behaviourist model accounts for the formation of a favourable attitude or acceptance by the simple fact of repeated contact, 'mere exposure'. This process has to be reconstructed by focusing on the actions employed by subjects to integrate the new into their own frame of reference, to situate it in their own field of information and evaluation. This frame and this field are socially structured in that they spring from a background of symbolic inter-action and ethnomethodology (Schutz, 1962; Garfinkel, 1967; Cicourel, 1973) that have established the role of everyday life, of social organisation and corresponding practices in the shaping of attitudes.

Moscovici (1976, 1981) contributed to an explanation of this mental process by showing how in the cognitive universe, social representations help 'familiarise the unfamiliar', by re-forming, even by transforming, all new information on the basis of socially constructed models that enable individuals to situate themselves and act in their environment, harmonizing their position with that of their social circle (Jodelet 1991).
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

Chapter Summary

This chapter draws upon the disciplines of organisational psychology and social psychology to understand the historical and social contexts of management consultants as change experts. The notion of a community of practice is highlighted as a useful conceptual tool for understanding the specific nature of the consulting firms within the 'change design and implementation' sector. The argument constructed in this chapter is that management consultants are in effect communities of practice, which are socially accepted as the community of 'Change Experts' within the private sector, because of their business and their history.

The commodification of expertise and very effective selling of expert knowledge around the change process, including the role of the management 'guru' is examined. With their position as the authorities and experts on organisation change management, the consultants shift to the public sector as the 'voice of authority,' giving 'organisational legitimacy' to the government's reform plans, and implementing private sector change models in the public sector. One feature that is highlighted, is the use of a common language that binds the community together. This common shared language is needed to demarcate the arena of the community of practice and in this specific case, holds the additional value of being the accepted language of change expertise.
Management Consultants: A Community of Practice
The industry of strategic change management consulting, including their history and their development into the expert community they are today.

The Nature of Communities of Practice
The notion of communities of practice had its introduction into academic literature in the work of Etienne Wenger an Independent consultant, researcher, author and speaker (2000) as he is introduced in his publication on Communities of Practice and Social Learning Systems. He comes to the notion of communities of practice while exploring the world of organizations and attempting to understand the organization from the perspective of learning systems. This he believes, is the crux of a successful organization. Organizations that do not learn, will soon disappear.

The distinction made among communities of practice is dependent on the modes of belonging that an organization implies. These are then differentiated by looking at the boundary processes and resultant identities that are shaped by these processes.

Wenger focuses on the notion of 'communities' rather than organization, as the state where learning most occurs and therefore successful. Learning in an organization is effective since 'they are the social 'containers' of the competences that make up such a system [of learning]... they offer an opportunity to negotiate competence through and experience of direct participation.' Three notions are critical to the definition of a community as a community of practice. They are socially defined competences, where norms and relationships of mutuality are critical and they have a shared repertoire of communal artifacts and resources.'

Weaknesses of communities are also apparent in the 'Communities of practice...are born of learning but they can also learn not to learn. They are the cradles of the human spirit, but they can also be its cages.'
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

The research for this thesis was conducted with two groups of people, with different histories and organizational structures, working together towards a common goal. An emerging concept within the world of organizational studies, is the notion of a community of practice. This is a concept developed by Ettienne Wenger in his work on organizations, communities, and social learning systems.

"Communities of practice are groups of people who share a concern, a set of problems, or a passion about a topic, and who deepen their knowledge and expertise in this area by interacting on an ongoing basis" (Wenger 2002). "They develop their own practices, routines, rituals, artefacts, symbols, conventions, stories and histories" (Wenger 1998). Community of practice is a group of individuals who collectively create and share knowledge through shared practice.

Given the flexibility and networked nature of the industry of top change management consultants, the sharing of knowledge and best practice across the industry, not to mention personnel, and the basic notion of intrinsic learning and learning base development, this could be a conceptual model that could be used to describe management consulting.

Most consultants would see themselves in this category of organisation, as it appears at a first glance to be antithetical to the notions of bureaucracy that Tom Peters and other management gurus speak of as "anti-consulting". It may even be argued that this industry was set up with the goal of removing all bureaucracy and creating learning-based networks of knowledge and shared practices.

Management Consulting: A Shared History

The world of management consultants is one that, although relatively young, holds a unique position in the corporate sector. Consultants are often seen as another word for specialist. Whether it is a doctor or a business specialization, the term is used to denote a special status in the wider group.
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

There are consultants in the business world of all types - from operational consultants, who help organizations with their organizational processes and logistics, to ergonomic consultants who come into businesses and give advice on how to make better use of the available office space. Much work has been done on the development and differentiation within this industry (Anand, N, Garder, H.K., & Morris, T. 2007). This thesis deals primarily with the emergence of the field of Change Management consultants.

Change Management consultants specialise in the planning, design, organisation, implementation and evaluation of change programmes in organisations. The day-to-day business of the organisation may differ as the consultants specialise on changing the internal business structures, hierarchies, processes, services, etc.

When organisational change is instigated, either internally or through external changes, they do not have the luxury of time, staff or the expertise, to carry out a change programme. The staffs of organisations are trained to carry out the job, build the product, provide the service etc. and the job needs to continue during the period of change. This is where the use of consulting staff comes in, as it provides extra people with the appropriate skills whose are solely focussed on the required change.

Change Management consulting was born in America out of a group of Harvard Business School graduates who came up with the concept of being independent of any of the large corporate houses. Instead, they preferred to sell their professional skills across industries (McKenna, C. D., 2001). Among the first consulting firms to be set up in the 1940s were the firms now known as McKinsey and Booze Allen Hamilton. Although the initial years were a struggle as they fought to gain ‘professional’ status, the industry today, is one of the highest revenue generating industries per employee and attracts top students from reputed business schools. It is a highly competitive industry with high salaries, often determining the longevity of an employee’s term in the firm.

It is this feature of consulting that denotes uniqueness in the consulting industry. Among the top consulting firms in the industry that include, McKinsey, Bain and Company, Boston
Consulting Group, Monitor, AT Kearney and Booze Allen Hamilton, there are a remarkable number of similarities, or commonalities in the way they function. Although firms may specialise in particular industries, such as government, or in particular functions such as Change Management, across firms there are remarkable similarities in terms of knowledge management and knowledge transfer.

This occurs in two ways. Firstly, the top consulting forms hire graduates from the same business schools. Therefore, the training and recent academic background is more or less the same for the new hires in the top firms. Working in the world of consulting is very rarely a long-term career. Even if a person remains in the same career for a while, he or she may work across a number of firms during their career. The accepted norm among consultants for remaining in a job, is two or three years. Often to be promoted or to get a raise, involves moving to another firm.

With this movement, comes the transfer of knowledge. The training and skills developed during working in a consulting firm, are often developed within the firm and are in the form of ‘Lessons learnt from the Previous Project’. Among the top 10 consulting firms, these seem to be standard as they fall into the category of ‘Best Practice’. There is a high degree of dissemination of knowledge and information across firms, mainly through the people that are moving around.

Knowledge-based firms, such as consulting firms have a lot of the knowledge and experience that is gained in the minds, experience, and the consulting laptops of their staff. In an attempt to make explicit much of the knowledge gained on consulting assignments, the consultant are required to participate in knowledge creation exercises at the end of each assignment. This may include working with the team and individually creating notes on the lessons learnt at the client site. These documents are collated and become what is called the ‘Intellectual Capital of the firm. They are freely available for any further consultants joining that project and/or planning to embark on a project in the same industry.

Consulting firms also tend to keep abreast of any latest management link through Harvard
Business Review. Most consulting knowledge is spread through management books that sell widely across the industry. Over the past two decades, management writing on change has included the earlier mentioned ‘Reengineering the Corporation’ (Hammer and Champy 1993), ‘Competing on the edge’ (Brown and Eisenhardt 1998) and the famous, ‘In Search of Excellence’ (Peters and Waterman 1982). These are all books that propagate particular methodologies to manage change and the competition. This is the theory of the consulting world.

These developments to the establishment of the community of consultants as the professional service industry and the acknowledged ‘change experts’ is well explained through the process of Normative Isomorphism developed by the institutional theorists DiMaggio and Powell (1983) as a motivation for change. This change results in the homogenisation of industries and institutions, following the principles of bureaucracy. This will be explained in detail in the next chapter while re-visiting the Weberian metaphor of the Iron Cage.

Literature on Management Consultants and Management Consulting

The literature on management consultants although recent, is indeed vast and varied. In this section we will take a brief look at the overall categories into which these literatures fall and the main beliefs of each school of thought. There have been a number of ways in which literatures have been divided and categorised.

In sociology, one method of categorisation is to make a distinction between different types of cognitive interests of the researchers and writers. This categorisation has been used in the paper ‘Management Consultants and Management Knowledge: A literature review’. They write about three main categorisations of cognitive interests: empirical – analytical, historical – hermeneutic, and critical (Kipping and Armbruester 1999).

‘An empirical- analytic interest is concerned with the prediction and control over social forces, a historical – hermeneutic interest is concerned with the development of an understanding of the life worlds of other people and a critical interest in concerned with an emancipatory
objective and focuses on the relationship between the exercise of power and the construction and representation of reality.

In their analysis of the literature on management consultants, they found that further categories were required for the literature and added the categories of a functionalist perspective. They further went on to distinguish between the literature with a historical and a hermeneutic perspective.

Researchers from a functionalist perspective demonstrate an interest in facilitating and fostering the knowledge transfer of management consultants. Historical scholars are interested in management consultants primarily to learn about the development and growth of the management consulting industry, while hermeneutic studies offer insights into the world of management consulting.

Kipping's and Armbreuster's discussion of these categorisations is given below. They are made from the perspective of the authors of each category to the literature.

*Empirical* consists of descriptive literature promises answers to questions such as 'Do management consultant contribute to the transfer of knowledge in one country more that in another?' or 'In which industrial sectors and through which kinds of services do management consultant contribute to knowledge-transfer?' Moreover, the distinctions between different services and providers, outlined in the empirical descriptive literature is essential in order not to compare cheese and chalk, that is, different kinds of services and hence different contents of management knowledge (Alpha 1996; Kubr 1996; FEACO 1997).

*Functionalist* literature provides information on the procedures and tools of consultants, and hence, on the means by which they convey knowledge. Since the transfer of knowledge is an avowed objective of this kind of literature, it particularly promises insights in the contents of what is transferred (Hofmann and Vogler 1991; Metzer 1993; Holtz 1994; Kishel and Kishel 1996).
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

Critical analyses, by contrast, questions the truth claims of the functionalist literature and thus helps to understand the extent to which management knowledge is more than fashion rhetoric, or a new emergence of old concepts (Huczynski 1993; Clark 1995; Micklewait and Woolridge 1997).

Historical publications, by contrast promise an insight into the evolution of the carrier of knowledge and their contribution to management practices over time. This kind of literature is particularly relevant to understand the diffusion of US-American management knowledge in Europe after the Second World War (Wolf 1978; Kahn 1986; Bhide 1995).

Finally, Hermeneutic studies focus on the communication during a consulting project and on the interaction between the consultant and the client. They help to understand the way management knowledge is codified and co-modified by the sender and perceived and absorbed by the receiver (Jackall 1988; Czarniawska - Joerges 1990).

Stewart Clegg in Critical issues in Organisation Science: A Dialogue, Part 2 states that organisations are historically constructed, they are historically evolving, they are socially constructed and they are socially changing all the time. Organisations are the effect, in part, of an ongoing conversation. They are a discursive effect of the kinds of conversations that go on inside organisations, or among organisation theories and consultants, consultants and corporations, governments and organisational, employee bodies and organisations and a myriad of other bodies.

With reference to management consulting literature, he states that much of recent organisation theory, particularly of the more evangelical kind, the sort of literature that sells well in the marketplace, appears to be a concerted attempt to move the calculative/remunerative relationships, to one that is more moral and remunerative. The employee gets pushed toward having a moral relationship with the organisation.

Kirkpatrick and Ackroyd (2003), suggest a different route forward. They suggest that the key weakness of the notion of change within management consulting firms, stems from the continued legacy of functionalism and the limited role given to any human agency. This is
compounded by the generalisation made from the private sector into the context of public service. They have suggested the use of morphogenic theory, developed into the sociology of professions under the broad umbrella of archetype theory.

Management Consultants as a Community

In the case of management consultants, the history may not indeed be longer than the last fifty years, but indeed what a glorious past and present the community has created for themselves. They live in the world of the corporate elite; believe themselves to be the ‘crème de la crème’ of the corporate world.

This community was born out of the top business school students from the top business schools in the world, primarily Harvard Business School. They have been the dynamic, intelligent, independent consultants for the top management of the corporate world and in the world of cutthroat business; the final cherry on the cake, is the prices that they charge for their work.

This language is spoken and clearly understood in the world where value is equivalent to the ‘price that someone is willing to pay for what you are selling’. Therefore by this, one of the fundamental tenets of this world, the consultants must indeed be the elite experts for they are in the highest bracket of earners in the corporate sector, apart from the investment bankers.

This earning is high both in terms of the prices that the consulting firms charge a company to use these consultants and in terms of the individual salaries that can be earned by a young graduate out of a business school who joins a consulting firm, as opposed to joining a mainstream corporate house. Moreover, in the world of ‘money talks’, this is the final evidence. Entry into this group is highly competitive and therefore the ‘rites of passage’ into the group are difficult.
Management Consultants: a Community of ‘Experts’

If one follows the socially constructed ‘myth’ of the management consultants being the messengers of ‘expert knowledge’ we can see this enactment. In a ‘consultants style’, bestseller book called ‘Dangerous Company’, O’Shea and Madigan (1997) described this strange phenomenon. The power of this socially constructed ‘myth’ held enormous powers in dictating behaviours and changing the ‘bottom line’. Consultants were seen to hold ‘intellectual capital’ for which they could charge exorbitant rates to share this privileged knowledge with the masses.

‘Management consultants in general resemble modern preachers of management sciences. Religion, the cultural means to help us to accept uncertainties outside our control has been substituted by increasingly refined scientific attempts to extend the sphere of our control. The promise of this extension is that eventually [management] science will have, or rather be, the answer to all our questions.’

(O’Shea and Madigan 1997)

As with the high priests (of religious institutions) management consultants dress distinctively, they lead a very dedicated and unique lifestyle, they are highly knowledgeable in a very specified field, their task is the study of and teaching of this field and they use their own means of communications. The analogy between management consultants and priests also addresses the role they play for those who ask their advice. Management consultants and priests are called upon in times of change and/or worry.

(Schmolze 2000)

‘Consultants feel in charge of the transmission of management knowledge.’ (Kipping and Armbruester 1999).

‘Content consultants provide expert knowledge and information or recommend a particular course of action to improve the performance of the organisation’ (Fullerton and West 1992).
Change management consultants are content consultants in as much as they provide expert knowledge on organisational change. Management consultants are expected to be experts in change. An expert is classified through several factors. Primarily he or she needs to have thorough knowledge about a certain topic...a certain analytic aptitude is also necessary...being an expert is a role and this role is socially constituted. Thus, a consultant must be socially recognised as an expert...finally, areas that have a practical component require that the expert have practical experience. Management consultants are expected to be experts who combine theory and practice.’ (Schmolze 2000).

Social Conditions

It is also important to understand the particular role that management consultants have in the world today to realise why this is such an economically successful industry. In a market driven, competitive context, it is extremely important to understand what were the conditions that allowed for the tremendous success of the particular ‘brand of expertise that the consulting industry has to offer.

The market situations were fertile for the creation of such an industry, the need for such expertise, prominent and the availability of such training was easily available to many. It appears to have been a situation of the three factors coming together to create suitable conditions.

The first condition that was satisfied was the impact of globalisation and the increase in competitiveness internationally forcing organisations to have to work to their best ability against international prices, abilities and organisational styles and practices. This created an environment where organisations seem to have been driven to increase their competitiveness and reduce their costs to international standards if they wanted to survive, since they were no longer protected by national or international boundaries, which sometimes provided safe and secure markets for their business.

The second condition was the establishment of a rhetoric that made the management of
organisations responsible for their own survival. The entire self-help industry, both at an individual level and an organisational level, was spawned out of this new rhetoric of control and capability.

This was in giving to individuals, a sense that they had control over their own lives and destinies. Similarly, organisations had control over their own futures. Not merely that they had control over their own future but more importantly, it was the responsibility of the leadership of organisations to take control and make strategic decisions and choices about the future of their organisations.

It was by this yardstick that they would be measured. The myth of control, not merely of the present by also of the future, entered into everyday language at a societal level and more explicitly, at an organisational, business level.

The third condition of readiness for the birth of the consulting industry, was the emergence of a new international language used across big businesses. This was the rhetoric taught at Business Schools and was used by business leaders throughout the world. Television channels about business soon picked up this rhetoric and books such as 'The Transnational Solution' (Bartlett, CA, & Ghoshal, S., 2001), 'Competing against Time' (Stalk Jr., G & Hout, TM, 1990) and 'Re-engineering the Corporation' (Hammer, M. & Champy, J., 1993) are examples of what was leading business thinking behind their problem solving approach.

These books and the 'Management Gurus' who wrote them, created a whole new language in business around managing, controlling, and strategically planning a future of the success of companies in competitive environments. This language soon became a part of the code, signifying membership in the elite business community and was taught increasingly explicitly in the Business School environment.

One of the new terms of this language was 'Best Practice'. This signified the process that was accepted by the industry as being the best process to accomplish a particular business task or process. Having access to this information, that is, how the industry leaders
accomplish a particular process or task, was seen as critical while competing with them and equally successful. Again this unique condition created an environment where ‘experts’ in ‘best practice’ could potentially demand high payment for the information or experience they possessed.

Management Consultants as Private Sector Change experts

The role of a manager is a difficult one in today’s business world that is rife with internal contradictions. The manager is called upon to be efficient, rational in day-to-day implementation of business processes. At the same time, he or she is expected to be creative and visionary in planning for the future in competitive market economies.

In the midst of all this contradiction, managers are required to identify and implement any required changes within their organisation to help it keep ahead of, or at the very least maintain the momentum of a rapidly changing environment. It is in the identification of precisely this moment, and providing some solutions or solace, that some of the success of the consulting industry may lie.

‘..Sometimes even the managers need help to control and change the organisation. This is when management consultants make their entry, offering tools for producing control (in the form of meaning), which is needed for collective action (Czarniawska-Joerges et al., 1990). These management models, methods and tools, offered by consultants, play an important role in the reproduction of this rationality myth, as they help to construct and image of a relatively simple, logical and predictable world, where action variables as well as their possible manipulations, are clearly identified [(Hucynski, 1993; Watson, 1994), as quoted in Berglund, J. & Werr, A, 2000].

To help achieve these large-scale reforms, Change Management consultancies are increasingly being called upon to work with the public sector to facilitate large-scale change. This is because the consultants are considered in the corporate sector as ‘change experts’.
The development of this image, both initially in the private sector and then in the public sector will be discussed later in this dissertation. Consultants from the private sector are hired by the public sector to help the public sector organization with the change process. Most often, the consultants are involved in the pre-implementation phases of the change. That is they are involved in the initial analysis, design, and benefits realisation.

Sometimes the consultants help to implement the changes. Consultants' reputations as 'change experts,' owe much to their development of proprietary change methodologies.

Change Management is a complex process. Consulting firms deal with this complexity by developing 'change methodologies' that comprise the firms 'intellectual capital'. An example of this is shown in Figure 3-1 below. In its linear depiction of the change, this figure, simplifies the change process, omitting overlaps and feedback loops. It depicts the phases of change at the highest level.

![Change Management Approach](image)

**Figure 3-1: High Level Phases of a Change Project**

An example of a private sector change management tool was the toolkit known as Business Transformation. This involved radical change in the organisation and was often in response to external stimuli or threats to the organisation. The main thinking behind this theory was
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

that economic benefits of transformations are sustained only when changes are implemented across all aspects of the business.

This theory involved looking at the company from five distinct perspectives – social, institutional, political, individual and economic. Proponents of this change methodology believed that only when all five of these aspects are effectively attended to, could any change be successful.

The social perspective refers to the norms of behaviour in an organisation that allow people to “fit in.” These can conflict with the institutional rules; for example, management versus union attitudes, or first-name usage within the organisation.

- The institutional perspective refers to the structures that formally define and control how employees do their work. For example, organisational structures, policies and procedures, steering committees, and HR management.

- The political perspective refers to the people who trade influence and make decisions. They may conflict with the institutional hierarchy; for example, managers, mentors, “shooting stars,” and “the old guard.”

- The individual perspective refers to the perspective of the individual, whose behaviour is conditioned by the different organisational systems, and his own history and personality.

- The economic perspective refers to the assets, activities, processes, skills, and technology enablers that generate benefits for an organisation and provide customer value. For example, manufacturing, deposits, real estate, and engagement execution process.

Detailed tools and process were designed and used in the implementation change in each of the areas of business transformation. Right down to the evaluation of the success of the change, attention was paid to each of the five perspectives.

Management Consultants and the Language of Change

This section of the thesis will look at the specific language of the strategic change...
management world.

Management Consultants and Representations of Change

In line with this thinking, Moscovici was one of the early researchers into social representations. This school of thought believed that understanding and studying the symbols and representations that are used in everyday life in a society, is a fundamentally useful endeavour.

For it is in the hearts and minds of people that consensual agreements are made about the significance and symbolism of features of the society. Therefore, something that holds a particular meaning and significance in a particular time and place may no longer hold the same significance at another time or place. This was a way of looking at social phenomena and a system of describing and explaining them.

Social representations encompass both a view of communication and everyday thinking in the world of today. In the world of management consultants and knowledge creation, it is interesting to look at the ways in which the social representations they use develop. These representations can indeed be powerful as consultants occupy the position of the ‘experts’ in the corporate world. This will be discussed in next chapter.

Their representations about the changes that are looked at in this thesis and often drive change programmes, are found explicitly in the ‘Intellectual Capital’ generated by the firm and implicitly in their actions and communication.

‘Social representations concern the contents of everyday thinking and the stock of ideas that give coherence to our religious beliefs, political ideas and the connections we create, as spontaneously as we breathe. They make it possible for us to classify ‘persons and objects’ and explain behaviours and to objectify them as part of our social setting. While representations are often located in the minds of men and women, they
can just as often be found ‘in the world’ and as such examined separately.’

(Weber as quoted in Moscovici 1984)

Social representations can be very powerful in human action and behaviour and therefore it is important to pay attention to these constructs to understand specific situations. During periods of change and uncertainty where the explicit instructions and rules of a situation are no longer clear, human beings cling onto their own sense-making tools.

Therefore, social representations take on an even more significant role in influencing individuals, since we derive only a small fraction of our knowledge and information from the simple interaction between ourselves and the facts we encounter in the world. Most knowledge is supplied to us by communication that affects our way of thinking and creates new content.

‘Most knowledge and ideas circulating in the mass media and by word of mouth are actually of more or less scientific origin. There is considered degradation since any idea that is exposed to contact with mass humanity is bound to be altered in the process and will perforce rub against other ideas in the brains of a different calibre than those from which it originated. Each of us, to a different extent and from a different niche, contributes to this shared knowledge which is transmitted, evolves and spread by means of representations becoming ubiquitous as rumours

(Arendt 1994)

Arendt, in her writings, explains the need for people to generate social representations, often out of very few facts or limited information. According to Arendt, people achieve these social representations to create a mental order in the chaos of everyday life. These representations shape ordinary behaviour but often are linked to the original fact by very tenuous threads. They also shape the social settings of our daily world and form the substratum of common sense.
Management Consultants Theories of Change

'The only constant in our business is that everything is changing. We have to take advantage of change and not let change take advantage of us. We have to be ahead of the game.'

(Michael Dell, Dell Computer Corporation)

Michael Dell here echoes the words of a number of Management Gurus in recent publications. The world of consulting is a fast-moving, fast-changing world that raises people up to the status of “gurus”, as quickly as they are discarded in the following week, for the next best thing. For the period which the current gurus hold that elite status however, they are extremely influential in bringing out and making incremental or revolutionary changes in the change theories and consulting practices of the day.

Management Gurus are often affiliated to both an academic institution and a consulting firm. They use both these routes to publish at paid rates, their latest thinking. This can be seen in the examples of Kathy Eisenhardt and Gary Hamel.

Katherine Eisenhardt is a tenured management chair professor at Stanford and runs a consultancy with an ex-student with whose help she publishes her latest academic thinking. Her most recent publication called “Competing on the Edge” was published with her consulting partner Shona L. Brown (Brown and Eisenhardt 1998).

Gary Hamel has a similar career path with his consulting firm called “Strategos” while he hold chair professorships at a number of schools, including the London Business School. Such people are most often the routes through which the latest academic thinking enters the corporate sector and vice versa. Some publications such as Harvard Business Review also help this infiltration.

The big event in change management theories in the 1990s was Business Process Reengineering (BPR). Smaller contributions included ‘Competing against Time’ by Stalk and Hout (1990), ‘Competing on the Edge’ by Shona L. Brown and Katherine Eisenhardt
(1998) to name just a few. The most recent and significant of these was called Business Process Reengineering (BPR) and was started with the publication of a book called ‘Reengineering the Corporation’ by Hammer and Champy (1993). The core features of each of this methodology will be presented here as examples of a consulting change methodology.

Business Process Re-engineering

Business Process Re-engineering was extremely popular in the early nineties. It was seen as a form of moderate change, often in response to the internal needs of an organisation. It focused on improving a company’s core processes. It also typically provides the basis for a new organisation and technology alignment by creating cross-functional links among departments and units.

It was seen as a way of saving companies in trouble. It achieved dramatic improvements in customer satisfaction. Quality of service was typically improved by a factor of 2 to 10; that is, 50% and costs are typically reduced by about 30%. Business Process Re-engineering was seen as an alternative possible change path. It was more radical than incremental improvement, less radical than enterprise-restructuring. It took a broader view of the business and all aspects of the “as-is”, in order to build an optimal “to-be” model.

Additionally, at a lower level of detail, there are a number of change theories which develop out of the first-hand, field experience of consultants. The top five consulting firms lead the industry in producing methodologies and papers that may be developed into tools which firms use to help in their analysis and change programmes.

Examples of these include McKinsey & Company’s Position, Industry Attractiveness Screen, Arthur D. Little’s Strategic Business Unit System. One example of such a tool is given below.
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Principles</th>
<th>Best Practice</th>
<th>Frequently Made Mistakes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Strategy drives the new processes</td>
<td>Designing a process consistent with the company's strategy</td>
<td>Focusing on solving current visible weaknesses, without aligning processes with business objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Balance impact, speed and sustainability</td>
<td>Manage impact (benefits of the transformation), speed and sustainability in a balanced transformation programme</td>
<td>Focusing only on impact and/or speed and ignoring sustainability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Take a holistic view</td>
<td>Combine business, social, institutional and political change to create more significant and durable benefits</td>
<td>Focusing only on the content of tasks and the relationships between existing functions, without questioning the other components of the organisation: structure, power base, reward systems, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Leverage on technology appropriately</td>
<td>Appropriate usage of up-to-date tools such as e-technology, intranet, knowledge management, video conference,</td>
<td>Excessive reliance on large, challenging IT systems Overlooking quicker, simpler solutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Involve people progressively</td>
<td>First get top management commitment Then bring on board, line managers and key stakeholders Finally, involve all personnel</td>
<td>Too early involvement of all personnel creating confusion Insufficient involvement creating rejection</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3-1 Business Process Re-engineering Framework

The Boston Consulting Group’s Growth/Share Matrix

This is most often used when organisations are evaluating the need for change. They also help to determine what kind of change is required. Companies are classified into four categories of the matrix shown in Figure 3-2.

The theory behind this model suggests that it is best to have a stable, high market share in some businesses to fund the cash needs of other businesses. This is because higher market shares were shown to have a strong correlation with higher Return on Investments and a lower cost because of the effects of the learning curve.
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

The interpretation of the organisational positioning and therefore the case for change, is as follows:

'The star is a high-market-share business in a high-growth industry. Stars grow and finance themselves. King World productions the syndicate of Wheel of fortune, Jeopardy and the Oprah Winfrey Show, is a good example of a self-financing growth company. Characteristically, these types of companies exist in competitive markets and they require vigilant management or change in order to maintain their enviable market positions on the BCG matrix. Cash Cows are high-market-share businesses in low-growth industries. These gems provide the cash to fund other businesses. Yesterday's stars e.g. Tobacco companies are today's cows. Dogs are small-market-share businesses in low-growth industries. These businesses are going nowhere and consume corporate cash and management's time in an attempt to stay competitive. Finally, question marks are small-market-share business in high growth industries. To grow they need cash. Some strategists call them “problem children”. If they become successful they will become stars and later Cash Cows.' (Stalk and Hout 1990).

This type of positioning exercise is very often a part of the initial analysis phase of a
change programme. It helps to determine where the company is locally, and whether portfolio management is a good option for this organisation. If so, the next steps are determining which quadrant it is capable of moving to, and the required steps to get there.

More recently with the introduction of the public sector as one of their key clients, project management skills (as the public sector changes are often on a very large scale) and the implementation of generic project management control structures, have become the tool of use. These tools Courpasson and Reed (2004) argue, are tools that provide the public sector with visibility and feelings of control over the vast processes. ‘Generic models of project management enhanced the visibility and calculability of individual behaviour by incorporating it within more highly routines, but indirect, unobtrusive control mechanisms’ (p.9).

Raisanen and Linde go one step further to look closer at the ‘configuration of the textual and discursive practices that are re-engineered by experts’. These authors believe that the skill in establishing and maintaining the control that the consultants do, is the style of discourse that they produce and refer to them throughout the article as ‘discourse technologist’.

The Ethos of Management Consulting

At the heart of any community lies the evolution, development and establishment of a language of interaction that is specific and particular to that community. Learning the specifics of the language, the vocabulary, the symbolic functions of this language and developing the effecting usage skills, is a critical ritual that must be fulfilled to gain credible entry into the community.

Understanding some of the inherent contradictions of the community ethos, accepting them and re-iterating them to the outside world, is a further step to establish one’s membership of a community. These rituals may be more important and require more attention in communities where entry has to be negotiated and constantly re-confirmed. This is because
of their more fluid nature, namely within communities of practice such as consulting firms, as opposed to naturalised socio-historical communities.

Contradictions within the consulting rhetoric have been examined more closely by Johan Berglund and Andreas Werr (2000) in their paper on ‘The Invincible Character of Management Consulting Rhetoric: How one blends incommensurates while keeping them apart’. Through their analysis using participant observation of numerous consulting environments, they have developed three main internal inconsistencies in ‘consultant speak’. The situational observations on which this research is based, are similar both in content and process to the experiences I witnessed while conducting my research.

These contradictions are referred to as ‘legitimating assumptions’, since their investigation is focussed around the quest for legitimacy which is integral to the consulting business. The main contradictions are that:

‘... the change process is orderly and possible to plan but required constant adaptation. The participants are motivated by the fact tat they are going to take part in a process that uses a radical new method, at the same time as it represents a well tested approach, of which the consultants have ample experience. The need for change is derived from strong external pressures but also the free will of management.’ (p638).

The fundamental contradiction is between being, in Berglund and Werr’s terms ‘A Man of Reason’, based on the managerial myth of rationality and ‘A Man of Action’, based on the managerial myth of normative/ pragmatism. The most apparent contradictions are in the rhetoric of novelty vs. the rhetoric of established views. The ability of the consultants to enable creativity while being the industry experts on processes, is illustrative of this contradiction.

Observations of the processes involved introducing a consultant into his new environment, particularly if it is in the presence of a client team or potential client teams. This appeared to be a carefully choreographed strategic learnt action with the explicit or implicit intention
to establish expertise and authority in the situation.

This is often exemplified in relatively well-rehearsed and carefully executed rituals which I call their “dance for legitimacy and authority” in the eyes of the audience. This “dance” is based on the deliberative repetition and re-iteration in numerous elaborate ways of the following two factors. These factors, on which their expertise and authority are based, are the particular knowledge that they have of industry best practices and the particular experience they have within the industry.

These are reiterated numerous times within the initial meeting period, whether the introduction is being made in person, or on paper, or on the back covers of the management consulting books. In addition, there are further non-verbal rituals that accompany this ‘dance’ such as the dress code, the laptops they carry, the phones they use and the particular language they speak.

A large amount of time and money is spent at the beginning of any consulting career in training the new members of the community on these details. Even within the consulting industry there is differentiation between the firms, based on details as fine as the style of the slides produced.

Slides in a consulting firm hold a position of prime importance. Slides in this world refer to Power Point slides that are the primary mode through which consultants communicate with one another and with the outside world. All meetings both within the firm and between the firm and the clients are based on a collection of thoughts that are put together with the help of a logical process presented in a ‘deck’.

A deck is a completed pack of slides or in other words, a completed thought process, argument, analysis, or discussion point that has been made explicit using the logic of a set of slides. Each firm has a template for slides and a quality that is considered acceptable. This detail is driven strongly and firmly into the new recruits in at least the first three levels of the firm, normally which end just below the rank of Manager.
Thus, it takes around 24 months before a consultant may produce slides without supervision from their direct line manager on the product. The slides that a consulting firm produce are largely seen as their most significant communications tools and from where some of their 'value addition' comes. Thus this ritual is one that needs to be adhered to rather closely since this is what the public views

Management Consultants and the Rhetoric of Change

The language of the management consulting industry is very specific to this industry. Management consultants live within a culture driven by the ideology of individual 'excellence' and based within a culture of 'delivery' (Karreman and Alvesson, 2004) and more importantly, this is how they like to talk about it.

Recruits and trainees are taught this style of language both explicitly and implicitly upon entering the world of consulting. As they are taught to represent their thoughts and their discussion on Power Point slides with a particular logical framework. Creating 'decks' or packs of slides, and the speed and effectiveness with which a consultant can learn to do that within the firm, is one of the key learning variables upon which they are appraised in their early years in the industry.

The rhetoric of the industry is also unique. Berglund and Werr (2000) find that the rhetoric of consulting is based on the commensuration of the dichotomy of bringing together the normative/pragmatic myth and the rationalistic myth. That is, joining the incommensurable spheres of the nature vs. culture debate. 'Herein lies the potential invincibility of the consultants rhetoric. This is the possibility of transforming that which earlier was treated as 'objective' and given into something negotiable and changeable. And vice versa, thereby increasing the possibility of satisfying ever-changing and contradicting needs' (p633).

This rhetorical style is typified in books produced by the Management Gurus including Tom Peters 'In Search of Excellence' (1982) which are filled with religious and magical

---

2 In the top five consulting firms, new consultant training included working with the book 'Say it with Graphs' Zelazny(1996), from the first day of the training as introducing and inculcating the consultants with the language of their new community.
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

metaphors emphasising the intuitive nature of managerial work presented in a language of control and manageability to provide a sensation of control over that which is indeed uncontrollable, the world around it.

The rhetoric of a management consulting, typified in the documentation that supports it is created by this industry that largely follows the logic of presenting a situation of deep chaos and uncertainty up front, using large number of statistical analysis and quasi ‘scientific’ representations of graphs and numbers.

This is followed by a description of the problem as the consultants see it (based on their vast previous experience of such issues), followed by a suggested solution to the chaos and how the client may actually take or re-gain control over the seemingly chaotic world around it. 3

The role of the consultants presented by Edgar Schein in his 1999 book ‘Process Consultation Revisited: Building the Helping Relationship’ presents consultants as the facilitator and translators for change. Here the language usage and the rhetorics of change are emphasized in helping the consultant play an effect role as the facilitators of the change process. Understanding the language of the change organisation and its employees, the rhetorical skills used by the community are seen as key to achieving any sustainable change.

The Character of the Management ‘Guru’

Academics, practitioners, and industry specialists have been critiquing the work produced by the Management Gurus as theoretically inadequate, and functionally limited. The idea that the ‘gurus’ come up with uniform management tools that may be implemented across

3 Organisational change management may in fact even within it contain some fundamental assumptions which are problematic as found by Sturdy and Grey(2003), who investigated this concept and found that it contains a practical and ontological pro-change bias, and a core problem of managing managerialism and universalism, as found in the Alternative Change Text they quote in their paper which replicates the kind of statement often found in this rhetoric ‘It is therefore imperative that today’s managers embrace stability and learn to manage continuity if they want to survive’ (p651)
regions and across industries to help the organisation become simpler and leaner, does not stand the test of time. If we look at the character of Tom Peters, who was possibly one of the first ‘Management Guru’, who in fact may have even defined the term “Management Guru” to some extent, we can look at how his first best-seller publication ‘In Search of Excellent’ stood the test of time.

Tom Peters and Robert Waterman (1982) wrote this book, citing research that they had conducted to establish the features and characteristics of the most successful corporations. They predicted that organisations that copy or mimic (DiMaggio and Powell, 1982) would be equally successful in their endeavours. The characteristics required for success in corporate life were:
- Bias for action
- Staying close to the customer
- Autonomy and entrepreneurship
- Productivity through people
- Hands on – Value driven
- Simple form - lean staff
- Simultaneous loose and tight properties.

Two years later in a Business Week article, which became the cover story of their November 5th issue in 1984, the companies that Peters and Waterman had sighted as the prime examples of success that other organisations should mimic, were looked at again in detail, as a test of their prediction. Business Week cited that ‘at least 14 out of the 48 ‘excellent’ companies highlighted by Peters and co authors Robert H. Waterman in their book just two years ago have lost their lustre’.

David Meister, another acknowledged management guru writes about consultants as the ‘hired guns’ in his book ‘Managing the Professional Service firm’ (1993). Here the role of gaining legitimacy by the consultants in the eyes of the employees is seen as critical in the initial phases of any change process. Understanding the nuts and bolts of the firm and
providing a framework for the detailed change processes are the key contributions that consultants make in the change process.

Similarly, other notions that appear to be the buzzword and the key management tool for one moment and one situation, often cannot be transposed and used in another. Peter Drucker, another Management Guru dismissed the book as being a 'book for juveniles', while publishing his latest management theory in 'Concept of the Corporation' (1993).

Within popular management literature, the core difficulty is that it is presented as the prophecy of evangelical truth (Micklewait, J., Wooldridge, A., 1996) or scientific research, both incommensurable paradigms that are based largely on the personal experience of the authors from which the evidence to support the case is drawn Fursten, (1995).

This will be discussed again in the chapter analysing the argumentation of the documentation produced.
Chapter 4: Organisations as Institutions: The British Civil Service

Chapter Summary

This chapter is concerned with the ‘long duree’ culture of the institution of the British Civil Service. The civil service is looked at through the lens of intuitional theory. The nature of institutions is considered, looking at the notions of institutional power and the act of instituting, and institutional rights and rituals. This chapter looks at the history of the British Civil Service, analysing it as a unique organisational institution with its own culture and to be considered within its own boundaries of existence. Using the notions of bureaucracy discussed by Weber, Macintyre, Blau and Crozier, this chapter argues that the function of the Civil Service was to promote stability in a changing society.

Bureaucracy is the organisational manifestation of the rational spirit of humanity

(Max Weber, 1930)

‘After all.... [Max Weber]...suggested that the ethos governing the conduct of the state bureaucrat and that governing the conduct of the business leader [are] non-transferable. Indeed, in addressing the kinds of responsibilities these ‘persons’ have for their actions, Weber insisted on the irreducibility of different spheres of ethical life and on the consequent necessity of applying different ethical protocols to them. For him, any attempt, ‘to establish commandments of identical content’ across ‘life orders’, whether philosophically or managerially motivated, was a distinctly ‘unworldly’ endeavour.’

Professor Paul Du Gay, (2000) - Sociologist
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

The British Civil Service is looked as the typification of an Institution and a Bureaucracy.

The British Civil Service

The nature of the British Civil service is looked at based on its historical, cultural and sociological roots.

History

The British Civil Service is one of the oldest and most established bureaucratic institutions in the world today. It has roots in the 18th century when some of its earliest rules were formed in response to empire and economic changes.

A Civil Service Commission was set up in 1855 to oversee its establishment and growth, based on the Northcote-Trevelyan model (found in the Northcote-Trevelyan report of 1854). Based on ideas of bureaucracy, its intention was to establish a politically neutral body that had a functional difference between the employees responsible for administration and those that performed more routine tasks.

Policy formulation, administration and implementation were reserved for the administrative class. The other substantial distinction was between the permanent employees of the civil service and political engagements of the day that were seen as changing positions that depended solely on the power of the electorate.

The core ideology and principles of this model for the British Civil Service has remained largely successful and unchanged over the following hundred and fifty years, including during the difficult periods of the two world wars. Each government consequently has made their impressions to improve the structures of the civil service. Lord Fullerton recommended and introduced the Civil Service College, which provided a unified grading system for all the civil service bodies and a central policy-planning unit. Edward Heath’s government introduced the series of Programme Analysis and Review (PAR) studies of policy effectiveness and efficiency.
Margaret Thatcher commissioned, amongst numerous other initiatives, the New Rights doctrine and the Next Steps initiative. She was also the Prime Minister under who performance-related pay became a part of the civil service ethos in 1984. John Major brought in the Citizen's Charter programme to respond to public service quality issues, facing the civil service at the time.

In June 2006, a New Civil Service Code was launched to reaffirm the core values of the British Civil Service, which were now defined as integrity, honesty, objectivity, and impartiality. Anonymity, which had been a core value, has now been removed from this list. The underlying core principle of the ethos of the British Civil Service Bureaucracy is its politically neutral character.

Scale
The British Civil Service is one of the largest public sector employers in the UK, employing around 5.855 million people in the UK at the end of 2005 (Public Sector Employment, First Release, Office of National Statistics, 2006)

The British Civil Service has 18 ministerial departments. An appointed government minister who gives political government directives and is known as the Secretary of State, leads these departments. They are also members of the Cabinet and are supported by a team of junior ministers. The Civil Service head who reports directly to the Secretary of State, is the Permanent Secretary of the department.

There are currently in the British Civil Service, 33 non-ministerial departments. These departments cover issues of state for which direct and senior political guidance is not considered as vital. They are headed by senior civil servants who are also called Permanent Secretaries or in some cases, Second Permanent Secretaries

The Civil Service: An Institution

Berger and Luckmann in their 1966 book, “The Social Construction of Reality” discuss in
some depth, the ideas and principles behind institutionalism. The fundamental thesis is that social order is a product of the human condition. In an attempt to create identity, human beings created structures in their daily lives, which over time and history get to be part of the taken-for-granted fabric of our identity. This identity formation as an outcome is the result of three social and psychological processes: habituation, legitimisation, and facilitation.

The Civil Service: Institutional Power/The Institutional Act (Legitimisation and Facilitation)

Institutional theory within social psychology has for a while, been examining the notion of institutions from the perspective of the institutional act, the power they hold within societies, and the force that they exert over the member of the institutions and wider societies. Such forms of organising have been one of the cornerstones of our societies and have been fundamental to the creation, maintenance, and changes of widely spread social knowledges in the history of the civilisations, as we know them today.

Institutions are thus classified, based on their relative permanence over history and time. These are seen as social forms of organising that are active and influential in expressing the social ideologies of a group or society. They impose upon the members of the society, meaning and structures within which the societies function. They often form a critical function in giving structure to the spaces and languages that we use to understand the world around us. Therefore it is important to realise that these are not dormant, harmless, inactive entities but rather, critical forces of great power that impose their views on the societies with which they interact.

Institutions are often emblematic of stability and ‘what is’. Their project and agenda is to maintain the established status quo, by actions directed towards maintenance and conservation. They hold power in that the assumptions they represent, have seeped deeply into the hearts and minds of societies that they are part of and the assumptions with which we think. Therefore, they require an entire cognitive shift before one can even begin to see a world without these institutions.
The institutional act creates the arbitrary boundary within which we function, from which we draw our identity of what is "us" and what is "them out there". It encourages us to communicate in specific manners, providing us with social concepts, frameworks of thought and language. It provides us with all of the tools to function effectively and survive in society and therefore life without institutions, is difficult to comprehend.

One may even question whether there is indeed such a state. Institutional living is a survival need for social, interdependent beings. Transgression of the institutional norm and boundaries is not only strongly discouraged, it is in fact often incomprehensible and unachievable. These conditions only change when one is removed from the security of being surrounded by a form of social institutional knowledge and forced to bump into an alternative form of institutional knowledge. This often occurs at the fringes of societies or at during moments of great social change.

Institutionalisation of individuals, groups and societies is the process by which the project, goals, and ambitions of institutions are ingrained into the minds of its members. Institutions are not quiet beings. They are loud and strong, often so loud that for long histories there is no space for any alternative voice. These are largely presented as mere social facts and the 'rightness' of the agenda never questioned.

They are rarely questioned and it is within this act, that they hold their social power, as they get represented within people as the 'is' which is never questioned and has no need to ever justify itself, almost with the power of a belief. They are so much a part of the very language and structure of our thoughts, beliefs and identities, that questioning them would be almost impossible without redefining all of the above. They are the 'facts' that grant us social legitimacy and without them we would be lost.

The need to establish authority and create legitimacy within an institution arises during periods of great change when institutions maybe called into question. These periods are when the underlying assumptions of the institutions are revealed and their value questioned.
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

The process of reaching into social memory and questioning assumptions is often painful and slow but these must indeed be questioned if there is going to be any change or progress. The institutional principles must then be revealed and questions answered as to why and how things function and what are the arguments created for their existence. This process often occurs only when social knowledges bump into one another.

For old and established institutions to be questioned there must be an alternative, or a reason for questioning, in the first place – a reason for questioning the legitimacy of the institution. This often occurs at the boundary of societies, or fringes of social communities. Here different types of social knowledges meet each other face to face and are forced to realise that there is indeed an alternate perspective, and an alternate way of being. This is often when assumptions are first questioned and representations of the institutions, most vibrant.

This is also the arena in which collective representations begin to crumble and social representations become more significant, as the assumptions enter into everyday discourse. This is where there is room for change and manoeuvre, as contradictory representations bump into one another, creating new social representations. This is the space where new representations and thereby new knowledge, is created.

The civil service as an institution, is one of the oldest and most symbolic forms of institutional power that we have in societies today. The very nature and history of these organisations are often ideal typifications of Weberian notions of bureaucracy but often fall just short of fulfilling his grand plan of rational efficiency. In fact, the realisation of the bureaucratic dream of Weber, contains within it, the fundamental paradox in its implementation that although in many cases, it did in fact increase efficiency, it is not the

---

4 There are authors who believe that in fact the Weberian ideal may never be achieved. Casey(2004) has made the case for the shift of some the fundamental norms and ideals of Weberian bureaucracy over time based on what she calls an ‘emergent raft of new activities’. These are to be found according to her paper in the arenas of establishing authority and the counter rational contestation which gives rise to a strategic neo-rationality based on the premise on the condition of postmodernity, which ultimately weakens instrumental rationality and action (p74).
organisational structure most conducive to efficiency. In fact, it has recently come to symbolise everything that an efficient organisation is not. It is the antithesis of bureaucracy and has been held up by many an organisational theorist, as the example of what efficient organisations must not be.

The Civil Service: Institutional Rites and Rituals (Habituation)

Institutions are integral to our societies as they through their existence, rites and rituals confer meaning, identity, knowledge, structure to the human condition. They view human beings as facts of social structure and remove individual agencies as far as possible. The human agency is considered important only in that it functions in line with beliefs, goals and traditions of the institution. Institutions exert this power through their rites and rituals that give us meaning and are the very fabric of our social space.

Institutions exercise power in that they define, contain and confer upon the human condition, the meanings and social knowledges of the everyday. They provide the general framework within which meanings are created and then crystallised, objectified, and conferred upon members of the institution. They provide vast libraries or spaces for the containment of social knowledges on all aspects of social life and therefore provide the very cognitive frameworks within which we function.

It is only when we bump into members of a different institution, do we realise that indeed there is another way, and indeed an institution merely provides one with a way of life, for there are alternatives. The knowledges provided by the institution are no longer taken for granted ‘facts’ of the ‘way things are’. Rather they are merely one way of looking at the ‘brute facts’ out there in the social world, if indeed one can ever access them.

Institutional rites and rituals provide human beings with the structures within which we exist. Gaining access to meaning using these rites and rituals, is the process through which we achieve our identity and membership of society. Representations are the symbolic structures that hold the meanings that we hope to attain. It is therefore critical for us to gain access to these representations and fulfil their rites and rituals.
In fulfilling the institutional rites and rituals, we gain access to meaning. These meanings that are drawn from the underlying assumptions that we hold or are given to us as members of institution-ridden societies, maybe challenged in the form of the creation of new social representations. Social representations are therefore, part of the symbolic environment of institutions. At the same time, they are a space within which these meanings may be challenged and re-formed, creating new meanings and therefore, new social representations.

Mahler (1997) suggests in line with some management theories that even within the public sector agencies, it is in fact the cultural variable that is most critical in determining the rate at which an organisation can learn and thereby integrate any changes that are implemented within the agency.

This is even more critical within the public sector because of its institutional nature and deeply embedded culture. Mahler states that ‘Culture provides a reservoir of organisational meanings against which results, experience and performance data are interpreted and inquiries about changes in procedures and program technologies can proceed’.

The Ethos of the Civil Service Institution

The Figure of the Bureaucrat: The Weberian Ideal (Du Gay, 2000)

‘Here stands the figure of the bureaucrat, a figure defined by rationality and objectivity, whose primary goal is to increase the efficiency of systems, by removing from within himself all notions of kinship, partiality and tradition in the workplace. The bureaucrat yearns of efficiency, and transparency in all that he does. Expertise in this world is developed based on the years of dogged determination and experience in the field of his bureaucracy. The ‘managerial’ traits of the bureaucrat in Weber’s terms of Lebensführung, is not the epitome of the disintegration of the unified moral personality (as accused by MacIntyre), but rather a distinct manner of conducting oneself in within a specific life order. ‘In
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

Weber’s account the impersonal, expert, procedural and hierarchical character of bureaucratic reason and action is not treated as a symptom of moral deficiency; instead the bureau us represented as having its own distinct ethic of existence’. Their underlying reason for such fundamental disagreement is that Weber hold the bureaucrat to the laws of an office, whereas MacIntyre holds his up to the blazing light of the moral code of a person.’

The Civil Service: A Bureacracy

Some classical theories of bureaucracy are looked at to understand the roots of this organisational system and therefore provide some insights into it current day ethos.

The Typification of Bureaucracy as a Theoretical Framework

Some readers of Weber believe that the Weberian ideal type bureaucratic organisation is a more a methodological ideal. It is not a reflection of reality but a conceptual tool devised using the core characteristics of the bureaucratic organisation and abstracted to its purest form.

It may be used to compare characteristics of individual bureaucratic organisations in relation to the scientific ideal, but there is no expectation of finding in reality, an ideal typical bureaucratic organisation. It is just expressing one end of the spectrum. Blau (1956) states that its intention is purely as a guide for empirical research, rather than a substitute for it. It merely helps to guide the researcher towards the primary characteristics of a type of organisation, which may be investigated to understand the extent of bureaucratisation. The key notion to be clarified here, is that an ideal type theoretical construct may not be refuted by empirical findings.

Although the ideal type constructs contain ‘pure’ constructs, there are also a number of assertions made regarding the relationships among these constructs. For example, that increased bureaucracy increases efficiency. Such relationships between the purist construct may be refuted or confirmed during empirical research. See Table 4-1.
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

The existence of the relationship is not in question, it is the strength of the assertion which is being studied and which may vary. Some theorists even refer to the strength of the assertion, being dependant on the degree of bureaucratisation. In other words, if the link between increased bureaucracy and efficiency tends to be extremely weak, then the conclusion would be that the organisation being studied, is indeed very slightly bureaucratised, if at all.

**Weber’s Ideal Type Construction of Bureaucracy (Blau, 1956)**

| The functional division of labour enabling job specialisation |
| Hierarchical organisational structuring |
| Functional governance via organisational rules e.g. Standards |
| Jobs must be performed rationally and impersonally – ‘impersonal detachment engenders equitable treatment of all persons and thus fosters democracy in administration’ (p.30) |
| Meritocratic organisation based on qualifications and career protection against arbitrary dismissal |
| Bureaucracy at its best, has all the efficiency functionality of a machine at its best. i.e. It functions at the level of maximising organisational efficiency over individual efficiency. |

**Table 4-1 Weber’s Ideal – Type Construction of Bureaucracy (Blau, 1956)**

The Civil Service: a Traditional Weberian Bureaucracy

The notion of bureaucracy was created by Max Weber as a culmination of his philosophy of the rational ideal of man. Weber in his writings saw the notion of bureaucracy as the answer to the question of creating legitimate authority in a rationalised organisation. Although much criticised for the shortcomings of this perspective today, the principles of bureaucracy still stand in strong stead, when looked at in the context of the cultural and historical context in which they were written.

---

5 Weber is often seen as the great architect and thinker behind modernity. His writings spanned a variety of topics including systems of organising with a strong leaning toward the rationality of the human condition, which was key in his propositions of rationality as the founding regulative principle of organising.

---

Kavita Abraham 78
The Weberian theory of bureaucracy was born out of concerns pertaining to the changing political patterns of life and social government. Weber saw bureaucracy as the only way to obtain and maintain legitimate authority in a rational system of organising. He developed this notion in contrast to the other two historically pertinent and long established modes of leadership or authority. These are charismatic authority and traditional authority.

Charismatic authority is based on the charm and ability of a particular individual. These charismatic leaders can often inspire their follower to great achievements, far greater than would have ever been achieved in their absence. They are often able to inspire large numbers of people and are seen personally connecting and carrying forward the causes of the masses.

The limitation of this form of leadership is that it is almost entirely dependant on the presence of this particular individual. Once the individual has moved on, there is very little chance of that legitimacy surviving. It may survive for a while in an organisation set up for this purpose, but without the presence and inspiration of the leader, these organisations soon fade into the distance.

Traditional forms of leadership deal with long standing, seldom questioned political systems, such as monarchies and or the caste system. Both of these are based on the inheritance of certain rights, powers and legitimate authority, based on birth. Traditional authority is the most stable of all forms of authority, as it is the form that most societies have lived with for many a generation. The limitation of this authority or leadership is that it is not based on the capability to perform the role, or the ability to face the challenge of leadership.

Weberian bureaucracy was presented thus in this historical context as an alternative process for creating legitimate forms of authority, based on the individual’s technical expertise in the job, creating transparency in the organisation and a meritocratic system. All these functions of the typification of Weberian bureaucracy put together, were supposed to
support generate great efficiency within the organisation. The key underlying theme of a Weberian bureaucracy was to remove all forms of irrationality, nepotism, tradition, etc. from within the confines of the organisational context and replace this with rational, transparent, and meritocratic systems.

Weber’s ideal type rational bureaucracy has come under much scrutiny and criticism over the decades. One of the key criticisms is of the very notion of bureaucratic authority. This is to come from expertise, in the bureaucratic ideal. However, whether that expertise should come from a position of seniority within the bureaucracy, or from a free floating pool of industry ‘experts’ as is the case of the modern day management consultant, remains unclear in Weberian writing.

One counter argument often presented is that in its ideal state, bureaucratic expertise is so highly intertwined with the notion of experience and seniority that makes this hardly a question worth asking. This tension however, is further played out, between the ‘managers’ and the ‘professional technical support’.

Weber acknowledged in his writings that there would be one more prevalent form of leadership or legitimate authority. This Weber called the ‘collegiate’ or the ‘peer group’ method of organising. With this was born the notion of what is today called the ‘professional service firm’. Heckscher and Donellan (1994), Peters (1982) and many more Management writers today suggest that the birth and growth in popularity of the ‘professional service firm’ (which is often more popularly known as the management consulting firm) is as a retaliation against the very ideas of bureaucracy.

This notion is central to this thesis and will be discussed in detail later. It should be noted that the use of the term “professional” in this context is quite different from the use of this term in the Weberian context. Here the professional service firm refers not to the technical staff, but rather to the trade of management, management knowledge, management training, management development, and so on.
The Iron Cage of Bureaucracy

Max Weber warned in the Protestant Work Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism (1952) about the unstoppable power of bureaucracy that resulted from the momentum gained by the rationalist spirit of man in the climate of capitalism.

He warned that the force of the principles of bureaucracy had gained their own unstoppable momentum that in these conditions would lead to the inevitable destruction of the human spirit. He famously stated that bureaucracy was the organisational manifestation of the rational spirit of man, and had the inbuilt power to control and implement with such force that it was in fact, quite irreversible (1968).

DiMaggio and Powell (1983) in their seminal work in institutional theory, 'The Iron Cage re-visited: Institutional Isomorphism and collective rationality in organisational field' look at the Iron Cage and create a strong argument supporting Weber's position although the reasons for this may have shifted because of structuration (Giddens, 1979).

They look at the three institutional processes of Isomorphism that continue to make organisations and bureaucracies largely resemble one another, even as organisations increasingly try to diversity themselves and the private sector management books cry out for uniqueness and creative individualised solutions, essential to organisational survival.

In fact, the authors argue that as organisations change, they morph into increasingly similar homogenous organisations, based on the fundamental principles of bureaucracy, control and legitimate authority, the similarity being forced by the institutions facing the same environmental conditions.

Although organisational diversity is a loudly proclaimed principle of current economic markets, these organisations and institutions internally look increasingly the same because of their levels of connectedness (Laumann etc al., 1978) and structural equivalence (White et al., 1976).
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

The three processes of Isomorphic change developed by DiMaggio and Powell are Coercive, Mimetic, and Normative Isomorphism. This thesis looks at an example of Normative Isomorphism. The three types of institutional or organisational change are differentiated by the motivation for the change; that is, the case for the change or in other words, the reasons that the change were embarked upon in the first place.

Coercive Isomorphism is driven by internal and external market conditions forcing the institution to change. Mimetic Isomorphism is driven by the uncertainty in the environment that cause institutions to imitate one another in their survival behaviours. Normative Isomorphism is driven by the need for professionalisation in competitive markets.

Larson (1977) states that the need for professionalisation derives from a need for a group of organisations or communities of practice (Wenger 1998), or occupations to standardise and develop industry norms and regulations around the practice of their business, ‘to establish a cognitive base and legitimisation for their occupational autonomy’. This is supported by the development of particular forms of education or schools that train people specifically for this trade that creates a pool of interchangeable individuals who can effectively fulfil the tasks within this industry (Perrow, 1974).

The second supporting feature of this process of Isomorphism is the development of networks across this industry horizontally. This could occur either because of a common training or because of the high transfer of individuals across a profession that helps knowledge and best practices also to be rapidly transferred across the profession.

The concept of Normative Isomorphism may be used to describe the rapid development and success of the consulting industry and their established label as the change ‘experts’ across organisations. What perhaps needs more consideration, is the coercive application of these principles of Normative Isomorphism to institutions that have a long history and are built around fundamental principles that differ from those of relatively new communities of professional service firms or management consultants.
Chapter 5: New Public Management

Chapter Summary

This chapter is concerned with the introduction of New Public Management (NPM) into the civil service in the 1990s. NPM requires civil servants to take on the role of managers running a business, and assuming some of the priorities of the private sector. This chapter includes existing critiques of the NPM, underscoring the tensions that can arise between individuals and groups, leading to a lack of trust and a break in communication. Under these circumstances, the civil servants resisted change, resulting in a failure of the PPP.

'The government spent at least £1bn on management consultants last year, making Tony Blair's administration the UK's biggest buyer of business advice, the growth of that sector "far outstripping the rates of growth in other sectors", according to industry figures. Central government doubled its spending on management advice last year to nearly £3m a day, figures published today by the Management Consultancies Association reveal.'

This Chapter of the thesis investigates the roots of the dissatisfaction with bureaucracy that lead to the development of New Public Management in its current form.

The Critique of Bureaucracy

Weber himself was aware of both the power and the limitations of the rational ideal. He wrote numerous times, most notably within “The Protestant Work Ethic” and the “Spirit of Capitalism” about the seductive nature of such a system, which he believed had the power to create a lack of humanity and agency within its subjects.

This has often been referred to in organisational and sociological literature as his metaphor of the ‘Iron Cage’{6}, where Weber warned that the asceticism and rational imperative of the capitalist system would become so powerful in its strength over its subject that it would destroy the very subjects who worked so hard to keep it alive, possibly till ‘the last ton of fossilised coal is burnt’ (Weber 1952: 181-82, as quoted in DiMaggio and Powell, 1983).

As is a requirement to create the dialectic tension required for open debate with any theoretical framework, as the birth of the perspective takes place within society so too, does the development of the critique of this perspective. The critique of the bureaucracy goes back, in the mind of one of its earliest critics, Alistair Macintyre in ‘After Virtue’ to a debate on the ethics and morality which thereby defines the efficacy of bureaucracy, or more specifically the bureaucratic personae.

The Moral Calamity

At the core of MacIntyre’s critique lies the bureaucratic figure who is a technical expert, whose concern is merely the rational implementation of human and non-human resources in order to efficiently achieve pre-established goals. MacIntyre’s angst with bureaucracy is one of the foundational cornerstones that help him to understand his large question, that of

---

the moral calamity facing modern society.

From MacIntyre’s perspective, this moral calamity was created out of the two false mythical seductresses of the previous century – the myth of science and the myth of rational-legal bureaucracy.

**Weberianism not ‘Weber’**

Bauman’s perspective flourishes on one of the tenets of Weberian Bureaucracy. He argues that the bureaucracy leads to the moral decay and ‘silencing’ of human morality, as a ‘moral sleeping pill’ (Bauman, 1989) and is an ‘instrument to obliterate responsibility’ by the reduction of human tasks to mundane minutiae and the insistence on the dispassionate execution of objective behaviour.

In this light, Bauman believed that bureaucracy was not merely an innocuous form of organising the tasks of an organisation but rather a form of de-humanising control that would enable the implementation of even genocidal action. The bureaucracy as Bauman saw it, was an organisational form that encouraged instrumental action which fundamentally undermined the moral essence of human relationships.

Du Gay argues that this in essence, is not the perspective on rationality of Weber’s original writing but rather an amalgamation of ‘Weberian thought’ or so called ‘Weberianism’ as it has developed over the years and through the interpretation of Weber’s texts (Du Gay, 2000; Hennis, 1988, 1996). Weberian rationality has been taken to a far more right-wing extreme position and endowed with a singularity of nature that was never originally intended in the texts of Weber.

This Du Gay repeatedly uses examples of in his critique of Bauman, although it must be said that this would be a far wider-reaching critique since it is not targeted at the inadequate interpretation of Weber but a to large proportion of Weberian scholars. Two key examples here of misinterpretation, include the Weberian notion of rationality and the Weberian notion of the ‘objectivity’ in the discharge of the bureaucratic behaviour called for by Weber.
In defence of Weber both to Macintyre and Bauman, Du Gay argues that Weber had a much less extreme position of this objectification and loss of humanity which appears to be the common problem described by both Macintyre and Bauman, leading to the loss of the moral soul of humanity.

There appears to be in Bauman and MacIntyre, an overwhelming belief in the moral and ethical code that pervades all aspects of human life or the ‘unifying moral personality underpinning and unifying human action’. There are multiple moral perspectives but an individual or organisational form may select only one form and this then, will be their overall framework for their life, work, family, and politics.

Weber presents bureaucracy as a far more contained notion as a specific style of living that is subject to particular laws contained within the organisational life. Pluralism and social differentiation (1994b) are features of modern society integral to Weber and these ideas are grounded in the concepts of different life codes that may govern different parts of one’s life and work. Bureaucracy, ‘...the office itself is a ‘vocation; a focus of individual moral commitment and ethical action which is separate from and privileged over, the bureaucrat’s extra-official ties to kith, kin, class and individual inner conscience (Weber 1978 II, quoted from Du Gay, 1994a).

This key distinction between the habitus of life within an public setting and the habitus of one’s personal life where ‘kith, kin, class and individual inner conscience’ as all the guiding principles, was one of the contributions of Weber into organisational sociological theory. One may even go as far as to state that these were among the first and most foundational writings on organisational culture, and herewith between Weber’s bureaucracy and his critics, appear the first notions of organisational culture clash.

The Key Missing Functionality of the Informal Structures of Authority

All deviations from the core tenets of bureaucratisation have a strongly negative impact on efficiency. Bureaucracy and its efficient ideals are best understood when juxtapositioned
with the principles of traditional authority. Traditional authority of the mid-nineteenth century was all around and based on some ‘...combination of heredity, kinship, religious status, personal loyalty, or friendship connection.’ (Handel, M. 2002)....for Weber, the use of specialists, impersonal norms, written documents, and the discipline of a command hierarchy [gave]. bureaucratic organisations a reliability, regularity and precision in the execution of tasks that no other form of authority equals.’

Blau states categorically that Weberian bureaucracy was presented as an ideal type of organisational structure, largely as a theoretical construct to support empirical research. The function of this concept, as is ‘...the function of all conceptual schemes: to specify the factors that must be taken into consideration in investigations and define them clearly’ (Blau 1956, p.34).

There are two misleading implications of this typification in the analysis of Blau. These are Weber’s exclusive emphasis on the formal authority and leadership within bureaucracy, and the assumption that any deviation from the formal processes of organisation would lead to inefficiency.

Blau’s critique states that clearly in organisational research, there is much empirical evidence to suggest that although formal structures of leadership and authority are integral and important to any organisation, it exists along with informal structures of authority and leadership. Different organisational theorists, based on different empirical studies may claim that these informal structures have varying levels of impact on the actual decision making of the organisation, depending on a number of factors, such as the type of organisational structure, size, etc.

However, they are all agreed that there is an impact of the informal leadership structures, and therefore merely focussing on the formal structure of leadership and authority, are largely inadequate.

Secondly according to Blau, pivotal to the notion of Weberian bureaucracy, is the idea of
efficiency that is driven by formal procedures and experiential expertise. Furthermore, any deviation from the formalised procedures would lead to organisational inefficiencies. The empirical evidence that has since been collected by organisational studies within bureaucracies, once again, does not support this. Blau agrees with the notion that there is no ideal type of bureaucracy, but many organisations contain these characteristics to varying extents.

Within these organisations there is evidence to show that informal procedures and processes are equally efficient if not in some cases, more efficient that following the formal procedures prescribed by the organisation.\(^7\)

The Ideological Critique

Crozier believes that the fundamental project of organisational theory and organisational theory development, at least at an organisational level should be the investigation of the relationship between the individual and the organisation. He propounds that:

\[
\text{Relationship between organisation and individual} = \text{The world of consensus } + \\
\text{The world of co-operative games } + \\
\text{The world of power}
\]

Crosier critiques not only Weber, but the discussion around Weberian Ideal Type Bureaucracy as the ‘the domain of myths and pathos of ideology’ (Crozier, 1964, p. 175).

His belief is that at the heart of the notion of bureaucracy and the writings on it in during last half century, lies a fundamental paradox. The paradox of bureaucracy on the one hand is presented as the rational ideal organisational form that would maximise efficiency and fairness. On the other hand, in these writings, this very bureaucracy is feared as the system

\(^7\) This fundamental inefficiency that exists in bureaucracy has been shown to exist both theoretically and empirically by authors before and after Blau, some of the biggest names being Merton (1936), Bendix, Selznick (1949), Gouldner(1961) and Dubin.
of organisation that is most destructive to human enterprise and democratic human values.

This has largely led to what Crozier terms the ‘dismal school delusion’ that was based on the positivism of scientific engineers. In his words ...‘This paradoxical view of bureaucracy in Western thought, has paralysed positive thinking on the problem and has favoured the making of catastrophic prognostications’ (p176).

Crozier, like the interactionists or the Lewinians accepts as assumption ‘..That human activities depend on the feelings and sentiments of the people involved, and on the interpersonal and group relationships that influence them.’ then it follows that, ‘...one cannot expect that imposing economic rationality on them will bring constant and predictable results’.

The Core Principles of New Public Management

‘As Tony Blair put it, New Labour’s ‘modernizing government’ programme is fundamentally concerned with ‘stimulating more entrepreneurship’ within the British Civil Service (Guardian 1999) through for instance, making civil servants more individually responsible for achieving specific policy outcomes. Such a shift would only be accomplished, it was further observed through instilling more of a ‘private sector work culture’ (Observer 1999) within Whitehall.’ (Du Gay, 04).

Reformed bureaucracy has an increased efficiency because of performance measurement

New Public Management
- Minimising political complaints from the public
- Reduction of uncertainty – irrelevance of uncertainty measures
- Fairness is a notion of the efficient bureaucracy
Bureaucracy, Weberian style had its hay day in the 50s and 60s. While the debate and criticisms around the forms of bureaucracy and bureaucracy as an organising principle brew and flourished, there emerged from its midst in the late 70s, a school of public sector reformists who believed largely in the fundamental principles of bureaucracy but called for reform of the public sector.

They generally wished to increase the efficiency and the service delivery of the public sector by learning some of the tools of trade from their private sector counterparts. In the last century, private sector firms had been speaking the rhetoric of efficiency leading to increased profitability and service delivery. An entire industry of management consultants had developed whose business it was, to increase the efficiency and profitability of private sector firms, creating lean, efficient firms with "Best Practice" delivery of product and services.

The public sector felt the need to follow this trend and increase efficiency and service delivery. This pressure was increased significantly and spurred into action when the politicians got involved and with the politicians, came big money.

New Public Management was considered among academics to have three lasting legacies (Lynn, L. E., 1998) for the field of Public Administration. These were:

- A stronger emphasis on performance motivated administration and the inclusion in the administrative cannon of performance oriented arrangements, structural forms and managerial doctrines

- An international dialogue on the study of design and administrative reforms

- The integrated use of economic, sociological, social-psychological and other advance conceptual models and heuristics for the study of public administration and management.

8 This movement in organisation science started with the publication of a series of texts around the notions of bureaucracy starting with The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism, Weber M, 1930, Oxford: Basil Blackwell.
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

Principles of Entrepreneurial Government (Osbourne and Gabler, 1992)

1. Competition between service providers
2. Empowering citizens through pushing control out of bureaucracies into communities
3. Focusing on outcomes rather than inputs
4. Organisation and persons driven by missions and visions, not by rules and regulations
5. Redefining clients as customers
6. Preventing problems before they emerge rather than simply treating them once they have arisen
7. Earning money, not just spending it
8. Decentralising authority and encouraging participative management
9. Using market-type mechanisms rather than bureaucratic techniques and practices
10. Catalysing partnerships between public, private and voluntary sectors

Table 5-1 Principles of Entrepreneurial Government

Customer service orientation is also considered by some to be at the core of New Public Management (Kaboolian, L., 1998; Cook, B., 1996; Kelly, R. M. and Duerst-Lahti, G., 1995).

The Role of the New Public Manager

Another idea at the core of New Public Management is the re-defining of leadership or more specifically, managerial leadership within the public service. Managers in the private sector are required not just to manage the processes below them but also to provide leadership and motivation to their teams. Within the public sector, the rhetoric of management is more around the implementation of the prescribed ministerial changes which come from above.

Robert D. Benn, in his paper ‘What right to public managers have to lead? (1998), makes the case that although public sector managers have the power to lead, many in fact, do not. He claims that the public managers are the key people who can correct the failures of the higher systems of governance whose basic failures are numerous. They are according to Benn, organisational, analytical, legislative, political and judicial.

The onus for the correction of these failures, should fall into the hands of the Public Managers. The fundamental difference here, in the ethos of the civil service, is the style of
motivation that is required. Rather than working with organisational ‘carrots and sticks’ as in the public sector, the motivation would need to be of a different style.

‘Motivation and inspiration energize people, not by pushing them in the right direction as control mechanisms do but by satisfying their basic human needs for achievement, a sense of belonging, recognition, self esteem, a feeling of control over one’s life, and the ability to live up to one’s ideals’ (Kotter, 1990,7). The ethos of the civil service would suggest that the most important forms of motivation, which would come from team leaders, would need to be in the style mentioned by Kotter. In other words, it would need to satisfy the human need for belonging, recognition, and provide the feeling of serving the community9.

Peters and Waterman (1982) followed these principles of slating bureaucracy as a stepping stone for the establishment of the ‘new private sector manager’. The culture of entrepreneurial, motivational leadership was one of the key features of their new private sector manager, which now under the auspices of New Public Management is being transferred to the public sector. They cited the ‘nadir of bureaucracy as its failure to produce members emotionally committed to the pursuit of economic efficiency because of the ethos of detachment’ (Stokes, J. and Clegg, S., 2002)

Taking a closer look at the notions of new managers within the post-bureaucratic state, Farrell and Morris (2003) argue that although post-bureaucratic models may have caused a reduction in the hierarchy of civil service, these models have increased bureaucratic tendencies, with particularly strong implications for the new managers within the public sector, referred to within the article as the ‘persecuted professionals’ (p.135).

The impetus on the public service managers, who may have for a long time been public service administrators, to take on the professional garb of managers, has been referred to in studies including those by Kitchener, (1997) and Hunter, (1998). They state that even

---

9 During the case study investigated in this thesis, a staff survey was carried out at the agency investigating peoples motivations for coming to work. The most important motivational feature within the agency was job satisfaction followed closely by a sense of service to the community one belongs to. According to Benn this would be quite different in the private sector.
within the private sector, middle management is resistant to change. There is a far greater reluctance in the public sector, where the administrators are being required to become part of the behaviour and discourse on professional management; that is, to become ‘the vanguard of new managerialism’ (p.137).

The Rhetoric of New Public Management

There have been many waves of improving the system of bureaucracy over the last two centuries. There has been widespread agreement of the need for change or reformation of bureaucracy to fit the needs of the modern governments, but the direct and nature of these changes have been more contested.

The latest formats of these have fallen broadly under the movement of entrepreneurial government or New Public Management. Within this new ethos, change has become a fundamental essentiality of the new culture of bureaucracy. Organisations must be able to survive and thrive on change (Du Gay, 2003). Led by an army of management consultants, (the change experts) the civil service agencies are undergoing fundamental change both ‘creative’ and ‘cultural’. ‘Creative’ and ‘cultural’ change are sold as business products which may be produced and re-produced by the agents of change. This distribution of cultural software and hardware are becoming the most ‘innovative’ actors in the economic world today (Lash and Urry, 1994).

The latest wave of bureaucratic reform is known as New Public Management. It has its birth in the charismatic rhetoric of what Du Gay refers to as the Anti-bureaucrat, a movement who expertise is today manifest in the industry of change management consultants. The essence of the Anti-bureaucratic movement was to be found in the move away from all things that bureaucracy came to represent in the early 20th century.

The thinkers and authors behind this type of public sector management, Osborne and Gabler (1992) provided a ten-step menu of principles that could be implemented and enacted by governments in OECD countries who were required to follow the model of entrepreneurial management.
The foundational ethos behind the notion of bureaucracy and the notion of entrepreneurial management are different. In entrepreneurial management, the emphasis has shifted from an efficient, rational, fair, and impartial government service, to treating government as a commercial enterprise. See Table 5-2 for a comparison between them.

The discourse has moved closer to that of management studies, with more emphasis on mission and visions of the organisation, and the entrepreneurial nature of the civil service. The civil service is then called upon to be an entrepreneur, taking risks, having initiative, making quick decisions and the public are now to be seen as the customers who pay for a service (Hodgeson, D. E., 2004).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethos</th>
<th>Principles of Bureaucracy</th>
<th>Principles of Entrepreneurial Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Job satisfaction through service</td>
<td></td>
<td>Job satisfaction though financial remuneration and achievement orientation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detachment from outcome</td>
<td></td>
<td>Responsible for the outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resistance to change</td>
<td></td>
<td>Constantly changing to meet market/industry changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pathos</td>
<td>Service to the Public</td>
<td>Evaluation and reward based on commercially efficient principles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Logos</td>
<td>Impartial, efficient service to support civil society</td>
<td>Cost reduction and efficiency increase</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5-2 Comparison of the Principles of Bureaucracy and Entrepreneurial Management
This notion has not gone quite as far as claiming ‘the customer is always right’ as in private enterprises but urges that government agencies be seen as enterprises that provide service for a cost to a customer in a competitive environment. It therefore also urges the shift away from monopolies in the government service industries, urging that climates of competition are created between agencies, thereby creating external pressures to increase the efficiency of the service providers.

The entrepreneurial management rhetoric of Public Sector Management is positioned within the field in opposition to the ethos of bureaucracy. There are calls to move away from the bureaucratic culture ‘with its commitment to norms of impersonality, adherence to due process, ethos of responsibility, and so forth [this culture] is seen as antithetical to the cultivation of those entrepreneurial skills and sensibilities to the cultivation of those entrepreneurial skills and sensibilities, now deemed so crucial to securing a ‘manageable’ and hence, sustainable future.’ (Du Gay, 2000, p85).

The crucial step along the path to entrepreneurial government occurred with the publishing of the ‘Next Steps Programme’ report, subtitled ‘Improving Management in Government’ (Efficiency Unit, 1988). This report laid out the steps to create a more private corporate-sector style management to the government agencies, and the production of ‘framework documents’.

This report outlined the roles, responsibilities and overall performance targets, based on private sector best practice models. The discourse in these documents are around notions of task, goals and targets, describing in detail, the aspects of individual roles, and their specific requirements to fulfil these roles.

They often also contain measurement targets that one has to achieve to be successful at this job. It was the Conservative government’s acceptance of this report’s recommendation that heralded a change in the identity of the Civil Service.
'Following what was supposed to be best current private sector practice
the unitary structure of the British Civil Service was replaced with a
quasi autonomous multidivisional structure, where operational
responsibilities were separated off from strategic and monitoring
responsibilities' (Corby 1993, 1998).

These were the first official steps of the private sector corporatisation into the public sector. This was a powerful step since it was targeted to change the very structures and identity of the public sector to one of a ‘corporate, competitive enterprise’.

The level of buy-in, for this philosophy was in the upper echelons of the public sector where there was a strong push towards creating individual executive agencies. The job titles within the Civil Service were changed and employees (based on their grade) were known as executive officers (EO), higher executive officers (HEO), and senior executive officers (SEO). Civil servants were encouraged to take ownership of their agencies and increase their levels of commitment by introducing private sector packages, such as performance related pay, and open competition within the agencies for jobs and posts.

The three primary shifts in the image and role of the civil servant under New Public Management included:

_no more the public scapegoat:_

The face of the British Civil Service was revolutionised by this change and many of the aspects of the ethos of the British Civil Servant fundamentally shifted.

The first fundamental shift has been to move the Civil Servants away from the implementers of ministerial policy to the creators of ministerial policy. There has always been a degree of overlap in these two areas, but with the Next Steps move, the senior civil servant is now publicly responsible for the policy. This has removed the responsibility from the shoulders of the Ministers, and allowed them to sidestep questions of policy within the British parliament, by passing them onto the shoulders of the Civil Servants in charge of
the individual agencies.

The argument for this in the Next Steps camp was to increase ‘transparency’ and ‘accountability’ in the Civil Service (Goldsworthy, 1991), leaving them open to be made the political scapegoats in situations of crisis (O'Toole, 1998).

**No More Dominated by Short Term Thinking:**

Another fundamental shift in the role of the Civil Servant has been to place upon them, the primary responsibility of reaching measurable targets laid out by the government. These targets are often publicly available and laid out in the election manifesto of the political party in power. The targets therefore, become the object of focus of the civil servant, rather than the way or manner in which the targets are reached.

The political agenda often has a life-span of around four years between elections. The civil service agencies, which are tasked with achieving these goals, have a much longer life-cycle and policy implementation has much longer repercussions in the civil service.

Removing the focus of the civil servant from the actual running of the agency and the long-term appropriateness of the reforms or changes to the agency, leads to short-term thinking and the implementation of short-term solutions, rather than the longer term vision of managing the agency effectively over time. Hodgeson (2004) argues that this is achieved through the implementation of Project Management Tools from the private sector\(^\text{10}\).

**Managing Ministerial Embarrassment:**

Covering the ministerial backs appears to be another result of the shift of the role of the civil servant. This also has implications on the effectiveness of the civil servant to focus on managing the agencies, rather focusing on ensuring that ministers live up to their parliamentary promises.

---

\(^{10}\) Best Practice Research also has its critic, for example it has been criticised within the Postbureaucratic Reform by Overman and Boyd (1994) in the Journal of Administrative Research and Theory, as being theoretically self validating, non cumulative and limited in scope and politically skewed.
It strongly hinders the degree to which the civil servants may speak clearly and strongly to the ministers about the reality of the situation on the ground within the agency. Rather, it creates artificial situations to ensure that parliamentary promises are lived up to. This often leads to hours of discussion and debate as to how to word the promises and feedback to the ministers, to avoid their embarrassment, rather than giving honest feedback on the situation within the agency.

An example of this is often seen in the implementation of IT systems within the civil service, where there are often delays and programme failures caused by the very nature of IT implementation. However, to avoid the ministerial embarrassment, hours are wasted and large amounts of money spent to ensure that the systems are delivered to achieve the date of implementation. This is done although the system may not be as it was promised when the commitment was made.

The Critiques of the Public Private Sector Partnership of New Public Management

Instigating the change towards New Public Management using the tools of private sector change experts in the form of management consultants, has been criticised by academics from both fields.

Gerard Hanlon (2004), has argued that it is in fact the very techniques of bureaucratic control that management consultants have used to implement their changes in the public sector. Despite the onslaught of management jargon (Hodgson, 2004) and principles into the public sector, Hanlon creates an argument for the resilience and longevity of the institutional values of homology, trust and reputational capital that still appear to structure the civil service.

One of the other key criticisms of public sector management which has been widely researched is the difficulty for embedding innovation or change in the public sector. Anand, N., Gardner H.K. and Morris, T. (2007) look at the difficulties of embedding these
practices even within the apparently most flexible of private sector firms, the management consultancies, or the professional service firms. They identify four main areas which can help the embedding processes of innovation and change: socialized agency, differentiated expertise, defensible turf and organizational support. In a change process where the change consultants are called in as the experts of the change, this would occur during the process of creating socialized agency. Even in this context the recommendation is to create partnerships with ‘change gurus’ rather than bring them in as the experts. The change needs to be developed and implemented internally within the organization.

Once Upon a Time in the Bureaucracy - A Case Study by Jon Stokes and Stewart Clegg

Whatever happened to the great promise of the public sector reformists, known as Next Steps in the UK and ‘Re-inventing Government’ in the USA – the promise to separate the influence of politicians and managers, the ministers and the civil servants? This case is presented from a human perspective as seen in this case study (2002).

Time and again across countries and political borders, there are numerous examples of at the very worst, entirely failed public sector reform and at its very best, public sector reform that has fallen far short of its initial promises, nor merely in terms of the end deliverable of improved public services, but in increased costs, time of delivery.

This would be considered entirely unacceptable in the private sector, but repeatedly this appears to the result of public sector change reform implemented by the private sector ‘change experts’. An additional creation often also appears to be the creation of a demoralised and under-committed public sector employee base.

When one considers that in the employee staff surveys of numerous public sector agencies, the primary reason sited by employees for joining the public sector repeatedly appears to be ‘service’ and ‘commitment’, then it does indeed appear to be quite a feat to repeatedly have converted these employees to become de-motivate and un-committed. Stokes and Clegg
identify the 'determinate absence'\textsuperscript{11} in the public sector reformist literature, as power.

Jon Stokes and Stewart Clegg in their critical paper 'Once upon a Time in the Bureaucracy: Power and Public Sector Management' present a perspective that could explain some of these apparently anomalous results.

'...we observe that reform can create an unaccountable and personally politicised elite and a demoralised work force, where some senior members engage in a capricious struggle for power and others struggle for remnants of bureaucratic meaning. The struggle seems not to serve any overall organisational purposes, destroys many pre-existing notions of responsibility and created, for many members, an experience of organisational reform as a process of unresolved and contradictory duality – between an enterprising promise and a rationally accountable past.'

The most well founded critique of bureaucracy in the management literature lies in the failure of its members to produce emotionally committed people to the pursuit of economic efficiency caused by the ethos of attachment. Thus the birth and proliferation in the management sector of the Management Gurus\textsuperscript{12} who give to the employees of the private sector, the great feeling of commitment and a stake in the winnings of the organisation.

They are big on providing visions and missions and encouraging the employees to 'believe' and 'have faith' in the organisation and the organisational goals. This has been translated and found its way into the public sector reform discourse where it '... involves a doubtful quasi-religious juxtaposition of expressions, such as visions and mission, theoretically framed by notions of efficiency (which at its core means cost cutting) (Du Gay, 2000).

\textsuperscript{11} a term popularised by Althusser (1969) originating in the work of Marx referring to a missing dimension of a debate.

\textsuperscript{12} starting with Peters and Waterman's management bestseller - In Search of Excellence
Chapter 6: Convergence or Conversion

Chapter Summary

This chapter formulates three hypothetical outcomes of the encounter between the civil servants and the management consultants, as well as provides the logic and tools of the argumentation analysis. The key hypotheses result from the previous theoretical discussions. There is the ideal state of Convergence (hypothesis 1), Conversion I (hypothesis 2) where the civil servants convert to the language representations of the consultants, and conversion II (hypothesis 3) where the consultants shift their language representations to those of the civil service.

This is followed by an argumentation analysis based on the field data, using Toulmin’s model of argumentation. An Atlas analysis is also conducted on the documentation analysing the rhetorical features of ‘ethos’, ‘pathos and ‘logos’ and claims, data, warrants and backing.

‘Text is a powerful lord that with the smallest and most invisible body, accomplishes the most god like works. It can banish fear and remove grief and instil pleasure and enhance pity. Divine sweetness transmitted though words is inductive of pleasure and deductive of pleasure.’

Gorgias (483 – 375BC)– Greek Sophist and Rhetorician
The arranged marriage of the public and private sector in its most recent form has been framed as New Public Management in recent years as discussed in the last chapter. The use of the metaphor of an arranged marriage to look at public private sector partnerships, has been a long tradition originating in the publication by Dan Corry, Julian Le Grand and Rosemary Radcliff at the Institute of Public Policy Research, with their publication ‘Public/Private Partnerships. A marriage of convenience or a permanent commitment’ (1997).

The persistent and extensive use of change management consultants in the implementation of New Public Management shown in the published government figures of around £508 million in the 1992/93 (Efficiency Unit, Cabinet office, 1994) rising to over £1.5 billion in 2003/04 as published in the Guardian (Finch, J, 04) demonstrates that indeed this has been a growing (in size, at the very least) permanent commitment between the public and the private sector.

The feature of this marriage that is interesting for this thesis, is the arrangement of this marriage. In other words, how does it come about, or in whose interest is this marriage. Who is arranging this relationship? Would the public-private partnership have had this degree of consistency or growth if it were left to the public and the private sectors?

The private sector would be involved in industries that can use their expertise and pay for their services. The public sector is consistently in a state of reform. The link between these two and who is involved in the partnership, depends on the government in power and the ministers in charge of the purse strings.

The expert status of the consultants in organisational transformation is accepted in the private sector. It is the government that must be responsible for the joining of the two, to encourage the use of this private sector expertise in the reform of public sector agencies. Thus the arrangement of this marriage, between the private sector change management experts and the public sector, which is reforming with the intention that they may use
private sector expertise to help themselves to refine their processes and learn private sector lessons of increased efficiency, accountability, and keeping costs low – integral to New Public Management.

The Propositions

There could be three possible outcomes from the encounter between these two groups.

**Proposition 1:** If the Consultants and the Civil Servants are involved in a process of mutual learning over a period of time this will result in a shared language typified in the language of the change team - **CONVERGENCE**

**Proposition 2:** If the Consultants teach effectively and the Civil Servant learn from the Consultants the Civil servants will speak the language of the Consultants typified by the language of the change team: **CONVERSION I**

**Proposition 3:** If the Consultants learn the language of the Civil Servants, learning must have taken place by the Consultants as typified by the language of the change team: **CONVERSION II**

The ideal hope and intention of this arranged marriage is that both parties may learn from each other and over time, come to share common ground through this encounter. One of the tangible manifestations of such an outcome, would be the development of a shared language with reference to the actual change and change processes.

The second possible outcome would be that the private sector gives its knowledge to the public sector, and the public sector through a learning process would think, behave and therefore, speak the language of the private sector specifically in this case, around the change and the change processes.

The third possible outcome would be that the public sector changes the thinking of the private sector, resulting in behaviour and language of the public sector across the group,
with reference to the change and change processes, over time.

**Argumentation as a Tool to Establish the Ethos of the Two Communities.**

**The Landscape of Argumentation Theory**

A brief history of the roots of argumentation theory is presented here in the tradition of Toulmin's work which is used for analysis in this thesis.

**Aristotle: The Rational Ideal**

The development of argumentation theory has a long and illustrious history. Argumentation as a specialised field had its birth within the field of rhetoric where it first developed out of the work of the philosophers, Coran and Tisias in the fifth century BC (Liakopoulous 2000). The art of rhetoric found its following in the world of power and politics as the strengths of mastery, over the art of persuasion, was soon realised as critical to any form of political or administrative advancement.

The philosopher Aristotle was the first scholar to make a real attempt at systematising the act of persuasion by creating a set of formalised rules as to what constituted good and bad argumentation. In his theory of reasoning, Aristotle was primarily interested in creating a set of rules, which exposed the fallacies of human thinking and created a logical argumentation structure (Aristotle 1991).

This was part of an attempt by social institution of philosophers to improve the quality of discourse by moving it towards a rational ideal. Aristotle developed a list of rules for evaluating an argument against its logical and rational ideal.

Traditionally argumentation was set out in the form of two premises followed by a conclusion.

---

For example: Philosophy is a complex subject;

Argumentation theory falls under philosophy;

So, argumentation theory is complex.

**Toulmin: The Interactionists Approach**

Argumentation theory has developed since into a prolific field of research and study. One of its main proponents, Stephen E. Toulmin, presented his main thesis about argumentation in his book ‘The Uses of Arguments’ (1958). Toulmin’s contribution to argumentation analysis stands apart from others, since it brought the analysis of argumentation a step further than the mere analysis of the dry logic contained within its structure.

Toulmin’s emphasis, on the other hand, lies in the persuasiveness and ‘ability to convince’ the audience about the argument. This is a critical step in making argumentation analysis relevant in the world of informal interaction, propaganda, and advertising (Liakopoulos 2000).

This is fundamentally different from the earlier sphere of argumentation research, since the audience or recipient of the argumentation becomes a critical component in the evaluation of the argument. The argument on its own with its dry, formalised logic is not sufficient to analyse and decide whether it is good or bad in Aristotelean terminology.

However, the effect or impact of being able to convince an audience to change their opinion or incorporate the new perspectives, is also considered critical in Toulmin’s perspective. The persuasive ability is seen in the strength of the warrant for the argument, based on the acceptability of the backing.

Toulmin stops, just shy of involving the audience in the analysis of the argument. His

---

\(^{14}\)Toulmin views argumentation as a social act which encompasses all activity, processes and background around the tasks of creating, supporting and backing up the argument. Toulmin, S. (1958). *The uses of argument*. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.
model of argumentation, based on the work on legal procedures is given in Figure 6-1

This core structure of argumentation is consistently present across all areas and fields of argumentation. The basis of any argument is the claim or assertion, which is being made and supported by data or facts or opinions.

![Diagram of Toulmin's Model of Argumentation]

Figure 6-1 Toulmin's Model of Argumentation. 'D; W; so C, [or Data, Warrant, so Conclusion' (Toulmin 2003)

The link between the data and the claim is usually supported by a justification of why the data is pertinent to that particular claim which is called a warrant. This increases or multiplies the strength of the link between the data and the claim and the effect of the justification or the warrant, is most strongly felt, making the claim link between data and claim strongest when backing supports the warrant. The backing statement pertains primarily to the relevance of the warrant to the link between data and claim but it may also be an independent statement as to the validity of the warrant.

Argumentative validity is assessed on the strength of the backing for the warrant, which is inherently 'field dependant' in Toulmin's assessment. Therefore soundness of a warrant or in other words, the value of a justification for the data's applicability to a claim, is specific to the rules and norms of the field within which the argument is being created. Therefore there is little sense in a psychologist assessing the value of a legal argument or vice versa.

There are three further distinctions in Toulmin's work that need to be noted here. These are
the notions of universal premises, analytic arguments and substantial arguments. If we take
the basic premise of Toulmin's theory of argumentation to be D; W; so C – or in other
words 'data, warrant so conclusion', his assertion is that any argument may be laid out in
this format, satisfying the criteria of formal validity; that is, it is not field dependant.
However,
‘A singular premise expresses a piece of information from which we are drawing a
conclusion, a universal premise now expresses, not a piece of information at all but a
guarantee in accordance with which we can safely take the step from our datum to our
conclusion. Such a guarantee will be neither factual nor categorical but rather hypothetical
and permissive.’ (Toulmin, 2003).

Perelman and Olbrechts-Tyteca : The New Rhetoric
The next major step forward in this interactional view of argumentation include Perelman
treatise on argumentation’.

The interesting feature of Perelman and Obrechts-Tyteca’s work is that they begin to
include in their analysis of argumentation, social psychological notions, such as ‘the
audience’, ‘the representation in the auger’s mind’ and ‘creation of an appealing argument’.
Here, the validity of the argument is made almost entirely from a functional perspective
mentioned earlier.

That is, was the argument successful in convincing the audience, or to put it more simply,
did the audience buy the argument? The audience is always presented as the ‘antagonist to
the argument’ in the first place and as the argument unfolds, it is successful only if it
manages to convince the audience, based on the relation between the premises put forward
and the appeal of the premises to the audience to accept the conclusions.

By making such a critical inclusion of the perspective and representations of the audience,
the processes of argumentation could be likened to the process that occur when social
knowledges bump into each other along the peripheries of social communities and are then
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

changed (Moscovici 2001). It is by studying these processes closely and carefully that the processes of evolution of social knowledges can begin to be unwrapped.

The structure of the argumentation may reveal the nature of the interaction of the two social communities by looking at the audience reception of the argumentation and the levels to which one community’s argumentation is (a) absorbed and accepted or (b) synthesised and assimilated or (c) rejected and replaced with the audience’s own argumentation.

This is the aim of using this type of argumentation analysis for this thesis. To better understand how the social knowledges around the organisational change existed at the beginning of the project, how they came into interact and what was the argumentation that evolved/emerged after working together for 11 months.

Eemeren and Grootendorst: The Pragma-dialectic Approach

Argumentation is a verbal, social, and rational activity aimed at convincing a reasonable critic of the acceptability of a standpoint by putting forward a constellation of propositions justifying or refuting the proposition expressed in the standpoint\(^{15}\) (Eemeren and Grootendorst 2004)). Any act of trying to convince an audience of a variant perspective from the one that they currently hold, may be done through the act of argumentation.

This may be seen in the form of conversations between individuals, discourses of societies and even documentation of social communities that are forced to interact, in an attempt to convince others of the correctness of their view.

Arguments may also be partly or wholly non-verbal (Groarke 2002), but they remain a social activity. At its very extreme, even a monological argument used in self deliberation may be considered as a social activity as within it there is contained a ‘dialogue interieur’ (Eemeren, Grootendoorst et al. 1996).

\(^{15}\) This definition of argumentation differs from the usage of the term in everyday language. It is an attempt to process-product ambiguity of the term, ie argumentation as a process and a product. This thesis focuses on the product aspect of argumentation.
In other words, an argument is by definition a dialectic process and involves two or more participants presenting their point of view to the other participants, with the intention of convincing the other of the superiority of their own position. The object of study within an argumentation analysis, based on written discourse or documentation, as is seen in this thesis, is the structure of the argument being put forward by either participant or in a more detailed sense, the components and positioning of the elements of the argument of each participant. That is, ‘the manner in which these statements are structured within discourse, and their soundness’ (Liakopoulos 2000).

The core elements of an argument according to Burleson (1979) are (i) the existence of an assertion construed as a claim, (ii) an organisation structure around the defence of the claim, and (iii) an inferential leap in the movement from support to assertion.

**The Audience: Features of a ‘Rational and Reasonable’ Critic**

The emphasis on the audience in the interactional approach of Toulmin et al, lays the onus of responsibility on the proponent of the argument to deploy a series of tools or strategies at his disposal to create in the audience, an effect of acceptance. On the audience, it places the onus of flexibility (the ability to change one’s standpoint), rationality and reasonableness.

Therefore attempting argumentation between Kuhnian ‘incommensurable paradigms’ would be a wasted exercise, since there is neither the space, nor the language, nor the opportunity to attempt to impact the audience with an alternate point of view. Toulmin in his book ‘Knowing and Acting’ lays out three primary criteria for ‘reasonableness’.

In this philosophical position, reasonableness is determined by the satisfaction of at least one of the following three criteria: the criteria of geometry, anthropology or criticality.

Geometrical reasonableness involves a clearly structured logicality of argument within which scholars or alternate audiences may look at the argument and make assertions as to
its reasonableness. Theorists from this philosophical standpoint believe that any argument is correct and they judge further argumentation on that basis.

Natural science argumentation would fall within this category.

For example, If \( a + b = c \), then \( a - c = b \).

Geometric philosophers are primarily concerned with the state of affairs, or the current state of an argument, whereas anthropological and critical philosophers primary focus is on the development and propagation of the discussion round a theme.

Anthropological reasonableness would focus its attention on the relationship between the participants in the argument and determine the features of the participants that make each other, valid and reliable participants from one another’s point of view. This is because here the reasonableness is defined by culture-specific norms and ideologies that may not be adequately transferred across cultures.

These are historically and culturally specific and any evaluation of the argumentation must be done within those boundaries. Examples of this kind of argumentation which cannot be adequately judged across cultures, would be issues like that of arranged marriages where anthropological reasonableness would state that the value and social significance of this social practice may only be judged within the actual context of cultures where this is a valid and occurring practice\(^\text{16}\). The arguer and the audience must share the same epistemic background.

Critical reasonableness would require the focus of analysis to be laid on the issues being argued and determine whether the position of the argument may be answered satisfactorily in the first place, regardless of the argument being put forward. In other words, whether there is a valid argument to be had in the first place or whether the issue is one that does not lend itself to such a discussion.

An example of this kind of argumentation would be the question of whether God is present in organisations. This question in its entirety may be considered one that cannot be answered with a strong degree of critical reasonableness, although a sub-section of this may be argued on studies, based on personal experiences or anecdotes. One of the critical features of this philosophical stance on reasonableness, is the Popperian view of intersubjective validity. In other words, two or more audiences experiencing this argumentation should have the same experience or reach the same or similar conclusions. This is termed the critical-rationalistic view of reasonableness.

Whatever the philosophical stance of the audience and the arguer, any study into argumentation theory, stands on a theoretical framework. The primary framework used for this thesis, is the pragma-dialectical theory of argumentation developed by Van Eemeren and Grootendorst (2004). This theoretical standpoint is based heavily on the work of the integrationists’ and Toulmin’s ideas

**From Rhetoric to Argumentation: Tools of Rhetoric – Ethos, Pathos and Logos**

Rhetoric, studied all the way down from the time of Aristotle may be viewed through a number of lenses. The most commonly used are the lenses of ethos, pathos, and logos. These are all tools used in the context of rhetoric to appeal to the audience in an act of persuasion.

**Ethos:** In an argument based on ethos, the audience is appealed to or persuaded through the authority or identity of the speaker. There are multiple authority or legitimacy signifiers both in the actual text of the speaker and in the signs and symbolic nature of the environment. The persuasive act is largely achieved by increasing the legitimacy of the authority of the speaker, thus convincing the audience of the legitimacy of the argument.

**Pathos:** Here the persuasive appeal of the argument is based on the emotional appeal that the speaker makes to the audience. In analysing this kind of argumentation situation, it is critical to have a visual or at the very least, an audio record of the speaker, since this is
where one may decipher the emotional context of the argument. Reading the dry text often does not provide a sufficient insight into the pathos of the speaker, which in this case, is his core platform from which the act of persuasion is being achieved.

Logos: This is the form of argumentation that is being looked at in this thesis and is most often the form found in any textual analysis. Here the persuasive act of the argumentor is found within the power of the logic that the argument is based on. Given the rules of a particular argumentation field, this form of argumentation is largely based on the ability of the argumentor to fulfil the criterion of logic within that field and thereby increase the sheer logical power over the audience to be persuaded by the argument.

It is largely within this field that Toulmin’s model (of Data, Claims, Warrants, Backing and Rebuttals) is used.

It should be stated here that although it is most common practice to use the Toulminian model to disentangle the logos of an argument, it could theoretically also be used in the context of ethos and pathos. In that case, of course, the notions of data, warrants, claims and backings would be quite different. However theoretically, it would be possible.

For the purposes of this thesis, which is analysing dry text at this stage, Toulmin’s model will be used to disentangle the logos of the arguments of the two communities – the public and the private.

The Process of Argumentation
At the beginning of an argument in its simplest form, there is an argument source and an audience for the argument. It is important for argumentation analysis to identify the social context of the two participants and the argumentation in general.

This also falls in line with the need to understand and explore the social milieu that the representations are formed within, as each will be thereby privy to its own set of existing representations, legitimacy signs and authority signals. These hold a particular significance
in the context of inter community interactions, and thereby in the Public Private Sector discussion and debate.

In the analysis of an argument, the first stage is to get a clearer understanding of the social groups that are interacting through the argument, since this will give insight into whether the argument will make any sense to the recipients. We also need to see whether the ‘languages’ of the two communities are fundamentally disparate. See Figure 6-2.

![Figure 6-2 Typification of the Argument of the Private Sector Change Experts](image)

The second stage of argument analysis is to create, within a few paragraphs, a summary of key ideas contained within the argument. Once this is clear the argument needs to be deconstructed, in this case, according to Toulmin’s argumentation scheme.

Arguments often may be broken up into more than one set of underlying claims, data, warrant backing etc. Each argument set must be analysed separately.
Typifying the Argument

An argument is made up of three fundamental parts with a few additional possibilities.

Claim: A statement initiating an argument that states the position of the argument with reference to other features of the argumentation environment.

Data: Facts or supporting factors of the claim of an argument. These are used at various stages and in a variety of ways to support the perspective of the argument being created.

Warrant: This statement strengthens and attempts to legitimise the link between the claim and the data by providing logical linkages between the two. The particular forms of logical linkages that are used are most often context-specific and pertain to the rules of logic of the particular sphere within which the argument is being made. In other words, a legal argument will be required to contain a different specific form of logic than a religious argument or a medical one.

Backing: This part of the argument legitimises the warrant as a link between the data and
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

the claim. It gives additional strength to the logic and acceptability of the warrant in the context of the argumentation field.

Rebuttal: This shows that there are cases in which the argument may not hold, therefore further supporting the case for the legitimacy of the argument within these conditions. The rebuttal shows that the argument can be falsified, or rather that should the conditions stated in the warrant and the backing not be met, there could be situations where the data would not support the claim.

There are two additional parameters in the investigation of argumentation in the Toulminian format. These are elements that help us to better understand the context ad background of the field within which the argument is being constructed. They are the argument domain and the valuation tone.

The Argument Domain is the background within which the argument is made. If we are going to judge the legitimacy of the argument according to the rules and logic of the context, it is critical for the argumentation analyst to understand the domain / background of the field. This often may present within it, hints of the sources of such thinking and the core beliefs of such social knowledges.

The Valuation Tone is the ethical/ moral/ value based flavour of the argument. Therefore this leads to an understanding of whether the author of the argument is presenting the issue in a positive or negative light. In other words, the argument presents whether they are in favour of or against the propositions. Such a code is often used in content analysis to get an overall flavor of the content before establishing particular arguments within its text.

Argumentation Within Disparate Communities: Establishing the Rules

This thesis deals with the analysis of the argumentation within the public sector and private sector organizations, participating in an organizational change process. As seen, it is critical while analyzing an argument, to understand the distinct rules argumentation of each of the
two disparate communities who attempt to work together and present arguments to each other. This is to achieve consensus/ persuade the other of the legitimacy and rightness of their argument.

Although the ultimate goal remained achieving the organizational change, the manner that this change was conceived of and more importantly the manner in which it would be most effectively achieved, was distinct and community specific. This was the discussion that the communities were engaged in.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rules of Engagement</th>
<th>Public Sector</th>
<th>Private Sector</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Format of Argumentation</td>
<td>Power point presentations</td>
<td>MS word documents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average length of Argumentation</td>
<td>15-25 slides</td>
<td>20-30 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average distribution list of</td>
<td>8-10 senior management</td>
<td>30 senior management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argumentation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average speed of production</td>
<td>24 hours</td>
<td>1-3 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average number of authors</td>
<td>2-3</td>
<td>8-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average number of reviews prior</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to presentation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location of key anchors</td>
<td>Title page of each slide</td>
<td>Within the text</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location of key objectifications</td>
<td>Diagrammatic representations of</td>
<td>Within the text</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>each slide</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback requirements before</td>
<td>From 8-10 senior management</td>
<td>Peer review process agency wide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>finalization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6-1 Comparative Description of Public Private Sector Argumentation Ritual

However the differences did not stop there, the manner of engagement in argumentation was also fundamentally different. Table 6-1 highlights a few of the procedural differences in the manner in which the argumentations styles differed within the two communities.

Domains of Argumentation of the Two Communities: Ethos

Three fundamental differences are immediately apparent in the comparison of the public and private sectors. Presented here are the overarching typifications of the ideal type construct of each, and although they appear in many forms and guises in their actual
existence, these three reasons are at the very core of the ‘raison d’etre’ (the reason for their existence).

The first are where the money for running the civil service and private sector organisations comes from and to whom they are accountable for their actions. The private sector firms are fundamentally accountable to their stakeholders to create profit. The civil service gets its funding from citizens of the state through the taxation system.

The division of taxes between government agencies is a matter of governmental policy. This creates a fundamental difference between the civil service and private enterprise in that the civil service is accountable to two audiences, the public and the political government in power.

The second difference is the source mission of two organisations – one to raise money and be profitable in a competitive market (the private sector), the other to provide the public services of the state and be the vehicle whereby the elected government’s agenda is implemented.

One of the key functions of the civil service is to provide continuity of knowledge and personnel over the many changes in governments and governmental procedure that occurs at least once in four years in this country. By maintaining the constancies of the civil service, with its bureaucracy and paper trails, new governmental policy is checked and changed and adds to the civil service’s feelings of always being responsive but never having ownership over the actual changes that are implemented. This has implications on the pace and responsibility taken over the changes that the civil service implements.

To some writers about the civil service, it is an agency which is in place to manage the changes of governments and their ‘public pleasing, ‘vote winning’ policies and to temper these with a long term perspective or a knowledge of the history of similar implementations of the past.
The third is the notion of ‘job’ and job security. The civil service, the most public of all agencies is a career choice that offers job security. This is fundamentally different from the private sector models of a job that is based on competitiveness, promotions, and bonuses.

The private sector often speaks of this, using the term ‘carrots and stick’ that are the motivators in the private sector. It is immediately apparent then, how differently their change models will be placed when developed within the private sector, rather than in the public sector within which they are being implemented.

The ‘carrots and sticks’ in the private sector are as follows: The ‘carrots’ being the possibility of offering a promotion or a bonus for immediate action by the employees. The ‘sticks’ are the possibility of loosing jobs or not receiving a bonus unless the behaviour or changes are modified to suit the new changes.

Civil servants who largely have job security cannot be motivated by threats but rather have stated in numerous job motivation surveys, that their primary reason for choosing this career was job satisfaction. In motivating them, it is important to consider this fundamental part of their ethos.

The Public Sector:
The civil service in the United Kingdom is one of the oldest and most established bureaucracies in the world. The culture and ethos of the civil service is very strong and has enduring the ‘long duree’ of time. It is an institution which is traditional, based on the fundamental principles of the civil service and implementing the duties of the state.

It is based on procedures and control, but its fundamental functions remain different from those of private enterprise and from the non-profit sector. It is an institution based on the principles of transparency and fairness, with paper work and explicitness being the price it pays for this. The ethos of the civil service is one of service to the public who pay the taxes
that maintain the system.

Under New Public Management (NPM) the government has attempted to make the civil service more efficient and accountable to the customer, based on private sector change models. One of the ways they have tried to introduce this, is by introducing private sector thinking into the public sector management like the example below of introducing performance measurement tools. Reformed bureaucracy has an increased efficiency due to performance measurement.

Setting measurable targets for the civil service to aim to achieve to achieve their required funding is one of the features of NPM. Examples include:

- Minimising political complaints from the public
- Reduction of uncertainty
- Irrelevance of uncertainty measures

These targets are set and data collected to measure their success or failure. These targets are critical in gaining further funding from the government for these projects for future years.

The language of the civil service that is widely described in articles, newspapers and even on television documentaries, is one of deep frustration. Their feeling is that their hands have been tied as they now spend much time in achieving targets and satisfying these goals, rather than focussing their attention on providing service to the customer, the public.

In some cases, much energy is also spent in learning how to avoid these targets or reach them for the sake of the numbers to the deterioration of the quality of the service provided. In a world of finite resources, this is the tension that must be dealt with but perhaps some civil servants would argue that the core of the customer and public service, needs to be put back into the these reforms.
Chapter 3: Organisations as Communities: Management Consulting

The Private Sector:

The rituals of introduction of this community of practice are an interesting one, since it is complicated and subtle, yet very effective in its intended outcome. This is the ritual of 'establishing expertise'. So successful has this industry been in this practice, that it now even sells legitimacy and authority to other top management decisions and often, when speaking to top management, one may see that this why consultants are hired.

Even with the civil service, if you add a management consultancy’s brand to your changes, your decisions are seen as adding legitimacy and giving expertise to your decision. Within the private sector when new information is released to the stakeholders, it is considered more credible if the name of a management consulting firm is attached to it. For example, a statement such as, “We have decided to embark on this organisational change based on the input from McKinsey and Co’ or ‘Price Waterhouse Coopers and Lybrand have determined that six hundred thousand pounds are adequate for this change”.

Within the consulting industry, some of the large firms started out as accounting firms. Examples of these include KPMG, Deloitte, and Touche, Accenture to name a few. In the accounting industry, these firm names are used as brands to establish rigour and fairness.

When a company’s accounts are released at the end of the financial year, the auditing firm’s name is stated right up front as a mark for the stakeholders and customers of that company to establish that the work has been done effectively. This is the case with the rhetoric around top management decisions and consulting firms.

One of the top managers in the civil service even said that the key decision to embark on the change had already been made. The consultants were called in only to make it seem legitimate and fair in the eyes of the civil service and other government ministers and to work out the details. The effect of selling expertise to industry is achieved by the interplay of typically four primary rhetorical tools used by consultants in new situations. These are:

Rhetoric Around Individuals – This involves a repetitive stating of their position of...
authority by stating upon introduction of the individuals, the relevant background of the individuals and their experience, with reference to the ongoing work which these particular individuals have.

This is very important within consulting, since the rates for consultants are in the thousands, even at the most junior levels. Thus creating an air of legitimacy around them, is critical. Consultants upon joining firms, right from their initial training are taught this rhetoric and constantly reminded through their culture that they are the best, have been selected from the best universities, and belong to the top 1% of earners in the country.

*Reams of Paperwork and Complex Modelling* – Making decks (packs of Power Point slides) is what consultants do from the start of their career. In the early years, it is upon the quality of these decks that the consultants are appraised and evaluated on. Most conversations and meetings happen around knowledge-based decks that are the result of analysis and number crunching, but are presented using their laptops (each consultant receives one upon entering a firm) with clear flow charts and graphics to help present the details in a consistent way.

Each consulting firm has their own style of decks and consultants spend much of their early years, learning to make the appropriate style of deck. Some people in consulting would say this is the most important ‘language’ of the firm, and to belong to the fold, one must learn the language quickly and effectively.

*Establishing the Rhetoric of Expertise* – Using generic symbols of expertise – These include the dress code, the kind and type of suit one wears, the bags one carries, the address one lives at, and the kind of activities one does during one’s spare time. These norms although never explicit, are quite dramatically lived out across the firms. In conversation with consultants, it is almost possible to make out who is going to be successful in this industry and who is not, by noticing how quickly and painlessly one falls into line with these symbols of the industry and dons the mantle of industry expertise.
A visit to the website of any consulting firm is a good example of the rhetoric of expertise that they surround themselves with, employing the best, being the best, and working with the best.

Establishing the Knowledge of Industry Best Practices – This is mainly done through the recruitment process. Top business school are largely the recruitment ground for consulting firms and networks of students, bring their juniors into the consulting firms they are employed in. Some consulting firms even offer a cash reward to existing consultants if they are able to recruit one of their juniors into the firm, in this competitive market.

Business schools have even changed some of their courses, adapted existing ones, or at the very least, added on a few electives to help prepare candidates to join these consulting firms, by providing them with the kind of language, style, and knowledge that they will require to be successful there.

Valuation Tone of the Argument – Determining the Success of the Argument

We need to understand the ethos of the public and the private sector and establish the historical domain of argumentation in which they function, to realise that these are fundamentally quite different characters, with different goals, ambitions, rites, rituals, motivations and life choices. This is to appreciate what lies at the core, is the difference in the values of these two industries and therefore what they consider important and worth their time and energy.

In my time as a researcher in this environment, I did not see a lot of overlap of these values. What I did experience was a clear dismissal of the other as either ‘too full of themselves in their snazzy suits’ (the civil servants of the consultant) or ‘not very bright and fast and efficient in poorly cut clothes’ (the consultants of the civil servants).

Both sides being dismissed as a viable audience in this process, being forced to work together by the political agenda is a set up for failure. There was just not enough time spent
in understanding the pathos of the audience who needed to be convinced. In the end the rhetoric did come together, perhaps more because of the short deadlines and the survival instinct of both teams, rather than any real learning that would require more attention to be paid to the other.
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology and ALCESTE

Chapter Summary

This chapter presents the details of the case study. It gives information on the overall project, the detailed planning that was undertaken for the whole project, the aims, scope and management of the project. This also gives a flavour of the levels of complexity that were in the organisational setting before the researcher entered the site and of the complexity of the project that was being undertaken. This background serves to give the reader a flavour of the rhetoric and project management tools that are used in the private sector during change implementation.

The specific case of Change X is then described in detail with the research timeline during which this specific research was conducted. It also details the key phases of time within this longitudinal and cross sectional study, describing the reasons for the critical moment around which the data has been divided.

Also in this chapter, is the detailed layout of the research design and data gathered in described in the methodological framework. Pertinent features of qualitative research in the social sciences are presented. These include a single case-study, quality criterion and the use of triangulation both in data and method. The research design of this thesis is then described, along with the processes that were undertaken in this study. These processes deal with defining the data corpora, data archiving, and data analysis.

This chapter then describes the analysis strategy of this research and develops a new protocol of the presentation of ALCESTE results. It demonstrates the data has been used for the cross sectional and longitudinal analysis. The protocol includes five levels of presentation and description of the ALCESTE results, suggesting new uses for the output. Of particular importance is the use of the analysis of rhetoric, and the dendrograms and tables that are often overlooked in the qualitative use of ALCESTE. The presentations are therefore more transparent and have a systemic approach - two of the often-made criticisms of qualitative analysis.
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology and ALCESTE

The Case Study

This research is based on a longitudinal participant observation of a change project in a public-private sector partnership. This change project was the result of the government's welfare reform agenda. Presented here are the details of the case study required to get an understanding of the size and complexity of the change project. The names of both the public and private sector organisations have been changed. The Public Sector Agency (the bureaucratic institution) will be known as the Buro and the Private Sector Company (the community of practice) will be known as the Biz.

The Government's Welfare Reform Agenda

In the late 1990s as part of the new Labour government's reform agenda to reform the public services making them more effective to deliver services to the public, a number of organisational transformation projects were commissioned by the government. At the time, a number of surveys had shown that these agencies were less successful in achieving their aims, than initially proposed.

The government had been elected on a public service manifesto and reform was at the heart of their electoral commitment. A number of white papers were presented at Parliament, based on detailed findings that illustrated the need for change and laying out the intention, strategy and required impact of the proposed reforms. Most public service agencies, it claimed, had failed to live up to the expectations set out when the agencies were set up because of complexity in internal procedures, complexity in organizational hierarchy and complexity in the customer service processes.

The overall aims of the Government's Reform Agenda were to:

- Provide work for those who can and security for those who cannot;
- Promote opportunity and work instead of dependence on benefit
- Support investment, economic growth and productivity by making sure that effort is rewarded and that work pays
- Ensure barriers to work are removed from the system
Give greater help to those with the greatest need and ensure that benefits go only to them

The role of the Buro in achieving its overall manifesto promise was critical. It was an institution in crisis. The Buro had to undergo fundamental changes to enable the government to reach its target.

The History of the Buro

The Buro had a long and itinerant history with the government. It was set up to provide specific services to the public but the project, although noble in its goals and ideals, never quite established itself on the ground, at the levels of success, initially conceived. It was often used as a "pin cushion" for opposition parties, as an example of the failures of the party in power, and featured hotly in the political wrangling at Westminster.

There were three primary reasons identified why the failures occurred. The first reason was the highly complicated customer service and business processes. These processes could go through an average of about 35 Buro staff before any concrete answers were received by the customer.

Secondly the organizational structure and culture of the Buro was very functionalized. As an example, individuals dealing with accepting customers were different from the staff who could determine where the applicant was eligible for the service. This increased the time for processing applications, the frustration of the applicant, and the number of errors that could be made along the way.

The third reason for past failures was the lack of transparency of internal process for the customer. A customer coming to the Buro remained unclear as to what the outcome of the meeting would be since there were no explicit rules apparent to the public, based on which decisions were made. This often led to customers with the same circumstances often getting varied responses, and therefore much of the Buro’s time and energy was spent keeping up with the appeals made to the decisions it took.
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology, and ALCESTE

This level of complexity along with the fictionalisation of staff knowledge and skill about any case, led to a lack of transparency in terms of disputed cases. These cases could be caught up in the courts for years on end.

In an attempt to resolve these issues in two simultaneous actions, a change to the legislative change was put through parliament creating a list of criteria and publicly available booklets with information about the internal functioning of Buro. These booklets clarified the internal decision making conditions.

An organisational change programme was embarked upon, by the senior management of the Buro, with a change team made up of senior civil servants and management consultants from the private sector that specialized in large-scale private sector organizational change.

To gain a perspective on the complexity and difficulty in changing Buro's organisational structure and functioning, presented below is one of the maps created during the change programme, depicting the one of the main business process of the Buro. See Table 6-1 for details.

Details from the business process chart have been removed to maintain the anonymity of the participating organisation.
Figure 7-1 Example of the Type of Business Processes, Functions and Associated Agencies Within Buro

The Buro Reform Programme

This Buro Reform programme was the largest change programme of its kind anywhere in the world, as it involved approximately 1000 staff working full-time on various aspects of the change. The change would fundamentally impact the way that 10,000 employees of the Buro worked. It would also impact the jobs of another 60,000 civil servants who worked in other agencies.

Buro reform was conceived as the vehicle to implement not only the new Scheme but also the fundamental business and IT changes needed to transform the way in which the Service is delivered to the agency’s clients. Buro reform was run as a partnership between the Agency, the Government, and a Consortium of consultancies to deliver a coordinated package of improvements throughout the business.
To get a flavour of the size and scale of this change given below are the overall structure and functions of Buro reform under the following three titles

- Objectives of Buro Reform
- Scope of the Buro Reform
- Management of Buro Reform

Objectives of Buro Reform

It was decided soon after the commissioning of the reform that the success should be measured against a set of objectives. A vision document issued very early in the project, detailed the change aims as objectives that were critical to the success of the project.

These measurable objectives provide the link between the business change that Buro reform set out to deliver and the five Reform change aims. They provided the focus of what was to be achieved to ensure the success of the project, throughout the length of the change process. See Table 7-1 for a description of the changes proposed by the Buro and their objectives.
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology, and ALCESTE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Change Aims</th>
<th>Measurable Objectives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Is accessible, comprehensible and responsive to the customers concerned</td>
<td>A more integrated service across government departments and agencies Improved customer satisfaction and reduced justified complaints A service that is easier to understand and more transparent to customers A more responsive service with faster resolution of queries A service that is easier to access through a mix of channels aligned to customer needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Ensures that the appropriate money comes into the agency</td>
<td>2.1 A reduction in the debt 2.2 Improved rate of compliance (natural and enforced)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Ensures that the transaction occurs in a matter of weeks not months</td>
<td>3.1 A faster and more reliable service which delivers prompt and regular payments to the appropriate customers 3.2 A reduction of work to target levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Increases the proportion of customers which receive service</td>
<td>4.1 Increased proportions of appropriate clients who receive service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Improves the value for customers in terms of the ratio of administrative costs to income and expenditure</td>
<td>5.1 More accurate service and decisions 5.2 A more modern and automated service 5.3 A more efficient service (higher productivity and a reduction in unit costs) 5.4 Increased staff satisfaction leading to a reduction in absenteeism and staff turnover 5.5 All management and staff trained and equipped to deliver the new service 5.6 A more consistent and standardized service 5.7 A service which is adaptable to the changing requirements of minister and customers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7-1 The Change Aims With Their Measurable Objectives

Scope of the Buro Reform

The scope of the Buro reform could be defined by answering the following two questions:

- What areas of the Buro organisational structure will it touch?
- What would it change?

What areas of the organization will Buro reform touch?

The Buro reform scope is focused on ‘core customer facing processes; that is, what is often referred to as operations. In this government agency this involved, approximately 10,000 staff across Great Britain of whom 8,156 are employed in multiple Business Units (BUs) across the UK. The remaining staff was employed on central support activities in the organizational headquarters.
The BUs dealt with centralized work, special appeals, and parliamentary correspondence. Satellite centres that used primarily the client-facing end of the business of Buro supported the business units. There were seventeen processing centres. Case processing within the Business Units was done by staff on a functional basis and it was a linear process. There were two additional telecom-based support structures for the business. Additionally, there were a range of other government agencies, such as Inland Revenue and some local authorities who interfaced with the day-to-day business of this organization.

*What would it change?*

Buro reform was conceived as the vehicle to implement not only the new government scheme but also the fundamental business and IT changes, needed to transform the way in which the agency service was delivered. The change model that was developed, was based on private sector ‘Service Delivery Models’ and was designed to affect a number of organizational dimensions: Customers, Process, People, IS/IT, Channel and Organisation.

The figure below outlines the main business processes and functional system components in the new design, that interfaced with other areas. The integrated change represented a fundamental transformation in the way in which the service was delivered.
The main changes are listed in Table 7-2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organizational Dimension</th>
<th>Main Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Customers</td>
<td>Customers sign posting to relevant agencies and information sources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Greater use of face-to-face contacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People</td>
<td>Consistency in staff allocation until a regular payment pattern is established</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Workload assignment based upon case risk, staff skills and staff availability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Process</td>
<td>Introduction of additional services to encourage customers co-operation in the process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reduction in handoffs for simple activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Risk scoring mechanisms to determine appropriate action at various points in the process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Improved ability to accept services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Greater access to information sources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reduction in information required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Increased powers to determine authenticity of customer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Greater sanctions for non-cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ability to contact customers over the telephone following a service meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IS/IT</td>
<td>Automated account set up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Improvement of the customer contact management functions within the new IT systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Use of IVR technologies to route customer enquiries to the appropriate staff member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Electronic data gathering with direct input to new IT system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Integrated debt management functionality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>On-line scheduling for face-to-face interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Electronic referrals</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7-2 The Main Organisational Change Areas

Management of Buro Reform

The programme represented a fundamental transformation of the way in which the service was delivered. It was not just about the implementation of new rules and new systems but also required changes in the process, organization and behaviours within the agency. The challenges facing the programme included:

- Engaging the people in the Business Units
- Producing an integrated solution covering all the dimensions of change
- Making the best use of all available resources
- Maintaining a focus on the objectives of the programme; at the same time, ensuring that we pay attention to the details, while developing the solution and plans for implementation
- Ensuring that there is good teamwork throughout the programme. Both the Buro and its partners must feel a real sense of common purpose and partnership with all stakeholders within the programme, namely the three partners in the change. That is, the Buro change team, the consortium of consulting firms and the IT provider.
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology, and ALCESTE

The Agency Reform Program Structure

Figure 7-2 Central Programme Structure of Buro Reform

Figure 7-2 illustrates the central programme structure. The seven main teams involved in the overall management of the project included:

**The Reform Programme Board** - This board had the delegated authority from the department of Social Security to oversee the business, financial, policy and technical considerations related to the delivery of the reforms. The board was responsible for providing the programme director with support and guidance to ensure that the programme achieves its measurable objectives.

The board was collectively responsible to ensure that the Programme was delivered to time, quality and within budget. Initially the board was responsible for steering the Initiation stage to fully establish the programme. This ended with the formal award of a contract to the consortium of consultants, consisting of two consulting firms and the IT service provider.
The Programme Management Team - The Programme management team was responsible for the day-to-day coordination and management of individual strands to ensure safe delivery of the programme. Collectively their responsibilities included:

- Operating and changing the process as defined by the Programme Board
- Setting control milestones for individual projects in line with the change process
- Monitoring strand performance on a weekly basis
- Identifying links and interdependencies across strands
- Ensuring the coordination of plans from the individual strands and resolve overlaps, interfaces and gaps
- Ensuring coordination of plans from the individual strands and resolve overlaps, interfaces and gaps
- Considering Quality Assurance reports and initiate any action required
- Actively managing Risk and Issues Registers
- Approving highlight reports to senior committees

The Performance Assurance and Transformation Group (PATG) - This was the formal link between the Reform programme and the senior management of the agency, specifically the board members and area directors

The Solutions Management Team and the Transformation Management Team - These teams were established to manage the their respective work streams

The Programme Management Office (PMO) - The primary function of the PMO was to provide the Programme Manager and Programme Management Team and the Programme Board with the necessary information to help them fulfil programme responsibilities.

The Central Design Team - The central design team supported the Programme Management Team and the Programme Board to ensure that:
- All programme products were aligned with design principles and linked together to deliver outcomes that moved toward the operational vision (i.e., final organization design)

- The programme had the right products for each stage

- The necessary linkages were in place between products and between each stage of the programme, thereby ensuring the end-to-end integrity and ‘do-ability’ of the product set and the programme as a whole.

The Overall Plan of Buro Reform

The programme plan was divided into eight stages to enable a reduction in complexity. This division also allowed the Programme Board and Management Team to review the programme at pre-agreed points along the way. The stages are shown in Figure 7-3.
The Role of the Researcher in the Change - Understanding the Field Conditions

The change programme researched for 11 months involved a management consulting firm facilitating the implementing of change in a public sector organisation. The change was instigated because of the political agenda of a new government's welfare reform scheme in the United Kingdom.

This activity was instigated not because the organisation felt the need to change, nor because there was any new competitor in the market. Neither was it because the customers of the organisation complained, since in the market that this organisation was in, they were the sole service-provider.

As with most planned change projects, the change process goes through the overall stages of analysis, planning, implementation, review, and amendments. This research starts at after the planning phase was over. Thus the initial analysis of the organisation had been completed. This included an in-depth study of the organisation at the time - the organisation structure, the formal hierarchies, the service provided by the organisation, the processed and logistics of this organisation. This in consultant speak is called ‘due diligence’ and is often conducted before the consulting firm gets the contract for the business.

When this research began, the high-level planning and design stage of the change process had also already been conducted. The ‘final state’ of the organisation had been designed in accordance with the targets set by the Secretary of State in terms of the business outputs.

In the case of this change programme, the organisation would be undergoing behavioural and process change along with a complete overhaul of its infrastructure and IT systems. This often involved changing simple yet fundamental things about the way each employee worked. For example, all customer-facing employees were to be given headsets with microphones instead of hand-held telephones. Both the documented final state of the organisation and the overall plans for the change process had been agreed upon and signed off by the senior members of the organisation, all the way up to the minister in charge.
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology, and ALCESTE

The change was planned to be implemented in four stages. Consultants were brought into work with the organisation teams, working on each of the four stages. I was the consultant working with the team to implement the first stage of the change. This gave me an opportunity to be involved in nearly all levels of the organisation, from the customer-facing end of the business, right up to the programme board that reported to the minister. Additionally, it gave me the opportunity to participate and observe the working together and interactions of four consultants – client teams.

I worked closely with a client who was the team leader (Grade 7 in the civil service). He looked after a team of five people, made up of a Senior Executive Officer (SEO), two Higher Executive Officers (HEO) and two Executive Officers (EO).

We worked alongside the other three teams, planning the implementation of the next three phases of change. I was accountable to the client team leader and to a consultant team leader who worked closely with the Grade 6 person in charge of the 'Implementation Team'.

Our team was responsible for the detailed planning of that phase of the change, the distribution of the plan to the six Business Unit change teams, working with them to develop plans on a local level and helping them centrally in the implementation of the change in the business unit.

The Specific Case of Change X

This research was conducted over an 11-month period in a public sector organisational transformation change project. This change affected the day jobs of over 10,000 employees and had a change team of approximately 800 people. The change team consisted of public sector civil servants and of consultants from a consortium of consultants (from three of the top five consulting firms) and the IT provider.
Consultants and civil servants worked together at the level of planning and implementing the overall change through four smaller scale changes. The data for this thesis is around these processes during the first phase of the change. Figure 7-4 shows these phases.

The objective of change phases X and Y was to implement the organisational transformation. In other words, to change the daily processes, structures and business process of the organisation. This was to fundamentally affect the people and the way they did their day jobs. Changes A and B were to focus more around the IT system and ensure that the data in the old IT system was compatible and transferred in an appropriate form to the new IT system.

Research Timeline
The change project (X) had been underway for over one year when this research began. The overall design and implementation plans had been developed for the change and a picture of how the final organisation would look, or the desired shape of the final organisation, after the change project, had also been agreed to.

The implementation of the change had been divided into four phases to allow for clarity and simplicity around each phase implementation, both in terms of planning and resource allocation. Four teams of consultants and public servants were to be created; each team to separately focus on each phase of change implementation. Initially, only the first two teams were set up to focus on the first two phases of the change implementation planning. Each team was made up of one consultant and five civil servants. The overall responsibility was with a public servant (at the level of Grade 6) who was aided by a senior consultant.
The Four Stages of Change X

The process of change is a continuous one, albeit not linear but rather more complex in its enactment. For the purposes of this research project, four theoretically distinct periods have been identified around critical decisions that occurred chronologically. (See Figure 7-5)

These were:
- The pre-project preparation phase
- The planning phase for Change X
- Restructuring of Change X because of contingent factors
- Planning for Change x

![Figure 7-5 The Four Phases of Change X](image)

*The pre-project preparation phase* of the project spanned a period of approximately two months. This was the period of time between the time that the researcher had been selected to be on this project and the time of the project actually beginning. Such a time-period is common in consulting projects. Future planning of the consultants' time is an essential ingredient for both the firm and the consultants to avoid resource wastage.

During this period of time, consultants are prepared for the field that they are about to visit. As the consulting firm had been involved in the previous phases of this project for over two years, the consultants were required to do a detailed study of the work conducted so far.

The consulting firm were the primary consultants during the change design
conceptualisation and change design phase. These phases were completed and documented according to the policy of the consulting firm, internal intellectual capital documents listing the lessons learnt during the previous phases of the change project. In addition, all documentation created within the change project by the public sector was also to be studied before joining the team. This included the government white papers, laying out the overall objectives of the change programme. Understanding of programme change team structures and key individuals involved, were also part of the preparation phase.

The planning phase for Change X has been demarcated as the period beginning on the day that the change team for Change X arrived on site for the planning phase. Members of this team were drawn from various divisions of the civil service with different types of expertise about the way the agency ran and knowledge on what this particular change involved.

One member of the team had actually worked on another phase of this change project before joining this team. The team consisted of one consultant and five public sector employees. Three of these employees were from the same agency. One was a new recruit into the civil service and one had already been on another area of the change project for four months before joining this team.

During this phase of the project, the team focussed on the development of the plans from the organisational design model of the conceptualisation of Change X to the detailed implementation plans in the business units. This was a period of nearly three months.

The restructuring of change X --> x occurred after the first level of detailed implementation plans were completed. A key factor in the organisational changes was the development of a new IT system to be implemented across the organisation. Change X, although largely behavioural and structural within the agency, required the implementation and thereby availability of the first stages of this IT system to be available.

There was a delay in the development of the IT and therefore, the level of IT first assumed
to be essential for this change implementation to occur, was not going to be available by the
deadline on which the plans were based. Therefore it was decided at the highest levels of
the change team, the Programme Management Team, that Change X would need to be
fundamentally changed from the level of the conceptualisation of Change X and therefore,
the objectives of what Change X could achieve.

This process of redefining the parameters of Change X, considering various
implementation options and the final decision-making on the preferred plans is looked at
during this phase of the project. Change X would need to be on a significantly smaller scale
with limited objectives, thereby called Change x for the purpose of this research.

The planning and implementation of Change x is the final phase of this research project.
This phase began after the final decision was taken in the Programme Management Team,
as to the preferred option for the implementation of Change x. This phase was completed
when Change x was finally implemented in a much reduced version of what was initially
conceptualised. It was decided that a version of Change X should be implemented, rather
than postpone the entire commencement of change. This was the form and structure of this
change. This decision was taken largely because of political reasons, rather than on the
value or benefits of the change project.

Research Design: The Act of Conducting Social Research on Organisational
Problematiques.

The world of organisations and bureaucracies are often worlds that are closed to the
outsider and thereby to the social researcher. To understand at any depth the questions
posed by this thesis, it was imperative to gain access to the inside of the world of private
sector firms and public sector firms, before one could even begin to pose the appropriate
methodological questions.

The most appropriate methodology therefore became the single case study, as what was
being sought after was more an in-depth perspective rather than an industry wide,
generalisable model. Although appearing quite the alternative, it was soon apparent upon
entering into the organisational context, that the two communities of practice being observed here were different at the most fundamental levels that are normally looked at when studying different cultures and nations, not different organisations.

The primary issue with this particular research agenda is that it crossed the boundaries between two fundamentally different worlds. The world of the private service firm and the world of the public sector bureaucracy, both of which contain their own particular barriers to entry, rites and rituals of acceptance and membership, and signs and symbols of authority, leadership, and legitimacy.

The second strategic decision concerning the appropriateness of the methodological approach to address this enquiry was made regarding the use of a multi-method approach, increasingly used among social scientists through the process of triangulation.

Triangulation is now a well-worn methodological strategy that is often used by social scientist investigating the development of social phenomenon in a complex and multifaceted world.

Using triangulation of methodology/data and analysis, the attempt is made to gain multiple insights from fundamentally differing perspectives into the same social phenomenon and thus to gain a more wholesome understanding of the social phenomenon being looked at.

In this case study, there was a triangulation of methodologies of data collection and a triangulation of analysis tools on one of data sets, was collected.

This research project was conducted as an entirely qualitative methodological glimpse into the interactions between the public and the private sector firms working together. The methodologies used were participant observation, ethnographic data, the collection of documents over an 11-month period, pertaining to the change in question and narrative interviews were collected from the change participants on both sides.

The nature of social representations is by definition, a particular kind of knowledge that is
of the common sense or of the everyday. Social representations create and at the same time, help us to understand the world in which we live and help us to navigate our way through the various sensory inputs that reach us every second. See Figure 7-6

Investigating social representations thus gives us insights into how this is understood and how new information, in this case about change, is inculcated into the language and thoughts of the communities that it comes into contact with.

Data Corpora
The data collection process was ethnographic in nature. There has been an increased use of these methods to investigate the everyday cultures, rites and rituals of life, as opposed studying ethnographically the ‘native tribe’. ‘Research in the fields of development and change is linked to the linguistic and interpretive turns that social sciences made earlier in its history. Such research tried to take on the participants’ perspectives, the researcher joining them in their everyday or institutional lives for a while, in order to analyze and describe how this everyday life evolves and how changes are produced and managed in it.’ (Flick, 1999)

Data collected on a research project may be considered reactive or non-reactive based on
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology, and ALCESTE

the source (Farr, 1993). Reactive data refers to any data that may have changed in content owing to the very act of its collection. Often this is data collected directly from persons.

A good example of this would be interview data. This data may be influenced directly because of the interview having taken place. The impact of the interviewer, the tone of the questions posed, the act of giving an interview etc. may all have a direct impact on the interviewee’s answers, views or recollections of the data that he is giving. Thus this data, had it been collected under different circumstances may have been different. This is referred to as reactive data.

Non-reactive data is not impacted by the processes of its collection. A good example of this type of data would be archival or documented data. This data will remain the same regardless of who collects it, during which period, and how it is collected. For after the document has been created; it is static and remains a snapshot of the views/events/plans of that moment.

The data collected included document data, interviews, and observation notes. The primary data to be used for analysis at this stage, is the documentary data for the reasons already stated. This data has been divided into two groups, the private sector document and the hybrid documents. These have then been each divided into a further two sections, based on the date of production of the document.

The critical event in the time line was in the end of June when a ministerial decision was taken that completely changed the very nature and object of the change being planned. Thus from July onward, the planned change was completely different from the change that was being planned pre-July. Therefore, the documents have been divided as into pre and post the ministerial decision.

Data Archiving

The primary data for this research is documentary data. The project documents have been
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology, and ALCESTE

divided into these four categories based on the date of production of the documents and the authorship of the documents. There are two main reasons why documentary evidence has been chosen as the primary source of data. Observations, diary notes and interviews will be used at a later stage to add flavour and a narrative to this core analysis.

The first reason why documentary data is the preferred data is because of the role of the researcher in the change team. The researcher was a full-time consultant in the field. This was the only way to get this degree of access into the field and participate in a real-life change project. Therefore, the data collected in the interviews would be what is often called “reactive data”.

The role of the interviewer in influencing the subjects of the interview has been written about in detail (Farr, 1993; Gaskell,). This would be a good example of eliciting a version of the story; that is, the version that the public sector employees wished the consultants to hear.

The second reason for this choice of data is based on the nature of a consulting project of this nature and the heavy amount of daily documentation that is involved. While the interview data has an inbuilt bias, this setting lends itself actively to documentary analysis. This is because it is an environment and a change situation in which everything is documented on a daily basis. People are working from over ten different sites across the United Kingdom – the 6 business units, the head office where the change team sits and the consulting firms involved in the project. Often one or more people may be missing from a meeting because of other commitments and therefore all the information gathered and discussed, is documented for circulation so that people may generate a common starting point for the next day.

Additionally, this is the nature of the training in private consulting firms. As is a well-understood and documented fact, because of the high turnover of staff both within the projects and within firms, a large amount of information that is held and knowledge that is generated, is in the heads or on the laptops of the consulting staff.
As most consulting firms were soon to realise, their value was in their people and so in an attempt to capture that knowledge, the processes and procedures of documentation and creating knowledge libraries were institutionalised into these organisations. Anyone leaving a project or finishing a phase of a project would need to provide a full, written documentation of both the contents of their work, plus any lessons learnt, tangible or intangible.

Often at the level of the associate in the firm (this is the level at which an MBA graduate would be employed into a consulting firm), a member of any consulting project team would be assigned to ensure that this process in fact did occur. This would be part of the consultant’s requirements during the next performance evaluation for their promotions and bonuses. Thus, documentation and intellectual capital capture is taken very seriously in these firms, from the point of training new consultants.

Therefore this environment presents within itself, a source of data which captures the processes and discussions, while removing the bias of the researcher. These documents are often created by a number of individuals who are responsible for the input to different sections. These multiple authors also allow for the minimisation of any individual bias and make it a rich source of looking at social representations. The details of the document, which have been produced and divided into chronological order, are seen on the next page.

Data Analysis

The analysis will be conducted in five stages and on the large library of documentation collected over an 11-month period. The first phase of analysis involves the use of the computer program ALCESTE. Using the main cluster emerging from ALCESTE, ATLAS.ti will be used to construct the representational field of the two groups involved in the change, while a pictorial analysis, (and later argumentation analysis) will look at the objectifications of change as seen in the Power Point documentation (which forms over 60% of the documents involved in this project).
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology, and ALCESTE

The final stage of analysis will involve an argumentation analysis on the documents to try and understand the evolution of the representations of change and any insight that may provide us into the working of a private-public change project. See Table 7-3 for details on the data analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Analysis</th>
<th>Analysis Tool</th>
<th>Expected Output</th>
<th>Data Corpus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Association structure analysis</td>
<td>ALCESTE</td>
<td>Insight into the key anchors of change</td>
<td>All documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretive coding</td>
<td>Atlas.ti</td>
<td>An understanding of the representational fields in the two groups</td>
<td>Selected documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argumentation</td>
<td>Rhetoric</td>
<td>Understanding of the mechanism behind the evolution of 'change'</td>
<td>Selected documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant observation</td>
<td>Ethnographic</td>
<td>Rich textual descriptions of the change experiences</td>
<td>Dairy notes and Interviews</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7-3 Diagnostic Table for Data Analysis

ALCESTE

Reinert (1998) in the handbook for using ALCESTE has stated that the object of an ALCESTE analysis is to obtain a classification of words used about an object, thus identifying different ways of talking about that object. In the case of this research project, it would be a tool to investigate the conversations that are found within the documentation around the change project that was being implemented. This would be a starting point for investing the social representations of change. ALCESTE has been used for 'natural language analysis, using the “free association” technique' (Lahlou, S, 1996) in areas as variant the political analysis of speeches (Schonhardt-Bailey, c., 2005), smells (Morrot, G. et al, 2001) and historical analysis (Klein, O & Licata, L, 2003) and concepts of eating (Lahlou, S. 1996).

In this research project, I felt that this was an essential starting point. I was deeply involved in the field participant observation for this research. Therefore, in an attempt to limit the imposing of my own, views, my own stories, or my own imaginations on the representational fields, the use of ALCESTE would help me to take some steps away from the data and see what naturally emerges from the documentation.

Allum (1998) used ALCESTE for social representations research and concluded that it provided a replicable base from which to start an interpretation. ALCESTE is based on two
primary assumptions:

Firstly, words that frequently occur are significant, and secondly, co-occurrences of words are significant. Based on these criteria, the computer program, clusters the most frequently occurring words into large mutually exclusive classes. It can then be interpreted that these clusters of words that occur together refer to different views, conversations, and representations around the main theme of the document.

This program is mainly used in large-scale text analysis as its strengths lie in being able to deal with large volumes of text (minimum text of 10,000 characters) and allowing the researcher a glimpse into the main clusters of language that occur together. Thus the requirements of any data to be analyzed using ALCESTE, is that it is formatted appropriately in a text file, so that it fulfils the minimum word requirement. In addition, to get any meaningful results, the contents should be about the same topic.

This is particularly relevant if a number of documents are being fed into the analyses. That is, a number of documents joined to create the single document that is to put into the ALCESTE analysis.

Although the actual analysis is done entirely by the computer program, the researcher’s role is significant both before and after the analysis. The text needs to be prepared in a detailed and specific fashion as a single *.txt document to enable the software to conduct the analysis. This can be done if the text is a transcription of interviews, focus group discussion or in a material that may be scanned into a Word document.

In the case of this data however, this was an extremely arduous process, as most of the private sector consulting documentation was in the form of Power Point documents, with the text hidden deep within flowcharts or diagrams. Also, the private sector, civil service documents that were distributed as *.pdf files were inaccessible and therefore often had to be hand-typed into Word.

There are for ALCESTE only two further requirements that must be fulfilled to enable to
program to produce effective results. The first is that the text be over 10,000 characters (which is fulfilled by all three corpora presented at this stage), and the second is that the topic or main theses of the text must be homogeneous. Homogeneity in this case, refers to consistency in primary themes and topics.

The exploration of the data collected for this thesis began with the use of a software package, ALCESTE. The functions and purposes of ALCESTE have been described earlier in this section. This was the first stage of the exploration of the two corpora, in an attempt to find out whether there was a real separation of language and thereby underlying beliefs, and culture, as shown through the data or not. There were three primary reasons why it seemed that using ALCESTE at this stage of the analysis, would be prudent.

Firstly, it allowed me, the researcher to take a step away from the data and see whether there was any natural clustering within the data collected, thereby increasing the reliability of any claims made by the clustering. This was considered important, since I was a participant observer in the change process and wanted to gain some distance from the data to allow the emergence of natural clusters from within the text.

The second strength of using an ALCESTE analysis at this first phase of analysis, was to help deal with the vast amounts of data collected over an 11-month project. This was thought to be a good starting point for me to get some flavour about the scope of the data and the primary clusters of meaning around the ‘change’ that existed in the two worlds.

The third strength of using ALCESTE at this stage of the analysis, was to help create the highest level of the coding frame that I would then use for the Atlas analysis. As the data was so vast, it was very helpful to me to go into the Atlas analysis with a thematic coding frame, allowing for top-down analysis, rather than have to sift through the data from bottom up.
This chapter therefore deals with level one of Table 7-4 (the shaded area). All the documentation used in this thesis was run through the ALCESTE programme in varying groups and will be discussed systematically as we go through the data.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Analysis</th>
<th>Analysis Tool</th>
<th>Expected Output</th>
<th>Data Corpus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Association structure analysis</td>
<td>ALCESTE</td>
<td>Insight into the key anchors of change</td>
<td>All documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretive coding</td>
<td>Atlas.ti</td>
<td>An understanding of the representational fields in the two groups</td>
<td>Selected documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semiotic interpretation</td>
<td>Pictorial</td>
<td>Interpretations of the pictorial objectifications of change. Understanding signs and symbols.</td>
<td>Power point documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argumentation</td>
<td>Rhetoric</td>
<td>Develop typified argumentation modes</td>
<td>Selected documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant observation</td>
<td>Rich description</td>
<td>Rich text on the experiences within the field</td>
<td>Diary notes Interviews</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7-4 Diagnostic Table of Analysis and Expected Results

As this research project was characterised by its large quantities of data, it was critical that the data was stored in a library that allowed the data to be viewed in a meaningful fashion in terms of the research questions that were going to be explored. An analysis of two types were planned, the data was stored so that it was divided explicitly, both by source and by date to enable the planned cross-sectional and longitudinal analysis.

The data library was attempted to resemble, as closely as possible, the project timeline of the project, and the research design. That is, the final slice of the data being made in the documentation around the critical event at the end of June, when the project was significantly restructured.

The documentation created around the change project was constructed into a library, divided according to author source and date of production. This was to allow for the convenience of cross-sectional and longitudinal analysis. Documents were sliced into three sections in the following sequence.

1. The documents from the private sector organisation, the Biz, which were involved in the training rites and rituals of the management consulting firm, the specific training for this
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology, and ALCESTE

project, and some of the internal firms knowledge sharing documentation, were collated into this section.

2. The documents that were created during the course of the entire project by the Biz were stored under ‘Private sector change representations’.

3. The documents that were created during the course of the project by the employees of the Civil Service Agency, the Buro, in conjunction with the consultants from the Biz, were stored together under the section ‘Hybrid change representations’.

There was no documentation which was purely from the Civil service, since the project was being run on the ‘expertise’ of the Biz and therefore all documentation, and templates for communication, were provided for by the Biz. To be noted here, is that this creation of the framework for communication would also have a big impact on the development of the representations over time.

The final slice in the data library was created around the end of June. This was a significant moment in the project, since a decision was taken externally about the project and the scale of the project was significantly scaled down. This fundamentally impacted the very nature of the change, the framework within which it was to be conducted, the actual employees it would impact, and the importance of this change to the organisation as a whole.

Data was run through the ALCESTE programme in various slices. During the 11-month period of change, there was a significant event around June when the overall change plans were fundamentally moved because of circumstances external to the change. The ethos of the required change remained the same but the scale of the required implementation was reduced significantly.

Refining the Analysis:

Cleaning data in ALCESTE has a specific meaning. It is done through working with the synonyms and the lemmatisation tables. If we understand the that function of ALCESTE, is to create clusters out of the repeatedly co-occurring words over a large volume of text, then we can see that this might pose a few problems to a programme that is entirely
meaning-insensitive and working from the lemmatised roots of a prescribed dictionary. Therefore the first analysis created by ALCESTE, needs to be looked at closer and specific attention paid to the lemmatisation tables and a little work done on synonyms within the text.

ALCESTE creates the clusters within its analysis using the lemmatisation tables provided. This is a process whereby ALCESTE reduces all words to their root functions. For example, Farm, farmer, farmed, farming may all be recognised by ALCESTE as their root form, “farm”. In some cases, this is entirely useful and it makes sense in the context of the research question, to have the root first, given the ‘weighting’ of its four forms. This could be in a research context that is not focussed around the area of farming.

However, there are cases where this would not make sense in the context of the research. For example, if the research was on the issue on Genetically Modified foods, then it would be quite critical for the researcher to distinguish between the farmer and the farming and the farmed, so that the root “farm” does not get an unnecessarily high ‘weight’.

In the context of this research question, it would be critical that ALCESTE recognised the difference between the words so that the researcher could distinguish between the correspondence of; for example, “farmer and dangerous”, and “farming and dangerous”. These might signal different problems and then indeed, different solutions.

*Lemmatisation:* Therefore when working with ALCESTE it is imperative to look at the lemmatisation tables that provide a list of all the words which have been reduced to their root function. Studying this may reveal to the researcher that certain words do indeed need to be separated from the lemmatised cluster. This can be achieved by going into the raw data and physically changing the format of the words to make them look visually distinct from the root form.

In the case of our example, we could do find and replace all the “farmers” with “farmer-person”. This would cause ALCESTE to see it as a different word from “farmers”, etc.
Another way to recognise lemmatised words is that they are in the analysis reports immediately followed by the (+) sign both in the word lists and the graphical representations.

In the context of this research project, numerous words had to be adjusted and removed from the lemmatisation lists. The most predominant example being that, each of the critical events within the project timeline, was called by a letter followed by the word “day”. That is, there was x day and y day and z day. In the case of running this within ALCESTE, these were all weighted together as ‘day’, giving the word “day” a disproportionately high occurrence as there were four such days in the project timeline.

**Synonyms:** Similar to the above process, there may be certain contexts in which you want words that look apparently different to mean the same. That is, synonyms to be counted as the same word. Continuing with the above example, it may be prudent to have “farmer” and “farm hand” together as people involved in the running of the farm. In this context, you would once again need to go into the original raw text and perhaps change “farm hand” into “farmer-person”, if you have done the lemmatisation changes mentioned above. The idea is that if you make it look identical to ALCESTE, the programme will read it as one.

In the case of this research project, I changed a number of the interim designations. For example, “executive”, “officer”, and “manager” into “strategy-management” and “implementation-management”. These words all seem to be referring to the roles and responsibilities of the individuals and therefore, in the context of this research where the specifics were not that critical. The weight of roles and responsibilities were more important, I divided them into the above two categories.

**Final cleaning:** One last important cleaning of the data which I should mention here that is specific to the data collected here, was that there was plenty of Information Technology people involved in the implementation of the Project. Therefore, the word IT appeared repeatedly in the documentation. ALCESTE does not recognise capital letters and merely changes them to small letters.
For example, at the beginning of a sentence, when IT was converted to ‘it’, it no longer appeared as a significant word in the clustering. This would have been a critical mistake had the data cleaning process not picked this up, as IT is so heavily present in this context that there appears to be, in nearly all of the analysis, a specific cluster related to IT issues. In this research project, I replaced IT with ‘itt’ making it a distinct formation.

In addition when the data is transformed from a rich format to a strong of textual data as is required from ALCESTE this has a fundamental reductionist impact on the data which remains. Much emphasis, intonation, highlighting of material etc. is lost in this process. This has been discussed in more depth where using texts as empirical material.

Developing the Protocol for Reporting of ALCESTE Results

This section of this chapter creates a structure protocol for the reporting of ALCESTE data that allows of maximum interpretation from looking at four moments of the analysis report.

Cross-sectional vs. Longitudinal Analysis

The project data was divided into four sections, as can be seen. What should be noted is that although the presentation is of seven analysis, there are the finalised robust analysis. Behind this presentation, there were numerous iterations of each analysis, while the date was cleaned and the clusters made robust.

The analysis concentrated around all of the data, as one single group to observe whether there was any natural clustering. The files were then tagged with the date and the author and the analysis run to check whether there was any systematic relationship between the clustering or between the clustering and the date of the document being produced.
The reasons for this is that the data is both cross-sectional and longitudinal, and I was trying to determine whether there was a greater convergence or differentiation on the language of discourse between the groups or the development of the language over time of the two groups. Presented in Table 7-5 are three of the most revealing and robust analysis that were developed in ALCESTE. The first is a comparative look at the cross-sectional data of the first half of the project. At this stage the private and hybrid representations of change remained fairly pure, allowing for clearer clustering, noticing the clear distinction between the two communities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data contained in the analysis</th>
<th>Analysis 1</th>
<th>Analysis 2</th>
<th>Analysis 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Private and Hybrid documents developed during change X - together and separate</td>
<td>Private and Hybrid documents developed during change x - together and separate</td>
<td>All documentation in the project, containing all the data collected - Each document tagged with date of document production</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Cross Sectional Analysis**

**Longitudinal Analysis**

Table 7-5 Cross Sectional and Longitude Analysis Strategy

The second analysis that will be looked at in more depth, is the cross-sectional data in the second half of the project. By this time, the group had been working together for around four months and again it is primarily, the content of the clusters that will be compared. The second analysis presented would begin our exploration of the longitudinal perspective. In this case, it would be interesting to compare, not only the differences between the two communities but also the cluster formations with the clusters during the first half of the project. This is to note where there has been a consolidation of the language or a differentiation around the representations of change over time.

Finally, in the third analysis we will consider an analysis of the overall data with all the
The Rhetoric of Clusters

Style of presentation for the private sector firm: All the documentation produced during this period was in the form of Power Point slides. These slides were developed according to very specific criterion and the new consultants are trained on creating these slides very early in their career. These slides are used primarily for communication within and across the teams, with a ‘pack of slides’ often created by more than a single consultant.

The most important feature of these slide packs is that they have a standard format right down to the last detail, including font size. There is a standardized layout of the slide packs, and they have a very explicit logic that is apparent for all to see. These very tight structural norms allow the readers and contributors to share information and participate in the discussion freely.

The logic of the slide pack is normally given in the first or the second slide of the pack and also shown in a diagrammatic form. For example:

![Diagram](image)

This diagrammatic representation of the logic of the slides or the process that the slides are going to follow, are then kept at the corner of all the slides in the pack. The area that is currently being dealt with, is highlighted on the slide. This helps the audience to follow the flow of the argument and be able to refer back or go forwards to consider some information in Stage 3 while reading Stage 1.
Clear and explicit logic and short action statements are the key characteristics of a consulting slide pack. A great deal of thought and effort is put into getting the slide titles right (as they are the main display of the argumentation of the slide) and ensuring that there is no superfluous language or unnecessary explanations.

These communication slide pack are fundamentally different from slide packs that are used for presentations in that they often contain detailed information, such as level of job descriptions. Often a slide contains a diagrammatic representation on one side that is detailed on the other. The slide packs on this project normally had one title, one sentence statement detailing what was in the slide, one diagram, and numerous bullet points, exploring the issue at hand.

At the beginning of each pack, there was a clear title page with the name of the people responsible for this pack, and the name of the firm. There was one slide (that served as a table of contents) that displayed page numbers and others followed the diagrammatic logic. Right at the end of the pack, there was always a summary slide, and a ‘next steps’ or ‘action points; slide. This was the nature of the slides produced in this organizational transformation project.

*Style of Presentation of the Public Sector Firm:* Written communication within the public sector agency always happened in the form of Word documents. These were structured in detail and there was a clear numbering format to these documents that were also produced with numerous inputs.

There was normally a list of peoples’ names on the front page. These people had to sign off the presentation. These papers tended to be very long and detailed. Most communication that had to be agreed upon was sent through a questionnaire whereby issues could be raised and then referred to the relevant people to resolve. In most project teams, this was a specific assignment of an individual in the team to manage the issues, follow up on them, and then report them to the senior management if they were unable to deal with them effectively.
Any project plan or policy statement, or implementation plan had to go through numerous question and answer processes until all the relevant signatories were happy with their contents and they could be signed off. This normally went through at least three to four rounds before any agreement was reached. Processes were in place for this feedback from the Q and A process to reach the teams. All of this was conducted in the form of memos and Word documentation.

Relation among Clusters

Graphical function of ALCESTE: One of the core strengths of ALCESTE is its ability to create a graphical representation of the space between the clusters in a two dimensional space. This has three functions, which increase the insight that one is able to reach about the relationship between the raw data, the meaning clusters, and the virtual distance between them.

While this is powerful in creating a visual representation of the distance between the meaning clusters (which are represented by # followed by the cluster number) its usefulness is increased by two factors.

Within the graphical space that is created by ALCESTE the second piece of information on this graph is the point where the raw data sets occur in relation to each cluster number. This is done through a process of ‘tagging’. Within the raw data to be put into ALCESTE, each document may be given a unique title of its own. This is called tagging and is done by presenting ***** followed by the tag name at the beginning of each unit of text/document.

In the case of this research, the documents were tagged using the document name and the date of production. This is a very powerful function of ALCESTE that helps the researcher to see whether there are any further effects related to the clustering. That is, longitudinal effects can be seen if the documents are tagged with the date, as in the case of this research.
Another interesting result would be to note if one of the clusters of meaning were predominantly related to a single document. This may indicate that the meaning clusters within the document are particular to that document and are sufficiently specific and robust to be used often enough to create its own meaning cluster. In other words, there is a specific language created within the documentation, which is specific to that document, and the issue dealt with, also remains specific enough for there not to be much sharing.

There is a further graphical representation produced in the ALCESTE results that one may use to explore the predominant words that lie below each of the clusters formed. The graphical representation uses the identical axes and displays the distributions of the words beneath the cluster space. If one graph is placed directly over the other, it presents a clear understanding of the main words beneath the cluster.

Thus the researcher may begin to unpack the textual contents of each cluster that are further confirmed using the chi square values. The chi square values taken out of the word lists are not frequency values but demonstrate the representativeness of the words for that cluster. In other words, the words around which the clusters were formed.

**Argumentation Analysis**

This analysis is conducted to help typify the argumentation seen in this environment. Social representations researchers have used argumentation analysis previously.

In recent work by Miltiades Liakopoulos (2000) he presents the theoretical links between argumentation analysis and one of the two structural features of social representations described earlier—objectification. The proposal is that social exchange is required for the creation of social representations and it is the very process of social exchange that is studied during argumentation analysis. Through the analysis of the structuring of arguments, one may see and understand the objectifications of the social representations of that field. It is based on Toulmin’s theory of argumentation (1958).
Further argumentation analysis over a longitudinal period of time, looking at the evolution of two competing sets of representations which exist in a social space would also shed light on the influencing factors in that environment and thereby, also on the method of influencing.

**Participant Observation**

There are insights and stories to be drawn from the participant observation conducted in this project. This work as far as I participated in the change, could be called ethnographic in its data collection methodology. This I believe to be one of the unique features of this research, since doing this is indeed labour-intensive.

There is however, an increasing call for the use of multidisciplinary research in management both conceptually and methodologically. Stephen Linstead (1997) in his paper ‘The social anthropology of management’ sates that ‘Social anthropology takes as its objectives, both accurate description of context and accurate understanding of how those contexts are interpreted and experienced by participants’.

Focussing on change situations, gives a particular perspective to the participant observer that would be extremely hard for the external researcher to obtain. I hope to add a flavour of these situations to the analysis of the data, using my filed notes and interviews.

Presented below are the Project timeline and data archiving scheme for the data collected for this thesis and in Figure 7.7. This overall research design will be referred to throughout the following analyses.
The documents in the library are individually stored within *.zip folders which contain documentation prepared around the same time focused around a particular event. The detailed list of documents in each folder is presented in appendix 1.
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology, and ALCESTE

* The documents in the library are individually stored in .zip folders which contain documentation.

The detailed list of documents in each folder is presented in appendix 1.

- IC1.zip
- IC2.zip
- NCO1.zip
- NCO2.zip
- NCO3.zip
- NCO4.zip
- NCO5.zip
- Overview_R2.zip

Pre restructuring data - Change X

Figure 7-7 Research Design

Kavita Abraham

163
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology, and ALCESTE

Qualitative Research in Social Sciences

There has been a recent resurgence in the use of qualitative research techniques in the study of culture, change and developmental processes (Flick, 1999). This has been largely because of increased acceptance of the constructivist process of the everyday. Importance is given to the participants' constructions of their daily lives and experiences and the stories that they tell about this.

The perspective then is that these constructions and representations of reality are a key, influencing factor in any enacted behaviour. Silverman (2001) recommends that the choice of methodology be influenced most by the research question to be investigated and the range of quantitative/ qualitative methodology available to the researcher. Each research methodology has its own strengths and weaknesses and therefore, there is a strategic choice to be made at the commencement of any research process about the research methodologies that are most likely to create the specific insight required to answer the questions of that specific research agenda.

Bauer and Gaskell (1999, 2000) emphasise that the rigour and the critical manner in which each methodology must be used is crucial to the validity criterion of the research endeavour. Qualitative methods therefore may enhance the insight into a given question, but must be equally rigorously and appropriately applied as quantitative methods to ensure insight.

A juxtaposition of three types of qualitative research methods thus appeared to be most appropriate for the research question posed in this thesis. The constructivist's, inductive exploration of factors influencing behaviour in a change process involving two fundamentally different communities, was best served by using qualitative research methodologies. These methodologies allowed inductive exploratory research to be conducted on well-researched areas, such as change from a new perspective – the perspective of the change participants.
‘[In qualitative research]...the theory is not the starting-point but the end of research. In the beginning, there is a more or less explicit and differentiated conception of the phenomenon under study, which will be developed and refined through empirical work. Theories are not tested against empirical reality but discovered from studying empirical phenomenon’

(Flick, 1999).

Features of Qualitative Research

The distinction between quantitative and qualitative research is more subtle and nuanced than that of merely being ‘non-numerical’. Numerous authors have written and re-written the defining differences and definitional features of qualitative research. To help in the exploration of the details of this thesis, the research methodology, data sets and characteristics, Flick (1999)’s criterion for the features of qualitative research will be used as a typification of the features of this research process. See Table 7-6.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appropriateness of methods and theories</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perspectives of the participants and their diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflexivity of the research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variety of approaches and methods in qualitative research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Verstehen’ as an epistemological principle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reconstructing cases as a starting point</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction of reality as a basis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texts as empirical material</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7-6 Features of Qualitative Research (Source: Flick, 1999)

Appropriateness of Methods and Theories: ‘The problem under study is the point of reference for choosing a method’ (Flick, 1999).

The research was conducted to understand the implications of varying social representations of change in a public-private sector partnership. The methodology chosen was one that would allow me to get deep into the community, understand the rules and norms of the social milieu and thereby receive access to the process of developing and evolving social representations of change of the two communities involved.
I participated in the change team over a period of 11 months and conducted over that time, interviews with the civil servants and the private sector consultants. I also maintained diary notes and conducted an extensive document collection. The issues of creating a 'good fit' between theoretical notions and empirical data gathering, are at the core of creating any effective research design.

Silvermann (2001) emphasises how the overarching theoretical and empirical concern is crucial to determine the validity and the reliability of the entire research endeavour. Concerns over validity include internal validity (which deals with notions of the effectiveness of the methodological process to emerge from the theoretical notions). The reliability issue is concerned with 'how the data collection process feeds into empirical and theoretical concerns (de-Graft Aikins, 2004).

**Perspectives of the Participants and their Diversity:** 'Qualitative research takes into account the fact that viewpoints and practices in the field are different because of the subject perspectives and social backgrounds connected with them' (Flick, 1999). This, in effect, is at the core of this research. This helps one to gain a deeper understanding of the different representations, of a common experience of change, experienced by two groups who are working together and participating in the change process with, at least theoretically, common objectives and goals.

An acknowledgement and understanding of the two group’s diversity is critical to this research. Diversity is seen in a number of aspects of these two groups, such as in social identification, organizational history, job selection criteria, work ethic, construction of self and construction of each other.

**Reflexivity of the Research:** '..unlike quantitative research, [qualitative research] takes the researchers communications with the field and it’s members as an explicit part of knowledge instead of excluding it as an interfering variable' (Flick, 1999).
The subjectivity of the participant individual experiences is at the heart of understanding social representations. I as the researcher, was a participant in the change team and thereby my experiences (diary notes, as well as the experiences of my team and conversations conducted during the project, will become a part of the data of this thesis.

It must be noted here however, that the primary data for this thesis will be from the document library. This is because of the role that I played in the change team as a member of the private consulting community, thereby strongly biasing any information that I may have received. Thus in line with Farr’s definition of reactive and non-reactive data (Farr, 1993) the data that I will be used here is the most non-reactive form of documents produced by teams in the change process.

Variety of Approaches and Methods in Qualitative Research: Flick delineates three levels of theoretical and methodological approaches based on their objective. ‘Subjective viewpoints are the starting point. A second line of research studies the establishment and the course of interactions, while a third attempts to reconstruct the structures of the social fields and the latent meaning of practices’ (Flick, 1999).

This research uses an alternate theoretical and methodological approach. It explores two groups working together in a change project largely using their documentation of the process (subjective experiences), and looks for variations in the social representations (anchoring and objectification processes) around the common experience over time. It will attempt to separate representational fields for each group, around a single topic or experience.

Furthermore it will look at the development of the representational field over time and using the tools of an argumentation analysis (Toulmin, 1958), looking at the processes involved in the development and evolution of these representations during the time taken for this project. Markova makes a strong point of this in her defence of methodological triangulation (Markova 1996) where she stated that to investigate human social thought, it is the ‘multilayered’ nature of the thought that is essential. Additional to the multilayered nature of human thought, there is the simultaneous nature of it, which exists at ‘different
levels of an individual’s awareness”. The specific kind of triangulation that will be used in this thesis will be discussed in detail later in this chapter.

“Verstehen” as an Epistemological Principle: ‘...understanding of the phenomenon or event under study from the inside. It is the view of one or of different subjects, the course of social situations or the cultural or social rules relevant for a situation which need to be understood’ (Flick, 1999). This will be seen in the development of representational field of the two groups involved in the change processes.

The documents in the library are classified according to two criteria, authors of the document and date of production of the document. The private sector consultants solely produce approximately half of the documentation. These have been labelled as ‘private’ and they will be analyzed to understand the social representations of change in the private sector group.

The other half of the documentation is co-authored and therefore will produce a joint representational field. Analyzing the two representational fields; that is, the private consultant field and the hybrid field however, would provide insight into the structure and content of the representational field of the public civil servants. Broadly speaking: Hybrid representation field – private representational field => public representational field.

Reconstructing Cases as a Starting Point: ‘Qualitative research start more or less consistently from the analysis of a single case’ (Flick, 1999). This research is conducted around a single organization and within that a single change team that formed part of a single change process. While there is considerable work being conducted within the UK and across Europe of a similar nature; that is, public private sector partnerships of various types and kinds, the question of generalisability is not of primary concern.

This research aims at gaining insight into the varying representations and their impact on the working of the two teams. Further work would need to be conducted through other case studies, in different organizations and different change processes that could then be used to
develop insights gained here and/or typologies.

Construction of Reality as a Basis: 'a central feature of qualitative research is that it takes constructionism more seriously ...data and results are understood as including various constructions of reality' (Flick, 1999).

The attention paid in this analysis at extracting or separating from the hybrid data, the different representations of the two groups involved, is important to this analysis. This is because of the belief that to understand any representations, one must be able to look at the groups within which and by whom they are created. The representations on their own, lose value since they are created out of and steeped within a specific social context, specific to those who share the representation and the history of that context.

Texts as Empirical Material: 'Texts are the empirical bases of qualitative research' (Flick, 1999). For the reasons discussed above, the intention of the analysis is to use non-reactive data the primary data of this thesis in the form of texts created by the groups being studied.

The unique feature of using texts in this case, is in the nature of the texts that were created and used. Communicating through texts and text based documents was a key feature of this project. Within the world of private consultants, this is a common ingrained feature of every interaction, and heavily encouraged at all client sites. All meetings, telephone conversations, brainstorming sessions and discussions are conducted around documents, (mostly Power Point slides and occasionally Word documents).

This is seen as a significant advantage to structured conversations. Here we make sure that all participants have the same information available to them at the beginning of the conversation. The conclusions of the conversations are also written out and distributed to ensure common understanding. This is also useful, as often individuals involved in a discussion, are not physically available at the time of the conversation. A good example of this is that on this project, as is common practice with most projects, the private consultants would return to their consulting head-office on Fridays, while continuing to work on the
Very often meetings were conducted and discussions had over the telephone were based on written documentation and e-mailed to all participants. Therefore, this was an environment where levels of documentation produced were very high and more detailed. This allowed me to access rich data to study social representations.

**Power point as the source of text:** Using powerpoint as a source of textual data comes with its own challenges. Researchers have started exploring the implications of this process as much which is expressed on a power point page is lost in the translation to mere text (Tufte, E. R. 2003; Stark D. and Paravel, V. 2007). Needless to say, as with a word document must of the emphasis, the positioning, the diagrammatic representations, and thus much of the meaning is lost in this process. Powerpoint slides, however, when constructed as constructed with words merely used as one of the multiple mean available to the creator of expression, much like misc and lighting are used in a movie for example (Yates, J. and Orlikowski, W, 2006).

Yates and Orlikowski, go further in investigating the role of forms of communications which they call ‘genres’, in the creation of particular types of ‘gentre repertoire’ and thereby organisational cultures. By looking at the 4 examples of power point slides below the poit of Tufte, Yates and Orlokiowski can be made. Much of the information which is on these slides are determined by spacial distances and the communication is not merely of the text alone.

I have presented 4 slides below to show the degree of pictoral representations that occurs in the creation of power point slide decks and the degree of specificity associated with the positioning of each word or phrase on the slides.
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology, and ALCESTE

**Title**

**Goals**

In the old organisation:
- Step 1
- Step 2
- Step 3

In the current organisation:
- Step 1
- Step 2

In the CSR final organisation:
- Step 1
- Step 2

---

Slide 1: A power point slide showing 2 organisational states

---

Slide 2: A power point slide showing the phased changes between the 2 organisational states
Slide 3: A power point slide with basic text and positioning indicators of the slide in the deck

The slide above shows a basic power point text slide without obvious diagrammatic representations. There is one flow chart at the bottom right hand corner of the slide. These tend to be present in most decks as they indicate to the reader the position of the slide within the logic of the whole framework of the deck of slides. These are particularly critical when the power point decks are used as communication tools rather than as presentation material, although may be used in both situations (Tufte, E. R. 2003).

When such material is analysed by straightforward text extraction this would give a additional weight to the words in the titles and the position indicators as these tend to be repetitive words, which ALCESTE would take to mean increased importance. However these words are used more to clarify the slides, than to increase the importance of one particular logic. In my final overall analysis for this thesis there is a cluster of these repetitive words which I call Implementation documentation. This cluster was apparent as it did not have any intrinsic meaning links between the words but rather were repetitive words due to documentation style.
This repetitiveness of words without increased significance in meaning is very apparent in the use of power point slides but it should be mentioned here, is the case with any form of highly formalized documentation. Some of the word documents were also repetitive due to the number of titles and subtitles required by the civil service formal documents.

Using the Single Case Study Approach to Qualitative Research

The collection of research data on organisation in the field setting has become increasingly popular amongst researchers and has been recommended by researchers in the field (for examples see Sutton and Shaw, 1995, Miles and Huberman, 1994 Edmonson and McManus, 2004). These recommendations for field-based research, are linked to the type of research and insights that these methodologies provide.

Field-based, quasi-ethnographic work, one of the most popular methodologies used in qualitative research, is often linked to the theory building stage of a field, before the theory may be tested, usually by hypothesis testing. Authors such as Bauer, Gaskell, and Allum (2000) have even gone a step further to refute ‘epistemological hypertrophy’ stating that both qualitative and quantitative methods may be used in a collusive fashion, rather than pitting them against one another. This is a futile exercise since there are areas of theoretical overlap and they are commensurable paradigms in the Kuhnian sense.

Case studies have often been considered a weak methodology in the field of research. This is because of a number of reasons. Mainly since there is a relatively high labour and time cost to create data and insights that may be of limited value since they cannot, often be generalised into other situations because they are rather context specific.

Yin (1989) argues that the perceived weakness of this research method is dealt with by clarifying the definition and requirements of the case study methodology, as the rigour of the process needs to be made more explicit and more standardised across the academic communities. There are multiple varieties of case studies that are conducted in disciplines as varied as economics, physics, botany and anthropology. Each is held up as the standards of the recipient community since the focus of each varies slightly.
Chapter 7: Research Design, Research Methodology, and ALCESTE

One of the most common definitions of the case study was found in the work of Schramm (1971), 'the essence of a case study, the central tendency among all types of case study is that it tries to illuminate a decision or set of decisions: why they were taken, how they were implemented, and with what result.' Yin has offered a more technical definition of the case study with the intention of creating a distinction between this research strategy and others.

'A case study is an empirical enquiry that: investigates a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context; when the boundaries between phenomenon and context are not clearly evident; and in which multiple sources of evidence are used.'

(Yin, 1989)

In the case of this research, this particular research strategy was chosen since the research questions in this dissertation draw on a number of literatures. For example, the new public management literature on bureaucracy, the organisational theory literature on communities of practice and the social psychology literature on the theory of social representations. Bringing these three literatures together and conducting some exploratory research, lends itself best to the case-study method (Eisenhardt, 1989a). This work although developing on the theory of social representations and others, is at the very early stages of bringing these three literatures together.

The second key reason for the use of the case-study methodology is the use of multi-method triangulation (Flick, 1992). As the phenomenon of the social representations of change is being investigated from a number of perspectives, using multiple methodological tools, a case-study also provides fertile ground for this type of research. As multiple methods are being used to increase the insight into events on the ground, rather than in an experimental situation, there may be a number of influencing factors, which are influencing the phenomenon under investigation. Therefore, a case-study allows the use of multiple methods focussing on one single phenomenon. This triangulation provides added insight into the focus of the case-study.

The third reason why this methodology was selected for this research falls in line as one of the key contributions of this research. This was access into a fairly closed and restricted
Investigations into organisations and organisational settings are often hard to do as a participant observer or in a quasi-ethnographic method. This is because the entry barriers into private sector consulting organisations are extremely high and gaining access into these organisations, often limited. These are worlds where access to the outside world is minimal and access to their clients, even more so. Gaining access to the consulting world, took over a year of gaining qualifications and after I joined a firm, there was a further period of training and coaching which was time and labour-intensive, while one learnt the language, rites, and rituals of the tribe. Once access was gained, the case-study methodology was almost a requirement since there was so much to be seen, learnt, investigated and explored.

Silverman (2001) proposed three key assumptions about the ‘theoretical character of the ethnographical case study which best capture the essence why the case-study was a useful tool in the investigation of these social representations. Silverman states that researchers using this methodology, have a number of assumptions that they take with them into the field, and perhaps it was because of the strength of these assumptions that the methodology was most appropriate. These are that:

- Common sense is complex and sophisticated rather than naïve and misguided
- Social practices are rites though which common sense operates
- The object of the study is seen as a social product through the activities of particular people in particular settings.

With these assumptions and the object of study being social representations of change, there was little further doubt as to what would be the most appropriate methodology.

Quality Criteria

A point of concern for all researchers in the scientific or social scientific community is one of the quality standards of the research conducted. Each research community has agreed standards by which research is judged, before the research may be accepted as part of the
work of that community. Classical or traditional quality criteria within the scientific community, often revolve around questions of reliability and validity. While these criteria are accepted within the scientific community, there has been a long debate within the social sciences as to whether such criteria can be applied to the study of human communities and behaviours.

As Farr (1993) states in his investigation on the methods of studying social representations there is 'no single royal road, in terms of the methods of research to the study of social representations' (p23). Largely though, what tends to be favoured in this attempt to investigate the substance of everyday life and thought, beyond positivist limitations (Breakwell & Canter, 1993), is a mixture or blend of qualitative and quantitative methods. This is often seen in the form of triangulation of different methods.

Authors such as Glaser and Strauss have ‘...raised doubts about the applicability of these canons of rigor as proper criteria for judging the credibility of theory based in flexible research...[they have]...suggested that criteria of judgment be based instead of the detailed elements of the actual strategies used for collecting, coding, analyzing, and presenting data when generating theory, and on the way in which people read the theory’ (1967, p.227).

A number of researchers in the field of qualitative research have developed through their work, quality criteria for qualitative research. Bauer and Gaskell (2000) have discussed this in detail and argue that although these criteria may not be directly transferable in their original form, from the deductive research to inductive methods of research, functionally equivalent criteria may be developed within the qualitative fields of research. They propose functionally equivalent criterion for inductive research, as seen in Table 7-7.
Table 7- 7 Functional Equivalents for Quality Assessment with Reference to Public Accountability
(Source: Gaskell and Bauer, p344)

Beyond the quality criterion of confidence and relevance described above, there is the notion of replicability. There is a strong linkage here with the notions of external validity or generalisability, while not exactly the same. External validity refers to the typicality or representativeness of a case in the general population. Replicability refers to the ability to reproduce the study and reach the same results.

These two notions do not impact this research project since they hold a basic fundamental positivist assumption about the objective nature of reality and thereby is not relevant in a constructivist’s exploratory approach. These become methodological issues when one assumes social phenomenon to be stable, unaffected, and existing outside of history and culture (Gervais, 1997).

Triangulation in the Study of Social Representations

Triangulation of data research methodology is often used in an attempt to compensate for the limitations or pitfalls of a single methodology. Using two to three varied methodologies with different strengths and weaknesses allows the data to be studied, using different methods. These methods may provide varying light on the question being asked thus providing concurrent validation of the research results (Denzin, 1978).

Methodological triangulation, Denzin wrote, involved a ‘process of paying off each method against the other so as to maximize the validity of field efforts’. Particularly in non-
positivist research where there are no clear hypotheses that need to be proven or nullified; that is, more exploratory or grounded theory investigations of subjective experiences.

There seems to be an increased case for the use of triangulation to limit the ability of the researchers to manipulate the data to serve their own purpose, rather than to investigate what emerges from the data. Thus analyzing data using different qualitative and quantitative methodologies, provides the opportunity to validate the findings of any one methodology, by using another one.

'The theory of social representations suggests the use of a plurality of methods for coming to grips with different versions of reality. This is so because social representations are always at once representations of something and representations of someone or some collectivity. Since different social groups and individuals are expected to hold and to construct different social representations according to their particular position in the wider society at a given historical junction, to their own life experience, to their immediate need and concerns, etc., one must develop methodological apparatus to apprehend how social representations emerge and function in different milieu. (Gervais, 1997).’ This is attempted in this PhD research.

Corpus Construction
The simple criterion for selection into any one of the four chronological groups, was the date of production of the document. At this preliminary stage that was the sole criterion for selection. The documents are shown in the *.zip files into which they are stored. A detailed version of the individual files with production dates and summaries of the content is given at the end of this chapter.

The documents are then further divided on authorship. The research question overlaying this entire thesis is understand and map the representational fields of two communities of practice (the public and the private) over a fixed period of time (11 months) during which they worked together to implement an organisational change. The distinction between the two communities therefore, needs to be made in the data.
Therefore the central core of documents collected between February and November, have then been separated on authorship into two categories: the documents written solely by the private sector and the documents created by both the public and the private sector, which we refer to as the Hybrid documents. There were very few, if any, documents collected which were authored solely by the private sector, and thus the Hybrid authorship category was created as the second category.
Chapter 8: Results: Cross Sectional Analysis

Establishing Differences in the Social Representations of Change

Chapter Summary

The results are presented in four sections, the analysis of private Change X, hybrid (all hybrid documents are those with joint authorship of the public and private sector) Change X, Private Change x and Hybrid Change x. At the end of the two analysis of Change X, there is a discussion of the comparative results presenting the idea of the evangelical private sector, vs. the change fatigued public sector. An analysis of the overall documentation of the change project is also presented at the end as an indicator of which communities has a 'louder voice'.
Chapter 8: Results: Cross Sectional Analysis

This analysis focused around noticing the main clusters of meaning to be found in the public community documents and the hybrid documents, at different points in time. This would be a good point to start noticing where the main overlaps and differences in the clusters of meaning around the change, occurred.

Analysis of Private Change X

The analysis of the documentation created by the private sector during Change X is presented in this chapter, using the reporting protocol suggested in the last chapter.

![Research Design](image)

Research Design

**Figure 8-1 Research Design – Private Change X**

The data was divided into all the documents authored by private sector employees in the first half of the change project (Change X) and was run through ALCESTE. After the analysis was made robust and the data cleaned, this analysis provides the main meaning clusters around the large-scale change during the first few months of the public/ private sector partnership. See Figure 8-1.
In other words this would contain as far as possible, the point when the clusters of meaning around change were most representative of the public and private sector groups participating in this change came from. Here we take a closer look at the analysis of the representations of change within the private sector firm during the first half of the change; that is, during Change X.

Formation of the Cluster

| Cl. 1 (58uce) | -------------------------------+ |
| Cl. 2 (26uce) | --+ | |
| 12 | -----+ | |
| 18 | | |
| Cl. 4 (22uce) | + | | |
| 14 | ---------------+ | |
| Cl. 3 (29uce) | -------------------------------+ | |
| 16 | | | |
| Cl. 5 (84uce) | -------------------------------+ |

**Figure 8-2 Dendrogram Private Change X**

This dendrogram shows the ease of separation of clusters within ALCESTE or in other words, distinctness of content contained within each cluster. The dendrogram, to be read from the right, shows the first cluster to emerge was Cluster 1. The second most distinct meaning cluster is Cluster 5. The last two clusters to separate were Clusters 2 and 4, showing that these two would be the closest to each other in meaning. See Figure 8-2.

Cluster 5 it emerges (discussed further down) refers to the 'Change design specifications'. Cluster 1 is the 'Processes around Agency/Customer interactions'. These are the areas that the private sector change expertise and project management tools are imported into the change programme and well-established tools of the private sector change models are being implemented.

Clusters 2 and 4 deal with the 'Agency Objectives on Customer relations' the 'Processes for change team and agency communications'. It can be seen here that both clusters deal with communications, and are split on the division between external communications. That
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

is, Cluster 2, which is about the agency communications with their clients, while Cluster 4 focuses around internal communications of the change team and the agency employees.

Content of the Clusters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster Title</th>
<th>Most significant words in the cluster</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Processes around agency/ customer interactions</td>
<td>Communications, planning, benchmarking, marketing, face to face</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Agency objectives and customer relations</td>
<td>Case transfers, end organisation, final organisation, output, deadline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Management and team role descriptions</td>
<td>Higher Executive officer, roles, executive officer, process management, simulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Processes for change team and agency communications</td>
<td>Agencies, national telephone exchange, intranet, pilot office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Change Design Specifications</td>
<td>Final organisation, links, projections, IT implementation, cases</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cluster 1: Processes around Agency/ customer interactions: The words in this cluster deal primarily with the processes of the change with reference to their impact on the Agency customers. This is one of the first areas of focus to be found in any private sector change management process where the focus on the customer and service delivery to the customer, is one of the key considerations during any time of change.

Cluster 2: Agency Objectives and customer relations: This cluster deals with the attempt of the change team to deal with the communications, managing the expectations and aligning the objectives of the change and the customer. In the private sector change, this would fall under market, public relations and advertising, so that the image and reputation of the Agency are managed in the public eye.

Cluster 3: Management and team role descriptions: This cluster contains the job and role specifications for the project management team and the specifications for the management of the new organizational structure. It is another standard level of documentation that is created within the public sector, as part of an organizational transformation project.

Here the new organizational structure that the change team is working towards, is thought about and planned up front. In this process, the planning is often done top down and so the change in the roles and jobs of the management and team leaders, is one of the first areas to
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

be confirmed.

Cluster 4: Processes for change team and agency communications: This cluster deals with the internal communications of the organization during the change and immediately afterwards. Private sector consultants often work on very large scale, in this case across six business units across the country. Therefore managing the communications and the processes of communication over this period, is critical to the success of the project.

Communications during a period of change are often quite different that during other times, particularly because there is a new group of people (the change team) managing this process. Therefore, it is considered crucial to have the new communications channels in place and agreed to by all. In this case, the change was ongoing for a few years and therefore, it was imperative that the new communication channels be made clear to the entire agency.

Cluster 5: Change design specifications: This cluster contains the thinking and documentation behind the overall change. When such a large change is planned, it is normally planned with a specific goal in mind.

One of the insights of the private sector consultants, is creating a high-level change plan with those goals in mind, and focusing and directing how the change will be phased in. This cannot be the job of the agency staff since they continue to run the agency and do their 'day job'. In this context the private sector consultant expertise in managing the overall change, is created into numerous documents that are circulated throughout the organization to be agreed to.

Rhetorical Features of the Clusters
This data is taken from the sentence lists produced by the ALCESTE results which give, like the word lists, the sentences most typical of each cluster. Rather than discussing the rhetoric individually for each cluster, it is perhaps more interesting to note the rhetoric of
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

the private sector documentation as a whole during the period of Change X.

All documentation in this analysis was in the form of Power Point slides and so the textual data had to be removed from the slides and converted into rich text format for ALCESTE. Therefore there were not many full sentences, and numerous issues that were dealt with were in a bullet-point format. The documentation retained the tone of the project management tools that were being implemented in this environment. There was little or no room for feedback at this stage; rather there was a search for the required information from the agency that would fill in the gaps for the change model package that the consultants had.

The change model package dealt with specific issues at this stage. These issues were organizational design, job roles and structuring and processes to be implemented during the change period to help the change team to communicate regularly with the change recipients. Design and communication were considered key at this time, which is the case in the private sector, where the focus is on the stakeholders and the customers of the business.

The language of this phase within the private sector documentation was full of “management consultant/ business school speak”. This can be seen from the ALCESTE sentence lists – ‘Design principles, implementation route map, initiate competence, customer expectations, reporting structures, and client’s customer experience’

Relations among Clusters

This is one of the most powerful functions of ALCESTE. It allows the researcher to see the positioning of the clusters, in relation to the actual documentation which forms the corpus. In this analysis the documents were tagged with the document name. We can see the five clusters in relation to one another and in relation to the tagged documents. See Figure 8-3
Here we can see confirmed, as we saw in the section on the formation of clusters, the 5 clusters of this analysis. We see once again that Cluster 5 and Cluster 1 are on their own, the most distant from the other clusters. In fact as expected, Cluster 5 and Cluster 1 do not share their half of the space with any other cluster at all. Clusters 2, 4 and 3 are together in one quadrant of the space, with Cluster 2 and 4 closest to each other.
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

We can interpret from this that documents 1, 2, and 3 close to Cluster 5 must contain a lot of information on the ‘Change Design Specifications’. We can also see that although all the documents must deal with ‘Processes around Agency/Customer interaction’ (Cluster 1), as they are all approximately equidistant from it, there is no one particular document which deals with this issue.

Summary of Analysis of the Documentation Produced by the Biz on Change X

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data corpora</th>
<th>Private change X</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total word count</td>
<td>9,996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of clusters</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial context unit</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary context units</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of words in clusters</td>
<td>83.27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Thus in summary we can see that during the first phase of Change X, the key meaning clusters contained within the documentation of the private sector firm, (9996 words) produced five meaning clusters with 83.27% of the words being within the clustering – Processes around agency and customer interaction, Agency Objectives and Customer Relations, Management and Team Role Descriptions, Processes for change team and agency Communications and Change Design Specifications.

Cluster 1 is the most distinct cluster that deals specifically with establishing processes for managing the customer. The remaining 4 clusters are about the people and processes involved in the change. This is where the consultant’s private sector expertise lies. That is, the consultant needs to establish project management processes and time lines to manage the process of change.
The core representations seen during this analysis are thus around managing the customer, people and processes.

**Analysis of Hybrid Change X Single Document**

The Documentation produced by the change team during Change X is analysed here and the results presented, according to the reporting protocol. The public sector change leader primarily authored this documentation although there may be some private sector influence.

**Research Design**

![Research Design: Hybrid Change X](image)

**Formation of the Cluster**

This dendrogram for the clustering of the Hybrid results during the period of Change X, shows the most distinct cluster is Cluster 6. Following from there, they appear to be more of less of the same degree of difference with Clusters 3 and 5 being closest to each other in meaning as they split last. See Figure 8- 6.
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

| Cl. 1  | 93uce | +--------------------------------+ | 15 | +--------------------------------+ |
| Cl. 2  | 31uce | +--------------------------------+ | 17 | +--------------------------------+ |
| Cl. 3  | 54uce | +--------------------------------+ | 12 | +--------------------------------+ |
| Cl. 5  | 20uce | +--------------------------------+ | 14 | +--------------------------------+ |
| Cl. 4  | 36uce | +--------------------------------+ | 18 | +--------------------------------+ |
| Cl. 6  | 18uce | +--------------------------------+ |

Figure 8-6 Dendrogram Hybrid Change X

Cluster 6 refers to ‘Contingency plans’. This is important to note since it is the primary cluster in the Hybrid discourse but did not appear at all within the private sector clusters. This will be discussed in more detail at the end of this section within the comparative analysis of Change X documentation.

The rest of the clusters appear more or less evenly split with Cluster 3 and 5 being closest in meaning. These are the clusters around ‘Management and Team behavioural changes’ and ‘Public Sector mission and risk management’. This could indicate that there is a close link in the Hybrid documentation between the role of the new management and the aligning that with the public sector mission. It could also indicate that Risk Management is one of the key functions of the new management and team behaviours.

Content of Clusters:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster titles</th>
<th>Most significant words in the cluster</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Reform change plans and targets</td>
<td>IT day, a day, ministerial report, final organisation, behaviour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Potential interactions and training with change partners</td>
<td>Training, business unit, roll out, telephony, agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Public Sector mission and risk management</td>
<td>Poverty eradication, individuals, poverty line, failure, risk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Management and Team Behavioural Changes</td>
<td>Leadership, executive, training, reporting, management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Public sector management team</td>
<td>Change team, change participants, executive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Cluster 1: Reform Change Plans and Targets: This cluster deals with the detailed planning of the operations of the change. It deals with the role of the information technology and the staged changes within the organisation and the business units.

Cluster 2: Potential Interactions and Training with Change Partners: This cluster deals with all partners of the change. This includes other governmental and non-governmental agencies and details the levels of interactions that the central agency has with them on a daily basis, as part of delivering their service. The planned organisational change is so fundamental to the business that it will also affect these partners.

Therefore, it would require the training that will be given to the employees of the agency to also include the employees of the partner agencies to help them cope with the change.

Cluster 3: Public Sector Mission and Risk Management: This sector deals with understanding the change from the perspective of the public sector goals and managing risk. Aligning the change with the Institutional goals appears important. However, at the same time, planning for failures and managing risk appears to be part of the discourse.

The risk management discourse here is quite detailed and strong since this appears to be a fundamental part of the change in an institution with a history of change failures. This is why it appears in the change process as a level of input from the public sector, without any input from the private sector during the same period of time.

Cluster 4: Management and Team Behavioural Changes: This cluster looks at the detailed behavioural changes that are required to achieve a successful organisation change, and what the team and management behaviours would be when the change is over. In other words, the focus on the transitional teams and the teams required to make a functional final organisation. It is quite prescriptive in nature, like a wish list of behavioural characteristics.
Cluster 5: Public Sector Management Team Roles: This cluster deals with the same issues in a similar cluster in the private discourse. It focuses on a detailed description of the management and their teams' roles and job descriptions. It appears that this is the public sector employees, adding to the discourse and structures of the private sector. Therefore, in the Hybrid documentation, there is little change.

Cluster 6: Contingency Plans: This cluster deals with issues and queries about contingency plans. That is these are plans that need to be thought through and put into place in case of failure or delays along the planning path. It deals with contingency plans, based on delayed IT delivery, on constructions of buildings not being in place and the staff resources not completing the required training.

Rhetorical Features of Clusters:
The main distinguishing factor of the language used in the Hybrid documentation of Change X is the entrance into this discourse of public sector language. There are numerous acronyms, such as EO HEO and SEO (Executive Officer, Higher Executive Officer and Senior Executive Officer) in the documents. The sentences in the discourse are longer and there appears to be more concern raised in this section, rather than in the action statements of the consultants.

There appears to be a further distinction in these documents between the transition phase of the change and the final state of the organisation, after the change. There is a definite focus on the business partners who will be affected by the change. These interactions are in a level of detail that was previously not there. This may just indicate that this is more a hands-on approach to the documentation, rather than the high-level approach of the consultants.
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

Relation among Clusters

![Diagram of Relation Among Clusters, Hybrid Change X]

In this analysis of the Hybrid data for change X we can see the 5 clusters that have formed. As seen in the dendrogram Cluster 6 is the most distance and the other five clusters are more or less evenly spaced. See Figure 8-7.

We can see that the document 1 is closely related to Clusters 4, 5 and 3. These are the clusters on Management and Team Behavioural changes, Public Sector management team roles and Public Sector mission and Risk Management.

These are the clusters where the language is specifically focussed around the public sector,
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

the teams of people involved in the change and the behavioural changes.

Clusters 1 and 2, Reform change plans and Targets and Potential interactions and training with change partners are largely dealt with in document 2. These are quite distinct areas of discussion and there is little area for overlap, causing the clusters to be formed on either end of the graph. Cluster 6, Contingency plans are spoken about in both documents and remains a distinct cluster equidistant from both documents sections.

Summary of Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data corpora</th>
<th>Hybrid change X</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total word count</td>
<td>14,280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of clusters</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial context units</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary context units</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of words in clusters</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In summary, documentation for the Hybrid Change X was analysed in ALCESTE. There were 14,280 words that produced 6 clusters with 72% of the words being within the clusters. The 6 meaning clusters which emerged are “Reform change plans and targets”, “Potential interaction and training with change partners”, “Public sector mission and risk management”, “Management team and behavioural changes”, “Public Sector management team roles”, “Contingency plans”. See Figure 8-8

Looking closer at the formation of the clusters and the meanings, they can broadly be divided into three areas which are (1) Public Sector goals and Communications (2) Processes and People and (3) Contingency.
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

Contingency is the strongest and most distinct cluster in this analysis. In other words, contingency is at the core of their representation on change during this period of the change, while they still maintain their thematic interests in people and processes and setting the public sector goals and communications.

The Overall Cross Sectional Comparative Analysis of Change X

While there will be plenty of overlapping in the results here with the data from the private sector, since this data is a hybrid data of the representations, what would be interesting to note would be the degree of overlap. Then if there are any indeed distinct clusters of meaning which could be attributed to the public sector concerns. See Table 8-1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Private Representations</th>
<th>Primary Cluster</th>
<th>Secondary Clusters</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hybrid Representations</td>
<td>Contingency</td>
<td>Public Sector Goals and Communications; People and Processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>People and Processes</td>
<td>Managing the customer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8-1 Primary and Secondary Clusters Formed in Change X

The Evangelists – The Private Sector

The private sector change experts bring with them into a change process, all their knowledge and expertise to implement numerous change processes in the private sector. These change models have been built and implemented successfully in private sector enterprise.

The nature of the private sector and the principles on which they are run are fundamentally different from the ethos and raison d’etre of the public sector. This becomes very apparent in this analysis as the private sector change models are implemented in the public sector.

The primary concerns of the private sector at this stage are around issues of processes and people that are the cornerstones of large scale ‘Project Management’. Their focus is on creating a system within the organisation that can be used effectively during the process of change which will be implemented top-down. In the private sector, this is managed by
using ‘carrots’ and ‘sticks’\textsuperscript{18}.

Another feature of the private sector change models are their relative short-term perspective from conception to implementation, as change is relatively swiftly implemented. Additionally, it is not in the current consulting model to have any consultant on the project for a long period of time\textsuperscript{19}. Therefore, the planning done in a change programme is explicit (so it can be passed on) and the perspective is not long term for the individuals concerned.

The language and tone of the Power Point presentations that are used to communicate these ideas, is one of expertise. The documents are filled with instructions and claims in an authoritative valuations tone, establishing that there is very little room for discussion and feedback at this stage in the process.

The private sector primary cluster is the focus around customer interactions. This is again a feature of the private sector change management model. This is one of the reasons that the Reform Project was implemented, to make the public sector more customer-oriented.

The Fatigued Change Recipient – The Public Sector

It can be seen from the clusters in this analysis that the public sector agency is facing change fatigue. As mentioned in the case study, this agency has seen numerous consultants come and go and seen change projects of this magnitude fail in the past. Thus their primary concerns at this stage are Contingency and Risk

Cluster 6 it emerges (see further down) refers to ‘Contingency plans’ created by the agency. This feature was completely missing from the discourse around change in the private sector firm. This Agency had a long institutional history of failed change implementations and

\begin{quote}
\textsuperscript{18} An example of a private sector carrot would be ‘If you do this change well, and do it quickly, you will be promoted or you will get a bonus’. A private sector ‘stick’ would be ‘If you don’t do this change you will either get a poor appraisal or get fired, but the repercussions will be soon’.

\textsuperscript{19} The consulting model from the perspective of their employees requires them to have a high turnover across projects. In other words the consultants must, at least in their early years on projects get a broad overview of change across industries and across projects. The average time a consultant stays on a private sector change project is 3 months. 6 months is considered a long time in consulting.
\end{quote}
had received lots of negative publicity both internally and externally, around change. This may serve as one possible explanation for this being the most distinct cluster of this part of the discourse, and one which originates in the public sector.

Another factor missing from the private discourse which appears in the public discourse is the issues of RISK. This appears in Cluster 3 in the Hybrid analysis but not in the private sector discourse. Clusters 3 and 5 are loosely linked and appear to contain a broader view on what is contained in Cluster 3 in the private discourse that deals with 'Management and Team Role Descriptions.

This may emerge out of the public sector being forced to think in the language of the private sector at this time of the project, for example, using their templates. The proximity of the clusters may also lead us to understand that in the Hybrid discourse there is a link between the management, team roles, and Risk Management

The public sector mission is only mentioned in the Hybrid discourse. Communications are only mentioned in the private sector change model in the interactions with training change partners. The Hybrid documentation of change X has more Word documents in the style of the Public sector communications. These are documents that are widely circulated and not signed off in agreement unless they have gone through a lengthy Q&A process.

---

20 Q&A procedures are part of the fabric of the British Civil Service. This is a process whereby documentation which is finalised within the civil service is circulated (in a word document) to the people who need to approve of the contents for feedback and agreement. The names of the recipients of the documentation are placed on the top of the file and people may send back queries or request more information from their colleagues before signing off any document. These are also maintained in great detail to keep a paper memory of the process and details of the development of the documentation.
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

Analysis for Change x Private Documents

The documentation produced during change x by the private sector consultants is analysed here and presented according to the developed protocol.

Research Design

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Change X</th>
<th>Change x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Marc</td>
<td>April</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hybrid change representations

Private sector change representations

Analysis III

Figure 8-9 Analysis 3: Private x Change Representation

Formation of Clusters

Figure 8-10 Dendrogram Private Change x

Kavita Abraham

197
In Figure 8-10 we can see the formation of clusters for the private documentation of Change x. There are 7 clusters of meaning produced. Clusters 3 and 7 separate from the rest of the clusters first. These are the clusters on document structuring and IT dependency issues. These are distinct from the other clusters that deal with the people and the processes of change within the documentation.

Clusters 5 and 6 appear closest in meaning. These are the clusters on the Agency Organisational Design and Managing the Business units. There are the change plans which are being reformulated at this stage of the change and dealing with the processes and details of the plans. The organisational design documents deal with the overarching change plans for the entire agency while managing the business units, deals with the detailed plans specifically for the Business Units within the Agency, at this new phase of the change.

**Content of Clusters**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster Title</th>
<th>Most significant words in the cluster</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Agency Job Role Design</td>
<td>Team leader, Business unit leaders, technician, telephony, agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Change Design</td>
<td>IT delivery, case transfers, it day, final organisation, employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Document Structuring</td>
<td>Title, table, header, organisational, change, appendix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Private Sector Knowledge Management</td>
<td>Issues, lessons, learning, backups, better processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Agency organisational design</td>
<td>Parallel, final organisation, linkages, process maps, delivery dates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Managing the business units</td>
<td>Leadership, central teams, business change, case manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 IT dependency issues</td>
<td>Delivery, IT implementation, case migration, mitigation, failures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Once again as we are dealing with documents produced by the private sector, we can see the high-level plans on design, document structuring, role division and knowledge management which are characteristic of the private sector change models.

*Cluster 1: Agency Job Role Design* – This cluster deals with the overall new job roles that
need to be created to manage this change and the job roles that would be required to run the organisation after this specific change is created.

**Cluster 2: Change Design** – This cluster deals with the overall design of the changes and the processes that need to be put into place to manage the change. These include communication process, processes for dealing with the IT, reporting procedures and the new team structures.

**Cluster 3: Document Structuring** – As typical of most private sector documentation, there are numerous statements that deal with the structuring of the documentation including repeated document titles, formatting and dividing of the documents into phases and dealing with the scope of the entire change documentation.

**Cluster 4: Private Sector Knowledge Management** - During most change projects by the private sector, a number of documents are created to enlist the lessons learnt and the processes and structures that are developed within the change process.

This cluster deals with these documents that are circulated only within the consultants in this project team. These are to get their input and then the documents are given to further consultants who join the project or who are involved in similar project across the consulting firm. The language and the style of these documents are different and therefore, there is a specific clustering around this by ALCESTE.

**Cluster 5: Agency Organisational Design** – This cluster contains the overarching organisational design changes that are to be made during the new change processes and to achieve the new change. As these were fundamentally changed during at the end of June, new documentation needed to be created to circulate within the organisation with the new change goals and the implementation plans.

**Cluster 6: Managing the Business Units** – The specific detailed plans to help the Business
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

Units adjust to the new change plans, are detailed in this cluster. It deals with the new project plans and how this would influence the Business Units and the new processes that they must implement, to be ready to deal with this new change.

Cluster 7: IT Dependency Issues – This cluster deals with all of the issues around the development and implementation of IT within this change. There was a realisation that the change implementation is in some areas, dependant on the IT delivery. Helping the organisation deal with this and therefore the discussion around the IT implementation, has taken on a more critical position within this Change x implementation.

Rhetorical Features of Clusters

The language in these clusters appears to be spotted with private sector change management jargon including ‘lessons learnt’, ‘structure for capturing knowledge’, ‘suggestions on good practice’. There remains in this section as in the previous private sector cluster, a cluster organised mainly around the documentation structuring which is a key feature of private sector discourse.

There appears to be a discussion around responsibility and accountability which is much more explicit that in the first half of the change and there is a distinct cluster of meaning around IT and the implications of the projects dependency on IT. So there now appears in the rhetoric of the private sector documentation, a slight shift in the ‘can do’ and ‘will be achieved’ rhetoric that characterised the first half of the project documentation, to a discussion where accountability and dependencies are being accepted and spoken about explicitly.

This may be because of the ‘shock’ of the end of June changes, or may be also in part caused by a realisation on the part of the private sector of the number of contingencies involved. Also, that the pace of change and degree of control that exists in the institutions of the public sector, is significantly less than in their previous private sector experience.
Relation among Clusters

| 10 |  *document 10 |  |
| 9  |  *document 9  |  |
| 8  |  Agency job role |  |
| 7  |  Managed the Business |  |
| 6  |  Units |  |
| 5  |  Document structuring |  |
| 4  |  *document 5  |  |
| 3  |  *document 6  |  |
| 2  |  Organisation design |  |
| 1  |  *document 7  |  |
| 0  |  *document 4  |  |
| 1  |  *document 3  |  |
| 2  |  Managing the Business |  |
| 3  |  Document structuring |  |
| 4  |  *document 5  |  |
| 5  |  *document 6  |  |
| 6  |  *document 7  |  |
| 7  |  Issues |  |
| 8  |  *document 8  |  |
| 9  |  *document 9  |  |
| 10 |  *document 10 |  |
| 11 |  *document 10 |  |
| 12 |  *document 9  |  |
| 13 |  *document 9  |  |
| 14 |  *document 9  |  |
| 15 |  *document 9  |  |
| 16 |  *document 2  |  |
| 17 |  *document 1  |  |
| 18 |  *document 1  |  |

Figure 8-11 Relation Among Clusters Private Change x

Figure 8-11 is a fairly evenly spaced cluster representation. Two documents appear to be closely related to Cluster 2, Change design while most of the rest of the documents appear to be closely around Cluster 7, IT dependency issues, with the middle clusters remaining more or less equally distant from each other.

This is a strong indicator that the focus of the documentation within the private sector, has shifted to be around IT dependency with an equally strong emphasis (as is to be expected with private documentation) around document structuring. While in the first half of the change, the documentation was around organisational design and change planning, it
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

appears now that there has been a significant shift or realisation of the dependencies in the project that are not controlled by the change consultants and need to be planned for and worked around.

Summary of Analysis for Change x Private Documents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data corpora</th>
<th>Private change x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total word count</td>
<td>9406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of clusters</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial context units</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary context units</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of words within clusters</td>
<td>89.72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 8-12 Summary of Analysis Private Change x

Figure 8-12 shows the analysis of the private documentation for Change x (9406 words) resulted in the creation of 7 meaning clusters by ALCESTE, with 89.72% of the data within the clusters. These clusters are Agency job role design, change design, document structuring, private knowledge management, organisation design, managing the business units and IT dependency issues. There have been some interesting and significant shifts in the discussion around the change within the private sector documentation since the period of Change X.

Clusters 3 and 7 were split within the ALCESTE analysis from the main text. These are the clusters on document structuring and IT dependency issues. The other clusters are around the people and processes involved in the change. The remaining clusters appear to be similar to those in the analysis of private Change X documents.

The representation of the change’s core concerns have developed now to include the issues...
arising around the IT dependency of the change process and the document structuring. These are new concerns that appear to be core since they are the first clusters to break away during the analysis.

IT dependency has become crucial in the change management process since the change process was restructured because of late IT delivery. The private sector has thus become sensitised to their lack of total control over the change and their documentation appears to be involving these issues more centrally during Change x.

Document structuring appears to have become a core concern of the private sector during this period of change, perhaps for two primary reasons.

- The first is their responsiveness to the culture of the public sector, thereby creating more explicit paper trails of where decisions were taken and requiring change participants to sign off on all agreements.

- Secondly, this may be the reaction to the shifting of the change plans from Change X which has caused them to be more aware of getting agreement from all participants, before assuming that any processes will change, simply because of their ‘expert opinion’.

Analysis for Change x Hybrid Documents

The documentation produced by the joint change team during change x are analysed and

Kavita Abraham

203
the results presented here. This change team had private sector member but was led primarily by the public civil servants.

Research Design

![Figure 8-13 Research Design Hybrid Change x]

Formation of Clusters

| Cl. 1 (105uce) |--------------------------+ |
| 16 |-------+ |
| Cl. 4 (49uce) |------------------------+ |
| 14 |------+ |
| 17 |----------+ |
| Cl. 6 (142uce) |------------------------+ |
| 18 |----------+ |
| Cl. 3 (87uce) |--------------------------+ |
| 19 |----------+ |
| Cl. 2 (165uce) |--------------------------+ |
| Cl. 5 (52uce) |--------------------------+ |

![Figure 8-14 Dendrogram Hybrid Change x]

The most distinct cluster in this analysis is the cluster on ‘Managing public expectations’
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

Cluster 7. (See Figure 8-14). This is very different from the concerns of the private sector documentation that did not have public expectations in any of the meaning clusters.

This may reflect a concern for the agency about their image and profile with their customers and the public, based on their history of negative publicity in the past. It may also reflect something more institutional, that is the public sector's ethos of service. This was found to be the primary reason for public sector employees choosing this line of work on an intranet survey that was conducted during this project.

The two clusters closest in meaning are Clusters 4 and 6 that are IT Fault Management and Managing partners and the government. This is a very interesting result, as the positioning of the role of IT at this stage, seems almost opposite for the private and hybrid documents. While they both picked up these concerns, they place them at either extreme - the most prominent concern to merely one of the many concerns.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster Title</th>
<th>Most significant words in the cluster</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Staffing</td>
<td>Final, employees, shifting, partners, re-assignment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Re-planning the change</td>
<td>IT day, design, pilot, change design, revision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Interim teams and responsibilities</td>
<td>Change team, senior executive officers, location, central offices, management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 IT fault management</td>
<td>Case migration, scheduling, contingency, consortium, issues management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Managing the public expectations</td>
<td>Communications, brochures, face to face, telephony, cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Managing partners and the government</td>
<td>Ministers, briefing, agencies, consultants, consulting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cluster 1: Staffing – This cluster deals with words around managing and moving staff around to deal with the new change plans, creating teams to deal with the interim period of change and then recreating the teams to manage the final organisation. As the change in the planning scope was so large, this appears to be a big area of concern for the public sector employees who need to be shifted around from the business units and their staffing requirement, re-assigned.

Cluster 2: Re-planning the change – This cluster deals with the re-planning of the overall...
change processes and the design of the new change. The inclusion of the IT dependencies and the new organisational design and structuring of the processes within the organisation to cope with the new overall plans appear to be core agenda.

Cluster 3: Interim teams and responsibilities – The new change implementation required a new set of teams to be set up to manage the interim process. The focus of this documentation is more short-term with the immediate goals of managing the teams and responsibilities around the latest restructuring.

Cluster 4: IT Fault Management – This cluster deals with the specifications around the IT faults and managing the risky process of IT delivery. The change process is undergoing a major re-planning. One of the key reasons for this, was the late delivery of IT. Therefore managing the IT delivery, is a key component of the new documentation around the change.

This cluster is of relatively less significance in this analysis, as the actual managing of this process was to be conducted by the private sector, while the public sector was reporting on this process from the end user perspective within the agency.

Cluster 5: Managing public expectations – This is the core cluster within this analysis. This has now become an area of primary concern for the public sector. With the history of failed change programmes within the agency and the bad publicity this creates for the agency, the change-weary agency is attempting to create structures to manage this process effectively.

As the change has already been delayed at this early stage of the implementation, it is critical that a communications programme be put into place to manage the public expectations around the disruption to agency services caused by the change.

Cluster 6: Managing partners and the government – This is another area of concern for the public sector which the private sector does not seem to pick up on during the second phase of the change.
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

Although the private sector does discuss in detail the managing of the Business Units (as it would since in private sectors this could be enforced to a greater degree), it is the public sector that primarily picks up on the role of managing the government and the ministers in charge of the change, by involving them in the actual process and contingencies around the process.

Rhetorical Features of the Clusters

The documentation created during the Hybrid change X is almost entirely in Microsoft Word format. The documentation structure has changed very little from the format of the Change X, while the private sector documentation has shifted much more to the public sector style. All documentation is sent through the Q&A process, with the list of the recipients on the front pages of the documents.
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

Relation among Clusters

The two main clusters coming out of this analysis (Figure 8-15) are re-planning the change and managing public expectations. The first cluster was managing public expectations which has three documents that are solely concerned with that function, but is mentioned either directly or as part of the core concerns within almost all documentation within the analysis.

Re-planning of the change also has numerous smaller sized documents around the cluster that are concerned solely with re-designing of the people and processes around the change.

Kavita Abraham

208
Summary of Analysis x for Hybrid Documents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data corpora</th>
<th>Hybrid change x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total word count</td>
<td>30,423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of clusters</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial context units</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary context units</td>
<td>827</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of words within clusters</td>
<td>72.55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 8-16 Summary of Analysis Hybrid Change x

As can be seen in Fig 8-16 the documentation for Hybrid change C was analysed as 30,423 words that produced six clusters with 72% of the words being within the analysis. Figure 8-16 gives a summary of this. The six meaning clusters produced are staffing, re-planning the change, interim teams and responsibilities, IT fault management, managing public expectations and managing partners and the government.

The two strongest clusters in this analysis are firstly, Cluster 5 that is managing public expectations and then Cluster 2 that has to do with re-planning the change. It is noteworthy here to mention that IT Fault Management is one of the smallest clusters.

The primary concern of the Hybrid documentation during Change x is the managing of public expectations. This is a concern that does not appear in the private sector documentation, but is the strongest in the Hybrid documentation. Communications with the customers of the agency, the government and the change partners appears to be of primary concern to the public sector during Change x.

IT Fault Management is one of the smallest clusters within the Hybrid documentation as this is seen as something which the public sector has to watch closely but does not take core responsibility for.
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

The Overall Cross Sectional Comparative Analysis of Change x

The primary and secondary clusters of meaning for Change x are given in Table 8-2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Private Representations</th>
<th>Primary Cluster</th>
<th>Secondary Clusters</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IT dependencies; Document structuring</td>
<td>People and processes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hybrid Representations</td>
<td>Managing public expectations</td>
<td>People and processes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8-2 Overall Change x Representations

During Change x, there appears to have been a significant shift in the core concerns around the change. While the overall planning and re-planning around the people and processes involved in the change, continues as a central theme within the private and the public sectors, the primary clusters of concern has shifted in the documentation.

The Change Coalition - The Public Private Sector Partnership

During the second half of the change programme (Change x) it appears that the private and the public sector are speaking a more common language around the change. There seems to be an agreement on the people and processes involved in the change and the common audiences affected by the change. Their division of labour has also been realigned during this period, as the consultants take the lead on managing the IT, while the public sector documentation appears to be focussed more around communications.

Difference in Commonality - IT and Communications

Both groups appear to be concerned with issues around IT implementation (which was one of the key reasons for the re-scheduling of the change). However, the private sector concerns, appear to be around managing the IT delivery development and deadlines, while the public sector has focussed their documentation around IT fault management and it is not one of their primary concerns.

This may be a result of their history of having failed IT implementations before and therefore, they are managing the contingencies and risks around the IT delivery, rather than focussing their energy on the actual IT delivery.
In line with this perspective, the public sector concerns are around communication with the core focus being around communicating with the customers of their agency, the public. There appear to be concerns within the agency, about the impact of this continued delay of the changes and the impact on the agency customers. Therefore, the public sector discussions appear to be concerned with creating a communications programme to manage the change with all contingencies.

One key learning that has occurred with the continuous working of the teams together, has been the private sector core clusters, being around public sector processes for communication. Thus creating core clusters during this second phase of the change as document structuring.

A closer look at the documentation created by the private sector during this phase, sees a significant reduction in the number of Power Point presentations but rather more Word documents in the format of the public sector. Also, the internal public sector processes of Q& As and sign offs were implemented even in the private sector documentation. This could also be an indicator that the private sector is getting ready to remove itself from the change process and leave the ownership for this process, in the hands of the public sector change team.

This is further indicated by the presence of a cluster concerned with private sector knowledge management. This is an internal process within the private sector, where the consultants put together material on the lessons that have been learnt in this project for the consulting firm's internal database. This is part of developing the consulting firm's intellectual capital from the projects it works on. This is critical in a structure that has such a high turnover of people.
Analysis of the Overall Documents of the Project

All documentation used in the separate analysis were analysed together in ALCESTE and the results presented below. This was a check to see whether any one theme was overall dominating the change processes, and if these were introduced by the civil servants or the private consultants.

Research Design

As seen above (Figure 8-18) there are four main clusters formed in the overall analysis of all the documentation from the projects. These are fairly evenly spread across all the
Chapter 8: Results: Cross sectional analysis

documentation with Clusters 1 and 2 more closely linked and Clusters 3 and 4 closely linked to each other.

Content of the Clusters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster Titles</th>
<th>Most significant words in the cluster</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Implementation documentation</td>
<td>Header, final organisation, titles, distribution list, appendix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Change logistics</td>
<td>Plan, change units, partner agencies, IT schedule, case migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Customer management</td>
<td>Agency customers, brochures, telephony, communications, advertising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Leadership team roles and behaviours</td>
<td>Change team, central, business unit head, management, employees</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The clusters formed in this analysis are:

Cluster 1: Implementation documentation – This cluster contains the words and sentences that are involved in document structuring. These are the titles and structures within the documentation and the repeated phrases that form the titles and the sign-off lists of people who are involved in the change.

Cluster 2: Change logistics – This cluster contains all the logistical words and phrases used in the project planning and implementation. This included process of IT implementation, the rooms and buildings, involved in the change at each phase and the various process maps that are developed during this process.

Cluster 3: Customer management – The new rules and regulations and processes for managing the customers of this project are included in this cluster. The customer in this case, includes the customers of the agency and the customers of the private sector that are the civil service teams. As the change is designed and planned, there are numerous changes involving the processes and communications with the customer that are mentioned in this cluster.

Cluster 4: Leadership team roles and behaviours – This cluster deals with the human resource management of the project, the setting up of the change management team within the civil service and the processed and people involved in the interim teams management.

Kavita Abraham

213
It appears that the separation between the closer clusters of Clusters 1 and 2 and Cluster 3 and 4 is the division between operations management and people management.

Rhetorical Features of the Clusters

The rhetoric of these clusters of meaning is mainly the language found in the private sector documentation. These predominant words in each of these clusters, are those used by the private sector in their implementation of change management. This could indicate that the private sector language is being used by the public sector in their documentation or that the private sector bears more responsibility for the overall documentation production during this project. This would have implications for the conversion of the public sector since the main anchors that emerged from this analysis, appear to be the core concerns of the representations of the private sector.

The only cluster where there seems to be a high level of public sector input, appears to be the cluster around customer management, but even this has been subsumed under the rhetorical language of the private sector and their concerns about managing their client or customer, the civil service. It is interesting to note though, that the language used to talk about this in the public sector documentation is that of the private sector.

Relation among Clusters
The clusters formed are fairly evenly spread in this analysis. (See Figure 8-19). The main distinction being that of Clusters 1 and 2 being about logistical management, one on the ground (Cluster 1) and one in the documentation (Cluster 2), and people management in Clusters 3 and 4. Cluster 3 and 4 appear relatively close together as the documentation dealing with the leadership team roles and behaviours and those pertaining to the customers may be similar, if not the same.
Summary of the Analysis of the Overall Documentation of the Project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data corpora</th>
<th>Overall change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total word count</td>
<td>80,017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of clusters</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial context units</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary context units</td>
<td>2071</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of words within clusters</td>
<td>77.50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Change logistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership and team roles and behaviours</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 8-20 Summary of Overall Documentation**

Difference in commonality: Although the overarching topics of conversations remain the same across the public and the private sector groups (which may be because of the 'explicitly' common goals and the extended period of close working) the nature of the conversations are different. This difference is seen primarily in the concept of the 'customer' and/or 'client'.

The private sector clusters of conversation are seen to have closer links with the joint conversations. This could indicate increased influence of the private sector over the public sector with the public sector conversations getting lost when the two are joined together.

The difference in meaning of "customer" in the public and private sector also plays a role in clustering. The primary concern of the public sector of customer management is seen here under customer management.
Chapter 9: Results - Longitudinal Analysis

Establishing the impact of the process of socially representing the change

Chapter Summary

This chapter presents the results of four analyses. The analysis of all documentation in the first time period (Change X), the analysis of all documentation in the second time period (Change x), the analysis of the overall documentation of the project, and the analysis of the overall documentation of the project, with the dates and the authors tagged. This is to demonstrate the development, if any, of the conversation around change and whether these core clusters of meaning are in any way related to the time of the project implementation.
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

The aim of this analysis is to look at the documentation produced within the change over the 11-month period of the change and investigate the longitudinal effects on the contents, rhetoric and the discourse of the change over this period. The analysis for the documentation, during the period of Change X and Change x, are presented.

Finally, an analysis of the documentation in the entire change process is analysed, with the documentation tagged on date and author to investigate whether there are any longitudinal effects that can be observed.

The Longitudinal Perspective

Looking at the development of the clustering of the data over time, may provide some insight into the development of the representations of the change over time. Additionally, we could look at the development of the clustering of the 'private' data and the 'Hybrid' data and notice whether there is any convergence or divergence over time. Most importantly, if there is any convergence, in whose direction. That is, which group's clustering is the most changed, and which group's clustering remains more or less the same.

If one is able to see a development of this nature, then we can make some tentative assertions as to which group has a greater impact on the change representations over time. We could understand better the dynamics of the development and see whether one group merely takes on the language of the other, the two groups remain distinct in their language representations, or if there is any convergence as would be expected, after working together for such a long period.
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

Analysis of Joint X Document

Presented here are the results of the analysis of all the documentation created during Change X by the private and public sector reported on the protocol.

Research Design

All the documentation for Analysis VI (Figure 9-1) was collected during the period for Change X. An analysis of this documentation, should provide insight into the predominant concerns over this time. Comparative analysis of this with the cross-sectional analysis would provide insight into the dominant language and representations at the time.

Formation of Clusters

Figure 9-2 Cluster Formation Joint Change X
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

The analysis of the joint documentation for the Change X period creates 5 clusters (Figure 9-2) of meaning. The most distinct cluster of meaning in this dendrogram appears to be Cluster 2, with Clusters 1 and 3, being closest in meaning.

Cluster 2 emerges as the Project Implementation Impact. This is a core area of concern for the private sector and the private sector change models. Clusters 1 and 3 are the change implementation operational plan and the expected behavioural change where the closeness is meaning, is apparent. Both sectors appear to be concerned with the plans being created for the change, but the concern around the behavioural changes being large enough to create an equivalent cluster of its own.

### Content of Clusters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster</th>
<th>Cluster Titles</th>
<th>Most significant words in the cluster</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Change implementation operational plan</td>
<td>Final organisation, design, plans, phased change, pilot office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Project implementation impact</td>
<td>Customers, partner agency, national agency, case migration, contingency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Expected behavioural changes</td>
<td>Leadership, change leaders, telephone, case officers, roles, new offices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Impact of change on partners</td>
<td>Case migration, training, agency, joint IT, compatibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>IT delivery and implementation</td>
<td>Date, contingency, IT risk, case migration, new case files, IT day</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These are the clusters formed from the joint documentation around Change X.

Cluster 1: Change implementation operational plan: This cluster appears to be formed around the main operational issues that are of concern during a change implementation in the private sector. Implementation and the reforms seem to be at the centre of this cluster, with the operational issues, also appearing to be key.

Cluster 2: Project implementation impact: This cluster appears to be formed mainly around the impact of the change on the complaints procedure and the customer experience. It also contains issues of compliance, developing, and reaching the newly-targeted compliance
goals for the agency. This deals with the main issues for the staff and customer of the agency that arise out of the implementation of the change from the customer perspective and the complaints procedure.

Cluster 3: Expected behavioural changes: This cluster deals with all the explanation of the desired behavioural changes expected of the staff in the jobs of the staff in the newly-projected, final organisation. It includes some of the behavioural changes required of the management of the transition team, to cope with the business during the change period.

Cluster 4: Impact of change on change partners: Here we find a cluster of meaning which focuses around the change partners who will be directly affected by this change within the organisation. There is the language around training of partners, national impact and constraints of the partners. This is also a common core category in the implementation change manuals of the private sector.

Cluster 5: IT delivery and implementation: Integral to this change and the change process, is the implementation of a new IT system. This cluster seems to deal with all the language around IT. This contains technical words, deadlines for IT implementation, testing contingency, etc.

Rhetorical Features of the Clusters
The clusters formed during the period Change X are filled with Management Consulting jargon. The majority of documents are Power Point presentations with short, sharp sentences and filled with the ‘can do’ ethos of consulting. There are numerous claims made in the consulting documentation around the history of the consultants, setting them up as legitimate experts in the area of change management, but very little data to back up these claims. This will be seen further in the chapter on argumentation.

The main clusters in this analysis have been formed around the private sector concerns. This may be more an indication of the clarity of the private sector documentation, being
focussed around certain key issues. Also, because they repetitively state these issues numerous times and in different types of documentation. The public sector with their Word documentation, had far more varied concerns that were discussed in more detail and in a more exploratory tone, but not in the format of the private sector Power Point presentations.

**Relation among Clusters**

![Figure 9.3 Relation Among Clusters Joint Change X](image)

Figure 9.3 gives a graphical representation of the distance between the meaning clusters with the cluster names, in the documentation produced during the period of Change X.

During this period of the change process, we can see the distance between the clusters of meaning. It is interesting to note the strength of the cluster around the implementation impact of the project. This was also seen in the dendrogram at the beginning of this section.
where it was apparent that this was the most distinct cluster of meaning in this group and the first to be separated (Cluster 2).

Another interesting feature of the relations between the clusters is the proximity of Clusters 4 and 5. That is, the impact of the change on the change partners and the IT delivery and implementation. This could indicate that there is a close relationship between the delivery of the IT and its implementation and the effect of the change on change partners.

In other words, the IT in the change partners would be the way in which many agencies interact with their partners. However, in this case it appears that the perceived dependence is even higher. They may be using similar or at least, connected IT systems. Therefore, the discourse around IT is very closely linked with the impact on the change partners. This was indeed the case during this implementation. This is also methodologically an interesting insight, otherwise unnoticed, which ALCESTE has enabled.

Another insight which this relational space gives us is the distance among Clusters 1 and 5. In other words, the distinctness of the conversation around the ‘change implementation operational plan’ and the ‘IT delivery and implementation’. Sometimes when such programmes of reform are seen from the outside perspective, or even by internal stakeholders, it appears that these are no more than IT implementation project management.

However we can see from this space, that although IT appears to be a significant element in the implementation, there are other distinct areas of concern, some that are even closer to the change implementation, such as the behavioural changes of the organisational members.
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

Summary of Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data corpora</th>
<th>Joint change X</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total word count</td>
<td>15,623</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of clusters</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial context units</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary context units</td>
<td>380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of words within</td>
<td>82.11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Analysis of the joint documentation of change X, produces five clusters of meaning from the 15,623 words with 82.11% of the words falling within the clusters. See Figure 9-4 for details. The clusters of meaning are the change implementation operational plan, the project implementation impact, the expected behavioural changes, and the impact of change on the change partners and the IT delivery and implementation.

In summary, during this period of change X there were two core issues that the public and private sector change teams noticed. These were (a) the operational plans for the change including the behavioural changes and the IT delivery and (b) the impact of this change on all who would be affected by the change process; that is, the staff, customers and partner agencies. Their most important concern at this time, appeared to be around the impact of the change on the organisation.
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

The Overall Cross Sectional Comparative Analysis of Change X

Looking at the separated text analyses and the overall text analysis, can provide evidence as to which group has had more language influence over the period Change X.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clusters in the private document</th>
<th>Clusters in the hybrid document</th>
<th>Clusters in the joint document</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Processes around agency and customer</td>
<td>Reform change plans and targets</td>
<td>Change Implementation operational plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management and team role descriptions</td>
<td>Public Sector mission and risk management</td>
<td>IT delivery and implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change Design Specifications</td>
<td>Public Sector management and team role</td>
<td>Expected Behaviour changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agency objectives on customer relations</td>
<td>Potential interaction and training with change partners</td>
<td>Project implementation impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Processes for change team and agency communications</td>
<td>Public sector behavioural changes</td>
<td>Impact of change on change partners</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 9-5 Overall Clusters Formed within Change X Documentation

The overall clusters formed during the analysis of the joint documentation during Change X provide some interesting insights into the documentation during this time. See Figure 9-5 for details. The key points to note here are:

- IT implementation has been picked up as a key concern within the joint documentation which was not considered as a separate core theme in within the private or hybrid analysis.

- The core issues around people and processes expressed in both individual analysis, are picked up within the joint documentation analysis.

Two new clusters appear in the joint documentation around the impact of the project on the agency and the impact on the change partners. These clusters appear to be highly connected with the hybrid concern, around managing the customers and partners during the change implementation.
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

It is interesting to see that although some concerns were expressed during the writing of the Hybrid documentation, they appear to not be picked up in the private documentation. These are primarily the core representations around contingency and risk, in terms of managing the agency and the agencies customers. These concerns are picked up in the joint documentation core concerns.

This may be because of the overall density of the Hybrid documentation around these issues, as these appear to be their core concerns, based on their experiences with change implementations. It is interesting to note that these are not core concerns of the private sector at this phase because of the history and ethos of successful change implementation.

Analysis of Joint Documents for Change x
Here all the documents created by the civil servants and the private consultants during Change x are analysed together and presented.

Research Design

![Research Design for Analysis VII Change x](image)

Formation of clusters
Figure 9-7 Formation of Clusters Joint

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cl. 1</td>
<td>190uce</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td>---+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl. 4</td>
<td>239uce</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td>---+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl. 2</td>
<td>142uce</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td>---+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl. 6</td>
<td>172uce</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td>---+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl. 3</td>
<td>104uce</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl. 5</td>
<td>62uce</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 9-7 shows the analysis of the joint document for Change x, produces six meaning clusters, as can be seen on this dendrogram. The most distinct cluster being Cluster 5 – Communicating the change. This is very significant, as this was not an area of great priority during Change X at all, neither internally to the customers nor to the partner agencies. There was clustering around the managing the customers and the partners, but the significant role of communication appears to have arisen during this period of Change x.

The clusters closest in meaning are Clusters 2 and 6 that are customer management and IT issues and support. Here once again we see an interesting shift. During Change X, it appeared that the cluster related to IT and the IT delivery was closest to the cluster on managing the change partners. During Change x, that seems to have shifted to being closest to customer related issues.

The cluster with the change partners (managing stakeholders in the change – Cluster 4), appears to be most closely linked to Cluster 1 – which is the considering the Implementation options. This once again demonstrates the power of this type of analysis to provide insights to the change when used for comparative analysis as this provides insight into the change process where the IT related issues, were shared across partner agencies since the impact of the transformation from Change X to change x was so significant.

Therefore, what were seen as change partners during the period of Change X, developed into core members of the change team and therefore involved in the implementation.
options. It is interesting that the textual data analysis should provide insight into these shifts in the team structures.

**Content of Clusters**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster Titles</th>
<th>Most significant words in the cluster</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Implementation options</td>
<td>Option, preferred, contingency, IT delivery, customer impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Customer management</td>
<td>Telephony, advertising, brochures, face to face, case managers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 New change plans</td>
<td>Pilot office, central change team, location, employee change teams, transfer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Managing stakeholders in the change</td>
<td>Partners, impact, training, case transfer, case migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Communicating the change</td>
<td>Ministerial visit, pilot scheme, advertising, face to face, impact, customer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 IT issues and support</td>
<td>IT delivery, contingency, consultant, issues management, delay</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These clusters are developed out of the analysis of documentation during the period of Change X.

**Cluster 1: Implementation options:** This cluster of meaning contains the language around the new implementation plans that were made to transform Change X into Change x. The language is around the change planning and creation of new detailed plans. Numerous options were created at the time to ensure that approval was reached by all the change partners and so there were numerous re-iterations of the plans during this period of time.

**Cluster 2: Customer management:** This cluster is one that did not appear during the period of Change X. While they were considered as part of the implementation planning, it has now become apparent that specific managers need to be set up, with specific responsibilities to manage the customers during the transition period and to help with the period after the implementation of the change.

**Cluster 3: New change plans:** This refers to the detailed plans created around the new change option that was agreed upon. All the high level planning and organisational design papers had to be adjusted and shifted, to accommodate the new change parameters. There
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

also had to be a clear understanding of how this change blended into the overall reform programme. This involved a lot of re-working of the original plans in the documentation and resulted in the formation of this cluster.

Cluster 4: Managing stakeholders in the change: The stakeholders in this change shifted after Change x was agreed to. What were previously seen as peripheral partakers in the change, had now become the key stakeholders and needed to be involved in the change planning. Managing the new structure of the core team of the change process, and managing the stakeholders, became part of the change discourse.

Cluster 5: Communicating the change: This was the most significant cluster that was found in the analysis. This is the cluster around communication of the change by the central change team, to all involved and impacted by the change, including stakeholders, employees, business units, management and customers.

The significance of this cluster lies in its absence, as an important area of discussion in the first half during Change X, and then its strong presence during Change x. This may be demonstrative of a learning process that has occurred during Change X about the centrality of communications as a core requirement during a change process.

This is even more significant if you consider the words within the cluster, the importance of constant communication with the customer alongside the change process, to enable the customers to keep up with the organisational change. This is because it will impact the services that the customers will receive, after the change has been implemented.

In the case of government agencies, this could be considered even more significant than in the private sector, as the impact of any changes or failures of the organisational change process could have far greater significant impact on the customers’ lives, than in the case of most private sector products on the life of a single individual.
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

Cluster 6: IT issues and support: This cluster is the main constant between Change X and Change x. This content of the clusters have remained largely constant. What has changed over the period is that during Change X, it appeared that IT related issues were closely linked with the change partners. During this period of Change x, it appears that the IT related issues are closely linked with customer management. This will be discussed further, later.

Rhetorical Features of the Clusters

The documentation style at this stage of the project, has changed completely. All documentation surrounding this phase of the change which has to be circulated within the agency are in Word documents. Power Point presentations are done only to support the detailed documentation that is circulated within the agency through the Q & A process for sign off.

Power Point presentations appear during this period for this analysis within the private sector documentation, around knowledge management. These are so strong and repetitive in maintaining their structure that they are primarily responsible for the cluster formed around document structuring.

The ethos of the documentation has also changed at this phase, as the whole change team has been through the ministerial decision to change. There also appears to be a greater team spirit around this period of time, as the project is much smaller and the deadline, more stringent.
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

Relation among Clusters

Figure 9-8 Relation Among Clusters Change x

This relationship graphic (Figure 9-8) is particularly interesting as it demonstrates the significant role that communication has taken during the change process. This cluster is the most distinct cluster and appears the most robust.

There appears to be a relationship between the creation of the implementation options and managing the stakeholders, while the actual new change plans appear closer to the customer management and the IT support issues. This could indicate that the decisions about choosing the implementation options would have been highly dependant on the
stakeholder issues. In the development of the new change plans, the two key issues closest to the actual planning, were customer management and IT related issues.

The significance of communication comes through very clearly in this analysis, as it was not even a cluster of meaning in the documentation around the change at the beginning of the change process. After a period of working together for four months, it is not seen as central to the change process. This is a significant learning for both the public and private sector change teams.

Summary of Analysis for Joint x Documents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data corpora</th>
<th>Joint change x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total word count</td>
<td>39,507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of clusters</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial context units</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary context units</td>
<td>1105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of words within clusters</td>
<td>82.26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The analysis of the joint documentation for change x produces six clusters from the 39,507 words in the documentation with 82.26% of the words in the documentation being within the six clusters. See Figure 9-9. The six clusters are implementation options, customer management, new change plans, managing stakeholders in the change, communicating the change and IT issues and support.
Overall Cross Sectional Analysis for Change x

All the documents created during Change x are analysed together and the core meaning clusters or representational anchors are compared with the individual analyses of the representational anchors of each group.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clusters in the <strong>private</strong> documents</th>
<th>Agency job role designs</th>
<th>Change designs</th>
<th>Document structuring</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private sector knowledge management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisational design</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing the Business Units</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT dependency issues</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clusters in the <strong>hybrid</strong> documents</th>
<th>Staffing</th>
<th>Re-planning the change</th>
<th>Interim teams and responsibilities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT fault management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing public expectations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing partners and the government</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clusters in the <strong>joint</strong> documents</th>
<th>Implementation options</th>
<th>Customer management</th>
<th>New change plans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing stakeholders in the change</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicating the change</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT issues and support</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 9-10 Summary of Clusters Joint x**

Looking at the clusters formed around Change x, the first thing to note is that the conversations during Change x are more numerous. Despite the project having been significantly scaled down and the deadline shorter, the core concerns appear to be more carefully defined. This can be seen quite clearly in the concerns around IT implementation that is picked up in all three analyses.

The private sector during this phase of the change has its concerns structured squarely around the IT dependency issues of the change project plan while the public sector as the recipients of the new IT, appear to have put in place a IT fault management system which they are carefully managing.
The private sector as is part of their ethos has started developing their own knowledge management documentation which is an indicator that they are about to leave the project or at least, the individual consultants involved in this phase of the implementation are about to leave. Therefore, they are in the process of creating knowledge documentation for the next group of consultants to work on.

This is if they plan to continue their involvement in this project as a firm. Otherwise, this documentation may be used in other similar projects. The creation of such documentation is part of the individual appraisals of all consultants and thus much attention is given to this.

Within the joint documentation cluster there also appears to be another clear demarcation of core interests that are around the managing of the impact of the change. This is between managing the stakeholders in the change, customer management and communicating the change.

These three clusters come primarily out of the public sector documentation as the only impact management that the private sector is concerned with at this stage is the managing of the business units involved. This is because the consultants maintained the responsibility at this phase of the change for high-level communication and getting the buy-in from the top management. This is as it would be done in a private sector change implementation.

It is interesting though that through these cluster formations, we can see that managing and communicating with the government and the top level civil servants has been taken on by the public sector.
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

Development of the Conversation around the Change: Comparison of the Meaning

At this point in the analysis we could have a closer look at the development of the rhetoric around change and the meaning clusters created during the two time periods to gain a better understanding of the impact of working together for this extended period of time. We can do this by taking a closer look at the cluster of meaning created by the joint documentation in both time periods. See Figure 9-11 for details.

Within these clusters there appears to be a couple of over-arching themes. After a cursory glance, it may appear that the conversation remains more or less the same over time with a new focus on communication. However, there is a definite development in the tone of the conversation and the rhetoric of the conversation over time.

During time period X, the main clusters of meaning are change implementation operational plan, project implementation impact, expected behavioural changes, impact of change on change partners, IT delivery and implementation. These are classical clusters during the
private sector change models. They provide the prescribed change process with a top-down approach, not only stating the process stages of the change but also with a large focus on the expected final delivery outcomes of the change processes. The rhetoric of these changes is all around implementation, goals, targets, expectations and what ‘will be done’.

The clusters formed during time period x are definitely of a different tone. Gone is the language of great prescription and planning and process. The focus of these clusters appears to be upon managing the people in the change process and the role of communication while managing. These clusters include implementation options, customer management, new change plans, managing the stakeholders in the change, communicating the change and IT issues and support.

Even the most stable cluster (the cluster around IT) has changed the tone of its contents, from one of delivery process and delivery dates, to one of managing the human IT interaction. It has done this by focussing on the issues that the IT creates and supporting the people and processes that IT delivery depends on.

This is also illustrated by the shift in conversation from the expected behavioural changes from Change X that are almost entirely absent during the Change x period. The specific cluster around customer management also appears to make an introduction during the Change x period.
See Table 9-1 for an illustration of the lessons learnt in translating a largely private-sector-driven change model to a more public-sector-implementation model.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area of concern</th>
<th>Private Sector Focus</th>
<th>Public-Private Sector Focus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhetorical style</td>
<td>Top down</td>
<td>Integrated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key area of change team focus</td>
<td>Planning</td>
<td>Communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation planning</td>
<td>Central</td>
<td>Decentralised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication style</td>
<td>Dictatorial</td>
<td>Consensus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management focus</td>
<td>Managing the processes</td>
<td>Managing the people</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9-1 Comparison of Public and Private Sector Focus

Analysis of the Overall Documents of the Project\(^{21}\)

The analysis of all documentation in the whole project is presented here, both to check whether core themes were present throughout the analysis and if so, was any one group dominant in maintaining these themes. Secondly, to see whether there is any relation between the themes and the dates of the documents in which they appear. In other words, check whether there were any longitudinal effects or whether all themes remained more or less stable over time.

\(^{21}\) The documents were also analysed as Private representations over the whole project and Hybrid representations over the whole project. These analysis have not been included in this report at this time.

Kavita Abraham

237
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

Research Design

Change X → 2003 → Change x

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>2003</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>March</td>
<td>April</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Analysis VIII

**Figure 9-12 Overall Analysis**

Formation of the Clusters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster</th>
<th>Project Code</th>
<th>Weight</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cl. 1</td>
<td>570uce</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl. 2</td>
<td>353uce</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl. 3</td>
<td>291uce</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl. 4</td>
<td>391uce</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 9-13 Formation of Cluster in Overall Analysis**

The analysis of the overall documents of the project creates four main meaning clusters. It appears that these are all evenly weighted, and there is no one predominant cluster. See Figure 9-13.

Cluster 1 – change logistics and Cluster 2 – implementation documentation remain more closely linked, while Cluster 3 – leadership and team roles and behaviour is closer to Cluster 4 – customer management.

Kavita Abraham

238
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

Content of the Clusters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster no.</th>
<th>Predominant words in the Cluster (with associated Chi square values)</th>
<th>Cluster Titles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Application(98), case(198), client(71), IT(222), private(97), system(74); 'meetings and any visitors', 'office set up', live stations', 'cases processed'</td>
<td>Change logistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Out(104), business (197), change(108), day_I(125), implement(206), reform(86); 'reform change business implementation', 'planning discussion document', 'discussion on pace and sequence'</td>
<td>Implementation documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Achieve(36), act(65), clear(29), customer(84), competence(50); 'positively set tone for the team', 'drive team thinking forward', 'delivery outcomes promotes trust and respect'</td>
<td>Leadership and team roles and behaviours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Oversee(25), appeal(24), care(24), complaint(67), core(75), design(35); 'resolution rates and complaints', 'high profile complaint', 'teams within customer care'</td>
<td>Customer management</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9.2 Word Lists for Main Clusters of the Overall Analyses

Cluster 1: Change logistics: This cluster of meaning refers to the processes and logistical plans, being put into place to help with the implementing the change process. It centres on the new processes and the management of cases, during the change period and after the change has been implemented.

Cluster 2: Implementation documentation: This is an interesting cluster which appears only in the overall documentation of the change. This cluster includes all the repeated titles and section headings that appear and re-appear as part of the documents that are circulated during the change process. These include the mailing lists and the sections headings of the documents. These are separated here into a Meaning cluster, since they repeatedly appear together in the same format, consistently over numerous documents that are analysed together.

Cluster 3: Leadership and team roles and behaviours – These two clusters now refer to the human and behavioural aspect of the change. This cluster contains expected behaviours for the change team, during the period of change. They also include behavioural changes that are expected from the employees of the agency during the change period and in the organisation after the change. It also includes the expected organisational implications of this new behaviour.
Cluster 4: Customer management – This cluster focuses primarily on the behavioural changes involved while managing the customer through the process. This includes communication with the customers during the process and managing the front office issues around the change.

Rhetorical features of the clusters
(See detailed discussion in Chapter 8)

Relation among Clusters

Figure 9-14 Relation Among Overall Clusters
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

Summary of Analysis of the Overall Documentation of the Project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data corpora</th>
<th>Overall change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total word count 80,017</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of clusters 4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial context units 76</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary context units 2071</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of words within clusters 77.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Change logistics
- Implementation documentation
- Leadership and team roles and behaviours
- Customer management

Figure 9.15 Summary of Overall Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data</th>
<th>Change X</th>
<th>Change x</th>
<th>Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>Hybrid</td>
<td>Joint</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Word Count</td>
<td>9,996</td>
<td>14,280</td>
<td>15,623</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Clusters</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICU’s</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECU’s</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of words included within Clusters</td>
<td>83.27</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>82.11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9-3 Details of Clusters Formed in Change X, Change x and Overall Analysis

This analysis was discussed in detail at the end of the previous chapter. It is presented here in detail to help remind the reader of the meaning clusters and their formation for clarity with reference to the next section.
Chapter 9: Results: Longitudinal Analysis

Analysis of the Overall Documentation Clustering with Date Tags

ALCESTE allows these comparisons of the clustering to be made over time, if one tags the document with the date and then examines whether there is correlation between the clustering and the date tags.

![Figure 9-16 Relation between Meaning Clusters and Dates](image-url)
In this section, we will take a detailed look at the analysis run with all the data from the project; that is, Private and Hybrid, tagging the documentation for date of production.

There appears to be in this longitudinal analysis, a link between the date tags and the cluster formations. If we ascribe the above meaning to these clusters as it is indeed the same analysis, we can say that Cluster 1: change logistics, Cluster 2: implementation documentation, Cluster 3: leadership and team roles and behaviours and Cluster 4: customer management.

Clusters 1 and 2 were the first to be separated from the text as seen in the dendrogram above. What is more interesting here is that Cluster 1 appears to have been created out of documentation around August (08/01), September (09/01) and October (10/01). Cluster 2 seems to have been created around documentation from June (06/01), July (07/01) and August (08/01).

In other words, it seems that the documentation created in August, September, and October is largely responsible for the cluster on change logistics; or we could say that they were largely concerned with the logistics of the change.

The documentation created during June, July and August, was largely populated with the implementation documentation structuring. In other words, this documentation was overly structured with numerous repeated titles and sub-headings so that this was the main cluster of meaning, resulting from that period of time.

It is also important to note here that this does not in any way indicate that this was the sole contents of the discussion, since the content of these documents would relate to all of the created clusters. It only means that this cluster of meaning was produced as a result of the overall analysis. However, it is most closely linked with the documentation produced early on in the project; that is, during June, July and August. Similarly, material out of the documentation produced during the August, September and October period was closely linked with the change logistics of the project.

Kavita Abraham
Cluster 3: Leadership and team roles and behaviour and Cluster 4: customer management are very close to each other and seem to be tightly linked to the documentation created around November, January and April in the following year.

Clusters 1 and 2 appear to be all about the structures and processes and seem to be what was predominant in the discourse at the beginning of the change process, while people-related issues, such as leadership roles and customer management, have come to the forefront towards the end of the analysis.

It is important at this stage, to remind ourselves that it was the same change team and the same change process that the consultants and civil servants worked together on, over a period of time. Therefore, this change in the focus of the documentation, while the content overall may be more evenly spread, needs further explanation and understanding.

This may be attributed to issues of learning, either to work together (thereby requiring less structure) or refocusing on the important issues, during a change process. Another reminder at this stage would be that although the change process remained within the same public service agency and with the same change team, the dimensions of the change process were changed half-way through.

Therefore, the amount of analysis, planning of logistics and movement of people, remained more or less constant throughout the process. Therefore, the amount of documentation produced during this time, also remained consistent, overall.
Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions - The Public Private Sector Partnership

Chapter Summary

The final chapter brings together the research findings, providing an explanation for certain forms of convergence and conversion that have taken place within the New Public Management implementation in this thesis. Four practical implications and areas for future research resulting from this study are also presented.

It is found that there are two distinct language shifts going on between the management consultants. One is in terms of the content words used around the change process and the other is of the rhetorical style and tools being used to communicate the change. While the 'expert community' may claim Dominance, other outcomes include mutual learning in Utopia or complete resistance if the civil servants refuse to shift. The findings of this research on these two dimensions are presented in the chapter.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rhetorical process</th>
<th>Conversion I</th>
<th>Convergence</th>
<th>Conversion II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conversion I</td>
<td>Dominance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convergence</td>
<td></td>
<td>Utopia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conversion II</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Resistance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10-1 Possible Outcomes of the Arranged Marriage of the PPP
Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions

This thesis has challenged the prevailing views of consultants as experts on public-sector management, specifically New Public Management. It provides insights as to why some Public-Private Partnerships do not accomplish their aims.

Current discussions on Public Private Sector Partnerships have focused on the private sector as 'change experts' helping the public sector as 'change recipients'. This thesis increases the scope of the debate by looking at impact of socially constructed knowledge of the individuals and groups involved in this partnership. It has demonstrated that the social representations of the changes that the public and private sectors effect on each other, over time. This suggests that the two groups, mutually learn from each other.

However, the findings of the study provide two important insights into the nature of the impact.

First, the vocabulary analysis shows that it is the consultants that have assumed the vocabulary of the civil servants, demonstrating the enduring control that the latter hold over public-sector change. Thus, private-sector change models can be ineffective in the public-sector, suggesting why some public-private partnerships or “arranged marriages” enforced by the state, fail.

Second, the mutual learning is limited to adopting only the rhetorical style of the other. The civil servants learn the ‘ethos’ of expertise of the consultants (Power Points, etc) creating documents with a higher number of claims with little data and back-ups. The consultants learn the ‘pathos’ of the civil servants, constructing Word documents.

At the core of this thesis, is a vocabulary analysis of the official documentation of a change project, implemented in a public-private sector partnership (2001-2002). This has provided
insight into the social representations of change within the two interacting members of the partnership: the civil servants and the consultants. The vocabulary used is looked at across the two groups (cross-sectionally) and working together (longitudinally) over time.

Theories of representations suggest that language is a manifestation of the representations that we hold in our minds. The analysis of this language helps us gain access to the representations we have. The theory of social representations further demonstrates how during times of conflict or at the boundaries of two disparate communities, representations are constructed among groups. These representations are of the disputed social objects where the ideas held by each community, differ. This changing of social representations happens through the processes of anchoring and objectification, with the functional objective of making the unfamiliar, familiar. The vocabulary clusters are thus taken to be indicators of the anchors that make up the core representations of change.

Between these two participants in this partnership, the first step of the analysis and results, explores the variation in the representations of change. This is done with the help of the co-occurrence analysis (ALCESTE) of the vocabulary, in the change documentation produced by the two groups. These results provide insight into the core representational anchors of both groups.

The second step, the longitudinally analysis, looks at the vocabulary used in the documentation produced by the two groups. This is done after a critical moment in the change process half-way through, when the overall change objectives were downscaled significantly, but the same group was still working together. From this co-occurrence analysis, insight is gained into changes in the anchors of change within the two communities over time.

Theoretically, three hypothetical outcomes are suggested as a result of the partnership. These are based on the ideas of the convergence of the documentation vocabulary and therefore the
Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions

representations of change.

Convergence would occur if the vocabulary of both communities merged or were shared equally. This is one outcome that would imply mutually shared representations with both the public and the private-sector representations, having shifted to a mutually agreed representational space. This would make the case of mutual learning.

Conversion I would occur if the vocabulary used, became predominantly that of the private sector. This would demonstrate the private sector consultants maintain their representational field and civil servants shift their representation, while they learn from the private sector expertise. This is the ideal outcome to support the role of the private sector consultants, as the change management experts and the civil servants, in the passive role of the change recipients.

Conversion II would occur if the vocabulary used, became predominantly that of the public sector. This could suggest that the civil servant representations, are more fundamentally embedded and it has been the private sector representations that have shifted. The expected learning from the private sector expertise has not occurred. Possible reasons for this will be explored later in this chapter.

An overall look at the expected changes:

There are two processes being considered through this thesis. This is the change in content and vocabulary of the documents and the change in the rhetorical style of the documentation.

The consultants as the Experts would expect (from the pre-partnership private sector documentation claims) to hold the position of Dominance (see Table 10.1) with a conversion of rhetorical style and content. According to learning theories within the
Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions

communities of practice literature (Wenger, 2002) it could be expected that people working together over time, if there is mutual learning, would reach the position of *Utopia* where there is convergence of rhetorical style and content. If however, there was no change in the public sector style or content, this would indicate strong *Resistance* on the part of the civil servants.

**Content**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Conversion I</th>
<th>Convergence</th>
<th>Conversion II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conversion I</td>
<td>Dominance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convergence</td>
<td></td>
<td>Utopia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conversion II</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Resistance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10-1 Possible Outcomes of the Arranged Marriage of the PPP

**Conversion II: Indicators of Conversion II**

a. Vocabulary

The vocabulary is analysed with the software package ALCESTE and the co-occurrence analysis, shows the variance in the representations of change at the beginning of the project. Over time the difference between the representational anchors, decreases as expected. What becomes clear in the results is the decrease in the difference between the two representational fields is caused by the process of Conversion II. That is, the civil servants representational field remains steady with the core anchors, remaining the same. What does shift, is the core representations of the change of the consultants.

The predominant meaning cluster (representational anchor) of the change is the ‘people and processes’. The cluster of IT problems has entered both representations. From the table below we can see the stability of the civil service core clusters, with the ‘public sector goals and communications’ and the ‘risk and contingency’, collapsing into one overall cluster of
‘managing the public expectations’. The private sector representations however, seem to have fragmented into four core anchors during Change x. The two key anchors, being ‘the people and processes’ and the ‘IT dependency issues’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Private change representational anchors</th>
<th>Main Clusters Change X</th>
<th>Main Clusters Change x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• People and processes</td>
<td>• People and processes</td>
<td>• People and processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Managing the customer (the civil service)</td>
<td>• IT dependency issues</td>
<td>• IT dependency issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Document structuring (smaller cluster)</td>
<td>• Document structuring (smaller cluster)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Private sector knowledge management (smaller cluster)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hybrid change representational anchors</th>
<th>Main Clusters Change X</th>
<th>Main Clusters Change x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• People and processes</td>
<td>• People and processes</td>
<td>• People and processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Public sector goals and communications</td>
<td>• IT fault management</td>
<td>• IT fault management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Risk and contingency</td>
<td>Managing public expectations</td>
<td>Managing public expectations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10.2 Development of Meaning Clusters over Changes X and x in each Separate Group

This argument for Conversion II becomes even clearer if we look at the predominant meaning clusters, found in the analysis of the overall documentation of Change X and Change x. Clearly the private sector representations are more dominant during the analysis of Change X documentation.

However during Change x, it appears that the core anchors of meaning are almost identical to the hybrid meaning clusters. This suggests that the public sector documentation has a much stronger role.
Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>anchors</th>
<th>IT issues</th>
<th>IT issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Project impact (on the civil service)</td>
<td>Communications</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10-3 Development of the Overall Meaning Clusters from Change X to Change x

b. The shift of influence:
Looking at the meaning clusters produced during an analysis of the overall cluster during Change X and Change x, it can be seen clearly that for Change X, the overall clusters are much closer in meaning to the private sector clusters. This is not because of the number of documents, since these are similar from each group over each time period.

The meaning clusters during Change x are however, much closer to those of the hybrid documentation, demonstrating the greater influence of the public sector on the core clusters and thus, the anchors of the representations of change at this stage.

Fig 10-4 Development of Detailed Meaning Clusters from Change X to Change x

The Conversion II, which has occurred during this period of change, appears to be fundamentally around the issues of communication. The civil service is concerned
throughout the encounter with communications with the public, from their service-driven ethos. After the shock of the rescaling of the change, it appears that this has become the primary concern through the change.

Possible Explanations for Conversion II

Civil servants are resistant to change – The civil service as a social institution is resistant to change. This could be one reason why Conversion II is experienced. The very nature of institutions as discussed in Chapter 4 is one that is resistant to change. Institutions are bureaucratic and endure the long duree and are thus, often seen as the organisational setting, most resistant to change. The short period of this change project, investigated in this thesis, may be just too short for any representational changes to occur within institutional settings.

Civil servants are experts on public sector change – The British Civil Service has over the last three decades, been involved in a constant reformation or restructuring of one form or another, and they may the fatigued change recipient. The civil servant change team that was looked at in this thesis, had been through some fundamental organisational changes of the same nature, within the last ten years. Thus they had developed within themselves, the mechanisms and expertise to implement change.

As they were not given any ownership of the change processes in this project, their knowledge and skills were wasted for the period of Change X. The consultants in their position as the change experts, only began to listen after the restructuring. Later they depended on the civil service expertise and the change models shifted to using the civil service expertise. Then the consultants played the roles of the facilitators of this change.

Consultants went native because of the lack of carrots and sticks – Another possible explanation for Conversion II, is the nature of the private sector and the resulting nature of the private sector change models. Consultants are experts in private sector change and have
developed very successful private sector change models (see Chapter 3). This is where their expertise has grown and developed, as they enact these change models over numerous companies in the private sector.

The nature of the private sector is fundamentally different from the public sector. The ‘carrots and sticks’ (to use a consulting term) available to change implementers are different from what exists in the public sector. Within the private sector, you can implement behavioural change with the Carrot – ‘if you change you behaviour, I will give you more money or a promotion’, or the Stick – ‘if you don’t change your behaviour you will be fired or not receive your bonus or promotion’. These are very clear, tangible behavioural motivators that work effectively in the private sector.

Within the public sector, the staff surveys consistently show that their main motivators are public service and job security. The Carrots and Sticks that the change models are based on, are no longer meaningful in the public sector.

Thus although consultants are experts in implementing change in the private sector, these models may need some fundamental re-thinking, based on the nature of the new context in which they are working. Alternately, the consultants could carry the mantle of the change facilitators of change, using the expertise which the British Civil Service holds.

Convergence: Indicator of Convergence - Argumentation

Convergence has occurred in the documentation style and argumentation between Change X and Change X. The argumentation style (logic of the documents), valuation tone, and presentation style (imposing the limitations of Power Point presentations vs Word documents) of the documentation during change X of the consultants and civil servants, are all fundamentally different.
Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions

Both groups documentation are standardized, as they are trained very early in the community to produce this style of text. Using Atlas.ti an analysis of typical documents from each community was carried out, using Toulmin’s argumentation structure of ethos, pathos, logos, data, backings and warrants. The most striking differences in the documentation are shown below.

**Variations in Argumentation Style of the Consultants and Civil Servants.**

![Figure 10-5 Examples and Percentage of Claims in Documentation](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Typical Private sector claims</th>
<th>Typical Public sector claims</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- We are the best consulting firm worldwide</td>
<td>- We will implement the changes on 4 stages.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- We employ the brightest and the best individuals</td>
<td>- Our aim in to improve public service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- We offer solutions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- We work with the best partners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During Change X, the consultants’ documents are between 78 - 92% claims, followed by minimal warrants and backups. The valuation tone of these documents is predominantly that of establishing the ethos of expertise. Numerous claims are made of their positions, as the change experts within minimal data and backup. The arguments constructed in Power Point presentations, aim to establish the ethos of expertise with claims such as, ‘we are the change experts; we have implemented successful organisational change in agencies’ as seen
The documentations shows that they also provide tools for implementation, with the same valuation tone of the experts. For example, ‘to implement change the business teams must change structure, the change team will move these jobs, the IT will substantially change the day job of three quarters of the employees’. 

The civil servants documentation follows a very different argumentation style. Also standard in its argumentation structure, these documents (mainly written in Word format) are filled mainly with backup (68%) with very few claims being made. They are based in the valuation tone of pathos and based on appealing to the ideal of providing a better service to the public, with some logos (30%) of the text). Typical arguments in this document include statements such as, ‘to serve our customer better we will, in order to best aid the partner agencies, to ensure that the information technology is delivered on time for the job’.

![Figure 10.6 Examples and Percentage of Backup in Documentation](image)

| **Typical Private sector backup** | - Look at our lists of clients  
- We are paid the highest day rate per consultant |
| **Typical Public sector backup** | - Business Unit 2 needs 35 more support staff  
The employee time sheets need to be submitted in a timely fashion |
This analysis clearly shows there has been convergence over time. This is in the argumentation style of the documents. The consultants have been forced to increase the amount of backing that they provide in the documents and reduce the number of claims. They also provide more documentation in Word and have reduced the number of free-floating claims in the text. The tone of the documentation has also changed from depending on the ethos of expertise, to appealing more to the pathos of public sector service.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area of concern</th>
<th>Private Sector Documents: Change X</th>
<th>Public-Private Sector Documents: Change x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhetorical style</td>
<td>Top down</td>
<td>Integrated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key area of change team focus</td>
<td>Planning</td>
<td>Communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation planning</td>
<td>Central</td>
<td>Decentralised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication style</td>
<td>Dictatorial</td>
<td>Consensus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management focus</td>
<td>Managing the processes</td>
<td>Managing the people</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10-4 Rhetorical Differences in the Clusters between Change X and x.

The civil servants have reduced the quantity of the data and backup in their documentation while maintaining the valuation tone. The documentation produced jointly, during Change x shows that claims, warrants, data and backup are more evenly spread out across the documents. The valuation tone has shifted closer to the civil service pathos of establishing consensus, and appealing to the public sector service ideals.

**The Overall Shifting Core Concerns Over Time**

The longitudinal analysis of the overall documentation data using the document production dates as tags (Chapter 9) shows that when the team came together (Change X), the primary concerns dealt with the change logistics and the implementation documentation structures (private sector driven). Over time (Change x), the key themes of the documentation shifted to delineating the roles of the people involved in the change and post-change, with a central focus on customer management. These are public sector driven, as communication with the public and their partner agencies have appeared in the public sector documentation from the
Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions

beginning of the project, as a co

This function of ALCESTE, using the tags as production dates, provides strong evidence as to the shift of the core issues within the documentation, over time. This is particularly powerful when all of the documentation is analysed together, as it shows which core meaning clusters are predominant overall in the documentation over time. The link between the meaning clusters and the dates of document production shows, within ALCESTE in the 2x2 grid (relation among Clusters).

The Overall findings of this research:

Based on the expectations of conversion I and II and convergence, it was found that 2 distinct shifts have taken places in the language of the consultants and civil servants. Conversion II has occurred in the content of the language used, or in other words the Consultants have taken on the language of the civil servants. Convergence has taken place in the process with the Consultants and Civil Servants mutually learning some of the rhetorical features of the other and using this in the change implementation documentation.

Content

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Conversion I</th>
<th>Convergence</th>
<th>Conversion II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conversion I</td>
<td>Dominance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convergence</td>
<td></td>
<td>Utopia</td>
<td>XX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conversion II</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Resistance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig 10-1 Outcomes of the Arranged Marriage of the PPP

Discussion and Conclusions

Having worked with the representations of change in the documentation of the public-private
sector partnership, there have been some insights into the nature of this “arranged marriage”
between the two fundamentally different organisational groups. This thesis has explored the
nature of the overlap of documentation text over a period of time, divided into two distinct
periods around a critical event.

We have seen the greater divergence of the rhetoric in the initial phases of the “marriage”
which then during the second time period (Change x) appear to come together in the form of
conversion. *Conversion, in this context has occurred in the process of accommodation*
(Berger and Luckmann, 1966) rather than assimilation or the reaching of a consensus via the
process of Convergence.

This convergence seen in this “arranged marriage” of the consultants and the civil servants
through the process of normative isomorphism (DiMaggio and Powell, 1983), of the
consultants shifting towards the rhetoric of the civil servants over time. This would suggest
that through the investigation of the social representations of the two communities, we can
see that the social construction of the consultants as the change experts, has shifted within
this partnership over time because of the lack of success of their project plans over Change
X.

This may serve as an example of a public-private partnership, where although the
consultants were brought into this “marriage” as the experts, they were the ones who had to
learn a new language and shift their change models over time, to be closer to those of the
institution of the public sector.

Creating change in institutional settings, thus appears to require a different kind of change
expertise, and the dependence on the institutional actors for the expert knowledge required to
implement the change, is much greater than within the private sector. In the private sector,
the ethos of hard Carrots and Sticks and coercive isomorphism, plays a greater role, to
enforce or encourage change.
Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions

Investigating social representations therefore, can provide a key insight into the reasons for behaviours. The understanding of these fundamentals can provide some guidance, during periods of change. For long lasting change, the engagement with social representations and the shifting of some of these fundamental anchors of these representations, albeit a painful process, may create the conditions for more long lasting change. If the anchors and some objectifications are shifted there is a great possibility of the required behavioural changes happening more naturally and most importantly, being more sustainable.

I. Establishing Difference: Cross Sectional Analysis => Conversion

Social representations: The thesis shows the difference in the conversations between the public and private sectors, involved in the same process over time. Although all thematic clusters, appear to have the same core anchor of the people and processes involved in the change, there appears to be variance in the other clusters across the two groups in both time periods.

Drawing on social representations theory, there appears to be an overlapping of the core anchors of the representations of the change around the issues of people and processes in the change. The other core anchors around the social representations of change, appear to be different during both time periods. That is, even after the groups has been working together towards the same goal over a period of time.

The private sector representational cores do not have any rhetoric of failure or risk in them and appear to be primarily concerned with standard private sector concerns of project management. It is only in the hybrid clusters that the public appear to have greater significance in time period X, around managing risk, contingency and communications. Finally in time period x, it becomes a core cluster with managing public expectations and dealing with failures.
II. Creating Similarity: Longitudinal Main Themes => Convergence

Social representing: The impact of the varying social representations of change is seen here in the development of the overall thematic clusters, over time. Although it appears once again that the core representations remain the same, around people and processes and the IT issues, the primary differences are seen in the core anchoring of the change process in communications by the public sector that become more accepted during the second time period x.

In other words, it appears from this analysis that the private sector language of change, has shifted closer to the public sectors, with the core concern being about communications, both internally and externally to the project and agency. This contrasts with time period X, where the core representations are determined by the private sector change models of project management. Thus we can see that the result of the longitudinal analysis is Conversion II.

Practical Implications

Social representations - Being vs. becoming (cross sectional vs. longitudinal). In this thesis we have seen the implications of the varying social representations of change in a public-private sector partnership. The role of the social representations and the process of social representing, have been seen in this process.

In the case of longitudinal projects, the recommendation is that the process of social representing, be given more attention as the ownership of the project shifts from the hands of the ‘experts’ to the implementers. The label of ‘expert’ is questioned when the expertise is being transferred across industries.

This is a case for re-visiting the raison d’etre of the civil service and its fundamental principles. This thesis explores the ideas of New Public Management and the style of
implementation, using private sector change models. These change models do not take into consideration, the ideas around the institution of the civil service and its fundamental ethos of public service.

It is recommended that these private sector change models, need to be adjusted or indeed re-developed within an institutional framework, with attention being given to the fundamentally different role that the civil service plays in society, and thus the nature of its employees who are implementing these changes.

The case for a re-thinking of the professionalisation of the civil service – Normative Isomorphism and its drivers. Looking at the development of management consulting as an industry and its role as the ‘change experts’, are considered in this thesis. The idea that they are in the process of implementing new and fundamentally different processes and learning across industries, is questioned using the idea of isomorphism.

Consultants may in this framework, be implementers of isomorphic changes through the process of mimetic or normative isomorphism. This would recommend a shift in their position as generic change experts, towards a more specified ‘best practice implementers’ framework.

'It is to be expected that [this] re-cycling of common sense does not in fact, result in a reasonably faithful reproductions of the scientific meaning of a theory. Instead, it is mainly those components that are immediately accessible to everyday understanding which are selected (Thorngate and Plouffe, 1987) and reduced to a ‘figurative schema’ (Herzlich. 1975)' (Wagner and Hayes, 2005, p.136).

The case for the developing of a change models that are civil service driven and institutionally sound. As one of the key features of the civil service in implementing the
political agenda of an elected government, which changes every four years or at the very least, once in three terms in the United Kingdom, this thesis suggests that they are experts in implementing change in the public sector. Within the civil service, lies the expertise of having undergone numerous changes and having implemented often fundamentally different policies, across agencies.

It is this expertise that could be called upon while implementing change in the public sector. This is because the inherent knowledge of the ethos is well understood and arguments for the change, would be within a consistent argumentation domain and valuation tone. Also because ownership of the change, would be firmly in the hands of the people who need to implement the change and work with its consequences.

'The concepts and theory fragments which survive popularisation are not without connection to the original theory, and do preserve some of the concept’s structural coherences. Nevertheless, the original content of the psychoanalytical theory is more of a roughly sketched image or metaphor than a reasonably faithful portrayal in its 'recycling as common sense' (Moscovici, 1961/1976) as quoted in Wagner and Hayes, 2005.

Contributions

Triangulation of textual data – Working with the textual data on ALCESTE and conducting cross sectional and longitudinal analysis of the documents, was a contribution of this thesis. The data was also worked on to develop and argumentation analysis, within Atlas.ti. The two-by-two analyses within ALCESTE, provided insights that would have been difficult to reach otherwise, given the vastness of the amount of data.

Analysing a discussion over time - The analysis tagging the documentation by date, showing the development of the core themes of the change over time, was uniquely possible because of the functionality of ALCESTE. This analysis demonstrates a different way in which ALCESTE may be used, to show differences or developments of representations over time.
Chapter 10: Discussion and Conclusions

Developing a protocol for the reporting of ALCESTE analyses - In the literature review, and papers presented on ALCESTE thus far, it appears that there is no standardised protocol for reporting ALCESTE data. This makes the reporting of each result, quite different.

This thesis develops a protocol of the reporting of ALCESTE data taking four points in the ALCESTE results as the key focal points to provide maximum insight into the data, from the approximately 50 pages of analysis report that each analysis creates. These are the dendograms (the formation of clusters), the lemmitisation word lists (the content of the clusters), the sentence lists (the rhetoric of the clusters) and the two dimensional cluster plot (the relation among the clusters).

Limitations

Limitations of the argumentation analysis: The Atlas.ti analysis conducted, based on looking at the argumentation themes of ethos, pathos and logos, played a much smaller role in the providing insight into the context, than hoped during the research design phase. As the majority of documentation in both communities is much standardised, be it Power Point for the consultants or Word documents for the civil servants, the argumentation structure appeared to be fairly pre-determined. If this research was being conducted on the spoken word, where there are far less constraints placed on the flow by the process of document structuring\(^2\), there would have been additional insights into the views of the individual participants of both groups.

Limitations of the analysis of documentation: This thesis is based on document analysis that has its limitations. The reason for this in this thesis, was that the researcher was a participant in the change-management consultant team. It would have added to the research, if it was

\(^2\) Document structuring even appeared as a core cluster during change X, indicating the amount of effort put into training and developing the structures of the documents at the initial phases of the change process.
possible to use some interview data to understand the perspectives of the participants in the change. Also to look at the language development in their spoken word to do with the change, over time periods X and x.

Limitations of a text analysis: During the change process, consultants started making most of their documents using Power Point presentations. Over time they slowly shifted to using Word documents during Change x. The analysis of the Power Point slides, their structure, imagery and logic, may have provided additional insight. For this thesis, the text was taken from the slides and analysed. In this process, some of the meaning of the text was lost. During the process of the research, the researcher makes numerous selective choices. These slides were not pictorially analysed. This would be an interesting piece of follow-up research.

Future Research

Understanding the role of institutional actors in embedding the new representations of change: Wagner and Hayes (2005) based on research presented in their book, provide a two-step process for creating change. Firstly, ‘Providing evidence by homogamic communication (conversation within the community with shared anchors of their representations) and selective information choice is the first step towards creating a reality.

The second step is to enact beliefs, derived from representations.’ In other words, creating a new reality, involves the presentation of the shift by legitimate members of the community, which is changing. This is followed by a series of actions within the new framework that result in demonstrable benefits to the change community. This thesis has looked at the first step within this process and further research would be required, to investigate the role of the legitimate members of the civil servant community. Such a study would also be able to provide insight into whether mimetic isomorphism would occur both within and across agencies in the civil service.
A study into the impact of prescribed document structuring on representations: As mentioned in the previous section, it would have been beneficial to be able to conduct an analysis of the textual data in the context in which it was created. An image discourse analysis would have provided the tools for such an analysis, looking at the context of the PowerPoint slides, their internal and external logic, their contextual role in establishing expertise, and their impact on change participants who are not accustomed to presenting their case in such a structure.
APPENDIX

ALCESTE analysis example

Overall date tagged documents analysis

Kavita Abraham
Plan de l'analyse : joint .pl ; Date : 17/5/04; Heure : 11:10:49

C:\&_0\joint .txt
ET 1 1 1 1
A 1 1 1
B 1 1 1
C 1 1 1
D 1 1 1 0 0
A1 1 0 0
A2 3 0
A3 1 1 0
B1 0 4 0 1 1 0 1 1 0
B2 2 2 0 0 0 0 0 0
B3 10 4 1 1 0 0 0 0 0 0
C1 0 121
C2 0 2
C3 0 0 1 1 1 2
D1 0 2 2
D2 0
D3 5 a 2
D4 1 -2 1
D5 0 0

A1 : Lecture du corpus

A2 : Traitement des fins de ligne du corpus :
N° marque de la fin de ligne :
Nombre de lignes étoilées : 76

A2 : Calcul du dictionnaire

Nombre de formes distinctes : 4092
Nombre d'occurrences : 80017
Fréquence moyenne par forme : 20
Nombre de hapax : 1212
Fréquence maximum d'une forme : 5114

74.07% des formes de fréq. < 9 recouvrent 10.66% des occur.;
86.71% des formes de fréq. < 23 recouvrent 20.34% des occur.;
92.57% des formes de fréq. < 45 recouvrent 30.29% des occur.;
95.82% des formes de fréq. < 73 recouvrent 40.07% des occur.;
97.92% des formes de fréq. < 126 recouvrent 50.11% des occur.;
99.05% des formes de fréq. < 257 recouvrent 60.16% des occur.;
99.58% des formes de fréq. < 5114 recouvrent 99.95% des occur.;
99.83% des formes de fréq. < 1126 recouvrent 99.95% des occur.;
100.00% des formes de fréq. < 2449 recouvrent 99.95% des occur.;
100.00% des formes de fréq. < 5114 recouvrent 99.95% des occur.;

A3 : Liste des clés et valeurs d'analyse (ALC_CLE) :

G 2 locations, country names
H 1 prepositions indicating a movement
J 2 Numbers
K 0 Numbers in figures
M 2 Words in capital letters (NAMES)
U 0 Words not found in DICIN (if it exists)
V 1 Irregular verbs
W 2 Surnames
X 1 Frequent unrecognised forms
0 2 Function-words not classed
1 2 Modals (or likely to be)
2 2 Words indicating modalisation (function words)
3 2 Words indicating spatial relationships (function words)
4 2 Words indicating temporal relationships (function words)
5 2 Words indicating intensity (function words)
6 2 Words indicating discursive relationships (function words)
7 2 Personal pronouns, possessive adjectives (function words)
8 2 Demonstratives, indefinites and relatives (function words)
9 2 Auxiliaries to be and to have (function words)

1 Unrecognised forms

A34 : Fréquence maximale d'un mot analysé : 3000

Nombre de mots analysés : 2228
Nombre de mots supplémentaires de type "r" : 413
Nombre de mots supplémentaires de type "s" : 115
Nombre d'occurrences retenues : 77424
Moyenne par mot : 28.697080
Nombre d'occurrences analysables (fréq.> 3) : 46940 soit 61.935110% 
Nombre d'occurrences supplémentaires : 28849
Nombre d'occurrences hors fenêtre fréquence : 1635

B1: Sélection des uce et calcul des données

B11: Le nom du dossier des résultats est && 0
B12: Fréquence minimum d'un "mot" analysé : 4
B13: Fréquence maximum d'un "mot" retenu : 9999
B14: Fréquence minimum d'un "mot étoilé" : 1
B15: Code de fin d'U.C.E. : 1
B16: Nombre d'occurrences par U.C.E. : 26
B17: Elimination des U.C.E. de longueur < 0

Fréquence minimum finale d'un "mot" analysé : 4
Fréquence minimum finale d'un "mot étoilé" : 1

Nombre de mots analysés : 1196
Nombre de mots supplémentaires de type "r" : 237
Nombre total de mots : 1433
Nombre de mots supplémentaires de type "s" : 115
Nombre de lignes de Bl DICB : 1948
Nombre d'occurrences analysées : 46940

Nombre d'u.c.i. : 76
Nombre moyen de "mots" analysés / u.c.e. : 22.665380
Nombre d'u.c.e. : 2071
Nombre d'u.c.e. sélectionnées : 2071
100.00% des u.c.e. sont sélectionnées
Nombre de couples : 67679

B2: Calcul de DONN.l

Nombre de mots par unité de contexte : 20
Nombre d'unités de contexte : 1582
B2: Calcul de DONN.2

Nombre de mots par unité de contexte : 23
Nombre d'unités de contexte : 1396

B3: Classification descendante hiérarchique de DONN.1

Elimination des mots de fréquence > 3000 et < 4
0 mots éliminés au hasard soit .00 % de la fenêtre
Nombre d'items analysables : 1035
Nombre d'unités de contexte : 1582
Nombre de "1" : 36708

B3: Classification descendante hiérarchique de DONN.2

Elimination des mots de fréquence > 3000 et < 4
0 mots éliminés au hasard soit .00 % de la fenêtre
Nombre d'items analysables : 1035
Nombre d'unités de contexte : 1396
Nombre de "1" : 35952
Cl. intersection des classes

Nom du dossier traité : C:\&_0\ 
Suffixe de l’analyse : 121 
Date de l’analyse : 17/ 5/**
Interession des classes RCDH1 et RCDH2

Nombre minimum d’uce par classe : 104

DONN.1 Nombre de mots par uc : 20
    Nombre d’uc : 1582

DONN.2 Nombre de mots par uc : 23
    Nombre d’uc : 1396

1605 u.c.e classées sur 2071 soit 77.50 %

Nombre d’u.c.e. distribuées : 1928

Tableau croisant les deux partitions :

RCDH1 * RCDH2

classes |  1   |  2   |  3   |  4

poids * 590 530 363 445

1 802 * 570 174 23 35
2 383 * 17 353 9 4
3 308 * 1 1 291 15
4 435 * 2 2 40 391

Tableau des chi² (signés) :

RCDH1 * RCDH2

classes |  1   |  2   |  3   |  4

poids * 590 530 363 445

1 802 * 1059 -23 -228 -270
2 383 * -154 1003 -84 -130
3 308 * -158 -135 1372 -68
4 435 * -240 -205 -34 1412

Classification Descendante Hiérarchique...
Dendrogramme des classes stables (À partir de B3_rcdhl) :

Cl. 1 ( 570uce) |------------------|+ 15 |------------------|
Cl. 2 ( 353uce) |------------------|+ 16 |
Cl. 3 ( 291uce) |------------------|+ 13 |
Cl. 4 ( 391uce) |------------------|

Classification Descendante Hiérarchique...
Dendrogramme des classes stables (à partir de B3_rcdh2) :

```
15
-+-
Cl. 1 (570uce) ---------------  
570 u.c.e. cl. 1

16
-+-
Cl. 2 (353uce) ---------------  
353 u.c.e. cl. 2

13
-+-
Cl. 3 (291uce) ---------------  
291 u.c.e. cl. 3

13
-+-
Cl. 4 (391uce) ---------------  
391 u.c.e. cl. 4
```

C2: profil des classes

Chi2 minimum pour la sélection d'un mot : 5.35

Nombre de mots (formes réduites) : 1433
Nombre de mots analysés : 1196
Nombre de mots "hors-corpus" : 115
Nombre de classes : 4

1605 u.c.e. classées soit 77.498790%

Nombre de "1" analysés : 29757
Nombre de "1" suppl. ("r") : 15512

Distribution des u.c.e. par classe...

1ère classe : 570. u.c.e.10288. "1" analysés ; 6245. "1" suppl..
2ème classe : 353. u.c.e. 6047. "1" analysés ; 3138. "1" suppl..
3ème classe : 291. u.c.e. 5842. "1" analysés ; 2560. "1" suppl..
4ème classe : 391. u.c.e. 7580. "1" analysés ; 3569. "1" suppl..

Classe n° 1 => Contexte A

Nombre d'u.c.e. : 570. soit : 35.51 %
Nombre de "une" (a+r) : 16533. soit : 36.52 %
Nombre de mots analysés par uce : 18.05

num  effectifs  pourc.  chi2 identification

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>20.</td>
<td>20.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>16.</td>
<td>23.</td>
<td>69.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>77.</td>
<td>125.</td>
<td>61.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>10.</td>
<td>10.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>4.</td>
<td>4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>12.</td>
<td>14.</td>
<td>85.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>51.</td>
<td>59.</td>
<td>86.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>11.</td>
<td>13.</td>
<td>84.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>14.</td>
<td>16.</td>
<td>87.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>25.</td>
<td>32.</td>
<td>78.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>61.</td>
<td>103.</td>
<td>59.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>3.</td>
<td>3.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>12.</td>
<td>16.</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73</td>
<td>19.</td>
<td>33.</td>
<td>57.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89</td>
<td>7.</td>
<td>8.</td>
<td>87.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96</td>
<td>8.</td>
<td>9.</td>
<td>88.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>102</td>
<td>10.</td>
<td>14.</td>
<td>71.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>104</td>
<td>5.</td>
<td>5.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>106</td>
<td>118.</td>
<td>213.</td>
<td>55.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>108</td>
<td>20.</td>
<td>36.</td>
<td>55.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>115</td>
<td>6.</td>
<td>8.</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>117</td>
<td>6.</td>
<td>6.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>122</td>
<td>4.</td>
<td>4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Column 1</td>
<td>Column 2</td>
<td>Column 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>129</td>
<td>98. 108.</td>
<td>90.74</td>
<td>154.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>136</td>
<td>14. 16.</td>
<td>87.50</td>
<td>19.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>137</td>
<td>37. 50.</td>
<td>74.00</td>
<td>33.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>143</td>
<td>37. 44.</td>
<td>84.09</td>
<td>46.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>147</td>
<td>47. 54.</td>
<td>87.04</td>
<td>64.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>153</td>
<td>15. 19.</td>
<td>78.95</td>
<td>15.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>161</td>
<td>11. 16.</td>
<td>68.75</td>
<td>7.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>168</td>
<td>5. 5.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>9.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>169</td>
<td>41. 49.</td>
<td>83.67</td>
<td>51.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>170</td>
<td>51. 73.</td>
<td>69.86</td>
<td>39.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>175</td>
<td>17. 27.</td>
<td>62.96</td>
<td>9.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>186</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>7.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>191</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>7.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>198</td>
<td>12. 18.</td>
<td>66.67</td>
<td>7.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>202</td>
<td>20. 35.</td>
<td>57.14</td>
<td>7.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>208</td>
<td>198. 353.</td>
<td>56.09</td>
<td>83.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>229</td>
<td>12. 17.</td>
<td>70.59</td>
<td>9.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>230</td>
<td>10. 12.</td>
<td>83.33</td>
<td>12.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>232</td>
<td>8. 8.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>14.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>234</td>
<td>8. 8.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>14.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>236</td>
<td>16. 20.</td>
<td>80.00</td>
<td>17.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>237</td>
<td>71. 103.</td>
<td>68.93</td>
<td>53.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>244</td>
<td>17. 17.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>31.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>246</td>
<td>3. 3.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>5.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>254</td>
<td>15. 17.</td>
<td>88.24</td>
<td>20.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>264</td>
<td>23. 35.</td>
<td>65.71</td>
<td>14.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>273</td>
<td>11. 11.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>20.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>280</td>
<td>10. 13.</td>
<td>76.92</td>
<td>9.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>282</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>7.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>287</td>
<td>30. 31.</td>
<td>96.77</td>
<td>51.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>303</td>
<td>12. 12.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>21.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>305</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>7.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>306</td>
<td>5. 5.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>9.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>316</td>
<td>9. 9.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>16.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>323</td>
<td>33. 58.</td>
<td>56.90</td>
<td>12.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>327</td>
<td>8. 8.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>14.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>335</td>
<td>11. 14.</td>
<td>78.57</td>
<td>11.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>337</td>
<td>93. 159.</td>
<td>58.49</td>
<td>40.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>341</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>7.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>345</td>
<td>30. 51.</td>
<td>58.82</td>
<td>12.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>350</td>
<td>8. 8.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>14.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>351</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>7.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>370</td>
<td>11. 12.</td>
<td>91.67</td>
<td>16.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>372</td>
<td>7. 7.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>12.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>373</td>
<td>15. 22.</td>
<td>68.18</td>
<td>10.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>390</td>
<td>3. 3.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>5.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>394</td>
<td>22. 25.</td>
<td>88.00</td>
<td>30.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>415</td>
<td>9. 9.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>16.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>416</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>7.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>418</td>
<td>6. 6.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>10.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>431</td>
<td>23. 23.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>42.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>440</td>
<td>16. 26.</td>
<td>61.54</td>
<td>7.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>443</td>
<td>25. 31.</td>
<td>80.65</td>
<td>28.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>445</td>
<td>13. 15.</td>
<td>86.67</td>
<td>17.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>448</td>
<td>5. 5.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>9.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>452</td>
<td>8. 10.</td>
<td>80.00</td>
<td>8.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>485</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>7.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>486</td>
<td>33. 34.</td>
<td>97.06</td>
<td>57.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>487</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>7.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>492</td>
<td>5. 5.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>9.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>496</td>
<td>32. 35.</td>
<td>91.43</td>
<td>48.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>499</td>
<td>5. 5.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>9.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>522</td>
<td>33. 44.</td>
<td>75.00</td>
<td>30.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>523</td>
<td>40. 69.</td>
<td>57.97</td>
<td>15.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>525</td>
<td>7. 7.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>12.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>535</td>
<td>32. 52.</td>
<td>61.54</td>
<td>15.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>541</td>
<td>9. 13.</td>
<td>69.23</td>
<td>6.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Line</td>
<td>Column</td>
<td>Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>552</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>553</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>571</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>583</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>72.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>592</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>601</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>612</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>625</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>627</td>
<td>222</td>
<td>391</td>
<td>56.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>630</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>633</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>83.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>634</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>94.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>635</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>636</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>642</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>85.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>660</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>68.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>663</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>88.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>666</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>667</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>680</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>683</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>86.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>689</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>694</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>711</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>85.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>715</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>716</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>72.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>722</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>727</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>73.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>735</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>737</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>747</td>
<td>212</td>
<td>390</td>
<td>54.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>749</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>753</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>83.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>754</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>68.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>755</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>56.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>759</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>65.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>761</td>
<td>291</td>
<td>347</td>
<td>83.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>763</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>97.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>764</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>86.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>766</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>768</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>60.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>770</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>83.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>799</td>
<td>246</td>
<td>294</td>
<td>83.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>804</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>805</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>80.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>806</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>808</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>809</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>828</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>52.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>838</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>839</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>857</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>858</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>83.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>860</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>96.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>865</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>79.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>868</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>331</td>
<td>48.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>873</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>883</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>887</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>907</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>85.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>908</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>70.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>913</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>916</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>919</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>50.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>920</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>921</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>932</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>934</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

hardware
head+
ie
incident+
indeed
infrequently
interface+
iscs
link+
live+
located
located+
location+
mail
mail+
man
manual+
meetings
migrate+
migrat+
minister+
model+
moving
multiple
new
normal
number+
number
old
ongoing+
operator+
operator+
parallel
partner+
part+
passe+
pathfinder
paul
place
postcode+
post+
prior
private
procedure+
process+
proforma+
protection
provision+
provision
ready
rec
receiving
recommend+
record+
recruit+
refresher
regenerate+
936  9. 10. 80.00  8.70  register+
941   6.   6. 100.00 10.94  relate+
954  25. 28. 89.29 35.98  request+
955  90. 159. 56.60 34.28  require+
956 4.  4. 100.00  7.28  requiring
967   7.   7. 100.00 12.77  rest
979 11. 15. 73.33  9.46  rollout
981 26. 30. 86.67 34.93  room
983 27.  45. 60.00 12.12  rules
984 33.  37. 89.19 47.64  same
988 11.  17. 64.71  6.39  scale+
990  9.  10. 90.00 13.04  schedule+
993 10. 10. 100.00 18.27  screen+
1000 21.  26. 80.77 23.63  select+
1031 27.  30. 90.00 39.63  small+
1033 4.  4. 100.00  7.28  smooth+
1045 5.   6. 83.33  6.01  specifi+
1046 4.  4. 100.00  7.28  spur
1047 4.  4. 100.00  7.28  stable
1048 151. 292. 51.71 40.89  staff+
1053 17.  30. 56.67  5.97  start+
1059  5.   5. 100.00  9.11  station+
1073 10. 10. 100.00 18.27  sufficient+
1079 157. 311. 50.48 37.74  support+
1080 4.   4. 100.00  7.28  suppress+
1085 74.  104. 71.15 61.68  system+
1091 33.  35. 94.29 53.97  techhnical
1095 65.  76. 85.53 87.13  telephony
1097 4.   4. 100.00  7.28  terminal+
1099 61.  98. 62.24 32.56  test+
1102 5.   6. 83.33  6.01  the'
1118 4.  4. 100.00  7.28  tours
1122 105. 143. 73.43 98.53  train+
1130 12. 13. 92.31 18.46  trial+
1150 5.   6. 83.33  6.01  upgrade+
1151 6.   6. 100.00 10.94  useful
1152 46.  57. 80.70 52.69  user+
1153 39.  80. 48.75  6.44  use+
1164 22.  34. 64.71 12.93  via+
1167 4.   4. 100.00  7.28  visibility
1170 4.   4. 100.00  7.28  visitors
1179 41.  60. 68.33 29.32  week+
1190 27.  45. 60.00 12.12  workflow
1193 4.   4. 100.00  7.28  workstations
1195 10. 10. 100.00 18.27  worse
1197 * 224. 525. 42.67 17.43 * a
1205 * 49.  79. 62.03 25.50 * 0 any
1207 * 69. 166. 41.57  2.96 * 0 at
1211 * 273. 674. 40.50 12.64 * 0 for
1213 * 265. 673. 39.38  7.55 * 0 in
1215 * 370. 930. 39.78 17.61 * 0 of
1216 * 16.  27. 59.26  6.76 * 0 off
1217 * 10.  14. 71.43  7.95 * 0 so
1221 *  7.   9. 77.78  7.06 * 0 very
1226 *  5.   5. 100.00  9.11 * 0 yes.
1227 * 12.  13. 92.31 18.46 * 0 you
1228 * 32.  58. 55.17 10.15 * 1 can
1230 * 28.  48. 58.33 11.25 * 1 may.
1232 * 364. 709. 51.34 138.89 * 1 will.
1233 * 19.  38. 50.00  5.57 * 2 no
1235 *  6.  10. 60.00  2.63 * 3 above
1242 *  3.   3. 100.00  5.46 * 3 near
1244 * 204. 517. 39.46  5.18 * 3 on
1251 * 13.  21. 61.90  6.47 * 4 back
1252 *  8.   12. 66.67  5.12 * 4 before
1253 * 30.  54. 55.56  9.80 * 4 during
1260 *  3.   3. 100.00  5.46 * 4 yet
1261 *  4.   5. 80.00  4.33 * 5 enough
Nombre de mots sélectionnés : 334

Classe n° 2 => Contexte B

Nombre d'u.c.e. : 353. soit : 21.99 %
Nombre de "uns" (a+r) : 9185. soit : 20.29 %
Nombre de mots analysés par uce : 17.13

num effectifs pourc. chi2 identification
1 18. 42. 42.86 10.94 H around
4 58. 110. 52.73 65.02 H into
6 104. 143. 72.37 235.52 H out
8 9. 18. 50.00 8.32 H over
14 4. 4. 100.00 14.22 V arise.
15 6. 10. 60.00 8.47 V become.
43 3. 3. 100.00 10.66 V light.
44 3. 4. 75.00 6.57 V lose.
47 22. 54. 40.74 11.45 V meet.
50 6. 10. 60.00 8.47 V pay.
128 12. 28. 42.86 7.23 appendix
133 35. 53. 66.04 61.97 approach+
138 6. 11. 54.55 6.84 april
142 6. 12. 50.00 5.53 ask+
148 25. 60. 41.67 14.06 assumption+
158 12. 14. 85.71 33.42 august
160 6. 8. 75.00 13.17 automatically
| 179 | 3. 4. | 75.00 | 6.57 | belief |
| 182 | 9. 20. | 45.00 | 6.25 | best |
| 185 | 10. 15. | 66.67 | 17.61 | birkenhead |
| 192 | 197. 473. | 41.65 | 151.01 | business |
| 193 | 6. 8. | 75.00 | 13.17 | bus+ |
| 197 | 5. 10. | 100.00 | 17.79 | calendar |
| 219 | 108. 225. | 48.00 | 103.16 | change+ |
| 225 | 14. 35. | 40.00 | 6.76 | child |
| 228 | 7. 8. | 87.50 | 20.11 | circulate+ |
| 249 | 3. 3. | 100.00 | 10.66 | collis |
| 254 | 4. 4. | 100.00 | 14.22 | comparison |
| 267 | 5. 8. | 62.50 | 7.69 | complexit+ |
| 270 | 5. 5. | 100.00 | 17.79 | complication |
| 284 | 28. 69. | 40.58 | 14.52 | consider+ |
| 296 | 14. 16. | 87.50 | 40.42 | contingency |
| 307 | 7. 11. | 63.64 | 11.20 | coordin+ |
| 317 | 23. 37. | 62.16 | 35.62 | criteria |
| 318 | 24. 36. | 66.67 | 42.84 | critical |
| 326 | 26. 71. | 36.62 | 9.26 | csr+ |
| 336 | 20. 42. | 47.62 | 16.51 | date+ |
| 338 | 55. 84. | 65.48 | 97.68 | day I |
| 340 | 125. 171. | 73.10 | 291.36 | day I+ |
| 342 | 15. 15. | 100.00 | 53.70 | de |
| 344 | 10. 12. | 83.33 | 26.52 | dec |
| 345 | 21. 51. | 41.18 | 11.30 | december |
| 346 | 16. 26. | 61.54 | 24.09 | decide+ |
| 352 | 18. 42. | 42.86 | 10.94 | define+ |
| 353 | 6. 9. | 66.67 | 10.53 | defining |
| 355 | 5. 8. | 62.50 | 7.69 | delay+ |
| 361 | 6. 9. | 66.67 | 10.53 | dependencies |
| 360 | 6. 6. | 100.00 | 21.36 | dimensions |
| 393 | 7. 14. | 50.00 | 6.46 | distribution |
| 396 | 25. 48. | 52.08 | 26.11 | document+ |
| 402 | 8. 8. | 100.00 | 28.52 | earli+ |
| 405 | 4. 5. | 80.00 | 9.84 | ease |
| 408 | 6. 6. | 100.00 | 21.36 | ebusiness |
| 454 | 10. 19. | 52.63 | 10.52 | evaluat+ |
| 477 | 6. 12. | 50.00 | 5.53 | facilit+ |
| 478 | 6. 6. | 100.00 | 21.36 | facing |
| 479 | 12. 16. | 75.00 | 26.47 | factor+ |
| 481 | 7. 7. | 100.00 | 24.94 | fail+ |
| 483 | 6. 6. | 100.00 | 21.36 | fallback |
| 489 | 33. 56. | 58.93 | 46.14 | february |
| 491 | 10. 14. | 71.43 | 20.12 | field |
| 511 | 3. 3. | 100.00 | 10.66 | forum |
| 533 | 3. 4. | 75.00 | 6.57 | goalposts+ |
| 549 | 16. 28. | 57.14 | 20.52 | handoff+ |
| 575 | 206. 291. | .70.79 | 493.31 | implement+ |
| 578 | 3. 4. | 75.00 | 6.57 | impossible |
| 610 | 3. 4. | 75.00 | 6.57 | intend+ |
| 619 | 10. 22. | 45.45 | 7.16 | introduction+ |
| 622 | 8. 8. | 100.00 | 28.52 | invoked |
| 626 | 45. 101. | 44.55 | 31.98 | issue+ |
| 627 | 132. 391. | 33.76 | 41.71 | itt |
| 628 | 3. 3. | 100.00 | 10.66 | itt_day |
| 631 | 18. 33. | 54.55 | 20.81 | january |
| 638 | 26. 27. | 96.30 | 88.37 | july |
| 639 | 9. 14. | 64.29 | 14.72 | june |
| 640 | 60. 118. | 50.85 | 61.80 | key |
| 644 | 7. 10. | 70.00 | 13.52 | last |
| 645 | 7. 8. | 87.50 | 20.11 | latest |
| 661 | 5. 6. | 83.33 | 13.21 | list |
| 665 | 18. 51. | 35.29 | 5.43 | local+ |
| 670 | 33. 40. | 82.50 | 87.54 | longbenton |
| 672 | 7. 15. | 46.67 | 5.37 | look+ |
| 677 | 5. 5. | 100.00 | 17.79 | lunch |
| 678 | 3. 3. | 100.00 | 10.66 | lynda |
| 695 | 14. 18. | 77.78 | 33.02 | map+ |
696 40. 48. 83.33 108.51  march
702 11. 16. 68.75 20.59  maximise
704 5. 6. 83.33 13.21  mbusiness
717 7. 8. 87.50 20.11  milestone+
723 6. 10. 60.00 8.47  minutes
724 3. 3. 100.00 10.66  missed
731 52. 64. 81.25 136.42  month+
734 17. 32. 53.13 18.44  move+
738 3. 4. 75.00 6.57  murray
749 8. 14. 57.14 10.17  north
769 22. 65. 33.85 5.55  operation+
774 96. 111. 86.49 289.09  option+
786 27. 33. 81.82 70.29  outline+
793 11. 11. 100.00 39.28  pace
807 8. 14. 57.14 10.17  pass+
815 20. 56. 35.71 6.37  period+
820 15. 20. 75.00 33.17  perspective+
823 55. 88. 62.50 89.04  phase+
829 68. 104. 65.38 122.04  plann+
830 75. 132. 56.82 101.67  plan+
834 37. 73. 50.68 36.69  point+
845 10. 22. 45.45 7.16  preferred
848 6. 10. 60.00 8.47  prepare
849 8. 15. 53.33 8.67  prepar+
850 24. 34. 70.59 47.81  present+
852 6. 7. 85.71 16.64  prevent+
853 5. 6. 83.33 13.21  previous+
855 3. 4. 75.00 6.57  primary
875 80. 112. 71.43 171.50  programme+
877 16. 44. 36.36 5.45  project+
884 44. 44. 100.00 160.46  prove
888 25. 49. 51.02 24.82  public+
896 12. 28. 42.86 7.23  question+
919 30. 62. 48.39 26.19  recommend+
931 86. 130. 66.15 160.79  reform+
944 22. 39. 56.41 27.60  release+
947 12. 23. 52.17 12.39  remain+
957 5. 5. 100.00 17.79  research
965 13. 49. 36.73 6.40  responsibilit+
972 13. 28. 46.43 9.92  review+
977 57. 84. 67.86 108.67  risk+
980 95. 125. 76.00 230.45  roll+
982 17. 22. 77.27 39.73  route+
996 22. 33. 66.67 39.19  sector
1003 7. 8. 87.50 20.11  sensible
1007 14. 16. 87.50 40.42  sequence
1008 6. 6. 100.00 21.36  series
1015 8. 10. 80.00 19.73  sharing
1021 8. 13. 61.54 11.95  sign+
1022 11. 13. 84.62 29.96  similar+
1027 5. 7. 71.43 10.01  situation
1035 33. 74. 44.59 23.10  solution+
1037 9. 19. 47.37 7.22  sort+
1050 7. 7. 100.00 24.94  stagger+
1058 15. 30. 50.00 13.98  step+
1063 5. 7. 71.43 10.01  strength+
1070 15. 21. 71.43 30.31  success
1096 20. 23. 86.96 57.40  template+
1099 34. 98. 34.69 9.91  test+
1108 4. 4. 100.00 14.22  till
1148 137. 388. 35.31 52.88  unit+
1154 22. 60. 36.67 7.82  using
1162 21. 21. 100.00 75.47  version
1166 4. 5. 80.00 9.84  virtual+
1174 8. 14. 57.14 10.17  wales
1176 7. 12. 58.33 9.31  warehouse
1178 6. 7. 85.71 16.64  weekend
1495 17. 20. 85.00 46.86 *itiday
1496 8. 8. 100.00 28.52 *itidayi
1497 10. 13. 76.92 23.05 *itidayim
1498 19. 19. 100.00 68.20 *itidayimp
1500 17. 18. 94.44 55.70 *itidayimple
1501 12. 14. 85.71 33.42 *itidayimplemat
1502 3. 3. 100.00 10.66 *ittimplemen
1508 23. 39. 58.97 31.86 *parallel
1511 13. 21. 61.90 19.76 *paralleloffice
1512 12. 19. 63.16 18.99 *paralleloffice01
1516 6. 11. 54.55 6.84 *privatesectorfirm
1518 6. 14. 42.86 3.58 *recommen
1519 9. 16. 56.25 11.05 *reform
1520 5. 8. 62.50 7.69 *reformlive
1521 11. 11. 100.00 39.28 *rollout
1522 7. 7. 100.00 24.94 *rolloutspeed
1523 5. 5. 100.00 17.79 *slidesfo
1531 4. 9. 44.44 2.66 *AFFINITY_MEETING
1533 4. 4. 100.00 14.22 *CONTINGENCY_STRAT
1534 5. 6. 83.33 13.21 *COPY_OF_ROUTE
1538 14. 24. 58.33 19.75 *implemente
1542 4. 9. 44.44 2.66 *PMUsli
1545 4. 9. 44.44 2.66 *Teambuild

Nombre de mots sélectionnés : 244
-----------------------------
Classe n° 3 -> Contexe C
-----------------------------
Nombre d'u.c.e. : 291. soit : 18.13 %
Nombre de "uns" (a+r) : 8402. soit : 18.56 %
Nombre de mots analysés par uce : 20.08

num effectifs pourc. chi2 identification

3 5. 5. 100.00 22.65 H inside
10 231.1177. 20.68 16.09 H to
e 14. 15. 93.33 47.69 H towards
19 22. 68. 32.35 9.68 V build.
e 32. 72. 44.44 35.16 V deal.
e 5. 7. 71.43 21.82 V drive.
e 12. 21. 57.14 17.52 V feel.
e 6. 11. 54.55 10.66 V forecast.
e 32. 6. 8. 75.00 15.72 V get.
e 33. 13. 24. 54.17 21.31 V give.
e 37. 14. 20. 70.00 10.76 V keep.
e 38. 13. 16. 81.25 43.38 V make.
e 45. 36. 124. 29.03 10.76 V make.
e 47. 17. 54. 31.48 6.71 V meet.
e 62. 32. 80. 40.00 27.13 V take.
e 64. 14. 15. 93.33 39.03 V think.
e 65. 22. 37. 59.46 43.58 V understand.
e 67. 4. 4. 100.00 18.11 aa
68. 8. 17. 47.06 9.69 ability
10. 13. 76.92 30.52 accept+
16. 43. 37.21 10.83 account+
11. 13. 94.62 37.03 accurate+
36. 57. 63.16 80.72 achieve+
9. 13. 69.23 23.06 achieve+
5. 5. 100.00 22.65 acknowledge+
65. 127. 51.18 101.49 act+
67. 9. 7. 77.78 21.69 advice
3. 5. 60.00 5.92 aim+
8. 9. 88.89 30.53 analyse+
13. 19. 68.42 32.76 answer+
5. 7. 71.43 13.45 anticipate+
468 6. 8. 75.00 17.52 expectation+
472 5. 6. 83.33 17.25 explain+
475 8. 17. 47.06 9.69 external+
480 5. 7. 71.43 13.45 fact+
482 8. 13. 61.54 16.64 fair+
490 29. 34. 85.29 105.56 feedback
503 8. 10. 80.00 25.95 flow+
504 6. 8. 75.00 17.52 focal
505 6. 6. 100.00 27.19 focuses
506 27. 77. 35.06 15.63 focus+
512 30. 39. 76.92 93.08 framework
514 6. 11. 54.55 9.89 free+
516 4. 4. 100.00 18.11 friendly
518 5. 5. 100.00 22.65 frustration
519 4. 5. 80.00 12.93 fulfil
520 43. 90. 47.78 56.46 full+
526 7. 14. 50.00 9.66 future
530 7. 12. 58.33 13.16 generate+
534 3. 3. 100.00 13.57 goals
536 17. 27. 62.96 37.19 grade+
542 4. 6. 50.00 5.50 guidelines
555 7. 7. 100.00 31.75 helpful
563 7. 7. 100.00 31.75 honest
565 3. 4. 75.00 8.74 hr
568 7. 11. 63.64 15.45 ideas
569 14. 31. 45.16 15.56 identify+
577 4. 7. 57.14 7.21 import+
580 47. 71. 66.20 115.63 improve+
595 13. 13. 100.00 59.18 indic+
599 39. 100. 39.00 31.29 inform+
604 12. 17. 70.59 31.85 initiat+
606 3. 4. 75.00 8.74 inspector+
614 9. 25. 36.00 5.46 internal+
615 5. 10. 50.00 6.89 interpret+
620 4. 7. 57.14 7.21 investig+
623 25. 76. 32.89 11.72 involve+
626 31. 101. 30.69 11.46 issue+
632 28. 52. 53.85 46.18 job+
637 6. 6. 100.00 27.19 judgement
641 29. 41. 70.73 78.43 knowledge+
647 33. 62. 53.23 53.51 leader+
652 5. 6. 83.33 17.25 liability
657 5. 8. 62.50 10.66 likely
662 8. 8. 100.00 36.30 listen+
669 8. 10. 80.00 25.95 logical+
674 3. 5. 60.00 5.92 lower
684 21. 58. 36.21 13.25 maintain+
685 18. 50. 36.00 11.10 maintenance
693 14. 16. 87.50 52.39 man+
699 4. 7. 57.14 7.21 match
712 25. 63. 39.68 20.52 member+
713 5. 6. 83.33 17.25 mentor+
729 8. 11. 72.73 22.24 money
730 20. 44. 45.45 22.75 monitor+
733 12. 12. 100.00 54.59 motivate+
740 4. 4. 100.00 18.11 nature
742 13. 30. 43.33 13.08 necess+
744 4. 4. 100.00 18.11 negotiates
756 25. 56. 43.10 25.28 objective+
757 9. 13. 69.23 23.06 obtain+
765 7. 15. 46.67 8.31 open+
771 22. 48. 45.83 25.58 opportunit+
773 4. 6. 66.67 9.56 optimum
776 12. 17. 70.59 31.85 order+
783 20. 21. 95.24 85.23 others+
785 22. 53. 41.51 20.18 outcome+
802 9. 11. 81.82 30.27 particip+
811 4. 4. 100.00 18.11 peer+
812 65. 143. 45.45 78.96 people+
814 59. 126. 46.83 75.85 perform+
817 22. 26. 84.62 78.70 personal+
821 5. 5. 100.00 22.65 persuasive
828 18. 48. 37.50 12.51 place
836 22. 26. 84.62 78.70 positive+
842 9. 14. 64.29 20.27 practice+
859 12. 20. 60.00 23.92 priorit+
862 13. 21. 61.90 27.47 problem+
876 13. 36. 34.21 6.78 progress+
878 8. 8. 100.00 36.30 promit+
879 24. 29. 82.76 83.10 promote+
880 11. 12. 91.67 44.05 prompt+
885 36. 108. 33.33 18.03 provide+
886 16. 27. 59.26 31.30 provide+
893 4. 4. 100.00 18.11 qualification+
896 3. 4. 75.00 8.74 queries
897 4. 8. 50.00 5.50 quick+
906 4. 4. 100.00 18.11 reaction+
917 6. 8. 75.00 17.52 recognise+
918 12. 12. 100.00 54.59 recognition
929 4. 5. 80.00 12.93 refine
930 7. 10. 70.00 18.24 reflect+
938 11. 21. 52.38 16.82 regular+
939 5. 6. 83.33 17.25 reinforce
942 17. 38. 44.74 18.56 relation+
945 20. 32. 62.50 43.30 relev+
953 10. 27. 37.04 6.61 represent+
961 42. 59. 71.19 116.16 resource+
962 17. 17. 100.00 77.58 respect+
963 12. 14. 85.71 43.46 respond+
969 11. 19. 57.89 20.48 result+
975 7. 7. 100.00 31.75 rewards
978 27. 86. 31.40 10.77 role+
987 3. 5. 60.00 5.92 satisfy+
997 4. 4. 100.00 18.11 secure+
1010 42. 128. 32.81 20.20 service+
1014 15. 20. 75.00 44.13 share+
1018 6. 6. 100.00 27.19 signal
1034 11. 22. 50.00 15.26 software
1036 13. 13. 100.00 59.18 solving
1039 3. 4. 75.00 8.74 sound
1040 4. 7. 57.14 7.21 source+
1044 19. 54. 35.19 10.95 specific+
1051 8. 13. 61.54 16.64 stakeholder+
1062 10. 23. 43.48 10.10 strategist+
1064 7. 8. 87.50 26.06 strong+
1066 4. 4. 100.00 18.11 style+
1074 7. 8. 87.50 26.06 suggest+
1081 3. 3. 100.00 13.57 survey+
1086 4. 6. 66.67 9.56 talk+
1087 34. 43. 79.07 110.54 target+
1094 8. 15. 53.33 12.64 telephone+
1111 10. 20. 50.00 13.86 time+
1115 8. 8. 100.00 36.30 tone
1129 3. 4. 75.00 8.74 trends
1132 5. 5. 100.00 22.65 trustworthiness
1133 9. 9. 100.00 40.87 trust+
1140 3. 5. 60.00 5.92 uncertain+
1153 28. 80. 35.00 16.14 use+
1155 9. 13. 69.23 23.06 utilise+
1157 11. 13. 84.62 39.03 value+
1165 5. 9. 55.56 8.54 view+
1168 7. 9. 77.78 21.69 visible
1180 23. 36. 63.89 51.95 well
1185 4. 8. 50.00 5.50 whole
1191 14. 32. 43.75 14.44 workload+
Nombre de mots sélectionnés : 282

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>num</th>
<th>effectifs</th>
<th>pourc.</th>
<th>chi2</th>
<th>identification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>35. 43.</td>
<td>81.40</td>
<td>78.00</td>
<td>H outside</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>4. 4. 100.00</td>
<td>12.45</td>
<td>V creep.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>30. 72. 41.</td>
<td>12.25</td>
<td>V deal.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>11. 16. 68.75</td>
<td>17.28</td>
<td>V learn.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>3. 4. 75.00</td>
<td>5.94</td>
<td>V lie.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>4. 9. 44.44</td>
<td>4.22</td>
<td>V override.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>25. 25. 100.00</td>
<td>78.85</td>
<td>V oversee.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>16. 35. 45.71</td>
<td>5.37</td>
<td>V show.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>3. 3. 100.00</td>
<td>9.33</td>
<td>V strive.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
<td>20. 37. 54.05</td>
<td>18.12</td>
<td>able</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76</td>
<td>6. 9. 66.67</td>
<td>8.79</td>
<td>accuracy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81</td>
<td>27. 38.</td>
<td>71.05</td>
<td>46.05</td>
<td>addition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85</td>
<td>5. 7.</td>
<td>71.43</td>
<td>8.45</td>
<td>additional+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86</td>
<td>26. 52.</td>
<td>50.00</td>
<td>19.17</td>
<td>address+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88</td>
<td>17. 24.</td>
<td>70.83</td>
<td>28.56</td>
<td>adhere+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>91</td>
<td>5. 6.</td>
<td>83.33</td>
<td>11.37</td>
<td>adjudication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92</td>
<td>4. 5.</td>
<td>80.00</td>
<td>8.43</td>
<td>adjust+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93</td>
<td>3. 4.</td>
<td>75.00</td>
<td>5.58</td>
<td>administrat+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95</td>
<td>9. 13.</td>
<td>69.23</td>
<td>14.32</td>
<td>addition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>97</td>
<td>10. 11.</td>
<td>90.91</td>
<td>26.62</td>
<td>agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>105</td>
<td>5. 5.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>15.57</td>
<td>advantage+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>122</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>12.45</td>
<td>analytical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>126</td>
<td>24. 30.</td>
<td>80.00</td>
<td>51.36</td>
<td>appeal+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>139</td>
<td>41. 85.</td>
<td>48.24</td>
<td>27.76</td>
<td>area+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>148</td>
<td>28. 60.</td>
<td>46.67</td>
<td>16.93</td>
<td>assumption+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150</td>
<td>41. 96.</td>
<td>42.71</td>
<td>18.65</td>
<td>assurance+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>155</td>
<td>3. 4.</td>
<td>75.00</td>
<td>5.58</td>
<td>attention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>162</td>
<td>41. 41.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>130.64</td>
<td>auxiliary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>165</td>
<td>5. 7.</td>
<td>71.43</td>
<td>8.45</td>
<td>avoid+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>171</td>
<td>5. 5.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>15.57</td>
<td>background</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>177</td>
<td>20. 32.</td>
<td>62.50</td>
<td>25.77</td>
<td>behavioural+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>179</td>
<td>32. 62.</td>
<td>51.61</td>
<td>25.99</td>
<td>behaviour+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>190</td>
<td>21. 39.</td>
<td>53.85</td>
<td>18.86</td>
<td>bu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>12.45</td>
<td>cancel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>203</td>
<td>24. 30.</td>
<td>80.00</td>
<td>51.36</td>
<td>care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>206</td>
<td>26. 35.</td>
<td>74.29</td>
<td>48.40</td>
<td>caseworker+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>208</td>
<td>106. 353.</td>
<td>30.03</td>
<td>7.89</td>
<td>case+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>213</td>
<td>3. 3.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>9.33</td>
<td>centralised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>214</td>
<td>36. 62.</td>
<td>58.06</td>
<td>39.76</td>
<td>central+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>215</td>
<td>12. 16.</td>
<td>75.00</td>
<td>22.49</td>
<td>centre+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>222</td>
<td>6. 7.</td>
<td>85.71</td>
<td>14.36</td>
<td>chart+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>224</td>
<td>22. 43.</td>
<td>51.16</td>
<td>17.22</td>
<td>check+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>227</td>
<td>6. 7.</td>
<td>85.71</td>
<td>14.36</td>
<td>chl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>250</td>
<td>11. 11.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>34.39</td>
<td>combi+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>252</td>
<td>22. 38.</td>
<td>57.89</td>
<td>23.75</td>
<td>command+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>257</td>
<td>31. 78.</td>
<td>39.74</td>
<td>10.53</td>
<td>communic+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>258</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>12.45</td>
<td>commun+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>263</td>
<td>67. 73.</td>
<td>91.78</td>
<td>188.65</td>
<td>complaint+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>266</td>
<td>9. 12.</td>
<td>75.00</td>
<td>16.83</td>
<td>complex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>268</td>
<td>56. 73.</td>
<td>76.71</td>
<td>133.75</td>
<td>compliance+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>269</td>
<td>5. 7.</td>
<td>71.43</td>
<td>8.45</td>
<td>compliant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>275</td>
<td>10. 11.</td>
<td>90.91</td>
<td>26.62</td>
<td>concept</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>288</td>
<td>3. 3.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>9.33</td>
<td>constant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>289</td>
<td>7. 11.</td>
<td>63.64</td>
<td>9.27</td>
<td>constraints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>293</td>
<td>30. 66.</td>
<td>45.45</td>
<td>16.62</td>
<td>contact+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>298</td>
<td>5. 8.</td>
<td>62.50</td>
<td>6.35</td>
<td>continuing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>309</td>
<td>75. 95.</td>
<td>78.95</td>
<td>163.28</td>
<td>core</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>320</td>
<td>5. 5.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>15.57</td>
<td>crt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>328</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>12.45</td>
<td>culmination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>329</td>
<td>6. 9.</td>
<td>66.67</td>
<td>8.79</td>
<td>culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>330</td>
<td>34. 93.</td>
<td>36.56</td>
<td>7.97</td>
<td>current+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>331</td>
<td>98. 235.</td>
<td>41.70</td>
<td>44.93</td>
<td>customer+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>343</td>
<td>11. 11.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>34.39</td>
<td>debt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>349</td>
<td>8. 9.</td>
<td>88.89</td>
<td>20.45</td>
<td>dedicated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>357</td>
<td>8. 12.</td>
<td>66.67</td>
<td>11.74</td>
<td>demand+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>362</td>
<td>11. 12.</td>
<td>91.67</td>
<td>29.72</td>
<td>dependent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>363</td>
<td>7. 9.</td>
<td>77.78</td>
<td>14.01</td>
<td>depend+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>365</td>
<td>4. 5.</td>
<td>80.00</td>
<td>8.43</td>
<td>depth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>366</td>
<td>8. 9.</td>
<td>88.89</td>
<td>20.45</td>
<td>describe+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>368</td>
<td>35. 52.</td>
<td>67.31</td>
<td>53.79</td>
<td>design+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>369</td>
<td>14. 25.</td>
<td>56.00</td>
<td>13.80</td>
<td>desir+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>377</td>
<td>7. 7.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>21.83</td>
<td>difference+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>378</td>
<td>11. 17.</td>
<td>64.71</td>
<td>15.18</td>
<td>different+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>384</td>
<td>4. 4.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>12.45</td>
<td>disciplines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>389</td>
<td>5. 7.</td>
<td>71.43</td>
<td>8.45</td>
<td>dispute+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>392</td>
<td>6. 11.</td>
<td>54.55</td>
<td>5.48</td>
<td>distribute+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>397</td>
<td>7. 7.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>21.83</td>
<td>dotted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>9. 9.</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>28.10</td>
<td>duration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401</td>
<td>30. 83.</td>
<td>36.14</td>
<td>6.60</td>
<td>each</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8. 8. 100.00 24. 96 minimise+
719 8. 13. 61.54 9.83 notification+
720 58. 126. 46.03 34.85 perform*
725 3. 3. 100.00 9.33 orchestrate+
726 25. 29. 86.21 61.30 pre
732 10. 18. 55.56 9.61 paper
735 60. 143. 41.96 26.38 people+
739 6. 11. 54.55 5.48 overview
740 4. 4  . 100.00 12. 45 personalised
743 4. 5. 80.00 18.70 region
747 32. 47. 68.09 50.23 responsible
751 4. 4. 100.00 12.45 report+
753 34. 86. 39.53 11.35 role+
759 25. 31. 95.00 39.69 self
762 6. 10. 40.00 12.45 seven
766 28. 48. 58.33 30. 99 skill*
769 46. 84. 54.76 44.46 structure*
773 3. 3. 100.00 9.33 referrals
775 6. 6. 100.00 18.70 relation+
779 14. 22. 63. 64 18. 67 significant+
780 7. 7. 100.00 21.83 sizing
784 24. 40. 60.00 28.28 special+
787 46. 84. 54.76 44.46 structure+
791 3. 4. 75.00 5.58 owned
794 21. 28. 75.00 39. 66 senior
798 27. 53. 70.00 11.37 self
802 52. 73. 71.23 91.18 report+
806 32. 47. 68.09 50.23 responsible
810 10. 14 . 71.43 16. 98 propose*
814 23. 31. 74 .19 42.60 qualit*
818 3. 4. 75.00 5.58 remove+
820 20. 38. 51.35 14. 97 resolution
824 28. 40. 70.00 46.37 profile+
828 19. 37. 51.35 14. 97 resolution
832 52. 73. 71.23 91.18 report+
836 132. 331. 39.88 54.49 process+
840 23. 35. 65.71 33.21 product+
844 28. 40. 70.00 46.37 profile+
848 10. 19. 52.63 8.34 satisfaction
853 9. 3. 100.00 9.33 remainder
857 3. 3. 100.00 9.33 referrals
861 6. 11. 54.55 5.48 power+
865 8. 9. 88.89 20.45 principles
869 46. 84. 54.76 44.46 structure*
873 3. 3. 100.00 9.33 referred
877 3. 3. 100.00 9.33 referred
881 4. 5. 80.00 8.43 power+
885 10. 14 . 71.43 16. 98 propose*
889 25. 29. 86.21 61.30 pre
893 4. 6. 66.67 5.85 press+
897 7. 7. 100.00 21.83 sizing
| 1476 | 18. 24. | 75.00 | 33.91 * | *27_April_01 |
| 1484 | 9. 16. | 56.25 | 8.92 * | *31/08/01 |
| 1486 | 4. 4. | 100.00 | 12.45 * | *6_April_01 |
| 1491 | 6. 11. | 54.55 | 5.48 * | *changeoverview |
| 1530 | 51. 77. | 66.23 | 76.96 | *Agencystandardmod |
| 1532 | 37. 63. | 58.73 | 42.04 | *AGENCY_STANDARD_M |
| 1536 | 37. 53. | 69.81 | 61.44 | *FEB01_Roadshow_H |
| 1537 | 184. 360. | 51.11 | 180.22 | *FINAL_ORGAN |
| 1539 | 18. 24. | 75.00 | 33.91 * | *OD_LESSONS_2 |
| 1543 | 4. 4. | 100.00 | 12.45 | *PROGRAMME_MANAGEMENT |

Nombre de mots sélectionnés : 292
Nombre de mots marqués : 1382 sur 1433 soit 96.44%

Liste des valeurs de clé :
- 0 si $\chi^2 < 2.71$
- 1 si $\chi^2 < 3.84$
- 2 si $\chi^2 < 5.02$
- 3 si $\chi^2 < 6.63$
- 4 si $\chi^2 < 10.80$
- 5 si $\chi^2 < 20.00$
- 6 si $\chi^2 < 30.00$
- 7 si $\chi^2 < 40.00$
- 8 si $\chi^2 < 50.00$

Tableau croisant classes et clés :

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>* Classes *</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clés</td>
<td>Poids</td>
<td>7028</td>
<td>3582</td>
<td>3066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>1678 *</td>
<td>616</td>
<td>410</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>198 *</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>886 *</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>1197 *</td>
<td>454</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>3974 *</td>
<td>1517</td>
<td>846</td>
<td>724</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>886 *</td>
<td>442</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>161 *</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1033 *</td>
<td>379</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>249 *</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>203 *</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>2315 *</td>
<td>942</td>
<td>425</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>272 *</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>2399 *</td>
<td>952</td>
<td>566</td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>2187 *</td>
<td>969</td>
<td>472</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tableau des $\chi^2$ (signes) :

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>* Classes *</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clés</td>
<td>Poids</td>
<td>7028</td>
<td>3582</td>
<td>3066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>1678 *</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>198 *</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>886 *</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-44</td>
<td>-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>1197 *</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-17</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>3974 *</td>
<td>-5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>886 *</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>-12</td>
<td>-13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>161 *</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1033 *</td>
<td>-4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>249 *</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>203 *</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>2315 *</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>272 *</td>
<td>-21</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>2399 *</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>-4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
9 * 2187 * 20 2 -13 -12

Chi² du tableau : 521.814900

Nombre de "1" distribués : 17638 soit 39 %

C2: Reclassement des uce et uci

Type de reclassement choisi pour les uce : Classement d'origine

Tableaux des clés (TUCE et TUCI) :

Nombre d'uce enregistrées : 2071
Nombre d'uce classées : 1605 soit : 77.50%

Nombre d'uci enregistrées : 76
Nombre d'uci classées : 72 soit : 94.74%
### A.F.C. du tableau C2DICB.121

A.F.C. de C:\&&_0\C2DICB.121

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effectif minimum d'un mot</th>
<th>:</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nombre d'UCE minimum par classe</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nombre de lignes analysées</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>821</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nombre total de lignes</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>1089</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nombre de colonnes analysées</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Seuls les mots à valeur de clé >= 8 sont représentés

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Num. *</th>
<th>Valeur Propre *</th>
<th>Pourcentage *</th>
<th>Cumul *</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.35479850</td>
<td>42.16071</td>
<td>42.161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>.26920140</td>
<td>31.98920</td>
<td>74.150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>.21753840</td>
<td>25.85009</td>
<td>100.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Nombre total de mots retenus : 420
Nombre de mots pleins retenus : 811
Nombre total de points : 424

Représentation séparée car plus de 60 points
Projection des colonnes et mots "**" sur le plan 1 2 (corrélations)

Axe horizontal : 1e facteur : V.P. = .3548 (42.16 % de l'inertie)
Axe vertical : 2e facteur : V.P. = .2692 (31.99 % de l'inertie)

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>x</th>
<th>y</th>
<th>nom</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>itdayimp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>rollout</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>-17</td>
<td>Suggestedques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>contingencystrate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>16/07/01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>copyofroute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>itdayimplementat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>COPY_OF_ROUTE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17_Apr_01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>privatesectorfirm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>17/07/01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-34</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>08_oct_01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-30</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>sslikes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-32</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>FEB01_ROADSHOW_H</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-30</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>OD_LESSONS_2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
keymilestonesanda
itt_DAY_SPEC_FIN
parallelloff
29/09/01
28/09/01
11/09/01
suggestedqu
26/09/01
27/09/01
theparallel
Projection des mots analyses sur le plan 1 2 (corrélation)

Axe horizontal : 1er facteur : V.P. = .3548 (42.16 % de l'inertie)
Axe vertical : 2e facteur : V.P. = .2692 (31.99 % de l'inertie)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>key</td>
<td>critical change+programme+</td>
<td>proveoutline+ approach+present+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>option+plan+ de ..plan+business</td>
<td>risk+july : versioninto</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>implement+.contingency</td>
<td>outmarch month+roll+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>day_I</td>
<td>day_II</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>effect+</td>
<td>phase+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>februaryunit+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>structure+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>act+ develop+full+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>resource+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>manage+ share+organisation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>focus+ .. ....improve+exemplary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>leader+mc ....... team+profile+colleagues</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>... job+compliance+organisation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Nombre de points recouverts 61 dont 11 superposés
Nomme de points recouverts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>x</th>
<th>y</th>
<th>nom</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>-17</td>
<td>DPU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>-17</td>
<td>LSS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>-17</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>-17</td>
<td>MO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-21</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Eo'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-20</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>eight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-21</td>
<td>-16</td>
<td>through</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>-17</td>
<td>WNwbusinees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>-18</td>
<td>CFAT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

D1: Sélection de quelques mots par classe
Valeur de clé minimum pour la sélection : 0

Vocabulaire spécifique de la classe 1 :
go.(51), applic+(98), associated(47), a_day(41), case+(198),
client(71), consortium(30), fault+(33), itt(222), live+(117),
model+(69), new(212), office+(291), old(36), parallel(246),
private(97), system+(74), technical(33), telephony(65), train+(105),
user+(46), up(77), agency+(118), associated(37), day+(93),
english(23), firms+(32), prior(35), procedure+(38), same(33),
staff+(151), onto(20), approximately(37), ba(51), code(17),
district+(22), functional+(33), november(26), part+(29), rec(20),
request+(25), require+(90), room(26), small+(27), support+(157),
test+(61), send.(25), set.(61), comments(15), computer+(11),
control+(12), daily(18), environment(25), head+(16), interface+(34),
joint(18), located(14), meetings(17), migrate+(13), number+(60),
fast+(10), post+(27), select+(21), week+(41), under(16), begin.(10),
find.(12), hold.(11), run.(14), split.(12), advance+(8),
amendment+(6), approx(14), attached(15), claim+(10), cleanse+(8),
clear quest(8);

Vocabulaire spécifique de la classe 2 :
into(58), out(104), approach+(35), business(197), change+(108),
day _II(55), day_I+(125), de(15), implement+(206), july(26), key(60),
longbenton(33), march(40), month+(52), option+(96), outline+(27),
phase+(55), plan+(68), plan+(75), programme+(80), prove(44),
reform+(86), risk+(57), role(95), template+(20), unit+(137),
version(21), contingency(14), critical(24), february(33),
present+(24), sequence(14), august(12), criteria(23), issue+(45),
map+(14), pace(11), perspective+(15), point+(37), route+(17),
sector(22), success(15), circulate+(7), dec(10), decide+(16),
dimensions(6), document+(25), earli+(8), ebusiness(6), facing+(6),
factor+(12), fail+(7), fallback(6), field(10), handoff+(16),
invoked(8), january(18), latest(7), maximise(11), milestone+(7),
public+(25), recommend(30), release+(22), sensible(7), series(6),
similar+(11), solution+(33), stagger+(7), around(18), arise.(4),
meet.(22), automatically(6), birkenhead(10), bus+(6), calendar(5),
clear quest(4);

Vocabulaire spécifique de la classe 3 :
towards(14), think.(14), achieve+(36), act+(65), appropriate+(38),
clear+(29), coach+(17), colleagues(16), competenc+(50),
contribut+(14), customer+(84), demonstr+(28), develop+(64),
display+(24), effort+(15), encourage+(14), ensure+(53), feedback(29),
framework(30), full+(43), improve+(47), indic+(13), knowledge+(29),
leader+(33), man+(14), motivate+(12), others+(20), people+(65),
perform+(59), personal+(22), positive+(22), promote+(24),
recognition(12), resource+(42), respect+(17), solve+(13),
target+(34), well(23), know.(13), understand+(22), consistent+(21),
credit(9), effect+(43), exemplary(11), job+(28), prompt+(11),
relev+(20), respond+(12), share+(15), trust+(9), deal.(32), keep.(14),
seek.(14), accept+(10), accurate+(11), analyse+(8), answer+(13),
confident+(7), construct+(7), deliver+(49), ensuring(20),
example+(18), excellent(8), grade+(17), helpful(7), honest(7),
inform+(39), initiat+(12), listen+(8), order+(12), particip+(9),
promise+(8), provid+(16);

Vocabulaire spécifique de la classe 4 :
outside(35), oversee.(25), appeal+(24), auxiliary(41), care(24),
complaint+(67), compliance+(56), core(75), design+(35), eemic(31),
enforcement(38), face(42), focus+(45), functionalis+(25), heo(38),
including(30), individual+(20), manager+(71), officer+(29),
organisational(28), organisation+(82), pre(25), processes(46),
process+(132), rate+(26), report+(52), responsible(32), team+(222),
activities(27), caseworker+(26), increase+(31), line+(37),
manage+(103), mc(22), profile+(28), qualit+(23), structure+(46),
technical(39), trace+(25), central+(36), combi+(11), debt(11),
Mots outils spécifiques de la classe 1 :
any(g49), for(g273), in(g265), of(g370), off(g16), so(g10), very(g7),
which(g56), yes(g5), you(g12), can(g32), may(g28), will(g364), no(g19),
above(g6), near(g3), on(g204), back(g13), before(g8), during(g30), late(g1),
et(g3), enough(g4), every(g6), half(g4), less(g4), more(g20), much(g16),
about(g21), according(g10), also(g20), although(g5), by(g136), either(g17),
from(g114), however(g15), if(g39), once(g11), or(g59), per(g28), than(g18),
through(g27), thus(g8), too(g2), whether(g8), why(g4), all(g112),
anywhere(g1), it(g53), non(g23), only(g28), the(g528), these(g27), this(g98),
those(g11), who(g22), be(g383), been(g27), being(g16), does(g12), done(g30),
bad(g4), need(g64), should(g26), would(g26), both(g34), one(g29), six(g3),
A(g39), APEX(g13), ATUS(g3), B(g3), BMS(g3), CAST(g7), CDA(g9), CFAT(g14),
CSSC(g26), CSSR(g2), D(g3), EDCF(g8), E(g3), EDS(g5), IB(g4), II(g2), III(g2),
IS(g4), ISCS(g3), IX(g2), I(g1), JSAP(g5), JSAPS(g3), LSS(g2), M(g3), MAGU(g4),
MO(g9), NB(g2), NCT(g15), NEL(g5), NRPs(g4), NRp'(g4), NRp(g10), NW(g4),
PO(g6), FWC(g24), R(g4), SAT(g7);

Mots outils spécifiques de la classe 2 :
at(g46), first(g10), least(g7), time(g17), we(g46), what(g21), not(g34),
along(g3), further(g6), next(g22), there(g38), now(g4), until(g9), many(g7),
mid(g1), most(g20), like(g3), our(g13), us(g3), some(g15), then(g49),
doing(g2), get(g5), have(g50), is(g92), must(g16), needed(g8), was(g10),
five(g16), I(g1), QA4(g5), Sebusiness(g6), Swbusiness(g5), SLIM(g1),
SLIMS(g4), SNebusiness(g6), W&NW(g39), s(g62);

Mots outils spécifiques de la classe 3 :
an(g34), as(g46), do(g9), good(g14), that(g59), upon(g5), with(g96),
need(g18), across(g16), forward(g8), here(g3), where(g16), always(g5),
when(g28), how(g18), plus(g1), and(g253), even(g4), rather(g1), their(g57),
them(g25), they(g21), its(g9), other(g19), are(g78), has(g19), having(g4),
own(g20), ten(g3), CSR(g5), MIS(g3), FACTS(g3), PWcs(g1), S(g1), _ (g2), x(g2);

Mots outils spécifiques de la classe 4 :
etc(g9), below(g8), while(g3), within(g71), after(g14), without(g3),
against(g3), because(g2), between(g27), but(g22), directly(g5), still(g10),
such(g3), throughout(g8), might(g2), were(g5), eight(g7), four(g4),
three(g15), two(g15), Ao'(g5), AA(g6), AO(g15), BU(g25), C(g11), CHL(g12),
CRT(g7), CSA(g5), EO'(g14), EMEIC(g33), EQ(g27), HEO'(g8), HEO(g58), HR(g11),
IT(g10), MA(g8), MC(g28), SEO'(g3), SEO(g15), c(g7), e(g15), i(g4);

Mots étiquetés spécifiques de la classe 1 :
*01/08/01(21), *03/09/01(2), *06/11/01(7), *10/08/01(6),
*10/09/01(11), *11/09/01(11), *14/08/01(14), *14/09/01(7),
*16/09/01(5), *18/07/01(12), *19/09/01(9), *25/07/01(14),
*25/09/01(2), *26/09/01(18), *27/09/01(8), *28/08/01(8),
*28/09/01(46), *29/09/01(45), *29/10/01(7), *31/07/01(10),
*associated(g2), *associatedage(g16), *assurancepoints(g6), *day_ipr(g7),
*itdayimpl(g9), *itt_DAY_SPEC_FIN(g154), *keymilestonesanda(g6),
*liveservic(g9), *livesuppor(g3), *mslides(g26), *paralleloff(g105),
*paralleloffic(g46), *posupport(g7), *programme(g40), *slimsmsld(g2),
*suggestedqu(g11), *technical(g7), *theparallel(g8), *Parallelloff(g4),
*Parallelloffi(g7), *Suggestedques(g9), *TASslides(g5);

Mots étiquetés spécifiques de la classe 2 :
*03/07/01(10), *04/11/01(5), *04/11/2001(4), *05/11/01(5),
*09/07/01(2), *10/07/01(3), *12/07/01(24), *13/08/01(10),
*15/06/01(1), *16/07/01(14), *16/08/01(14), *17/07/01(28),
*17_Apr_01(5), *18/06/01(1), *19/09/01(9), *21/07/01(7),
*22/07/01(12), *22/07/01(8), *23/09/01(5), *26/06/01(10),
*26/07/01(35), *27/11/01(4), *29/08/01(10), *29_aug_01(4),

Mots étiquetés spécifiques de la classe 3 :

Mots étoilés spécifiques de la classe 3 :
*08 Oct_01(4), *16 July_01(11), *19 Jan_01(172), *7 Aug_01(1),
*slides(2), *AFFINITY_MEETING(4), *CUSTOMER_EXPERIEN(11),
*FINAL_ORGAN(172), *TRAFFIC_LIGHTS(1);

Mots étoilés spécifiques de la classe 4 :
*08/10/01(51), *08_oct_01(37), *27 April_01(18), *31/08/01(9),
*6 April_01(4), *changeoverview(6), *slimsmeeting(9),
*Agencystandardmod(51), *AGENCY_STANDARD_M(37), *FEB01_ROADEXH(37),
*OD_LESSONS_2(18), *PROGRAMME_MANAGEM(4);
D1: Sélection des mots et des uce par classe

D1 : Distribution des formes d'origine par racine

Formes associées au contexte A

A9 go. : go(48), goes(1), going(4);
A9 applic+ : applicant(8), applicants(18), application(38), applications(48);
A9 associated : associated(58);
A9 a_day : a_day(48);
A9 case+ : case(88), cases(177);
A9 client : client(78);
A9 consortium : consortium(32);
A9 fault+ : fault(55), faults(19), fault'(2);
A9 itt : itt(309);
A9 live+ : live(134), lives(1), live'(8);
A9 model+ : model(76), models(1);
A9 new : new(332);
A9 office+ : office(509), offices(27), office'(4);
A9 old : old(37);
A9 parallel : parallel(428);
A9 private : private(123);
A9 system+ : system(81), systems(8), system'(1);
A9 technical : technical(43);
A9 telephony : telephony(76);
A9 train+ : train(4), trained(26), training(103);
A9 user+ : user(40), users(10);
A8 up : up(90);
A8 agency+ : agency(153), agency'(1);
A8 associated : associated(44);
A8 day+ : day(116), days(3);
A8 english : english(27);
A8 firms+ : firms(34);
A8 prior : prior(42);
A8 procedure+ : procedure(4), procedures(38);
A8 same : same(34);
A8 staff+ : staff(192), staffed(5);
A7 onto : onto(22);
A7 approximately : approximately(39);
A7 ba : ba(71);
A7 code : code(20);
A7 district+ : district(21), districts(1);
A7 functional+ : functional(3), functionality(29), functionality'(1);
A7 november : november(26);
A7 part+ : part(28), parties(2);
A7 rec : rec(20);
A7 request+ : request(22), requests(3);
A7 require+ : require(14), required(56), requirement(12), requirements(13), requires(2);
A7 room : room(28);
A7 small+ : small(29);
A7 support+ : support(210), supported(8), supporting(11), supports(1);
A7 test+ : test(6), tested(8), testing(55);
A6 send. : send(5), sending(1), sent(21);
A6 set. : set(59), setting(15);
A6 comments : comments(24);
A6 computer+ : computer(8), computers(3);
A6 control+ : controlled(12);
A6 daily : daily(24);
A5 trial+ : trial(12);
A5 useful : useful(6);
A5 via+ : via(22);
A5 workflow : workflow(30);
A5 worse : worse(22);
A4 choose. : choosing(1), chosen(3);
A4 access+ : access(18), accessed(2);
A4 adequate+ : adequate(3), adequately(4);
A4 affect+ : affect(7), affected(3);
A4 age : age(5);
A4 announce+ : announce(2), announcement(2);
A4 automat+ : automated(11);
A4 a' : a'(5);
A4 basis : basis(17);
A4 block+ : block(5);
A4 bugs : bugs(4);
A4 call+ : call(5), called'(1), calls(8);
A4 capacity : capacity(20);
A4 circumstance+ : circumstances(12);
A4 confirm+ : confirm(4), confirmation(1), confirmed(5);
A4 connect+ : connected(2), connections(2);
A4 convers+ : conversation(2), conversion(2);
A4 converted : converted(5);
A4 dci : dci(4);
A4 deferred : deferred(4);
A4 determine+ : determine(10), determined(5);
A4 electronic : electronic(4);
A4 entire+ : entire(2), entirely(14);
A4 error+ : error(5), errors(3);
A4 estimate+ : estimate(1), estimated(5), estimates(2);
A4 fashion : fashion(4);
A4 faxed : faxed(4);
A4 figure+ : figure(2), figures(3);
A4 fixing : fixing(5);
A4 hardware : hardware(6);
A4 ie : ie(4);
A4 incident+ : incident(8), incidents(2);
A4 indeed : indeed(4);
A4 infrequently : infrequently(5);
A4 jsa : jsa(5);
A4 lack : lack(6);
A4 migrat+ : migrating(1), migration(12);
A4 nrp+ : nrp(6), nrps(9);
A4 operational+ : operational(23), operationally(1);
A4 pathfinder : pathfinder(4);
A4 reactive+ : reactive(5), reactively(1);
A4 register+ : register(3), registered(6);
A4 requiring : requiring(4);
A4 rollout : rollout(12);
A4 smooth+ : smooth(2), smoothly(2);
A4 spur : spur(4);
A4 stable : stable(4);
A4 station+ : station(2), stations(4);
A4 suppress+ : suppress(2), suppressed(2);
A4 terminal+ : terminal(3), terminals(1);
A4 tours : tours(4);
A4 visibility : visibility(4);
A4 visitors : visitors(4);
A4 workstations : workstations(4);
A3 sit. : sat(1), sit(2);
A3 agree+ : agree(10), agreed(15);
A3 alpha : alpha(7);
A3 collate+ : collate(2), collated(1);
A3 contd : contd(13);
A3 disruption+ : disruption(2), disruptions(1);
A3 guarantee+ : guaranteed(9);
A3 jane : jane(4);
A3 john : john(5);
Formes associées au contexte B

---

B9 into : into(67);
B9 out : out(162);
B9 approach+ : approach(41);
B9 business : business(321);
B9 change+ : change(93), changed(8), changes(63);
B9 day_II : day_II(69);
B9 day_I+ : day_I(190), day_I_(8);
B9 de : de(18);
B9 implement+ : implement(8), implementable(9), implementation(311), implementations(2), implementing(42), implements(2);
B9 july : july(30);
B9 key : key(67);
B9 longbenton : longbenton(45);
B9 march : march(45);
B9 month+ : month(19), months(61);
B9 option+ : option(147), options(46);
B9 outline+ : outline(1), outlined(2), outlines(26);
B9 phase+ : phase(70), phased(2), phases(5);
B9 plann+ : planned(7), planning(71);
B9 plan+ : plan(64), plans(27);
B9 programme+ : programme(112), programmes(3);
B9 prove : prove(62);
B9 reform+ : reform(102), reforms(34);
B9 risk+ : risk(32), risking(11), risks(31);
B9 roll+ : roll(138), rolling(7);
B9 template+ : template(19), templates(3);
B9 unit+ : unit(106), units(49), unit'(71);
B9 version : version(21);
B8 contingency : contingency(17);
B8 critical : critical(27);
B8 february : february(34);
B5 workshop+ : workshop(12), workshops(1);
B4 over : over(10);
B4 become. : become(1), becomes(3), becoming(2);
B4 light. : light(3);
B4 pay. : paid(3), paying(3);
B4 appendix : appendix(16);
B4 April : April(8);
B4 brief+ : brief(1), briefing(1);
B4 child : child(15);
B4 collis : collis(4);
B4 complexity+ : complexities(2), complexity(3);
B4 csr+ : csr(34);
B4 defining : defining(6);
B4 degree : degree(2);
B4 delay+ : delay(1), delayed(3), delays(1);
B4 dependencies : dependencies(9);
B4 ease : ease(4);
B4 evaluate : evaluated(2), evaluation(9);
B4 forum : forum(3);
B4 introduction+ : introduction(8), introductions(2);
B4 itt_day : itt_day(4);
B4 lynda : lynda(4);
B4 minutes : minutes(6);
B4 missed : missed(3);
B4 north : north(8);
B4 note+ : note(5), noted(3);
B4 pass+ : pass(8);
B4 preferred : preferred(11);
B4 prepare : prepare(6);
B4 prepare+ : preparation(3), preparing(5);
B4 review+ : review(14), reviewer(1), reviewers(1);
B4 situation : situation(5);
B4 sort+ : sort(9);
B4 strength+ : strengthen(2), strengths(3);
B4 using : using(39);
B4 virtual+ : virtual(4);
B4 wales : wales(8);
B4 warehouse : warehouse(7);
B4 west : west(8);
B3 feed. : fed(4), feed(4);
B3 lose. : lose(3);
B3 ask+ : asked(6);
B3 belief : belief(3);
B3 best : best(10);
B3 distribution : distribution(8);
B3 facilitate : facilitate(6);
B3 goalposts+ : goalposts(2), goalposts_(1);
B3 highlight+ : highlighted(4);
B3 impossible : impossible(3);
B3 intend+ : intend(2), intended(1);
B3 local+ : local(18), locally(1);
B3 look+ : look(6), looks(1);
B3 murray : murray(3);
B3 operations+ : operations(24);
B3 period+ : period(20);
B3 primary : primary(3);
B3 project+ : project(14), projects(3), project'(1);
B3 responsibil+ : responsibilities(8), responsibility(10);
B2 agenda+ : agenda(5);
B2 appendices : appendices(3);
B2 calculate : calculate(3);
B2 day_III : day_III(3);
B2 illustrate : illustrated(5);
B2 likelihood : likelihood(3);
B2 output+ : outputs(5);
B2 prefer+ : preferable(3);
B2 session : session(3);
B2 third : third(6);
B2 unitiST : unitiST(3);

Formes associées au contexte C
C4 assess+: assess(4), assessing(2), assessment(6), assessments(4);
C4 awareness: awareness(6);
C4 concentrate: concentrate(3);
C4 difficult+: difficult(5), difficulties(1), difficulty(1);
C4 earning+: earning(2);
C4 enhance+: enhance(4), enhanced(1);
C4 external+: external(8);
C4 free+: free(5), freed(1);
C4 future: future(7);
C4 hr: hr(3);
C4 import+: importance(2), important(2);
C4 inspector+: inspectorate(3);
C4 interpret+: interpreting(1), interprets(4);
C4 investigate+: investigated(3), investigation(1), investigators(3);
C4 likely: likely(5);
C4 match: match(4);
C4 open+: open(7);
C4 optimum: optimum(4);
C4 original+: original(1), originality(1);
C4 progress+: progress(9), progressed(1), progression(3);
C4 queries: queries(3);
C4 question+: questions(11);
C4 sound: sound(3);
C4 source+: sources(6);
C4 strategy+: strategic(4), strategies(1), strategy(5);
C4 talk+: talk(4);
C4 trends: trends(3);
C4 tus: tus(2);
C4 view+: views(7);
C4 aim+: aim(2), aims(1);
C3 children: children(3);
C3 collective: collective(6);
C3 control+: control(6), controls(2);
C3 discuss+: discuss(8), discussed(1), discussion(1), discussions(6);
C3 distribute+: distribute(1), distributes(4);
C3 exercise+: exercise(2), exercises(1);
C3 guidelines: guidelines(4);
C3 lower: lower(3);
C3 potential+: potential(9), potentially(1);
C3 quick+: quick(1), quickly(3);
C3 representative: representative(6), representatives(5);
C3 satisfy+: satisfy(1), satisfying(2);
C3 uncertain+: uncertainty(3);
C3 whole: whole(4);
C2 adherence: adherence(1);
C2 adviceline: adviceline(1);
C2 appoint+: appoint(1), appointments(2);
C2 audience: audience(3), audiences(1);
C2 capabilities: capabilities(1), capability(8);
C2 certain+: certain(3), certainty(1);
C2 continuous: continuous(5);
C2 create+: creating(3);
C2 create+: creating(3);
C2 eliminate+: eliminate(2);
C2 happy+: happy(2);
C2 income+: income(2), incomes(1);
C2 inspire+: inspires(1);
C2 maq+: maq(2);
C2 meaningful: meaningful(3);
C2 personnel: personnel(4);
C2 policies: policies(1), policing(1), policy(2);
C2 premium: premium(1);
C2 produce+: produce(1), produces(2);
C2 reason+: reason(3), reasonably(1);
C2 suspend+: suspend(1);
C2 throughput : throughput(2);
C2 travel : travel(2);
C2 turn+ : turns(1);
C2 utilis+ : utilising(2);
C2 wait+ : wait(1);

Formes associées au contexte D

D9 outside : outside(36);
D9 oversee. : oversee(37);
D9 appeal+ : appeal(3), appeals(27);
D9 auxiliary : auxiliary(43);
D9 care : care(28);
D9 complaint+ : complaints(93);
D9 compliance+ : compliance(66), compliance_2);
D9 core : core(91);
D9 design+ : design(49), designated(1), designed(5), designs(1);
D9 emeic : emeic(37);
D9 enforcement : enforcement(47);
D9 face : face(104);
D9 focus+ : focus(40), focused(9);
D9 functionalis+ : functionalisation(23), functionalised(6);
D9 heo : heo(59);
D9 including : including(30);
D9 individual+ : individual(15), individuals(5);
D9 manager+ : manager(53), managers(60);
D9 officer+ : officer(34), officers(13);
D9 organisational : organisational(34);
D9 organisation+ : organisation(108), organisations(1),
organisation_2);
D9 pre : pre(25);
D9 processes : processes(58);
D9 process+ : process(181), processing(3);
D9 rate+ : rate(7), rates(19);
D9 report+ : report(12), reporting(40), reports(8);
D9 responsible : responsible(35);
D9 team+ : team(191), teams(224), team_s(2);
D9 activities : activities(27);
D8 caseworker+ : caseworker(13), caseworkers(14);
D8 increase+ : increase(18), increased(18), increases(3);
D8 line+ : line(36), lines(2);
D8 manage+ : manage(36), manageable(1), managed(2), management(81);
D8 mc : mc(27);
D8 profile+ : profile(33), profiles(5);
D8 qualit+ : quality(29);
D8 structure+ : structure(32), structures(22);
D8 technical : technical(45);
D8 trace+ : trace(26), traced(2);
D7 central+ : central(33), centrally(8);
D7 combin+ : combination(1), combining(10);
D7 debt : debt(11);
D7 eo : eo(25);
D7 executive+ : executive(34);
D7 gain+ : gain(2), gains(11);
D7 handling : handling(24);
D7 high+ : high(23), higher(30), highly(1);
D7 initiate : initiate(18);
D7 organised : organised(11);
D7 page+ : page(5), pages(6);
D7 product+ : productivity(23);
D7 senior : senior(25);
D7 skill+ : skill(1), skilled(10), skills(18);
D7 vision : vision(12);
D6 address+ : address(8), addressed(8), addressing(2);
D6 advantage+ : advantage(8), advantages(3);
D6 area+ : area(3), areas(44);
Clé sélectionnée : A

1677 38 #meetings and any #visitors/ #tours/ this would potentially entail #moving some reform #staff offsite? #rec 2: the #technical and #telephony for the #parallel #office will be #set up within the #parallel/ #office by the 29th of #october/ 20 #live work #stations on #new #technical/ #telephony/ 5 #workstations for #support, could be on #old #technical, #technical, #telephony,

1691 38 #meetings and any #visitors/ #tours/ this would potentially entail #moving some reform #staff offsite? #rec 2: the #technical and #telephony for the #parallel #office will be #set up within the #parallel/ #office by the 29th of #october/ 20 #live work #stations on #new #technical/ #telephony/ 5 #workstations for #support, could be on #old #technical, #technical, #telephony,

1043 33 all cases to be processed, no #prior #screening of cases. #private #cases identified by #postcode for the #chosen #associated #agency, #district #rec: 3: the #technical and #telephony for the #parallel #office will be #set up within the #parallel #office by the 29th of #october.

1004 32 and #associated #private #cases for the #same area, will be processed in the #parallel #office, #approximately 25 to 35 a #week.

the #technical and #telephony for the #parallel #office will be #set up by the 29th of #october A #joint #request for #approximately 35 #operational #staff to work in both the #model #office and the #parallel #office will be made to the #capacity/

1108 32 #model #office #staff will be #brought into #the' #go #live' #environment to provide #support for non NCT #functions #eg. change of #circumstances. #new #applications from only #private clients will be received through #associated #agency during the #lit #day period.

1131 32 #model #office #staff will be #brought into #the' #go #live' #environment to provide #support for non NCT #functions #eg. change of #circumstances. #new #applications from only #private clients will be received through #associated #agency during the #lit #day period.

1021 30 an #application for 25 #desks has been #submitted to #accommodation. half #spur #required to ensure #room for #support, #meetings and any #visitors/ #tours. this would potentially entail moving some reform #staff offsite. #rec 2: the #technical and #telephony for the #parallel #office will be #set up by the 29th of #october.

1022 29 20 #live work #stations on #new #technical/ #telephony. 5 #workstations for #support, could be on #old #technical, #technical, #telephony, #consortium of #private #firms have #visibility of #parallel #office plans.

1044 29 20 #live work #stations on #new #technical/ #telephony 5 #workstations for #support, could be on #old #technical, #technical, #telephony, #consortium of #private #firms have #visibility of #parallel #office plans.

694 28 in the worst #scenario, #cases may have to be #manually #converted back #onto the #old #itt for processing #training can be developed and delivered in a timely #fashion to all #staff #requiring #training for this #advanced #go #live #itt #day will be #scaled back to #cover only.

1512 28 #procedure for processing a #benefits #agency #application, 04/ 02/ 02 to 25/ 02/ 02? 25 30 #cases per #week from a #associated #agency #district, yet to be #determined. #attached to WNwbusiness unit will be #sent to the #parallel #office #via the #interfaces. 1561 28 #procedure for processing a #benefits #agency #application, 04/ 02/ 02 to 25/ 02/ 02? 25 30 #cases per #week from a #associated #agency #district, yet to be #determined. #attached to WNwbusiness unit will be #sent to the #parallel #office #via the #interfaces.

709 27 to #determine the data and #operational issues #associated with using the #automated/ #clerical #interfaces, particularly in
#bringing across #linked and #multiple #cases #onto the #new #itt to #test the #new #csa #telephony #system with #real customers #prior to #a day in a #controlled way to demonstrate the capabilities of the #new #system,

919 27 387 6 total #number of #staff with communication only #requirement #approx 37,000 total #number of #staff with #training #requirement #approx. 37000 13. ba approach for #itt #day ba drive ba #office #selection in a phased #rollout with a #joint #decision on which #csa bu is #chosen for the #itt #day #go #live on 3 #december 2001.

1025 27 35 to 35 a #week. SAT #figures show W&NW #receive an average of 186 #private #cases per month 120 #estimated to be #english #cases. all #cases to be #directed to the #parallel #office. #controlled on a #ad hoc #basis. #rec 5: #associated #agency will #re #direct all #private #applicants for the #lead business unit to the #parallel #office.

1039 26 #associated #agency #case #packs will be #sent directly to the #parallel #office from the day_I #associated #agency #district. the sorting of #post for the #parallel #office will be done at #crewe and #sent to the #parallel #office by #same #day #guaranteed #mail. 1508 25 every #case that is #entered onto the #new #itt will be #entered #onto a #suppressed CSCS CP03 #system #located within the #parallel #office on a #daily #basis.

1557 25 #controlled on a #ad hoc #basis? #rec 5: #associated #agency will #re #direct all #private #applicants for the #lead business unit to the #parallel #office. the processing of a #case will be done entirely within the #parallel #office member of #associated #agency or #trained member of MO to do #associated #agency #function within the #parallel #office all #itt #related actions to be #conducted within the/ 

Ola 6 tapril 2001 #third draft #issued for QA6 draft. 01b 17 tapril 2001 final #distribution #list for #sign off #programme management: #distribution #list for information this #document #outlines our #approach for #implementing the #critical #public #sector #reform #business #changes by october 2003.
It must be noted that de-risking day II involves both assuring the new reform itt and reform solutions, and preparing operations. Option 1: prove the new itt in W&NW business unit for 2 months and then roll out into the other 5 business units, current plan.

De-risking day II would involve de-risking reform itt, reform solutions and operations. Comparison of the 4 options along the 6 dimensions shows option 1 prove the new itt in W&NW business unit for 2 months and then roll out into the other 5 business units, current plan, option 2a:

On the 4th of March the roll out will be into the lead business unit, Wales and north west. The 3 key recommendations for phase 2.

On the 4th of March the roll out will be into the lead business unit, Wales and north west. The 2 key recommendations for phase 2.

Reform programme reforms business change implementation team development of issues around day I discussion document July 2001. Day I: prove the new itt and solutions in Longbenton for 2 months and then roll out to all 6 business units’ s, current plan.

On the 4th of March the roll out will be into the lead business unit, Wales and north west. The 2 key recommendations for phase 2.

Reform programme reforms business change implementation team, implementing day I option 2a programme management team presentation 16th August 2001. Some of the planning recommendations presented at programme management team on the 26th of July have changed. The programme management team on the 26th of July signed off 14 recommendations from the day I implementation team around day I implementation.

De-risking day II involves de-risking reform itt, reform solutions and operations. Option 1 prove the new itt in W&NW business unit for 2 months and then roll out into the other 5 business units’ s, current plan, option 2a:

On the 4th of March the roll out will be into the lead business unit, Wales and north west. The 2 key recommendations for phase 2.

On the 4th of March the roll out will be into the lead business unit, Wales and north west. The 2 key recommendations for phase 2.

De-risking day II would involve de-risking reform itt, reform solutions and operations. Option 1 prove the new itt in W&NW business unit for 2 months and then roll out into the other 5 business units’ s, current plan, option 2a:

De-risking day II would involve de-risking reform itt, reform solutions and operations. Option 1 prove the new itt in W&NW business unit for 2 months and then roll out into the other 5 business units’ s, current plan, option 2a:

De-risking day II would involve de-risking reform itt, reform solutions and operations. Option 1 prove the new itt in W&NW business unit for 2 months and then roll out into the other 5 business units’ s, current plan, option 2a:

The calendar for February and March 2002: Roll out must. Be implementable from an itt perspective. Maximise time to sort out local issues in all business units. Roll out must be implementable from a implementation resource perspective. Maximise time to sort out local issues in all business units. Maximise time to test interfaces in all business units. Option 1: preferred implementation option

Option 2: staggering the roll out to one business unit per weekend during the roll out phase.

On the 4th of March the roll out will be into the lead business unit, Wales and north west. The third stage is the roll out into the business units.

Reform programme reforms business change implementation team. Implementing day I option 2a programme management team presentation 26th July 2001. At the programme management team last on the 5/7, the following option was decided on for day I implementation as the most effective option for sharing the risk between itt and day II there are 3 key stages to the implementation option:

Cle sélectionnée : C

412 Positively sets the tone for the team, leading by example by demonstrating exemplary behaviours motivates staff, rewards/recognition: consistently recognises good performance and
# acknowledges it. # drives the team's thinking towards delivery of outcomes # promotes # trust/ # respect: # entrusts others by providing opportunities for them to achieve, and demonstrates trustworthiness managing resources # know capacity/ # capability of resources:

484 68 # positively sets the tone for the team, leading by example by demonstrating exemplary behaviours # motivates staff, # rewards/ # recognition: # consistently # recognises good performance and # acknowledges it. # drives the team's thinking towards delivery of outcomes # promotes # trust/ # respect: # entrusts others by providing opportunities for them to achieve, and demonstrates trustworthiness managing resources # know capacity/ # capability of resources:

668 68 # positively sets the tone for the team, leading by example by demonstrating exemplary behaviours # motivates staff, # rewards/ # recognition: # consistently # recognises good performance and # acknowledges it. # drives the team's thinking towards delivery of outcomes # promotes # trust/ # respect: # entrusts others by providing opportunities for them to achieve, and demonstrates trustworthiness managing resources # know capacity/ # capability of resources:

321 49 # recognised appropriately/ # ensures that policy is developed and/ or applied consistently across the business unit/ # promotes # trust/ # respect/ earns the respect and trust of colleagues/ # promotes and earns the respect and trust of colleagues and customers/ # entrusts others by providing opportunities for them to achieve,

208 48 will be able to answer customer enquiries knowledgeably # people get actively involved in team achievements, # making suggestions for how performance can be improved further # people are motivated not demoralised by unrealistic targets the effective management of people expectations will reduce frustration and overcome uncertainty about the future/

166 44 # exemplary behaviours: # focuses on: # performance of team and BU, by: # coaching and mentoring # delivering customer service managing resources motivating people determining appropriate priorities # delivers: # well trained and developed team # leaders # performance targets # service improvements key change: # interpreting and applying MIS PACTS data # achievement of outcome by focusing on people the key competencies are: # leadership: #

309 42 recommendations and decisions conduct telephone communications # communicates in a clear, helpful and courteous manner when dealing with customers on the telephone # answers customer enquiries/ # questions in full and explaining in an easy to understand language has prompt, open and honest communications with the customer,

408 42 team working # participates in team # effort: leads their team # ensuring all team members are fully and actively involved # respects others contributions: # listens to, # consults and # respects the views of others and # takes them into account.

410 42 # develops # shared # objectives: # drives team # efforts towards # collective # objectives on which all members accept and deliver on # customer focus # communicate with the # customer: # obtains feedback from the # customers on the # service provided by the team and # shares this with the team and plans # customer # service improvements with them.

664 42 team working # participates in team # effort: leads their team # ensuring all team members are fully and actively involved # respects others contributions: # listens to, # consults and # respects the views of others and # takes them into account.

480 42 team working # participates in team # effort: leads their team # ensuring all team members are fully and actively involved # respects others contributions: # listens to, # consults and # respects the views of others and # takes them into account.

492 42 # develops # shared # objectives: # drives team # efforts towards # collective # objectives on which all members accept and deliver on # customer focus # communicate with the # customer: # obtains feedback from the # customers on the # service provided by the team and # shares this with the team and plans # customer # service improvements with them.
respects others' contributions: listens to, consults and respects the views of others and takes them into account.

666 42 develops shared objectives: drives team efforts towards collective objectives on which all members accept and deliver on customer focus; communicate with the customer; obtains feedback from the customers on the service provided by the team and shares this with the team and plans customer service improvements with them.

1932 42 develops shared objectives: drives team efforts towards collective objectives on which all members accept and deliver on customer focus; communicate with the customer; obtains feedback from the customers on the service provided by the team and shares this with the team and plans customer service improvements with them.

666 42 develops shared objectives: drives team efforts towards collective objectives on which all members accept and deliver on customer focus; communicate with the customer; obtains feedback from the customers on the service provided by the team and shares this with the team and plans customer service improvements with them.

1935 42 drives the teams thinking towards delivery of outcomes; communicates with the customer: obtains feedback from the customers on the service provided by the team and shares this with the team and plans customer service improvements with them.

1930 38 there are no exceptions. the key competencies are: team working; participates in team effort: leads their team ensuring all team members are fully and actively involved; respects others; contributions: listens to, consults and respects the views of others and takes them into account.

1930 38 well trained and developed people: performance targets excellent customer service key change: promotes full team accountability managing resources: know capacity/ capability of resources: provides role model; approachable and uses initiative when appropriate; provides support and guidance to less experienced colleagues; positively sets the tone for the team, leading by example; demonstrating exemplary/ behaviours: actively encourages the team to deliver by displaying a clearly supportive leadership/ style/ builds an environment to allow teams to fulfil their role and potential.

1930 38 there are no exceptions. the key competencies are: team working; participates in team effort: leads their team ensuring all team members are fully and actively involved; respects others; contributions: listens to, consults and respects the views of others and takes them into account.

1930 38 well trained and developed people: performance targets excellent customer service key change: promotes full team accountability managing resources: know capacity/ capability of resources: provides role model; approachable and uses initiative when appropriate; provides support and guidance to less experienced colleagues; positively sets the tone for the team, leading by example; demonstrating exemplary/ behaviours: actively encourages the team to deliver by displaying a clearly supportive leadership/ style/ builds an environment to allow teams to fulfil their role and potential.

1930 38 well trained and developed people: performance targets excellent customer service key change: promotes full team accountability managing resources: know capacity/ capability of resources: provides role model; approachable and uses initiative when appropriate; provides support and guidance to less experienced colleagues; positively sets the tone for the team, leading by example; demonstrating exemplary/ behaviours: actively encourages the team to deliver by displaying a clearly supportive leadership/ style/ builds an environment to allow teams to fulfil their role and potential.

Clé sélectionnée: D

225 53 resolution rates and complaints will be measured, detail to follow, within HEO command/ additional trace/ technical assurance/ complaints handling/ outside HEO command; face to face/ enforcement/ appeals/ high profile complaints/ mc case teams/ purpose:

229 48 resolution rates and complaints will be measured, detail to follow, within HEO command/ additional trace/ technical assurance/ complaints handling/ outside HEO command; face to face/ enforcement/ appeals/ high profile complaints/ purpose:

234 48 resolution rates and complaints will be measured, detail to follow, within HEO command/ additional trace/ technical assurance/ complaints handling/ outside HEO command; face to face/ enforcement/ appeals/ high profile complaints/ purpose:

234 48 resolution rates and complaints will be measured, detail to follow, within HEO command/ additional trace/ technical assurance/ complaints handling/ outside HEO command; face to face/ enforcement/ appeals/ high profile complaints/ purpose:

463 42 additional trace teams/ technical assurance teams within customer care/ technical assurance teams within core heo team/ complaints handling teams within core heo team/ high profile complaints teams/ quality teams/ enforcement teams/
resolution rates and complaints will be measured, detail to follow, within HEO command/ EMEIC/ MC/ additional trace/ outside HEO command/ appeals/ complaints handling/ teams within core/ heo/ team/ purpose:

- Grouping by outcome exposes individuals to a broader range of disciplines, and increases their sensitivity to end to end processes there are 8 heo team types for the core and auxiliary process areas the diagram shows the different team types and summarises their purpose within the organisation to deal with all.

Resolution rates and complaints will be measured, detail to follow, within HEO command/ within SEO command/ face to face/ outside HEO command/ EMEIC/ MC/ additional trace/ complaints handling/ face to face/ teams/ purpose:

- Integrated with 3 associated functions at the HEO level complaints technical assurance additional trace auxiliary processes support the core processes specialist support, a term which includes functions that assist the core activities face to face enforcement/ fraud/ customer care, a term which includes inbound customer contact CRT.

- But the key difference is that there are no longer functional groups within the core process areas. The three groupings in the new organisation are: core processes consist of the end to end processes of establish maintenance entitlement, initiate compliance, emeic, or maintain compliance, mc.

Resolution rates and complaints will be measured, detail to follow, interfaces/ dependencies within heo command/ additional trace/ technical assurance complaints handling/ outside heo command/ face to face/ enforcement/ appeals/ complaints/ purpose:

- Integrated with 3 associated functions at the heo level complaints technical assurance additional trace auxiliary processes support the core processes specialist support, a term which includes functions that assist the core activities face to face enforcement/ customer care, a term which includes inbound customer contact CRT.

- But the key difference is that there are no longer functional groups within the core process areas. The three groupings in the new organisation are: core processes consist of the end to end processes of establish maintenance entitlement, initiate compliance, emeic, or maintain compliance, mc.

- There will be a new team structure for the establish maintenance entitlement initiate compliance, emeic, process combining pre ma, account set up and some debt management,
D2: Calcul des "segments répétés"

Seuls les 20 SR les plus fréquents sont retenus ici:

2 236 will. be
2 158 business unit+
2 127 of the
2 111 in the
2 104 parallel office+
2 96 to be
2 81 to the
2 75 there are
2 76 for the
2 62 itt day+
2 60 associated agency+
2 58 deal. with
2 57 assurance+ point+
3 56 face to face
2 54 on the
2 54 team+ leader+
2 52 technical assurance+
2 51 and the
2 49 has been
2 48 with the

D2: Calcul des "segments répétés" par classe

*** classe n° 1 (20 SR maximum) ***

2 1104 will. be
2 1 82 parallel office+
2 1 52 to be
2 1 38 of the
2 1 38 associated agency+
3 1 34 new client team+
2 1 32 in the
4 1 32 consortium of private firms+
4 1 31 within the parallel office+
2 1 31 business unit+
3 1 30 the parallel office+
2 1 30 associated agency+
2 1 30 go. live+
2 1 29 model+ office+
2 1 29 itt day+
2 1 27 government+ agency+
2 1 26 for the
4 1 25 on the new itt
4 1 25 in the parallel office+
2 1 24 W&Nw business unit+

*** classe n° 2 (20 SR maximum) ***

2 2 43 business unit+
2 2 37 will. be
2 2 33 reform+ programme+
2 2 32 of the
2 2 32 business change+
2 2 32 assurance+ point+
4 2 27 using staff+ from W&Nw
3 2 25 on the of
5 2 25 reform+ business change+ implement+ team+
there are roll+ out to be implement+ plan+ prove the new itt and solution+ in longbenton phase+ roll+ out time to implement+ plan+ de risk+ are not route+ map+ 

*** classe n° 3 (20 SR maximum) ***
deal. with customer+ service+ csr+ competenc+ framework team+ work+ to the team+ member+ to customer+ on the with the of the team+ leader+ will. be in a the team+ and the public+ sector reform+ focus+ on in place competenc+ framework in order+ to 

*** classe n° 4 (20 SR maximum) ***
face to face technical assurance+ business unit+ in the heo team+ focus+ on for the additional+ trace+ HEO team+ to the will. be team+ leader+ deal. with within HEO command+ there are will. manage+ resolution rate+ outside HEO command+ Eo’ s at the
D3: C.A.H. des mots par classe

C.A.H. du contexte lexical A

Fréquence minimum d'un mot : 5
Fréquence minimum d'un mot : 6
Fréquence minimum d'un mot : 7
Fréquence minimum d'un mot : 8
Fréquence minimum d'un mot : 8
Fréquence minimum d'un mot : 8
Fréquence minimum d'un mot : 8
Fréquence minimum d'un mot : 8
Nombre de mots sélectionnés : 64
Valeur de clé minimum après calcul : 6

Nombre d'uce analysées : 570
Seuil du chi² pour les uce : 0
Nombre de mots retenus : 64
Poids total du tableau : 3922

A6 select+
A8 associated
A7 district+
A8 same
A6 send+
A6 post+
A9 applic+
A8 english
A9 associated
A8 agency+
A9 private
A6 week+
A9 case+
A6 control+
A9 office+
A9 parallel
A9 model+
A8 staff+
A6 located
A7 approximatel
A7 request+
A6 joint
A7 part+
A6 computer+
A9 consortium
A8 firms+
A7 november
A6 head+
A9 technical
A6 october
A7 rec
A7 room
A8 up
A6 set.
A6 comments
A6 daily
A6 meetings
A9 fault+
A7 code
A8 procedure+
| A9 user+ | ------------+ | | |
| A7 test+ | | | |
| A7 support+ | ------------+----| |
| A9 go. | ------------+----| |
| A9 live+ | | + | |
| A7 onto | ------------+----| |
| A6 migrate+ | | | |
| A9 client | ------------+----| |
| A9 train+ | ------------+----| |
| A7 require+ | | | |
| A9 old | | | |
| A9 system+ | | | |
| A9 itt | | | |
| A9 new | | | |
| A6 environment | ------------+----| |
| A7 small+ | | | |
| A6 number+ | | | |
| A7 functional+ | ------------+----| |
| A6 interface+ | | | |
| A9 a_day | | | |
| A8 prior | | | |
| A8 day+ | | | |
| A7 ba | | | |
C.A.H. du contexte lexical B

Fréquence minimum d'un mot : 5  
Fréquence minimum d'un mot : 6  
Fréquence minimum d'un mot : 7  
Fréquence minimum d'un mot : 8  
Nombre de mots sélectionnés : 93  
Valeur de clé minimum après calcul : 2  

Nombre d'uce analysées : 353  
Seuil du chi² pour les uce : 0  
Nombre de mots retenus : 93  
Poids total du tableau : 3042

B6 recommend+ |-------------------------------+ |  
B4 west |+++-|  
B4 north |++-|  
B4 wales |+|  
B6 january |-------------------+ |  
B8 contingency |+-+---+|  
B6 invoked |+-+|  
B6 release+ |--------------++-|  
B5 remain+ |+-+++|  
B4 pass+ |++-|  
B5 step+ |--------------+|  
B7 point+ |---+++|  
B7 criteria |+-+|  
B5 meet. |+-+|  
B3 feed. |-------------------------------+ |  
B9 template+ |-------------++-|  
B6 handoff+ |+-+|  
B4 prepar+ |-------------------+ |  
B3 operation+ |+-+|  
B3 responsibi |-------------------+ |  
B4 csr+ |---------+|  
B6 field |---+-|  
B3 project+ |+-+|  
B5 around |-------------------------------+ |  
B5 sign+ |-------------++-|  
B4 introduction |-------------++-|  
B9 july |-------------++-|  
B8 present+ |+++-|  
B9 day_I+ |-------------------+ |  
B9 implement+ |-------------++-|  
B9 plann+ |-------------++-|  
B5 workshop+ |-------------++-|  
B9 key |-------------++-|  
B9 change+ |-------------++-|  
B9 programme+ |+-+|  
B9 reform+ |+-+|  
B4 append+ |-------------++-|  
B7 augus+ |-------------++-|  
B7 map+ |+++-|  
B7 route+ |+-+|  
B9 outline+ |+++-|  
B4 child |+-+|  
B6 similar+ |-------------++-|  
B5 define+ |+-+|  
B9 approach+ |-------------++-|  
B7 sector |-------------++-|  
B6 public+ |+|  
B4 review+ |-------------++-|  
B8 critical |-------------++-|  
B7 success |-------------++-|
B6 factor+  |---+  |
B6 evaluat+  |---+  |
B4 document+  |---+-+  |
B5 june  |---+-+  |
B9 de  |---+-+  |
B9 day_II  |---+-++  |
B9 risk+  |---+  |
B9 plan+  |---+-+  |
B9 version  |---+-+  |
B9 option+  |---+-+  |
B5 consider+  |---+-+  |
B3 best  |---+-+  |
B5 birkenhead  |---+-++  |
B5 move+  |---++  |
B4 note+  |---+-++  |
B3 period+  |---+-++  |
B4 using  |---+-++  |
B6 solution+  |---++  |
B9 longbenton  |---++  |
B9 month+  |++  |
B9 move+  |++  |
B9 business  |---+-+  |
B9 phase+  |---+-++  |
B9 into  |---+-++  |
B9 unit+  |---+-++  |
B9 out  |++  |
B9 roll+  |++  |
B7 issue+  |---+-+  |
B4 preferred  |---+-+  |
B7 perspective+  |---+-+  |
B3 local+  |---++  |
B6 maximise  |++  |
B4 sort+  |++  |
B4 over  |---+-+  |
B8 sequence  |---++  |
B7 pace  |---++  |
B6 decide+  |---+-+  |
B5 sharing  |---+-+  |
B9 march  |---+-+  |
B8 february  |---++  |
B6 earli+  |---+-+  |
B5 date+  |---+-+  |
C.A.H. du contexte lexical C

Fréquence minimum d'un mot :  5
Fréquence minimum d'un mot :  6
Fréquence minimum d'un mot :  7
Fréquence minimum d'un mot :  8
Fréquence minimum d'un mot :  8
Fréquence minimum d'un mot :  8
Fréquence minimum d'un mot :  8
Nombre de mots sélectionnés :  96
Valeur de clé minimum après calcul :  6

Nombre d'uce analysées :  291
Seuil du chi² pour les uce :  0
Nombre de mots retenus :  96
Poids total du tableau :  2126

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2126</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C9 ensure+
C8 effect+
C7 accurate+
C7 seek.
C7 promise+
C9 mann+
C8 respond+
C9 appropriate+
C9 personal+
C9 feedback
C9 improve+
C7 deliver+
C7 customer+
C6 service+
C9 develop+
C9 perform+
C9 coach+
C9 people+
C9 encourage+
C6 priorit+
C9 leader+
C9 well
C9 indic+
C9 competenc+
C9 framework
C8 prompt+
C7 grade+
C6 apply+
C6 objective+
C9 knowledge+
C9 job+
C7 value+
C6 money
C9 resource+
C9 achieve+
C9 target+
C7 analyse+
C7 excellent
C7 order+
C6 achieve+
C6 monitor+
C9 solving
C6 problem+
C6 result+
C6 calculat+
C6 easi+
C6 logical+ |-----------+-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C6 utilise+ |       |   +-----+-----+-----+-----+
C8 relev+ |       |   +-----+-----+-----+-----+
C6 equip+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C7 deal. | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 full+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C7 ensuring | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C6 commun+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 clear+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 display+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C7 keep. | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C7 inform+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C8 understand. | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C7 answer+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 act+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 colleagues | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C6 practice+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 promote+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C6 opportunit+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C8 trust+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 others+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 respect+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 think. | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C8 know. | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 demonstr+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C7 example+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 recognition | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C7 provid+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C6 behaviour+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 motivate+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C8 exemplary | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C7 tone | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 positive+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C8 consistent+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 give. | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 contribut+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C8 credit | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C6 take. | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C7 particip+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C7 listen+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C6 consult+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C7 initiat+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C6 flow+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C8 share+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 towards | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C6 drive. | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C9 effort+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C6 member+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C7 accept+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
C6 obtain+ | |       | |-----+-----+-----+-----+-----+
## C.A.H. du contexte lexical D

| Frequence minimum d'un mot : 5 |
| Frequence minimum d'un mot : 6 |
| Frequence minimum d'un mot : 7 |
| Frequence minimum d'un mot : 8 |
| Frequence minimum d'un mot : 8 |
| Frequence minimum d'un mot : 8 |
| Frequence minimum d'un mot : 8 |
| Nombre de mots sélectionnés : 85 |
| Valeur de clé minimum après calcul : 6 |

| Nombre d'uce analysées : 391 |
| Seuil du chi² pour les uce : 0 |
| Nombre de mots retenus : 85 |
| Poids total du tableau : 2576 |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>D6 concept</th>
<th>D9 design+</th>
<th>D6 principles</th>
<th>D6 describe+</th>
<th>D9 organisation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D6 behaviour+</td>
<td>D9 focus+</td>
<td>D6 outcome+</td>
<td>D6 extend+</td>
<td>D6 final+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9 organisation</td>
<td>D6 end</td>
<td>D6 centre+</td>
<td>D9 functionalis</td>
<td>D6 minimise+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9 focus+</td>
<td>D6 outcome+</td>
<td>D6 extend+</td>
<td>D6 final+</td>
<td>D9 organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D7 vision</td>
<td>D9 responsible</td>
<td>D6 centre+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9 auxiliary</td>
<td>D9 core</td>
<td>D6 area+</td>
<td>D9 minimise+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D6 mostly</td>
<td>D6 particular+</td>
<td>D7 skill+</td>
<td>D6 multi</td>
<td>D7 gain+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D8 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9 auxiliary</td>
<td>D9 core</td>
<td>D6 area+</td>
<td>D9 minimise+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D6 mostly</td>
<td>D6 particular+</td>
<td>D7 skill+</td>
<td>D6 multi</td>
<td>D7 gain+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D8 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9 auxiliary</td>
<td>D9 core</td>
<td>D6 area+</td>
<td>D9 minimise+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D6 mostly</td>
<td>D6 particular+</td>
<td>D7 skill+</td>
<td>D6 multi</td>
<td>D7 gain+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D8 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9 auxiliary</td>
<td>D9 core</td>
<td>D6 area+</td>
<td>D9 minimise+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D6 mostly</td>
<td>D6 particular+</td>
<td>D7 skill+</td>
<td>D6 multi</td>
<td>D7 gain+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D8 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9 auxiliary</td>
<td>D9 core</td>
<td>D6 area+</td>
<td>D9 minimise+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D6 mostly</td>
<td>D6 particular+</td>
<td>D7 skill+</td>
<td>D6 multi</td>
<td>D7 gain+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D8 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9 auxiliary</td>
<td>D9 core</td>
<td>D6 area+</td>
<td>D9 minimise+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D6 mostly</td>
<td>D6 particular+</td>
<td>D7 skill+</td>
<td>D6 multi</td>
<td>D7 gain+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D8 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9 auxiliary</td>
<td>D9 core</td>
<td>D6 area+</td>
<td>D9 minimise+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D6 mostly</td>
<td>D6 particular+</td>
<td>D7 skill+</td>
<td>D6 multi</td>
<td>D7 gain+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D8 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9 auxiliary</td>
<td>D9 core</td>
<td>D6 area+</td>
<td>D9 minimise+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D6 mostly</td>
<td>D6 particular+</td>
<td>D7 skill+</td>
<td>D6 multi</td>
<td>D7 gain+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D8 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
<td>D8 structure+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9 auxiliary</td>
<td>D9 core</td>
<td>D6 area+</td>
<td>D9 minimise+</td>
<td>D9 processes+</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
* Fin de l'analyse *

Date : 17/5/04; Heure : 11:15:06
Temps d'exécution : 0 h 4 mn 17 s
Bibliography
Bibliography


Bibliography


Armbruster, T. Organizational Change Through the Transfer of Knowledge: Pitfalls in the Use of Management Consultants, Unpublished Manuscript.


Bauer, M. 'Technophobia': a Misleading Conception of Resistance to New Technology (pp. 97-119).


Bibliography

Political Sciences, London, UK.


Bibliography


Billig, M. Studying the Thinking Society: Social Representations, Rhetoric and Attitudes (pp. 39-61).


Brooke, W., & Ehninger, D. Toulmin on Argument: An Interpretation and Application. The Quaterly Journal fo Speech, 44-.


Bibliography


Bibliography


Bibliography


Bibliography


Farr, R. Social Representations as Widespread Beliefs, *The London School of Economics and Political Science* (pp. 1-29). London.


Bibliography


Foucault, M. *Two Lectures*: Wheatsheaf, H.


Bibliography


Bibliography


Habermas, J. An Alternative Way out of the Philosophy of the Subject: Communicative Versus Subject-Centred Reason: Polity press.


Bibliography


Howarth, C. S. (2003). If "a social representation is not a quiet thing" are we listening?, manuscript unpublished.


Bibliography


Bibliography

Kipping, M., & Armbruster, T. Management Consultants and Management Knowledge: A Literature Review.


Bibliography


Lindkvist, K. Approaches to Textual Analysis. In K. Lindkvist (Ed.), Advances in Content Analysis (pp. 23-41). London: Rosengrass, K. E.


McKenna, C. D. Selling Corporate Culture: Codifying and Commodifying Professionalism.


Bibliography


Bibliography


Schmolze, R. (2000). Resistance to change and flexible responses: Conducting action...
Bibliography


Theoretical and Methodological Examination of a Nepali Adolescent's Narrative. Forum: Qualitative Social Research, 2(3).


Bibliography


Bibliography


